



May 4, 2016

Mr. David Perri
Commissioner of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Gary J. Jastrzab
Executive Director

Anne Fadullon
Chair

Joseph Syrnick
Vice-Chair

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Michael DiBerardinis
Rob Dubow
Patrick Eiding
Harold T. Epps
Cheryl Gaston, Esq.
Maria Gonzalez

Re: Civic Design Review for 1111-17 South Broad Street, Application No. 665702

Dear Mr. Perri:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a mixed used project at 1111-17 South Broad Street.

The proposed project location fronts two streets: South Broad Street to the west and Alter Street to the south. Washington Avenue is just a block north of the site. The development team is proposing to remove a one-story building and build a 6-story, mixed-use building containing one commercial space (1,907 square feet), 53 residential rental units (42,680 square feet), and 13 parking spaces, one of which is a car share space. The site is 10,675 square feet in area, and includes 18 on-site bicycle parking spaces and a roof top amenity deck. The current zoning of the parcel is CMX-3.

At its meeting of May 3, 2016, the Civic Design Review Committee offered the following comments, and voted to complete the CDR process:

1. Servicing the Building

The CDR Committee had questions concerning how loading, emergency access, and trash disposal will be handled for the proposed project. The development team responded that a 20-minute loading space at the front entrance is proposed to replace two existing on-street parking spaces on South Broad Street. Conversations regarding this are continuing with the Streets Department. Trash will be held on site and wheeled to vehicles at curbside, and that all emergency and loading will be facilitated on South Broad Street.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning

2. Loft Unit Concerns

The Committee members had mixed opinions concerning the three loft units proposed by the development team along Alter Street. Comments included concern for basement living and the functionality of the 3-story layout. Emergency egress from these units is a concern that will need to be reviewed further. Additional comments stated that the loft units are a unique compromise and the architects used challenging spaces well, but the basement level living should be minimized, or even eliminated. The use of double-height spaces at the street-level first floor of the units should be reexamined. The development team offered to review and consider adjusting the layout of the units.

3. The Ubiquitous Use of “Box” Bays Present an Architectural Design Issue for the City

Several Committee members spoke of the undesirability of “box” bay windows, which has seen increasing use in Philadelphia residential construction. It was stated that the use of this type of window is “not generous” to residents or the public. The Committee desires more refined and detailed design features for bay windows in future projects.

4. Broad Street Marquee

The CDR Committee requested that the development team review the three foot-wide marquee continuously fronting South Broad Street, and asked if the team could reconsider its length, which encroaches into public space.

5. Sustainable Measures

Overall, the CDR Committee stated that the sustainable design measures proposed are outdated and already required by the Philadelphia Code. The Committee requested the development team to highlight sustainable aspects above and beyond requirements of the Code.

6. Landscape

The Committee had a concern about the vegetation proposed for the rear and side yards, and requested shade tolerant species in those locations as well as a maintenance plan.

7. Benefit to the Community

Several Committee members made favorable comments about the building’s overall composition and the benefit this project will provide to the neighborhood and community. The Committee commented that the scale and functions of the building will be a positive contribution to the area.

PHILADELPHIA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

CIVIC DESIGN REVIEW

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,



Gary J. Jastrzab
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review Committee, nrt23@drexel.edu
Dan Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review Committee, danielg@upenn.edu
Councilmember Mark Squilla, 1st Council District, Mark.Squilla@phila.gov
Sean McMonagle, Councilmember Squilla's Office, Sean.Mcmonagle@phila.gov
Marie Beren, Constituent Services Representative 1st Council District, Marie.Beren@phila.gov
Jeff Watson, HarmanDeutsch Architecture, jeff@hdarchitecture.com
Rustin Ohler, HarmanDeutsch Architecture, rustin@hdarchitecture.com
David Orphanides, Orphanides& Toner, LLP, dorphanides@otllp.com
Pradeep Parekh, Plans Examiner, L&I, Pradeep.Parekh@phila.gov
Marty Gregorski, PCPC, marty.gregorski@phila.gov
David Schaaf, PCPC, david.schaaf@phila.gov