

PHILADELPHIA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
February 21, 2012

PRESENT:

Joseph Synchron, Vice Chairman
Brian Abernathy, representing Richard Negrin
Duane Bumb, representing Alan Greenberger
Patrick J. Eiding
Bernard Lee, Esq.
Elizabeth K. Miller
Nancy Rogo Trainer
Nilda Ruiz
Saskia Thompson, representing Rob Dubow

ABSENT:

Executive Director: Gary J. Jastrzab
Deputy Executive Director: Eva Gladstein

Vice Chair Joseph Syrnick convened the City Planning Commission Meeting of February 21, 2012 at 1:06pm.

- 1) Approval of the Minutes for the January 17, 2012 meeting.

Upon motion by Ms. Thompson, the City Planning Commission approved the minutes for the January 17, 2012 meeting.

- 2) Executive Director's Update

Mr. Jastrzab stated the first item is the Special Commission Meeting on March 6th at 1pm at the Free Library's Montgomery Auditorium at 19th and Vine Streets. There will be 3 things on the agenda:

1. Approval of Capital Program
2. Action on Central Delaware Riverfront Plan
3. Info Only review of draft regulations for new Zoning Code

- **DEADLINE FOR DISTRICT PLAN COMMENTS**

We have set a window for comments for the first 2 District Plans (Lower South and West Park) for March 1st. Please leave your comments on Phila2035@phila.gov by March 1st.

ITEMS IN ACCORD WITH PREVIOUS POLICY:

These items are recommended for Administrative Approval.

1. Three Redeveloper Agreements:

- a. Redeveloper Agreement with *Habitat for Humanity Philadelphia, Inc.* for new construction of a SF house for affordable homeownership at 1815 N. Gratz Street in North Central Philadelphia.
- b. Redeveloper Agreement with *Kevin and Whitney Redding* for a residential side yard at 1709-11 Olive St. in the Francisville neighborhood.
- c. Redeveloper Agreement with *Katherine Sepulveda* for a residential side yard at 2652 N. Orkney Street in Eastern North Philadelphia.

2. Modification to Urban Renewal Plan

For Independence Mall Urban Renewal Area, Unit No. 3: pertaining to the site between 4th and 5th Streets on the north side of Race Street. Modification would add "residential, hotels, and motels" as permitted uses in urban renewal plan.

This is the former Pincus Brothers clothing business, now proposed for mixed-use development with hotel. In April 2011, PCPC recommended approval for a zoning change from L4 Limited Industrial to C3 Commercial (Bill No. 100552-AA signed by the Mayor on 4/27/11).

PRA determined that the proposed development does not conform to the urban renewal plan, which designates the site for light industrial and commercial use, except that hotels

are not permitted. PRA requests this urban renewal plan modification, striking the restrictions on hotels.

This Bill rezoned the site and changed the text of the zoning code in a number of ways, permitting restaurants (which were prohibited under the Old City overlay), permitted a height of 145' as opposed to the 65' limitation, and changed the parking requirements for hotels on this block, from 1 per 2 hotel rooms to 1:3. While the development is not PRA-assisted, it is located in an urban renewal area and the land use controls do not permit a hotel.

3. ZBA Case 17101 for Zoo Intermodal Center, 3400 block Girard.

The ZBA hearing is tomorrow, February 22. They have received 2 refusals: one for parking structure use (property is zoned G-2); one for parking space size (undersized for G2 standards, but meet the residential-size standards). PCPC previously reviewed this proposal in May 2011 when recommended approval of Prop Bill 110257, transferring land to Zoo. It was determined that the land was acquired for Park use, and could not be transferred as Fee Simple. The Law Department is working on it.

4. Zoning Bill

Zoning Bill No. 120021 (introduced January 26, 2012): Repealing Bill No. 070955-AA (approved December 21, 2007) which rezoned a portion of Burholme Park "IDD" to accommodate the proposed expansion of the Fox Chase Cancer Center. In February 2009, PA Supreme Court denied the appeal of a Philadelphia Orphan's Court ruling blocking the hospital's efforts to expand into Burholme Park. Parkland would return to its original REC zoning classification.

5. Streets Bills

- Streets Bill No. 120003 (introduced January 26, 2012): A second time extension for Bill No. 070504 (originally approved 7/3/2007) and Bill 090574 (9/17/2009) striking Casper Street from Tioga to Russell Streets, and Russell Street from Casper Street to a dead end 310 feet southeast, and reserving utility rights-of-way in stricken streets.
- Streets Bill 120051 (introduced February 2, 2012): Striking Spruce Street from 25th Street to the Schuylkill River, and 26th Street from Spruce Street to Delancey Place, and ceding the vacated areas to the Department of Parks and Recreation – removes paper streets from Schuylkill Banks.
 - a. On 12/14/2010, PCPC approved Property Bill 100777 authorizing the City to accept from CSX Transportation, Inc. an easement for an at-grade crossing on Race Street between 23rd Street and the Schuylkill River, an easement for an at-grade crossing on Locust Street between 25th Street and the Schuylkill River and for an aerial easement in the vicinity of Spruce and 26th Streets, to provide pedestrian bridge access to Schuylkill Banks Park.

3) *Information Only: Review of First Draft of Sign Controls Legislation*

Eva Gladstein, Executive Director of the Zoning Code Commission, stated this is a first draft of the new sign controls legislation. There will be a second draft on April 14. This is a companion piece of the Zoning Code. The new Zoning Code approved by City Council and signed into law by the Mayor in December 2011 did not include substantive amendments to the sign controls portion because the Zoning Code Commission did not have the resources to complete this work within its timeline. At the end of 2010, an interagency Sign Controls Working Group began analyzing the existing sign controls and developing a new framework for this chapter of the Zoning Code. Please submit your comments before March 23 on the ZoningMatters.org website. The goal is to submit an ordinance for introduction at City Council in May 2012 to allow sufficient time for City Council review and adoption so that the sign controls can go into effect when new Zoning Code goes into effect on August 22. Some of the input is reflected in this draft. We are planning 5 meetings once this draft is out.

Starting point – goals for sign control same as new Zoning Code. Simplify the Code so it is consistent and easy to understand, should help shape future construction and development, and should enhance and improve Philadelphia's development approval process while encouraging positive development and protecting the character of Philadelphia's neighborhoods. Reorganize the Chapter – what is a type of sign and what is a characteristic; accessory signs and non-accessory signs and removal of existing signs; national display of signs; and digital signs – it is a new and growing field. Display as much info in table format. Sign Types: flat wall consistent with current sign types; projecting signs sometimes projecting out; awning/canopy sign; marquee sign – overhanging structure of permanent construction attached to a building; roof sign – a sign wholly on and over the roof of a building; freestanding sign – a ground-mounted sign; and A-frame – sign not attached to structure. Sign characteristics are height, extensions, number of signs, illumination, moving signs, and digital displays. When is art – art, and where is it a sign. Good sign behavior: incentive to give bonus. Stiff regulations – take into account if building is vacant. Do you want signs or not. Art Commission or Historical Commission review or should it be another design review committee. Accessory sign – related to business. Non-accessory not related to business at location. Request we have been asked to treat window signs differently. Merchandise sign – such as coke cola in a deli, or a dress in a shop. Sign area with several tenants. Replacement ratio – remove sign to have a new sign added. We completed that meeting on Friday. Next steps – we have had survey posted on ZoningMatter.org regarding different signs. Over 300 people have taken it. The second step we have to take all of the information and take it into account. Get comments from second draft and get it to City Council in May. E-mail your comments to Zoning.Commission @phila.gov. Written comments on this draft are appreciated. You need to get them to us by March 23.

Ms. Rogo Trainer complemented them for all of the work. Which of these signs will not be allowed under the new code?

Ms. Gladstein replied we have looked at C2 corridors – 2 sq. ft. to 8 sq. ft. People felt the 2 sq. ft. are fine.

Ms. Ruiz asked what will happen to the existing signs.

Ms. Gladstein replied all signs that are non-conforming but legal would continue to exist.

- 4) *Information Only: Development of a hotel, restaurants, and accessory uses at the former Blue Horizon boxing venue, 1314-16 N. Broad Street (Mosaic Development Partners).*

Darwin Beauvais, attorney for Zarwin Baum DeVito Kaplan Schaer Todd P.C., representing Mosaic Development Partners, stated he is here today with Leslie Smallwood.

Leslie Smallwood-Lewis, Principal at Mosaic, introduced David Schmauk of Wulff Architects, Scott Orens of Orens Brothers co-developer, Derrick Kennedy – Traffic Engineer from Orth Rogers, Paul Loney - Civil Engineer from Aqua Economics, and Lelia Hamroun - Historic Consultant of Heritage Design Collaborative. She stated this site is located on the 1300 block of N. Broad Street. In July 2010, it was shut down for business. It adds to the Avenue of the Arts North initiative. It will be a hotel 2 blocks from Temple's Main Campus. It is near public transportation. There will be a banquet hall and a jazz facility at 1310 N. Broad. It will be part of the ongoing development. It will be an 8-story, 87-room hotel with jazz bar. We are preserving an iconic structure of a historic building. They have entered into an agreement with Temple School of Hospitality. The public benefits: creating 86 direct jobs, as well as, indirect jobs. There will be minority and female participation. Econsult received a letter approving \$6 million grant. At 1310 N. Broad, we are intending to take it down. The entrance to the Blue Horizon will be another entrance into the bar/hotel. The restaurateur wanted to be on Broad Street. In 1876 the building started as a mansion. In early 1900's added an auditorium. We are downsizing space of auditorium. The 3rd floor will be converted into hotel suite. The mansion will be converted into 12 hotel suites. It will be an 8-story structure with drive out, and outdoor deck space for restaurant.

Mr. Schmauk explained the walked through floor plan. It is 3 feet below grade with valet service. There are 2 ways in: the round stair case, and the lower level. The main level is where the lobby and restaurant will be, and the jazz bar. Atrium space is another space for entertaining for the restaurant.

Ms. Smallwood-Lewis replied as for signage, we are still open for discussion. We have discussion with the surrounding owners. Their intentions are to either acquire property for parking lot 1 at 1326 N. Carlisle Street. Lot 2 is at 15th and Master Streets. Lot 3 is at 17th and Master Streets with 100 to 120 spaces. Progress Plaza is another place. Temple and the Liacouras garage will provide more spaces.

Mr. Beauvais replied it is zoned "C2". We are looking to demolition and seeking addition for "C4", and for parking and curb cuts, and additional issues. Darrell Clarke supports this project. Proposed amendment to support new Zoning Code. GFA over 5600% justifies going to "C4", and lot reconfigured. They have support letters from Avenue of the Arts and Temple.

Mr. Syrnick asked what clientele are you shooting for to cater to.

Ms. Smallwood-Lewis replied the only hotel on Broad is Conwell Inn with 22 rooms. We are looking to cater to Temple sports teams, as well as, tourists, family reunions, church events, and African Americans.

Ms. Rogo Trainer asked isn't this a register building.

Ms. Smallwood-Lewis replied it is not an historic Philadelphia building; but on the National Register. We have reached out to Randy Baron at the Historical Commission.

Mr. Beauvais replied it was discussed to set building back so that you could see façade of old building.

Ms. Smallwood-Lewis replied they said no and pushed us back.

Ms. Rogo Trainer asked them to talk about the design and materials.

Mr. Schmauk replied pulled it back to face of mansion. Between mansion and existing building is a glass wall; it opens up and separates it. We are going to use modern materials like stone. Stucco finished when you get around to the back of the building, you can see what was new and what is existing part of building.

Ms. Rogo Trainer replied Broad Street is an important part. She doesn't want it to look like it was something from the suburbs that was just placed there. She wished the Historical commission were reviewing it. She wants as much quality on Broad Street.

Ms. Hamrou replied they are trying to respect the building with new materials; and have an active outreach. This design with outreach is what leads to this design. New materials are under discussion with outreach.

Mr. Abernathy asked why didn't you choose legislative representative. Why did you choose this instead?

Mr. Beauvais replied we didn't circumvent the community. We sat down with the Councilman and he said to go this way.

Mr. Abernathy asked about the new issues.

Mr. Beauvais replied under the new Zoning Code for restaurant and take-out.

Mr. Abernathy asked permitted smoking.

Mr. Beauvais replied we had question to allow a smoking area.

Mr. Abernathy asked about the 1 to 2 parking.

Mr. Beauvais replied we believe there is a lot of public parking nearby, and valet parking.

Mr. Abernathy replied to present this next time, have firmer answers.

Mr. Kennedy replied there is a traffic study from Orth Rogers. The previous use of this site was for 1500 seats. We are looking to go down. There will be 22% less of land use.

Ms. Ruiz asked is anything green use.

Mr. Schmauk replied they are not looking to go green roof, but we will look to go LEED.

Ms. Ruiz asked if they had any community meetings with leaders.

Ms. Smallwood-Lewis replied Council President directed us to speak to people.

Brian McHale replied from this perspective, traveling along you will see a 7-story blank façade on Broad Street.

Ms. Smallwood-Lewis replied we will think about a mural arts on that wall.

John Macklin, President of National Association of Minority Contractors, stated we have monthly meetings at the Freedom Theater. He didn't notice their parking lot was in your presentation.

Ms. Smallwood-Lewis replied they are very much aware about what we are doing.

Mr. Macklin replied he is also on the Board of Freedom Theater. He would like to meet with Ms. Smallwood-Lewis, and see about his group getting a piece of the pie.

Ms. Smallwood-Lewis replied she agreed.

Judith Robinson, homeowner, replied it is a good project; it sounds good. Make sure you reach out to the community.

5) ZBA Case 17196: Development of a 12-story residential building containing retail and educational space at 2017-23 Chestnut Street.

Larissa Klevan, Development Planning Division, stated this is a mixed use development that this Commission saw last month as an information only item. The developer proposes to demolish the existing building on site to construct a twelve-story building with one hundred and ten apartments on the second through twelfth floors, a 4,834 square feet ground floor commercial space and 9,600 square feet of educational use in the basement that will be occupied by the Freire Charter School, whose main facilities are located at 2025-29 Chestnut Street, immediately adjacent to the proposed development site. The site will also include one car share space. There are changes from January: the internal courtyard has gotten narrower and it has extended the height to 2 feet. It is consistent with the Philadelphia2035 Plan. In 2010 we did a Center City study on parking, there are enough parking lots and garages, plus public transit to support this. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Ms. Rogo Trainer replied she wanted to see rendering for the louvers.

Neil Sklaroff stated he is the attorney for Aquinas 2021 Chestnut Street, LP, who will be developing 2017-23 Chestnut Street. He is here with Michael Ytterberg and Len Poncia.

Ms. Rogo Trainer replied they have not changed it at all.

Mr. Ytterberg replied it is the same as the John Buck Building.

Mr. Eiding replied they aren't on the Chestnut Street side on the Buck Building.

Mr. Ytterberg replied yes they are.

Mr. Syrnick replied the last time you were here, we had a discussion about the louvers. Maybe you didn't understand.

Mr. Sklaroff replied he thought there was a request to show the louvers; to show another view of it.

Mr. Ytterberg replied we also brought back some material with us. It is an economical approach to this type of building. What we are asking for is to ask for an economic situation.

Mr. Bumb replied that he wasn't sitting on the Board the last time they were here. But the louvers are facing traffic in the east.

Ms. Rogo Trainer replied she trusts that she did make herself clear.

Mr. Eiding replied that we asked you to look at this because if you look to use cheap material, what will the next building be. The Buck Building does not sit out. He knows they cannot match the other buildings. He takes a little offense about professional courtesy when we ask you to take another look at this building.

Mr. Ytterberg replied the louvers in the other building are common and are also used in New York City. These are vertical louvers that form a pattern. We are not being cheap. He showed the materials. It is not an all granite building. We feel the solutions we offered are pleasing. It makes the project feasible.

Mr. Eiding asked if the louvers are on the back of the building too.

Mr. Ytterberg replied yes.

Mr. Eiding asked is there any sort of membrane that can go over the louver.

Mr. Ytterberg replied yes, but they are more expensive.

Mr. Eiding replied that is what we are asking for to cover the louver.

Mr. Bumb replied regardless that we are not happy with the materials, it is a very good project for the City.

Upon motion by Mr. Bumb, seconded by Ms. Thompson, the City Planning Commission approved ZBA Case 17196 at 2017-23 Chestnut Street.

- 6) Zoning Bill 120023: Remapping the area bounded by 2nd, 3rd, Chestnut, and Walnut Streets from "REC" Recreation to "C3" Commercial to permit the development of the National Center for the American Revolution (Introduced by Councilmember Squilla on January 26, 2012).

Ms. Klevan stated this is a remapping from "REC" Recreation to "C3" Commercial. We feel "R3" is appropriate for this site. The National Center for the American Revolution is looking to open in 2016. We feel that "C3" is appropriate for this site. This is consistent with the

Philadelphia2035 and tourism. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Upon motion by Mr. Eiding, seconded by Ms. Ruiz, the City Planning Commission approved Zoning Bill 120023.

- 7) Zoning Bill 120004: Remapping the area bounded by Torresdale Avenue, Megargee Street, Cottage Street, Placid Street, Frankford Avenue, and Tolbut Street (Introduced by Councilmember Henon on January 26, 2012).

Martin Gregorski, Development Planning Division, stated this Bill will rezone 32 acres from its current zoning of "R11A" Residential to a new designation of "R9A" Residential. This is the old Liddenfield Homes that is owned by PHA. PHA has a RFP process for this site. Staff supports the "R9A", but wants 45 days. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is for an extension of 45 days.

Mr. Bumb asked do we know if the sponsor of the Bill wants to hold it for 45 days.

Mr. Gregorski replied he doesn't want to but he will have to.

Mr. Jastrzab replied the City Planning Commission has the option whether to approve the street striking, or to ask for the extra time of 45 days. It was introduced on January 16, 2012. Typically we have to comment on the Bill. Under Section 307 of the Charter, it gives the Commission 45 days extension. That would take us to April 10; and Council can take this Bill on April 12, 2012. PHA has received 20 proposals for this RFP. We would like PHA to get the opportunity.

Mr. Eiding replied it is only fair to the area. It could come back to us and get rezoned again. This site has an impact on the area.

Stan Cywinski, President of Upper Holmesburg Civic Association, read a letter to the commission (see "Exhibit 7"). He asked the Commission to support this Bill.

Bob Hall, Vice President of the Upper Holmesburg Civic Association, stated he would hope we would approve this Bill.

Judith Robinson asked since this is PHA land, will any of those units be replacement units.

Mr. Gregorski replied there aren't any people in those units.

Ms. Robinson asked where did they go and will they be coming back.

Mr. Gregorski replied they have moved to other locations.

Ms. Thompson asked is the community against the 45 day waiting period.

Mr. Cywinski replied this was incorporated in the plan before the PHA process.

Mr. Abernathy asked were the community involved in the RFP process.

Mr. Cywinski replied no one was involved.

Mr. Jastrzab replied we have staff that is involved.

Upon motion by Mr. Lee, seconded by Ms. Ruiz, the City Planning Commission asked for a 45 day extension for Zoning Bill 120004.

- 8) Zoning Bill 120024: Remapping the area bounded by Snyder and Pattison Avenues, the Delaware River, and I-95 (Introduced by Councilmembers Johnson and Squilla on January 26, 2012).

Mr. Gregorski stated there are a number of properties down here that are zoned "LR" Least Restricted. Based on existing land use we are going from "LR" to G2" for some of the sites. This will allow for properties owned by the PRPA to be used as Port Industrial. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval. This is supported in the Lower South District Plan.

Upon motion by Mr. Abernathy, seconded by Ms. Rogo Trainer, the City Planning Commission approved Zoning Bill 120024.

- 9) Streets Bill 120022: Striking Strahle Street from Pine Road to the Philadelphia-Montgomery County Line and Rockwell Avenue (Introduced by Councilmember O'Neill on January 26, 2012).

Sarah Chiu, Development Planning Division, stated this is in the Fox Chase neighborhood of the City. The streets proposed to be stricken are not physically improved and are not open to public traffic. They are paper streets on the City Plan. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Mr. Synchron asked the streets are not legally opened.

Ms. Chiu replied yes.

Ms. Rogo Trainer asked is it on both sides.

Ms. Chiu replied yes.

Upon motion by Ms. Rogo Trainer, seconded by Ms. Ruiz, the City Planning Commission approved Streets Bill 120022.

- 10) Streets Bill 120050: Authorizing SEPTZ to construct, own, and maintain open-air passenger shelters and other encroachments on the public sidewalk at 33rd and Dauphin Streets and Ridge Avenue (Introduced by Councilmember Jones for Council President Clarke on February 2, 2012).

Ms. Chiu stated this is in the Strawberry Mansion section of the City. The existing shelter canopy will be demolished; and they will install an open air bus shelter on 33rd Street. The bus will come in and pull out. There will be open air passenger shelters at both southern and northern end of the bus shed building, fronting on Ridge Avenue. There will also be the installation of landscaping beds, signage for both directional and informational purposes, the stainless trash receptacles, painted steel bike racks, lighting fixtures, artwork, electrical conduit for future AVPA and security camera. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is approval.

Mr. Syrnick replied it will have landscaping, streetscaping and furniture improvements.

Judith Robinson said how do we use this shelter; we use this shelter from the elements.

Ms. Chiu replied there will be 2 new bus shelters on Ridge Avenue.

Ms. Robinson asked so this new shelter will be protection from the elements.

Mr. Jastrzab replied this will allow SEPTA to take up some of the sidewalk for their project.

Ms. Robinson replied there is a vendor there. Is there going to be a coffee shop there?

Ms. Chiu replied she hasn't heard of that.

Ms. Robinson replied they have met with the community once. Will they meet again?

Mr. Jastrzab replied you need to take that up with SEPTA.

Benita Cummings replied the community at large has not been heard of on this project. We have not had a proper opportunity to see this project. To have this Commission to push it along would be a lack of transparency and disrespect to the community at large. Their community needs to know how they are going to survive.

Mr. Syrnick asked what the timing of this is.

Ms. Chiu replied SEPTA is on a tight timeline. They are pushing it along.

Ms. Miller asked are you against the improvements.

Ms. Cummings replied there was no money, and then Chaka Fattah found money, and SEPTA is pushing it along.

Ms. Miller replied it is a \$2 million dollar project that should not be stopped.

Ms. Cummings replied we were told that there was nothing we could do.

Mr. Syrnick asked has there been any discussion with Council President Clarke or Councilmember Greenlee.

Ms. Cummings replied we were not allowed to have any input; there were a lot of signage.

Mr. Jastrzab asked did you have a Zoning Board of Adjustment hearing.

Ms. Cummings replied yes on January 26. We were not allowed to make comments unless we were against it.

Mr. Syrnick replied when you look at this proposal taking \$2 million dollars for streetscaping, landscaping, etc; it is really good.

Ms. Cummings replied SEPTA should not be pushing anything through without the community's input. They shouldn't be using our tax dollars without our input.

Ms. Ruiz replied SEPTA can do whatever they want without this Commission.

Ms. Cummings replied we should have the respect to have the opportunity to comment.

Mr. Jastrzab replied City Council hasn't met yet.

Ms. Cummings replied this Commission has the power to make SEPTA do something.

Mr. Eiding asked can we suggest that SEPTA meet with the community.

Mr. Bumb replied we are having our next meeting on March 6, 2012. We could send a message to them by tabling it.

Upon motion by Mr. Bumb, seconded by Mr. Eiding, the City Planning Commission tabled Streets Bill 120050.

- 11) Streets Bill 120085: Striking Cinnaminson Street from Smick to Mansion Streets, and reserving a utility right-of-way in the stricken Cinnaminson Street (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on February 9, 2012).

Ms. Chiu stated this is in the Roxborough section of the City. Cinnaminson Street is not physically improved and is not open to public traffic. Mansion Street is on the City Plan, but it is not opened. Silverwood Street is on the City Plan, but not legally opened. This area is zoned for R5 Residential; there are several vacant parcels that haven't been developed due to the challenges of the natural topography, and the lack of public infrastructure in the area. However, there is continued interest from the development community to make improvements here. Within the last six years, the Planning Commission has reviewed and approved two residential subdivisions on Cinnaminson Street. The City Planning Commission approved the preliminary plat for the 8-acre parcel at 201 Rear Parker Avenue in November 2005. The development was for a 48-unit twin-homes fronting on the cul-de-sac street (Cinnaminson Street), the development conforms to the existing zoning R5 classifications. However, the development was eventually stalled. On October 25, 2007, the attorney representing the Parker Avenue LP asked for extension of the plat approval. Ex-Councilmember Campbell introduced 3 Streets related Bills in 2007 to help the development to move forward, community and near residences objected the potential increased traffic. As the result, all of the Bills lapsed. The City Planning Commission approved the preliminary plat at the adjacent parcel of a 1.5 acre tract of land at 259 Cinnaminson Street in November 2007 and again in September 2009. This was for 7 single-family dwellings on land zoned for R5, when the developer demolished an existing

house. But this developer did not move forward. The City Planning Commission staff recommendation is disapproval. Here are the following reasons for the disapproval:

1. There are existing subdivision plans approved by the PCPC for this site (November 2005, and a request for extension of plat approval in October 2007);
2. The action of striking the legally open and on City Plan portion of Cinnaminson Street is against the Planning Commission's policy of creating parcels without public access.

Mr. Beauvais introduced Gregory Ventresca and Walt Lewis from Parker Ave LP. He stated in 2005 or even prior to this, we set a timeline for everyone to look at. In 2005 and going forward, we have been in a debate with the community. In 2009 the community met with his clients. They would still need access to Cinnaminson Street. They thought they would develop 78 units.

Mr. Ventresca replied the community was concerned with access coming from Cinnaminson. Upon further study, we found this was not feasible. We now are looking at Parker.

Mr. Beauvais replied we think they want to stop this project. We did ask the sponsor of the Bill for discussions. We do applaud the staff's recommendation for disapproval.

Mr. Syrnick asked if they could use Smick Street.

Mr. Ventresca replied we could and would. We purchased this in 2005. It was zoned "R5". We were involved and engaged with the community.

Mr. Lewis replied we had our preliminary plan approved and introduced by Streets and Services, and at the last minute it was tabled. When the new Mayor came into office, it died.

Mr. Lee asked if the alternate plan with this access has been approved by the community.

Mr. Ventresca this is not the alternate plan. We were taken aback by this Bill.

Mr. Beauvais stated there are a lot of residents here, and they are concerned with getting a lot of new traffic.

Upon motion by Ms. Rogo Trainer, seconded by Ms. Miller, the City Planning Commission disapproved Streets Bill 120085.

Mr. Syrnick adjourned the City Planning Commission Meeting of February 17, 2012 at 3:52pm.

SUMMARY

- 1) Approval of the Minutes of the January 17, 2012 meeting. Approved
- 2) Executive Director's Update.
- 3) *Information Only: Review of First Draft of Sign Controls Legislation*
(Presented by Eva Gladstein) Presented
- 4) *Information Only:* Presented
- 5) ZBA Case 17196: Development of a 12-story residential building containing retail and educational space at 2017-23 Chestnut Street (Presented by Larissa Klevan). Approved
- 6) Zoning Bill 120023: Remapping the area bounded by 2nd, 3rd, Chestnut, & Walnut Streets from "REC" Recreation to "C3" Commercial to permit the development of the National Center for the American Revolution (Introduced by Councilmember Squilla on 1-26-12; Presented by Larissa Klevan). Approved
- 7) Zoning Bill 120004: Remapping the area bounded by Torresdale Avenue, Megargee Street, Cottage Street, Placid Street, Frankford Avenue, & Tolbut Street (Introduced by Councilmember Henon on 1-26-12; Presented by Martin Gregorski). 45 day extension
- 8) Zoning Bill 120024: Remapping the area bounded by Snyder & Pattison Avenues, the Delaware River, & I-95 (Introduced by Councilmembers Johnson & Squilla on 1-26-12; Presented by Martin Gregorski). Approved
- 9) Streets Bill 120022: Striking Strahle Street from Pine Road to the Philadelphia-Montgomery County Line & Rockwell Avenue (Introduced by Councilmember O'Neill on 1-26-12; Presented by Sarah Chiu). Approved
- 10) Streets Bill 120050: Authorizing SEPTA to construct, own, & maintain open-air passenger shelters & other encroachments on the public sidewalk at 33rd & Dauphin Streets & Ridge Avenue (Introduced by Councilmember Jones for Council President Clarke on 2-2-12; Presented by Sarah Chiu). Tabled
- 11) Streets Bill 120085: Striking Cinnaminson Street from Smick to Mansion Streets, & reserving a utility right-of-way in the stricken Cinnaminson Street (Introduced by Councilmember Jones on 2-9-12; Presented by Sarah Chiu). Disapproved

"EXHIBIT 7"

Date: 2/21/2012

Philadelphia Planning Commission
1515 Arch St, 13th Floor
Philadelphia PA 19102
RE: Liddonfield zoning request

Dear Commissioner,

As you know, last year, City Planning, Upper Holmesburg, PHA, Elected Officials and many sister communities put forth a great deal of effort developing a revitalization plan for the Upper Holmesburg Community. That plan, part of City Planning's Phila2035 initiative, included several development strategies for the Liddonfield properties. Those strategies always included a zoning amendment for the Liddonfield parcel so it would balance with surrounding properties. Changing the current the zoning of the site from R-11A (new code: RM-2) to R-9A (new code: RSA-5) would help level the playing field in our residential area. We believe this change is paramount to the future well being of our community by providing concrete guidelines for any future housing initiative.

We also reviewed several non-conforming development possibilities including senior housing, assisted living and a sports complex. Since these development concepts would require an approved variance from the city and support from our community, we believe these zoning rules would provide enough regulation to maintain community continuity.

We respectfully request City Planning to approve and support Councilman Henon's proposed zoning amendment in Bill Number 120004.

Let me know if you have any questions and thank you for your time.

Sincerely,

Stanley S. Cywinski
President, UHCA

CC: Bob Henon Councilman 6th District.