

**CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
BOARD OF PENSIONS AND RETIREMENT
Meeting of October 27, 2016**

MINUTES

On October 27, 2016, Paula Weiss called the Regular Meeting of the Board of Pensions and Retirement to order at 9:05 a.m. in the Board's Conference Room.

Present: Paula Weiss
William Rubin
Brian Abernathy
Brian Albert
Pedro Rodriguez
Carol Stukes-Baylor
Ronald Stagliano
Brian Coughlin
Veronica Pankey
David Magaldi

Also Attending: Francis Bielli - Board of Pensions
Shamika Taliaferro – Board of Pensions
Ellen Berkowitz – Law Department
Jo Rosenberger Altman – Law Department
Brendan O'Rourke, Adam Coleman – Law Department
Christopher DiFusco, Bernard Buckley – Investment Unit
Tyrone Jordon, Kristyn Bair – Investment Unit
Ray Sweetland – Prudential
Kweku Obed, Dave Smith – Marquette
Pam McCue – Financial Investment News
Will Greene – Loop Capital

Ms. Weiss called the meeting to order and stated that the first order of business was the consideration of the Minutes of September 26, 2016. She stated that there is a correction on page 7; Carol Stukes-Pankey should be Carol Stukes-Baylor and the vote should read 6-0-1 as Ms. Pankey abstained. The corrections to the Minutes were made.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve the Minutes of September 26, 2016. Brian Coughlin seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

CONSIDERATION OF 118 PENSION APPLICATIONS AND 83 WITHDRAWAL APPLICATIONS

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Brian Coughlin seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

APPLICATION FOR SERVICE-CONNECTED DISABILITY BENEFITS

Case of Robin Reeves, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits – Plan “J”

This is an application submitted by Robin Reeves, former Dispatcher with the Philadelphia Parking Authority for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “J”.

According to Ms. Reeves, on July 17, 2015, she slipped on water on the bathroom floor and fell on her knee. When she tried to get up she slipped again falling on her knee causing severe pain. She further states that the next day she had pain in her lower back.

David Magaldi made a motion to deny. Pedro Rodriguez seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried unanimously 4-0-4.

Case of Octavia Mitchell-Adams, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan “Y”

This is an application submitted by Octavia Mitchell-Adams, former correctional officer, with the Department of Corrections for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Ms. Mitchell-Adams, on March 8, 2002 her right shoulder was struck by a steel door and the weight of an inmate. Ms. Mitchell-Adams states that she returned to limited duty following surgery to repair a injury to her shoulder.

Carol Stukes-Baylor made a motion to approve. Ronald Stagliano seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of Sara Hopkins, Deceased, Application for Survivorship Benefits for Medically Dependent Adult Child, Plan J

This is an application by Clinton Hopkins for survivorship benefits as the medically dependent adult child of Sara Hopkins.

Sara Hopkins, retired from the OSHA Department March 1, 1993. She elected option number 4, naming her sons as beneficiaries.

The Board reviewed documents that were submitted in support of Clinton Hopkins’ application.

Carol Stukes-Baylor made a motion to approve. Pedro Rodriguez seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of Jeffrey Carpenter, Request to Transfer Pension Membership from Plan Y to Plan J

Jeffrey Carpenter was originally hired under the Comprehensive Employment and Training Program (C.E.T.A.), effective 8/18/77 and his pension membership was assigned to Plan J. Following the Federal Government's advice that C.E.T.A. employment was not eligible for pension membership, his pension contributions were terminated and refunded.

He was laid off from C.E.T.A. employment effective 6/28/80.

He was rehired as a Correctional Officer Trainee and his pension membership was assigned to Plan Y. He purchased pension credit for his two years, five months and five days of prior C.E.T.A. employment.

His request to transfer his pension membership from Plan Y to Plan J was received on 9/2/16. An administrative denial was forwarded to him on 9/9/16. His timely appeal was received on 9/21/16.

Pedro Rodriguez made a motion to deny. David Magaldi seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried unanimously 7-0-1.

Case of Reda Kroma, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits – Plan “J”

This case was tabled at the August 25, 2016 Board meeting for further information from the Philadelphia Parking Authority (PPA) and September 26, 2016 for clarification on the report from MMRO. A revised report is attached.

Case History:

This is an application submitted by Reda Kroma, former Parking Enforcement Officer in the PPA for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “J”.

According to Ms. Kroma, on March 5, 2015 she was carrying heavy equipment for a long period and experienced sharp stabbing pain that was shooting up her arm. She also stated that she reported other injuries early in her employment.

Veronica Pankey made a motion to approve. There wasn't a second motion to approve.

Brian Abernathy made a motion to deny. David Magaldi seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried 4-1-3.

Case of Eunice L. Gillis, Application to Change Survivorship Option – Plan J

This case was denied at the board meeting held on February 25, 2016. A hearing panel was held on Wednesday, July 20, 2016. The case was left open for 60 days for Ms. Gillis to provide additional supporting documentation, which is attached.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

| | |
|----------------------|-------------------------|
| Carol Stukes-Baylor: | Approve |
| Ronald Stagliano: | Approve the application |
| David Magaldi: | Deny |

Case Summary:

This is an application by Eunice L. Gillis to change her Survivorship Option from #1 to #2.

Eunice L. Gillis retired from DROP effective September 17, 2015. She selected Survivorship Option #1 and named her fiancé Antonio T. Scott.

In a letter dated December 11, 2015, Ms. Gillis requested to change her survivorship option from #1 to #2 due to not clearly understanding the options presented at her appointment on October 2, 2015. Pension Program Administrator Stacey White administratively denied her request in a letter dated December 18, 2015. Ms. Gillis submitted a written appeal dated January 4, 2016.

At the retirement appointment, the counselor noted that Ms. Gillis selected Survivorship Option #4 at the DROP Seminar on September 16, 2011, however, there wasn't a marriage certificate in the file. A marriage certificate was requested at this time but she and Mr. Scott weren't legally married. Therefore, the other survivorship options were reviewed. Ms. Gillis wanted Mr. Scott to receive a survivorship benefit under Option 2, but was concerned about the \$20,000.00 decrease in her DROP total and ultimately she selected Option 1.

Mr. Rubin asked why Ms. Gillis is requesting a change to survivorship Option 2 instead of Option 4 if she is submitting documents to prove common law.

Ms. Stukes explained that when Ms. Gillis came to the hearing she stated she had a discussion with her husband/fiancé and she changed her mind and wanted to change it to Option 2. The panel explained that her pension would be offset and she would be losing money if she had Option 2.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Brian Coughlin seconded the motion.

The motion to approve tied 3-3-2. The Chair voted to deny making the vote 3-4-2.

The motion failed and is denied 3-4-2.

NEW BUSINESS

- **Executive Director's Report** – Mr. Bielli congratulated Carol Stukes-Baylor, Veronica Pankey, Ronald Stagliano and Brian Coughlin on their re-election to the Board. They will be sworn in at the Board meeting on November 17, 2016.
- There was a glitch with Dr. Weinerman submitting his contract documents which is the reason for the small amount of cases this month. The contract was signed last week so we will be seeing more cases at the November meeting.
- The Business and Education Travel reports for the 3rd Quarter of 2016 were placed in the folders.

FYI

- a. **Litigation Summary** – Ms. Berkowitz stated that Mr. Teppers' attorney filed their brief in Commonwealth Court. We filed our brief last week on Daley, oral argument is November 17, 2016 and the federal court matter is still stayed.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to adjourn. Pedro Rodriguez seconded the motion.

The meeting adjourned at 9:13 a.m.