

**CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
BOARD OF PENSIONS AND RETIREMENT
Meeting of November 14, 2019**

MINUTES

On November 14, 2019, Jacqueline Dunn called the Regular Meeting of the Board of Pensions and Retirement to order at 9:34 AM in the Board's Conference Room.

Present: Rob Dubow
Ronald Stagliano
Rebecca Rhynhart
Kellan White
Christopher Rupe
Marsha Greene-Jones
Carol Stukes-Baylor
Brian Coughlin
Veronica Pankey
Sharolyn Murphy
Marcell Pratt
Francois Dutchie
Rebecca Rhynhart

Also Attending: Francis Bielli, Shamika Taliaferro, Bill Rubin – Board of Pensions
Ellen Berkowitz, Adam Coleman – Law Department
Christopher DiFusco, James Cousounis – Investment Unit
Bernard Buckley Kristyn Bair– Investment Unit
Brett Warren, Anu Patel - Cheiron
Pam Cox - Financial Investment News
Will Green – Loop Capital
Arnold West – GIA Partners
Jeff Francis, Brad Nyce, Bina Kumar – Nationwide
Greg Leonberger, Kweku Obed – Marquette
Matt Coyne – Torry Cove
Laura McCrystal – Philadelphia Inquirer
Keith Graham – Bergamot Asset Management
Kass Everett, David Robb – Janney Montgomery Scott LLC

Jacqueline Dunn called the meeting to order and stated that the first order of business was the Consideration of the Minutes of September 26, 2019.

Brian Coughlin made a motion to approve the Minutes of September 26, 2019. Kellan White seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

CONSIDERATION OF 208 PENSION APPLICATIONS AND 122 WITHDRAWAL APPLICATIONS

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Sharolyn Murphy seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

APPLICATION FOR SERVICE-CONNECTED DISABILITY BENEFITS

Case of Yolanda M. Anderson, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Yolanda Anderson, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Ms. Anderson, on August 8, 2015 while working a traffic detail she pushed a barricade to the right of the highway to allow a construction vehicle access when she injured her back. Ms. Anderson states that on September 4, 2016 while working the "Made in America" detail she strained her lower back due to long periods of uninterrupted standing.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Carol Stukes-Baylor seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 6-2.

Case of Brian Beaudet, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Brian Beaudet, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Beaudet, on April 23, 2016 while responding to a large fight he exited his police vehicle, planting his left foot to run when left knee buckled causing him to fall. Mr. Beaudet states that he continued toward the altercation under severe pain and finished his tour of duty. Mr. Beaudet further states that at home he noticed swelling, redness, and felt a burning sensation which increased throughout the night.

Brian Coughlin made a motion to approve Carol Stukes-Baylor seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Mark Brown, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Mark Brown, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Brown, on January 21, 2018 while climbing the rear stairs leading up from the male locker room, he injured his hand. Mr. Brown states that he tripped on the stairs, braced for the impact, and bent his fingers backward causing injury.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Sharolyn Murphy seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of Dennis Carey, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Dennis Carey, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Carey, on March 1, 2015 while exiting his police vehicle he slipped and fell on the ice causing injury.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion. The motion to deny failed 3-5.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Allen Harmon, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Allen Harmon, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Harmon, on December 14, 2015 while working with a dog during K-9 training he injured his shoulder.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion. The motion tied 4-4. Rob Dubow voted to break the tie.

The motion to deny carried 5-4.

Case of Michael Pazdan, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits – Plan B

This is an application submitted by Michael Pazdan, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “B”.

According to Mr. Pazdan, on November 23, 2015 while responding to a disturbance at a business (bike shop) the customer became irate and refused to leave the building. Once outside, Mr. Pazdan states that the customer became combative and resisted arrest. While attempting to handcuff the customer his foot became jammed under a bike rack while his forward momentum propelled him forward causing the injury to his foot.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of Kimberly Reitano, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan “B”

This is an application submitted by Kimberly Reitano, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “B”.

According to Ms. Reitano, on September 28, 2012 while she and her partner were breaking up an after-school fight at George Washington High School she sustained multiple injuries to her weapon hand.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Carol Stukes-Baylor seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried unanimously 8-0.

Case of Lisa Mychack-Wade, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan “B”

This is an application submitted by Lisa Mychack-Wade, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “B”.

According to Ms. Mychack-Wade, on January 14, 2015 while responding to a call, man wanted on a warrant she sustained multiple injuries. Ms. Mychack-Wade states that when she arrived at the location of the “offender” he was hiding in the attic (ceiling) and fell through, striking her body while sheetrock debris rained down striking her in the face and head.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion. The motion to deny failed 3-5.

Veronica Pankey made a motion to approve. Ronald Stagliano seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Scott L. Wallace, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Scott Wallace, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Wallace, on December 25, 2015 while responding to a call of a house disturbance he fell through a rotted section of the porch deck. He stated that as he was wedged between the porch deck and the central air conditioning unit, he sustained multiple injuries.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Carol Stukes-Baylor seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Steven Wilson, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Steven Wilson, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Wilson, on April 25, 2014 while returning from delivering mail to the 15th district he stumbled on the stairs. Mr. Wilson states that he grabbed the hand rail twisting his knee in the process. He continued to work through the pain, responded to another call, and reported the incident to his supervisor.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion. The motion to deny failed 3-5.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Carl M. Ford, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan "J"

This is an **administrative** application submitted by Carl Ford, former Heavy Equipment Operator I with the Streets Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "J".

According to Mr. Ford, on May 6, 2015 while turning the buckle on the trash truck, he was struck on his right hand. Mr. Ford states that on January 16, 2018 while dumping debris from the trash truck he attempted to loosen the bucket and strained his entire side and lower back.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion. The motion to deny failed 3-5.

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Carol Stukes-Baylor seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Terrina Brown, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan "Y"

This is an application submitted by Terrina Brown, former Youth Detention Counselor Supervisor with Department of Human Services for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y".

According to Ms. Brown, on July 19, 2017 while attempting to separate five male residents from physically assaulting another male resident a struggle ensued and Ms. Brown suffered multiple injuries.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion. The motion to deny failed 3-5.

Carol Stukes-Baylor made a motion to approve. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Najah Williams, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan "Y"

This is an application submitted by Najah Williams, former Correctional Officer with the Department of Corrections for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y".

According to Ms. Williams, on April 28, 2016 while attempting to stand up from her desk she struck her knee and sustained multiple injuries.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion. The motion to deny failed 3-5.

Veronica Pankey made a motion to approve. Kellan White seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Phillip E. Brown, Deceased, Application for Ordinary Death Benefits

This is a request by Shakirah Brown, daughter of Phillip E. Brown, on behalf of herself and her twin sister, Shamirah, to make application for Ordinary Death Benefits.

Phillip E. Brown worked as an Equipment Operator 1 for the Streets Department with a total of 17 years, 5 months and 8 days of credited service with the City.

On February 23, 2011, Mr. Brown designated his daughters, Rasheedah Melchor and Marcella Bratcher, as his beneficiaries.

Mr. Brown applied for DROP on August 1, 2017. His official DROP start date was November 13, 2017.

Mr. Brown died as an active employee on October 6, 2019.

His designated beneficiaries, Rasheedah Melchor and Marcella Bratcher have been contacted by the Board to begin the application process for Ordinary Death Benefits.

Shakirah Brown has submitted a letter to Executive Director Francis X. Bielli requesting that she and her sister, Shamirah, also be granted Ordinary Death Benefits.

Carol Stukes-Baylor made a motion to approve. Brian Coughlin seconded the motion. The motion to approve failed 3-5.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Green-Jones seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried 6-2.

Case of Derek Everage, Request to Appeal beyond the 30 day deadline to Purchase Pension Credit – Plan Y

On June 6, 2019 Derek Everage's application for purchase of prior service was received by the Board of Pensions. Mr. Everage applied for purchase of his time with CSX.

On June 8, 2019, he separated from City employment.

An administrative denial was sent to his home address by Certified and First Class mail on August 8, 2019. He was given a deadline of September 9, 2019 to appeal.

Mr. Everage's appeal was received on September 24, 2019.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion.

The motion to deny carried 7-1.

OLD BUSINESS

Case of Martin Moskowitz, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits – Plan D

This case was **denied** at the Board meeting held January 28, 2016. A hearing panel was held on Wednesday, July 24, 2019.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Marsha Greene-Jones:	Denied
Carol Stukes-Baylor:	Approved
Kellan White:	Denied

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Martin Moskowitz, former police officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “D”.

According to Mr. Moskowitz he was rear-ended in two separate car accidents; October 24, 2000 which occurred on the southbound lanes of I-95 and June 27, 2012 while at a stop sign.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion. The vote tied 4-4. Rob Dubow voted to deny and break the tie.

The motion to deny carried 5-4.

Case of Robert L. Ross, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits - Plan Y

This case was **denied** at the Board meeting held October 16, 2017. A hearing panel was held on Wednesday, July 24, 2019.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Marsha Greene-Jones:	Denied
Carol Stukes-Baylor:	Approved
Kellan White:	Denied

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Robert Ross, former HVAC mechanic with the Water Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Mr. Ross, on May 21, 2015 while he was climbing out of a gator (golf cart) type vehicle he felt severe lower back pain on his right side.

Sharolyn Murphy made a motion to deny. Marsha Greene-Jones seconded the motion. The vote tied 4-4. Rob Dubow voted to deny and break the tie.

The motion to deny carried 5-4.

Case of Terry Bond, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits – Plan B

This case was **denied** at the Board meeting held on July 26, 2018. A hearing panel was held on Wednesday, August 28, 2019.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Carol Stukes-Baylor:	Approve
Marsha Greene-Jones:	Deny
Veronica Pankey:	Approve

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Terry Bond, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Bond, in 2013 he and another police officer were tasked with transporting the remains of a 19 year old shooting victim to the medical examiner's office. He also describes an altercation he had with a mentally ill male patient during which his knees were injured.

Carol Stukes-Baylor made a motion to approve. Veronica Pankey seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Robert Urwin, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits – Plan B

This case was **denied** at the June 28, 2018 Board meeting. A hearing panel was held on Wednesday, August 28, 2019.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Carol Stukes-Baylor:	Approve
Marsha Greene-Jones:	Deny
Veronica Pankey:	Approve

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Robert Urwin, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Urwin, on June 1, 2014 while transporting a prisoner who was under the influence of a controlled substance the prisoner resisted, twisted, and pulled him causing multiple injuries during the struggle.

Brian Coughlin made a motion to approve. Ronald Stagliano seconded the motion.

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

NEW BUSINESS

Executive Director's Report – Mr. Bielli stated that the State and annual audits are continuing.

The Third Quarter Business and Education Travel reports were distributed to Board members.

- Business & Education Travel Requests
 1. 13th Annual PAPERS Fall Workshop, Pittsburgh, PA, November 20-21, 2019
 2. Plan Sponsor Educational Institute, Key West, FL, January 21-24, 2020
 3. NCPERS Legislative Conference, Washington, DC, January 26-28, 2020

Ronald Stagliano made a motion to approve. Kellan White seconded the motion.

The motion to approve the Business & Education Travel Requests carried unanimously 8-0.

Litigation Summary – Ms. Berkowitz stated there are four cases in Common Pleas court and two case in Commonwealth court. The Daley case (disqualification), awaiting scheduling order.

Kellan White made a motion to adjourn. Christopher Rupe seconded the motion.

The meeting adjourned at 9:50 AM.