

**ADDRESS: 4221 PINE ST**

Proposal: Legalize replacement of slate mansard with brown asphalt shingles

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Gina and Thomas Ross

Applicant: Gina Ross

History: 1900; William Kimball, developer

Individual Designation: None

District Designation: Southeast Spruce Hill Historic District, Contributing, 7/12/2024

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

**OVERVIEW:** This application proposes legalizing the removal of slate and replacement with GAF Timberline HDZ fiberglass asphalt shingles in a brown color on the mansard at 4221 Pine Street. This twin property is part of a larger development row on the 4200 block of Pine Street, all of which historically featured slate mansard roofs. The properties on the block were listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places in July 2024 as part of the Southeast Spruce Hill Historic District, meaning that any slate mansard replacement prior to written notice being sent to property owners was not reviewed by the Historical Commission.

In November 2025, a community member contacted the Historical Commission to inform it of the recent replacement of slate with brown fiberglass asphalt shingles at this property. The Department of Licenses and Inspections issued a violation for the roofing work without a building permit, prompting this request for legalization from the property owner.

According to the National Park Service's Preservation Brief #29, slate roofs have a lifespan of 60 to 125 years. Section 6.10.c.4 of the Commission Rules & Regulations states that "the staff shall review and may approve without referral to the Architectural Committee and the Commission permit applications proposing the replacement of slate roofing materials, with the exception of mansards, turrets, and other character-defining features, provided the severity of deterioration requires replacement and the substitute materials closely approximate the color and shape of the historic slate roofing materials." The Historical Commission staff acknowledges that the slate on the mansard reached the end of its lifespan, but it would have been unable to administratively approve a brown fiberglass asphalt shingle as a replacement, had this application been submitted as a building permit application for review in advance of the work commencing.

**SCOPE OF WORK:**

- Legalize replacement of slate on mansard with brown asphalt shingles.

**STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:**

- *Standard 6: Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*
  - The brown GAF Timberline HDZ fiberglass asphalt shingles do not match the old in design, color, texture, or materials. This application fails to satisfy Standard 6.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Denial, pursuant to Standard 6.



**Figure 1. 4221 Pine Street mansard roof, July 2025.**



**Figure 2. 4221 Pine Street mansard roof, December 2022.**





Figure 3. 4221 Pine Street with new shingles installed, November 2025.

4221 Pine St.  
Philadelphia Historical Commission  
December 2025/January 2026





**Figure 4. 4221 Pine Street with new shingles installed, December 2025.**





**Figure 5. 4221 Pine Street with new shingles installed, December 2025.**



## Historic Property – Approval Documentation Form

This form must accompany any eCLIPSE application for a historic property that does not require drawings.

### Project Address & Scope

Applicant: Enter the location of work and scope for the permit. Then email form to Historical Commission staff at **preservation@phila.gov**

State the legal address of the historically designated property and describe the proposed work in detail. Attach additional sheets if needed.

1

Address: 4221 PINE STREET, PHILADELPHIA PA 19104

Project Scope: INSTALLATION OF GAF TIMBERLINE HDZ ARCHITECTURAL ASPHALT ROOF

#### TASK LIST

1. Installation of a comprehensive tarping system to collect all waste materials to be deposited into onsite dumpsters
2. Removal & disposal of all existing shingles, flashing and underlayment
3. Installation of all new white aluminum drip edge on roof perimeter, step flashing on chimney(s) and pipe collars on all roof extrusions
4. Installation of all new GAF WeatherWatch® Ice & Water Barrier Underlayment on all roof eaves and valleys
5. Installation of all new GAF Synthetic Underlayment on remaining roof areas
6. Installation of all new GAF Timberline® HDZ Architectural Asphalt Shingles (Color TBD)
7. Installation of all new GAF Timberline ProStart Asphalt Starter Shingles
8. Installation of new GAF Cobra® Ridge Vent at roof peak for proper attic ventilation and air flow
9. Final cleanup, inspection & review with homeowner

#### NOTES

1. Contractor is a GAF Master-Elite Roofing Contractor providing you with a 25-Year Workmanship Warranty directly through GAF, along with a 50-Year Non-Prorated Material Warranty on your new roof system.

### Applicant Declaration & Signature

By submitting this form, the undersigned hereby agrees to comply with all conditions selected by PHC staff below. Failure to comply may result in processing delays or permit revocation.

Name: Gina M. Ross (please print) Title: Owner

Signature: [Signature] Date: 12/3/25

### PHC Conditions (for PHC staff use only)

Each selected condition is a requirement for this permit application.

Conditions must be complied with before issuance of any Certificate of Approval or Certificate of Occupancy.

Where review of shop drawings or a field sample is required the responsible party must coordinate review with Historical Commission staff by emailing **preservation@phila.gov**.

2

#### Restrictions & Limitations:

- ☐ No exterior work permitted as part of this permit.
- ☐ No work to the windows and / or exterior doors as part of this permit.
- ☐ No work to the front façade as part of this permit.

#### PHC Staff Review of the following required for final approval:

- ☐ Window shop drawings
- ☐ Door shop drawings
- ☐ Shutter shop drawings
- ☐ Roof specifications and sample
- ☐ Cornice details and shop drawings
- ☐ Brick, stone or other masonry sample required in the field
- ☐ Masonry pointing sample required in the field
- ☐ Masonry cut-out sample required in the field
- ☐ Masonry cleaning sample required in the field
- ☐ Paint removal sample (3 ft x 3 ft) required in the field
- ☐ Signage, awning structure and / or light fixture details.
- ☐ \_\_\_\_\_ specifications.
- ☐ \_\_\_\_\_ to be salvaged and re-installed.
- ☐ Other:

### Philadelphia Historical Commission Approval (for PHC staff use only)

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Approval Date: \_\_\_\_\_