ADDRESS: 4370-74 MAIN ST

Proposal: Construct two-story addition

Review: In Concept

Owner: Laurel Holdings Group

Applicant: Joseph Serratore, Joseph Serrator & Company Architects.

History: 1900, 4370 Main Street, Oliver S. Keely & Co.; 1930, 4372-74 Main Street

Individual Designation: None.

District Designation: Main Street Manayunk Historic District, 12/14/1983

Staff Contact: Josh Schroeder, joshua.schroeder@phila.gov

## BACKGROUND:

This application proposes to construct a two-story addition, to add six residential units, to 4370-74 Main Street, a one-story commercial property. The properties at 4370 and 4372-74 Main Street have been consolidated. The building at 4370 Main Street is classified as contributing to the Main Street Manayunk National Register Historic District while the buildings at 4372-74 classified as "intrusions" in the district. Two floors would be added to the one-story combined building. The application does not propose any changes to the existing front façade of 4370 Main Street. The application does not specify how the large front parapet above the storefront would be incorporated into the addition.

The combined building's rear façade faces the Schuylkill River Trail with substantial public visibility. Significant changes are proposed to the existing rear façade. The application proposes a completely new fenestration pattern to align the four window bays proposed for the second and third floors above, suggesting infill of existing windows and/or expansion of window openings.

## SCOPE OF WORK:

 Construct two-story addition on top of 4370-74 Main Street and alter front and rear façades.

## STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- Standard 2: The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alterations of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
  - The proposal maintains the historic storefront's features, satisfying Standard 2, but the proposal lacks detail regarding how the addition interacts with the wall above the cornice on the front façade.
- Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not
  destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the
  property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the
  historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the
  integrity of the property and its environment.
  - The proposal maintains the contributing property's historic storefront and other features. The proposed massing, scale, and general appearance appear compatible with the district's character, but more detail is required for proposed materials and color.
  - Historically, the building served as commercial office space, while other properties in the Main Street Manayunk Historic District facing the river had

- similar or industrial appearances in the rear. The proposed alterations to the existing rear façade may detract from the historic character of the district.
- Standard 10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.
  - The proposed addition maintains the appearance of the front façade, though more detail on the interaction between the second-floor addition and front parapet on the contributing building is needed to determine if the application satisfies Standard 10.

The Main Street Manayunk review criteria restated in the Historical Commission's Rules & Regulations include:

- Section 6.9.b.4: Storefronts: Original existing storefronts contributing to the character of the district shall be retained and repaired. New storefronts shall be compatible with the proportion, form and materials of the original building.
  - The application proposes no changes to the storefront on the contributing portion of the building.
- Section 6.9.b.5: Design: Additions, alterations and new construction shall be designed so as to be compatible in scale, building materials, and texture, with contributing buildings in the historic district.
  - The proposed massing, scale, and general appearance appear compatible with the district's character, but more detail is required for proposed materials and color.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Approval of the overall size, massing, and general design of the proposed additions, but denial based on the need for additional details about materials, colors, finishes, and the proposed alterations to the rear façade, pursuant to Standards 2, 9, and 10, and Main Street Manayunk review criteria.









