

**PUBLIC COMMENT FOR
4024-34 APALOGEN ROAD**



Nomination of 4030 (4024-34) Apalogen Road, Phila, PA

From Grace, Janet <Janet.Grace@jll.com>

Date Mon 10/13/2025 1:20 PM

To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>

Cc Janet Grace <imjanetgrace@gmail.com>; David.Breiner@jefferson.edu <David.Breiner@jefferson.edu>; Steven Peitzman <peitzmansj@gmail.com>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

To Whom it May Concern,

- I am the owner of 3419 -23 W School House Lane which was the first Modernist Home to be placed on the Philadelphia Historic Register.
- I founded, along with 9 Board Members, the DOCOMOMO Greater Philadelphia Chapter to preserve Modernist Buildings in the Greater Philadelphia Region.
- I wrote the successful Historic Nominations for my home (in 2009), the Fleer House (a Modernist Home in Chestnut Hill, in 2011) and the East Falls Library in 2010.
- I coauthored the successful Historic Nomination of the PSFS Building on Lehigh Avenue.
- In my role as a member of the National Society of Colonial Dames in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, I have been actively involved in the preservation of Stenton, the ancestral home of James Logan.
- In my role as a member of the National Society of Colonial Dames in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, I have been actively involved in the preservation of the Marion Cruger Coffin Garden located at 1630 Latimer Street, in Philadelphia.
- In my role as a past member of the Colonial Dames of America, I have been involved in the preservation of Lemon Hill Mansion.
- My ancestor, Silas Crispin, was on the ship "Welcome" with William Penn in 1682 and was one of the first 100 landowners in Philadelphia. Silas Crispin's father-in-law, Thomas Holmes, was the first Surveyor General of Philadelphia and laid out the distinctive grid pattern of streets with the Center Square and 4 surrounding Squares, which still exists today.

I am writing in support of the Nomination of 4030 (4024-34) Apalogen Road, which is my near neighbor and is worth preserving. As a woman who started practicing in the field of architecture 40 years ago, I can appreciate the fortitude of the architect of this wonderful home, who was also a woman. At the time that Ms. Fleisher designed and built the house, her contemporary, Marion Cruger Coffin a landscape architect who graduated from MIT in 1904, stated that to be a woman in what was considered to be a male career was "professional and matrimonial suicide". Women at that time were discouraged from having careers and only the most talented were able to succeed under very challenging situations and discrimination. 4030 (4024-34) Apalogen Road is certainly great example of Modernist architecture which is significant for the reasons stated in the Nomination.

We would be well served as a community to keep this wonderful home in the fabric of our East Falls Neighborhood, as treasures such as this home contribute to Philadelphia's recognition as the only UNESCO World Heritage City in the United States.

We appreciate any consideration that can be given to placing this home on the Historic Register.

Warm Regards,

Janet Kimbleton Grace
267-565-8605



[One of the 2025 World's Most Ethical Companies®](#)

Jones Lang LaSalle

For more information about how JLL processes your personal data, please click [here](#)

This email is for the use of the intended recipient(s) only. If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender immediately and then delete it. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not keep, use, disclose, copy or distribute this email without the author's prior permission. We have taken precautions to minimize the risk of transmitting software viruses, but we advise you to carry out your own virus checks on any attachment to this message. We cannot accept liability for any loss or damage caused by software viruses. The information contained in this communication may be confidential and may be subject to the attorney-client privilege. If you are the intended recipient and you do not wish to receive similar electronic messages from us in the future then please respond to the sender to this effect.



Outlook

4024-34 Apalogen Road (Tulipwood) Historic Designation Nomination

From meggreenfield1 <meggreenfield1@gmail.com>

Date Tue 10/14/2025 12:51 PM

To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

I am a neighbor on Apalogen Rd. I support the nomination of 4024-4034 Apalogen for historic designation.

The property is unique in many ways and significant as it was designed, built and lived in by Elizabeth Fleisher, the first woman architect to be licensed in Philadelphia.

Elizabeth Fleisher also designed (with then partner Gabriel Roth) the Parkway House at 22nd Street and Pennsylvania Avenue. Her firm also designed the modern nurses' residence for the Woman's Medical College of Pennsylvania on Henry Avenue. Few of her other buildings in Philadelphia survive.

The house is quite livable and deserving of preservation. It contributes to the unique character of Apalogen Rd. which has a number of architecturally unique homes, including mine designed, built and lived in for many years by Henry Churchill, also an architect.

Thank you for your consideration.

Marjorie Greenfield
4107-11 Apalogen Rd

Sent from my Galaxy



4024-34 Apologen Road East Falls

From jonathan berger <savantriver@gmail.com>

Date Tue 10/21/2025 11:27 AM

To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>; Steven Peitzman <peitzmansj@gmail.com>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear Preservation Philadelphia,

As a resident of nearby Timber Lane who lives in a mid century modern home designed and built in the same time period as 4024-34 Apologen Road , I write to add to the public comment regarding the proposed demolition and or certification as historically significant of 4024-30 Apologen Road also known as Tulipwood. Tulipwood as documented in the formal nomination application submitted by the East Falls Historical Society was designed by my maternal grandmother Elizabeth Fleisher and landscaped by my grandfather Horace Fleisher.

The qualifications and achievements of both my grandparents are well known in the broader American and international design community. It is not my intention to review this meritorious and distinguished service but rather to place incontext my lifelong association with Tulipwood and the blessed memory of my beautiful grandparents and parents.

What is a house if not a collection of memories and reflections of loved ones passed? As I walked through the place during the realtor's open house I recalled formative events in my life. The most important occurred in the small study adjacent to the main entry and looking out over the deck. It was here that my grandmother Elizabeth, known to me as Granny, set me on my life course of the study of ecology, landscape interpretation through writing and drawing , and environmental planning.

Between June 1967 and October 1969 I served as a Peace Corps volunteer in Burkina Faso, West Africa. Here amidst the harsh clipped beauty of the savannah, where trees were half a mile apart, and wind blown grasses dominated the land, I dug water wells and sold potatoes and mangos through a co-op organized by the local farmers. Upon my return to Philadelphia I searched for a profession. Through reading I became acquainted with the ideas of ecology as broadly applied to humans and their environment. I set myself on a course to acquire and read major works in the field.

At that time Granny was still alive and I regularly visited with her for lunch and just to sit and chat about our days together from when she taught me to play Scrabble at the age of 6 through my canoe guiding days as a college student and into the current time. At one of these meetings a fateful moment arrived and she said, "Your mother tells me you are reading books on ecology." I replied, "Yes Granny I am and I wonder if there is a career there for me?" At that moment she reached up onto the shelf, pulled a book off, and said, "You had better read this one." She gave me her copy of *Design With Nature* by Ian McHarg of the University of Pennsylvania. I read it that night and a day later went for an interview at the Department of Landscape Architecture and Regional Planning at the Graduate School of Fine Arts of the University of Pennsylvania. I was there for fifteen years as a student and faculty member.

Back to the recent past and the open house. I stood in the corner of that study as memories of that moment and her devotion washed over me.

Of course I was not the only person she helped through her life in that house. From a young age I recall she hosted post war survivors of Auschwitz - I saw the tattoos and later refugees from the failed Hungarian revolution.

Sincerely yours

Dr. Jon Berger
4101 TimberLane
Philadelphia PA 19129
2679721220



Halt the demolition of 4024-34 Apalogen

From Chris McKenzie <cmm832@gmail.com>
Date Mon 10/27/2025 11:28 PM
To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>
Cc Steven Peitzman <peitzmansj@gmail.com>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

To Whom this concerns,

We are in favor of saving a historical landmark in East Falls and oppose the demolition of 4024-34 Apalogen Rd.

We live in East Falls.

On the basis of, and in rebuttal to the Owners Opposition Statement:

Owners Statement #4:

At the time of Owners' purchase, the Property was vacant and the prior owners had already imposed significant changes to the Building's exterior in preparation for its listing for sale in 2024, including painting the entire exterior black. Images of the Building before and after the application of exterior black paint are included in Exhibit C.

Our Response:

While the previous owner did paint the exterior black, that cosmetic alteration is superficial and reversible. Paint color does not diminish the building's architectural significance or historical integrity. Restoration to a historically accurate finish can easily be accomplished under the guidance of the Philadelphia Historical Commission.

Owners Statement #5:

Owners, who own Philadelphia-based Safran Turney Hospitality, are long-time residents and investors in Philadelphia, specifically in the Gayborhood/Midtown neighborhoods where they own and operate several stores and restaurants, including Barbuzzo, Bud & Marilyn's, Little Nonna's, Darling Jack's Tavern, Open House, Verde, Marcie Blaine, and He Said, She Said.

Our Response:

Preserving this property is about protecting the neighborhood's shared history, not opposing progress. Too many of Philadelphia's irreplaceable homes and structures have been lost to modern redevelopment. Allowing demolition here would erase yet another tangible link to the character of East Falls, substituting authenticity with convenience and short-term gain.

Owners Statement #6:

Seeking to be closer to William Penn Charter School, where their young daughter attends school, Owners purchased the Property in June 2024 with the intention to take down the existing house and build a new house for use as their family residence. For health-related reasons, Owners' require, and sought to build, a home with a primary bedroom, bathroom, and home office on the ground level, with minimal steps needed to enter the home.

Our Response:

The existing midcentury structure already accommodates single-level living, with 5 bedrooms, 3 bathrooms, and additional rooms situated on the same floor. Its design inherently supports accessibility needs without requiring demolition. With thoughtful renovation, the home can meet modern health or mobility requirements while retaining its historical value and original character.

Thank you to the East Falls Historical Society for stepping in, and advocating for the correct designation for this home.

--

Drs. Chris and Emma McKenzie
3301 W Queen Ln.

To the Members of the Philadelphia Historical Commission:

We are writing to express Jefferson's Center for the Preservation of Modernism's strong support for the nomination of *Tulipwood* (4024-34 Apalogen Road), for historic designation. This home is an integral part of the mid-century modern enclave that defines the architectural character of the Apalogen Road community, a rare and cohesive collection of mid-century modern residences, embodying the optimism, craftsmanship, and innovation of their era.

Tulipwood is particularly significant as a residence designed by Elizabeth Hirsh Fleisher, the first registered woman architect in Philadelphia and the fourth in Pennsylvania, and one of her last surviving residential works. Fleisher's contributions to the architectural profession and to the city's built environment are invaluable, yet far too few of her designs remain standing. The house also features a remarkable fireplace wall designed by Wharton Esherick, the renowned artist and craftsman. The loss of *Tulipwood* would represent the erasure of a pioneering woman's legacy in Philadelphia's architectural history, in addition to the destruction of an important architectural artifact.

Preservation of the Apalogen Road enclave is essential to maintaining both the physical and historical integrity of this distinctive neighborhood. Each home contributes to the neighborhood's sense of place, while exhibiting compatible modifications and additions. Protecting *Tulipwood* through historic designation likewise will keep open many options for the future of the site, including construction of an addition to the house to accommodate current and future needs. Acknowledging the importance of *Tulipwood* through designation will preserve this shared heritage of this special place and serve as a tangible reminder for future generations of a period when architecture embraced both modern design principles and deep respect for natural surroundings.

The East Falls Historical Society's nomination offers a thorough documentation of *Tulipwood*'s historical and architectural value. We urge the Commission to approve this nomination to ensure that this irreplaceable piece of Philadelphia's architectural and cultural history is not lost to demolition.

Thank you for your consideration and for your continued dedication to protecting the city's historic fabric.

Sincerely,

Suzanne Singletary, Ph.D.

Associate Dean, New Academic Initiatives and Graduate Studies,
College of Architecture and the Built Environment, Jefferson
Director, M.S. Historic Preservation &
Center for the Preservation of Modernism

Barbara Klinkhammer, Dipl.-Ing., RA (DEU)

Dean and Professor, College of Architecture & the Built Environment (CABE), Jefferson
Director - SMARTlab@Jefferson; President - Architectural Research Center Consortium
UNESCO Co-Chair Smart, Healthy and Learning Cities

David Breiner, Ph.D.

Associate Dean and Associate Professor, History and Theory, Historic Preservation, CABE,
Jefferson

Jennifer M. Arnoldi, AIA,

Associate, Mills + Schnoering Architects

Nina Rappaport

Director, Vertical Urban Factory
Publications Director, Yale School of Architecture

Michael Schade, AIA LEED AP BD+C

Principal, ATKIN OLSHIN SCHADE ARCHITECTS, INC.

Grace Ong Yan, PhD

Assistant Professor, History & Theory, Archival Research, Modernism, Historic Preservation

Kelly Sutherlin McCleod, FAIA

Kelly Sutherland McCleod Architects, Inc., Long Beach, CA

Paul Savidge, JD

Chief Legal Officer, Spark Therapeutics, Inc.

Robert A. Douglas AIA, NCARB, LEED AP BD+C, CPHD

Partner and Sustainability Program Manager
VOITH & MACTAVISH ARCHITECTS LLP
Architecture, Preservation, Planning, & Interiors

Kevin T. King, Jr., Assoc. AIA

Andrew Hart, NCARB, AIA, NOMA

Philadelphia Historical Commission:

I am in support of the designation of 4024-4034 Apalogen Road to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

An affidavit states that "Owners purchased the 2.37 acre Property in June 2024 for \$1,850,000." The PHC staff note that, "The current property owner purchased this property and the adjacent vacant property at 4100-04 Apalogen Road in June 2024." The 4100-04 Apalogen Road parcel is about 1.264 acres. Both properties are on the same deed with the purchase price of \$1,850,000. The full purchase price is therefore not attributable to the parcel at 4024-34.

The owner's affidavit also states that "Between June 2024 and September 2025, Owners spent more than Four Hundred Thirty-Six Thousand Dollars (\$436,000) for the studies, consultants, and designs described in Exhibit D and summarized in Section 2."

Section 2 lists Site Survey, Schematic Design, Septic Design and Soil Testing, Landscape Plans, Conceptual Stormwater Management Plans, Septic Design, Performance of Standard Penetration Test, Final Design, Issuance of Septic Design Permit from the City Health Department, Act 537 Exemption Application. No costs are specifically identified for these items although the owners included an arborist's recommendation to remove dead, diseased and malformed specimens for a cost of \$58,500. Many of the items listed in Section 2 pertain to a new septic system for this property in the Wissahickon Watershed.

New owners would want to remove dead and diseased trees and have a new, functioning septic system. These expenses do not justify demolition. Please don't demolish Tulipwood, add on if needed.

Thank you,

Nancy Pontone
East Falls resident
3428 Midvale Ave.
Philadelphia, PA 19129

11/11/2025

To whom it may concern:

As a near neighbor, I am writing in support of historic designation for "Tulipwood", which is located at 4030 Apalogen Road. This home was designed and lived in by a very important architect of her day, Elizabeth Hirsh Fleisher, in 1954. I have walked by the home many times. It has always been kept in very good condition by the previous owner to my knowledge. Typical of a mid-century modern home, the vistas are at the back of the home with numerous windows looking out on nature. Until recently the home boasted of a Wharton Esherick designed fireplace which has been sold off. Even without this design element, the home remains a beautifully situated dwelling on Apalogen Road which is known for its many mid-century homes in East Falls. Please consider historic designation.

Sincerely, Patricia Cheek

4141 Timber Lane

Philadelphia, PA 19129

4030 Apalogen Road

From Henry Donner <hdonner@kanghaggerty.com>

Date Wed 11/12/2025 3:52 PM

To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

I am writing to oppose the designation of historical certification for this property. Although I am aware of the significance of Elizabeth's Fleisher's successful career as a female architect and her collaboration with Gabriel Roth, 4030 Apalogen Road does not come within the purview of her landmark post-World War II design for the Parkway House at 22nd Street and Pennsylvania Avenue. Notwithstanding the recommendation of the East Falls Historical Society, having been in the property visiting former owners in my view it is a teardown. The roof was replaced a few years ago because of leaking. It was staged recently for sale with a sloppy exterior paint job. Rather, this and other homes on Apalogen Road are significant because of place, not design. They're in the woods and 15 minutes from Center City. That's what makes them special.

Kindly consider these thoughts in your deliberations.

Henry Donner

Kang Haggerty

tel: 215.305.8688 | **main:** 215.525.5850

email: hdonner@kanghaggerty.com | **web:** www.kanghaggerty.com

office: 123 South Broad Street, Suite 1950, Philadelphia, PA 19109

social: LinkedIn | Twitter | Facebook

DISCLAIMER

This e-mail message is intended only for the personal use of the recipient(s) named above. This message may be an attorney-client communication and as such privileged and confidential and/or it may include attorney work product. If you are not an intended recipient, you may not review, copy or distribute this message. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by e-mail and delete the original message.

4030 Apalogen Road

From pflahertydmd@verizon.net <pflahertydmd@verizon.net>

Date Wed 11/12/2025 6:36 PM

To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Hello,

I write to you to oppose certifying 4030 Apalogen Road as an historic house. Now in my 3rd decade living on the road I have always viewed this property as an eye sore and the least attractive home on the road. Decades of deferred maintenance have left the property really nothing more than a tear down. I understand there is some noteworthiness as to the architect, but surely, this is not her best work. I hope the committee agrees with the sentiments of the residents of our private road and thus allow the owners their right to improve the property as they see fit. We, The Apalogen Road association , did not ask for or seek this historically certified designation and neither did the new owners.

Thank You
Peter Flaherty, DMD
Treasurer, Apalogen Road Association

pflahertydmd@verizon.net

4034 Apologen Road

From cbhart77 Hart <cbhart77@gmail.com>
Date Wed 11/12/2025 8:51 PM
To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear Commission,

We are writing to express and document our opposition to the designation of 4034 Apologen Road as a historical site. We are homeowners on Apologen Road (our address is 3443 W Schoolhouse Lane but our home has frontage on Apologen). We have thoroughly enjoyed our time here and look forward to many more years on this wonderful road. The road and homes on it are an invaluable part of Philadelphia and East Falls in particular. We all work hard to make it a place that neighbors can enjoy while enjoying the surrounding park. I know all the homeowners on the road believe this to be a special place. It is our opinion that designating this home or others removes our autonomy as homeowners and would not allow the necessary upkeep and possible improvement necessary to maintain the beauty of this jewel. Thank you for your time and consideration.

Best regards,

Chris Hart and Dr. Ellen Casey Hart

-

Chris Hart

4034 Apalogen Road Historic Designation

From maryellencammisa@gmail.com <maryellencammisa@gmail.com>

Date Wed 11/12/2025 9:11 PM

To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

To Whom It May Concern,

I am writing to express my deep concern regarding the nomination of this property for historic designation. It is disheartening to see such a move made without transparent communication with the new owners—individuals who have consistently demonstrated their commitment to Philadelphia through their acclaimed restaurants and substantial investments in Center City.

These owners are exemplary citizens who contribute meaningfully to the city's cultural and economic vitality. Their dedication to enhancing our community is evident, and I believe they deserve recognition and support—not bureaucratic surprises that could hinder their efforts.

I urge you to reconsider the approach and timing of this nomination. Respectful dialogue and collaboration should be the foundation of any decision that affects property rights and community development.

Also, as a resident of Apalogen Road for 3 decades, 4034 Apalogen has been nothing but an eyesore. I understand that Mrs Fleischer was a famous woman architect, but the house is not designed to be conducive to today's lifestyles and should be torn down.

Why hasn't the historic commission nominated this house years ago? Or at least prior to the property being listed for sale?

Maryellen Cammisa-Flaherty
4112 Apalogen Road
Philadelphia, PA

Historical Preservation of 4030 Apalogen Road

From Faye Senneca <fayesenneca@gmail.com>

Date Thu 11/13/2025 1:22 AM

To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

Dear members of the Philadelphia Historical Commission,

This letter is in opposition to the request by the East Falls Historical Society to place the house on 4030 Apalogen Road on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. I believe it is blatantly unethical to request this "after the fact" that this house was bought before this designation was considered. Also, since the present owners took great care to preserve significant elements including the Wharton Esherick fireplace, I believe it no longer has any other significant features that are deserving of preservation.

I believe Valerie Safran and Marcie Turney, like many other Apalogen Road owners, bought 4030 Apalogen Road for the property and not for the house. I see nothing worthy of preservation of a kitchen that includes the laundry machines, or of a lower level that includes a utility room which is reached only by an outside stairway (where the laundry machines were placed to make the kitchen more presentable for the sale. The front of the house facing the Road, is an ugly carport. The bedroom area is very ordinary and does not have the space for expansion.

I believe the preservation of the uniqueness of Apalogen Road is more important than the preservation of any single home on the Road. The happiness of living here has always come from the honesty, love and concern for our neighbors. To see a neighbor society go through very questionable tactics to cause all this stress in order to preserve a home that was sold honestly without any preservation concerns, and whose preservation is questionable, is deeply disturbing to me. I ask that this request for the preservation of the home on 4030 Apalogen Road be denied.

Sincerely yours,

Faye Senneca Ed.D. 4153 Apalogen Road



Philadelphia Historical Commission
1515 Arch Street, 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Written Comment on Proposed Designation of 4024–34 Apalogen Road (“Tulipwood”)

RePoint Philadelphia urges the Historical Commission to approve the designation of 4024–34 Apalogen Road (“Tulipwood”) consistent with the Committee on Historic Designation’s recommendation under Criteria C, D, and E, recognizing both the architectural merit of the property and the significance of its designer, Elizabeth Fleisher, one of Philadelphia’s pioneering women architects.

This nomination also presents a broader test of institutional integrity: whether the Commission will adhere to the framework established by the Ordinance and the Rules or depart from that framework by allowing speculative legal theories and redevelopment considerations to influence a designation decision.

The staff recommendation opposed designation, citing guidance from the City Law Department that designation could “frustrate the owner’s investment-backed expectations” and potentially expose the City to legal challenge. At its October meeting, the Committee on Historic Designation correctly confined its review to the question of historical significance, declined to consider the owner’s financial expectations, and recommended designation.

RePoint agrees with the Committee’s assessment and finds the staff recommendation unsupported by the Ordinance and the Rules for two reasons:

- First, it reflects a jurisdictional overreach, as the Commission’s role is to faithfully apply the designation criteria, not to avoid litigation risk based on speculative legal theories.
- Second, it misapplies the Commission’s own procedures, importing permit-review considerations into a designation process where they do not belong.

Both errors, if left uncorrected, would create a destabilizing precedent that undermines the structure of the City’s historic preservation program and weakens public trust in the Commission’s independence.

1. Jurisdictional Overreach: Legal Theorizing and Litigation Avoidance Is Not the Commission’s Role

The staff recommendation rests on legal speculation that is outside the Commission’s authority to consider. Nowhere in the Philadelphia Historic Preservation Ordinance or in the Commission’s Rules and Regulations is there any instruction or implication that the Commission should avoid potential litigation or speculate about how a court might rule. Such a step would create dangerous precedent: an owner with even a sketch-level development concept could claim “investment-backed expectations” and pair it with a litigation threat to discourage or derail a nomination.

Respectfully, the staff's reliance on Law Department advice confuses these institutional roles. While the City Law Department may properly advise on litigation exposure, its mission to minimize legal risk cannot override the Commission's statutory duty to evaluate designations on their merits. The Law Department's institutional role is to protect the City from litigation risk, which naturally incentivizes a defensive posture by default. That orientation is appropriate for legal counsel but also underscores why the Law Department is not the proper adjudicator of whether a property meets the criteria for historic designation. The Philadelphia Historical Commission alone has that jurisdiction and should exercise it independently.

If the Commission chose to withhold or condition designation to prevent a potential legal action, it would effectively be delegating its administrative duty to the City Law Department and substituting speculative risk management for the factual application of the Ordinance's criteria.

The Commission's responsibility is not to predict litigation or court rulings, but to apply the law transparently and let the courts, if ever necessary, resolve disputes after the fact. Acting within its clear statutory authority is the Commission's strongest legal position.

Even if the Commission indulged these constitutional takings concerns, settled law renders them baseless. Both federal and state precedent, including *Penn Central Transp. Co. v. New York City*, 438 U.S. 104 (1978) and *United Artists' Theater Circuit, Inc. v. City of Philadelphia*, 635 A.2d 612 (Pa. 1993), affirm that historic-preservation regulation is a lawful exercise of municipal police power and that a compensable taking exists only upon proof of total economic deprivation, an extraordinarily high threshold not remotely approached here.

A vague advisory opinion premised on undisclosed reasoning from the Law Department cannot substitute for the Commission's own statutory responsibility to determine historical significance. The Law Department has no jurisdiction over historic-designation decisions. Outsourcing that judgment would amount to an abdication of delegated authority and compromise the independence the Ordinance requires.

2. Misapplication of Rules: Redevelopment Plans Belong to Permit Review, Not Designation

Staff's reliance on the Section 6 provision that the Commission may consider development plans during permit review misapplies that authority to a Section 5 designation proceeding. This cross-application is inconsistent with both the Rules and the Ordinance. Using a Section 6 standard in a Section 5 proceeding collapses two distinct stages of review. If the Commission begins importing permit-review considerations into designation decisions, the procedural distinctions between Sections 5 and 6 cease to have meaningful force. Section 5 does not even provide an option for consideration of development plans.

Section 6.9(a)(10) of the Commission's Rules and Regulations, quoted below, is located in Section 6, which governs permit review. It is not part of Section 5, which governs designation:

“When reviewing permit applications, the Commission may consider development plans in place at the time of the issuance of the notice announcing the consideration of a designation...”

Far from expanding authority, this rule *only* clarifies that pre-notice plans may be considered *later*, during permit review under § 14-1005. In other words, Section 6.9(a)(10) is designed to ensure fairness for projects already in the pipeline. It does not authorize the Commission to consider redevelopment plans during a designation proceeding.

Applying this clause at the designation stage inverts the structure of the Ordinance, which establishes a deliberately bifurcated process:

- Designation (§14-1004): Determines whether a resource meets one or more criteria of historical significance.
- Permit Review (§14-1005): Considers alterations, demolitions, or new construction, including any redevelopment plans or hardship claims.

Collapsing these steps by allowing development intent to block designation would be a misapplication of the Rules, effectively granting de facto hardship relief before the property is even designated or a permit application filed.

3. Requested Action

RePoint Philadelphia respectfully urges the Historical Commission to:

1. **Approve** the designation of 4024–34 Apalogen Road (“Tulipwood”) consistent with the Committee on Historic Designation’s recommendation under Criteria C, D, and E.
2. **Reject** the staff recommendation to withhold or deny designation on litigation-avoidance grounds.
3. **Affirm** that the only lawful question before the Commission is whether 4024–34 Apalogen Road meets one or more criteria in §14-1004(1).
4. **Clarify** in the public record that redevelopment plans, hardship claims, and speculative legal threats are not relevant factors in a designation proceeding. Legal risk assessments or opinions from the City Law Department may inform the City’s overall posture but they do not confer or remove jurisdiction from the Historical Commission. The Commission alone is the body empowered by Chapter 14-1000 to determine historic significance and to act on nominations.

4. Concluding Note

Designation of Tulipwood would advance the City’s stated policy of recognizing underrepresented figures in Philadelphia’s architectural history, consistent with the inclusive purposes of §14-1001. Upholding the Committee’s recommendation would reaffirm the Commission’s independence and preserve the integrity of the Ordinance itself.

Respectfully submitted,

RePoint Philadelphia
repointphila@gmail.com

This testimony was prepared and submitted by RePoint Philadelphia Action, a 501(c)(4) nonprofit organization. The views expressed herein reflect the organization's mission to advocate for sound preservation policy and accountability in civic planning.



DREXEL UNIVERSITY

College of
Medicine

*The Legacy Center: Archives and Special Collections
Women in Medicine and Homeopathy*

13 November 2025

Philadelphia Historical Commission

via email: preservation@phila.gov

re: 4024-34 Apalogen Road, Philadelphia, PA

To the Philadelphia Historical Commission:

As a keeper of the history of the Woman's Medical College of Pennsylvania (WMCP), I write to urge the preservation of 4024-34 Apalogen Road, aka Tulipwood, a home of cultural and architectural importance designed by Elizabeth Hirsh Fleisher, by approving the nomination to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Fleisher was a dedicated supporter of WMCP, and beyond its stunning mid-century modern design, this residence embodies the legacy of a pioneering woman who broke barriers and shaped both architectural practice and influenced women's higher education in the twentieth century.

WMCP was the first degree-granting medical school for women in the world, dedicated to training only women for 120 years. Ms. Fleisher served on the WMCP Board of Corporators for over 30 years, an enduring example of working to expand professional authority in fields from which women had long been excluded. She pushed for academic excellence and steered the school's mission and vision as it faced major transitions, supporting many growth projects and scores of women entering medicine. Next to the medical school at 3200 Henry Avenue in East Falls stands a living legacy of Fleisher's firm Roth and Fleisher, the 1950 Nurses' Residence for WMCP's Hospital. This extant building is part of the Falls Center, a multi-use site a few miles from 4024 Apalogen Road.

Losing the Apalogen Road site would erase an important example of a woman's leadership in mid-century design, a story which, like the story of women in medicine, remains underrepresented in our heritage. Protecting this home would ensure that future generations can study, interpret, and celebrate the contributions of a designer who helped open professional and creative doors for women in architecture while serving as a role model for women in the parallel male-dominated profession of medicine.

I respectfully urge the Board to act in favor of preservation and to recognize 4024-32 Apalogen Road as a site reflecting both architectural and educational advances.

Sincerely,

Margaret Graham
Director

SAVE TULIPWOOD

From Emma Kulickowski <emmakulski23@gmail.com>

Date Thu 11/13/2025 9:19 AM

To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

To whom it may concern,

I urge the Philadelphia Historical Commission to approve Tulipwood's designation, as already recommended by the Committee on Historic Designation. Its historic and iconic architectural design is worthy of designation and preservation! The Commission's job is to decide what's historically significant - not avoid possible lawsuits or development plans!

I appreciate your time and attention to this matter.

Thank you,
Emma Kulickowski

4034 Apalogen Road historical designation

From john detre <detreja@gmail.com>

Date Thu 11/13/2025 11:36 AM

To preservation <preservation@Phila.gov>

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

To whom it may concern,

As a homeowner on Apalogen Road, I am writing to express my opposition to the recommendation of the East Falls Historical Commission for historic designation of 4034 Apalogen Road. Although this property sold at well above market value due to the costly staging efforts carried out by the prior owner under the guidance of their real estate agent, this property was well known to be in an extremely dilapidated condition and most of the homeowners considered the property to be a tear-down when it went on the market.

The reality is that mid-century modern architecture was built prioritizing “form over function” and not necessarily with the idea of lasting into posterity, particularly in seasonal locations like Philadelphia.

While I appreciate the desire of the East Falls Historical Commission to preserve mid-century architecture to the extent possible, in many cases that may not be feasible for homeowners of these innovative-in-their-time but often highly impractical dwellings.

John Detre
4141 Apalogen Road