

# Low-Income Rate Affordability Assistance: 25 Years of Independent Third Party Program Evaluations

*Compiled by:*

Roger Colton  
Fisher, Sheehan and Colton  
Public Finance and General Economics  
Belmont, MA 02478

December 2014 (updated July 2016)

Items for which Electronic Copies Exist	Date Report Published	Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation	Utility/Program	Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report	Report Title
Reports for which electronic copies do not exist:	1986	Minnesota	State	NCLC	Evaluation of Minnesota Fair Share Pilot Program.
	1985	Ohio	State	Tractell, Inc.	A Study of the Commission's Procedural Determination of Customer Payment Options Pursuant to the Investigation into the Long-Term Solutions Concerning Disconnection of Gas and Electric Service in Winter Emergencies.
	1988	Illinois	State	Brenda Griffin	IRAPP: Preliminary Evaluation of the Illinois Residential Affordable Payment Program.
	1989	Montana	State	Thomas Schneider	Evaluation of Ravalli County Percentage of Income Payment Plan (PIPP) Pilot Project.
1	Dec-87	Rhode Island	State	Nora Barnes	A Study of Client Satisfaction: Rhode Island Percentage of Income Payment Plan
2	Jan-88	Rhode Island	State	Roger Colton	Evaluation of Warwick (Rhode Island) Percentage of Income Payment Plan (PIPP) Demonstration Project
3	Sept-88	MA	Commonwealth Electric	Synergic Resources	Evaluation of the Cost-Effectiveness of a Bad Debt Conservation Program

<b>Items for which Electronic Copies Exist</b>	<b>Date Report Published</b>	<b>Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation</b>	<b>Utility/Program</b>	<b>Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report</b>	<b>Report Title</b>
4	1990	National	Non-program	Roger Colton	Client Consumption Patterns within an Income-Based Energy Assistance Program, Journal of Economic Issues, Vol. 24, Issue 4 (1990)
5	May-91	Kentucky	Louisville Gas & Electric	Roger Colton	The Percentage of Income Payment Plan in Jefferson County, Kentucky: One Alternative to Distributing LIHEAP Benefits
6	1992	Pennsylvania	State	Pennsylvania PUC, Bureau of Consumer Services	Final Report on Investigation into the Control of Uncollectible Balances.
7	Jan-93	Philadelphia	Philadelphia Gas Works (PGW)	Response Analysis (now Apprise)	Energy Assurance Program Pilot: Year One Report
8	Jul-94	Penn	Equitable Gas	Gil Peach	Equitable Gas Energy Assistance Program (EAP): Process Evaluation
9	Mar-95	Colorado	PSCO	Steve Brown	Evaluation of Colorado Arrearage Management Program (CAMP)
10	1996	Penn	Duquesne Light	IRT Environment	Duquesne Light Smart Comfort Program: Profile
11	Jan-96	NY	National Fuel Gas	Barakat & Chamberlin	Final Report: Process and Impact Evaluation of National Fuel Gas Distribution's Low-Income Residential Assistance Program
12	Sept-96	PA	Equitable Gas	Gil Peach	Impact Assessment of the Equitable Gas Company Energy Assistance Program
13	Nov-96	PA	Columbia Gas	A&C Enercom / Steckel	Final Report: Process and Impact Evaluation of Customer Assistance Program
14	Dec-96	Colorado	PSCO	Steve Brown	Affordable Rate Pilot Project: Report on Two Evaluations of Public Service Company of /Colorado Payment Assistance Programs
15	Feb-97	PA	Equitable Gas	Gil Peach	Energy Assistance Program: An Affordable Energy Alternative for Low Income Families
16	Apr-98	Wisconsin	Campaign to Keep Wisconsin Warm	Gil Peach	Pilot Evaluation: Campaign to Keep Wisconsin Warm: A Voluntary Fund to combat Fuel Poverty and a Working

<b>Items for which Electronic Copies Exist</b>	<b>Date Report Published</b>	<b>Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation</b>	<b>Utility/Program</b>	<b>Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report</b>	<b>Report Title</b>
					Prototype for a Statewide Fuel Fund
17	Aug-98	Penn	PECO Energy	Gil Peach	Impact Assessment of the PECO Energy “CAP Rate” Pilot
18	Sept-98	Penn	Columbia Gas	Steckel	Process Evaluation of Columbia Gas of Pennsylvania’s Customer Assistance Program (Participant Focus Groups)
19	Jan-99	Penn	Columbia Gas	Gil Peach	Impact Assessment of the One-Year Extension of the Columbia Gas CAP Pilot
20	Jan-99	Penn	PP&L	RPM Systems Group	OnTrack and Beyond: Final Impact Evaluation of PP&L’s On Track Pilot Program
21	Mar-99	NY / Penn	National Fuel Gas	Barakat & Chamberlin	Process Evaluation of the Low-Income Residential Assistance Program (LIRA)
22	May-99	Penn	UGI Utilities	Steckel	Final Process Evaluation of the Low-Income Self-Help Program Pilot
23	Aug-99	NY / Penn	National Fuel Gas	Barakat & Chamberlin	Final Evaluation Report: Low-Income Residential Assistance Program (LIRA)
24	Feb-02	NY	Niagara Mohawk	Apprise	Low Income Customer Assistance Program: Impact on Payments and Arrearages
25	Jun-02	Penn	PECO	Gil Peach	Customers with Incomes to 50% of the Federal Poverty Level in PECO Energy’s Customer Assistance Program
26	Jun-02	Penn	PGW	Gil Peach	Philadelphia Gas Works Universal Service Programs: Pathways to Compliance.
27	Aug-02	NY	Niagara Mohawk	Apprise	LICAP Program Evaluation: Final Report
28	Jan-03	Oregon	State	quantec	Oregon Energy Assistance Program Evaluation: Final
29	Sep-03	California	State	quantec	Evaluation of California Alternate Rates for Energy (CARE) Program’s Outreach and Administrative Practices
30	Oct-03	Penn	Allegheny Power	RETEC Group	Evaluation of LIPURP and Other Allegheny Power Universal Service Programs
31	Oct-03	Penn	Duquesne Light	RETEC Group	Evaluation of CAP and Other Duquesne Light Universal Service Programs
32	Oct-03	Washington	PacifiCorp	quantec	Final Report: Washington Low-Income Bill Assistance Program: Phase II Impact Analysis

<b>Items for which Electronic Copies Exist</b>	<b>Date Report Published</b>	<b>Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation</b>	<b>Utility/Program</b>	<b>Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report</b>	<b>Report Title</b>
33	Oct-03	Missouri	Missouri Gas Energy	Roger Colton	The Impact of Missouri Gas Energy's Experimental Low-Income Rate (ELIR) on Utility Bill Payments by Low-Income Customers: A Preliminary Assessment
34	Jul-04	Penn	Columbia Gas	Melanie Popovich	Columbia Gas of PA, Inc.: Universal Service Program Impact Evaluation
35	Oct-04	Penn	First Energy: Penelec	Gil Peach	Impact Assessment of the First Energy Pennsylvania Universal Service Programs (Pennelec component)
36	Oct-04	Penn	First Energy: Met Ed/Penn Power	Gil Peach	Impact Assessment of the First Energy Pennsylvania Universal Service Programs: Met Ed and Penn Power components)
37	Nov-04	Penn	TW Phillips	Apprise	TW Phillips Energy Help Fund Program Evaluation: Final Report
38	Nov-04	NV	State	Gil Peach	State Fiscal Year 2003 Evaluation of the NRS 702: Energy Assistance Program and Weatherization Assistance Program
39	Nov-04	Penn	Dominion Peoples	Melanie Popovich	Dominion Peoples Universal Service Program: Impact Evaluation
40	Jan-05	Utah	PacifiCorp	quantec	Utah HELP: Program Evaluation
41	Apr-05	NV	State	Gil Peach	State Fiscal Year 2004 Evaluation of the NRS 702: Energy Assistance Programs and Weatherization Assistance Programs
42	Jun-05	Ohio	Non-program	Triad Research Group	Focus Groups with PIP Participants
43	Aug-05	Penn	PG Energy	Apprise	PG Energy: Universal Services and Energy Conservation Programs: Final Report
44	Nov-05	NJ	JCPL	Apprise	Evaluation of the New Jersey Universal Service Fund: Fresh Start Program: Jersey Power and Light Payment Counseling Program
45	Feb-06	Penn	PGW	Apprise	Philadelphia Gas Works Customer Responsibility Program: Final Evaluation Report
46	Feb-06	Missouri	Empire District Electric	Roger Colton	Experimental Low-Income Program (ELIP): Empire District Electric Company Final Program Evaluation

<b>Items for which Electronic Copies Exist</b>	<b>Date Report Published</b>	<b>Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation</b>	<b>Utility/Program</b>	<b>Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report</b>	<b>Report Title</b>
47	Apr-06	NJ	NJ BPU	Apprise	Impact Evaluation and Concurrent Process Evaluation of the New Jersey Universal Service Fund: Final Report
48	Apr-06	Penn	PECO	Apprise	PECO Energy Universal Services Program: Final Evaluation Report
49	Apr-06	Penn	PPL Electric	Apprise	PPL Electric Utilities: Winter Relief Assistance Program: Final Evaluation Report
50	May-06	NV	State	Gil Peach	State Fiscal Year 2005 Evaluation of the NRS 702: Energy Assistance Program and Weatherization Assistance Program
51	Aug-06	Penn	NFG	Melanie Popovich	National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation: Universal Service Program Evaluation
52	Oct-06	Penn	PECO	Apprise	PECO Energy Customer Assistance Program for Customers Below 50 Percent of Poverty: Final Evaluation Report
53	May-07	NV	State	Gil Peach	State Fiscal Year 2006 Evaluation of the NRS 702: Energy Assistance Program and Weatherization Assistance Program
54	May-07	MD	MD PSC	PA Consulting Group	Electric Universal Service Program Evaluation: Final Evaluation Report
55	Jun-07	Penn	UGI	Melanie Popovich	UGI Utilities Inc.: Universal Service Program Evaluation
56	Jul-07	Indiana	NIPSCO, CGCU, Vectren Energy	Roger Colton	An Outcome Evaluation of Indiana's Low-Income Rate Affordability Programs: 2007 Report
57	Oct-08	Penn	PPL	Apprise	PPL Electric Utilities: Universal Service Programs: Final Evaluation Report
58	Aug-09	Indiana	NIPSCO, CGCU, Vectren Energy	Roger Colton	An Outcome Evaluation of Indiana's Low-Income Rate Affordability Programs: 2008/2009 Report
59	Oct-09	Penn	Duquesne Light	AECOM	Evaluation of Duquesne Universal Service Programs
60	Dec-09	IL	State	Apprise	Illinois PIP Program Impact Evaluation: Draft Report
61	April-10	Pennsylvania	PGW	Apprise	Philadelphia Gas Works: Customer Responsibility Program, Analysis and Recommendations, Final Report
62	Jul-10	Penn	Allegheny Power	Apprise	Allegheny Power Universal Service Programs: Final Evaluation Report

<b>Items for which Electronic Copies Exist</b>	<b>Date Report Published</b>	<b>Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation</b>	<b>Utility/Program</b>	<b>Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report</b>	<b>Report Title</b>
63	Aug-10	Penn	Peoples Natural Gas	Melanie Popovich	Peoples: Universal Service Impact Evaluation
64	Oct-10	Penn	First Energy (Met Ed, Penelec, PennPower)	Gill Peach	2010 Impact Assessment of the First Energy Pennsylvania Universal Service Programs: Metropolitan Edison, Pennsylvania Electric Co., PennPower
65	Nov-10	Penn	Columbia Gas	Melanie Popovich	Columbia Gas: Universal Service Impact Evaluation§
66	Jan-11	NV	State	Gil Peach	SFY 2010 Evaluation: Energy and Weatherization Assistance Programs
67	May-11	Penn	Equitable Gas	Melanie Popovich	Equitable Gas: Universal Service Impact Evaluation
68	Nov-11	Maryland	BGE	Apprise	Baltimore Gas and Electric Limited Income Pilot Payment Program: Final Evaluation Report
69	Nov-11	NV	State	Gil Peach	SFY 2011 Evaluation: Energy and Weatherization Assistance Programs: Executive Summary
70	Feb-12	CO	Public Service Co. Colorado	Roger Colton	Public Service Company of Colorado Pilot Energy Assistance Program (PEAP) and Electric Assistance Program (EAP): 2011 Final Evaluation Report
71	Mar-12	Mass	State	Roger Colton	Attributes of Massachusetts Gas/Electric “Arrearage Management Programs” (AMP); 2011 Program Year
72	Jul-12	Pennsylvania	UGI Utilities	Apprise	UGI Utilities, Inc. (Gas Division), UGI Penn Natural Gas Universal Service Program Final Report
73	Oct-12	Penn	PECO	Apprise	PECO Energy Universal Services Program: Final Evaluation Report
74	Nov-12	Pennsylvania	PGW	Apprise	PGW Universal Service Program: Impact Evaluation Final Report
75	Dec-12	NV	State	Gil Peach	SFY 2012 Evaluation: Energy and Weatherization Assistance Programs
76	Sept-13	Pennsylvania	PECO	PECO	Alternative Models for the Delivery of Customer Assistance Program Benefits
77	Oct-13	Pennsylvania	PECO	Roger Colton	Review of PECO Energy’s Report on Alternative Models for the Delivery of Customer Assistance Benefits

<b>Items for which Electronic Copies Exist</b>	<b>Date Report Published</b>	<b>Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation</b>	<b>Utility/Program</b>	<b>Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report</b>	<b>Report Title</b>
78					
79					
80					

## Supplemental Non-Program Evaluations: 25 Years of Independent Third Party Program Evaluations

*Compiled by:*

Roger Colton  
Fisher, Sheehan and Colton  
Public Finance and General Economics  
Belmont, MA 02478

June 2016

Items for which Electronic Copies Exist	Date Report Published	Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation	Utility/Program	Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report	Report Title
		New York	NY	NY DPS	Gas and Power Uncollectibles and Collection Activity
	1991	National	National	Colton	Understanding why customers don't pay: The need for flexible collection practices
	Jun-91	Philadelphia	Non-program	Institute for Public Policy Studies, Temple University	An Examination of the Relationship Between Utility Terminations, Housing Abandonment and Homelessness
	1997	Wisconsin	Non-program	Ron Grosse	Win-Win Alternatives for Credit and Collection
	1998	National	Non-program	Colton	Non-participation in public benefit programs: Lessons for energy assistance
	1998	National	National	VEIC	An Integrated Approach to Low-Income Energy Affordability for a Restructured World
	1998	National	National	Brockway	Statewide Administration of Public Purpose Programs
	May-00	National	National	MSB Energy	Meeting Low-Income Energy Needs through Public



<b>Items for which Electronic Copies Exist</b>	<b>Date Report Published</b>	<b>Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation</b>	<b>Utility/Program</b>	<b>Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report</b>	<b>Report Title</b>
				Associates	Benefits: Selecting Energy Assistance and Weatherization Funding Levels
	Jun-00	Iowa	Non-program	Mercier Associates	Iowa's Cold Winters: LIHEAP Recipient Perspective
	2002	National	Non-program	Colton	Models of Low-Income Rates
	2003	Illinois	Non-program	Illinois DNR	Home Energy Costs and Assistance in Illinois
	Apr-03	National	Non-program	NRRI	Where Consumers Go for Help Paying Utility Bills
	2004	National	National	NEADA	Tracking the Home Energy Needs of Low-Income Households through Trend Data on Arrearages and Disconnections
	Apr-04	National	Non-program	Apprise	National Energy Assistance Survey Report: 2003
	Jul-05	National	Non-program	Apprise	LIHEAP Burden Evaluation Study: Final Report
	Sep-05	National	Non-program	Apprise	National Energy Assistance Survey Report: 2005
	2006	National	Non-program	NARUC	Report by NARUC Consumers Affairs Subcommittee on Collections Data Gathering by the States
	Feb--07	Colorado	Colorado	CO Interagency Statewide Council on Homelessness	Colorado Statewide Homeless Count: Final Report 2006
	Sept-07	National	National	Children's Sentinel Nutrition Assessment Project	Fuel for Our Future: Impact of Energy Insecurity on Children's Health, Nutrition and Learning
	Jun-08	National	Non-program	Apprise	2008 Energy Cost Survey
	Dec-08	National	Non-program	Apprise	National Energy Assistance Survey Report: 2008
	Apr-09	National	Non-program	Apprise	National Energy Assistance Survey Report: 2009

<b>Items for which Electronic Copies Exist</b>	<b>Date Report Published</b>	<b>Jurisdiction of Program Subject to Evaluation</b>	<b>Utility/Program</b>	<b>Consultant Preparing Evaluation Report</b>	<b>Report Title</b>
	Feb-10	National	Non-program	Apprise	LIHEAP Special Study of the 2005 Residential Energy Consumption Survey: Dimensions of Energy Insecurity for Low Income Households: Final Report
	Nov-11	National	Non-program	Apprise	National Energy Assistance Survey Report: 2011
	2013	Vermont	Vermont	VT Law School Institute for Energy and the Environment	Energy Costs and Burdens in Vermont: Burdensome for Whom?
NAE = Not Available Electronically					