



November 26, 2024

Christopher Hartland
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 1830 N Broad St (Application # ZP-2024-005019)

Dear Christopher,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed academic building at 1830 N Broad Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes an academic building totaling 198,941 gross square feet. This proposal includes classrooms and a continuation of Polett Walk, a prominent pedestrian thoroughfare through Temple University's campus. The parcel is zoned SP-INS and is a part of the Temple University Master Plan.

This proposal was reviewed at the Master Plan stage at the October 2023 CDR meeting. At its meeting of November 6, 2024, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR for Buildings process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: Beech Community Services

A representative of the Beech Community Services RCO attended the meeting and participated as a voting member of the CDR Committee.

The representative from Beech Community Services expressed excitement about the project as a symbol to the community.

CDR Committee Comments:

The committee noted that Temple's single-entry/exit policy for buildings limits the opportunity for engagement with the sidewalk and limits a building's ability to provide for an active ground floor - especially for buildings as large as this one. Additional comments were as follows:

- It is a thoughtful, high-quality design and building.
- More transparency should be added to the building facade on Polett Walk.
- The area between the two wings of the building at Broad Street is a strength and activity node.
- The crosswalk across Broad Street can be a major point of activity and a point of civic interest. Find ways to celebrate it through signage and other means.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



- The overall building transparency shown at the Master Plan CDR review is missing in the current design. Committee liked the previous design's showcasing of programs in the building.
- The use of landscape, planting materials, and hardscape is excellent.
- The green space on the west side of the proposed parcel is a great opportunity space for activity.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Octavia Howell
Executive Director
Philadelphia City Planning Commission

cc: Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Jeffery Young, Council District 5, jeffery.young@phila.gov
Conlan Crosley, Representative to Council District 5, conlan.crosley@phila.gov
Colin Koop, Skidmore, Owings & Merrill LLP, colin.koop@som.com
Eileen Quigley, Ballard Spahr LLP, quigleye@ballardspahr.com
Peter Crawford, Temple Area Property Association, peter.redpike@gmail.com
Christine Brown, Beech Community Services Incorporated, cbrown@beechinterplex.com
Dorothy Kelly, The Good News Community Organization, Louise159@verizon.net
Lewis Nash Sr., MAP Holistic CDC, amenphilly@gmail.com
Bonita Cummings, Strawberry Mansion Community Concern, SHL851@aol.com
Darnell M Deans Sr., 32nd Ward RCO, donelldeans23@gmail.com
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, david.fecteau@phila.gov
Christopher Hartland, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, christopher.hartland@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Meryl Klein, Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems, meryl.klein@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

**Civic Design Review
Committee**

Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



November 26, 2024

Chanwoo Jung
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 4401 Holden St (Application # ZP-2024-002431)

Dear Chanwoo,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use residential development at 4401 Holden Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes the construction of five (5) new multi-family residential buildings and renovation of an existing multi-family residential building totaling 330,085 gross square feet (including 135,545 square feet in the existing building) and 327 total dwelling units, including 189 affordable units. The proposal also includes 61 car parking spaces, 102 bike parking spaces, and 2 loading spaces. The five (5) new buildings include:

- One (1) 6-story mixed-use building totaling 138,502 square feet, including 145 residential units and 2,000 square feet of commercial space; and
- Four (4) 3-story multi-family residential buildings totaling 56,038 square feet.

The parcel is zoned CMX-4 Commercial Mixed-Use, is in the Mixed-Income Neighborhoods (MIN) Overlay District, and the Transit-Oriented Development (TOD) Overlay District. The proposal, as designed, requires a variance for the percentage to which it is built to the street line along its primary frontage (Market Street).

At its meeting of November 6, 2024, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: West Powelton Saunders Park RCO

A representative of the West Powelton Saunders Park RCO attended the meeting and participated as a voting member of the CDR Committee. The RCO representative provided a recap of the public meetings hosted by the RCO, noting that the community was supportive of the project overall, with the only main concern being the potential impact on the adjacent Nehemiah Homes, whose residents oppose a new street connection from the project site (a connection that is not currently part of the proposal). Finally, the RCO representative expressed excitement about the possibilities in Phase 2 of the project for people to be able to purchase units.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



CDR Committee Comments

The Committee members expressed appreciation for the thoughtfulness of the proposal, including the connection to Market Street, the integration of the existing building, and the pedestrian pathways throughout the site. The Committee members emphasized several staff comments with which they agreed, including: the importance of coordinating with ALDI on a more direct pedestrian connection; consideration of balconies on the new 6-story mixed-use building; and encouragement of implementing rooftop solar sooner than later.

The Committee expressed additional questions and concerns, including: questions about what the commercial space could be, noting the size seems a little small; concerns that the rowhomes fronting streets do not appear to be facing other active frontages or spaces, and encouragement of creating streets with active frontages on both sides; and encouragement of exploring more placemaking throughout the site (not just the far-west portion, where it is strongest).

Finally, the Committee asked to include staff comments, as follows:

Site Design

- Staff appreciates active street frontage of new buildings on new streets, multiple outdoor common spaces, ADA accessibility throughout challenging site, and consideration of stormwater challenges including for play areas.
- Staff appreciates new Market Street Plaza. Consider adding seating, space for food trucks, and coordination with ALDI on more direct pedestrian connection.
- Consider activating sidewalk and/or open space area near current site entrance at intersection of Holden Street and Powelton Avenue to create more of a welcoming gateway condition.

Parking Design

- Staff supports parking in rear of new rowhouse buildings.
- Staff has concerns about impact of Building B parking lot on adjacent rowhomes facing it. Explore reconfiguration to allow for some public space on east side of Building B (to greater activate both sides of street).

Building Design

- Staff appreciates active ground floor uses and connectivity to outdoor spaces.
- Consider balconies or setbacks for new multi-family building (in keeping with character of balconies proposed to remain on existing Building B).
- Staff appreciates conservation of existing Building B. Consider opportunities near building entrance or within lobby for artwork, information, or other community purposes.
- Staff appreciates use of brick, color and texture to create diverse yet cohesive residential character. Consider informal seating opportunities.

Open Space Design

- Staff appreciates tailored, site-specific open space concept that integrates social and environmental functions and addresses unique challenges.
- Staff has questions about locations/types of trees to be removed/retained/added, including for existing trees bordering ALDI.

Civic Design Review Committee

Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



Sustainable Design

- Staff appreciates designing rooftop to be solar-ready and encourages efforts to incorporate them in Phase 1 of project.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Octavia Howell
Executive Director
Philadelphia City Planning Commission

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

cc: Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Jamie Gauthier, Council District 3, jamie.gauthier@phila.gov
Andrew Goodman, Representative to Council District 3, Andrew.goodman@phila.gov
Drew Kmetz, Erdy McHenry Architecture, dkmetz@em-arc.com
Meredith Trego, Ballard Spahr, tregom@ballardspahr.com
Pamela Andrews, West Powelton Saunders Park RCO, andrewsp0719@gmail.com
Kevin Brown, People's Emergency CDC, KevinB@hopephl.org
Gary Jonas, Drexel Area Property Association, dapaboard@gmail.com
Ang Sun, Ph.D., West Philly United Neighbors, WPUNRCO@gmail.com
Emma Sonner, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, emma.sonner@phila.gov
Chanwoo Jung, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, chanwoo.jung@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Meryl Klein, Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems, meryl.klein@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



November 26, 2024

Andrew DiDonato
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 2001 Richmond St (Application # ZP-2024-004417)

Dear Andrew,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use residential development at 2001 Richmond Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes the construction of a 400,559 gross square foot mixed-use multi-family residential building with 8,115 commercial square feet, 308 dwelling units, and 208 car parking spaces. This proposal is part of phase 2 of the North Bank development project. The proposal is a redesign and expansion of a previously approved portion of North Bank. The redesign results in an increase of 222 dwelling units and 173 parking spaces.

The parcel is zoned CMX-3 Commercial Mixed-Use and is in the Central Delaware Overlay District (CDO). This proposal is a by-right project.

This proposal for 2001 Richmond Street was reviewed at the September 3, 2024 CDR meeting and asked to return for a second review. At its meeting of November 6, 2024, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

CDR Committee Comments:

As this was a second review, and previous phases of the project have been reviewed by the CDR Committee, comments focused mostly on missed opportunities of such a large investment, summarized as follows:

- North Bank is a sophisticated project providing much needed housing; however, it feels separated from the rest of the city.
- The proposed multi-family building should serve as a welcoming gateway to the river trail. Currently the back of the building and loading zone is what greets you when you approach the site.
- The redesigned building results in the loss of a green finger or (linear green space) consistent throughout the other areas of the development. These fingers are the organizing element of the overall site design.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



The committee was disappointed that only one of the eight comments from the first review were acted upon. The comments from the first review are as follows:

Site Design

- The new design reduces open space and pedestrian connections to Fishtown – one of the “green fingers” is lost.
- Both Shirra Drive and Dyott Street are now fronted with auto-oriented uses – surface parking on Shirra Drive and loading on Dyott Street.

Building Design

- Additional retail space may be worth considering due to the site’s location and lack of physical connections to other retail spaces.
- Staff recommends limiting the use of dark colored standing seam and corrugated metal panels on public-facing facades.

Parking Design

- Staff recommends removal of the parking fronting Schirra Drive. If parking remains, it should be designed as a flexible plaza space for use by both pedestrians and cars.

Open Space Design

- Staff recommends a direct connection from the ground-level open space network to the amenity deck

Sustainable Design

- Consider rooftop solar energy generation on the multi-family building.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee’s action.

Sincerely,

Octavia Howell
Executive Director
Philadelphia City Planning Commission

cc: Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Mark Squilla, Council District 1, mark.squilla@phila.gov
Jennifer Slavic, Representative to Council District 1, jennifer.slavic@phila.gov
Sean McMonagle, Representative to Council District 1, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov
Brian Phillips, FAIA, LEED AP, ISA, brian@is-architects.com
Ron Patterson, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, RPatterson@klehr.com
Matt Ruben, Central Delaware Advocacy Group (CDAG), mruben@gmail.com
Will Dungan, Fishtown Neighbors Association, zoning@fishtown.org
Peter Barnard, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, peter.barnard@phila.gov
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, david.fecteau@phila.gov

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



Department of Planning and Development

Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Andrew DiDonato, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, andrew.didonato@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Meryl Klein, Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems, meryl.klein@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

Civic Design Review Committee

Established 2012

Octavia Howell

Executive Director

Philadelphia City

Planning Commission

Daniel K. Garofalo

Civic Design Review

Interim Chair

Leonidas Addimando

Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA

Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP

Clarissa Redding, RA

Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



November 26, 2024

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 5932-42 Germantown Ave (Application # ZP-2022-14368C)

Dear Paulose,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a mixed-use development at 5932-42 Germantown Avenue.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a mixed-use multi-family residential building totaling 96,645 gross square feet. This proposal includes 75 dwelling units, 3,538 commercial square feet, and 38 car parking spaces. The parcel is zoned CMX-2.5, Neighborhood Commercial Mixed-Use. This proposal is a by-right project.

This proposal for 5932-42 Germantown Avenue was reviewed at the September 3, 2024 CDR meeting and asked to return for a second review. At its meeting of November 6, 2024, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: West Central Germantown Neighbors

A representative of the West Central Germantown Neighbors RCO attended the meeting and made the following comments:

- The RCO appreciates the changes to the driveway but disagreed with the CDR staff assessment that it's a pedestrian hazard.
- The RCO would like to see a more formal dialogue with the police department about the use of the driveway.
- The RCO would like to see more affordable housing in Germantown.

CDR Committee Comments:

The committee encouraged further dialogue between the developer and the community to improve the design. The committee had limited comments mostly related to the proposed driveway design.

This driveway, as designed, is a missed opportunity to create a beautiful street. Consider thinking further to make this an interesting streetscape.

- Add signage to improve safety and reduce likelihood of crashes on the proposed driveway.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**

Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



- Consider adding mirrors, lights, and speed humps.
- Consider adding a flexible space for cars to pull over, while maintaining a small walking zone so that a pedestrian can navigate safely.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action

Sincerely,

Octavia Howell
Executive Director
Philadelphia City Planning Commission

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

cc: Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Cindy Bass Council District 8, cindy.bass@phila.gov
Charles Richardson, Representative to Council District 8, charles.richardson@phila.gov
Devon Beverly, Canno Design, beverlyd@ballardspahr.com
James Mills, Ballard Spahr LLP, millsj@ballardspahr.com
Ines Love, Faith Community Development Corporation, faithcdc.rco@gmail.com
Ruffian Tittman, Friends of the Wissahickon, tittmann@fow.org
Julie Stapleton Carroll, West Central Germantown Neighbors, juliescarroll@gmail.com
Patrick Jones, 59th Democratic Ward, patwjones@gmail.com
Keith Coleman, KECO INC, thieman555@gmail.com
Meg Cavanagh, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, meg.cavanagh@phila.gov
Nina Solomon, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, nina.solomonic@phila.gov
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Meryl Klein, Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems, meryl.klein@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



November 26, 2024

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

**Re: Civic Design Review for 309 W Mount Pleasant Ave
(Application # ZP-2023-012424)**

Dear Paulose,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 309 W Mount Pleasant Avenue.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a mixed-use multi-family residential building totaling 62,193 gross square feet. This proposal includes 2,884 commercial square feet, 68 dwelling units, and 23 car parking spaces. The parcel is zoned CMX-2 Neighborhood Commercial Mixed-Use. This proposal is a by-right project.

This proposal for 309 W Mount Pleasant Avenue was reviewed at the October 1, 2024 CDR meeting and asked to return for a second review. At its meeting of November 6, 2024, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

City Council Office Comments:

Charles Richardson from Councilmember Cindy Bass's office attended the meeting and participated as a voting member of the CDR Committee. Charles provided the following comments, in line with staff comments:

- As rendered, W Mount Pleasant Avenue is shown as much too wide.
- The building is too large and out of context with the surrounding building fabric and neighborhood.

RCO Comments: West Mount Airy Neighbors (WMAN)

A representative of the West Mount Airy Neighbors RCO attended the meeting and participated as a voting member of the CDR Committee. They provided the following comments:

- The RCO is grateful for the movement of the parking access-drive aisle.
- The RCO would like to see curb bump-outs at the driveway access.
- The RCO asked for the applicants to consider placing the roof deck along the W Mount Pleasant Avenue frontage rather than closer to the side elevation which is adjacent to other residences.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**

Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



- The RCO noted disappointment that the building volume could not be stepped down and that the side and rear facades are banal.

CDR Committee Comments:

The committee was appreciative of the changes made since the first review. Specifically, the design and location of the parking and driveway entrance. The entrance to the parking garage is now shown in the center of the development instead of adjacent to the adjoining building. While the committee was supportive of the project, they had concerns about the facade designs and materiality. The applicant team was strongly encouraged to take the facade design and materiality comments seriously.

In addition, the applicant team was urged to address comments that have not been addressed from the previous submission such as:

- Improving the secondary facades using a mixture of higher-quality materials and a differentiated window pattern to add detail and richness,
- Stepping down the overall massing of the project,
- Adding some 3-bedroom units to overall plan, and
- Modifying the rear fence design for better viability of the landscaping.

The committee also adopted staff comments, as follows:

- Staff appreciates the addition of the landscape buffer between the roof deck and the alley and adjacent homes.
- Consider additional adjustments to the roof deck size and location for better usage and buffering.
- Staff appreciates the buffer extension incorporating landscaping on the west side of the building but has remaining concerns about trash access and the location and size of the utility area.
- Staff continues to have concerns about the building and its massing: it is large and out of context for the neighborhood and adjoining properties.
- Staff appreciates the modifications made in relocating the garage access.
- Consider screening of the garage entrance.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Octavia Howell
Executive Director
Philadelphia City Planning Commission

cc: Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Cindy Bass, Council District 8, cindy.bass@phila.gov
Charles Richardson, Representative to Council District 8,
Charles.richardson@phila.gov
Tom Chiacchio, The Chiacchio Law Firm, cnase-poust@foxrothchild.com
Sergio Coscia, CosciaMoos Architects, Scoscia@cosciamoos.com
Stephen Kendall, WMAN, drstephenkendall@gmail.com
Meg Cavanagh, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, meg.cavanagh@phila.gov

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



Department of Planning and Development

Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Nina Solomonik, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, nina.solomonik@phila.gov
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Meryl Klein, Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems, meryl.klein@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

Civic Design Review Committee

Established 2012

Octavia Howell
*Executive Director
Philadelphia City
Planning Commission*

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Interim Chair*

Leonidas Addimando
Sarah Astheimer, ASLA, PLA
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Carol Scott

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>