## PHILADELPHIA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

## MEETING VIA ZOOM

## **MINUTES MAY 16, 2024**

PRESENT:	Joseph Syrnick, Vice Chair		
	Tavare Brown		
	Cheryl Gaston		
	Michael Johns		
	Dawn Summerville		
	Kathleen Grady		
	Maria Gonzalez		
	Adam Theil		
	Patrick Eiding		

NOT PRESENT:

The Philadelphia City Planning Commission was called to order by Chair Syrnick at 1:00 p.m.

Peter Bernard, of the Philadelphia City Planning Commission, (PCPC) – introduced the Zoom platform and remote City Planning Commission process. We are hosting this meeting at the Zoom. We may also have some people join us by phone.

During today's meeting, each agenda item will be presented by a member of the staff. Following each presentation, the Chair will ask the Commissioners for questions or comments. The Chair will then ask the audience questions and comments. After that, the Commissioners will finish their discussion and vote.

Those of you who are joining us at Zoom will have two options to ask questions and comments. If you would like to speak, click, or tap on the "RAISE HAND" button on the menu bar on the bottom of your screen at any time during the agenda item. You will be called on and will have the opportunity to speak to the Commission and the audience.

If you prefer to type your question or comment, click, or tap on the "Q&A" button on the menu bar at the bottom of your screen at any time during the agenda item. Once all attendees have had an opportunity to speak, I will read out loud any written questions and comments that have been posted to the Q&A.

For those joining by phone, we're unable to take spoken testimony, however, you can email your questions and/or comments to the Commission at Planning@ phila.gov. This meeting will be recorded and posted to our website.

Peter Bernard turned the meeting over to the Commission Chair, to begin the meeting.

### 1. Deputy Executive Director's Update Presented by Paul Brumbelow

### Next Civic Design Review Meeting

Tuesday June 4, 2024, 1:00pm

## Next City Planning Commission Meeting

■ Thursday, June 6<sup>th</sup> at 1:00 p.m.

### **RCO** Registration

- Begins June 1
- Ends June 30

### Online Information Sessions for RCO

■ June 12 at 6pm and June 20 at 12pm

### Welcome New Staff

Camilla Lizundia, Community Initiatives Specialist

- I. Items for Administrative Approval
  - Zoning Bill 24033: Amending Section 14-533 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled? IN, Mixed Income Neighborhoods Overlay District," to update the Illustrative maps to reflect recent redistricting changes, all under certain terms and conditions. Introduced by Councilmember Lozada on April 25, 2024
  - ii. Streets Bill 240301: Authorizing encroachment in the nature of a sidewalk cafe in the vicinity of 6516 Castor Avenue, Philadelphia, PA 19149, under certain terms and conditions. Introduced by Councilmember Phillips on April 18, 2024
  - iii. Streets Bill No.240305: Authorizing encroachments in the nature of a sidewalk café in vicinity if 795 N 24<sup>th</sup> St , Philadelphia PA 19130, under certain terms and conditions. Introduced by Councilmember Young on April 18, 2024.
  - iv. Streets Bill No. 240384: Authorizing encroachments in the nature of a sidewalk café in vicinity of 9444 North 2<sup>nd</sup> Street Philadelphia, PA 19123, under certain terms and conditions. Introduced by Councilmember Squilla on May 2, 2024

Staff recommendation for each of the Streets Bills are for administrative approval.

## 2. Review and Comment:

The School District of Philadelphia Fiscal Year 2025 Capital Budget and Program Presented by . (Presented by John LaVacarre; Meka Perez, School District; Surekha Ramanjulu, School District)

The Philadelphia Home Rule Charter requires the City Planning Commission to review the School District of Philadelphia (SDP) Capital Budget and Program is scheduled for adoption on the May 30, 2024, for the fiscal year 2025, beginning on July 1, 2024

The School District is proposing to spend \$2.804 billion on capital improvements over the next six years. The district is also proposing to revise their FY2024 Capital Budget to \$200.9 million, a decrease of \$129.1 million from the originally adopted FY2024 budget of \$329.8 million. This reduction of funds reflects the actual project expenditures, as well as the reevaluation of projects and associated costs.

Mr. Hill took question and comments at this time (00:33:31).

3. Action Item: Subdivision plan to create two ne parcels "4B1" and "4B2" from existing parcel 4B at the Philadelphia Navy Yard. Presented By Meg Cavanaugh

The reason is to straight out stormwater fees and Utility bills . 4B1 is occupied by a tenant as 4B2 is not.

Staff recommendation is for Approval.

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:08:28).

Commissioner Gonzales asked why one parcel was excluded and the reason was because it is just a separate parcel "4C"

Seeing no further questions and comments from the Commission or Public, Chair Sharpe asked for a motion (01:09:14).

Motion duly made by Commissioner Patrick Eding and seconded by Commissioner Maria Gonzales to accept staff recommendation for Approval.

Chair Sharpe polled the Commission for the vote: Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Gaston, Commissioner Johns, Commissioner Summerville, Commissioner Powers, Commissioner Theil, Commissioner Grady, and Commissioner Gonzales

Motion carried to approve staff recommendation for Approval (8-0).

4. Action Item: Request for excess impervious coverage at 724 Saint Andrew Rd in Chestnut Hill (Presented by Meg Cavanaugh)

PCPC Minutes May 16,2024

I am being asked to increase the impervious coverage. The current allowable rate is 27%. The proposed impervious is 35%. This project meets all five criteria that is needed to extend. Proposed also are to subsurface infiltration basins.

Staff recommendation is for Approval.

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:15:00).

Seeing no further questions and comments from the Commission or Public, Chair Sharpe asked for a motion (01:18:00).

Motion duly made by Commissioner Maria Gonzales and seconded by Commissioner Patrick Eding to accept staff recommendation for Approval.

Chair Syrnick polled the Commission for the vote: Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Gaston, Commissioner Johns, Commissioner Eding, Commissioner Summerville, Commissioner Theil, Commissioner Grady, and Commissioner Gonzales

Motion carried to approve staff recommendation for approval (8-0).

5. Action Item: Zoning Bill No. 240336. Amending Title 14 of The Philadelphia Code, entitled "Zoning and Planning" by adding definitions; and creating a new Chestnut Hill Lower East /NCO in the area generally bounded by the SEPTA Chestnut Hill East Line, Cresheim Valley Drive, Germantown Avenue, Winston Road, Moreland Avenue, Devon Street, Ardleigh Street, and Springfield Avenue, under certain terms and conditions. Introduced by Councilmember Bass on April 25, 2024. (Presented by Ian Hegarty)

This bill proposes a Neighborhood Conservation Overlay, or NCO, regulating RSA-3 properties in a portion of the Chestnut Hill neighborhood in the Upper Northwest planning district. NCOs are zoning overlays that apply zoning and design requirements to residential properties.

Staff recommendation is Not for Approval.

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:32:39).

Commissioner Gaston asked if there was a way to impose historical standards. Ian Hegarty answered that this is to impose the outward layer regulation of new construction.

Statements for the public was continued as concerns were expressed about having the developments (01:36:33).

Commissioner Eding stated that we should be more considerate so that we are able to preserve the culture and not just put-up developments. This was regarding any development throughout the city

Seeing no further questions and comments from the Commission or Public, Chair Syrnick asked for a motion (01:57:04).

Motion duly made by Commissioner Peter Eding and seconded by Commissioner Maria Gonzales to hold for 45 days did not accept staff recommendation for Not Approved.

Chair Syrnick polled the Commission for the vote: Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Gaston, Commissioner Johns, Commissioner Eding, Commissioner Summerville, Commissioner Theil, Commissioner Grady, and Commissioner Gonzales

Motion carried out to approve staff recommendation for 45-day hold (8-0).

6. Action Item: Zoning Bill No. 240385. To amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Snyder Avenue, 6th Street, Cantrell Street, and 7th Street. Introduced by Councilmember Squilla on May 2, 2024. (Presented by Sarah Banh)

The original request for legislation was to modify the zoning classification for the properties located at 624-28 Snyder Avenue for SEAMAAC (Southeast Asian Mutual Aid Association). Staff looked at the existing block and felt that zoning on the block of CMX-1 could be elevated to CMX-2 to reflect the commercial nature of the block.

Staff recommendation is for Approval.

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:11:05).

Seeing no further questions and comments from the Commission or Public, Chair Sharpe asked for a motion (00:2:11:16).

Motion duly made by Commissioner Trave Brown and seconded by Commissioner Cherly Gaston to accept staff recommendation for Approval.

Chair Syrnick polled the Commission for the vote: Commissioner Brown,
Commissioner Gaston, Commissioner Johns, Commissioner Summerville,
Commissioner Eding, Commissioner Theil, Commissioner Grady, and
Commissioner Gonzales

Motion carried out to approve staff recommendation for approval (8-0).

 Action Item: Streets Bill No. 240382: Authorizing the installation, ownership and maintenance of various encroachments in the vicinity of 4432 Main Street, 4436-42 Main Street and 4436R Main Street, Philadelphia, PA 19127, under certain terms and conditions. Introduced by Councilmember Jones on May 2, 2024. (Presented by Daniel Farrell)

Staff recommendation is for 45 Days.

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:15:22).

Seeing no further questions and comments from the Commission or Public, Chair Syrnick asked for a motion (00:02:22:20)

Motion duly made by Commissioner Patrick Eding and seconded by Commissioner Cherly Gaston to accept staff recommendation for 45 Day.

Chair Syrnick polled the Commission for the vote: Commissioner Brown, Commissioner Gaston, Commissioner Johns, Commissioner Eding, Commissioner Summerville, Commissioner Theil, Commissioner Grady, and Commissioner Gonzales

Motion carried to approve staff recommendation for 45-day hold (8-1).

Chair Syrnick asked for a motion to adjourn at the minute mark in video (02:23:38).

Motion duly made by the Commission to adjourn the May Planning Commission.

The next Planning Commission is scheduled for June 6, 2024, at 1:00 p.m.

#### **SUMMARY**

1. Deputy Executive Director's Update.

**APPROVED** 

- 2. Comment and Review
- 3. Action Item: Subdivision plan to create two ne parcels "4B1" and "4B2" from existing parcel 4B at the Philadelphia Navy Yard

**APPROVED** 

- 4. Action Item: Request for excess impervious coverage at 724 Saint Andrew Rd in Chestnut Hill APPROVED
- 5. Action Item: Zoning Bill No. 240336 45-day hold
- 6. Action Item: Zoning Bill No. 240385 APPROVED
- 7. Action Item: Streets Bill No. 240382 45-day hold

# Ballard Spahr

1735 Market Street, 51st Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599 TEL 215.665.8500 FAX 215.864.8999 www.ballardspaht.com Matthew N. McClure Tel: 215.864.8771 mcclure@ballardspahr.com

February 16, 2024

Via E-mail and U.S. Mail

Ian Hegarty, AICP Philadelphia City Planning Commission 1515 Arch Street, 13th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Nominated East Mermaid Lane Neighborhood Conservation Overlay

Dear Ian:

As you know, we represent Mermaid East Associates, LLC ("Landowner"), an affiliate of The Goldenberg Group and the owner of 100-102 E. Mermaid Lane ("Landowner's Parcel"). Landowner's Parcel is the largest parcel of land subject to the pending nomination for a "East Mermaid Lane Neighborhood Conservation Overlay" (the "Nomination"), which we understand was submitted by five individuals who reside on the west side of Mermaid Lane across from Landowner's Parcel (the "Nominators"). As you also may know, the Nominators have been vocal opponents of multifamily development on Landowner's Parcel. This letter sets forth some of Landowner's substantive and procedural concerns about the Nomination.

# The Statutory and Regulatory Framework Governing the Adoption of a Neighborhood Conservation Overlay (a "NCO).

The Nominators submitted the Nomination to the Philadelphia City Planning Commission (the "Commission") pursuant to Sections 14-304(3)(f) and 14-504 of the Philadelphia Zoning Code (the "NCO Ordinance"). The provisions of the NCO Ordinance, as well as Section 11 of the Commission's Regulations (the "NCO Regulations"), govern the Commission's review and processing of the Nomination. As a general matter, the Commission has no power to consider the Nomination (as a NCO) outside of compliance with the NCO Ordinance and its NCO Regulations.

Section 14-304(3)(f) of the NCO Ordinance sets forth City Council's directives to the Commission regarding a nomination for a NCO. Once the Commission reviews and accepts a NCO nomination, the NCO Ordinance provides that "the Commission shall convene at least one public meeting within the /NCO district's proposed boundaries in order to seek public comment on the proposed /NCO district and design guidelines." *See* Phila. Code

Ian Hegarty, AICP February 16, 2024 Page 2

§ 14-304(3)(f)(.2). Section 11.2.4 of the NCO Regulations further (and unequivocally) provides that a public meeting to review a NCO must be convened by the Commission's Executive Director. Neither the NCO Ordinance nor the NCO Regulations permits this statutory requirement to be delegated to anyone else, let alone a non-governmental actor. <sup>1</sup>

## To Date, the Commission Has Failed to Convene a Public Meeting on the Nomination.

As you have previously informed us, the Commission has delegated the task of convening the statutorily required public meeting to the Nominators. We understand that this practice has been followed by the Commission with regard to other NCO nominations. Although objectively well meaning, we note that such practice violates both the NCO Ordinance and the NCO Regulations.

As we understand the facts, the Nominators originally intended to host the public meeting on a Friday evening: January 12, 2024 at 6:30 p.m. Leaving aside the oddity of convening a public meeting on a Friday evening, the Nominators reportedly sought to host the meeting during a snowstorm, but only agreed to reschedule the meeting at the behest of Councilperson Cindy Bass's Office. Thereafter, the Nominators rescheduled the public meeting for Thursday, February 8, 2024 at 6:30 p.m. (the "Nominators' Meeting").

Although Commission staff was present at the Nominators' Meeting, it was convened and entirely run by the Nominators. The Nominators started the meeting with a description of their past activities in opposing development -- signaling out with special emphasis the development of Landowner's Parcel. Thereafter, the nominator made a patently biased pitch for the Nomination and the proposed NCO. There was no objective explanation of the design criteria or the cost that a NCO may have on homeowners. Moreover, the proposed (and very detailed draft NCO legislation) was not even handed out until the actual meeting. For example, it was not posted on a publically accessible website in advance of the Nominators' Meeting. Even more troubling, the Nominators (and others) stated several

Moreover, pursuant to Section 11.2.3 of the NCO Regulations, the Commission's Executive Director is required to review a NCO nomination to determine if the proposed overlay area possess "a consistent architectural character as a result of a concentration of residential buildings of similar character or a continuity established by an overall plan." Without this factual finding, neither the Commission nor City Council can consider (and subsequently adopt) a NCO. See Phila. Code § 14-304(3)(f)(.4) and Commission Reg. § 11.1.5. To date, we have not received any documentation confirming that this factual finding has been made (let alone the substantive basis therefor).

Ian Hegarty, AICP February 16, 2024 Page 3

times that a primary purpose of the Nomination was to frustrate the development of Landowner's Parcel. Obviously, this is an improper legislative purpose.<sup>2</sup>

The Nominators' Meeting failed to comply with the specific requirements and objectives of the NCO Ordinance and the NCO Regulations. If the Commission believes that the Nomination substantively complies with Section 14-304(3)(f)(.4) of the NCO Ordinance (and has made such a factual finding), the Commission is required to convene its own public meeting to present the Nomination and the Commission's findings, as well as to assess public support of the Nomination after an objective review of the proposed requirements. For the Commission to proceed with the Nomination relying on Nominators' Meeting alone, however, would be a violation of governing law.<sup>3</sup>

## The Future Development of Landowner's Parcel

Notwithstanding the objections to Nominators' Meeting, Landowner remains committed to finding a path forward to develop Landowner's Parcel consistent with solid land planning principles, market conditions and appropriate property owner stewardship. To that end, we understand that our client has requested time to meet with Commission staff to review various development concepts. We greatly appreciate the Commission's efforts in this regard. Landowner looks forward to working with the Commission's staff on this important endeavor.

Very truly vours

Natthew N. McClure

MNM/mpg

We note that Landowner's Parcel is currently zoned RSA-3. As you know, there has been nothing on 102 E. Mermaid Lane even remotely consistent with the RSA-3 regulations for decades (if ever). The current improvements are not (and have never been) single family residential. Although not the purpose of this letter, Landowner reserves the right to object to the current RSA-3 zoning as being substantively infirm under Pennsylvania law.

We also note that the Nomination does not, however, comply with Section 14-304(3)(f)(.4) of the NCO Ordinance. As such, the Nomination should not proceed.

Ian Hegarty, AICP February 16, 2024 Page 4

cc: Mr. Charles Richardson (Office of Councilperson Cindy Bass)

John Mondlak, Esq. (Interim Director, Department of Planning and Development)

Leonard F. Reuter, Esq.(Philadelphia Law Department)

Kevin M. Trapper (The Goldenberg Group) Mr. Rob Fluehr, Jr. (The Goldenberg Group)

Devon Beverly, Esquire Meredith Trego, Esquire

## Fw: East Mermaid Lane NCO Legislation -- Bill No. 2400336

## Leonard Reuter < Leonard.Reuter@Phila.gov>

Thu 5/16/2024 3:02 PM

To:David Fecteau <David.Fecteau@phila.gov>;Paula Brumbelow <Paula.Brumbelow@Phila.gov>;lan Hegarty <lan.Hegarty@Phila.gov>

This is the email he's asking to be put in the record. I'm fine with that. As it was attorney to attorney, I would not have put this in the record, but since he's asking me to do that, I assume he's waiving any issues with that...

Leonard F. Reuter Senior Attorney City of Philadelphia Law Department 1515 Arch St, 15<sup>th</sup> Fl. Philadelphia, PA 19102 Leonard.reuter@phila.gov

This electronic mail transmission and the documents accompanying it contain information from The City of Philadelphia Law Department, which is confidential and/or legally privileged. The information is intended only for the use of the individual or entity named in this transmission. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, copying, distribution or the taking of any action in reliance on the contents of this information is strictly prohibited.

From: McClure, Matthew N. <McClure@ballardspahr.com>

Sent: Tuesday, May 7, 2024 6:30 PM

To: Leonard Reuter < Leonard. Reuter @ Phila.gov>

Subject: East Mermaid Lane NCO Legislation -- Bill No. 2400336

External Email Notice. This email comes from outside of City government. Do not click on links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender.

### Len:

In our free time tomorrow, can we discuss this legislation (which will be before PCPC on March 16)? We have concerns that the legislation does not comply with procedural and substantive requirements of the NCO provisions of the zoning code. Let me know when you can talk.

All the best,

### Matt

Matthew N. McClure
He/Him/His
Ballard Spahr LLP
1735 Market Street, 51st Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103-7599
Direct 215.864.8771

Mobile <u>267.872.4238</u> mcclure@ballardspahr.com www.ballardspahr.com

From: Beverly, Devon < <a href="mailto:BeverlyD@ballardspahr.com">BeverlyD@ballardspahr.com</a>>

Sent: Monday, May 6, 2024 10:08 PM

To: McClure, Matthew N. < McClure@ballardspahr.com >

Subject: East Mermaid Lane NCO Legislation

Matt,

Below please find my findings with regards to the procedural and substantive issues with Bill No. 240336 introduced in City Council on April 25, 2024.

To begin with, the creation of Neighborhood Conservation Overlay Districts (each a "NCO") is governed by Sections 14-304(3)(f) and 14-504 of the Philadelphia Zoning Code (the "NCO Ordinance"). NCOs are further governed by Section 11 of the Philadelphia City Planning Commission's Regulations (the "NCO Regulations"). As a general matter, the Philadelphia City Planning Commission ("PCPC") has no power to consider a NCO nomination unless the nomination complies with the NCO Ordinance and NCO Regulations. Further, per the NCO Ordinance, City Council cannot consider, nor subsequently adopt NCO legislation, until City Council has referred the proposed ordinance to PCPC for comment and waited at least 30 days for PCPC recommendations. PCPC may extend its review period per Section 2-307 of the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter.

Given the above, we believe that there are a number of procedural issues and at least one substantive issue with Bill No. 2400336.

### Procedural Issues with Consideration of Bill No. 240336

- 1. Section 14-304(3)(f)(.1) of the NCO Ordinance states that a petition for the creation of a NCO must be filed with PCPC either (i) by a Local Registered Community Organization located within the proposed NCO boundaries or (ii) by [that certain petition] containing the signatures of at least thirty percent (30%) of all property owners or at least thirty percent (30%) of all owners of owner-occupied housing units located within the proposed NCO. The petition must include a draft map of the NCO boundaries and draft design guidelines. (See also Section 11.2.2 of the Regulations)
  - a. Here, the petition was submitted by five individuals not a local RCO. And, the petition <u>did not</u> contain the signatures of 30% of all property owners within the area or the proposed NCO area.
  - b. Further, the petition lacked the required proposed design guidelines.
  - c. As such, the petition was improperly filed and fails to meet the threshold requirements for consideration set forth by the NCO Ordinance.

NOTE: the petition (as an instrument of notice), must be filed with the PCPC before the public meeting to establish that residents are well informed about the proposal.

- 2. Section 11.1.3 of the Regulations requires that PCPC's Executive Director make a determination that at least seventy percent (70%) of the NCO's proposed area be of residential use and zoned residential prior to any consideration of the nomination.
  - a. Here, 43% (or 45% if you exclude the RSA-5 properties from the area) of the proposed NCO area are non-residential. Therefore, the Executive Director cannot make a finding that 70% of the proposed area is residential. Therefore, the proposed NCO fails to meet the threshold nomination criteria for consideration set forth in the NCO Regulations.
- 3. Section 11.1.3 of the Regulations requires that PCPC's Executive Director make a determination that the proposed NCO "possess a <u>consistent architectural character</u> as a result of a concentration of residential

buildings of similar character or a continuity established by an overall plan."

- a. Here, PCPC's Executive Director has not made a finding that the residential buildings within the proposed NCO area possess a consistent architectural character. In fact, the staff of the PCPC has told us that there is no consistent architectural character. Therefore, the proposed NCO fails to meet the threshold nomination criteria for consideration set forth in the NCO Regulations.
- 4. NCO Regulations Section 11.2.4 and NCO Ordinance Section 14-304(3)(f)(.3) requires that PCPC convene at least one public meeting within the proposed NCO's boundaries in order to seek public comment on the proposed NCO and its design guidelines. Neither the NCO Ordinance nor the NCO Regulations permit this statutory requirement to be delegated to anyone else, let alone a non-governmental actor. Further, adequate notice must be given to all individuals within the proposed NCO boundaries.
  - a. Here, PCPC improperly delegated its responsibility of convening a public meeting to a handful of neighbors. Also, PCPC did not provide sufficient public notice of the meeting. The meeting information was not posted on a publically accessible website in advance of the meeting.

#### Substantive Issues with Bill No. 240336

Section 14-504(7)(c)(.1) of the proposed legislation states that "the design of new buildings shall be
consistent with the character defining features of the Chestnut Hill National Historic District, in terms of
massing, vertical and horizontal articulation, proportion of window openings to wall area, and building
materials." This language does not provide any objective design standards for the NCO district, thus
property owners within the district would be subject to completely subjective (and potentially arbitrary)
design standards.

Attended	User Name (Original Name)	Join Time	Leave Time
Yes	Letitia McNeil	5/16/2024 13:30	5/16/2024 13:31
Yes	Letitia (Letitia McNeil)	5/16/2024 13:32	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	John LaVaccare (PCPC Staff) (John LaVacarre)	5/16/2024 12:53	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Peter Barnard (PCPC Staff) (Peter Barnard)	5/16/2024 12:52	5/16/2024 12:54
Yes	Peter Barnard	5/16/2024 12:55	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Kathleen Grady (she/her) (Peter Barnard)	5/16/2024 13:03	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	David Fecteau (PCPC Staff) (David Fecteau)	5/16/2024 12:51	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	David Fecteau	5/16/2024 13:11	5/16/2024 13:21
Yes	Sarah Banh# PCPC Staff (Sarah Banh)	5/16/2024 12:49	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Adam Thiel	5/16/2024 13:04	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Dan Farrell	5/16/2024 13:01	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Dan Farrell	5/16/2024 13:09	5/16/2024 13:11
Yes	Michael Johns	5/16/2024 12:56	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Meka Perez# SDP Ops Manager (Meka Perez)	5/16/2024 12:22	5/16/2024 14:09
Yes	Oz Hill# SDP COO (Meka Perez)	5/16/2024 12:24	5/16/2024 14:09
Yes	Dawn Summerville	5/16/2024 13:01	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Cheryl Gaston	5/16/2024 12:53	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Greg Waldman   PCPC Staff (Greg Waldman)	5/16/2024 12:56	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Patrick Eiding	5/16/2024 12:54	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Surekha Ramanjulu	5/16/2024 12:47	5/16/2024 14:06
Yes	Maria Gonzalez	5/16/2024 12:57	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	lan Hegarty (PCPC Staff# he/him) (lan Hegarty)	5/16/2024 12:55	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Meg Cavanagh (PCPC Staff) she/her (Meg Cavanagh)	5/16/2024 12:44	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Leonard Reuter	5/16/2024 13:30	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Tavare Brown	5/16/2024 13:03	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Jametta Johnson(PCPC staff) (Jametta Johnson)	5/16/2024 12:38	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Billy Collins (PCPC Staff) He/him (Billy Collins)	5/16/2024 12:50	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Paula Brumbelow Burns	5/16/2024 12:55	5/16/2024 15:26
Yes	Joseph Syrnick	5/16/2024 12:56	5/16/2024 15:26

Time in Session (minutes)	Is Guest	Country/Region Name
2	Yes	United States
114	Yes	United States
153	Yes	United States
2	Yes	United States
151	Yes	United States
144	Yes	United States
155	Yes	United States
11	Yes	United States
158	Yes	United States
142	Yes	United States
145	Yes	United States
2	Yes	United States
151	Yes	United States
108	Yes	United States
106	Yes	United States
145	Yes	United States
153	Yes	United States
150	Yes	United States
152	Yes	United States
80	Yes	United States
149	Yes	United States
151	Yes	United States
162	Yes	United States
116	Yes	United States
143	Yes	United States
168	Yes	United States
156	Yes	United States
151	Yes	United States
151	Yes	United States

Attended	ttended User Name (Original Name)				
Yes	Jen Lava				
Yes	Ross	5/16/2024 13:17			
Yes	Cindy LaRue (PCPC Staff)	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Abigail Sobotka/Briner 5.				
Yes	Brian Wenrich (PCPC staff)	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Brian Wenrich	5/16/2024 14:51			
Yes	Emma Sonner (she/her)	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Stephanie Pennypacker	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Cynthia Brey -	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Kacie Liss	5/16/2024 13:03			
Yes	Keith Davis _ PCPC Staff	5/16/2024 13:08			
Yes	Robert Caserio	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	blumgarj	5/16/2024 13:08			
Yes	Tracie Jackson   The Maple Corporation	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Michael Gall	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Marissa Howard (JKRP)	5/16/2024 13:35			
Yes	JKRP Architects - Marissa Howard	5/16/2024 14:28			
Yes	Erin DeRocini	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Matt Wysong	5/16/2024 13:05			
Yes	N	5/16/2024 15:12			
Yes	Ben Schmidt	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Ben Schmidt	5/16/2024 13:52			
Yes	Kyle Brown, AICP	5/16/2024 14:49			
Yes	Adam Schantz	5/16/2024 13:05			
Yes	Joy C	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Joy C	5/16/2024 13:09			
Yes	Eliza Bower (Staff)	5/16/2024 13:13			
Yes	Aaron Holly	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Celeste Hardester	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Bruce.Bohri	5/16/2024 13:30			
Yes	12155685096	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Alex Smith	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Calvin Williams	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Mina Monavarian (Staff)	5/16/2024 13:03			
Yes	Adam Thiel	5/16/2024 13:03			
Yes	Rebekah L. Grimes	5/16/2024 13:52			
Yes	Larry	5/16/2024 13:30			
Yes	Leigh Clark	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Jimmy Stiving	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Jimmy Stiving	5/16/2024 13:50			
Yes	peterstraus	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Nicole Ozdemir	5/16/2024 13:02			
Yes	Teresa Fleming	5/16/2024 13:02			

Yes	Stephanie Magagna	5/16/2024 13:35
Yes	Rell Brown	5/16/2024 13:19
Yes	aaron	5/16/2024 13:19
Yes	aaron	5/16/2024 15:15
Yes	Shaun Douglas, Deputy COO, SDP	5/16/2024 13:13
		5/16/2024 13:34
Yes	Shaun Douglas, Deputy COO, SDP	
Yes	Brett Feldman	5/16/2024 14:32
Yes	Marcus's OtterPilot	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	David Archibald	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Doris Aldridge	5/16/2024 13:24
Yes	Doris Aldridge	5/16/2024 14:47
Yes	Doris Aldridge	5/16/2024 14:57
Yes	Judith Robinson	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Jason Tucker	5/16/2024 13:19
Yes	Samantha	5/16/2024 14:15
Yes	Stephen Megargee	5/16/2024 13:39
Yes	Alan Fody (PWD)	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Jaylene Gutierrez (She/Her)	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Guest Guest	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	12158435555	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	robf	5/16/2024 13:54
Yes	gregoryl	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Nate Mollway - Moto	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	sultan	5/16/2024 13:03
Yes	Sultan Smalley	5/16/2024 13:06
Yes	Ian Litwin (staff)	5/16/2024 13:13
Yes	Ian Litwin (staff)	5/16/2024 14:09
Yes	Dylan Langley, PIDC	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Dylan Langley, PIDC	5/16/2024 13:18
Yes	Sarah Chiu	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Sarah Chiu	5/16/2024 13:13
Yes	Emma Mevin School District of Philadelphia GSI Program Manager	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Henry Felsman	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	emcmahon	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Mark Le Munyon	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Anthony christinzio	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Cassandra	5/16/2024 13:24
Yes	Cassandra	5/16/2024 13:59
Yes	Cassandra	5/16/2024 14:31
Yes	James.Kellett	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Jonathan Goins	5/16/2024 13:05
Yes	Jonathan	5/16/2024 14:56
Yes	Steve Talbott	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Kevin Trapper	5/16/2024 13:05
163	κενιιι παρμεί	0/ 10/2024 10:00

Yes	mgladnick	5/16/2024 14:46
Yes	a weiss/SoLo	5/16/2024 13:15
Yes	12158435555	5/16/2024 14:47
Yes	Camille Peluso	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Nathan Grace	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Nina Solomonic	5/16/2024 13:10
Yes	Ali	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Ali	5/16/2024 14:21
Yes	Ali	5/16/2024 14:46
Yes	Ali	5/16/2024 14:47
Yes	Ali	5/16/2024 14:48
Yes	Ann Williams	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Mark	5/16/2024 13:05
Yes	Cassidy Martin	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Cassidy Martin	5/16/2024 13:14
Yes	Cassidy Martin	5/16/2024 14:59
Yes	Jack Conviser (PCPC)	5/16/2024 13:06
Yes	Jack Conviser (PCPC)	5/16/2024 15:09
Yes	Patrick Osei-SDP	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Patrick Osei-SDP	5/16/2024 13:12
Yes	Kate Witiak	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Ronald.Bednar	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Sterling Scott	5/16/2024 13:02
Yes	Nicole Simonsen	5/16/2024 13:02

Leave Time	Time in Session (minutes)	Is Guest	Country/Region Name
5/16/2024 13:16	14	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:14	117	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:44	102	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	35	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:11	129	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	143	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	138	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:11	130	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:13	125	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:16	135	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	111	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	58	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:11	69	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	141	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:25	14	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:20	19	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	94	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	37	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:00	55	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:07	6	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:03	114	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	133	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	116	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:25	143	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:03	1	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	94	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:15	106	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:11	69	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:03	1	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:25	96	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:25	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:12	71	Yes	United States

5/16/2024 15:26	111	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:05	106 27	Yes Yes	United States United States
5/16/2024 13:35			
5/16/2024 15:26	11	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:33	25	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:56	22	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:25	54	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:45	103	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:22	81	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:47	83	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:57	10	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	29	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:11	113	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	71	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:11	93	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:45	103	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:23	81	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:15	13	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:11	78	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:16	134	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:01	119	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:06	4	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	140	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:58	46	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	78	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:18	16	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:13	55	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:09	7	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	134	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:09	67	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:58	57	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:58	34	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:03	4	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:42	12	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	141	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:08	12	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:09	67	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:11	127	Yes	United States
5/10/2024 15:11	12/	res	Officed States

5/16/2024 15:26	40	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:47	92	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	39	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:12	130	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:25	143	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	136	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:21	79	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:46	25	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:47	2	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:48	1	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	39	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:12	128	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:13	11	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:33	80	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	27	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:06	120	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	17	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 13:11	10	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:09	58	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	Sweden
5/16/2024 14:56	114	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 14:33	92	Yes	United States
5/16/2024 15:26	144	Yes	United States

				I	I		
#	Question	Asker Name	Answer	Question Time	Answered Time	Answer Name	Answer Email
			Please raise your hand and				
	will the fitler school 140 w seymour st phila pa 19144		address your question to the Commissioners and School				
1	get a playgound this coming year?	a weiss/SoLo	District staff.	5/16/2024 12:20	5/16/2024 13:29	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
2		a weiss/SoLo	District stall.	5/16/2024 13:38	5/16/2024 15.29	David Fecteau	uaviu.iecteau@piiita.gov
3	sure thank you Calvin Williams has Hand Up.	Calvin Williams		5/16/2024 13:38			
4	how do we contact mr hill?	a weiss/SoLo	abill@philagd.org	5/16/2024 14:06	5/16/2024 14:06	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
5	thank you	a weiss/SoLo	ohill@philasd.org	5/16/2024 14:07	3/16/2024 14.06	David Fecteau	uaviu.iecteau@piiita.gov
3	IT'S CALLED ROOTSTOCK!!!	a weiss/sulu		3/10/2024 14.07			
	When one comes looking for their Roots, and they						
	have been DEMOTED!!!						
	By Mindy Fullilove		Please raise your hand to				
	Calvin and Other , order a Copy !!!		address your comments to the				
6	Continues to be important!!	Judith Robinson	Commissioners.	5/16/2024 14:10	5/16/2024 14:11	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
	Communication and important	700111111001110011			0.10.10111111	241141 001044	aarranootoaac piinai8ot
	I will be expecting a materials be guaranteed the						
	accountability the materials used in the construction						
	or equivalent must have responsible contractors						
	working on your building and keep them in cold and						
	we need to lose or anything like that calling basement						
	pack walls so please have total inspection of		Please raise your hand and				
	materials and work being done otherwise they don't		address your comment to the				
7	approved	Sterling Scott	Commissioners.	5/16/2024 14:29	5/16/2024 14:29	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
		<u> </u>				- 3	G F (G - )
	typo how will the inspection of materials and the						
	proper use going construction phase do you really do		Zoning does not deal with				
	not need to have leaky roofs or crack foundations ,		contractor behavior or				
	the people have accountability on all things are		certification. Please raise your				
	construction to make sure to work is properly done by		hand and address your question				
8	qualified contractors	Sterling Scott	to the Commissioners.	5/16/2024 14:31	5/16/2024 14:32	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
	I live in one of two semi-attached homes within the						
	NCO on Mermaid Lane. At a very densely populated						
	corner of Mermaid Lane. The unique residential and						
	architectural character of Chestut Hill is its attraction						
	and its selling point. The NCO wants to continue that		Please raise your hand and				
	attraction and make it available for all those who want		address your comment to the				
9	to live here.	Robert Caserio	Commissioners.	5/16/2024 14:38	5/16/2024 14:39	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
			I see you in the audience.				
			Please try again. If we see your				
			hand, we will unmute you so				
10	I am raising my hand, and it's not being registered.	Robert Caserio	you can speak.	5/16/2024 14:39	5/16/2024 14:41	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
			Please trying pressing *9 and				
11	okay I hope you can recognize me	Robert Caserio	we'll see if that works.	5/16/2024 14:42	5/16/2024 14:44	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
			Your name keeps flashing on an				
			off. If you try #9 only once, we				
			can see if that works.				
	It doesn't seem to work. Can you read on my behalf	B. 1	Otherwise, we may be able to	F /4 0 /5 = = : :	F.4.0.0000		
12	what I have sent?	Robert Caserio	promote you another way.	5/16/2024 14:46	5/16/2024 14:47	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
			V 0. !! 1				
			Yes Sultan. Thank you for your				
			question. By early next week,				
			you'll find the recording here:				
			https://www.phila.gov/departm				
			ents/philadelphia-city-planning-				
	will the recording from this meeting be posted	<b>.</b>	commission/recordings-of-				
13	somewhere?	Sultan Smalley	public-meetings/	5/16/2024 14:54	5/16/2024 14:55	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
			,,,				
			We usually only allow people to				
			speak once. We need to give				
	Please may I spake again. I am a member of the		everyone a chance to comment.				
	Chestnut Hill Community Association and the Land		And we only have a quorum for				
14	use and Planning zoning committee	Camille Peluso	a limited time.	5/16/2024 14:54	5/16/2024 14:57	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
4-	Ikia makua miina difambla NOO	0		F/40/000111 ==			
15	It is not required for the NCO to come before an RCO	Camille Peluso		5/16/2024 14:55			
4.0	The chesnut Hill Community Association refused to	October D. I		E /4 0 /000 4 4 1 5 =			
16	review the NCO when presented	Camille Peluso	Vou oro woles as	5/16/2024 14:55 5/16/2024 14:57		David Fasts	david footoor
17	okay thank you.	Sultan Smalley	You are welcome		5/16/2024 14:57	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
18	please help us preserver our neighborhood	Camille Peluso		5/16/2024 15:00			

				ı			
19	I can't get my speaker to work.  I simply want to point out that you today, are making decisions that will effect Philadelphians for generations. Years from now, when young people and future generations see what CH used to look like. They will ask, "What happened?" will the answer be, well, there was a meeting in 2024 that was the beginning of the end for beautiful places to live Stephen Megargee. Thank you	Stephen Megargee	The Commissioners have moved on from public comments. Thank you for writing in today.	5/16/2024 15:01	5/16/2024 15:01	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
	I can't get my speaker to work.						
	I simply want to point out that you today, are making						
	decisions that will effect Philadelphians for						
	generations. Years from now, when young people and						
	future generations see what CH used to look like. They						
	will ask, "What happened?" will the answer be, well,						
	there was a meeting in 2024 that was the beginning of		You can also provide public				
19	the end for beautiful places to live Stephen Megargee. Thank you	Stephen Megargee	comment to City Council during their hearings.	5/16/2024 15:01	5/16/2024 15:02	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
19	It is not required to be reviewed by any RCO according	Stephen Megalgee	their nearings.	3/10/2024 13:01	3/10/2024 13.02	David Fecteau	uaviu.iecteau@piiita.gov
20	to your process	Camille Peluso		5/16/2024 15:05			
			That is correct. But there ideally				
	It is my understanding that an RCO does not need to		does have to be a community				
21	approve or present an NCO	Cynthia Brey -	vote.	5/16/2024 15:06	5/16/2024 15:06	David Fecteau	david.fecteau@phila.gov
	There is no requirement for an NCO To be reviewed by						
22	an RCO	Camille Peluso		5/16/2024 15:06			
	There was a community neighborhood vote. We						
23	worked closely with PCPC for three years and folllowed their lead	Camille Peluso		5/16/2024 15:07			
23	We had a community meeting which was open to all	Carrille Felusu		3/10/2024 13:0/			
	We have received more than the required signatures						
24	in support of the NCO.	Cynthia Brey -		5/16/2024 15:07			
	The members of the CHCA that spoke do not live	-					
25	within the bounday of the NCO.	Cynthia Brey -		5/16/2024 15:08			
	We ARE the community. The RCO persons who spoke						
	today attended the neighborhood meeting in February, and the developer the Goldenberg Group attended the						
26	meeting in February.	Robert Caserio		5/16/2024 15:09			
	mooming mir oblidary.	1100011 0400110	<u> </u>	3. 10. 202 - 10.00			