



June 18, 2024

Andrew Kulp
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 30-36 S 52nd St (Application # ZP-2023-013801)

Dear Andrew,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development consisting of two buildings at 30-36 S 52nd Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes two (2) mixed-use buildings totaling 125,454 gross square feet, including 204 total dwelling units, two (2) commercial spaces, one (1) loading zone, and 68 bike parking spaces. There are no vehicular parking spaces proposed. Both buildings are proposed to be six (6) stories, with one facing Chestnut Street (33 dwelling units) and one facing Ludlow Street (171 dwelling units). The proposal also includes a green roof with roof deck access for residents of both buildings and a shared side yard for both buildings' residents. The parcel is zoned CMX-2.5, located in the Mixed-Income Neighborhoods (MIN) and Transit-Oriented Development (TOD) Overlay Districts, and is a by-right project.

At its meeting of June 4, 2024, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (Cobbs Creek Neighbors Association)

The RCO representative noted that a second community meeting was held the night before the CDR meeting, and that at the first community meeting, the project was received favorably. The RCO representative provided several comments:

- A request for additional bike racks at ground level, located either in the shared side yard or along the sidewalk.
- Concerns about the blank side facades of the Ludlow Street building.
- A request for more sustainability measures, including rooftop solar panels.
- A request to ensure that street trees are maximized.
- A request for an on-site property management office to help with safety, security, and cleanliness, located in the basement or ground floor.

Finally, the RCO representative noted that the community was overall supportive of the project, expressing appreciation for the design and the ongoing conversations between the development team and community members and stakeholders.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



Planning Commission staff also received a letter of non-opposition from the RCO prior to the meeting, with the hope that the development will help bolster the businesses along the 52nd St. commercial corridor. In addition, the letter noted the benefit of the added density encouraging public transportation use and walkable shopping experiences.

CDR Committee Comments

The Committee commended the development team for embracing the Mixed-Income Neighborhoods (MIN) Overlay and for gaining community support through outreach efforts. The Committee emphasized that, since this will be an early example of a project that makes use of the MIN Overlay (and potentially provide a model for future such projects), the details are important to get right; however, there are certain areas in the proposal where, the Committee noted, these details seem to be lacking or pose issues. The Committee expressed several concerns and recommendations to improve the project, including:

Building Design

- Consider further activation of the Ludlow Street frontage, including: increased ground floor transparency along Ludlow Street with larger commercial space; and opportunity to transform pedestrian experience of 5200 block of Ludlow Street by creating larger ground-floor units with street-facing entrances (by combining with adjacent ground floor or second story 1-BR units), more in line with what exists on the ground floor of the 5100 and 5300 blocks of Ludlow Street.
- Concerns that overall building design is missing mark with the combination of brick and metal.
- Concerns that party wall side facades of “Building 2” will appear as large gray walls.
 - Consider a combination of building articulation, windows, setbacks, and mural space.
- Concerns about lack of natural light in some of the residential units, including basement units, ground floor units, and units near elevators.
 - Consider opportunity to create units with better natural light by combining units on west side of “Building 2” into multi-bedroom units with windows on multiple facades.
- Concerns that Chestnut St. building (“Building 1”) has no relation to the adjacent buildings, particularly with regards to height.
 - Consider setbacks or other ways to address height discrepancy architecturally, stylistically, or through materiality.

Site and Open Space Design

- Concerns that the shared side yard appears as leftover space.
 - Consider improved integration with pedestrian walkways and opportunity for looped path.
 - Consider opportunity to provide added open space, larger landscape buffers, and enable improvements (including windows) to blank party walls, by slightly shrinking building footprint.
- Concerns about lack of shade on roof deck spaces. Consider shade structures and rooftop solar.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Jamie Gauthier, Council District 3, jamie.gauthier@phila.gov
Andrew Goodman, Representative to Council District 3, Andrew.goodman@phila.gov
Logan Dry, KCA Design Associates, logan.dry@kcadesignassociates.com
Sean Whalen, Vintage Law LLC, sw@vintagelaw.com
Larissa Mogano, Cobbs Creek Neighbors Association, cobbscreekneighbor@gmail.com
Kyle Sampson, West Philadelphia Economic Development Council publicpolicy@gmx.com
Vandelyn Waring, The Generationals of Philadelphia – Cobbs Creek, vandelyn.w@gmail.com
Ang Sun, West Philly United Neighbors, WPUNRCO@gmail.com
Brian Wenrich, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, brian.wenrich@phila.gov
Andrew Kulp, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, Andrew.kulp@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Ben She, Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems, benjamin.she@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA



June 18, 2024

Mark Griffenberg
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 246-52 S 59th St (Application # ZP-2023-002113)

Dear Mark,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed commercial mixed-use building at 246-52 S 59th Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a building totaling 82,090 gross square feet. The proposal includes 96 dwelling units, 3 commercial spaces, and 6 car parking spaces. The parcel is zoned CMX-3 Commercial Mixed-Use and is a by right proposal.

At its meeting of June 5, 2024, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (West Philadelphia Economic Development Council)

The design was supported by the RCO, with some concerns relating to Manning Street, as follows:

- Residents on Manning Street use their garages, but people do not walk there due to safety concerns (there is no lighting and is not welcoming).
- Residents encourage the applicant team to add bollards along Manning Street to prevent people from double parking and parking on the sidewalk.
- The RCO would like to see more improvements on this street including lighting and improved sidewalk conditions.

CDR Committee Comments

The Committee expressed support for the overall design, specifically the reuse of the warehouse building on the site and the extensive green roof. To improve the project, the committee recommended:

- Incorporating balconies to help make up for the lack of accessible open space on the site for residents.
- Add EV charging stations at each parking space.
- Incorporate solar panels in addition to the proposed green roof.
- Consider a building set back for the proposed building on Manning Street to achieve a Complete Streets Standard compliant (9 foot) sidewalk and allow for more ADA accessibility.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



- The team was asked to consider more thought to the trees proposed for the back side of the building as light access will be limited, prohibiting tree growth.

Additionally, the CDR committee discussed the idea of working with neighbors to reprogram Manning Street so that it is a shared auto / pedestrian space, but recognized that this may not be possible. There was also discussion about the commercial space proposed for the Manning Street frontage and how it may be hard to lease in the short term.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

cc:

Councilmember Jamie Gauthier, Council District 3, jamie.gauthier@phila.gov
Andrew Goodman, Representative to Council District 3, Andrew.goodman@phila.gov
Chris Class, Designblendz, chris.class@designblendz.com
Rachael J. Pritzker, Pritzker Law Group LLC, rachael@pritzkerlg.com
Carman Hubbard, ACHIEVEability, carmen.hubbard@achieve-ability.org
Carl Johnson, 3rd Ward Republicans, cljrr2000@yahoo.com
Larissa Mogano, Cobbs Creek Neighborhood Association, cobbscreekneighbor@gmail.com
Ronald G. Waters, 3rd Ward Executive Committee, rwaters9@verizon.net
Kyle Sampson, West Philadelphia Economic Development Council, publicpolicy@gmx.com
Greg Spear, The Generationals of Philadelphia- Cobbs Creek, gregspear@me.com
Brian Wenrich, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, brian.wenrich@phila.gov
Mark Giffenberg, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, mark.griffenberg@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Ben She, Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems, benjamin.she@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA



June 18, 2024

Chanwoo Jung
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 4600 Island Ave, #A (Application # ZP-2024-001260)

Dear Chanwoo,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed industrial cold storage building at 4600 Island Avenue, #A.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a 261,478 square foot industrial cold storage building with associated paving, utilities, landscaping, and stormwater management controls. The parcel is zoned SP-AIR and is a by-right project.

At its meeting of June 4, 2024, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (40th Ward Republican RCO and Eastwick United CDC)

The RCO representative noted that they understand the industrial nature of the project and its limited public interactions. However, they encouraged the design team to embrace access via public transportation and bicycles to the greatest extent possible considering the projects locations and security needs. Further the RCO suggested using the roof for public art viewable from planes landing at the airport.

RCO Comments: (Eastwick United CDC)

The RCO representative expressed concern that the address of the parcel is confusing since truck access is via South Road and not Island Avenue.

CDR Committee Comments

Due to the limited public access and industrial nature of the proposed project, the CDR committee had limited comments. In particular, the committee was appreciative of the following features of the project:

- The project is engineered to be solar ready (due to the nature of the building, this will be a tenant decision based on heat load),
- The landscaping adjacent to the driveway, and
- Color changes made to the office entries in response to staff comments.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Council President Kenyatta Johnson, 2nd Council District, kenyatta.johnson@phila.gov
Frantz Pierre, Representative to 2nd Council District, frantz.pierre@phila.gov
Brett Nedelkoff, Representative to 2nd Council District, brett.nedelkoff@phila.gov
Katherine Missimer, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, kmissimer@klehr.com
Cornelius Brown, PE, Bohler Engineering PA, LLC, cbrown@bohlereng.com
Carolyn Moseley, Eastwick Community Network, moseleymose@gmail.com
Craig Melidosian, 40th Ward Republicans, craigsolve@aol.com
Theodore Pickett, Eastwick United CDC, thpickett@comcast.net
Jonathan Goins, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, jonathan.goins@phila.gov
Chanwoo Jung, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, chanwoo.jung@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Ben She, Office of Transportation and Infrastructure Systems, benjamin.she@phila.gov
Jonathan Goins, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, jonathan.goins@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA