

**REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION  
OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**WEDNESDAY, 17 APRIL 2024  
REMOTE MEETING ON ZOOM  
EMILY COOPERMAN, CHAIR**

**CALL TO ORDER**

**START TIME IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 00:00:00

The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. The following Committee members joined her:

<b>Committee Member</b>	<b>Present</b>	<b>Absent</b>	<b>Comment</b>
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., Chair	X		
Suzanna Barucco	X		
Jeff Cohen, Ph.D.		X	
Bruce Laverty	X		
Debbie Miller	X		
Elizabeth Milroy, Ph.D.		X	

The meeting was held remotely via Zoom video and audio-conferencing software.

The following staff members were present:

- Jonathan Farnham, Executive Director
- Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner III
- Mary Costello, Esq., Law Department
- Laura DiPasquale, Historic Preservation Planner III
- Shannon Garrison, Historic Preservation Planner III
- Kristin Hankins, Historic Preservation Planner I
- Heather Hendrickson, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Ted Maust, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Leonard Reuter, Esq., Law Department
- Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Alex Till, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons attended the online meeting:

- Abbey Lewis
- Adam Goldman
- Albert Krull
- Allison Weiss, SoLo Germantown
- Amy Lambert
- Andrew Goodman, City Councilmember Gauthier's Office
- Andrew Scott
- Angela Kent
- Anna Steiner
- Anthony Killough, Penn Holdings Pine 1 LLC
- Barbara Tilley

Barry Grossbach  
Brett Feldman, Esq., Klehr Harrison  
Cameron O'Grady  
Carla Willard  
Carlin Romano  
Daniel Trubman  
David G. Orphanides, Esq., Orphanides & Toner LLP  
David Othmer  
David Traub, Save Our Sites  
Della Langan  
Dennis Carlisle, OCF  
Ed Foote  
Elizabeth Burns  
Elizabeth Planet  
Emily Scolnick  
Fay Beauchamp  
George Poulin  
Greg Berzinsky  
Gregory Fisher  
Gregory Montanaro  
Hanna Stark, Preservation Alliance  
Janine Sanzari  
Jake Torkelson  
James Shmalo  
Jamie Vann  
Jan Singer  
Jane Chi  
Jason Diamond  
Jay Farrell  
Jeanette Litts  
Jeffrey Lin  
Jenine Sanzari  
Joan Weiner  
John Polanin  
Julie Bush  
Karen Bliss  
Kathy Dowdell  
Keeping Society  
Kevin Block  
Kevin McMahon  
Kostis Kourelis  
Lauren Leatherbarrow  
Libby Rosof  
LiLing Choing  
Lori Salganicoff, Chestnut Hill Conservancy  
Marjorie Russell  
Mark Graefe  
Mark Brack  
Marta Bartholomew  
Mary Berzinsky  
Mathew Grubel

Matt Myers  
Matthew Campbell  
Max Polichuk  
Michael Hersher  
Michael McIlhinney, Esq.  
Michael Phillips, Esq.  
Michael Ramos  
Michael Tucker  
Minesh Shah  
M. Nixon  
Nancy Brisbon  
Nancy Pontone  
Oleg Sokolov, Esq.  
Padhraig Higgins  
Pat Lavelle  
Patrick Bayer  
Richard Wentzel  
Russell Fulton  
George Thomas  
Samantka Monroe  
Sharon Fleming  
Stanley Uhr  
Stephanie Boggs Magagna, Esq.  
Steven Peitzman  
Suzanna Barucco  
Suzanne Ponsen, WCGN  
Terry Mond  
Timothy Kerner  
Tiziana Fox  
Tony West  
Tre Ambroise  
Vimukti Aslan  
Wayne Marquardt  
Will Tung  
Zoe Greenberg

## **AGENDA**

### **424 E WOODLAWN ST**

Name of Resource: Smith-Steel-Humphreys House

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: 424 E Woodlawn LLC

Nominator: Oscar Beisert

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 424 E. Woodlawn Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property, known as “Smith-Steel-Humphreys House,” satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J. The nomination states that the property satisfies Criterion A, owing to its significant character, interest, and value as part of the development of the Borough of Germantown, during a period in which it was transformed from a German village to one of the premier suburbs of Philadelphia. It is noted under Criterion A that 424 E. Woodlawn Street is also significant for its longtime association with Phebe Remington Westcott Humphreys (1864-1939), an important and prolific female author, “garden tastemaker,” horticulturist, journalist, and photographer, who occupied the subject house from 1894 to 1939. The nomination also contends satisfaction under Criterion J, as the Smith-Steel-Humphreys House is representative of early suburban, Romantic-era style dwelling types that served prosperous and often prominent Philadelphia families during the third and fourth quarters of the nineteenth century. The proposed period of significance for Criteria A and J is from the time of construction in 1850 through to the occupancy of Phebe Westcott Humphreys in 1939.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates the proposed historic district satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING:** 00:12:27

#### **PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Mehley presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Oscar Beisert represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

#### **DISCUSSION:**

- Ms. Miller commented that the fact that the house was moved to its current site is interesting because it changed context. She said she would not recommend that the property satisfies Criterion I but stated that the property presents an opportunity for further study of the physical landscape, including landscape archaeology, given the work of former owner Phebe Remington Westcott Humphreys. Ms. Miller said the nomination is well written and she supports designation.
- Mr. Laverty stated that the nomination is a good one, especially from a landscaping and gardening point of view. He commented that the property is a classic mid nineteenth-century example of suburban Germantown architecture. Mr. Laverty added that the biographies of the former owners were extremely helpful as they provided the reader with a great sense of continuity. He pointed to a description of “faux siding” that appeared on page 10 of the nomination and asked that it be revised for clarification.

- Ms. Barucco stated that she enjoyed the nomination. She commented that she appreciated reading about the discoveries that have led to our understanding of the landscape and garden history of Philadelphia, and about Phebe Remington Westcott Humphreys. Ms. Barucco stated that the nomination made her curious about Humphreys' writings and wished there could have been more about it in the nomination. She said that it could have provided greater insight into her ideas and personal viewpoints. She commented that she is always fascinated by women like Ms. Humphreys, who were busy writing and advising and telling people what style they should like. Ms. Barucco said she was pleased to hear that the owners commissioned the nomination, and she wishes them luck as they take steps toward stewardship of this important site. Ms. Barucco stated she supports the designation of the property.
- Ms. Cooperman said that Ms. Humphreys epitomizes a generation of women who paved the way for women of the next generation to become professionals in design and criticism. She pointed out they were change agents in a period that is often overlooked.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- Allison Weiss of SoLo Germantown Civic Association spoke in support of the nomination.
- Steven Peitzman of the East Falls Historical Society spoke in support of the nomination.
- Lori Salganicoff of the Chestnut Hill Conservancy spoke in support of the nomination.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:**

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The property owner commissioned the nomination of the property.
- The nomination is well researched and written.
- Although the nomination does not propose designation under Criterion I, the property's landscape is worthy of further study.
- The nomination highlights the life and work of Phebe Remington Westcott Humphreys.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion A, owing to its significant character, interest, and value as part of the development of the Borough of Germantown, and for its longtime association with Phebe Remington Westcott Humphreys, an important and prolific female author, "garden tastemaker," horticulturist, journalist, and photographer, who occupied the subject house from 1894 to 1939.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion J, as the Smith-Steel-Humphreys House is representative of early suburban, Romantic-era style dwelling types that served prosperous and often prominent Philadelphia families during the latter part of the nineteenth century.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 424 E Woodlawn St satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J.

<b>ITEM: 424 E WOODLAWN ST</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate; Criteria A and J</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Barucco</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Lavery</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller	X				
Elizabeth Milroy					X
Total	4				2

**ADDRESS: 1200-08 S BROAD ST**

Name of Resource: Order Sons of Italy in America, Grand Lodge of Pennsylvania

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: Programs for Exceptional People; Programs Employing People Inc.

Nominator: Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia, author Kevin McMahon

Staff Contact: Alex Till, [alexander.till@phila.gov](mailto:alexander.till@phila.gov)

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1200-08 S. Broad Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. A Modernist, two-story, steel-frame, institutional building known as the Order Sons of Italy in America, Grand Lodge of Pennsylvania, designed by the architecture firm of Carroll, Grisdale & Van Alen, and built in 1954, stands on the property.

The nomination contends that the Order Sons of Italy in America, Grand Lodge of Pennsylvania satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, E, and J. It argues that the building, owing to its use as the state headquarters for the Order Sons of Italy in America, Grand Lodge of Pennsylvania, and that organization’s importance to the Italian American community in Philadelphia, has significant character, interest, and value as part of the heritage and cultural characteristics of Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, and the Northeastern United States, satisfying Criterion A. In addition, it also exemplifies the cultural, political, social, and historical heritage of the South Philadelphia community, satisfying Criterion J.

The nomination also argues that the building reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies many of the distinguishing characteristics of the Modern architectural style, satisfying Criteria C & D.

The nomination further argues that the Carroll, Grisdale & Van Alen architecture firm, designers of the building, had a significant influence on the development of Modern styles of architecture in the city of Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion E.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1200-08 S. Broad Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, E, and J and should be designated as historic and listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 00:31:39**

**PRESENTERS:**

- Mr. Till presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Hanna Stark of the Preservation Alliance represented the nomination.
- Attorney Stephanie Boggs Magagna represented the equitable property owner. Michael Tucker represented the current owner, Programs Employing People.

**DISCUSSION:**

- Ms. Stark provided a brief summary of the nomination, highlighting the building's modern style, the architecture firm of Carroll, Grisdale & Van Allen, and its function as the headquarters of the Order Sons of Italy in America, Grand Lodge of Pennsylvania. She acknowledged that the Historical Commission has already approved plans for an addition to the building and specified that the Preservation Alliance is not opposed to that work.
- Ms. Magagna gave an overview of the building's recent history. She described the organization, Programs Employing People, which has owned and occupied the building for approximately 30 years. She described the organization's mission of serving individuals in the community with developmental disabilities and how their financial situation no longer allows them to continue with upkeep of the building. She reported that the recent addition that was approved by the Historical Commission and how that project will allow Programs Employing People to remain as tenants in the building and will add additional residential space to it. She stated that the equitable owners who are purchasing the property do not object to the nomination.
- Mr. Tucker described Programs Employing People's mission and function and how it has changed over time to need less dedicated space in their building. He also described some issues they have experienced with maintaining the building. He went on to say that his organization supports the nomination and looks forward to the future development and maintenance of the property.
- Mr. Lavery complimented the nomination and building. He added that he would not have guessed that this building was a lodge for a fraternal order upon seeing it and described it as "designed to incorporate the community." He continued to say that he agrees with the comments of Ms. Dowdell regarding Carroll, Grisdale & Van Alen being underrecognized.
- Ms. Cooperman agreed that Carroll, Grisdale & Van Alen deserves more recognition and pointed out that several of their designs appear on the National Register, but few do on the Philadelphia Register. She also complimented the comparison buildings by the firm that were described in the nomination and that added that the firm's work is important to the twentieth-century heritage of the city.
- Ms. Barucco echoed the statements made by previous Committee members on being surprised to see this design was made for a fraternal lodge and she also had not been very familiar with Carroll, Grisdale & Van Allen before reading this nomination. She also complimented the plan for the addition and the nomination overall.
- Ms. Miller commented that she also has a mental image of what a lodge like this usually looks like and that this building is a nice surprise to see.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- Kathy Dowdell commented in support of the nomination. She highlighted the inclusion of the Carroll, Grisdale & Van Alen architecture firm as part of the

nomination’s criteria for designation and described the firm as “not known as well as they should be.” She also complimented the plans for the addition to the building that have already been approved.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:**

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The property at 1200-08 S. Broad St was constructed in 1954 as headquarters of the Order Sons of Italy in America, Grand Lodge of Pennsylvania.
- The property was designed in the modern style by the architecture firm of Carroll, Gridsale & Van Alen.
- Carroll, Gridsale & Van Alen were a significant architectural firm designing buildings in modern styles in the mid twentieth century.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property, owing to its use as the state headquarters for the Order Sons of Italy in America, Grand Lodge of Pennsylvania, and that organization’s importance to the Italian American community in Philadelphia, has significant character, interest, and value as part of the heritage and cultural characteristics of Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, and the Northeastern United States, satisfying Criterion A.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property exemplifies the cultural, political, social, and historical heritage of the South Philadelphia community, satisfying Criterion J.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies many of the distinguishing characteristics of the Modern architectural style, satisfying Criteria C & D.
- The nomination demonstrates that the Carroll, Gridsale & Van Alen architecture firm, designers of the building, had a significant influence on the development of Modern styles of architecture in the City of Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion E.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1200-08 S. Broad Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, E, and J.

<b>ITEM: 1200-08 S BROAD ST</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate; Criteria A, C, D, E, and J</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Barucco</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Miller</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Debbie Miller	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Total	5				1



**ADDRESS: 4201-47 WOODLAND AVE**

Name of Resource: Griffith Hall

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: University of the Sciences/St. Joseph's University

Nominator: Preservation Alliance of Greater Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Alex Till, alexander.till@phila.gov

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes designating one of the buildings on the property at 4201-47 Woodland Avenue and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. A three-story masonry academic building known as Griffith Hall, designed by architects Norman Hulme and John J. Dull and built in the Georgian Revival style in 1927 and 1928, stands on the property.

The nomination contends that Griffith Hall satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, and D. It argues that the building has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or Nation as the oldest and most significant lasting academic building constructed by the Philadelphia College of Pharmacy and Science, the first college of Pharmacy in the United States and an institution that helped establish the modern field of pharmacology in the nineteenth century and continued to make significant and foundational contributions to that field throughout the nineteenth, twentieth, and twenty-first centuries.

The nomination argues that the building reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies many of the distinguishing characteristics of the Georgian Revival architectural style as seen on academic buildings, satisfying Criteria C & D.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4201-47 Woodland Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, and D and should be designated as historic and listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING:** 00:49:47

**PRESENTERS:**

- Mr. Till presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Hanna Stark of the Preservation Alliance represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

**DISCUSSION:**

- Ms. Stark gave a brief summary of the nomination highlighting the history of the Philadelphia College of Pharmacy and the building's Georgian Revival style.
- In response to Ms. Dowdell's public comment, Ms. Cooperman expressed interest in the lot as well and clarified that it is not currently covered under the proposed boundary. She asked if Ms. Dowdell could further explain the easement she mentioned.
  - Ms. Dowdell responded that based on looking at an old registry map, it appeared that there was a "utility easement" for the lot. She admitted to not knowing exactly what that meant or if it was current and she wanted to emphasize that the area should remain open to preserve the viewshed of the building.
  - Ms. Cooperman postulated that such an easement may prevent development on the lot, but that it would require more research to determine exactly what the

- easement would cover. She went on to ask Mr. Farnham about how potentially expanding the boundaries of the nomination would affect the review process
- Mr. Farnham responded that in order to expand the proposed boundary, the Historical Commission would have to notify the property owner of the potential designation of the property at least 30 days in advance of a meeting considering the designation and provide the owner with an opportunity to participate in the deliberations. He added that the Committee could also recommend that the Historical Commission designate the property as proposed and then direct the staff to amend the boundary and notify the property owner at that point.
  - Ms. Barucco commented that she learned more about the history of the pharmaceutical industry in Philadelphia from the nomination and that it is important to recognize this building as part of it. She added that the Committee should consider recommending expanding the boundary to ensure the view of the building remains open.
  - Mr. Laverty supported the nomination. He described the building as “red and white architecture” of the early twentieth century and compared it to both the Atwater Kent manufacturing plant, constructed the year after this one was, and the nearby Woodlands mansion from the eighteenth century. He commented on the Colonial Revival in Philadelphia and how a modern building for its time still needed to reflect the city’s colonial past.
  - Ms. Miller described several “waves” of Colonial Revival architecture in the city and agreed with Mr. Laverty’s comparison to the Woodlands. She added that she has a particular interest in the pharmaceutical industry as she encounters medicine bottles often in her archaeological work and that many of the remarkable advances in the field were made at this school in this building. She described it as having “international” importance as a result.
  - Ms. Cooperman agreed with the previous Committee members’ comments on the important link between this building and the history of pharmacology and education.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- Kathy Dowdell commented in support of the nomination and as a follow-up to a written letter she submitted to the Committee. She highlighted the importance of this building as the oldest surviving building associated with the Philadelphia College of Pharmacy. She also wanted to clarify the proposed boundary of the nomination and expressed concerns that an adjacent parking lot, which currently permits a wide viewshed of the building from the surrounding public rights-of-way, was not included. She added that it appears to her, based on some research, that the parking lot is currently under an easement related to utilities, so it may already be protected from future development anyway. She stressed that the Historic Commission should potentially extend the boundaries of the nomination to include this parking lot if it is not otherwise protected.
- Jeanette Litz, an alumna of the Philadelphia College of Pharmacy and Science, commented in support of the nomination.
- Amy Lambert of University City Historical Society commented in support of the nomination.
- David Traub of Save Our Sites commented in support of the nomination.
- Wayne Marquardt, an alumnus of the Philadelphia College of Pharmacy, commented in support of the nomination. He highlighted both the building’s architectural importance but also its association with the history of pharmaceutical sciences.

- Karen Bliss, an alumna of the Philadelphia College of Pharmacy and Science, commented in support of the nomination.
- Adam Goldman, a neighbor, commented in support of the nomination.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:**

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The property at 4201-47 Woodland Ave is a Georgian Revival academic building constructed by the Philadelphia College of Pharmacy and Science in 1927.
- The property represents the oldest surviving building associated with the Philadelphia College of Pharmacy and Science, and that institution was a major contributor to the field of pharmacology in the United States and internationally.
- The property represents an important example of Georgian Revival academic architecture.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or Nation as the oldest and most significant lasting academic building constructed by the Philadelphia College of Pharmacy and Science, the first college of Pharmacy in the United States and an institution that helped establish the modern field of pharmacology in the nineteenth century and continued to make significant and foundational contributions to that field throughout the nineteenth, twentieth, and twenty-first centuries, satisfying Criterion A.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies many of the distinguishing characteristics of the Georgian Revival architectural style as seen on academic buildings, satisfying Criteria C & D.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4201-47 Woodland Ave satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, and D.

<b>ITEM: 4201-47 WOODLAND AVE</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate, Criteria A, C, and D</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Miller</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Barucco</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Debbie Miller	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Total	5				1

**ADDRESS: 1520-22 CHESTNUT ST**

Name of Resource: S.S. Kresge Store

Proposed Action: Designate

Property Owner: PR Chestnut Associates LP

Nominator: Center City Residents Association

Staff Contact: Ted Maust, theodore.maust@phila.gov

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. A two-story masonry commercial building, known as the S.S. Kresge Store, stands on the property. The nomination contends that the S.S. Kresge Store, built in 1934, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

The nomination argues that the property reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style and embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style, specifically the Art Deco style, satisfying Criteria C and D.

The nomination also argues that Silverman & Levy, the architects of the structure, was a firm that significantly influenced the development of the City of Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion E.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E and should be designated as historic and listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:15:35**

**PRESENTERS:**

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Tim Kerner and Oscar Beisert represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

**DISCUSSION:**

- Ms. Cooperman commented that the banding motif along Chestnut Street is evocative of the work of Frank Lloyd Wright.
- Ms. Barucco asked about the date of the photographs, which were taken in 2022.
  - Mr. Maust noted that the nomination was received in 2022 and has been continued for some time.
- Ms. Barucco wondered whether “Carrara Glass” might be a better descriptor of the “opalescent glass” above the door on the Chestnut Street facade.
  - The Committee discussed the terminology and decided that all of the options fall under “pigmented structural glass.”
- Ms. Cooperman expressed gratitude for more attention being drawn to the work of Silverman & Levy.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- David Traub of Save Our Sites spoke in support of designation.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:**

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The two primary elevations of the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street display characteristics of the Art Deco style.

- The architecture firm of Silverman & Levy had a significant effect on the city of Philadelphia.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property’s Art Deco features satisfy Criteria for Designation C and D.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion E as a project of Silverman & Levy, a firm that significantly influenced the development of the City of Philadelphia.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1520-22 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

<b>ITEM: 1520-22 CHESTNUT ST</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate; Criteria C, D, E</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Barucco</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Lavery</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller	X				
Elizabeth Milroy					X
Total	4				2

**ADDRESS: 1039 CHESTNUT ST**

Name of Resource: Union Republican Club  
 Review: Designation  
 Property Owner: Samson Asset Management  
 Nominator: Philadelphia Historical Commission Staff  
 Staff Contact: Ted Maust, [theodore.maust@phila.gov](mailto:theodore.maust@phila.gov)

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1039 Chestnut Street as historic and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the building, constructed in 1878 and significantly modified in 1918, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and J. The property was the headquarters of the Union Republican Club from 1878 to 1901 and for the Republican City Committee until 1934. The property has a long history of commerce at the first-floor level, and from 1949 through the 1970s, the whole building was used by Tappin’s Jewelers for retail sales. The nomination argues that the property satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J, exemplifying the social and economic history of the city in its political and commercial history. The nomination further argues that the distinctive architectural elements of both the original structure, exhibiting trademarks of nineteenth-century eclectic design, and the renovated façade along Chestnut Street, in the Commercial Style, satisfy Criteria for Designation C and D.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1039 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and J.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING:** 01:31:25

**PRESENTERS:**

- Mr. Maust presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Jan Singer represented the property owner.

**DISCUSSION:**

- Mr. Singer expressed the opinion that the windows have been changed and, with that significant modification, the property is unworthy of designation. He noted that there is no door or stairway to the building's upper floors. He suggested that a state historical marker recognizing the political history at the site might be a better way of honoring that legacy.
- Ms. Cooperman commented that the nomination brings needed attention to Yarnall & Cooper and builders who acted as designers as well.
- Ms. Miller asked why the upper floors were closed off.
  - Mr. Maust answered that it appeared that was a result of reshaping the first floor for a variety of shops in the early 1880s.
- Ms. Miller expressed the desire to know more about the Mysterious Pilgrims Club and voiced appreciation for the image of the building with a large political banner across the intersection.
- Ms. Barucco expressed wonder at the fact that the 1918 modification included rebuilding the window arches at the right end of the 11<sup>th</sup> Street elevation.
- Mr. Lavery reminisced about first seeing the building painted, with the Tappin's sign on it, and being amazed when the removal of the paint revealed the elaborate brickwork on the 11<sup>th</sup> St elevation.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- Oscar Beisert of the Keeping Society commented in support of the nomination.
- David Traub of Save Our Sites commented in support of the nomination.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:**

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The building at 1039 Chestnut Street features elaborate brickwork on its 11<sup>th</sup> Street façade, which has made it a landmark in the neighborhood.
- That Yarnall & Cooper were a building firm which also designed structures and its work is worthy of more attention.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion A and J, owing to its history as a center of political activity.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property, featuring nineteenth-century eclecticism and twentieth-century commercial style on its two primary facades, satisfies Criterion C and D for designation.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1039 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and J.

<b>ITEM: 1039 CHESTNUT ST</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate; Criteria A, C, D, and J</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Barucco</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Miller</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Debbie Miller	X				
Elizabeth Milroy					X
Total	4				2

**ADDRESS: 1330-36 CHESTNUT ST**

Name of Resource: F.W. Woolworth Co. Store

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Treeco/Manor LP

Nominator: Historical Commission staff

Staff Contact: Dan Shachar-Krasnoff, [daniel.shachar-krasnoff@phila.gov](mailto:daniel.shachar-krasnoff@phila.gov)

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the Woolworth Building, 1330-36 Chestnut Street, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the Woolworth Store, built in 1949, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and H. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the purpose-built Woolworth Store was part of a comprehensive effort by the company to develop large flagship stores in downtowns across the United States and Canada. Under Criteria C and D, the nomination argues that the store’s design is based in the Modernist, International Style, with some references to the Art Deco/Streamline Moderne styles. Under Criterion H the nomination maintains that the Woolworth Store’s horizontality, minimal aesthetic, and stark white color sets it apart from surrounding structures making it a distinctive feature in Center City generally and the 1300 block of Chestnut Street in particular. The period of significance spans from 1949 when the building was constructed, to 1960 when the character-defining original WOOLWORTH sign was replaced.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the property at 1330-36 Chestnut Street, the Woolworth Store, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and H and should be designated as historic and listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 01:51:27**

**PRESENTERS:**

- Mr. Shachar-Krasnoff presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Attorney Michael Phillips and preservation consultant George Thomas represented the property owner.

**DISCUSSION:**

- Mr. Phillips declared that the nomination does not demonstrate that the property satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, or H. He noted that George Thomas and Richard Wentzel authored reports opposing the nomination.
- Mr. Thomas spoke in opposition to the nomination. He described inappropriate alterations beginning in the 1960s through recent years. In the 1960s, a new entrance was created at the west end of the front elevation facilitating use of the upper floors by a stockbroker. Recent alterations include large areas of colored tile and signs for current businesses altering the building's symmetry. He also noted that the storefront no longer reflects the original material or dimensions. The rear elevation on Sansom Street is compromised by the removal of polished stone entrances and masonry infilling of windows. Mr. Thomas opined that the store was irrelevant to the history of the Woolworth's chain. He argued that the Philadelphia stores were a subset of the Wilkes-Barre region, not a region unto itself. He also stated that the building at 1330-36 Chestnut Street was not a significant flagship as it was built later than those in other cities. His opinion was that the poorly designed Woolworth building lacks the characteristics of the International Style as defined by Alfred Barr. He continued that the building is incongruous with the context of Beaux Arts "canyon" that developed in the vicinity of City Hall after it opened in the 1890s. His judgement is that the low slung, horizontal Woolworth's building is incongruous with these majestic buildings. He criticized the nomination for not exploring Philadelphia Modern buildings in the Vertical Style that became the basis for Art Deco design with examples such as Rittenhouse Plaza (1925), Horn and Hardart Offices (1929), Horn and Hardart bakeries (1931 & 1939) and the N.W. Ayer Building (1929). The nomination also did not address the work of George Howe. Mr. Thomas further argued that several of the building's character-defining features on the north and south facades are non-compliant with contemporary building codes and therefore the building is a poor candidate for adaptive reuse. For example, the north facade's horizontal windows are too high off the floor to meet code requirements as a means of egress. Mr. Thomas declared that the building's current zoning classification allows for a very tall building, and historic designation would therefore reduce the value of the property.
- Ms. Cooperman commented that the design of the building is Modern even if it does not comply with Alfred Barr's design rules. She said the nomination is a flagship store for Woolworth's within a Philadelphia context, and despite alterations, the original design is clearly decipherable.
- Mr. Laverty opined that the building represented the transition from the Victorian city to an embrace of Modern commercial buildings. He identified a relationship between the Woolworth building and the Victor Gruen designed Robinson Building on Market Street.
- Ms. Barucco observed that the Woolworth Building is important in the context of Philadelphia and that alterations have not detracted from the building's Modern character. She stated that 1330-36 Chestnut Street satisfies Criterion H because its design is so different from its context.
- Ms. Miller agreed that the design is unique compared to its context and therefore is worthy of designation, including under Criterion H.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- Oscar Beisert, representing the Keeping Society, spoke in support of the nomination.
- Jay Farrell spoke in support of the nomination.



- Samantka Monroe spoke in opposition to the nomination.
- David Traub, representing Save Our Sites, spoke in support of the nomination.
- Steven Peitzman spoke in support of the nomination.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:**

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The building at 1330-36 Chestnut Street is designed in a Modern style.
- The building at 1330-36 Chestnut Street was constructed as a flagship Woolworth’s Store in downtown Philadelphia.
- The original design of the building at 1330-36 Chestnut Street is readily apparent despite alterations.
- The building at 1330-36 Chestnut Street is significant in the context of Philadelphia.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion A as a purpose-built Woolworth Store that was part of a comprehensive effort by the company to develop large flagship stores in downtowns across the United States and Canada.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criteria C and D because the design is based in the Modernist, International Style, with some references to the Art Deco/Streamline Moderne styles.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property satisfies Criterion H, owing to its horizontal, minimal aesthetic, and stark white color that sets it apart from surrounding structures, making it a distinctive feature in Center City generally and the 1300 block of Chestnut Street in particular.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1330-36 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and H.

<b>ITEM: 1330-36 CHESTNUT ST</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate; Criteria A, C, D, and H</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Miller</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Barucco</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Debbie Miller	X				
Elizabeth Milroy					X
Total	4				2

**ADDRESS: 8527-29 GERMANTOWN AVE**

Name of Resource: The Chestnut Hill Office of the Germantown Trust Company

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: PTBK LLC

Nominator: Chestnut Hill Conservancy

Staff Contact: Laura DiPasquale, laura.dipasquale@phila.gov

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes designating the property at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue as historic and listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the former Chestnut Hill Office of the Germantown Trust Company building, constructed in 1927, satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E. Under Criterion C, the nomination contends that the property reflects the environment of Chestnut Hill and the larger German Township in the second and third quarters of the twentieth century, and embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Colonial Revival style, satisfying Criterion D. Under Criterion E, the nomination asserts that the property is significant as the work of Arthur H. Brockie, a prominent local architect of the first and second quarters of the twentieth century.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING:** 02:36:49

**PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. DiPasquale presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Lori Salganicoff of the Chestnut Hill Conservancy and Oscar Beisert represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner. Ms. DiPasquale noted that the staff received an email from representatives of the owners indicating that they would be listening to the meeting but did not plan to participate in the review.

**DISCUSSION:**

- Ms. Salganicoff explained that the building at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue is an important bank building in Chestnut Hill and commented that she is looking forward to working with owners on its next life.
- Mr. Beisert commented that it was a pleasure to work on nomination for landmark bank building in Chestnut Hill and add to the literature on Arthur Brockie.
- Ms. Cooperman noted that the building at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue is a prominent and important building on Germantown Avenue in Chestnut Hill, right at top of the hill in the core of Chestnut Hill and was designed by an important architect.
- Ms. Cooperman expressed surprise not to see a discussion in the nomination about Sesquicentennial, which was very important in Germantown and influenced the use of the Colonial Revival style throughout Germantown as a statement of identity in the area. She opined that it is wonderful to see a nomination for the property.
- Ms. Cooperman noted that she believes there is a T-Square illustration of the property somewhere, but that it is not necessary for the nomination.
- Ms. Barucco supported the nomination, noting that she loves this building. She noted that the Committee often discusses styles not being cookie cutter, but that this property truly embodies the Colonial Revival style.
- Ms. Barucco questioned the identification of the property location as being in the "Upper Northwest."

- Ms. Miller responded that she would not call Germantown Upper Northwest but would call Chestnut Hill Upper Northwest.
- Ms. Salganicoff clarified that Chestnut Hill is part of the Upper Northwest Planning District.
- Ms. Barucco commented that Figure 16 or 17 identifies the iron signage bracket on the primary elevation as a character-defining feature and suggested that the intricate scupper boxes at the top of the downspouts are also characteristic of this style and should be highlighted. She noted that the scupper boxes are more than just a simple downspout but rather an architectural feature.
- Ms. Miller commented that the property is incredibly indicative of the Chestnut Hill landscape and the Colonial Revival style. She noted that there was careful development in Chestnut Hill that preserved the viewshed of the larger community, and that this building is so true to its roots that one is left wondering if it is a true Colonial building or a Colonial Revival building.
- Mr. Laverty opined that the property is a great addition to the community and a no-brainer designation.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- Samanka Monroe supported the nomination, opining that the building is impeccable and well-kept and adds to the historic nature of Chestnut Hill.
- Allison Weiss of SoLo-Germantown Civic Association supported the nomination.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:**

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The building at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue was built in 1927 as the Chestnut Hill office of the Germantown Trust Company.
- The building includes many notable architectural features, including significant scupper boxes, which are not specifically highlighted in the description but are important parts of the overall design.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The nomination demonstrates that the property reflects the environment of Chestnut Hill and the larger Germantown Township in the second and third quarters of the twentieth century, satisfying Criterion C.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Colonial Revival style, satisfying Criterion D.
- The nomination demonstrates that the property is significant as the work of Arthur H. Brockie, a prominent local architect of the first and second quarters of the twentieth century, satisfying Criterion E.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 8527-29 Germantown Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E.

<b>ITEM: 8527-29 GERMANTOWN AVE</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate; Criteria C, D, and E</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Miller</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Lavery</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller	X				
Elizabeth Milroy					X
Total	4				2

**SPRUCE HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT, SOUTHEAST QUADRANT**

Proposed Action: Designation  
 Property Owner: Multiple  
 Nominator: Spruce Hill Community Association  
 Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes designating the Spruce Hill Historic District, Southeast Quadrant and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The proposed district includes 572 properties in West Philadelphia that are primarily residential and commercial buildings. This district is the first of four anticipated in Spruce Hill, encompassing an area that will eventually include approximately 2,000 properties. For administrative purposes, the area was divided east to west at 43rd Street, and north to south at Spruce Street, into four quadrants and each of the four quadrants is being nominated separately and sequentially, owing to the complexities of nominating large numbers of properties simultaneously. It is anticipated that nominations for the other three quadrants will follow as the inventories are completed. The boundaries of the district currently proposed are generally 43rd Street to the west; Spruce Street to the north; 39th Street to the east; and Baltimore and Woodland Avenues to the south.

The nomination states that the proposed district satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, E, and J. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that Spruce Hill has significant character, interest, and value as part of the development of West Philadelphia where public transportation drove speculative development of a high caliber that still retains its architectural integrity. Under Criteria C and D, the nomination states that Spruce Hill reflects the environment in an era characterized by distinctive architectural styles and that the buildings embody distinguishing characteristics of mid to late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century architectural styles, including Italianate, Queen Anne, Colonial Revival, Neo-Grec, Second Empire, and Georgian Revival. Under Criterion E, the nomination outlines the significant architects commissioned to design buildings in Spruce Hill, including Samuel Sloan, Theophilus P. Chandler, G.W. and W.D. Hewitt, and Willis G. Hale. Lastly, under Criterion J, the nomination argues that Spruce Hill exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community, as an exemplary representation of West Philadelphia’s development as a streetcar suburb.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates the proposed Spruce Hill Historic District, Southeast Quadrant satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, E, and J.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING: 02:54:30**

**RECUSAL:**

- Ms. Barucco recused from the review of the nomination, owing to her involvement in preparing the nomination.

**PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Chantry presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Attorney David Orphanides, preservation consultant Sharon Fleming, and Janine Sanzari of the Spruce Hill Community Association represented the nomination.
- Numerous property owners participated in the discussion.

**DISCUSSION:**

- Mr. Laverty stated that he would need to leave the meeting at 1:30 p.m. which would result in the loss of a quorum at that time.
  - The Committee proceeded with the review, acknowledging that Mr. Laverty's departure in approximately 50 minutes would mean that the review of the nomination would continue at a future Committee meeting.
- Mr. Orphanides, Ms. Fleming, and Ms. Sanzari summarized the significance of the proposed historic district.
- Numerous property owners participated in the discussion.
  - Matt Myers, the owner of 329 S. 43<sup>rd</sup> Street, commented in support of the nomination.
  - Samantka Monroe, representing 4208 and 4210 Chester Avenue, commented in opposition to the nomination. She stated that her properties are already designated as part of the 4208-30 Chester Avenue Historic District. She questioned why 4200, 4202, 4204, and 4206 Chester Avenue, which were excluded from the 4208-30 Chester Avenue Historic District, are now included in the proposed Spruce Hill Historic District, Southeast Quadrant. It was noted that a petition in opposition for the inclusion of 4204 Chester Avenue was provided to the Committee. She asked that the matter be tabled until a proper community meeting with property owners is held.
  - Jane Chi, the owner of 507 S. 41<sup>st</sup> Street, commented in opposition to the nomination.
  - Attorney Michael Phillips, representing Campus Apartments and University City Housing, which collectively own 50 properties within the proposed Spruce Hill Historic District, Southeast Quadrant, commented in opposition to the nomination. He referenced his letter submitted in advance of the meeting which outlined the reasons for opposition. He explained that the opposition is based on procedural grounds, stating that the nomination for a quadrant is "incomplete and unripe" and should be returned to the Historical Commission's staff. He stated that he could not opine on the merits of the nomination because the nomination is incomplete.
  - LiLing Choing, the business owner of Five Star Deli at 4204 Chester Avenue, commented in opposition to the nomination. She expressed frustration at her property having been excluded from the 4208-30 Chester Avenue Historic District in 2022, only to now be included in the proposed Spruce Hill Historic District, Southeast Quadrant.

- Vimukti Aslan, the owner of a unit in 4202 Pine Street, commented in support of the nomination.
- Della Langan, the owner of 4245 Regent Square, commented in opposition to the nomination. She expressed concern about an increased cost to do work, and about work happening in the neighborhood without permits.
- Joan Weiner, the owner 4217 Pine Street, commented in support of the nomination.
- Attorney Oleg Sokolov, representing the owners of eight properties, 3955 Baltimore Avenue, 3924 Pine Street, 415 S. 40<sup>th</sup> Street, 3931 Baltimore Avenue, 4003 Baltimore Avenue, 4007 Baltimore Avenue, 4009 Baltimore Avenue, and 4015 Baltimore Avenue, commented in opposition to the nomination. He stated that the nomination is incomplete as proposed.
- Mathew Grubel, the owner of 4233 Regent Square, commented in support of the nomination.
- Adam Goldman, the owner of 4102 Spruce Street and 426 S. 42<sup>nd</sup> Street, commented in support of the nomination. He lamented the loss through demolition of historic buildings in Spruce Hill in recent years.
- Mr. Farnham stated that the Committee was about to lose its quorum. He recommended that the Committee acknowledge that fact, conclude the meeting, and recommend to the Historical Commission at its 10 May 2024 meeting to direct this matter back to the Committee for the continuation of the review at a future meeting. He explained that everyone, including property owners who had not yet spoken and the public, would have an opportunity to participate in the review at that future Committee meeting.
- Ms. Cooperman stated that the Committee would proceed as Mr. Farnham has recommended, with the expectation that the matter will be taken up again at a Committee meeting in the near future.
- Mr. Orphanides requested that, owing to the amount of time that participants for this matter had to wait for today's review and will continue to have to wait for it to be heard again, it be placed first on an upcoming Committee on Historic Designation agenda.
  - Ms. Cooperman responded that she does not control the order of the agenda, but that this is a reasonable request.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:**

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- It should not proceed with the review after losing quorum.
- The Historical Commission can direct the matter back to the Committee for the continuation of the review at a future meeting.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission remand the Spruce Hill Historic District, Southeast Quadrant nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation for the continuation of the review at a future meeting.

<b>ITEM: Spruce Hill Historic District, Southeast Quadrant</b>					
<b>MOTION: Recommend that PHC to continue review to future CHD meeting</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Lavery</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, Chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco				X	
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Debbie Miller	X				
Elizabeth Milroy					X
Total	3			1	2

**ADJOURNMENT**

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM RECORDING:** 03:39:22

**ACTION:** The Committee on Historic Designation adjourned at 1:33 p.m.

**PLEASE NOTE:**

- Minutes of the Philadelphia Historical Commission and its advisory Committees are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the video recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.
- Application materials and staff overviews are available on the Historical Commission’s website, [www.phila.gov/historical](http://www.phila.gov/historical).

**CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION**

§14-1004. Designation.

(1) Criteria for Designation.

A building, complex of buildings, structure, site, object, or district may be designated for preservation if it:

- (a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past;
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;
- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or professional engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or nation;
- (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant innovation;
- (g) Is part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area that should be preserved according to a historic, cultural, or architectural motif;

- (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or City;
- (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or
- (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.

DRAFT