

**CITY OF PHILADELPHIA  
BOARD OF PENSIONS AND RETIREMENT  
Meeting of March 28, 2024**

**MINUTES**

On March 28, 2024, Jacqueline Dunn, Alternate Chairperson, called the public meeting of the Board of Pensions and Retirement to order at 9:31 a.m. This meeting is being conducted in person in the Board's Conference Room at the Board's offices on the 16<sup>th</sup> Floor of Two Penn Center. Pursuant to Section 21-1503 of the Philadelphia Code, electronic recordings of this meeting will be made through Microsoft Teams conference technology and by an audio recording.

An electronic recording will be made available to the public online at the Board's website without charge within 10 days. Please note that you consent to such recording by attending, participating, or speaking at such meeting.

Present:                   Jacqueline Dunn  
                              Brian Coughlin  
                              Sharolyn Murphy  
                              Andrea Rose  
                              Paul Reed  
                              Marsha Green- Jones  
                              Carol Stukes Baylor  
                              William Sierra  
                              Adam Thiel

Also Attending:       Francis Bielli – Executive Director, Board of Pensions  
                              Elizabeth Bonner, Aiween Zoleta- Board of Pensions  
                              Miranda Mathias, Denise McNeil- Board of Pensions  
                              Christopher DiFusco, Chief Investment Officer  
                              Bernard Buckley- Deputy CIO  
                              Josh Stein- Chief Compliance Officer  
                              Marianna Fazylova, Crystal Brooks- Investment Unit  
                              Tyrone Jordan, Kristyn Bair - Investment Unit  
                              Neshea Bumpus, Lavonia Jenkins – Investment Unit  
                              Christy Brady, Bill Rubin- Controller's Office  
                              Brad Nyce, Bina Kumar, Jeff Francis- Nationwide  
                              Alberto Rivera, Hayley McCollum, Chad Schaeffer- Marquette  
                              Thomas Li- Law  
                              Tara Mohr- MDO  
                              Sara DeNault- City Council  
                              David Robb- Janney  
                              Kass Everett- JMS  
                              Phillip Rhym- BNY Mellon

Jacqueline Dunn stated that the first order of business is a motion to adopt the rules of order that the Board has approved and used for its virtual public meetings and in-person public meetings. The purpose is to help ensure that accurate and complete audio-visual recordings of the meeting occur to comply with the Code's requirements.

**The motion to adopt the new procedures for the meeting carried unanimously on a roll call vote.**

**CONSIDERATION OF THE MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 22, 2024**

**The motion to approve the Minutes of February 22, 2024 carried unanimously on a roll call vote.**

**CONSIDERATION OF (120) PENSION APPLICATIONS AND (50) WITHDRAWAL APPLICATIONS**

**The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.**

**APPLICATIONS FOR SERVICE-CONNECTED DISABILITY BENEFITS**

**Case of Saeed M. Hawkins, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “10”**

This is an application submitted by Saeed Hawkins, former Youth Detention Counselor II with the Department of Human Services for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “10”.

According to Mr. Hawkins, on January 16, 2020 while breaking up a fight and restraining one of the residents he felt a pain in his left knee. Mr. Hawkins reports that he immediately sought medical attention for the injury.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Abstain

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Abstain  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

**The motion to approve failed 0-3-5. Motion denied.**

**Case of Wayne Brown, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “16”**

This is an application submitted by Wayne Brown, former Water Operations Repair Helper with the Water Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “16”

According to Mr. Brown, on July 6, 2021 he injured his knee while climbing a metal ladder on the utility truck he was operating. Mr. Brown states that when the ladder broke, he struck his knee on the metal ledge of the truck as he fell.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Approve  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve carried 5-2-1.**

**Case of Damon Jackson, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “16”**

This is an application submitted by Damon Jackson, former Semi-Skilled Laborer with the Water Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “16”

According to Mr. Jackson, on September 2, 2020 while entering a water filter to add media he slipped off a cement beam and fell into an “iron trough”. Mr. Jackson states that while attempting to brace himself as he fell, he bruised his left leg and broke his left wrist.

**The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.**

**Case of James Caldwell, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “A”**

This is an application submitted by James Caldwell, former Firefighter with the Fire Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “A”.

According to Mr. Caldwell, on August 10, 2018 he was diagnosed with chemically induced vitiligo to his face subsequent to the continuous use of his firefighter scuba mask. Mr. Caldwell reports that the onset of his reactions cannot be pinpointed to a specific date since the exposure continued throughout his use of the mask.

**The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.**

**Case of Crystal Cosby, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “A”**

This is an application submitted by Crystal Cosby, former Fire Service Paramedic with the Fire Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “A”.

According to Ms. Cosby, on multiple occasions she suffered injuries to her left knee. On or about 2011 she reports bone bruising with water on the knee; on or about 2014 she reports sustaining a meniscal tear in her left knee as she assisted a patient in the rear of the Medic Unit. On March 3, 2017 she reports sustaining a condyle fracture while assisting a patient from his home when he pulled away from her grasp, causing her to awkwardly turn/twist the knee. On November 22, 2021 while exiting the Medic Unit she reports that she tripped and stuck her left knee.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Abstain

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Abstain  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

**The motion to approve failed 0-3-5. Motion denied.**

**Case of Jose Rodriguez, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “A”**

This is an application submitted by Jose Rodriguez, former Firefighter with the Fire Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “A”.

According to Mr. Rodriguez, on April 2, 2017 while trying to lift a thirty-five (35) foot ladder to keep it from falling to the ground he injured his lower back.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Abstain

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Abstain  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

**The motion to approve failed 0-3-5. Motion denied.**

**Case of Ronnie S. Young, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “A”**

This is an application submitted by Ronnie Young, former Firefighter with the Fire Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “A”.

According to Mr. Young, on January 16, 2019 while descending the rear compartment of a fire truck the driver suddenly accelerated the truck. Mr. Young reports that after he yelled at the driver who abruptly stopped the vehicle, he mentions experiencing pain , swelling, and instability in his right knee as a result of these actions.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Approve  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve carried 5-2-1.**

**Case of Dolores J. Bartholomew, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “B”**

This is an application submitted by Dolores Bartholomew, former Police Sergeant for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “B”.

According to Ms. Bartholomew, on October 27, 2020 while working crowd control during the protest she was struck and run over by a vehicle which drove through the crowd of police and protesters. Ms. Bartholomew was immediately transported to the emergency room for life-saving medical treatment.

**The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.**

**Case of James P. Klepesky, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “B”**

This is an application submitted by James Klepesky, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “B”.

According to Mr. Klepesky, on February 23, 2018 while assisting in the removal of a dead body from a confined bathroom area he injured his lower back/back and legs.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Approve  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve carried 5-2-1.**

**Case of Eric Rankin, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “B”**

This is an application submitted by Eric Rankin, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “B”.

According to Mr. Rankin, on December 23, 2014 while responding to a call of a “person with a gun” he was involved in a vehicular accident. Mr. Rankin reports injuries and severe pain to his back, body, and neck as a result of the impact

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Approve  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve carried 5-2-1.**

**Case of Sharon Thomas-Williams, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “D”**

This is an application submitted by Sharon Thomas-Williams, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “D”

According to Ms. Thomas-Williams, on July 22, 2018 while assisting a pedestrian she stepped off the curb and injured her left knee. Ms. Thomas-Williams reports that she got up quickly and continued her task, it was not until after the pain and stiffness became unbearable that she sought medical relief.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Approve  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve carried 5-2-1.**

**Case of Michael W. Bell, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an application submitted by Michael Bell, former Correctional Officer with the Department of Corrections for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Mr. Bell, on July 4, 2020 he was assaulted by an inmate who struck him in the back of his head. Mr. Bell reports that he sustained lacerations to his head along with fractures to his nasal and eye socket. Mr. Bell further reports that during the assault/attack he lost consciousness.

**The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote**

**Case of Diane P. Fontaine, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an application submitted by Diane Fontaine, former Parking Enforcement Officer with the Philadelphia Parking Authority for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Ms. Fontaine, on February 10, 2019 while crossing 38<sup>th</sup> Street she tripped and injured her knee. Ms. Fontaine reports that as she braced herself against the fall with her umbrella, she felt a pull on the outside of her left knee along with lower back pain.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Abstain

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Abstain  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

**The motion to approve failed 0-3-5. Motion denied.**

**Case of Tanya M. Jones, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an application submitted by Tanya Jones, former Correctional Officer with the Department of Corrections for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Ms. Jones, on March 4, 2020 while responding to an “officer assistance” call she injured her left ankle and pulled/stretched her left achilleas. Ms. Jones further reports that she was sent to the Comp Clinic for treatment.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Abstain

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Abstain  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

**The motion to approve failed 0-3-5. Motion denied.**

**Case of James C. Newkirk, Administrative Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an **administrative** application submitted by James Newkirk, former Laborer with the Streets Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Mr. Newkirk, on October 11, 2019 while standing on the side of the trash truck he was struck by a tree branch. Mr. Newkirk states that he sustained injuries to his head , neck, lower back, and hip from the blow.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Approve  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve carried 5-2-1.**

**Case of Cody Sheriff, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an application submitted by Cody Sheriff, former Deputy Sheriff with the Office of the Sheriff for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Mr. Sheriff, on September 30, 2015 he initially injured his right hand and continued to intermittently suffer with swelling and loss of hand mobility through November 17, 2018. Mr. Sheriff reports that on November 17, 2018 he fell while walking up the stairs in Family Court and aggravated his right hand as he extended it to brace against the fall.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Approve  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve carried 5-2-1.**

**Case of Kevin Sizer, Administrative Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an **administrative** application submitted by Kevin Sizer, former Correctional Lieutenant with the Department of Corrections for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Mr. Sizer, on March 7, 2018 he was assaulted by an inmate who was attempting to hang himself. Mr. Sizer reports that the unprovoked attack began when the inmate threw a punch and attempted to tackle him to the ground. A struggle ensued and Mr. Sizer reports sustaining injuries to his shoulders as he wrestled to break the grip of the inmate.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Abstain

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Abstain  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

**The motion to approve failed 0-3-5. Motion denied.**

**Case of Eric Skelton, Administrative Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an **administrative** application submitted by Eric Skelton, former Water Operations Repair Helper with the Water Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Mr. Skelton, on August 21, 2017 he was involved in a vehicular accident. Mr. Skelton states that he was a passenger in a department vehicle that was side swiped by a tractor trailer. Mr. Skelton further states that the impact caused bodily injuries, most notably his neck and back violently “snapped” during the accident.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve failed 4-4-1, with Jackie Dunn casting a tying vote. Motion denied.**

**Case of Dawn L. Sprowal, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an application submitted by Dawn Sprowal, former Laborer with the Streets Department for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Ms. Sprowal, on February 23, 2021 while working she began to experience pain in her right shoulder. Ms. Sprowal further states that she was unable to perform the task of lifting trash bags, she notes that the bags were heavier than she expected, and the coolness of the day prevented her from lowering her (right) arm.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve failed 4-4-1, with Jackie Dunn casting a tying vote. Motion denied.**



**APPLICATIONS FOR SERVICE-CONNECTED DISABILITY BENEFITS BEYOND THE ONE-YEAR DEADLINE****Case of Tony W. Ruffin, Appeal the Denial of a Request to Apply for Service-Connected Disability Benefits beyond the one-year deadline under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an application submitted by Tony Ruffin, former Semi-Skilled Worker Officer with the Department of Commerce for Service-Connected Disability Benefits beyond the one-year deadline under Pension Plan “Y”. Tony Ruffin was separated effective October 9, 2019.

Mr. Ruffin was required to submit an application for service-connected disability benefits no later than October 8, 2020.

Mr. Ruffin had an in-person appointment on September 21, 2021 and did not submit a **written** request to apply for service-connected disability benefits beyond the one-year deadline.

On January 22, 2024 Mr. Ruffin submitted an emailed request to apply beyond the one-year deadline. This request was **administratively** denied on January 29, 2024.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve failed 4-4-1, with Jackie Dunn casting a tying vote. Motion denied.**

**Case of Darrell W. Tindall, Appeal the Denial of a Request to Apply for Service-Connected Disability Benefits beyond the one-year deadline under Pension Plan “Y”**

This is an application submitted by Darrell Tindall, former Correctional Officer with the Department of Corrections for Service-Connected Disability Benefits beyond the one-year deadline under Pension Plan “Y”.

Darrell Tindall was separated effective August 26, 2022. Mr. Tindall was required to submit an application for service-connected disability benefits no later than August 25, 2023.

Mr. Tindall had an in-person appointment on February 14, 2024; he was instructed that he must submit a **written** request to apply for service-connected disability benefits beyond the one-year deadline.

On February 14, 2024 Mr. Tindall submitted a written request to apply beyond the one-year deadline. This request was **administratively** denied on February 14, 2024.

Brian Coughlin- Approve  
Marsha Green-Jones- Deny  
Sharolyn Murphy- Deny  
Paul Reed- Approve

Andrea Rose- Deny  
Willie Sierre- Approve  
Adam Thiel- Abstain  
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

**The motion to approve failed 4-4-1, with Jackie Dunn casting a tying vote. Motion denied.**

## **NEW BUSINESS**

### **Executive Director's Report**

- **NCPERS 2024 ACE Conference- Seattle, Washington**  
Brian Coughlin made a motion that any staff member or Trustee that wants to attend, may attend, Paul Reed seconded the motion.  
\*The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.
- **NCPERS Delegate form due April 24, 2024.**
- **State Audit exit interview is in late April.**
- **Actuarial final report expected in the next few weeks.**
- **Medical Panel RFP has been posted to the eContract website and the deadline has been extended to April 19, 2024.**
- **Budget testimony held March 27, 2024, went very well.**
- **DEIC Power 100 Award Classification presented to Carol Stukes Baylor.**

### **Litigation Summary**

- **Several Common Pleas cases pending.**

**The motion to adjourn carried unanimously 8-0 on a roll call vote at 9:54 AM.**