



Philadelphia Art Commission Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, January 10, 2024 - 9:30 AM

Members Present: José Almiñana, Matthew Kenyatta, Raed Nasser, James Lowe, Sarah McEneaney, Pepón Osorio, and Robert Roesch

The Philadelphia Art
Commission
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

José Almiñana
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Matthew Kenyatta
James Lowe
Sarah McEneaney
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

Alex M. Smith
Director

MEETING OF THE PHILADELPHIA ART COMMISSION

Alex Smith – Director of the Art Commission – introduced the Zoom platform and remote Art Commission process, noting that the meeting is being recorded and those participating in the meeting are giving their consent to be recorded. A link to the recording, will be posted on the Art Commission website and the meeting agenda and materials can also be found on the website at:

(<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/>).

*Mr. Smith welcomed Commissioner James Lowe, who is now the designee for the Department of Public Property. Mr. Smith then polled the commission via roll call announcing a quorum, then stated a few instructions for the public. Members of the public may comment on agenda items during the meeting. When the agenda item that you are interested in is being discussed, you can use the “raise hand” feature and staff will unmute you during the public comment period. If you’re joining by phone, you can also use the hand raise feature by dialing *9 during the public comment period, and if you have any submitted comments through email, staff will read those emails out loud at the appropriate time. Thank you.*

Chairperson Roesch called the meeting to order and announced a quorum.

MEETING MINUTES

- October 11, 2023
- November 8, 2023
- December 13, 2023

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the October, November, and December Minutes.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney.

Consensus of the vote carried all in favor to approve the meeting minutes from October, November, and December with no nays (7-0).

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4636

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)



REPORT OF THE SIGN AND STREETERY COMMITTEE – DECEMBER 20, 2023

The Philadelphia Art
Commission
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

José Almiñana
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Matthew Kenyatta
James Lowe
Sarah McEaney
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

Alex M. Smith
Director

Streeter Structure Applications

First Reviews:

- 1. 296-23
Radicchio Café**
402 Wood Street

Sign Applications

Second Reviews:

- 1. 286-23
UPS**
1735 Market Street

First Reviews:

- 1. 295-23
Santander**
2103 Hamilton Street

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the recommendations of the Sign Committee and Streeter Structure Committee from December 20, 2023.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana.

The Commission voted unanimously to approve the recommendations of the Sign Committee and Streeter Structure Committee from December 20, 2023 (7-0).

ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA

- 1. 1-24
Police District 24/25
3901 Whitaker Avenue**
Review Type: Minor construction on City property
Project Details: Roof renovations
Applicant: Department of Public Property (DPP)

This administrative item proposes the replacement of the roof of Police District 24/25 at 3901 Whitaker Ave.

The scope of work includes replacing the roof area, several areas of masonry, and parapet wall. Like materials will be used for the replacement and construction of roof elements.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4636

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)



**The Philadelphia Art
Commission**
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

José Almiñana
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Matthew Kenyatta
James Lowe
Sarah McEneaney
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

Alex M. Smith
Director

Commissioner Almiñana wanted to know what type of membrane will be applied to the roof, specifically, if it will be a high reflective membrane. A representative of DPP responded and provided an overview of the material being used is a 3-ply SBS modified bituminous roof, with white cap sheet.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve (00:08:21)

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana.

The vote was taken by consensus. Motion carried unanimously to approve (7-0).

2. 2-24

Towey Playground 1832 N Howard Street

Review Type: Minor construction project on City property

Project Details: Playground replacement and exterior site improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation (PPR)

This administrative item proposes the replacement of certain elements within Towey Playground at 1832 N Howard Street.

The scope of work includes the installation of new safety surface, play equipment, replacement of benches and asphalt work, and a new trash enclosure adjacent to Howard Street. Two trees are being removed as part of the scope of work.

Commissioner Almiñana asked if any trees were going to be replanted if they are removing two large trees. Almiñana noted there will be a net loss of biomass, and it lessens the shade canopy in the area. A representative from PPR explained that since it was a small area no additional trees will be planted in the space. She also stated that the community would have liked to have all trees removed due to the maintenance of leaf litter and other trash.

Public Questions: Timothy wanted to reiterate concerns about the non-replacement of trees. Given that the city created a tree plan to further build out an urban tree canopy, it was recommended that new trees be incorporated into the work.

Commissioner Lowe asked if the maintenance plan for the site is the same or will there be a new proposed plan? PPR responded that the maintenance of trees and playground will remain as is with PPR.

Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve with a request for a new tree to be planted as part of the proposal.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Almiñana and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4636

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)



The vote was taken by consensus. Motion carried unanimously to approve (7-0).

**The Philadelphia Art
Commission**
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

José Almiñana
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Matthew Kenyatta
James Lowe
Sarah McEaney
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

Alex M. Smith
Director

3. 4-24

**Carroll Park
5801 W Girard Avenue**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property
Project Details: Exterior site improvements
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation (PPR)

The scope of work includes improvements to Carroll Park including extending the playground area with safety surface by approx. 1,300 square feet, installing four new swings, replacing playground equipment that was damaged or missing from a previous 2018 install, installing a new lockable bulletin board, adding new PPR signage at the park entrances and replacing wood and painting of 32 benches.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve (00:28:51)

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana.

The vote was taken by consensus. Motion carried unanimously to approve (7-0).

PRESENTATIONS FOR FINAL REVIEW

1. 162-23

**Nicetown Park
4301 Germantown Avenue**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property
Project Details: Exterior site improvements
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation (PPR)
Presenter: Ground Reconsidered

Sarah Endriss of Ground Reconsidered, representing PPR, started the presentation for this project (00:30:13).

Questions and comments from the Commission.

Commissioner Lowe asked about the community meetings, specifically if neighbors had any concerns about the proposed lights adjacent to the yards of the adjacent row houses. Sarah Endriss responded that they did not hear any concerns or complaints from the residents. Endriss also noted the lights are dark sky complaint so they would alleviate reflectivity and shining into the back of homes.

Chairperson Roesch noted that the restroom seemed far from the center of activity. Sarah answered that it made sense financially and utility hook up wise to have the one

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4636

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)



**The Philadelphia Art
Commission**
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

José Almiñana
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Matthew Kenyatta
James Lowe
Sarah McEneaney
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

Alex M. Smith
Director

restroom instead of the other Portland Loo options previously noted, as PPR would be able to maintain the restroom. Chairperson Roesch then asked for questions or comments from the Commission or Public.

Commissioner Almiñana asked about how EMT, and maintenance vehicles access the site, given that the area has a serious short dumping issue. Sarah answered that Gratz Street has two removable bollards that allow for access as needed.

Chairperson Roesch asked how many trees are being put in the park. Sarah answered 24 -25 trees are being added.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve approval (00:47:04).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Kenyatta.

Mr. Smith polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio and Chairperson Roesch.

Motion carried unanimously to approve as final approval (7-0).

PRESENTATIONS FOR CONCEPT REVIEW

1. 6-24

Harriet Tubman Statue

1400 John F. Kennedy Boulevard

Review Type: Public Art

Project Details: New Public Art on City property

Applicant: Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy (OACCE)

Presenter: Alvin Pettit and OACCE

Margaritte Anglin and Alvin Pettit presented this project (00:49:20).

Questions and comments from the Commission.

Chairperson Roesch commented that the sculpture was a beautiful and powerful piece. Roesch noted his excitement and appreciation for the work.

Commissioner Nasser expressed concern about people sitting and lounging on the base of the piece. Alvin explained the piece would cover most of the base so there would not be space to lounge or sit on it comfortably.

Commissioner McEneaney commented that she thinks the piece is beautiful and she wanted to say congratulations.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4636

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)



Seeing no questions or comments from the Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve approval.

**The Philadelphia Art
Commission**
Established 1911

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Osorio.

Robert Roesch
Chair

Mr. Smith polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio and Chairperson Roesch.

José Almiñana
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Matthew Kenyatta
James Lowe
Sarah McEneaney
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

Motion carried unanimously to approve as final approval (7-0).

2. 227-22

Piccoli Playground 1501 E Bristol Street

Review Type: Construction project located on City property
Project Details: Exterior site improvements
Applicant: Rebuild
Presenter: Community Ventures and Studio Sustena

Alex M. Smith
Director

Community Ventures presented this project (1:31:36).

Questions and comments from the Commission.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve approval (1:51:56).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana.

Mr. Smith polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio and Chairperson Roesch.

Commissioner Nasser had stepped away during the vote. Motion carried unanimously to approve as final approval (6-0).

3. 5-24

Friends Select School 1600-64 Race Street

Review Type: Construction project in Benjamin Franklin Parkway Buffer Area
Project Details: New building addition and exterior site improvements
Applicant: Friends Select School
Presenter: OLIN

Demetrios Staurinos, Michael Gary, Meghan Talarowski and Christopher Kircher from the applicant team presented this project (01:54:03)

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4636

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)



**The Philadelphia Art
Commission**
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

José Almiñana
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Matthew Kenyatta
James Lowe
Sarah McEneaney
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

Alex M. Smith
Director

Questions and comments from the Commission.

Chairperson Roesch asked what material along the walkway was being used for the proposed signage saying, “Friends Select School.” The answer was wood and steel.

Commissioner McEneaney asked will the play area be accessible to the public? The answer was no, but talks have been held about possibly opening it up to the public.

Commissioner Osorio asked if the space becomes public, has lighting been considered? And if not, would the area be gated? The answer was yes, there would be gates; however, the gate has not been fully designed yet so it was not included in the renderings.

Commissioner Lowe had a technical question about getting rid of the 24 parking spaces in and how it would impact their zoning requirements. The answer was that they are prioritizing kids playing over the parking spaces and have noted that teachers are asked to park off site. It was noted that the zoning requirements should not be impacted at this location.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve approval (2:27:28).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Kenyatta and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney.

Mr. Smith polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch.

Motion carried unanimously to approve as final approval (7-0).

4. Georges Hill Pump Station **S Georges Hill Dr**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property.

Project Details: new pump station in Fairmount Park

Applicant: Philadelphia Water Department (PWD)

Presenter: HDR

Troy Belcher from HDR presented this project (2:29:28)

Commissioner Almiñana had questions about the lighting that is proposed. Commissioner Almiñana stated that the lighting that is being proposed is not desirable light for the wildlife, 3000k or less is preferred, which is a softer warmer tone.



Questions and comments from the Public (02:41:15).

A member of the public noted the four large aluminum louvers that connect to the pumps. They noted concerns about the sound impacts on the adjacent Mann concert venue, specifically the Skyline stage.

It was also noted that there are extraneous trees being removed. Members of the public objected to the removal of all these trees. The member of the public requested a plan for the replacement of these trees, including the trees that will be planted off site.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve approval (2:58:23).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Osorio.

Mr. Smith polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Lowe, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio and Chairperson Roesch

Motion carried unanimously to approve as final approval (7-0).

The next Art Commission will be held Wednesday, February 14, 2024, at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom.

**The Philadelphia Art
Commission**
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

José Almiñana
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Matthew Kenyatta
James Lowe
Sarah McEneaney
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

Alex M. Smith
Director