CITY OF PHILADELPHIA
BOARD OF PENSIONS AND RETIREMENT
Meeting of October 26, 2023

MINUTES

On October 26, 2023, Jacqueline Dunn, Alternate Chairperson, called the public meeting of the Board of Pensions and Retirement to order at 9:40 a.m. This meeting is being conducted in person in the Board's Conference Room at the Board's offices on the 16th Floor of Two Penn Center. Pursuant to Section 21-1503 of the Philadelphia Code, electronic recordings of this meeting will be made through Microsoft Teams conference technology and by an audio recording.

An electronic recording will be made available to the public online at the Board's website without charge within 10 days. Please note that you consent to such recording by attending, participating, or speaking at such meeting.

Present:	Jacqueline Dunn Brian Coughlin Francois Dutchie Lief Erickson Paul Reed Marsha Green- Jones Carol Stukes Baylor Roosevelt Poplar Aubrey Powers (not present for Benefits Meeting Agenda Items 1-3. Present for all matters of Board business thereafter through adjournment)
Also Attending:	Francis Bielli – Executive Director, Board of Pensions Shamika Taliaferro- Deputy Director Bill Rubin, Aiween Zoleta- Board of Pensions Elizabeth Bonner, Denise McNeil- Board of Pensions Christopher DiFusco, Chief Investment Officer James Cousounis- Chief Compliance Officer Bernard Buckley- Deputy CIO Crystal Brooks, Kristyn Bair- Investment Unit Neshea Bumpus, Lavonia Jenkins – Investment Unit David Smith-Marquette Associates Brad Nyce, Jeff Francis- Nationwide Dave Smith, Kweku Obed- Marquette Will Greene- Loop Capital Ellen Berkowitz, Thomas Li- Law Khabir Richardson, Carlene Wyche- Guests

Jacqueline Dunn stated that the first order of business is a motion to adopt the rules of order that the Board has approved and used for its virtual public meetings and in-person public meetings.

The purpose is to help ensure that accurate and complete audio-visual recordings of the meeting occur to comply with the Code's requirements.
The motion to adopt the new procedures for the meeting carried unanimously on a roll call vote.

CONSIDERATION OF THE MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 29, 2023

The motion to approve the Minutes of September 29, 2023, carried 5-0-2, with Francois Dutchie and Marsha Green-Jones abstaining.

CONSIDERATION OF (118) PENSION APPLICATIONS AND (46) WITHDRAWAL APPLICATIONS

The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.

APPLICATIONS FOR SERVICE-CONNECTED DISABILITY BENEFITS

Case of Sandra Gondi-Morales, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Sandra Gondi-Morales, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Ms. Gondi-Morales, on June 20, 2019, while engaged in bicycle training at the Academy she fell off her bike injuring her right side. Ms. Gondi-Morales reports that she sustained an abrasion to her right cheek, a fractured right elbow and a cut above her right eye that required stitches.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Abstain
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Abstain
Leif Erickson- Deny
Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

The motion to approve failed 0-4-4. Motion denied.

Case of Ashley D. Hoggard, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Ashley Hoggard, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Hoggard, on June 14, 2009 while patrolling the area of Broad and Somerset shots were heard and shooters were observed firing from multiple directions (corners). Mr. Hoggard was struck by a bullet while attempting to advance up the 1300 block of West Somerset Avenue.

The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.

Case of John Perilli, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by John Perilli, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Perilli, on September 30, 2016, while making an arrest, a microwave fell striking his left shin and right foot and ankle.

The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.

Case Robert Redanauer, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Robert Redanauer, former Police Detective for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Redanauer, on July 24, 2020, while entering the District Building he avoided a puddle of water that had collected at the foot of the stairs and subsequently slipped on the wet step. Mr. Redanauer reports that he lost his balance and fell into the stair railing, as he attempted to right himself, he again lost his balance, twisted his body to avoid falling but struck his knee. Mr. Redanauer further reports that another detective assisted him to his feet and he worked until he felt an excruciating pain on the right side of his rib cage. He reported the incident and subsequently sought medical attention. His areas of complaint are lower back, knee, and nerve damage.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Abstain
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Abstain
Leif Erickson- Deny
Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

The motion to approve failed 0-4-4. Motion denied.

Case of Michael A. Ticcino, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by Michael Ticcino, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Ticcino, on September 13, 2017, while attempting to place handcuffs on a suspect, I reached to my right side for my handcuffs, then realizing they had slid over to my left side, I tried to retrieve them with my right hand. I then felt a tightness and pain in my shoulder/neck area. While in my police vehicle, filling out paperwork, I tried exiting the vehicle, using the vehicle with my right hand, I then felt intense pain and was unable to lift my right arm.

Brian Coughlin- Approve
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Approve
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Approve
Leif Erickson- Approve
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of John J. Todt, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan "B"

This is an application submitted by John Todt, former Police Officer for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Todt, on October 1, 2018 while attempting to place handcuffs on a resistant and combative suspect his right fifth finger snapped backwards. Mr. Todt reports that his finger was dislocated and deformed such that he is unable to straighten his finger when the right hand is extended.

The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.

Case of Dhamir R. Moore, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan "Y"

This is an application submitted by Dhamir Moore, former Laborer II with the Streets Department, for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y".

According to Mr. Moore, on November 28, 2020 while returning a trash receptacle to the curb he was pinned between two parked cars when another vehicle plowed into the rear of one of the parked cars. Mr. Moore states that he suffered two fractured knees and a broken tibia of his right leg as a result of the accident.

Brian Coughlin- Approve
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Approve
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Approve
Leif Erickson- Approve
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Case of Carlene P. Wyche, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan "Y"

This is an application submitted by Carlene Wyche, former Executive Support Supervisor with the Department of Licenses, and Inspections for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y".

According to Ms. Wyche sometime during April of 2020, while working as part of essential personnel she was exposed to and subsequently contracted COVID; upon her return home she affected her family members. Ms. Wyche reports that she lost her mother and brother due to their COVID exposure and complications, she further reports that she and her daughter continue to suffer from the aftermath of COVID. Anxiety, grief, depression, and PTSD remain a daily battle.

Brian Coughlin- Approve
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Approve
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Approve
Leif Erickson- Deny
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve
Jacqueline Dunn- Deny

The motion to approve failed 4-5, with Jackie Dunn casting a tie breaking vote. Motion denied.

Case of Jerome J. Stallworth, Application for Service-Connected Disability Benefits under Pension Plan "Y"

This is an application submitted by Jerome Stallworth, former Correctional Officer with the Department of Corrections for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y".

According to Mr. Stallworth, on September 2, 2008 while attempting to place handcuffs on an incarcerated resistant individual his thumb was jammed in the process. Mr. Stallworth further states that on October 1, 2020 while stacking hazardous medical materials in the storage room his left wrist popped and the weight of the box pulled him downward. Mr. Stallworth reports that his left bicep, elbow, hand, and wrist were injured.

The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.

APPLICATION TO CHANGE SURVIVORSHIP OPTION

Case of John Haney, Application to Change Survivor under Option 2 Plan "Y"

This is an application by John Haney, former Correctional Officer requesting to change his survivor under Option 2.
Mr. Haney retired March 24, 2007, and chose option 2 naming Jennifer Haney, spouse.
Mr. Haney divorced Jennifer Haney in 2015 and married Teresa Berger-Haney on January 2, 2023.
He is requesting to change his survivor from Jennifer Haney to Teresa Berger-Haney.
Mr. Haney submitted a letter requesting to change his survivor under option 2.
Mr. Haney's request was administratively denied, and he submitted a request to appeal the administrative denial.

Brian Coughlin- Deny
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Deny
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Deny
Leif Erickson- Deny
Carol Stukes Baylor- Deny

The motion to approve failed 0-8. Motion denied.

APPLICATION FOR SURVIVORSHIP BENEFITS

Walter Teesdale, Deceased, Application for Survivorship Benefits– Plan "D" (Common Law Marriage)

This is an application by Janet Martin, for survivorship benefits in Plan "D".

Walter Teesdale retired effective January 27, 1988, At the time of his retirement, elected Survivorship Option #4 naming Anne Marie Teesdale, wife.

Walter Teesdale passed away on April 2, 2022, death certificated submitted.

Brian Coughlin- Deny
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Deny
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Deny
Leif Erickson- Deny
Carol Stukes Baylor- Deny

The motion to approve failed 0-8. Motion denied.

Case of Joyce Clark, Deceased, Application for Survivorship Benefits on Behalf of a Medically Dependent Adult Child (MDAC)- Plan "J"

This is an application by George Clark, son of Joyce Clark, to receive Survivorship benefits as the MDAC under Plan "J."

Joyce Clark, a Recreation Attendant retired March 11, 2006. She chose Survivorship Option 4, as permitted under section 22-306 of the Retirement Code, which allows for the designation of a medically dependent child, named George Clark. Ms. Clark passed away on June 2, 2023.

The motion carried unanimously on a roll call vote.

Case of Daniel Williams, Appeal of Administrative Denial for Survivorship benefits- Plan J

This is an appeal by Karen P. Williams, widow of Daniel Williams, of the administrative denial of her application for survivorship benefits under survivorship option #4 through Common-Law. Daniel Williams, a former Heavy Equipment Operator for the Streets Department, entered the DROP program on January 12, 2004, and retired from City service effective January 12, 2008.

Brian Coughlin- Deny
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Deny
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Deny
Leif Erickson- Deny
Carol Stukes Baylor- Deny

The motion to approve failed 0-8. Motion denied.

OLD BUSINESS

Hearing Panel summary for Timothy P. McDevitt Sr., Application for service-connected disability benefits– Pension Plan "A"

This case was denied at the Board meeting held on June 1, 2023. A hearing panel was conducted on September 27, 2023.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Carol Stukes-Baylor:	Approve
Roosevelt Poplar:	Approve
Jacqueline Dunn:	Approve

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Timothy P. McDevitt Sr., former Firefighter for service-connected disability benefits under Pension Plan “A”.

According to Mr. McDevitt, on November 11, 2018, while driving a “reserve” fire truck he was involved in an accident. Mr. Devitt states that he was traveling at “emergency speed” when the impact occurred causing injuries to his lower back and leg.

The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.

Hearing Panel summary for Cherise M. Butts, Application for service-connected disability benefits– Pension Plan “Y”

This case was denied at the Board meeting held on July 26, 2023. A hearing panel was conducted on September 27, 2023.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Carol Stukes-Baylor:	Approve
Roosevelt Poplar:	Approve
Jacqueline Dunn:	Deny

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Cherise M. Butts, former Correctional Officer with the Department of Corrections for service-connected disability benefits under Pension Plan “Y”.

According to Ms. Butts, on April 23, 2021 while assisting an inmate out of a transport van she was grabbed on her left arm by the falling inmate. Ms. Butts reports that the full weight of the inmate was on her left side as she exited the van pulling her down. Ms. Butts and the inmate never hit the ground; however, the downward motion rotated her body and caused injuries to her left wrist, shoulder, leg, and back on the left side. Ms. Butts describes the pain as instant and intense enough to cause her to cry.

Brian Coughlin- Approve
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Approve
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Approve
Leif Erickson- Approve
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Hearing Panel summary for Navarro Fischer, Application for service-connected disability benefits– Pension Plan "Y"

This case was denied at the Board meeting held on June 22, 2023. A hearing panel was conducted on August 16, 2023.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Leontyne Freeman:	Deny
Roosevelt Poplar:	Deny
Andrea Rose:	Deny

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Navarro Fischer, former Correctional Officer with the Department of Corrections for service-connected disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y".

According to Mr. Fischer, on May 31, 2018, while training and certifications with multiple weapons the constant recoil injured his right wrist and hand. Mr. Fischer further reports that on December 4, 2020, while teaching a class on handling multiple tasks with weapons he experienced a sharp pain and swelling in his right hand.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain	Aubrey Powers- Deny
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny	Paul Reed- Abstain
Francois Dutchie Deny	Leif Erickson- Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Abstain	Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

The motion to approve failed 0-4-4. Motion denied.

Hearing Panel Summary for Steven Heller, Request to apply for service-connected disability benefits beyond the one-year deadline under Pension Plan "Y"

This case was **deferred** to a hearing panel at the Board meeting held on June 1, 2023. A hearing panel was conducted on August 16, 2023.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Leontyne Freeman:	Deny
Roosevelt Poplar:	Deny
Andrea Rose:	Deny

Case Summary

This is a request submitted by Steven Heller, former Machinery and Equipment Mechanic with the Streets Department to apply for service-connected disability benefits beyond the one-year under Pension Plan "Y".

Steven Heller was separated effective January 14, 2017. Mr. Heller was required to submit an application for disability/service connected disability benefits no later than January 13, 2018.

Mr. Heller had an in-person appointment on May 17, 2023 where he was again instructed that he must submit a **written** request to apply for service-connected disability benefits beyond the one-year deadline.

On February 28, 2023 Mr. Heller submitted a written request via email to apply beyond the one-year deadline. This request was **administratively denied** on May 17, 2023.

Brian Coughlin- Abstain
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Abstain
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Abstain
Leif Erickson- Deny
Carol Stukes Baylor- Abstain

The motion to approve failed 0-4-4. Motion denied.

Hearing Panel summary for Denise McCabe, Application for service-connected disability benefits– Pension Plan "Y"

This case was denied at the Board meeting held on June 1, 2023. A hearing panel was conducted on September 27, 2023.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Carol Stukes-Baylor: Approve
Roosevelt Poplar: Approve
Jacqueline Dunn: Deny

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Denise McCabe, former School Crossing Guard with the Police Department for service-connected disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y".

According to Ms. McCabe, on September 6, 2019, while crossing children she tripped over an uneven concrete surface and fell, injuring her right shoulder. Subsequently Ms. McCabe reported to the 24th Police District and was sent to the ER at Jeanes Hospital for treatment. Ms. McCabe was determined to have sustained a sprain from the fall, which was later revealed to be a fracture, rotator cuff tear, and bicep tear.

Brian Coughlin- Approve
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Approve
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Approve
Leif Erickson- Approve
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Hearing Panel summary for Kahbir M. Richardson, Application for service-connected disability benefits– Pension Plan "Y"

This case was denied at the Board meeting held on June 1, 2023. A hearing panel was conducted on August 16, 2023.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Leontyne Freeman:	Deny
Roosevelt Poplar:	Approve
Andrea Rose:	Approve

Case Summary:
This is an application submitted by Kahbir M. Richardson, former Correctional Officer with the Department of Corrections for service-connected disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y".

According to Mr. Richardson, on July 10, 2015, while attempting to gain control of an unruly inmate a physical struggle ensued. Mr. Richardson reports that during the altercation he and the inmate fell to the ground with the inmate landing on his left hand causing it to fracture. Mr. Richardson further reports that he was involved in another altercation with an inmate on March 30, 2021

Brian Coughlin- Approve
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Approve
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Approve
Leif Erickson- Approve
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

Hearing Panel Summary for Christopher Daukaus, Appel the denial of his application for service-connected disability benefits under Pension Plan "B"

This case was **denied** at the Board meeting held on April 27, 2023. A **virtual** hearing panel was conducted on September 13, 2023.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Sharolyn Murphy, Esq.:	Approve
Lief Erickson:	Approve
Paul Reed:	Approve

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Christopher Daukaus, former Police Sergeant for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "B".

According to Mr. Daukaus, on March 6, 2019, while attached to the SWAT unit they were executing a search warrant at a residence. Mr. Daukaus reports that while clearing a bedroom, he lifted a wooden bed, heard a "pop", and felt a pull in his right shoulder.

The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.

Hearing Panel Summary for Gerald L. Dombecki, Appel the denial of his application for service-connected disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y"

This case was **denied** at the Board meeting held on July 27, 2023. A **virtual** hearing panel was conducted on September 13, 2023.

The hearing panel recommendations are as follows:

Sharolyn Murphy, Esq.:	Deny
Lief Erickson:	Deny
Paul Reed:	Approve

Case Summary:

This is an application submitted by Gerald L. Dombecki, former Correctional Officer with the Department of Corrections for Service-Connected Disability benefits under Pension Plan "Y".

According to Mr. Dombecki, he states that he developed COPD as a result of his exposure to various toxins while a member of the K9 (Narcotics) and Elite CERT Units that visited multiple facilities. Mr. Dombecki further states that he suffered a heart attack and had a stent placed in his heart to help with its function.

Brian Coughlin- Approve
Marsha Green- Jones- Deny
Francois Dutchie Deny
Roosevelt Poplar- Approve
Aubrey Powers- Deny
Paul Reed- Approve
Leif Erickson- Approve
Carol Stukes Baylor- Approve

The motion to approve carried 5-3.

NEW BUSINESS

Executive Director's Report

- **Annual CLA Audit completed.**
- **State Audit anticipated to begin in the next several weeks.**
- **Possible SEPTA strike would go in effect at midnight on October 31, 2023. The city is making contingency plans with staff regarding remote work, when possible.**
- **Deferred Comp Subcommittee is meeting November 2, 2023. Chris will reach out to the sub committee prior to the meeting.**
- **Pensions held a presentation with the Executive Committee of DC 47 on October 19, 2023**
- **PAPERS will be holding Fall workshop November 8th and 9th.**

  Brian Coughlin made a motion that any staff member that wants to attend, may attend. Carol Stukes-Baylor seconded the motion.

  ***The motion to approve carried unanimously on a roll call vote.**

Litigation Summary

- Several Common Pleas cases pending. One case has been dismissed.

The motion to adjourn carried unanimously 8-0 on a roll call vote at 10:09 AM.