

Christopher Hartland
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 970 N Delaware Ave (Application # ZP-2023-007494)

Dear Christopher,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use building at 970 N Delaware Avenue.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The development at 970 N Delaware Avenue (approved and under construction) includes six buildings totaling 418,591 square feet of gross floor area. This includes 462 dwelling units, 21,584 square feet of retail space, 140 car parking spaces, and 196 bicycle parking spaces.

The proposal for review is a redesign of one of the structures that adds 35,388 square feet including 42 residential units and four visitor accommodation units. The redesign reduces retail square footage by 1,677 square feet. The redesign does not change the parking counts. This proposal is by-right under CMX-3 zoning within the Central Delaware Overlay District.

The project was first presented at the October 3, 2023 meeting of the Civic Design Review Committee. The committee had concerns with the design of the public realm on Canal Street in the vicinity of the visitor accommodation units and voted for the project to return for further review. The project team made significant changes to the ground floor design and returned for the November 7, 2023 CDR meeting. At its meeting of November 7, 2023, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the Civic Design Review process and offered the following comments:

#### **RCO Comments:**

There was no RCO representative present at either of the project reviews.

#### **CDR Committee Comments**

At the October 3, 2023 review, the Committee focused its comments on the design and placement of the visitor accommodation units and their impact on Canal Street. The committee encouraged the design team to explore relocating the units within the development. If this was not possible, the design team was encouraged to treat the entries to the units as porch spaces, continue to develop the plan with an eye towards improving the Canal Street pedestrian experience, and remove the impediments to pedestrian circulation such as ramps, stairs, and columns.

Civic Design Review
Committee
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

> Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Clarissa Redding, RA Leonidas Addimando Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St., 13<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615



The design team redesigned the visitor accommodation units but did not relocate them. The entry doors were revised to be full-lite frosted glass doors with transom windows above. Bathroom layouts were revised to provide an additional window in each unit. The stairs and ramp from the arcade area were removed to provide a barrier free walkway.

In response to these changes, the committee had little comment aside from appreciation for the changes made to the project in response to their comments.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP Interim Executive Director

Civic Design Review
Committee
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

> Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Clarissa Redding, RA Leonidas Addimando Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com

Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com

Councilmember Mark Squilla, 1st Council District, mark.squilla@phila.gov

Jennifer Slavic, Constituent Services Representative for Councilmember Mark Squilla, iennifer.slavic@phila.gov

Eric Quick, Harman Deutch Ohler Architecture, eric@hdoarch.com

Ron Patterson, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, RPatterson@klehr.com

Larry Freedman, Northern Liberties Neighbors Association (NLNA),

larryfreedman@comcast.net

Matt Ruben, Central Delaware Advocacy Group (CDAG), mruben@gmail.com

Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com

Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Ian.Litwin@phila.gov

Christopher Hartland, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, Christopher.Hartland@phila.gov

Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov

Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov

Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov

Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org

Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St., 13<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102



Shakir Cohen
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 1406 Cecil B Moore Ave (Application #ZP-2022-013351)

Dear Shakir,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential building at 1406 Cecil B Moore Avenue (AKA 1600 N Broad Street).

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a multi-family residential building totaling 238,090 square feet on a lot with two existing retail buildings totaling 102,277 square feet. The new building is proposed to contain 245 dwelling units and 46 parking spaces. The parcel is zoned CMX-4. The project is seeking a loading space waiver per section 14-806(4)(a) of the Philadelphia Code, but otherwise is by-right.

The project was first presented at the August 1, 2023 meeting of the Civic Design Review Committee. The committee had concerns with the design of the public realm at the ground floor and voted for the project to return for further review. The project team made some enhancements to the ground floor public realm design and returned for the November 7, 2023 CDR meeting. At its meeting of November 7, 2023, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the Civic Design Review process and offered the following comments:

#### **RCO Comments: (United Neighbors Alliance Civic Association)**

Despite the enhancements made to the public realm for the November 7, 2023 CDR meeting, the RCO has remaining concerns. The RCO is concerned that the project is being targeted at students and will not be affordable to existing non-student residents or senior citizens in the area. The RCO is also concerned with the lack of parking as the parking on site is currently used for patrons of the adjacent movie theater. Generally, the RCO is not satisfied with the level of communication with the development team.

### **CDR Committee Comments**

The CDR Committee felt that the architecture of the proposed tower fits well with its immediate context, but that the ground floor design is lacking. The committee stated that the changes made, including more vegetation, help to soften the design, but that the drive aisle limits the ability to improve the public realm.

The Committee expanded on the RCO's concerns by asking that the applicant include larger, more affordable units and open amenity spaces within the building to the community. The

Civic Design Review
Committee
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

> Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Clarissa Redding, RA Leonidas Addimando Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St., 13<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615



committee expressed disappointment that the community's concerns were not addressed and encouraged the applicant to have further communication with the RCO.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP Interim Executive Director Civic Design Review
Committee
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

> Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Clarissa Redding, RA Leonidas Addimando Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com

Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com Council President Darrell Clarke, Council District 5, darrell.clarke@phila.gov

Mary Jones, Legislative Counsel, mary.jones@phila.gov

Jerry Roller, JKRP Architects, jroller@jkrparchitects.com

Tina Roberts, Tower Development, tinaroberts@towerdev.com

Ron Patterson, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, rpatterson@klehr.com

Peter Crawford, Temple Area Property Association (TAPA), peter.redpike@gmail.com

Christine Brown, Beech Community Services Incorporated, cbrown@beechinterplex.com

Vivian VanStory, Community Land Trust Corporation, communitylandtrustcorp0@gmail.com

Dorothy Kelly, The Good News Community Organization, Louise159@verizon.net

Louise Bundy, Friends of the 47th Ward, LouiseBundy1@comcast.net

Lewis Nash, MAP Holistic CDC, map.nashsr@gmail.com

William T. Harris, United Neighbors Alliance Civic Association, unacarco47ward@gmail.com

David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, David.Fecteau@phila.gov

Shakir Cohen, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, shakir.cohen@phila.gov

Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle, brisbon@phila.gov

Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov

Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov

Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org

Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St., 13<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102



Paulose Issac Department of Licenses and Inspections Municipal Services Building, Concourse 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 2024-28 N 22<sup>nd</sup> Street (Application # ZP-2022-001452)

Dear Paulose Issac.

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use building at 2024-28 N 22<sup>nd</sup> Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

This project proposes a mixed-use building with over 80,000 square feet of new gross floor area. The development team intends for the project to include affordable housing for seniors. 120 dwelling units, over 10,000 square feet of commercial space, are 7500 square feet of amenity space are included. 46 bicycle parking spaces and 9 vehicular parking spaces are provided in the proposal. The existing zoning is RM-1. As designed, the proposal will need four variances to move forward for number of units proposed, building height, use, and parking.

At its meetings on August 1, 2023, and November 7, 2023, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

# RCO Comments: (32<sup>nd</sup> Democratic Ward RCO; From August 1, 2023, meeting only)

- □ Concerns about parking and traffic impacts.
   □ Officially requests a traffic and parking study.
   This could be a great TOD project around the 33 bus, but 9 parking spots for 120 units does not seem like enough.
  - Major concerns about how project will impact residents of Fontain St., who will most certainly be impacted by increased traffic and lack of sufficient onsite parking. Requests that those residents be notified and have their concerns addressed.
  - People in the area are already parking on pavement, due to increased density on Diamond.
  - Additional bike infrastructure does not make up for the lack of parking.
- Concerns about trend of projects that utilize lot consolidation to increase density so significantly. This area is not created for the kind of density that is proposed.
   Appreciates green space components of project.
- $\hfill \Box$  Pedestrian walkway needs clarification on whether it is open to public as cross-street.

Civic Design Review
Committee
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

> Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Clarissa Redding, RA Leonidas Addimando Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St., 13<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615



Questions about demolition protocols regarding existing vacant building; requests to be kept informed.

#### **CDR Committee Comments**

- The general site plan does not appear to be designed to fully thrive.
- Concerns about parking
  - Echo community concerns that parking is a real issue.
  - Questions about whether the layout of the parking and drop off sequence is well suited for seniors.
  - Aligning the parking with the current zoning while proposing density that is more than double what would be permitted in that zoning is problematic.
- Concerns about building design
  - o The building orientation does not acknowledge that buildings may be adjacent to this in the future.
  - The size of the one bedrooms and studios is not convincing.
  - Consider building features, programming elements, and commercial tenants that would be appropriate for senior housing.
- The committee expressed appreciation for the planter boxes added to the roof level, and encouraged drip irrigation to ensure they remain viable.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com CC: Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com Council President Clarke, Council District 5, darrell.clarke@phila.gov Mary Jones, Legislative Counsel to Council District 5, mary.jones@phila.gov Jordan Keller, OOMBRA Architects, jkeller@oombra.com Vern Anastasio, Anastasio Law, LLC, vern@alawphilly.com Priscilla Tee Bennett, St. Elizabeth's RCO, st.elizabethrco@gmail.com Lewis Nash Sr, MAP Holistic CDC, amenphilly@gmail.com Bonita Cummings, Strawberry Mansion Community Concern, SHL851@aol.com

David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, david.fecteau@phila.gov Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov

Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov

Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov

Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov

Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org

Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

Civic Design Review Committee Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

> Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Clarissa Redding, RA Leonidas Addimando Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St., 13th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102



Richard Maggetti
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 5709 Cottage Street (Application # ZP-2022-010911)

Dear Richard Maggetti,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed multi-family building at 5709 Cottage Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a multi-family residential building totaling 92,613 square feet of gross floor area. This proposal includes 81 dwelling units, 43 car parking spaces, and 35 bike parking spaces. The parcel is zoned RM-1 Residential Multi-Family and is a by-right project and is utilizing a Green Roof bonus.

At its meeting of November 7, 2023, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

# 7<sup>th</sup> Council District Office Comments:

A representative from the 7<sup>th</sup> Council District's office joined the panel and noted that the second community meeting was held by the Council office since the RCO had not been verified at that time. The representative mentioned that they had sent a letter to PCPC noting the concerns of the community which had mostly been related to the new development process and the community had been looking to resolve with the developer moving forward. In opposition to the PCPC staff comment regarding underground parking, the Council District representative also mentioned the community's concerns about the effects of excavation for underground parking on the surrounding houses.

#### **CDR Committee Comments**

At the Civic Design Review meeting, one Committee member acknowledged that the site was hard to design, suggested the site plan to include more context including the alleyway, and asked if it was utilized by neighboring houses. The committee suggested the open space fronting Cottage Street to be simplified and include more intentional design elements. Similarly, it was recommended that the Cottage Street building façade be simplified to be more aligned with the character of Philadelphia homes.

Civic Design Review
Committee
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

> Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Clarissa Redding, RA Leonidas Addimando Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St., 13<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615



There was some discussion about the lack of proper internal pedestrian circulation and pathways within the parking garage and the rear/side yards. It was suggested that more architectural elements, pathways, and landscaping be added to make it look more like a garden. The committee also encouraged the team to look at maintenance of the ground floor outdoor spaces, making sure they were well maintained and utilized. Another committee member agreed with PCPC staff comment regarding the parking garage entrance and believed that it had to be reworked to accommodate more uses as well as clear pathways for pedestrians and cyclists as well. The committee member also noted that the private outdoor spaces had to be paved for the residents to use them.

Finally, a committee member suggested the addition of shading structures for the roof deck as well as solar panels on the roof as strategies for a more sustainable development. In response to the comment from the Council office's representative, the committee member explained that there would still be excavations and earth disturbance involved given the size of this development, and the idea of not including an underground parking would not change that. The committee member suggested other strategies to remedy that issue and recommended combining units to allow for 3-bedroom units which would take the burden off the parking numbers as well.

Lastly, the CDR Committee adopted the Planning Commission staff comments, which included recommendations to add an entrance to the ground floor unit facing Cottage Street, enlarge the pathways' width for the open space along Cottage Street, define a clear circulation for ground floor units, and propose higher quality materials for large portions of the building façade. PCPC staff also noted that the location of loading was far from the residential elevator which would make move-in move-out challenging. Finally, PCPC staff suggested the addition of more/larger windows on the building façade to allow for more internal natural light and discouraged the use of long narrow balconies.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP Interim Executive Director

CC: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Quetcy M. Lozada, Council District 7, quetcy.lozada@phila.gov
Sloane Folks, Representative to Council District 7, sloane.folks@phila.gov
Kevin J. O'Neil, KJO Architecture, info@kjoarchitecture.com
Linda Truong, Zhen H Jin Law LLC, ltruong@zhjinlaw.com
John Barnes, Wissinoming Civic Association, johnbz@comcast.net
Michael Gall, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, michael.gall@phila.gov
Richard Maggetti, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections,richard.maggetti@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov

Civic Design Review Committee Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

> Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Clarissa Redding, RA Leonidas Addimando Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St., 13<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102



Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability,
casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

Civic Design Review Committee

Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

> Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Clarissa Redding, RA Leonidas Addimando Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St., 13<sup>th</sup> Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615