



October 23, 2023

Frederick Marshall
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 1528 N Broad Street (Application # ZP-2023-001507)

Dear Frederick Marshall,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of **1528 N Broad Street**. *Staff notes that conditional permit # ZP-2022-013044C has also been associated with this proposal.*

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

This proposal is a mixed-use building totaling 381,877 square feet comprised of an 11 story base and a 28 story tower. More than 20,000 square feet of retail space is proposed at the ground floor. 289 new dwelling units and residential amenities are included in the floors above. An underground parking garage with 78 automobile spaces and 100 bicycle spaces is also included. The existing zoning is CMX-4. The proposal does not require any variances, but it utilizes bonuses for underground parking, green building, and public open space. The public open space bonus will be subject to review and approval at building permit.

At its meeting of October 3, 2023, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (United Neighbors Alliance Civic Association)

The community supports this proposal. But the community did have concerns about additional development in the area which were noted to the development team. The RCO representative noted that this proposal serves a need of the community, addressing student housing in an appropriate way.

CDR Committee Comments

The committee expressed appreciation for the team's work to gain community support for the project. The committee likewise commended the inclusion of underground parking, particularly given the below-grade activity on Broad Street. This removal of parking from the ground floor allows for the ample active retail space provided.

The Committee also appreciated the pursuit of LEED Gold but noted it should be considered a starting point.

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



The committee appreciates that this proposal provides density of housing in a location that makes a lot of sense given transit access. The proposal is further strengthened by its good architectural building articulation and sustainable design commitment.

The Committee commented that the loading and garage access on Carlisle Street warrants additional consideration. Carlisle Street is a residential street not an alley – a setback may be needed. The committee is very appreciative of the street trees provided along N Broad. The committee requested that the street trees are feasible and have what they need to thrive.

The Committee had a series of comments regarding the public open space proposed:

- The plaza feels more like a private courtyard than a public engagement space. Consider ways to provide more visual and physical access to that space.
- Consider a connection from the public space to retail activity or another indoor amenity.
- Please ensure the planters are as large as possible given the constraints of the plaza being built largely on the roof deck of the parking garage.
- The committee appreciates that the park paving extends toward Broad Street. This is a nice gesture to pull people into the space.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Clarke, Council District 5, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Mary Jones, Legislative Counsel to Council District 5, mary.jones@phila.gov
Cube3, info@cube3.com
Eileen Quigley, Ballard Spahr, quigleye@ballardspahr.com
Peter Crawford, Temple Area Property Association (TAPA), peter.redpike@gmail.com
Christine Brown, Beech Community Services Incorporated, cbrown@beechinterplex.com
Dorothy Kelly, The Good News Community Organization, Louise159@verizon.net
Lewis Nash Sr., MAP Holistic CDC, amenphilly@gmail.com
William T. Harris, United Neighbors Alliance Civic Association, unacarco47ward@gmail.com
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, david.fecteau@phila.gov
Frederick Marshall, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, frederick.marshall@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



Department of Planning and Development

Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability,
casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

Civic Design Review Committee

Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



October 23, 2023

Eleanor Sharpe, Director of the Department of Planning and Development
Department of Planning and Development
1515 Arch Street, 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1830 N Broad Street,
Temple University Master Plan Amendment**

Dear Eleanor,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of 1830 N Broad Street, as an amendment to the Temple University Master Plan.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a 210,000 square foot facility for academic and performance spaces on a 2.4 acre site within a SP-INS zoning district of Temple University. The site is located between 15th Street to the west, Broad Street to the east, Montgomery Avenue to the south, and Norris Street to the north. The scope of the master plan amendment includes significant site modifications such as the extension of Polett Walk and additions to existing vehicular loading areas accessed from 15th Street.

At its meeting of October 3, 2023, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (Map Holistic CDC)

The RCO expressed overwhelming community support for the project, including the Wards associated with this site. They feel that the changes being made will make the neighborhood much safer.

CDR Committee Comments

The Committee expressed support for the proposal noting that the amendment is moving things in the right direction and that the overall building design is very thoughtful. They also noted that Temple University has made enormous improvements in the livability of its campus in the last few decades. They commended the design team for its public outreach, noting that community organizations are looking forward to the project. At the request of the committee, Planning Commission staff observations have been incorporated into the comments below.

The Committee noted support for the extension of Polett Walk across Broad Street to the west side of the campus. This allows for the creation of open spaces and amenities similar to the rich experiences of the academic campus on the east side of Broad Street. To facilitate the Polett Walk extension, the Committee endorses the exploration of a raised crossing with bump outs and bollards across Broad Street. Additionally the applicant should consider

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



merging the two lines of crossing into a single crossing, similar to what was done at the crossing between the Pennsylvania Academy of Fine Arts and the Philadelphia Convention Center. Recognizing the challenges of planting on N Broad Street, the Committee noted the importance of street trees, and encouraged the design team to begin exploring subsurface conditions now to ensure that they can be successfully incorporated into the project.

Additionally, the Committee encouraged the development team to think of Polett Walk as a linear park that has spaces for gathering and a variety of experiences. Capitalize on the grading changes between Broad Street and 15th Street to create lively pedestrian activation, similar to what has been done on Liacouras Walk. The Committee requested the applicant consider the various ways that the walk connects to ground floor activity and put an effort into an ecological systems approach to landscaping, based on native plantings. The Committee requested large bike parking areas close to 15th Street to encourage the use of the existing bike sharrows and to discourage bike travel on N Broad Street. The Committee also noted that there were several areas in and around Polett Walk that could accommodate larger open spaces with active programming, plantings, sheltering elements, gathering spaces, and more.

The Committee commends the well-planned entries at the intersection Broad Street and Polett Walk, but also noted the lack of entrances along other public faces. To improve these frontages, the committee encouraged additional points of entry and active ground floor uses where feasible. On 15th Street, the Committee supported the placement of new loading areas away from the street but also noted the current prevalence of loading areas and service spaces. They encouraged new frontages facing 15th Street to keep the ground floors light, transparent, and airy, improving the pedestrian experience.

Regarding building architecture, the committee appreciated the high amounts of transparency planned for Broad Street, and is enthused by the amount of light that will come out in evening hours. They also asked the development team to manage concerns with glazing and potential hazards for birds. Additionally, the committee noted the large scale of the proposal. They asked the design team to consider future refinements to building massing and architectural details, making it more complementary to academic architecture elsewhere on Broad Street.

Regarding sustainable design, the committee applauded the intention to pursue LEED Silver certification but also asked that the development team consider that to be a minimum standard, and to aim higher where feasible. They urged the development team to make good use of the extensive roof areas, noting the potential for green roofs and solar photovoltaic panels.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



Department of Planning and Development

Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Council President Darrell Clarke, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Mary B Jones, Esq., Legislative Counsel, mary.jones@phila.gov
Matthew McClure, Ballard Spahr, McClure@ballardspahr.com
Eileen Quigley, Ballard Spahr, QuigleyE@ballardspahr.com
Peter Crawford, Temple Area Property Association, peter.redpike@gmail.com
Christine Brown, Beech Community Service
Incorporated, cbrown@beechinterplex.com
Dorothy Kelly, The good news community
organization, Louise159@verizon.net
Lewis Nash Sr, Map Holistic CDC, amenphilly@gmail.com
Bonita Cummings, Strawberry Mansion Community
Concern, SHL851@aol.com
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability,
casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

Civic Design Review Committee

Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



October 23, 2023

Jais Skaria
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 3900 Main Street (Application # ZP-2021-011239)

Dear Jais Skaria,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use residential and commercial building at 3900 Main Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes three mixed-use, multi-family residential and commercial buildings totaling 178,619 gross square feet, including 120 dwelling units, three commercial spaces, and 52 underground vehicular parking spaces. The site, which is 1.36 acres, is zoned ICMX and requires variances for use (multi-family residential), height, and building within the 50' required waterfront setback.

This proposal was first discussed at the February 7, 2023 meeting and was asked back for a second review. At its meeting of October 3, 2023, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (Manayunk Neighborhood Council)

The RCO representative expressed concerns that a residential building of such a large scale was being proposed for a site with such limited by-right buildable area, requiring a building footprint significantly closer to the riverfront than is allowed by-right. The representative emphasized flooding concerns, including: feasibility and safety concerns regarding underground parking; impacts along the Main Street side (not just the riverfront side), where three commercial spaces are proposed at the ground floor; and the lack of legal standing in the development team's proposed flood preparedness strategies. The representative also noted a lack of clarity about the proposal due to apparent inconsistencies among various plans and renderings.

CDR Committee Comments

The Committee expressed agreement with much of the comments made by the RCO representative. One Committee member questioned the value of discussing specific design details that would not have any effect on the fundamental problem with the project, which is its location in a flood-prone area. The Committee member added that the renderings appear nondescript and lacking detail of amenities. It was also noted that, due to flooding impacts,

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>



underground parking at this location would pose a safety risk, not just to parked cars, but also to drivers who go down to move their car at the wrong time.

The Committee asked to include staff comments:

- Staff remains concerned with flooding impacts along Main Street.
- Please ensure continuous bike/ADA from Main Street to riverfront promenade.
- Staff has questions about activation of linear public access spaces that do not connect to adjacent trail segments.
- Staff remains concerned about underground parking in flood-prone area.
- Staff has ongoing questions about design of public spaces, including the hardscaped plazas that connect Main Street to riverfront.
- Staff questions size and location of 2nd floor mail room and management office.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Curtis Jones, Council District 4, Curtis.jones.jr@phila.gov
Joshua Cohen, Rep. to Council District 4, Joshua.cohen@phila.gov
Stuart Rosenberg, SgRA Architecture, stuart@sgra.com
Max Dipperstein, SgRA Architecture, mdipperstein@sgra.com
Adam Laver, BlankRome, adam.laver@blankrome.com
John Hunter, Manayunk Neighborhood Council, johnhunter286@gmail.com
Louis Agre, 21st Ward Democratic Committee, dems21stward@gmail.com
Aaron Holly, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, aaron.holly@phila.gov
Jais Skaria, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, jais.skaria@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

**Civic Design Review
Committee**
Established 2012

Martine Decamp, AICP
Interim Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA,
NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
*Civic Design Review
Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Redding, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615

<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-city-planning-commission/>