



CPOC Commissioners' public meeting minutes September 5, 2023

Section 1 – Call to Order: Meeting called to order at 6:14 pm

- A. Commissioner Roll Call:
- Present: Commissioners Jahlee Hatchett (Chair), Hassan Bennett John Solomon, Elder Melanie Dubose, Rosaura Thomas, Hakim Peay
 - Absent: None
- B. Motion to approve Agenda: Motion passes; Agenda approved.
- C. Commission will postpone Action Items 1 & 2:
- Executive session regarding Commissioner compensation and Resolution to Update CPOC Bylaws will be postponed.
- D. Community update:
- Chair Hatchett updated the community that CPOC held a meeting about the fatal shooting of Eddie Irizarry on August 14, 2023. CPOC provided a recommendation to PPD Commissioner Outlaw concerning that case. CPOC is continuing to monitor this case and will update the public when we can.
- E. Executive Director Report: available on [CPOC website](#).
- During this presentation, Interim Executive Director Anthony Erace confirmed that on August 22, 2023, CPOC made a recommendation to PPD to terminate Officer Dial, which was also sent to the District Attorney's Office.
 - Chair Hatchett passed along community suggestion about interest in having CPOC meetings around the city.
 - Interim ED Erace explained that the website and social media has all the information about public events and meetings around the city.
- F. CPOC transition to Civil Service and current hiring:
- Chair Hatchett raises the question of whether this is a good time to move forward with hiring? Prior to the ballot question, Commissioners had asked the Interim ED to pause hiring.
 - Interim ED Erace: the process of transitioning to civil service is complicated and we're working with MDO and HR to move that forward. It's a good time for any hiring, we're very understaffed, so it would help us do our work.
 - Comm. Thomas stated that CPOC needs investigators and analysts. She does not believe that CPOC needs public relations people. She referenced the killing of Eddie Irizarry and wants to see more help and staff for the Director of Investigations.
 - Interim ED Erace: We have a build out plan, which allows us to grow over time. We need to accomplish a lot of oversight functions while working out how we will perform other functions with PPD. Early plans for investigations include "NTSB" style after-action reports. If the hiring freeze is lifted, some positions are ready to be posted.
 - Commissioners did not have any other concerns about CPOC hiring. No reason to stop or prevent hiring or civil service transition.

- Community question from “mymac”:
 - how many staff have already taken and passed the civil service exam, how many have not taken it?
 - Shouldn’t the Commission hire an Executive Director first?
 - How many investigations have been done to date and how many are in the process of being done?
- G. Resolution to hire a consulting company for the Executive Director Search
 - General Counsel Catherine Twigg: CPOC has contacted two search firm companies who have contracted with the city and has an additional quote from a third search firm, who does not currently have a contract with the city.
 - Chair Hatchett:
 - Proposal 1: \$40,000, paid in three instalment payments of \$13,000. Detailed 9 week process, doing all the leg work, screening candidates. The search firm would conduct initial interviews of finalists, who would then be interviewed by the commissioners. Prior recent, high-level experience with the City of Philadelphia.
 - Proposal 2: \$35,400, paid in 4 instalments of \$8,550. Differs in that they solicit individuals and put together recommended candidate lists, commissioners would then be involved in all interviews.
 - Proposal 3: \$40,000. Similar to proposal 1. They have experience hiring for government and non-profits, but not experienced in Philadelphia or currently under contract. They also appear to specialize in legal hiring.
 - Comm. Bennett felt that the primary difference between the proposals was that in proposal 2, the Commissioners are more involved and present for interviews.
 - Atty Twigg responded that all proposals allow the commissioners to be involved as much as they want to and their schedules allow, they can always be present for interviews.
 - Comm. DeBouse asked if the third firm had ever applied to contract with the city. This information was not known. Comm. DeBouse did not feel prepared to vote because she had not read the proposals.
 - Comm. Peay: we did not receive Proposal 3, was it not sent because they are not contracted with the city.
 - Chair Hatchett can circulate all of the proposals, with or without redactions. How would the Commissioners like to move forward?
 - Motion to move forward with voting on a search firm passes.
 - Commissioner vote on whether they would move forward with selection and which firm they would select:
 - Comm. Peay: Yes, proposal 1
 - Comm. Bennett: Yes, proposal 2
 - Comm. DeBouse – Abstain.
 - Comm. Thomas – Yes, proposal 2
 - Comm. Solomon – Abstain
 - Chair Hatchett Yes, proposal 1 *[corrected]*

- **Vote: Two commissioners supported proposal 1, two commissioners supported proposal 2, and two commissioners abstained. No search firm is selected.**

H. Community Comment:

- Andy Kang:
 - What kind of certification are police officers required (and how regularly) before they are allowed to use lethal force?
 - Officers who are not comfortable using their firearm effectively are more likely to panic and make mistakes.
 - If an officer has a PFA entered against them, are they required to turn in personal firearms to the sheriff like other citizens, or prevented from taking service weapon home?
- Comm. Thomas: As a survivor of domestic violence by a police officer involved in domestic violence, it is difficult for survivors to receive a PFA. Police officers are required to turn in their firearms, but sadly, it doesn't happen.
- "Mymac"
 - You are supposed to allow us the information from the Police Board and investigations, as described in the legislation.
 - There were 15 complaints without Commission discussion sent to Internal Affairs, were they investigated before you sent them?
 - Please fill us in on investigations that CPOC should be investigating.

I. Comm. Bennett comment about public release of information about a case that is ongoing.

- Atty Twigg: concurrently there is a criminal investigation, conducted by the District Attorney's Office, and there is an administrative investigation, conducted by PPD, which could be discipline – up to and including termination. When an incident is under investigation, legal restrictions on the ongoing criminal or administrative investigations. Until the proceedings are complete or made public by PPD or the DAO, other agencies cannot provide specific information.
- Comm. Bennett: are we talking about the end of PBI hearings or the end of the criminal trial. Atty Twigg explained that this is a complicated, case-by-case question.
- Comm. Bennett: this is why we cannot be transparent as soon as we like, although we have the information.
- Atty Twigg: yes, it's important to protect that information and those investigations.
- Comm. Bennett: the Commissioners are provided confidential, detailed information and the opportunity to weigh in on CPOC's work.
- Comm. Thomas: all of the Commissioners take their work seriously. We are working together as a team to work for transparency and accountability.

J. Motion to adjourn – motion passes; meeting adjourned.

Approved by Commissioners on October 24, 2023.