



October 15, 2020

Mr. Jeffrey Tan
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1030 N American St.
(Application No. ZP-2020-003505C)**

Dear Mr. Tan,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1030 N American St.**

This proposal is to redevelop the second block of Liberties Walk between American and Bodine Streets in Northern Liberties with a new 8-story mixed-use building while also maintaining the site's east-west pedestrian connection. The site is zoned CMX-3, and no zoning variances are required. The proposal totals 160,679 gross square feet including 8,970 square feet commercial space on the ground floor, a 9,435 square foot public courtyard, 76 residential units, 89 car parking spaces, and 33 bike parking spaces.

At its meeting of October 13, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments:

A representative from the West Girard Progress RCO attended the meeting and commended Post Brothers for training 40 local residents in the building trades and for lending their expertise to RCO's to help develop affordable housing projects.

2. CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee shared their appreciation for the design and programming of the project.

Members of the committee commended the development team for their comprehensive approach to development and redevelopment in Northern Liberties and for their openness to work with the community on design issues prior to the CDR meeting.

Another member of the committee stressed that although the embodied energy of existing structures will be wasted through demolition, she understood why the development team was taking this approach. She also

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



lamented that some of the charm of the existing Liberties Walk is lost in the new design

Lastly, the members of the committee urged the design team to continue to work with the Streets Department on the mid-block crossing design details

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Council President Darrell Clarke, Council District 5, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Corey Bell, Representative to Council District 5, corey.bell@phila.gov
Larry Freedman Northern Liberties Neighbors Association, larryfreedman@comcast.net
Craig Charlton, 5th Ward Republican RCO, charlton_craig@hotmail.com
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com
Ron Patterson, Klehr Harrison, rpatterson@klehr.com
Brian Philips, AIA, LEEP-AP, Interface Studio Architects, brian@is-architects.com
Cornelius Brown, Bohler Engineers, cbrown@bohlereng.com
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov
Jeffrey Tan, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, jeffrey.tan@phila.gov



October 13, 2020

Mr. Shakir Cohen
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

Re: Civic Design Review for 1600-50 W. Girard Avenue (Application # ZP-2020-003056)

Dear Mr. Cohen,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1600-50 W. Girard Avenue**.

The proposal is for a 7-story residential and commercial mixed-use building with 192 residential units on floors 2-7, totaling 147,588 square feet. The project also proposes ground floor commercial space totaling 9,452 square feet. The project proposes 44 parking spaces and a publicly accessible courtyard between the existing building and this proposal. The proposal sits on a CMX-3 parcel and is a by-right project.

At its meeting of October 13, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments – United Francisville Civic Association (UFCA)

An RCO representative did not attend this meeting on the 13th. However, the RCO provided a letter dated October 5, 2020 which included the following comments:

- The projects should include a greater number of electric vehicle parking spots relative to the total presented.
- The project's 44 parking spaces are not adequate relative to the 280 units (*280 units includes the existing phase 1 building*)
- Exterior design, lighting, and brick color homogenizing is requested. The project should consider using the Mural Arts program for the building exterior. It was also suggested that the brick facade on Cambridge Street match next door properties and the historical nature of the neighborhood.
- Retail space vacancy is a concern for the neighborhood. Some built retail space remains vacant, including vacancies within the newly rehabbed Phase I part of the project and other spaces around the neighborhood within the same price points.
- Another concern was raised about the hindrance of views for the 1600 block of Cambridge Street.
- Nearby neighbors suggested security cameras and significant street lighting on Cambridge Street should be included.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



- Nearby neighbors also requested confirmations of all curb cut changes on all sides of the project.
- Cambridge Street neighbors requested trees and plantings on the street.
- One concern was that the fire exits around Phase I property need fixing. These have been used for unwanted activity.
- A suggestion not to have a gate on Cambridge Street at the parking entrance to eliminate unwanted noise for nearby neighbors.
- Finally, consensus was noted for the need for affordable housing in the neighborhood and it was suggested to make some of the units available to such residents.

2. CDR Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee had several positive comments and generally agreed that this proposal was commendable with many thoughtful design decisions and a well-articulated project. The Committee and PCPC staff provided the following comments:

- The CDR Committee noted that the project seemed appropriately scaled for this site, specifically along W. Girard Avenue.
- Several Committee members noted that the ground floor site design which focuses on public functions is a benefit. There was general agreement that this project will be a great addition to Girard Avenue and larger neighborhood.
- There was discussion about the potential to add color and/or a mural to the upper floors of the proposal.
 - a. Some Committee members expressed excitement about the potential for color to be added to the façade in certain locations.
 - b. Others, including PCPC staff, noted that the design team should continue to work with the community and the RCO when considering additional colors and art on the facade.
 - c. In addition, or as a substitute to color, the Committee suggested exterior lighting options, which may not age as quickly as paint, and may be easier to change and upgrade over time.
- Several CDR Committee members complimented the courtyard design, specifically the lighting and amenities for night use.
- Finally, the CDR Committee chair noted that the project was unique, but also very Philadelphian in nature, and in keeping with the neighborhood's character.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director



cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Council President Darrell Clarke, Council District 5, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Corey Bell, Representative to Council District 5, corey.bell@phila.gov
Michael V. Phillips, Obermayer Rebmann Maxwell & Hippel LLP, Michael.phillips@obermayer.com
Sergio Coscia, Coscia Moos Architecture, scoscia@cosciamoos.com
Katie Burrell, Coscia Moos Architecture, kburrell@cosciamoos.com
Darlene Cerullo, United Francisville Civic Association, zoning@unitedfrancisville.com
Vivian VanStory, Community Land Trust Corporation, cltc3@netzero.net
Lewis Nash, MAP Holistic CDC, map.nashsr@gmail.com
Joseph McLaughlin, Francisville Neighborhood Development Corporation, joe.mclaughlin@sodexo.com
Drew Kondylas, Friends of Ogden Park, kondylas@gmail.com
Louise Bundy, Friends of the 47th Ward, LouiseBundy1@comcast.net
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.Litwin@phila.gov
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, David.Fecteau@phila.gov
Shakir Cohen, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, Shakir.Cohen@phila.gov
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



October 21, 2020

Ms. Reeba Merin Babu
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

Re: Civic Design Review for 1705 N. American Street (App. No. ZP-2020-1640)

Dear Ms. Babu:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1705 N. American Street**.

The proposal is for a 6 story, multi-use building with 9,452 square feet of commercial space at ground floor, 114,044 square feet of residential units and residential amenities above. The building includes 179 residential units. 42 total parking spaces are provided at the rear of the site. This project requires several variances for use, building height, the pilot houses, parking provided, and off-street loading.

At its meeting of October 13, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments

Marco Gorini of South Kensington Community Partners was in attendance and expressed that, while his group had some concerns, community members are supportive of this type of project overall. Concerns were expressed about the height of the proposed building, particularly facing Phillip Street, where a more significant setback would be preferred. Regarding materials, a concern was voiced about the durability of the proposed cement board panels. Mr. Gorini also asked that team give more consideration to management of stormwater on the site.

2. CDR Committee Comments

The Committee was supportive of the proposal, finding it to be thoughtful, beautiful, and consisting of a mix of unit types and affordable units that is always encouraged but rarely seen. The discussion focused primarily on ways to encourage the team to push the public space of the project further. The team was advised to look for ways to break up the scale of the plaza to make it more inviting, and to revisit the plants incorporated to ensure viability and success. Wayfinding signage was encouraged. The Committee also asked that the team coordinate efforts with larger streetscape improvement plans for American Street in general and specifically by looking for ways to provide off-street loading for the project. While the team was commended for the environmental performance of the project, they were also encouraged to

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



consider solar or other additional options for the site. Overall, the Committee felt this project is a great model for developers.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Maria Quinones-Sanchez, maria.q.sanchez@phila.gov
Atrium Design Group, team@atriumdesigngroup.com
Hercules Grigos, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, hgrigos@klehr.com
Ellie Matthews, South Kensington Community Partners, RCO@southkensingtoncommunity.org
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com
Dave Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, david.fecteau@phila.gov
Reeba Merin Babu, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, reeba.babu@phila.gov
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



October 13, 2020

Paulose Issac
Plan Examiner, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

Re: Civic Design Review for 3449 Scotts Lane (Application No. ZP-2020-000786C)

Dear Mr. Issac:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed multi-family housing development at **3449 Scotts Lane**.

The proposal is for the construction of four buildings containing 220 multi-family residential units and 220 parking spaces. This is a by-right project within the RM-1 zoning district.

At its meeting of October 13, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments:

Representatives from RAH Civic Association and East Falls Civic Association attended the October 13th meeting and offered the following comments and recommendations:

- a. Concerns about children and seniors walking in the area were addressed by changes to the plan design.
- b. Safer and wider pedestrian connections to the surrounding neighborhood are still needed, especially down Scotts Lane and across the street to McDevitt Recreation center.
- c. Overall, many issues have been addressed and this is a good development.

2. CDR Committee Comments:

The CDR Committee offered the following comments and recommendations:

- a. The Committee supported the revisions made to this project since the first review, including the addition of glazing on Building A to open up the lobby area.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



- b. The Committee recommends that the applicant confirm that the sidewalk leading up to Henry Avenue meets ADA requirements for grading. If it does not, the applicant should add an alternative route to provide this access.
- c. The Committee accepted all staff comments which focused on increasing pedestrian safety, including recommendations to widen the sidewalk along Scotts Lane, verifying the sidewalk grade up to Henry Avenue, and to provide a safer crossing to McDevitt Recreation Center.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Curtis Jones, Jr., curtis.jones.jr@phila.gov
Joshua Cohen, Chief of Staff, joshua.cohen@phila.gov
Ronald J. Patterson, Esq., rpatterson@klehr.com
Steve Fillmore, East Falls Forward, fillmore.steve@gmail.com
Rosalie Cooper, RAH Civic Association, rahcivicassociation@yahoo.com
Hilary Langer, East Falls Community Council, hilary.j.langer@gmail.com
Ariel Diliberto, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ariel.diliberto@phila.gov
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov