

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando Ashley Di Caro, LEED - AP Tavis Dockwiller, RLA Clarissa Kelsey, RA Flise Vider

May 6, 2021

Matthew Wojcik Department of Licenses and Inspections Municipal Services Building, Concourse 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 300 N Christopher Columbus Blvd (Application #ZP-2020-00329C)

Dear Mr. Wojcik,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **300 N Christopher Columbus Boulevard.**

The proposal is for a 25-story, 345,231 square foot mixed-use building containing 360 residential units, 10,000 sf retail space, 108 vehicle parking spaces, and 123 bike parking spaces. The parcel is zoned CMX-3 within the Central Delaware Overlay. The project, as designed, utilizes the following height bonuses to attain a maximum height of 276 feet: Public Art (12'), Public Space (36'), Mixed-Income Housing (48'), Green Building Bonus (36'), Trail Bonus (12'), Retail Space Bonus (24') for 10,000 sf, and Stormwater Bonus (24').

At its meeting of May 4, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments

The Central Delaware Advocacy Group (CDAG) was the coordinating RCO for this project. They held a virtual public community meeting on April 8, 2021.

A representative from CDAG was in attendance and stated that CDAG's member organizations are generally supportive of the proposed uses, site configuration, and building materials. However, they have concerns with some of the design details.

CDAG urged the design team to reconsider both the materiality and facade composition to better relate to the homes across Water Street. In addition, they requested that the design team consider moving the ADA ramp to Vine Street to allow for more direct connections between the retail spaces and the Columbus Boulevard sidewalk. Lastly, CDAG would like the landscape design to better represent the subsurface archaeological resources and history of the waterfront site.

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St. 13th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone 215-683-4630 Facsimile



2. CDR Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee had numerous positive public realm comments, noting that the project proposes many admirable design features including the LEED platinum design, the multi-generational public space, and the high-quality building materials. Members complimented the diverse unit mix but implored the design team to include larger units and to consider building affordable housing units on-site as opposed to making a payment inlieu to the affordable housing trust fund.

Members of the CDR Committee echoed comments made by CDAG pertaining to the Wood Street façade and the ADA ramp along Columbus Boulevard. The design building facades on parking levels will be subject to Planning Commission staff approval before a building permit can be issued.

The relationship between the retail spaces and the Columbus Boulevard sidewalk was further discussed, and the design team was encouraged to decrease the commercial setback and to explore the concept of integrating the stairs and ADA ramps together.

The design team was urged to consider adding more balconies on the western side of the building to provide more private outdoor space and to include more bicycle parking spaces due to the site's proximity to the Central Delaware Riverfront Trail.

The CDR committee also adopted Planning Commission staff comments, with a specific focus on the proposed fences and gates surrounding the park space. It was stated that there are other, less harsh ways to accomplish the desired security needs. The design of the park will require Planning Commission staff approval before a building permit can be issued.

In closing, the CDR Committee stressed that the project's success will hinge on the establishment and care of the site's landscapes.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director



cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com Daniel K. Garofalo, Vice-Chair, Civic Design Review Committee, dkgarofalo@gmail.com Councilmember Mark Squilla, mark.squilla@phila.gov Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov Jennifer Slavic, Constituent Services Representative, jennifer.slavic@phila.gov Peter Kelsen, Esq., BLANKROME, kelsen@blankrome.com Julia Limongello, Durst Organization, jlimongello@durst.org David Margolis, Handel Architects, dmargolis@handelarchitects.com Christopher Hager, Langan Engineers, chager@langan.com Matt Ruben, Central Delaware Advocacy Group (CDAG), mruben@gmail.com Kate Esposito, Center City Organized for Responsible Development, ccordrco1@gmail.com Ian Clark, 5th Ward Republican RCO, ianclark93@gmail.com Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov



Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Tavis Dockwiller, RLA Clarissa Kelsey, RA Flise Vider

May 10, 2021

Mr. Paulose Issac Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 1201-09 Vine Street (App. No. ZP-2020-009283)

Dear Mr. Issac:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of the proposed development of **1201-09 Vine Street**.

The proposed development includes 81,000 gross square feet with 8-stories of new construction featuring mechanical parking, residential entrance, and leasing on the ground floor with residential units above, combined with a two-story residential overbuild on the existing Jarvis Building at 1209 Vine Street. There are 120 new dwelling units proposed between the new building and overbuild construction, with 36 mechanical automobile spaces and 40 bicycle parking spaces proposed. The proposal utilizes a Public Art zoning code bonus, though the details of the artwork to be included are still in the early stages.

The Civic Design Review Committee voted to conclude the CDR process at its meeting on **May 4, 2021**. The Committee offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments

Sarah McEneaney attended the meeting on behalf of **coordinating RCO Callowhill Neighborhood Association**. Ms. McEneaney indicated that the group is generally supportive of the project and its density. She encouraged the team to begin the public art process as soon as possible, saying that it is a great opportunity for the site and the community. She emphasized several improvements to further the project, including the need for bump outs to aid pedestrians crossing Vine Street, greater consideration of potential streetscape improvements such as planters, and the need to avoid trash dumpsters along Pearl Street.

Yue Wu of Philadelphia Chinatown Development Corporation was in attendance as well and reinforced the comments of Ms. McEneaney. She suggested the team consider ground floor programming such as a small retail location along 12th Street to provide more activity at the street level.

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St. 13th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone 215-683-4630 Facsimile



2. CDR Committee Comments

The CDR Committee was supportive of the project while offering suggestions for improvement, particularly at the ground floor. The team was encouraged to look for ways to enhance the ground floor with commercial space, additional greening, potential expansion of the public art, or a combination of all three. The Committee emphasized the need for curb bump outs on Vine Street, the removal of existing sidewalk bollards if possible, and a general need to approach site security by providing amenities rather than limiting them. Additional glazing, lighting, or doors facing Pearl Street was also encouraged. For the public art, the Committee agreed with staff and the RCO members present in urging the team to think about the art opportunity more broadly in terms of potential subject matter, location, and potential medium proposed. Though the straightforward design approach was admired, the team was encouraged to look for ways to add more richness and greater articulation to the material palette.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director

Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com cc: Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov Councilmember Mark Squilla, mark.squilla@phila.gov Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant to Councilmember, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov Sarah McEneaney, Callowhill Neighborhood Association, sarahmceneaney@me.com Ian Clark, 5th Ward Republican RCO, ianclark93@gmail.com Yue Wu, Philadelphia Chinatown Development Corporation, vwu@chinatown-pcdc.org Mahn S. Park, Asian American Federation of the United States, mahnpark@gmail.com Kate Esposito, Center City Organized for Responsible Development, ccordrco1@gmail.com Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov



Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Tavis Dockwiller, RLA Clarissa Kelsey, RA Elise Vider

May 4, 2021

Cheli Dahal Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 1901 E York St (Application No. ZP-2021-000336)

Dear Cheli Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1901 E York St.**

6,080 square feet of artisanal spaces, 28 vehicular parking spaces, and 48 bicycle parking spaces. The site is bound by E York Street to the southwest, Jasper Street to the northwest, E Boston Street to the northeast, and private parcels to the southeast. The parcel is zoned IRMX and the project is by-right. At its meeting of May 4, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. East Kensington Neighborhood Association:

A representative from the RCO offered the following comments: They appreciate the development of a new mixed-use building in the neighborhood with light-industrial artist studios. However, the RCO expressed concerns that the artisanal spaces would be converted to residential dwellings at a later date, given the oversupply of artist spaces in the area. The RCO encouraged the development team to consider converting the spaces to commercial uses if artist studios prove to be infeasible.

2. New Kensington Community Development Corporation:

A representative from the RCO offered the following comments: They appreciate the quality of the design of the building, the elements that reflect the light-industrial character of the older building stock, and how it integrates into the neighborhood. The RCO expresses that there is a desire and need for more affordable housing in the area and encourages the development team to provide some on-site affordable units.

> One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St. 13th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone 215-683-4630 Facsimile



3. CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee offered the following comments, which include Planning Commission staff observations adopted by the CDR committee.

For site design and complete streets, the committee encourages that the development team meet complete standards for all surrounding public areas, including for East York Street, where various scenarios proposed by the development team create inadequate conditions to either the walking zone or furnishing zone. The committee recommends that the development team meet recommended walking and furnishing zone widths by either minimizing encroachments from window wells and stoops or setting the building back from the property line.

For building design, the committee appreciates the quality of the material composition and overall design of the building. The development team is encouraged to match the proposed fiber cement façade of the portion of the building to the northeast of the site to the architectural quality of the part with the brick facade.

For parking design, the committee encourages the development team to consider how loading will function for artist studios, where on-street loading could be needed. The development team is also encouraged to create a more convenient location for bicycle parking by moving the bicycle storage room closer to the lobby entrance or providing direct access from the street. The committee noted that parking lot access might not be necessary on both sides of the building, and that loading could be consolidated to also be accessed from the East Boston Street frontage.

For sustainable design, the committee supports the expansion of green roofs and encourages the development to follow-through and construct them. The committee appreciates the number of sustainable design building metrics being met and encourages the development team to meet additional metrics.

The committee echoes concerns from community groups about the oversupply of artist studio space in the area and encourages the development team to create a contingency plan or subsidizing the rents of the studios if the owner is unable to lease the spaces at market rate rents.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director



CC: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com Daniel K. Garofalo, Vice-Chair, Civic Design Review Committee, dkgarofalo@gmail.com Councilmember Maria Quiñones Sanchez, maria.g.sanchez@phila.gov Sloane Folks, Commercial/Zoning Services Liason, sloane.folks@phila.gov Eli Storch, LRK, Inc., estorch@lrk.com Jennifer Ilana Tintenfass, Royer Cooper Cohen Braunfeld, LLC, itintenfass@rccblaw.com Max Silverstein, Maestro Redevelopment Corporation, max@maestrodredev.com Jonathan Weiss, Equinox Management & Construction, LLC, jweiss@equinoxmc.com Jessica Hoffman, New Kensington Community Development Corp, jhoffman@nkcdc.org Madison Gould, East Kensington Neighbors Association, info@ekna.org Greg Waldman, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, gregory.waldman@phila.gov Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, cheli.dahal@phila.gov Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Tavis Dockwiller, RLA Clarissa Kelsey, RA Elise Vider

May 6, 2021

Srivatsa Krishnan Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 3800 Powelton Avenue (Application No. ZP-2020- 985227)

Dear Srivatsa Krishnan,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **3800 Powelton Avenue**.

This proposal is to build an eight-story parking garage that is 493,039 square feet total. The garage includes 6,460 square feet of ground floor commercial, 1,439 vehicular parking spaces, and 112 bicycle parking spaces. The site is bound by Powelton Avenue to the north, 38th Street to the east, Filbert Street to the south and Sloan Street to the west. The parcel is zoned CMX-4 and there is a referral for a special exception for above-ground accessory parking.

At its meeting of May 4, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process. The coordinating RCO representative was not in attendance but several affected RCOs made supportive comments during the public comment period.

1. CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee offered the following comments, which include Planning Commission staff observations adopted by the CDR committee.

The committee encouraged the development team to set new standards for sustainable design, as they already are leaders in building design. The committee urged the project team to look at ways of reducing traffic traveling between the campus and the surrounding streets. They also noted that there was an opportunity to install solar panels on the parking garage roof. The development team is encouraged to meet more of the sustainable design building metrics.

For site design, the committee noted that there is an opportunity to make the southern plaza into a healthy, outdoor living room with increased amenities. The committee urged the development team to add a landscape architect to their team to assist them. Additionally, the committee commented that the interior pathway that leads to the central campus should feel like a complete, safe

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St. 13th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone 215-683-4630 Facsimile



pedestrian walkway, which includes having a crosswalk to connect to the pedestrian plaza.

For building design, the committee supports the use of the laser cut façade and asks the development team to consider applying that treatment to the entire building. The committee also noted that the laser cut lacey façade would lend itself to working well with some special lighting effects.

Lastly, the committee and staff noted several inconsistencies within the development team's plans. The most recent plans that they submitted to PCPC on April 30, 2021, have inconsistencies in the number and location of bike parking spaces, as well as discrepancies for their northern plaza along Powelton Avenue, including an ADA ramp, the depth of the plaza, and the amount of paving versus planters. The committee recommended that the development team work to address these inconsistencies as they continue discussions with the community.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

ona

Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director

CC: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com Daniel K. Garofalo, Vice-Chair, Civic Design Review Committee, dkgarofalo@gmail.com Councilmember Jamie Gauthier, Council District 3, jamie.gauthier@phila.gov Andrew Goodman, Council District 3, Andrew.Goodman@phila.gov Stephen Dimambro, Penn Medicine, stephen.dimambro@pennmedicine.upenn.edu Ronald Patterson, Klehr Harrison, RPatterson@klehr.com Craig E. Bryson, Pennoni, CBryson@Pennoni.com HuYoung Kim, THA Consulting, hkim@tha-consulting.com Steve Sebelski, Powelton Village Civic Association, president@poweltonvillage.org Bernadette Ingrid Wyche, 24th Democratic Ward, biwyche1@gmail.com Pam Andrews, West Powelton Saunders Park RCO, andrewsp0719@gmail.com Netrisa Dockery, Parkside Area Community Association, netrisat@yahoo.com Gary Jonas, Drexel Area Property Association, dapaboard@gmail.com James Wright, People's Emergency Center Community Development Corporation, jameswright@pec-cares.org Ang Sun, Ph.D., West Philly United Neighbors, woshiang@gmail.com Srivatsa Krishnan, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, srivatsa.krishnan@phila.gov Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov



Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, <u>idougherty@septa.org</u> Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, <u>paula.brumbelow@phila.gov</u> Nicole Ozdemir, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, <u>nicole.ozdemir@phila.gov</u>



Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Tavis Dockwiller, RLA Clarissa Kelsey, RA Elise Vider

May 4, 2021

Shakir Cohen Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 4401 Ridge Avenue (Application No. ZP-2020-009878)

Dear Shakir Cohen,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **4401 Ridge Avenue**.

This proposal is for approximately 178,837 square feet of new construction comprised of 185 multi-family units, 4,400 square feet of commercial spaces, 186 vehicular parking spaces, and 62 bicycle parking spaces. The site is bound by Ridge Avenue to the south, Merrick Road to the east and private parcels to the north and west. The parcel is zoned CMX-3 and there are refusals for loading and for steep slopes.

At its meeting of May 4, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. East Falls Community Council RCO:

A representative from the RCO offered the following comments:

The RCO notes the length of tenure of the many long-term residents within their organization and their experience with what works in their neighborhood. East Falls relies on their social street life to make the community thrive. This includes porches, lots of contact on the street and larger dwelling units or houses. They have a concern that the small size of the units and their removal from the street does not support or work with this neighborhood pattern.

The RCO has concerns with how the project engages Ridge Avenue and adjacent properties. The building should be built closer to or on Ridge Avenue and away from the single-family housing adjacent to the north or across Merrick Road. The building should enliven Ridge Avenue along its full length and should be pulled away from the single-family housing, because it is out of scale with the character and form of those homes. They also question the addition of 200 cars or parking spaces on this stretch of Ridge Avenue and how that could impact the quality of life and local traffic.

One Parkway Building 1515 Arch St. 13th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone 215-683-4630 Facsimile



The RCO supports more changes in building design to bring it more into scale with the neighborhood and to achieve a more sustainable design. These include more diversification of the building materials as the current scheme is monolithic and overwhelming. The RCO asks if the building mass could be more broken up into more discreet volumes. The community also has concerns with flooding and supports the recent changes that add green roof area and permeable paving. However, they have concerns that these recent additions could be removed from the project because of construction costs.

The RCO supports the amount of community engagement and the number of meetings that the development team attended, but notes that few changes have come out of those efforts. They also note that none of the substantive changes they requested have been made.

2. CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee offered the following comments, which include Planning Commission staff observations adopted by the CDR committee.

For sustainable design the committee supports the expansion of green roofs and encourages the development follow-through and implement them in construction. The committee also supports the use of permeable paving in the parking area and encourages the development team to expand the area of its use. The committee also encourages better screening of the surface parking areas until the vegetation is established. The development team is also encouraged to meet more of the sustainable design building metrics.

For building design, the committee supports the expansion of glazing on the ground floor along Ridge Avenue and on the lower levels facing Merrick Road. The committee echoes the concerns of the RCO about the scale of the building as it relates to the surrounding neighborhood. There is also support for the lighter building palette which can reduce heat island effects.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com Daniel K. Garofalo, Vice-Chair, Civic Design Review Committee, dkgarofalo@gmail.com



Councilmember Curtis Jones, curtis.jones@phila.gov Joshua Cohen, Chief of Staff for Councilmember Curtis Jones, Joshua.cohen@phila.gov Michael Brahler, Oombra Architects, mbrahler@oombra.com Sean Whalen, Attorney, sw@vintage-law.com Hilary Langer, East Falls Community Council, hilary.j.langer@gmail.com Steve Fillmore, East Fall Forward, fillmore.steve@gmail.com Ronald Bednar, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ronald.bednar@phila.gov Shakir Cohen, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, shakir.cohen@phila.gov Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov