



December 9, 2021

Yaniv Gal
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Clarissa Kelsey, RA

Re: Civic Design Review for 1106-14 Spring Garden Street (Application # ZP-2021-005586)

Dear Mr. Gal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 1106-14 Spring Garden Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

This proposal is to build a total of 74,587 square feet comprised of one five-story mixed-use building including 79 residential units, 5,509 square feet for commercial spaces, 5,208 square feet of amenity spaces, and 27 underground vehicular parking spaces. This proposal is by right, it is zoned CMX- 2.5, and is utilizing Mixed Income Housing and Green Roof bonuses.

At its meeting of December 7, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (Philadelphia Chinatown Development Corporation)

At the meeting, the RCO representative mentioned that they generally support the developments within the Callowhill neighborhood and particularly on this site which has been vacant for a long time. The representative also showed appreciation for the improved pedestrian experience, including the commercial ground floor. They also encouraged the development team to have conversations with the next-door property owner (Chosen 300) who has some concerns with the project.

RCO Comments: (Callowhill Neighborhood Association)

The representative from Callowhill Neighborhood Association mentioned that while they were disheartened about the demolition of the existing building, they appreciated the density, the inclusion of the public courtyard, the on-site affordable units, and the hidden parking. The RCO representative also commended the development team for the streetscape design, the high-quality materials, the inclusion of the green roof, and solar panels, believing that this project would be a great addition to the neighborhood.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



CDR Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee chair believed this proposal was a thoughtful project, and despite understanding the public's concerns with the use of the courtyard, he appreciated the inclusion of the courtyard. The concern was brought up by a next-door property owner about the potential for mistreatment of the homeless population that reside nearby and who would be able to use the courtyard since it is intended to be open to the public. The Committee chair believed that any concerns could be better addressed through partnerships and communication, and resolved through relationship-building, rather than by restricting access to the courtyard as it is intended to be a neighborhood amenity.

The Committee also appreciated the activation of the ground floor level, however agreed that the entrance to the public courtyard should be more significant. In response to the public comments about parking, one CDR committee member believed that it would always be challenging to find parking in a dense neighborhood like Callowhill, however this project had maintained a good balance between density and the number of parking spaces.

Lastly, the CDR Committee adopted the Planning Commission staff comments:

Site Design

- Staff notes the infeasibility of planting trees on the sidewalk, however, encourages the incorporation of larger planters on both Spring Garden and 11th Street to accommodate trees.
- Please continue coordination with Streets and OTIS for the Spring Garden Connector trail.
- Staff appreciates addition of residential lobby entrance on both Spring Garden Street courtyard and 11th Street.
- Staff suggests enclosing the bike parking storage.

Open Space Design

- Staff commends the development team for addition of the public courtyard in the design and supports its location facing south, however recommends a more welcoming and open entrance to the courtyard.
- Please continue coordination with Streets and OTIS for the Spring Garden Connector trail.
- Please ensure the hours of operation is long enough for the public use and the programming of the courtyard is diversified to ensure its activation.

Building Design

- Staff appreciates the commercial ground floor and addition of upper-floor terraces which help activate the Spring Garden and 11th Street frontages.
- Staff suggests reworking the window sizing, patterns, and overall character of the proposed building façade to better align with the existing building facade to maintain and respect the character of the historic building that is being removed as part of this



- development and to accentuate the commercial ground floor as well as the open space entrance.
- Staff supports use of lighter color material for the upper floors and the perforated porcelain panels but would prefer to see a higher quality material than stucco.
 - Staff notes affordable units on site. The units will be reviewed by PCPC to ensure comparable quality with market rate units.

Parking Design

- Staff appreciates locating all the parking spaces underground and supports the parking entrance on 11th Street.

Sustainable Design

- This proposal meets several sustainable metrics, staff encourages the team to pursue third party certification.
- Staff appreciates addition of green roof and solar panels as an investment in on-site renewable energy.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Mark Squilla, Mark.squilla@phila.gov
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov
Jennifer Slavic, Constituent Services Representative, jennifer.slavic@phila.gov
Stephen Varenhorst, Varenhorst Architects, dan@varenhorst.com
Eileen Quigley, Ballard Spahr, quigleye@ballardspahr.com
Sarah McEneaney, Callowhill Neighborhood Association, sarahmceneaney@me.com
Mahn S. Park, Community Organization: Asian American Federation of the US, mahnpark@gmail.com
Ian Clark, 5th Ward Republican, ianclark93@gmail.com
Yue Wu, Philadelphia Chinatown Development Corporation, ywu@chinatown-pcdc.org
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov
Yaniv Gal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, yaniv.gal@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov





December 8, 2021

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Clarissa Kelsey, RA

Re: Civic Design Review for 1300 N Howard Street (Application #ZP-2021-005394)

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 1300 N Howard Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes to reuse a single-story vacant warehouse/storage facility and add three stories. The proposed multi-family residential building will total 129,568 square feet. The proposal includes a single commercial space totaling 7,324 square feet and 112 residential dwelling units on floors 2-4. The proposal includes 47 parking spaces on the ground floor and 40 bicycle stalls. The parcel is zoned RSA-5 and thus has a number of zoning variances including use variances, loading, and parking variances and a height variance.

At its meeting of December 7, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments:

Neither RCO spoke to the project at the CDR meeting.

CDR Committee Comments

The CDR Committee noted broad approval for this project and provided the following comments.

The Committee commended the design team for the well-designed and thoughtful project. The Committee noted the richness of the design, and an appreciation for the materials selected. The Committee also applauded the reuse of existing warehouse and storage building on site, specifically calling out that the reuse of the cornice and brick material details which will send a signal that this architect and developer value the historic fabric of the neighborhood.

The Committee did provide some recommendations for improvements, specifically for the development team to find additional opportunities to the activate the ground floor. The Committee appreciated the new punched openings, windows, and doors which will activate the ground floor commercial

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



space, but suggested looking at additional ways to improve the existing blank facades of the warehouse building. The CDR Committee noted that the size and continuity of retail space fronting on three streets was beneficial.

The Committee suggested that the applicant include solar panels on the roof of the project, which are increasingly more affordable, especially for larger projects.

The CDR members noted that the proposed trees are undersized, in particular that Thompson and N Howard Streets could include large trees and tree pits as both streets have larger sidewalks and could increase tree coverage in the surrounding block.

Lastly the Committee agreed with PCPC staff comments and asked if the development team would consider using brick for the N Mascher Street elevation rather than the proposed metal panel, as metal panel was a lower quality material.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Darrell Clarke, 5th Council District, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Curtis Wilkerson, Director of Constituent Services – 5th District, curtis.wilkerson@phila.gov
Mary Jones, Legislative Counsel, 5th Council District, mary.jones@phila.gov
Hercules W. Grigos, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, hgrigos@klehr.com
Rustin Ohler, Harman Deutsch Ohler Architecture, rustin@hdoarch.com
Eric Quick, Harman Deutsch Ohler Architecture, eric@hdoarch.com
Marco Gorini, South Kensington Community Partners, rco@southkensingtoncommunity.org
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, David.Fecteau@phila.gov
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 13, 2021

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Clarissa Kelsey, RA

Re: Civic Design Review for 2202-14 E Allegheny Avenue (Application # ZP-2021-005331)

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 2202-14 E Allegheny Avenue.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

This proposal is to build a total of 306,135 square feet in two separate parcels. Parcel A includes one six-story mixed-use building including 189 residential units, 17,711 square feet for commercial spaces, and 85 vehicular parking spaces, whereas Parcel B includes 3 to 4-story townhome style buildings including 22,253 square feet of commercial spaces, 76 residential units, and 69 vehicular parking spaces. This proposal is by right, it is zoned IRMX and is utilizing a Green Roof bonus.

This project was asked to return following a first meeting on November 2, 2021. The development team updated the design documents based on the comments from the first meeting, including:

- The addition of more open spaces in parcel B with the removal of one townhome unit from the site.
- The addition of pedestrian crosswalks connecting the townhomes to the mixed-use buildings.
- The removal of two parking spaces and creating one public park along E Allegheny and Trenton Avenues.
- Conducting solar study and updating the plant list based on the results.
- The removal of the building stoops from the Witte Street sidewalk.
- Creating an open space along E Allegheny Avenue
- Reaching out to the Office of Transportation, Infrastructure, and Sustainability to confirm the feasibility of a bike share station for this site.

At its meeting of December 7, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



CDR Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee appreciated the positive changes that had been made based on the comments by staff and the Committee at the first CDR hearing on November 2, 2021, and adopted the Planning Commission staff comments:

Site Design

- Staff appreciates addition of open spaces and through-block connections for pedestrian, however there is still opportunity to create larger public open spaces for community use.
- Staff encourages the team to redesign the “Allegheny Neighborhood Park”, extending it to E Allegheny Avenue for better access and use.
- Staff appreciates removing the stoops from Witte Street sidewalk to ensure the sidewalk width is consistent, however the furnishing zone is still undersized.

Building Design

There were no updates to the building’s massing or materials, so all previous comments stand.

- Staff suggests breaking up the massing and utilizing a more vibrant material palette.
- Please reconfigure the atrium space for improved functionality.

Sustainable Design

- Staff encourages the team to revisit the sustainable design metrics.
- Staff suggests using noise cancelling and air quality mitigation strategies for the spaces next to the railroad tracks.
- Staff appreciates reaching out to OTIS to confirm the feasibility of a bike share station.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee’s action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Mark Squilla, Mark.squilla@phila.gov
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov
Jennifer Slavic, Constituent Services Representative, jennifer.slavic@phila.gov
Angelina Jockovich, VBC Studio, ajockovich@vbc.co
Sean Whalen, Vintage Law, sw@vintage-law.com
Rolando Sanchez, Impact Community Development Corporation,



Department of Planning and Development

Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

rsanchez@impactservices.org
Shannon Farrell, Harrowgate Civic Association,
harrowgatecivicassociation@gmail.com
Ken Paul, Port Richmond On Patrol & Civic Association,
propac19134@gmail.com
John Kalicki, South Port Richmond Civic Association, johnk@sopocivic.org
Jessica Hoffman, New Kensington Community Development Corp,
nwesterman@nkcfdc.org
Gregory Waldman, Philadelphia City Planning Commission,
Gregory.waldman@phila.gov
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections,
paulose.issac@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 8, 2021

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Clarissa Kelsey, RA

Re: Civic Design Review for 3114 Grays Ferry Avenue (Application ZP-2021-005303)

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed self-storage facility at 3114 Grays Ferry Avenue.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a five story self-storage facility totaling 141,391 square feet. The proposal includes nine surface parking spaces and four off-street loading spaces. The project sits between Grays Ferry Avenue to the north, Wharton Street to the South, S Patton Street to the west, and S Napa Street to the east. The project has one variance, 71 parking spaces are required, and only 9 are proposed. This parcel is zoned ICMX.

At its meeting of December 7, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (Note RCO)

No RCO spoke to the project at the CDR meeting.

CDR Committee Comments

Because of the proposed use and location of this project, there were very few Committee comments. The CDR Committee did note that storage facility projects do not typically contribute to public realm or create a community resource, and suggested finding ways to better integrate the building with the surrounding neighborhood and block. One Committee member asked the development team if any type of community amenity could be added to the proposal, for example solar panels, a dog park, or Amazon drop box (pick up) location. The Committee member requested that the project try to find ways to accommodate other neighborhood uses and become an asset to the community beyond its main function as a storage facility.

The Committee also noted that while PWD guidelines are being met, the development team is encouraged to include a green roof for the site, which would help alleviate the pressures of the City's Combined Sewer system. Managing stormwater on site would be a huge benefit to this project and the City's existing infrastructure.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



Finally, it was requested to include PCPC staff comments, staff encouraged the applicant locate active uses along Grays Ferry Avenue and suggested setting the building back on the side streets to incorporate additional street trees along S Napa and S Patton Streets. Incorporating additional street trees would help soften the site and provide texture to an otherwise blank and monotonous façades. PCPC staff noted the deadening impact of the proposed building and asked the applicant to consider additional ways to further activate the ground floor of the building. It was also recommended to improve the quality of the materials and to include other architectural elements to activate the building and reduce the scale to better fit into the neighborhood context.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Kenyatta Johnson, 2nd Council District, Kenyatta.Johnson@phila.gov
Franz Pierre, Legislative Assistant – 2nd Council District, Frantz.Pierre@phila.gov
Carrie B. Nase-Poust, Fox Rothschild LLP, CNase-Poust@FoxRothschild.com
Charles Reeves, Tasker-Morris Neighbors Association, creeves.RAC2@gmail.com
Rodney Ray, Philly Thrive (SWPDC), phillythrive@gmail.com
Carmine Zulli, Grays Ferry Community Council, carmineZulli@gmail.com
Jonathan Goins, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Jonathan.goins@phila.gov
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, Paulose.Issac@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 13, 2021

Richard Chen
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Clarissa Kelsey, RA

Re: Civic Design Review for 4301-29 Chestnut Street (Application # ZP-2021-005691)

Dear Mr. Chen,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 4301-29 Chestnut Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a seven-story mixed-use building totaling 223,665 square feet including 30,300 square feet of ground floor retail space, 11,173 square feet of amenity space, 275 residential units (147,562 square feet, 2nd - 7th floors), 75 below grade parking spaces, and 99 Class 1A bicycle parking spaces. The majority of the building is proposed to be constructed through off-site fabrication allowing for less material waste and additional energy efficiency. The building includes a 21,070 square foot green roof. The site is zoned CMX-4 and does not require any zoning variances.

This proposal was first heard at the October 5, 2021 CDR meeting. At this meeting, the committee voted for the proposal to return after making changes to the design. At its meeting of December 7, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: Spruce Hill Community Association

The representative from the Spruce Hill Community Association reiterated their support for the amount of retail space and subsurface parking included in the project design. In addition, they expressed appreciation for the revisions made to the building's facades between CDR meetings. However, they questioned the use of wood paneling on the building's facades.

RCO Comments: West Philly Plan and Preserve

The representative from West Philly Plan and Preserve expressed their opinion that although the changes made between CDR meetings represent an improvement, design was not a serious consideration in the development of this large building. In addition, West Philly Plan and Preserve feels that projects with units intended primarily for students and leased at prices beyond the means of many of the neighborhood's existing residents are adversely impacting the quality of life and affordability of the neighborhood.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



CDR Committee Comments

The committee focused mostly on building design at both CDR meetings. Members of the CDR Committee felt that the decision to limit the building to mostly studios and junior one-bedroom units limited the potential richness of the façade design and requested that the development team use modular building components to create larger units with bedrooms that have windows. No changes were made to the unit mix of the building.

In response to comments made by the CDR Committee at the October 5, 2021 meeting, changes were made to the facade design to add depth and shadow, decrease the number of materials, and increase the glazing to the first-floor retail spaces.

Pertaining to site design, the members of the CDR Committee commended the project's massing and disposition of programmatic elements. However, they see the proposed Chestnut Street setback as a missed opportunity to create an amenity space.

Lastly, the committee asked the design team to prioritize environmental performance and to push the boundaries of energy efficiency for modular construction projects.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Jamie Gauthier, Jamie.Gauthier@phila.gov
Andrew Goodman, Dir. of Equitable Development, Andrew.Goodman@phila.gov
Mark Cartella, Alterra Property Group, mark.cartella@alterraproperty.com
Kyle Shallow, Bohler Engineering, kshallow@bohlereng.com
Jonathan Broh, JKRP Architects, jbroh@jkrparchitects.com
Adam Laver, BlankRome, laver@blankrome.com
Gary Jonas, Drexel Area Property Association, dapaboard@gmail.com
Kyle Sampson, West Phila. Economic Development Council, publicpolicy@gmx.com
Ang Sun, Ph.D., West Philly United Neighbors, woshiang@gmail.com
J. Matthew Wolfe, 27th Republican Ward, Matthew@Wolfe.org
Barry Grossbach, Spruce Hill Community Association, b.grossbach@gmail.com
Mary McGettigan, West Philly Plan + Preserve, westphillyplanpreserve@gmail.com
Netrisa Dockery, Parkside Area Community Association, netrisat@yahoo.com
Nicole Ozdemir, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Nicole.Ozdemir@phila.gov



Department of Planning and Development

Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Ian.Litwin@phila.gov
Richard Chen, Department of Licenses and Inspections, Richard.Chen@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 15, 2021

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Clarissa Kelsey, RA

Re: Civic Design Review for 4519 Chestnut Street (Application # ZP-2021-006228C)

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 4519 Chestnut Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a multi-family residential building totaling 223,848 square feet of gross square feet. This proposal includes 327 dwelling units, and 154 car parking spaces. The parcel is zoned CMX-4, Center City Commercial Mixed Use and is a by-right project.

At its meeting of December 7, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: Spruce Hill Civic Association & West Philly Plan and Preserve

The West Philly Plan and Preserve RCO representative commented that the percentage of the project site that is dedicated to parking rather than open space is out of proportion. The representative noted that they would not want to see the public open space be gated. They did commend the project team on the building design, as well as the provision of affordable housing units, but noted they would like to see more of those units provided.

The Spruce Hill Civic Association representative also noted their concerns about the focus on providing a surface parking lot over a harmonious experience for the public. The representative did appreciate the addition of a retail space, noting that commercial uses are critical for the area. The RCO representative discussed that there will be many new units coming into the neighborhood and commended the project team for using better materials and its design relationship to the existing school building.

CDR Committee Comments

The CDR Committee agreed with RCO comments on the building design and materials, noting that the project feels like an asset and works well with the existing school building. Members of the committee also commented that the more the development team can promote retail, the stronger the project will be. The committee

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



urged the project team to explore other uses that have public interfaces and uses that would encourage activity into the evening as well.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Antonio Fiol-Silva, Sitio Architecture + Urbanism, afs@sitioau.com
David Gest, Ballard Spahr, gestd@ballardspahr.com
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 15, 2021

Cheli Dahal
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Clarissa Kelsey, RA

Re: Civic Design Review for 5000 Warrington Avenue (Application # ZP-2021-07200)

Dear Ms. Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential development at 5000 Warrington Avenue.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes two residential buildings totaling 131,016 square feet of gross square feet. This proposal includes 104 dwelling units, and 99 car parking spaces. The parcel is zoned I-2, Medium Industrial and will require three variances: Seven loading spaces are required but the project is providing two, 10% of parking space area must be dedicated to interior landscaping but the project is providing 5%, and multifamily use is prohibited in an I-2 district.

At its meeting of December 7, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO & Council Comments: 51st Ward Democratic RCO Committee & Councilmember Gauthier

The 51st Ward Democratic RCO Committee representative commended the project team for having met with the community almost a dozen times and adjusting the project based on community feedback. The RCO representative also noted that there are a number of other affected RCOs involved and that they all will continue to meet and work on this project with the development team.

Councilmember Gauthier's office representative stated that the councilmember views this site and project as having potential to be transformative. The CM representative noted that many neighborhoods need more affordable housing and expressed how unusual this project is in providing so many below market rate units, particularly in an area that has access to amenities. They asked that the committee conclude the process for this project so that it could move forward in the development process in order to apply for grant funding.

CDR Committee Comments

The committee mainly focused on site design during the meeting. Members of the CDR Committee had concerns about the setback buildings being fronted by the

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



surface parking lot. The committee acknowledged that the project has been through several iterations but questioned the placement of affordable housing units next to active train tracks so far back from the street. Members also voiced concerns about both residential and public access to the playground being difficult and felt that children will end up playing in the parking lot. The committee suggested incorporating a grand stair to welcome the community, instead of the current access configuration which they noted feels tacked on.

The CDR Committee encouraged the project team to find a way to meet the landscaping requirements and increase the amount of open space. Committee members noted the existing large, beautiful street trees and implored the project team to keep as many of them as possible and to make the project as green as possible.

Lastly, Committee members suggested that since there are three proposed curb cuts on Warrington Avenue, the project team should change the two curb cuts for the parking lot to each being one-way in order to cut down on potential conflicts and confusion.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Peter Kelsen, Blank Rome, Kelsen@BlankRome.com
Polina Bakhteiarov, Omni America LLC, PBakhteiarov@onyllc.com
Jason Wistreich, JKRP Architects, jwistreich@jkrparchitects.com
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 7, 2021

Cheli Dahal
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Clarissa Kelsey, RA

Re: Civic Design Review for 7619-25 Germantown Avenue (Application # ZP-2021-007451)

Dear Cheli,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 7619-25 Germantown Avenue.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

This proposal is to build 124,057 square feet consisting of 114 dwelling units and supported by 38 parking spaces in a garage. The site is bound by Germantown Avenue to the west, an alignment for Westbrook Lane and a former rail to the north, and private parcels to the east and south. There are steep slopes towards the northern and eastern boundaries of the site. The site is zoned CMX-2 and the applicant is applying for bonuses for a Green Roof and Mixed Income Housing. Licenses and Inspections has not issued any refusals for this scheme. The proposal will be subject to façade review under the terms of the Germantown Neighborhood Commercial Area (NCA) when there is a building permit application.

At its meeting of December 7, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

(1) RCO Comments – Mt. Airy Business Improvement District

The representative of the RCO noted that there were about 125 participants at the RCO meeting of September 30, 2021. Comments from the meeting included concerns related to parking, traffic, traffic congestion, and pedestrian safety.

(2) City Council Representative Comments

Charles Richardson was in attendance for the 8th Council District. Council's office noted that it was a great looking building, but it was too large and had too many units. They also noted concerns with access to public transit for such a large number of units. It was unrealistic to rely on the 23 bus for service. The lot was effectively "landlocked" -- most shopping and services were too far away to walk to and many residents would rely on cars for daily activities.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



Council offices also recognized community concerns with regard to the curves on Germantown Avenue. They created dangerous situations for pedestrians and drivers who would try to make illegal left turns into Woodbrook Lane. Council offices also endorsed community requests for the building's design to complement the significant presence of Wissahickon Schist throughout the neighborhood.

(3) CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee offered the following comments, which include Planning Commission staff observations adopted by the CDR Committee.

This is a well-designed project. It is rich in its composition and is a well thought out, beautiful design. The ground floor has engaging spaces for people and the committee supports the public access into the courtyard. The materials are good quality, used appropriately, and have good architectural details. Façade design positives also include the high amounts of transparency at the ground floor, the use of balconies facing Germantown Avenue, and the use of full brick and cast stone. The design team should maintain this level of material quality and details, which will also be the subject of a Planning Commission staff review when the project returns to apply for building permits.

The committee also affirmed comments from the public at large. These include the possible need for more parking, and that the public spaces might need to increase to have a better relationship to the street – the building could be set back to allow for more open space and the applicant should consider bollards for pedestrian safety. The design team could also consider planters along the curb line, because underground utilities appear to limit street trees, and the applicant should resolve conflicts between trolley poles and ADA ramps. Additionally, the applicant should adjust grades to ensure that cross-slopes between Germantown Avenue sidewalks and the lower plaza do not exceed ADA requirements. They also encouraged more work on the stormwater concerns raised by the community, though they were commended for managing Westbrook Lane stormwater on-site.

The applicant should consider stronger connections to public transit and trail development which will strengthen the project in the long term. This would include using appropriate paving surfaces and creating walking zones on Westbrook Lane for a clear connection to the trail being developed on the former rail line to the north. The committee also supported the applicant's provision of on-site affordable units to comply with the mixed income housing bonus.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director



cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
City Councilmember Cindy Bass, Cindy.bass@phila.gov
Charles Richardson, Director of Constituent Services,
Charles.richardson@phila.gov
Ron Patterson, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg, rpatterson@klehr.com
Dariya Medynska, M Architects, dariya@morrissey-design.com
Zamir Garcia, M Architects, zamir@morrissey-design.com
Janis Risch, Mt Airy Business Improvement District, janis@mtairybid.com
Natalia Serejko, East Mt. Airy Neighbors, info@eastmountairy.org
Ian Hegarty, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.hegarty@phila.gov
Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, Cheli.dahal@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov