



The Philadelphia Art
Commission
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

Carmen Febo San Miguel
Deborah Cahill
José Almiñana
Mario Zacharjasz
Matthew Kenyatta
Pepón Osorio
Raed Nasser
Sarah McEneaney

C. Beige Berryman
Staff

Minutes

The Philadelphia Art Commission

April 12, 2023 - 9:30 a.m.

Remote – Zoom Meeting – Hosted by DPZ

Members Present: José Almiñana, Deborah Cahill, Carmen Febo San Miguel, Matthew Kenyatta, Raed Nasser, Sarah McEneaney, Pepón Osorio, Mario Zacharjasz, and Robert Roesch

Meeting of the Philadelphia Art Commission

Beige Berryman – staff member of the Art Commission – introduced the Zoom platform and virtual meeting process, noting that the meeting is being recorded and those participating in the meeting are giving their consent to be recorded. A link to the recording, will be posted on the Art Commission website and the meeting agenda and materials can also be found on the website at:

(<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/>).

*Ms. Berryman polled the commission via roll call announcing a quorum, then stated a few instructions for the public. Members of the public may comment on agenda items during the meeting. When the agenda item that you are interested in is being discussed, you can use the “raise hand” feature and staff will unmute you during the public comment period. If you’re joining by phone, you can also use the hand raise feature by dialing *9 during the public comment period, and if you have any submitted comments through email, staff will read those emails out loud at the appropriate time. Thank you.*

Chair Roesch called the meeting to order at the mark (00:02:17).

Minutes

- February 8, 2023, meeting minutes
- March 8, 2023, meeting minutes

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to approve the February and March minutes (00:02:49).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Osorio and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, the vote carried with all in favor to approve the meeting minutes.

Report of the Sign and Streetery Committee – March 29, 2023

Sign Applications

First Reviews:

1. **54-23**
Penn Medicine
1-4 Convention Avenue
2. **53-23**
Miller Theater
250 S Broad Street
3. **55-23**
Unsettled
Ellen Phillips Samuel Memorial temporary art installation, Kelly Drive
4. **51-23**
Faherty
1600 Walnut Street
5. **52-23**
Alo
1608 Walnut Street
6. **56-23**
Insomnia Cookies
1 S Broad Street

Second Review:

1. **216-22**
Temple University Center City Campus
1515 Market Street

Streetery Structure Applications

First Reviews:

1. **57-23**
Source Urban Brewery
1101 Frankford Avenue
2. **58-23**
Bob & Barbara's Lounge
1507-09 South Street
3. **59-23**
Lucha Cartel
207 Chestnut Street

4. **60-23**
Loco Pez
2401 E Norris Street
5. **61-23**
Loco Pez
4631 Baltimore Avenue
6. **62-23**
Loco Pez
700 S 20th Street

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to approve the recommendations of the Sign and Streetery Committee from March 29, 2023 (00:03:26).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch.

The Commission voted unanimously to approve the recommendations of the Sign and Streetery Committee from March 29, 2023 (8-0).

Administrative Agenda

1. **70-23**
Annual Sculpture Conservation
Various locations, 29 sculptures
Review Type: Public art maintenance
Project Details: General cleaning and maintenance treatments
Applicant: Association for Public Art

Ms. Berryman presented six administrative items beginning with the annual sculpture conservation (00:04:22). The Association of Public Art is currently preparing for the 2023 ongoing Annual Conservation Program of outdoor sculptures in Philadelphia. This year the City-related program involves 29 sculptures. The work is planned to start the first week of June.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (00:05:01).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. Motion carried unanimously to approve the Annual Sculpture Conservation of 29 sculptures (9-0).

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4674 Telephone

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)

2. 71-23

Morris Estate Recreation Center

1610 W. Chelton Avenue

Review Type: Minor construction on City property

Project Details: Exterior routine maintenance

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

This project covers the exterior rehabilitation of the Morris Estate Recreation Center through replacement in kind of existing roofing, exterior wood trim, and many of the existing wood dormers. The project also includes reconstruction of the structural elements at the attached garage, and the restoration of selected interior finishes that have been damaged by water infiltration.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (00:06:25).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Kenyatta, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch.

Motion carried unanimously to approve the Morris Estate Recreation Center renovations (9-0).

3. 72-23

Mt. Airy Recreation Center

7001 Germantown Avenue

Review Type: Minor construction on City property

Project Details: Porch reconstruction

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

This project covers the reconstruction of the front canopy at the Mt. Airy Recreation Center through replacement in kind of existing structural and finish elements. Staff has confirmed that access to the building will be maintained during construction.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (00:07:33).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Osorio and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch.

Motion carried unanimously to approve the Mt. Airy Recreation Center (9-0).

4. 73-23

Benjamin Franklin Elementary School

5735 Rising Sun Avenue

Review Type: Minor construction on City property

Project Details: Exterior window replacement

Applicant: Philadelphia School District

New window louvers and new chiller will be installed in the oldest, original portion of the school. The roof mounted chiller will be set back from the edges of the roof to reduce visibility. New louvers will be installed in existing window openings, replacing existing upper and/or lower window sashes and will match the existing color. The existing stone and architecture terra cotta window moldings will not be removed or altered.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (00:09:00).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch.

Motion carried unanimously to approve the Administrative Item Benjamin Franklin Elementary School (9-0).

5. 74-23

Bus Shelter Upgrades

Various locations

Review Type: Encroachment in the public right-of-way

Project Details: Six new bus shelter installations

Applicant: Office of Transportation, Infrastructure & Sustainability

This proposal is for six new bus shelters at various locations around the city. All new locations are proposing new shelters where currently no shelter exists. Staff have reviewed the location of each in terms of Complete Street standards. While the recommended Complete Street walking zone dimensions cannot be met at all locations, staff recommends approval as the shelters offer improved conditions.

Chair Roesch clarified that the bus shelter upgrades were the same designs that were previously approved before and therefore the Commission was familiar with the project.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (00:10:38).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch.

Motion carried unanimously to approve the Bus Shelter Upgrades (9-0).

6. 4-22

**Kingsessing Recreation Center
4901 Kingsessing Avenue**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property
Project Details: Minor revisions to exterior utility enclosure
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

This proposal was previously approved in December 2022, however, the project team made changes to exterior mechanical units, which resulted in enclosures at the rear of the building that are larger than previously presented. The closures are adjacent to building service areas and exterior secondary access stairs, and are screened.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (00:12:13).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Zacharjasz, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch.

Motion carried unanimously to approve the Kingsessing Recreation Center revisions (9-0).

Presentations for Final Review

1. 22-21

**Philadelphia Peace Plaza, a.k.a. Statue of Peace
805 S Front Street**

Review Type: Public art proposal
Project Details: Statue and associated plaza to commemorate the history of Comfort Women
Applicant: Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy
Presenter: Philadelphia Peace Plaza Committee

This presentation began at the minute mark (00:13:17). Marguerite Anglin, Public Art Director, spoke about the return to the Art Commission for final review of the plaque inscription text for the Philadelphia Peace Plaza, also known as the Statue of Peace. Ms. Anglin provided the previous dates when the project was reviewed. She was followed by Shinjoo Cho, representative of the Philadelphia Peace Plaza Committee, who described the plaque location, text revisions, and available language translations.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4674 Telephone

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)

Public comment began with Edward Mazurek, civil rights attorney representing the Japanese Association for Greater Philadelphia, who advocated for the review to be postponed and thought that the revised text was not universal enough in content.

Questions and comments from the public (00:39:55 – 00:52:58).

The public comments continued and included a mix of opposition and support of the project. Comments were given by the following individuals: Tammy Hertzbach (opposition), Ren Egawa (opposition), Sung Sohn (support), Takeshi Furumoto (opposition), Alejandra (support), Norman Oh (support), and HoJun Yu (support).

At the minute mark (00:53:10), Ms. Anglin addressed Mr. Mazurek comments.

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:00:58).

Commissioner Nasser mentioned that the revisions were not what he was expecting, as he thought that the plaque language would be more global and positive, while Commissioner Osorio disagreed and was supportive of the revisions. Regarding the text, Commissioner Kenyatta commented that specificity is needed in order to reach justice. Commissioner Osorio added that the sculpture is being proposed because someone spoke up, and agreed on the importance of recognizing who was brave enough to speak.

Discussion continued about additional text revisions. Suggestions were made to add the years that the Japanese Imperial Army existed for clarity. The word “ongoing” was also suggested to help clarify the third paragraph. Finally, the commissioners agreed that a QR Code was the best method for directing visitors to translations. General support was then reached for the qualifying language suggestions.

Ms. Cho agreed to the suggested revisions around the minute mark (01:22:15) and clarified that her understanding of the suggested revisions matched what the Commission requested.

The Commission discussed and agreed that the final additions to text get reviewed administratively.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (01:31:47).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Cahill for approval with administrative review of the agreed upon revisions, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch.

Motion carried unanimously for approval with administrative review of the text (9-0).

2. 42-21

Island Ave Trolley Station Reconstruction

Island Ave at Lindbergh Boulevard and Tanager Street

Review Type: Construction within the public right-of-way

Project Details: Trolley station demolition and reconstruction

Applicant: SEPTA

Presenter: SEPTA

Emily Silver began the presentation at the minute mark (01:34:09). Ms. Silver presented the changes, studies, and rendering requested by the Commission during the concept approval in March 2021. The shelter length was increased, the pedestrian amenities were upgraded, and details on the fence style, lighting, and traffic attenuators were given.

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:42:39).

Chair Roesch clarified that the fence was located on top of the crash barrier (01:42:07). Commissioner Almiñana asked about the light quality and color of new LED lights, he suggested warm colored lighting rather than cool.

Commissioner McEneaney inquired about the blue signs, which did not match the green branding of the station. Clarification was made that the new wayfinding branding would be applied to the station and the rendering was not accurate in terms of the signage.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (01:47:24).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Cahill and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. Motion carried unanimously for final approval (9-0).

3. 171-22

Francis J Myers Recreation Center

5801 Kingsessing Avenue

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Building and site improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: DIGSAU

Jules Dingle began the presentation at the minute mark (01:48:48). Mr. Dingle presented the requested details of the building, followed by Tom Mahone, who presented the developments of the landscape, play equipment, and plantings (01:51:03).

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:59:52).

Commissioner Almiñana inquired about removal and replacement numbers of the trees. Mr. Mahone clarified that there would be a removal of 12 trees, with a replacement of 102. The discussion continued through the minute mark (02:04:25).

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (02:04:35).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Almiñana and seconded by Commissioner Zacharjasz, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. Motion carried unanimously to approve (8-0).

4. 207-22

Johnny Sample Recreation Center 280 Cobbs Creek Parkway

Review Type: Construction project on City property
Project Details: Building and site improvements
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation
Presenter: Sitio Architecture and Urbanism

Tara Rasheed began the presentation at the minute mark (02:06:04). Ms. Rasheed and her team are hoping to improve visibility, access, and availability and access to the building. Ausra Mussett continued the presentation on engagement (02:07:24) followed by Todd Grant, who presented the existing conditions, site design, the civic spine, landscape, lighting, plant species, and wayfinding. Lastly Mark DiMonte presented the stormwater strategy (02:20:16).

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:24:36).

The Commission highly commended the project and all its components. Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (02:25:49).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Cahill and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. Motion carried unanimously for final approval (8-0).

Presentations for Concept Review

1. 78-23

Parkway Outpost Visitor Information and Pop-Up Shop 2600 Benjamin Franklin Parkway

Review Type: Construction located on City property and within Benjamin Franklin Parkway Area
Project Details: Modular structures located on apron of Philadelphia Museum of Art
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation
Presenter: Philadelphia Visitor Center Corporation

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4674 Telephone

www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/

Jennifer Nagle introduced the team: Robert Allen, Fletcher Daniel, Dennis Boylan, and Dan Bosin (02:26:55). She gave an overview of the purpose of the project to provide visitor amenities and clarified that the three shipping containers are already on site. The project is designed to be quickly removed from the site as needed for special events, and is temporary in nature.

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:42:35).

Commissioner Cahill asked about the barriers shown in the photos, suggesting a more thoughtful approach to crowd management is needed. It was clarified that the barriers will be removed. Commissioner Febo San Miguel observed that the aesthetics of the containers is in stark contrast with the Philadelphia Museum of Art context. Commissioner McEneaney asked how the proposal could accommodate the large crowds of visitors. Commissioner Roesch commented that the temporary aesthetics were problematic as it looked purely functional. He suggested changing the paint color to a warmer tone.

Public comments were heard. Dennis Boylan spoke in support of the proposal.

Commissioner Nasser suggested an alternative location, such as the Oval. Commissioner McEneaney asked for the graphics and signage to be reconsidered. Commissioner Osorio asked if the containers could look friendlier and then asked about hours of operation and capacity.

Commissioner Almiñana expressed concerns about the white finish being a canvas for graffiti, then suggested vinyl graphics for information purposes, and commented that security would be needed. Additionally, he hoped that the installation would be temporary and was disappointed that the project was not presented earlier in the design process to the Commission (02:57:17).

Based on suggestions from the Commission, Chair Roesch requested that the project return with clarification on the circulation path around the containers, a revised color scheme, and reconsideration of the graphics (02:59:14).

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (02:59:30).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Cahill and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chair Roesch. Motion carried for concept approval (6-1). Commissioner Nasser opposed.

2. 76-23

Christy Recreation Center 728 S 55th Street

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Building and site improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: SMP Architects

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4674 Telephone

www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/

Principal of SMP Architects, Todd Woodward began the presentation by going over the existing conditions and community engagement, followed by Julie Bush from Ground Reconsidered and Francesco Cerrai from Parks and Recreation (03:01:43). Ms. Bush presented the overall site plan (03:08:02). Front entrance circulation, landscape, basketball court, sprayground, and other equipment upgrades were described.

Chair Roesch inquired about the existing chain link fence, and the timing of Phase 1 and Phase 2 (03:13:05). Mr. Cerrai responded that it depended upon the fundraising for Phase 2 (03:15:31).

Questions and comments from the Commission (03:15:48).

Commissioner Cahill applauded the overall realignments made within the site. She had questions about the location of trees on the site plan and if adequate shading was provided. Chair Roesch asked about benches along the pedestrian promenade and Commissioner McEneaney asked about lighting.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion and summarized the lighting and tree location concerns (03:21:40).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, and Chair Roesch. Motion carried unanimously for conceptual approval (5-0).

3. 77-23

Cecil B. Moore Recreation Center 2551 N 22nd Street

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Building and site improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Kelly Maiello Architects

Troy Leonard began the presentation at the minute mark (03:23:43). Mr. Leonard gave an overview of the building and site plan. Kristen Loughry presented the landscape design and clarified that the auditorium component is not yet funded (03:29:46).

Questions and comments from the Commission (03:43:55).

Chair Roesch asked for clarification on some of the ground surface materials.

Commissioner Cahill inquired about the caliber totals of the trees and heritage trees. She asked for more design details for the potential scenario of the auditorium not being built. Chair Roesch had questions about the lighting plan, to which Ms. Loughry responded that a lighting plan was not included at this time but they will be using the PPR standard light pole fixtures. Commissioner Febo San Miguel inquired about the shading on basketball courts.

Chair Roesch summarized the Commission requests, which included activating the lawn area if the auditorium is not built, include more shade on the basketball courts, and lighting plan (03:49:33). Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (03:50:48).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Cahill to approve for conceptual approval, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, and Chair Roesch. Motion carried unanimously for conceptual approval (5-0).

4. 75-23

West Penn Playground

351-355 W Penn Street

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Exterior site improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Mark Paronish began the presentation at the minute mark (03:51:39) and gave an overview of the playground design, equipment, sidewalk replacement, street tree planting, lights, safety cameras, and fencing.

Questions and comments from the Commission (03:59:20).

Commissioner Cahill inquired about age that the play equipment was designed for, as multiple ages is preferred. Commissioner Roesch inquired about the possibility of planting a tree inside the playground. Mr. Paronish responded that space was too limited.

The Commission then suggested giving the project final approval. Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (04:03:40).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, and Chair Roesch. Motion carried unanimously for final approval (5-0).

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to adjourn the April Art Commission meeting (04:04:07).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Cahill and seconded by the Commission, the motion carried.

This concluded the April 12, 2023, Philadelphia Art Commission meeting.

The next Art Commission meeting will be held Wednesday, May 10, 2023, at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom.