



Minutes

The Philadelphia Art Commission

November 9, 2022 - 9:30 a.m.

Remote – Zoom Meeting – Hosted by DPZ

The Philadelphia Art
Commission
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

José Almiñana
Deborah Cahill
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Matthew Kenyatta
Sarah McEneaney
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

C. Beige Berryman
Staff

Members Present: José Almiñana, Deborah Cahill, Carmen Febo San Miguel, Matthew Kenyatta, Raed Nasser, Sarah McEneaney, Pepón Osorio, Mario Zacharjasz, and Robert Roesch

Meeting of the Philadelphia Art Commission

Beige Berryman – staff member of the Art Commission – introduced the Zoom platform and remote Art Commission process, noting that the meeting is being recorded and those participating in the meeting are giving their consent to be recorded. A link to the recording, will be posted on the Art Commission website and the meeting agenda and materials can also be found on the website at: (<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/>).

*Ms. Berryman polled the commission via roll call announcing a quorum, then stated a few instructions for the public. Members of the public may comment on agenda items during the meeting. When the agenda item that you are interested in is being discussed, you can use the “raise hand” feature and staff will unmute you during the public comment period. If you’re joining by phone, you can also use the hand raise feature by dialing *9 during the public comment period, and if you have any submitted comments through email, staff will read those emails out loud at the appropriate time. Thank you.*

Chair Roesch called the meeting to order at the minute mark (00:02:09). He then announced that the Aviator Park Building Relocation proposal requested to be reinstated on the agenda.

Ms. Berryman asked for a motion to restore the agenda (00:03:27).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch.

The Commission voted unanimously to restore the Aviator Park Building Relocation project back to the agenda (8-0).

Minutes

- July 13, 2022 meeting minutes

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chair Roesch asked for a motion for approval.

Motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Zacharjasz.

Report of the Sign Committee – October 26, 2022

Second Review:

1. **182-22**
Buena Onda
114 S 20th Street

First Reviews:

1. **198-22**
4 Ever Young
1216-1218 Walnut Street
2. **199-22**
A Taste of Spain
2100-2106 Chestnut Street

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to approve the recommendations of the Sign Committee from October 26, 2022 (00:05:11).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Zacharjasz and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Sign Committee Report (8-0).

Administrative Agenda

1. **206-22**
Chestnut Hill Booster Pump Station Improvements
8301 Germantown Avenue
Review Type: Construction project located on City property
Project Details: Equipment upgrades and routine maintenance
Applicant: Philadelphia Water Department

Ms. Berryman presented one administrative item (00:06:16). The Chestnut Hill Pump Station Rehabilitation was constructed in about 1924. The Philadelphia Water Department, (PWD) will be making equipment upgrades and performing routine maintenance on the pump house, it is not on the local Philadelphia Register.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to approve the Chestnut Hill Booster Pump Station Improvements (00:07:26).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Chestnut Hill Booster Pump Station Improvements (8-0).

Presentations for Final Review

1. 137-22

Cobbs Creek Golf Course Improvements – Driving Range, Youth Education Center and associated site work 7400 Lansdowne Avenue

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Site and building construction and improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Blackney Hayes Architects

Kathryn Ott Lovell introduced the project and expressed support for the revitalization of the Cobbs Creek Golf Course (00:10:15). Jeff Shanahan followed by representatives from Langan presented and highlighted four areas: community engagement held, environmental impact and mitigation details, site improvements including detailed landscape plans, and the driving range features.

Questions and comments from the Commission (00:29:12).

Commissioner Nasser mentioned transportation, asking how visitors would arrive without a car. Commissioner Almiñana questioned the parking lot drawings and whether they will guide the construction and plantings. He also commended the team for their plans to revegetate the neighborhood with new tree plantings.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel was pleased with the adjustments, especially the environmental improvements, that had been made since the last Commission review. Chair Roesch and Commissioner McEneaney agreed.

Questions and comments from the public (00:41:12).

Quatina Littles spoke in support of the project.

Gina spoke in support of the project.

Eireann Young was concerned about its environmental impact.

Chris Pugliese expressed support of the project particularly for academic, athletic, and social development.

Blane Stoddard expressed overwhelming support for the project adding that it would be a community benefit.

Asmeret Easley spoke in support of the project.

Bethany Teigan commented on the lack of community outreach.

Kiasha Huling asked the Commission about plans for the trees.

Timothy Reimer asked the Commission to hold their vote until the applicants have the information that had been repeatedly asked for previously.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to approve (00:58:03).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner McEaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted for approval (7-2).

Commissioner Cahill and Commissioner Kenyatta abstained from this item.

2. 69-22

Cohocksink Recreation Center Improvements 2901 Cedar Street

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Site and building improvements

Applicant: Rebuild / Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Community Ventures

Aaron Rowlett began the presentation at the minute mark (01:00:33), additional presenters were Troy Hannigan and Brian Szymanik. Mechanical, ADA, and window upgrades were described. Site improvements and programming were reviewed, including sport fields, play areas, site furniture, and plantings. Equipment selection was part of the engagement process. Lighting and grading were addressed, as requested from the previous review.

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:10:54).

Commissioner Almiñana inquired about the fence and if there was overlapping outfield areas on the sports fields. Lisa McDonald spoke to the schedule management needed of the various areas. Commissioner Cahill commended the rethinking of the layout of the play areas.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to approve (01:15:42).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Cahill and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve (9-0).

Presentations for Concept Review

1. 207-22

Johnny Sample Recreation Center 280 Cobbs Creek Parkway

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Building and site improvements

Applicant: Rebuild/Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Sitio architecture and urbanism

Tara Rashid introduced the project followed by Luke Sinopoli, who began the presentation (01:17:02). Ausura Mussett spoke about the community outreach on the project (00:19:52). Plans for the Cobbs Creek Parkway improvements were mentioned. The grade change needed to visually “open up” the building was discussed.

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:29:29).

Commissioner Zacharjasz asked if the stone areas would be preserved. Also, he was concerned that the entrance was minimized in the new design, and it should be made more inviting and generous.

The presenters addressed inquiries from Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, and Commissioner Febo San Miguel about accessible parking spaces, signage, ADA access along the walkway, grading, adding perennial plants, and public transportation.

Commissioner Osorio wanted to know who currently uses the recreation center. Ausura Mussett spoke about the existing programs and ages of visitors (01:46:38). He also asked about any alternative recreation center locations while construction was on-going here.

Commissioner Cahill asked about the caliper of the tree replacement, as large caliper trees were being lost.

Questions and comments from the public (01:50:03).

Kathryn Ott Lovell answered the question about what facilities are nearby.

After commending the project design and stunning community outreach, Chair Roesch summarized the requests for the next review including the front entrance canopy, signage for the parking area, exterior lighting, grading plan, stormwater, and tree replacement plan (01:51:58).

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion for concept approval (01:53:08).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Zacharjasz and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (9-0).

2. 190-22

Murphy Recreation Center

300 W Shunk Street

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Site and building improvements

Applicant: Rebuild / Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Kelly Maiello Architects

This presentation was introduced by Troy Leonard, who provided a description of the project and scope of improvements, followed by Sean Smith from Pennoni Associates, who presented details of the proposed site improvements (01:57:53) including new sports field, new trees, new shed, sidewalk repair, and protective fencing. Victor Guarino from Kelly Maiello Architects continued with the building improvements (02:04:48).

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:05:56).

Commissioner Nasser voiced support to make a final approval vote so the project construction can begin (02:06:12). Commissioner Cahill asked about the landscape plan for sidewalk repair and tree replacement details. Commissioner Nasser and Commissioner Febo San Miguel inquired about the lighting plan. Angela Dixon responded to the inquiries (02:11:40).

There was further discussion about whether a concept or final approval was appropriate, and if administrative review could be considered. After, Chair Roesch clarified that concept approval was most fitting, and seeing no further comments from the commission or public, asked for a motion.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (7-0).

3. 208-22

McVeigh Recreation Center 400 E. Ontario Street

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Site and building improvements

Applicant: Rebuild / Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Impact Services

The presentation began at the minute mark (02:20:04) with Nestor Torres giving an introduction followed by presenters Jeff Alexander, who presented site details, Mario Gentile, and Patricia Codina, who presented community engagement (02:26:07). Activating the corner at D Street and Westmoreland Street and the entry plaza with tree bosque and benches were highlighted.

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:39:40).

Commissioner Cahill commended the project and asked about seating and the tree bosque design. Commissioner Osorio was concerned that the community garden space

was not in an accessible or prominent location. The location was discussed further, comparing the existing conditions with the proposal, as well as the community desires.

The discussion then moved to the entry space, sightlines, security, and whether the new design improved the openness and visibility of the entrance. The proposed trees may need to be thinned, or relocated around the entry to create a clear sightline. The resulting recommendation was to revisit the design of the entrance spaces with the goal to increase sightlines, seating options, and a create more welcoming sequence.

Chair Roesch reiterated the Commission's areas of concern including entry design and distribution of proposed trees, community garden location, and increased seating opportunities. Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion for concept approval (03:01:15).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (7-0).

4. 209-22

East Park Booster Pump Station 33rd Street and Girard Avenue

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: New construction to replace existing pump house

Applicant: Philadelphia Water Department

Presenter: JMT

Dennis Gentilin began the presentation with background on the pump station (03:02:47). The proposal is for new construction to replace the old facility.

Questions and comments from the Commission (03:15:05).

Commissioner McEneaney asked about the Percent for Art requirement, the applicant is in conversations with the Office of Arts and Culture, and the Creative Economy. Commissioner Cahill inquired about the landscape, new trees, and the details for the existing trees that are being lost. Commissioner Febo San Miguel questioned the lighting plans.

Commissioner Zacharjasz asked if additional architectural details could be built such as more windows or dormers on the roof to improve the character of the new building.

Chair Roesch restated the Commission requests for information for the next review including a tree replacement plan, lighting details, and architectural solutions to give character to the building (03:18:50).

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to approve (03:19:32).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (7-0).

5. 210-22

Aviator Park Building Relocation 20th and Race Streets

Review Type: Construction in the Benjamin Franklin Parkway Area

Project Details: Relocation of former gas filling station

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Pennoni

Staff member Beige Berryman provided the Commission with background information about the project prior to the presentation (03:20:20). This proposal is for the relocation of an existing building, an historic gas station, to a section of Logan Circle called Aviator Park. Its current location is a surface parking lot at 20th and Arch Streets. The building is on the Local Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. There is a redevelopment proposal for the surface parking lot for a commercial mix-use office building. Relocation of the historic structure to Aviator Park, is part of the redevelopment plan for 20th & Arch Street site. The City has accepted the structure as a donation through the Parks and Recreation Department and the building will become public property. The relocation effort has also been donated and the donation is similar to when the City accepts an object or work of sculpture into its public property inventory. The selected site, Aviator Park, is within the Benjamin Parkway overlay which is why the Art Commission is reviewing the new location proposal.

This presentation began at the minute mark (03:23:03).

Wale Mabogunje introduced the project to the Commission followed by Sean Smith from Pennoni Associates, who presented the scope of work (03:24:07). The relocation details, past engagement, and status of various agreements was described.

Questions and comments from the Commission (03:30:08).

Commissioner McEneaney inquired about the size of the building. Commissioner Zacharjasz asked why this new location was chosen and the process behind the decision. Commissioner Febo San Miguel asked about plans for a future tenant and what the next steps were for the space. Other commissioners shared their discomfort with the structure remaining empty for the near future as well as their discomfort with the stakeholder engagement thus far. There was general support for the preservation of the structure, but concern about its future use. More information was requested.

Questions and comments from the public (03:50:06).

Nick Anderson from the Parkway Counsel asked for more information.

Kathryn Ott Lovell from Parks and Recreation added they have been in discussions with Parkway for a few years about this idea. They have a signed Letter of Intent from August that outlines the plan to move the building from its current location to Aviator Park.

Dennis Boylan expressed support for the project but stated that the LSNA RCO needed more detailed plans (03:52:55).

Some commissioners had questions about the historic landmark status of Logan Circle and asked for more information.

Questions and comments from the public continued (04:06:52).

Jay Farrell stated that Aviator Park was not on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, but the building itself was (04:06:52).

Nick agreed with Dennis that more information is needed and that there needs to be a clear understanding with Parks and Recreation. So he suggested that all parties involved have a conversation with Parks and Recreation to lead the discussion.

Chair Roesch suggested that the Commission make a motion to continue so that near neighbors can discuss the proposal thoroughly, and so that more information on the future of this structure can be clarified. Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chair Roesch asked for motion to continue.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Zacharjasz and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to continue (7-0).



Seeing no further comments or questions, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to adjourn at (04:11:49). Upon the motion made by Commissioner Zacharjasz and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, the November 9, 2022 Philadelphia Art Commission meeting concluded.

The next Art Commission meeting will be held Wednesday, December 14, 2022 at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom.