



City of Philadelphia
CERTIFICATION REPORT

JANUARY 2023



Table of Contents

Candidate Information	3
Audit Findings	4
Framework Areas	4
Strategies	8
Compliance	10
Core Criteria Compliance	10
List of Non-Compliant Core Criteria	11
Appeals	11
Additional Criteria and Scoring	12
Scoring	12
Your Certified Welcoming Score	13
Appendix A: Certification Worksheet	14
Appendix B: Audit Interviewees	15



Candidate Information

CERTIFICATION STATUS	Certified
NAME OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT	City of Philadelphia, PA
TYPE OF GOVERNMENT	City Government
TYPE OF ASSESSMENT	Initial Certification
CONTACT PERSON	Name: Amy Eusebio Organization: City of Philadelphia Email: Amy.Eusebio@phila.gov
APPLICABLE STANDARD	Welcoming Standard 1.0
OBJECTIVE	Evaluation of local government's compliance with the criteria in the Welcoming Standard.
ASSESSMENT TEAM	Auditor(s): Jenny Diaz and Melissa Bertolo Analyst(s): Jenny Diaz and Melissa Bertolo
AUDIT DATE	November 2- 4, 2022
REPORT DRAFTED BY REPORT APPROVED BY	Jenny Diaz Melissa Bertolo



Audit Findings

The following tables provide a brief overview of audit findings in each of the framework areas of the Welcoming Standard along with the four key strategies we apply to each of the framework areas. For additional information regarding the audit findings, please see Appendix A, Certification Worksheet for both highlights and observations related to the criteria.

Framework Areas

<p>GOVERNMENT LEADERSHIP</p>	<p><i>In welcoming places, the local government implements systems and programs that strengthen community efforts and embed inclusion within government agencies.</i></p> <p>Government Leadership is a strength for the City of Philadelphia. The Office of Immigrant Affairs’ cross-sector collaboration with city departments, community organizations, and residents demonstrates commitment to equity, inclusion, and belonging work. The institutionalization of the Office of Immigrant Affairs through the charter amendment is a highlight.</p> <p>While Philadelphia does not have a formal welcoming plan, there are clear and formal structures for identifying and setting goals and responding to immediate needs through direct feedback from impacted community groups. Setting a community-wide plan for immigrant inclusion is an opportunity for the Office of Immigrant Affairs to ensure long-term goals are reflective of the priorities of the immigrant community and achieved even in times of administration changes. We look forward to seeing how a community-wide plan reinforces and moves forward Philadelphia’s immigrant inclusion work.</p> <p>Among Philadelphia’s strengths include disseminating information, with Philly Counts being a highlight. Its repurposing after the Census to identify community needs and connect residents with resources demonstrates the City’s commitment to ensuring all residents have access to services.</p>
<p>EQUITABLE ACCESS</p>	<p><i>Welcoming places work to ensure community services and opportunities are available to all residents, including immigrants.</i></p>



Equitable Access is a strength of Philadelphia. Both city agencies and community organizations work to improve equitable access to services and resources through information sharing and creating opportunities for direct feedback loops from impacted community members.

Language access is a highlight, with a clear investment of resources from the City of Philadelphia. The recent efforts to improve data transparency around departmental usage of language services provides additional opportunities to hold city departments accountable for providing interpretation and translation. There is also an opportunity to formalize the role of the departmental language access coordinators to ensure all departments are utilizing and promoting the language access services available.

The City of Philadelphia's commitment to creating a more equitable and navigable justice system is evident. Highlights include the work of the immigration counsel at the District Attorney's Office to avoid unjust immigration outcomes, the joint work with the Pennsylvania Immigrant Unity Project to create pathways for representation for immigration cases, and the Right to Counsel's work on housing cases.

The Philly ID is also a highlight. The municipal ID demonstrates a commitment from the City that immigration status should not inhibit access to services.

CIVIC
ENGAGEMENT

Welcoming communities actively ensure that residents, including newcomers fully participate in civic life by increasing access to leadership and democratic spaces.

Civic engagement is both a strength and opportunity for the City of Philadelphia. There are clear partnerships that expand civic engagement opportunities for immigrants, including the recent work to expand language access in voting with the Office of the City Commissioners.

Multiple programs are available to increase residents', including immigrants', knowledge of local government services and community programs. As the City standardizes its appointment process for boards, there is an opportunity to consider how to create pipelines of new leaders, including through its community engagement academies and programs.



	<p>The Mayor's Commission on African and Caribbean Immigrant Affairs and the Mayor's Commission on Asian Pacific American Affairs are strengths as they provide important avenues for direct communication and advocacy to the City. There is opportunity to consider representation of newer arrivals on the commissions as well as creating additional commissions to represent all immigrant groups.</p>
<p>CONNECTED COMMUNITIES</p>	<p><i>Welcoming communities build connections between newcomers and longer-term residents by strengthening relationships and communicating shared values.</i></p> <p>Connected Communities is an area of strength and opportunity for the City of Philadelphia. Strengths include the city's consistent messaging on the value of welcoming all, and the place-based work of community organizations including SEAMMAC and ACANA. The Black and Gold series is also a highlight for its work to address inter-racial tension between the Black and AAPI communities in Philadelphia.</p> <p>There is opportunity to deepen these investments by implementing strategies that bring together diverse residents to work on issues of common interest.</p>
<p>EDUCATION</p>	<p><i>Welcoming communities strive for an educational system that ensures all students have the support they need to succeed in school and the education they need to succeed in the workforce.</i></p> <p>K-12 education is an area of strength for the City of Philadelphia, with the Office of Multilingual Curriculum and Programs (OMCP) at the School District of Philadelphia being a highlight. The shared “problem tracker” between OMCP and community-based organizations demonstrates transparency and accountability on behalf of the school district in working to address challenges faced when navigating the school district. Bilingual counseling assistants are also a strength for providing bicultural support and program navigation for immigrant families in the school district.</p> <p>Adult education is also a strength for Philadelphia, with multiple programs serving the immigrant community. The Welcoming Center's emphasis on working with immigrants who have foreign education and work experience while also being accessible to all levels of skills and education is a strength.</p>



	<p>Ensuring workforce readiness programs, such as CareerLink, are accessible beyond the English and Spanish speaking population is an opportunity for Philadelphia.</p>
<p>ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT</p>	<p><i>Welcoming communities harness the full potential of all residents. Immigrants have the skills and assets to thrive, and economic development systems are prepared to leverage new and existing talent.</i></p> <p>Philadelphia’s equity strategy for economic development is a strength. The city’s emphasis on reducing disparities for multiple outcomes, including income, unemployment, and educational attainment show a holistic approach to economic development.</p> <p>Multiple policies and programs protect workers’ rights, including the Pay Equity Ordinance, Consumer Financial Protection Task Force, and the Domestic Worker Bill of Rights. The Community Outreach and Education Fund through the Department of Labor’s Office of Worker Protections is a highlight for its work to utilize trusted sources to inform immigrant workers about their rights and increase access to protection against predatory practices.</p> <p>Opportunities to deepen the work in the economic development framework area include engagement of employers, particularly outside of a compliance related framework. There is opportunity for the private sector to be engaged in welcoming work, particularly for improving workplace culture and addressing concerns before they arise to the level of a complaint.</p>
<p>SAFE COMMUNITIES</p>	<p><i>Welcoming communities foster trust and build relationships between residents, including newcomers, and local law enforcement and safety agencies.</i></p> <p>The city's actions to strengthen trust in local law enforcement through policies that clarify the jurisdiction and separation between local law enforcement and federal immigration enforcement agencies are a highlight, as are the City's legal actions to protect and maintain these policies. Additionally, the work of the Immigration Counsel at the District Attorney’s Office is a highlight for its work to avoid unjust immigration outcomes, including the training of prosecutors and partnership with trusted community based organizations to ensure that all involved in a case with a noncitizen understand the intersection between immigration and the criminal justice system.</p>



Again, as in other framework areas, there is a clear commitment from the city leadership to reduce barriers and increase equity and access to safety agencies. Policy changes within the Philadelphia Police Department demonstrate this commitment, including Philadelphia’s Driving Equality Law and ending the PARS agreement with ICE.

There is a clear commitment from multiple safety agencies, including emergency management and licensing and inspection, to ensure information is accessible and received from trusted entities.

Strategies

RECEIVING COMMUNITIES ENGAGEMENT

Welcoming communities build connections, communicate shared values, and nurture leadership to create places where everyone belongs.

A strength of Philadelphia is its communication of shared values of welcoming and inclusion. Identifying opportunities for community members to come together on issues of common interest is an opportunity to deepen receiving community engagement work.

PARTNERSHIP

Collaboration can leverage new resources, build program capacity, and strengthen community support for immigrant inclusion.

Partnership is a strength for Philadelphia. The city is connected with a large and extensive network of organizations working on immigrant inclusion and welcoming. There is an opportunity to engage the private sector to build capacity in economic development. There is also an opportunity to formalize a plan and meeting group to ensure that these partnerships have the opportunity to meet and discuss common issues regularly and that efforts continue despite inevitable administrative and staffing changes.



**EQUITY,
DIVERSITY,
AND
INCLUSION**

Designing programs and partnerships to increase access to varying religions, cultures, races, ethnicities, physical and mental abilities, ages, genders, and sexual orientations is essential to meeting the Welcoming Standard and to ensuring that a focus on immigrant inclusion is one that leads to greater access for all.

Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion is a strength for the City of Philadelphia. There is a clear commitment from city leadership to decrease disparities and create equitable outcomes for all in the city. This commitment is demonstrated throughout framework areas of the Welcoming Standard, and by multiple departments and agencies, demonstrating the full recognition that DEI work cannot be the sole responsibility of one office or agency. There is an opportunity to deepen the work between the DEI Office and Office of Immigrant Affairs as there are clear areas of intersection for both goal setting and technical assistance to departments.

The capacity building project for African and Caribbean serving organizations through the Mayor's Commission on African and Caribbean Immigrant Affairs is an important project to ensure equity in funding and support of Black immigrant led organizations and again recognizes the commitment from city leadership to address long-standing inequities and disparities.

**GOAL
SETTING,
MONITORING,
AND IMPACT**

Identifying priorities and allowing for course correction are critical to impact, particularly when resources are limited.

The Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion goals set for all departments and agencies in the City demonstrate a commitment to ensuring DEI work is measurable and action oriented. Furthermore, the DEI plan template provides a clear guide for departments and agencies to follow to ensure there is accountability and transparency in their work.



Compliance

Philadelphia meets 42/45 of the core criteria of the Welcoming Standard, which means the City of Philadelphia may receive its certificate and designation as Certified Welcoming. Since Welcoming America is transitioning to the Welcoming Standard 2.0 and a tiered certification system, **the City of Philadelphia is expected to become compliant with the remaining three criteria and submit evidence by April 19, 2023.** If you do not resolve the non-compliant items within the time frame specified, Philadelphia may be subject to sanctions, including decertification.

Welcoming America offers an [Audit Action Plan \(bit.ly/PhiladelphiaAuditActionPlan\)](https://bit.ly/PhiladelphiaAuditActionPlan) as a planning tool to help achieve compliance and is willing and available to work with you through the process.

Core Criteria Compliance

Category	Total Core Criteria	Complied	Non-complied
GOVERNMENT LEADERSHIP	10	7	3
EQUITABLE ACCESS	10	10	0
CIVIC ENGAGEMENT	3	3	0
CONNECTED COMMUNITIES	7	7	0
EDUCATION	2	2	0
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT	4	4	0
SAFE COMMUNITIES	9	9	0
OVERALL COMPLIANCE	45	42	3



List of Non-Compliant Core Criteria

Category	#	Requirement/ Indicator	Description	Evidence of Non-Compliance
GOVERNMENT LEADERSHIP	GL4	Requirement	A program is in place to manage a community-wide plan for immigrant inclusion.	No evidence was provided that showed a community-wide plan for immigrant inclusion was in place.
GOVERNMENT LEADERSHIP	GL4.1	Indicator	The program includes processes to regularly assess the needs and priorities of the local immigrant community in each of the categories of this standard and use that feedback to strengthen the plan.	No evidence was provided that shows a community-wide plan for immigrant inclusion was in place.
GOVERNMENT LEADERSHIP	GL4.2	Indicator	The program includes processes to engage cross-sector and diverse stakeholders in the maintenance and implementation of the plan, including stakeholders from the immigrant community and receiving community.	No evidence was provided that shows a community-wide plan for immigrant inclusion was in place.

Appeals

Should you disagree with any decision regarding compliance with the Welcoming Standard, you may file an appeal. Please note, you must submit a completed appeal form within 10 business days of receiving your Final Audit Report. The appeal form and instructions are available online at www.certifiedwelcoming.org or <https://www.tfaforms.com/4663366>. A decision regarding your appeal will be made within 20 business days of receiving the appeal.



Additional Criteria and Scoring

Compliance with additional criteria is not required for certification. Additional criteria are used to encourage continuous improvement, as demonstrated through an increased score. Your Certified Welcoming Score is generated by averaging the number of points you received for additional criteria only. Points for core criteria are not included in this score as they are used to determine your certification. Your Certified Welcoming Score captures a useful snapshot of strengths and opportunities for improvement beyond meeting the core criteria. Scores were created to set a baseline by which to define improvement during recertification, but with the new [Welcoming Standard 2.0](#) will be retired.

For a full list of points assigned to each criterion, see Appendix A, the certification worksheet or [Appendix A in the Standard Operating Procedure](#).

Scoring

All criteria— core and additional, requirements and indicators— have assigned points. The points system takes into account the impact of the criteria, the resources required to implement the criteria (in other words how accessible a criteria is to cities and counties regardless of budget, population, jurisdiction, and other factors), and whether the criteria is core or additional. Points for requirements range from 101 to 200 with all core requirements receiving 200 points. Indicator points range from 1 to 100 with all core indicators receiving 100 points.

To the right is a graph showing Philadelphia's score for each framework area. On the following page is a table with additional information pertaining to the score as well as showing Philadelphia's score against the Certified Welcoming average. At the time of Philadelphia's certification, 18 other cities or counties have achieved the status of Certified Welcoming and you can see how Philadelphia compares with these other 18 places.





Your Certified Welcoming Score

Framework Area	Total Additional Criteria	Number of Compliant Additional Criteria	Total Possible Points	Number of Points Achieved	Philadelphia Score	Certified Welcoming Average
Government Leadership	10	9	665	575	86.5	53.0
Equitable Access	14	14	1278	1278	100.0	52.5
Civic Engagement	6	5	443	393	88.7	62.7
Connected Communities	3	3	140	140	100.0	63.1
Education	9	9	470	470	100.0	78.3
Economic Development	13	8	809	494	78.4	58.1
Safe Communities	3	3	324	324	100.0	15.1
TOTAL	58	51	4129	3674	92.37	54.48



Appendix A: Certification Worksheet

Philadelphia’s Certification worksheet contains the responses to the self-assessment and your certification team’s final assessment of compliance for all core and additional criteria. Additionally, the worksheet contains information about reasons for non-compliance, and highlights and observations pertaining to the work. To view the certification worksheet, please [REDACTED]

Explanation of Highlights: During the audit process, our team identified particularly innovative or effective programs and strategies that set Philadelphia apart in its pursuit of the Welcoming Standard. Welcoming America would like to engage your team around the possibility to amplify, share, and learn more about these practices.

Explanation of Observations: During the certification process, our team identified opportunities for growth and improvement, which are described in the observations column. We typically require observations to be substantially improved to be considered compliant for recertification. However, since Welcoming America is transitioning to the Welcoming Standard 2.0 in 2023, these observations are only intended to help you grow and improve your work. If you would like to discuss any of the observations, please contact your certification team at certified@welcomingamerica.org.



Appendix B: Audit Interviewees

Name	Organization
Heather Arias	City of Philadelphia
Caleb Arnold	District Attorney's Office
Sarah Bailey	City of Philadelphia
Benaline Baluyot	School District of Philadelphia
Jannie Blackwell	Mayor's Commission on African and Caribbean Immigrant Affairs
Derek Bowmer	City of Philadelphia
Melvin Carrasquillo	City of Philadelphia
Candace Chewing	City of Philadelphia
John Chin	Mayor's Commission on Asian Pacific American Affairs
Adara Combs	City of Philadelphia
Rhona Cooper	City of Philadelphia
Nicole Cousounis	City of Philadelphia
Caroline Cruz	City of Philadelphia
Ralph DiPietro	City of Philadelphia
Randy Duque	Philadelphia Commission on Human Relations
Amy Eusebio	City of Philadelphia



Damaris Feliciano	City of Philadelphia
Maria Giraldo Gallo	City of Philadelphia
Peter Gonzales	The Welcoming Center
Dr. Guy Sims	City of Philadelphia
Fran Healy	Philadelphia Police Department
Valerie Herteg	HIAS PA
Voffee Jabateh	Mayor's Commission on African and Caribbean Immigrant Affairs
Seth Jacobson	Philadelphia Community College
Tianna Kalogerakis	City of Philadelphia
Nicole Klingerman	PA Domestic Workers Alliance
Steven Larin	Nationalities Services Center
Romana Lee-Akiyama	City of Philadelphia
Marcos Lomeli	Ceiba
Sarah Maguire	Philadelphia Community College
Obafemi Matti	City of Philadelphia
Beth McConnell	City of Philadelphia
Cathryn Miller Wilson	HIAS PA
Patrick Morgan	City of Philadelphia
Myla Morris-Skeiker	Philadelphia Community College



Ursula Ortiz	City of Philadelphia
Rebecca Piser	City of Philadelphia
Christine Piven	City of Philadelphia
Liz Pride	City of Philadelphia
Michelle Quach	FACE Philly Public School District
Krishna Rami	City of Philadelphia
Andrew Richman	City of Philadelphia
Gretchen Shanfield	Nationalities Services Center
Nefertiri Sickout	City of Philadelphia
Lindsay Southworth	Free Library of Philadelphia
Stanley Straughter	African Caribbean Business Council
Jarreau Thomas	Philadelphia Police Department
Andy Toy	Mayor's Commission on Asian Pacific American Affairs
Azucena Ugarte	City of Philadelphia
Gwendolyn Vilade	City of Philadelphia
Ting Wang	City of Philadelphia