



Minutes

The Philadelphia Art Commission

October 12, 2022 - 9:30 a.m.

Remote – Zoom Meeting – Hosted by DPZ

The Philadelphia Art
Commission
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

Members Present: José Almiñana, Deborah Cahill, Carmen Febo San Miguel, Matthew Kenyatta, Raed Nasser, Sarah McEneaney, Pepón Osorio, and Robert Roesch

Meeting of the Philadelphia Art Commission

Beige Berryman – staff member of the Art Commission – introduced the Zoom platform and remote Art Commission process, noting that the meeting is being recorded and those participating in the meeting are giving their consent to be recorded. A link to the recording, will be posted on the Art Commission website and the meeting agenda and materials can also be found on the website at: (<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/>).

*Ms. Berryman polled the commission via roll call announcing a quorum, then stated a few instructions for the public. Members of the public may comment on agenda items during the meeting. When the agenda item that you are interested in is being discussed, you can use the “raise hand” feature and staff will unmute you during the public comment period. If you’re joining by phone, you can also use the hand raise feature by dialing *9 during the public comment period, and if you have any submitted comments through email, staff will read those emails out loud at the appropriate time. Thank you.*

Chair Roesch called the meeting to order at the minute mark (00:02:35).

Report of the Sign Committee – September 28, 2022

First Reviews:

1. 181-22

FDR Park Signage

1500 Pattison Avenue

2. 182-22

Buena Onda

114 S 20th Street

3. 183-22

The Standard

119 S 31st Street

4. 184-22

The Hannah

1306-1314 Callowhill Street

5. 185-22

Mochi Doughchi

132 S 11th Street

6. 186-22

Express Edit

1521 Walnut Street

7. 187-22

Edgewater

230 N 23rd Street

8. 188-22

J'aime

401 S 17th Street

Chair Roesch noted that two sign recommendations were continued, and the rest had approval recommendations before asking for a motion (00:03:08).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve (8-0).

Presentations for Final Review

1. 22-21

Philadelphia Peace Plaza, a.k.a. Statue of Peace

805 S Front Street

Review Type: Public art proposal

Project Details: Statue and associated plaza to commemorate the history of Comfort Women

Applicant: Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy

Presenter: Philadelphia Peace Plaza Committee

Before the presentation began, Ms. Berryman made a brief announcement to remind participants about the review format of the Peace Plaza, which was a continuation of the review that began on September 19, 2022 (00:03:58). Afterwards, Chair Roesch shared that he received 150 emails from the public about this project, the majority of which were not in support of the proposal. As the project's presentation was made previously, commissioners began their deliberations.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:07:28).

Commissioner McEneaney expressed support and found the sculpture to be poignant powerful, and healing because it focused on the victims of the event. Brief comments were made by Commissioner Cahill and Commissioner Febo San Miguel, who were in support but asked for revisions to the inscription text. Commissioner Osorio was also concerned about the inscription text and added that it should be available in multiple languages.

Shinjoo Cho, representing the Peace Plaza Committee, responded and agreed with the Commission's suggestions to consider revising the inscription and providing language translations in English, Spanish, simplified Chinese, Korean, Vietnamese, and Japanese.

At the minute mark (00:27:08), Commissioner Febo San Miguel made a motion to approve the statue with two provisos: modifications to the inscription language that frame the issue as one example of a broad and global problem, and secondly, that language translations of the plaque are available. The motion was seconded by Commissioner McEneaney.

Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve with provisos (8-0).

2. 169-22

Calder Gardens

2100 Benjamin Franklin Parkway

Review Type: Construction project located within Benjamin Franklin Parkway Area Overlay

Project Details: New museum building and associated landscape and exterior site work

Applicant: CP2023

Presenter: Ballinger

Peter Kelsen presented an outline of the Commission's requests at the concept review held on September 14, 2022 (00:30:22). The requests included: sustainability measures, details of how visitors interact with the landscape including furniture such as, ramps and benches, material of the retaining walls, drainage plans, parking and bike lane details, and tree removal and replacement plan. Paul Arougheti and David Riz continued the presentation (00:32:09).

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:45:48).

Commissioner Almiñana requested clarification on how the sunken gardens are drained and other flood barriers, which Richard Herbert addressed. He then asked for confirmation on the number of trees being removed and the spacing between the water main replacement line and the sidewalk. The discussion moved to sustainability measures such as plant species, maintenance, bird strike reduction, and the building's energy efficiency.

Clarification on whether gates or fences were being installed was needed. The views should remain open and landscape feel welcoming to the public, although a 42" guardrail is needed around the sunken gardens for safety.

Commissioner Cahill expressed concerns about the drop off sequence and circulation paths. Further discussion continued on the topic (00:50:47) as the drawings had some discrepancy between them, and the ADA route design was discussed. Secondary circulation paths within the landscape are needed.

The plantings and design of the rain garden were discussed. The loss of the Parkway trees was described as detrimental.

Commissioner Cahill also inquired about educational and wayfinding signage (01:04:22). Commissioner Osorio inquired about defining spaces in the garden for engagement and gathering.

Chairman Roesch expressed concerns about the 60-ft of curb cut.

Many concerns were brought up about the circulation, interaction, and site furnishings along the Parkway edge. In general, the project's relationship with the Parkway was unresolved. Following these comments from the Commission, Chairman Roesch asked the project team to return with the revisions (01:22:17).

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chairman Roesch asked for a motion to continue (01:22:51).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to continue (8-0).

3. 172-22

Academy of Natural Sciences Mural

1900 Benjamin Franklin Parkway

Review Type: Project located within Benjamin Franklin Parkway Area Overlay

Project Details: Exterior mural

Applicant: Academy of Natural Sciences of Drexel University

Presenter: Academy of Natural Sciences of Drexel University

Jennifer Sontchi presented the mural proposal, “Watershed Daydreams”, describing the revisions from the last review including a night rendering to depict lighting conditions and more details on the signage.

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:27:12).

Chair Roesch commented on the unfortunate relationship with the doorway. Commissioner Kenyatta inquired about size of the mural, which is predetermined by the larger program and this mural is only one of many. Additional comments were made by members of the Commission concerning signage, language, QR Code, and location of the related murals.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (01:42:26).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Kenyatta and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve (8-0).

4. 115-22

Shepard Recreation Center Improvements

5700 Haverford Avenue

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Building and site improvements

Applicant: Rebuild / Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenters: SMP Architects and Salt Design Studio

Robert Totaro introduced the project followed by Todd Woodward. Sara Pevaroff Schuh presented the landscape design. Details on the play spaces, exterior lighting, paving, and furniture were presented.

Questions and comments from the Commission (01:52:31).

Commissioner Almiñana inquired about adding controls for the lighting. Commissioner Cahill asked about the tree protection plan. Commissioner Febo San Miguel inquired about the Percent for Art requirement.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch asked for a motion (01:57:57).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Almiñana and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve (8-0).

Presentations for Concept Review

1. 189-22

Baker Recreation Center

5431-43 Lansdowne Avenue

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Building and site improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: SMP Architects

Francesco Cerrai introduced the project followed by Todd Woodward (01:59:20). Mr. Woodward presented the site plan and existing conditions. There is minimal site work, but the building is receiving an addition and restoration.

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:08:43).

Commissioner Cahill asked if the play equipment was being upgraded, not at this time.

Questions and comments from the public (02:11:11).

Chief of Staff Josh Cohen, from the Office of Councilman Jones, Jr., expressed the dire need for the renovation.

Commissioner McEneaney inquired about the details of the mural, currently it's on the exterior of the building, but it will be on the interior after the addition is built. She voiced concern about interrupting the art piece with new door openings.

Commissioner Almiñana voiced concern about the narrow width of the new vestibule, considering the space of the door swing and high volume of circulation that it needs to accommodate.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission, Chairman Roesch asked for a motion (02:23:20) and suggested final approval with the proviso that details showing where the door openings are on the mural and how the door swing is resolved within the vestibule space are submitted to staff (02:24:36).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve with the proviso (8-0).

2. 191-22

Philadelphia Urban Riding Academy

298 N. Daggett Street

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Building renovation and site improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: O Z Collaborative

Erin Brown began the presentation with an introduction and overview of the project (02:26:08). Richard Olaya continued the presentation, with plans and images of the building renovation (02:29:12).

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:38:27).

Commissioner Cahill inquired about proper heat and water provided for horses overnight. Ms. Brown ensured the horses had comfortable conditions. Commissioner Febo San Miguel asked about the protection of birds hitting the windows and the project's connection to Cobbs Creek Park. Commissioner Almiñana asked if more utility space was needed for the facility's functions. Commissioner McEneaney asked about the building's programs and also how the second half of the property was used. The existing bocce court use will remain.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chair Roesch suggested final approval and asked for a motion (02:51:07).



Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (8-0).

Seeing no further comments or questions, Chair Roesch asked for a motion to adjourn at (02:51:54). The motion was made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney.

This concluded the October 12, 2022 Philadelphia Art Commission meeting.

The next Art Commission meeting will be held Wednesday, November 9, 2022 at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom.