

Minutes

The Philadelphia Art Commission

September 14, 2022 - 9:30 a.m.

Remote – Zoom Meeting – Hosted by DPZ

The Philadelphia Art
Commission
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

Members Present: José Almiñana, Deborah Cahill, Carmen Febo San Miguel, Matthew Kenyatta, Raed Nasser, Sarah McEneaney, Pepón Osorio, Mario Zacharjasz, and Robert Roesch

Meeting of the Philadelphia Art Commission

Beige Berryman – staff member of the Art Commission – introduced the Zoom platform and remote Art Commission process, noting that the meeting is being recorded and those participating in the meeting are giving their consent to be recorded. A link to the recording, will be posted on the Art Commission website and the meeting agenda and materials can also be found on the website at: (<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/>).

*Ms. Berryman polled the commission via roll call announcing a quorum, then stated a few instructions for the public. Members of the public may comment on agenda items during the meeting. When the agenda item that you are interested in is being discussed, you can use the “raise hand” feature and staff will unmute you during the public comment period. If you’re joining by phone, you can also use the hand raise feature by dialing *9 during the public comment period, and if you have any submitted comments through email, staff will read those emails out loud at the appropriate time. Thank you.*

Chair Roesch called the meeting to order at the minute mark (00:02:40).

Chair Roesch announced that there would be a special meeting for the Statue of Peace proposal, September 19, 2022, at 9:30 a.m. He then announced one revision to the order of the presentations on today’s agenda. The Cobbs Creek Golf Course presentation will be heard immediately following the Calder Gardens presentation.

Report of the Sign Committee – August 24, 2022

Second Reviews:

**1. 35-21
Independence Place
233-241 S 6th Street**

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102
215-683-4674
artcommission@phila.gov

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4674 Telephone

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)



- 2. 16-22**
Kimmel Center Cafe
300-18 S Broad Street

First Reviews:

- 1. 141-22**
Fairmount Tavern
1700 Fairmount Avenue
- 2. 148-22**
Grandma's
1304 Walnut Street
- 3. 149-22**
Outdoor Voices
1723 Walnut Street
- 4. 150-22**
American Vegan Center
17-19 N 2nd Street
- 5. 151-22**
Pressed
113 S 13th Street
- 6. 152-22**
Veterinary Emergency Group
1213 Walnut Street
- 7. 153-22**
Rescue Spa
130 S 18th Street
- 8. 154-22**
Free People
1632 Walnut Street
- 9. 158-22**
City Fitness
45 N 3rd Street
- 10. 147-22**
Asurion
1128 Walnut Street
- 11. 155-22**
1128 marquee
1128 Walnut Street

12. 156-22

Oyster House

1516 Sansom Street

13. 157-22

Saatva

1712 Walnut Street

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the recommendations of the Sign Committee from August 24, 2022 (00:04:28).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Raed and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Sign Committee recommendations (9-0).

Administrative Agenda

1. 166-22

Bus Shelter Upgrades

Various locations

Review Type: Encroachment in the public right-of-way

Project Details: Ten new bus shelter installations

Applicant: Office of Transportation, Infrastructure & Sustainability

Ms. Berryman presented three administrative items. This proposal is for nine new bus shelters at various locations around the city. All the locations are proposing new shelters, where currently no shelter exists. Staff has reviewed each location in terms of Complete Street standards, and while the recommended complete street dimensions cannot be met at all locations, staff recommends approval, as the shelters offer improved conditions.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the Bus Shelter Upgrades (00:06:19).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Bus Shelter Upgrades (9-0).

2. 167-22

Sidewalk security bollards

1701 John F. Kennedy Boulevard

Review Type: Encroachment in the public right-of-way

Project Details: Replacement and addition of bollards for site security

Applicant: Liberty/Comcast

The Comcast Center, located at 1701 J.F.K. Boulevard, is proposing to replace existing bollards and add new bollards within the furnishing zone of the sidewalks along their perimeter. This includes Arch Street, 17th Street, and J.F.K. Boulevard around the parcel. The Streets Department has approved the bollards, and they're now undergoing the final review of the encroachment legislation. The new bollard design is ten inches taller, but otherwise has the same appearance. They are stainless steel sleeves. They are necessary for security to prevent unauthorized intrusion of motor vehicles into the currently unprotected areas of the pedestrian plaza and sidewalks that surround the Comcast Center.

Questions and comments from the public (00:06:55).

Timothy Reimer opposed the sidewalk security bollards.

Questions and comments from the Commission.

Commissioner Cahill inquired about the design. Commissioner Kenyatta inquired about the security claims. Ms. Berryman directed the Commission to Mr. Williams from the project team, who addressed the questions (00:11:17). Commissioner Raed spoke about being proactive, regarding the bollards.

Additional questions and comments from the public (00:14:30).

Ms. Handy L Asked the Commissioner to take into consideration the “well-secured” people versus those who are not well-secured, those who are unhoused.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the sidewalk security bollards.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Raed and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the sidewalk security bollards (9-0).

3. 168-22

Senator William Vincent Mullin Playground Improvements

4301 Princeton Avenue

Review Type: Minor construction on City property

Project Details: Upgrade of play equipment and safety surface

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

The playground will be replaced in kind without significant impact to the existing landscape. The project includes new play structures, as well as a new safety surface in the play space.

Questions and comments from the public (00:17:12)

Timothy Reimer expressed support for the project.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the Senator William Vincent Mullin Playground Improvements (00:18:05).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Zacharjasz and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Senator William Vincent Mullin Playground Improvements (9-0).

Presentation for Concept Review

1. 169-22

Calder Gardens

2100 Benjamin Franklin Parkway

Review Type: Construction project located within Benjamin Franklin Parkway Area Overlay

Project Details: New museum building and associated landscape and exterior site work

Applicant: CP2023

Presenter: Herzog & de Meuron

Mr. Peter Kelsen began with an overview of the project and Mr. Jason Frantzen continued the presentation (00:19:02). Mr. Frantzen spoke about the Calder family heritage in Philadelphia, the importance of landscape for the site, and finally the three components of the proposal, the wall, the garden, and the disc. A visual and verbal “walk-through” the proposal was presented including the interior galleries and exterior gardens.

Questions and comments from the Commission (00:38:52).

Commissioner Zacharjasz asked about the inspiration for the wood and stainless steel materials. Commissioner McEneaney asked about accessibility to the outdoor spaces. Commissioner Almiñana inquired about the potential of the site for flooding, how the Parkway design was being considered in the proposal, and the existing vegetation. Commissioner Febo San Miguel requested more detailed information. Commissioner Osorio asked about the size of the spaces given the scale of Calder’s work. Commissioner Kenyatta asked more about the material and surface of the building. Commissioner Cahill inquired about the possibility of visiting artists as part of the galleries’ programming.

Questions and comments from the public (01:00:54).

Ms. Handy L. was curious about who the project was designed for and who might be getting excluded.

Ann Dixon asked if renewable energy would be incorporated into the project.

Jason Frantzen addressed these questions.

Julian Bender wanted to know how many trees would be removed.

Peg Zminda of the Barnes Foundation spoke about the support for the maintenance of the gardens.

Kitty Jauregui spoke about accessibility being part of the project's design.

Jay Farrow asked about the lack of brick.

Timothy Reimer asked about the current and proposed trees.

Lawrence Szmulowicz commented about native plants and bird-friendly glazing.

Keisha Usher was concerned about the lack of inclusivity.

Sheren Chang spoke about bird-friendly glass.

Questions and comments from the Commission.

Commissioner Kenyatta inquired about the glass and material, Commissioner Osorio commented on the garden space, and Commissioner Almiñana spoke about sustainability, in particular the solar, choices of material, and landscape components (01:34:38). He also brought up traffic concerns including bus traffic, the 22nd Street drop-off area, and the slope near the Vine Street expressway.

Chair Roesch summarized the following areas that need more details when the project returns for the next review: energy and sustainability measures, public accessibility for the outdoor spaces, ramps, benches, and outdoor gathering spaces, material of the retaining walls of the sunken gardens, drainage, parking and bike lane details, and finally tree removal and replacement plans (01:36:43).

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for concept approval (01:38:54).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Raed and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (9-0).

Presentation for Final Review

1. 137-22

Cobbs Creek Golf Course Improvements – Driving Range, Youth Education Center and associated site work 7400 Lansdowne Avenue

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Site and building construction and improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Blackney Hayes Architects

Before moving forward, Chair Roesch first asked the Commission for a motion to continue three building groups associated with this proposal, Building Group Two, Three, and Four. Building Group One would be heard today.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Almiñana and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to continue Building Groups Two, Three, and Four (9-0).

In terms of public comment, Chair Roesch requested that comments be short, concise, and avoid repetitiveness, especially considering that extensive public comments were heard previously at the special July 27th Art Commission meeting.

Jeff Shanahan then began the presentation and introduced the context of the project, followed by John Haynes who described the building design details (01:45:04).

Questions and comments from the Commission.

Commissioner Almiñana noted that the scope of work was unclear, the project limit boundary was inconsistent among presentation slides. He then commented on the driving range landscape, amount of shade, and bird-safe glass. He suggested additional conversations were needed to clarify the environmental impact of the proposal.

Commissioner Zacharjasz commented that the architecture of the prefabricated buildings was generally acceptable, but bird-safe glass needed to be specified.

Commissioner Kenyatta and Commissioner Almiñana expressed concerns about the lack of response to the public's and Commission's feedback on the proposal, and the absence of the landscape architect associated with the project during the presentation and review.

Chair Roesch suggested an additional meeting was needed with the Commission. Claudia Becker, counsel to the Art Commission, articulated that recommendation with the term "continuance".

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to continue the project for future deliberation (02:16:37).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Almiñana Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to continue the project for future deliberation at a mutual determined date for improvements to the Cobbs Creek Golf Course (8-0). Commissioner Cahill recused herself from this item.

Presentations for Concept Review (continued)

2. 170-22

Feltonville Intermediate School 238 East Wyoming Avenue

Review Type: Construction project paid with City funds

Project Details: Exterior renovations and mural

Applicant: Philadelphia School District

Presenter: Schrader Group

Paige Geldrich began the presentation at the minute mark (02:18:56). She gave an overview of the exterior façade improvements and the new mural.

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:27:34).

The Commission praised the project. Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or the public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for final approval (02:29:12).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Zacharjasz and seconded by Commissioner Kenyatta, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Kenyatta, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chair Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (8-0). Commissioner Nasser was not present for the vote.

3. 171-22

Francis J Myers Recreation Center 5801 Kingsessing Avenue

Review Type: Construction project on City property

Project Details: Building and site improvements

Applicant: Rebuild / Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: DIGSAU

Mr. Jules Dingle began the presentation with an overview followed by Tom Home (02:31:16). They described the existing conditions and proposed improvements. The front entry circulation improvements or “accessibility machine”, were given special attention.

Questions and comments from the Commission (02:46:08).

Commissioner Almiñana raised questions about the trees and if they were being replaced with equivalent calipers. Commissioner Zacharjasz asked about the lighting, and Commissioner Cahill inquired about the playground equipment, benches, and ADA. Commissioner McEneaney wanted to know about the budget and One Percent for Art requirement.

Questions and comments from the public (02:50:21).

Timothy wanted to know which trees were being removed and Jules addressed the question.

Shereen Chang spoke about concerns for tree replacement and bird safety.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch suggested the following details be presented at the next review: stormwater management, lighting, trees, playground details, and Percent for Art, then asked for a motion for concept approval (02:56:00).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (8-0).

4. 172-22

Academy of Natural Sciences Mural 1900 Benjamin Franklin Parkway

Review Type: Project located within Benjamin Franklin Parkway Area Overlay

Project Details: Exterior mural

Applicant: Academy of Natural Sciences of Drexel University

Presenter: Academy of Natural Sciences of Drexel University

Jennifer Sontchi began the presentation at (02:57:16). She described the mural proposal as part of a larger Philadelphia campaign for raising awareness of sustainable development goals.

Questions and comments from the Commission (03:02:13).

Chair Roesch asked about the duration and installation dates which are planned for November 2022 through 2026. Commissioner Cahill expressed that signage would help with the messaging. Commissioner Febo San Miguel wanted to know about illumination of the mural. Commissioner Osorio asked if there was any association between the artist and the Academy. Chair Roesch confirmed that the existing door applique would be removed.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for concept approval (03:10:10).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEaney and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (5-0).

Presentations for Final Review (continued)

2. 186-21

Park at Penn's Landing

101 S. Columbus Boulevard

Review Type: Construction project paid with City funds

Project Details: New 12-acre park capping I-95

Applicant: Delaware River Waterfront Corporation

Presenter: Hargreaves Jones & Kieran Timberlake

Lizzie Woods presented the project at the minute mark (03:11:07). She highlighted design details. Rosa Mannion continued the presentation to talk about the area under the cap and the trail details (03:18:38). Mary Margaret Jones described the “top side” of the cap, including winter renderings, tree details, lighting, and programming details.

Questions and comments from the Commission (03:34:00).

The Commission praised the project and appreciated the response from the initial concept review. Commissioner Cahill asked if there would be a welcome sign and about the care and maintenance of the plants. Ms. Woods addressed the inquiries. Commissioner Osorio commented on the successful balance between the natural and the built environment. Further discussion continued on the subject. Commissioner McEaney asked about the ventilation for bicyclists under the cap. Ms. Woods mentioned that ventilation would be a PennDOT question but that ventilation isn't required because it isn't classified as a tunnel.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for final approval (03:43:57).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (5-0).

Seeing no further comments or questions, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to adjourn at (03:44:49). Upon the motion made by Commissioner Cahill and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, the meeting adjourned.

This concluded the September 14, 2022, Philadelphia Art Commission.

The next Art Commission will be a special meeting on Monday, September 19, 2022, at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom.