



**December 7, 2022**

Matthew Wojcik  
Department of Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, Concourse  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Clarissa Redding, RA  
Leonidas Addimando  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

**Re: Civic Design Review for 217-53 N 9<sup>th</sup> Street (Application #ZP-2021-015505)**

Dear Mr. Wojcik,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential development at 217-53 N 9<sup>th</sup> Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes an affordable, senior housing development, totaling 48,500 square feet of new gross floor area. This proposal includes 51 dwelling units on floors one through five and proposes 9 vehicular parking spaces in a surface lot. There are an additional two non-accessory surface parking spaces to be located offsite at 241 N 10<sup>th</sup> Street. The parcel is zoned CMX-4, and the project has two parking related variances.

At its meeting of December 6, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: (Philadelphia Chinatown Development Corporation)**

A representative from PCDC provided the following comments:

Several community members noted concerns about safety issues and encouraged the applicant team find ways for more secured access into and out of site to protect residents. The RCO asked the development team to consider including cultural elements into the site design elements (specifically light poles, seating, and other elements) to celebrate Chinatown's rich history. The representative noted their desire for the applicant to consider ways to allow for N 9<sup>th</sup> Street to engage more with the sidewalk, either with larger windows or allowing for a community posting board for more sidewalk interaction and activity. Finally, the RCO requested further exploration of a mural for the building.

**CDR Committee Comments**

The CDR Committee had mostly favorable comments regarding this project, specifically noting the following:

The Committee appreciated the long plant beds along N 9<sup>th</sup> Street but noted that the exact locations of the planting areas could have impacts on mobility and access. In

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



particular, the planter in front of the lobby restricts drop-offs from occurring directly in front of the entrance. The committee also asked for more information regarding drop off and pick up for paratransit vehicles.

The Committee had several comments about the private outdoor space, noting their appreciation for a welcoming amenity for future residents. Many Committee members commended the space but noted that there were several missed opportunities. The Committee wished for a more programed and designed space, better utilizing the planting beds, and agreed with staff comments to incorporate a shade element. Another Committee member commented on the proposed safety of the space and requested more information regarding lighting and the impacts of being so close to Vine Street.

The committee requested the access driveway become narrower to give more space to the plaza and residential uses but recognized the code constraints of this request.

The Committee agreed with both the RCO and PCPC staff comments regarding the N 9<sup>th</sup> Street façade. The Committee noted that activity was lacking and encouraged more interaction on 9<sup>th</sup> Street and direct access to the community room from the plaza space.

Overall the committee noted that this was a challenging site with many utility conflicts, but applauded the team for positioning the building properly, and providing affordable senior housing which is needed in Chinatown.

Finally, there was discussion about the other parcels on this block, which were previously seen by the CDR Committee several years ago. The Committee asked how this project can best fit into the future development of the other parcels, but it was noted by the applicant team that this parcel was subdivided to be a separate, singular parcel and there was limited information regarding what will happen to the remainder of the block in the future.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Councilmember Mark Squilla, Council District 1, Mark.Squilla@phila.gov



Department of Planning and Development

**Civic Design Review**

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Anne Kelly, Representative for Council District 1, [Anne.Kelly@phila.gov](mailto:Anne.Kelly@phila.gov)  
Sean McMonagle, Representative for Council District 1, [Sean.McMonagle@phila.gov](mailto:Sean.McMonagle@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Slavic, Representative for Council District 1, [jennifer.slavic@phila.gov](mailto:jennifer.slavic@phila.gov)  
Peter Kelsen, BlankRome, [peter.kelsen@blankrome.com](mailto:peter.kelsen@blankrome.com)  
Lindsey Samsi, Pennrose, [lsamsi@pennrose.com](mailto:lsamsi@pennrose.com)  
David J. Gamba, WRT, [DGamba@wrtdesign.com](mailto:DGamba@wrtdesign.com)  
Shuning Zhao, WRT, [SZhao@wrtdesign.com](mailto:SZhao@wrtdesign.com)  
Ian Clark, 5th Ward Republican RCO, [ianclark93@gmail.com](mailto:ianclark93@gmail.com)  
Yue Wu, Philadelphia Chinatown Development Corporation, [ywu@chinatown-pcdc.org](mailto:ywu@chinatown-pcdc.org)  
Mahn S. Park, Asian American Federation of the United States, [mahnpark@gmail.com](mailto:mahnpark@gmail.com)  
Kate Esposito, Center City Organized for Responsible Development, [ccordrco1@gmail.com](mailto:ccordrco1@gmail.com)  
Matthew Wojcik, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [matthew.wojcik@phila.gov](mailto:matthew.wojcik@phila.gov)  
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [Ian.Litwin@phila.gov](mailto:Ian.Litwin@phila.gov)  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, [michelle.brisbon@phila.gov](mailto:michelle.brisbon@phila.gov)  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, [kisha.duckett@phila.gov](mailto:kisha.duckett@phila.gov)  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, [jeanien.wilson@phila.gov](mailto:jeanien.wilson@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)



**December 7, 2022**

Paulose Issac  
Department of Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, Concourse  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Clarissa Redding, RA  
Leonidas Addimando  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

**Re: Civic Design Review for 500-10 W Montgomery Ave (Application # ZP-2021-015638)**

Dear Paulose Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential building at 500-10 W Montgomery Avenue.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a mixed-use building totaling 165,503 square feet consisting of 78 dwelling units, a 910 square foot residential lobby, 2,950 square feet of artist studio space, a 2,400 square foot 7th floor amenity terrace, and 13 enclosed parking spaces. The parcel is zoned IRMX Industrial Residential Mixed-Use and is a by-right project earning an industrial use height bonus.

At its meeting of December 6, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: South Kensington Community Partners**

There was no representative from South Kensington Community Partners present at the CDR meeting. However, the RCO submitted a letter, summarized below:

Neighbors are particularly concerned about impacts to the streets and utilities from this project, as the area sees significant flooding from stormwater events as well as increasing pressure on the supply of on-street parking. Given the size and impact that this project will have, providing a benefit to the community in the form of a rain garden at the corner of Randolph and Cecil B. Moore, would be a welcome addition to the project.

The design also lacks any contextual elements that will make the building appear to fit among the handsome industrial buildings that surround the site. To better fit the context of the neighborhood, the design could incorporate industrial-style windows and materials, like brick, that better match the surrounding buildings.

There are also issues with the design of the project, in particular the roof terrace, which lacks any sort of setback or separation from the street. Neighbors would like to see a planter or some other type of separation between the terrace and the edge of the building to act as a setback and shield activities on the terrace from the street.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



### **CDR Committee Comments**

The design team was encouraged to explore a less reflective color for the metal panels on the upper floors of the building and to utilize continuous street tree pits where possible. It was also noted that the raised planter at corner of 5th and Montgomery Streets creates a pinch point for pedestrians, especially those with limited mobility. The design team replied that they would explore other designs for this corner.

The design team was encouraged to further develop the design of the entry plaza by softening the exposed party wall with additional greenery and lighting.

It was also noted that one elevator seems insufficient for the number of units and height of the building.

Lastly, it was noted that many IRMX projects that come before the CDR Committee include an artist studio for zoning bonus purposes, but that in most cases, this one included, the proposed space needs more resolution to function as intended. One suggestion was to add a direct connection to the parking area.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Sloane Folks, Representative to Council District 7, Sloane.Folks@phila.gov  
Herb Schultz, Studio HS4, hschultz@hs4arch.com  
Michael Phillips, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, mphilips@klehr.com  
Annie Moss, Olde Kensington Neighborhood Association, Zbaokna@gmail.com  
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com  
Marco Gorini, South Kensington Community Partners, RCO@southkensingtoncommunity.org  
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, David.Fecteau@phila.gov  
Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, Cheli.R.Dahal@Phila.gov  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



**December 8, 2022**

Christopher Hartland  
Department of Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, Concourse  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Clarissa Redding, RA  
Leonidas Addimando  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1031 Germantown Avenue Phase II (Application # ZP-2022-005627)**

Dear Mr. Hartland,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed self-storage facility at 1031 Germantown Avenue phase II.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a total of 51,285 square feet of gross floor area. This proposal is the second phase of a three-phase development which includes 15 townhomes (3,419 square feet on average, each with roof deck and green roof) and 30 vehicular parking spaces. The parcel is zoned RSA-5/ CMX-2 and there are use refusals for the use and number of principle uses and structures as well as zoning refusals for rear yard depth, maximum height, minimum ADA parking spaces, and minimum off-street loading spaces.

At its meeting of December 6, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: (Northern Liberties Neighbors Association)**

Northern Liberties Neighbors Association held a public meeting on October 3, 2022. They did not attend the CDR meeting but sent a letter of support.

**CDR Committee Comments**

The Committee chair started the conversation by reading the Northern Liberties Neighbors Association RCO letter:

"This project creatively provides two car parking and a public component to a residential development. Please ensure that the public space is accessible (follows universal design) and remains open to the public. We like the landscaping as presented for the interior, but we would like to see specific plan for street trees. We are concerned that the two-way drive aisle will be hard to navigate and will reduce use of the provided parking. If a glass railing at the roof level is maintained, please use bird friendly glass or substitute picket railings. We appreciate the additional windows but would like to see even more glazing at the corner of Allen Street and Germantown Avenue. Please vary the brick and metal color."

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



The committee expressed their appreciation for this development and the treatment of the public deck as a pedestrian alleyway, however suggested that more native plants be proposed for the planters on the deck. The committee commented on the discrepancy between the street trees shown on the renderings but not on the site plan, and suggested maximizing the number of street trees.

After some discussion about the appropriate amount of parking for this proposal at this location, committee members agreed that there are benefits to including parking spaces in the development and the fact that they are located underground is beneficial to the public realm.

The committee chair believed that there was an opportunity to create mix of units in order to provide more affordable choices of housing. The CDR committee also emphasized the necessity of integrating solar panels on the roof as well as the including electric vehicle charging stations at the time of construction.

Lastly, the CDR Committee adopted the Planning Commission staff comments:

### **Site Design**

- There is a pinch point on the Pollard Street sidewalk. Staff suggests setting the building back to ensure the walking zone meets the minimum ADA accessibility requirement for intersections.
- The walking zone along Pollard Street is undersized with the light wells and steps encroaching onto the sidewalk. Please set the building back on this side to provide enough room for pedestrian circulation.
- Please add trees on both Pollard and W Allen Streets sidewalks.
- Staff appreciates the inclusion of the public deck, would like to see some more definition between public, semi-public, and private spaces. Staff discourages any gates or fences which may send a message of exclusion.
- Please include renderings or elevation drawings showing the end point of the public walkway and how it's treated until the next phase is built.
- Staff encourages the development team to ensure the public courtyard is connected to public streets through phase 3 of this development.

### **Building Design**

- Staff appreciates the building entrances facing the streets, building massing, window patterns, and setbacks to match the scale of the surrounding neighborhood, and the use of high-quality brick all around the development.
- Staff appreciates the inclusion of windows on the side elevations.

### **Parking Design**

- Staff commends the development team for locating all the parking spaces below grade.
- Please explain how loading/unloading and trash pickup are being managed.

### **Sustainable Design**

- Staff requests more information on the energy and atmosphere category on the checklist and encourages the proposal to meet more sustainable design metrics.
- This site is within 1000 feet of I-95, consider sound and air quality impacts.



In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Councilmember Mark Squilla, Mark.squilla@phila.gov  
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov  
Jennifer Slavic, Constituent Services Representative, jennifer.slavic@phila.gov  
Jose Hernandez, JKRPA Architects, johern@jkrparchitects.com  
Sean Whalen, Vintage Law LLC, sw@vintage-law.com  
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com  
Marc Collazzo, Fishtown Kensington Area Business Improvement District, marc@fishtownbid.org  
Larry Freedman, Northern Liberties Neighbors Association, larryfreedman@comcast.net  
Ian Clark, 5th Ward Republican, ianclark93@gmail.com  
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov  
Christopher Hartland, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, christopher.hartland@phila.gov  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov





**December 7, 2022**

Cheli Dahal  
Department of Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, Concourse  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Clarissa Redding, RA  
Leonidas Addimando  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1700-16 N Randolph St (Application # ZP-2021-015631)**

Dear Cheli Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential building at 1700-16 N Randolph St.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a residential building totaling 57,160 square feet consisting of 75 dwelling units, a 2,120 square foot residential lobby, a 1,525 square foot 4th floor amenity terrace, and 9 surface parking spaces. The parcel is zoned RM-1 Residential Multi-Family and is a by-right project earning a green roof bonus.

At its meeting of December 6, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: South Kensington Community Partners**

There was no representative from South Kensington Community Partners present at the CDR meeting. However, the RCO submitted a letter, summarized below:

Neighbors are particularly concerned about impacts to the streets and utilities from this project, as the area sees significant flooding from stormwater events as well as increasing pressure on the supply of on-street parking.

The design also lacks any contextual elements that will make the building appear to fit among the handsome industrial buildings that surround the site. To better fit the context of the neighborhood, the design could incorporate industrial-style windows and materials, like brick, that better match the surrounding buildings.

There are also issues with the design of the project, in particular the roof terrace, which lacks any sort of setback or separation from the street. Neighbors would like to see a planter or some other type of separation between the terrace and the edge of the building to act as a setback and shield activities on the terrace from the street.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



### **CDR Committee Comments**

Committee members wanted to see more brick on the upper stories to better relate to existing fabric of the neighborhood. In addition, it was noted that the parking (accessed off N 6th Street) is awkward and inefficient. The design team was encouraged to revisit this portion of the project to maximize the usefulness of the amenity patio.

Committee members requested more 2+ bedroom units and noted that the play structure shown in rendering of the patio space doesn't seem to fit with unit types proposed.

Lastly, it was noted that if this permit were pulled today, there would be an affordable unit requirement due to a new zoning overlay that covers this parcel.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Sloane Folks, Representative to Council District 7, Sloane.Folks@phila.gov  
Herb Schultz, Studio HS4, hschultz@hs4arch.com  
Michael Phillips, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, mphilips@klehr.com  
Annie Moss, Olde Kensington Neighborhood Association, Zbaokna@gmail.com  
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com  
Marco Gorini, South Kensington Community Partners, RCO@southkensingtoncommunity.org  
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, David.Fecteau@phila.gov  
Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, Cheli.R.Dahal@Phila.gov  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



**December 6, 2022**

Cheli Dahal  
Department of Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, Concourse  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Clarissa Redding, RA  
Leonidas Addimando  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

**Re: Civic Design Review for 3801-17 Chestnut Street (Application # ZP-2022-007024)**

Dear Cheli Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use building at 3801-17 Chestnut Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a mixed-use building totaling 392,405 square feet of gross square feet. This proposal includes 225,822 square feet of research and development, 93,375 square feet of office space, 3,926 square feet of retail, 4,192 square feet of personal service, and 45 car parking spaces in an underground garage. The parcel is zoned CMX-4, Core Commercial Mixed-Use, and is a by-right project by utilizing the following zoning bonuses: Green Building, Underground Parking, and Public Art. In order to use the Public Art bonus, the project team will need to get approval from the Philadelphia Art Commission.

At its meeting of December 6, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: (Spruce Hill Community Association & 27<sup>th</sup> Republican Ward))**

A representative from Spruce Hill Community Association had the following comments:

The RCO members appreciated the inclusion of ground level retail space, however, they wish there was even more retail space. The representative understands the limitations of this building mass but the final design is not as strong as they had hoped. They don't believe that the building design responds to the historic context of the surrounding neighborhood. They related that the building has a very calm, reserved, and quiet presence but they had hoped for a more compelling and interesting design.

A representative from 27th Republican Ward had the following comments:

The representative stated that this proposed building was an attractive replacement of what currently exists on the site. However, they also noted that the proposed design has the neighborhood losing retail space as compared to what is there now. In general, the RCO would like to see more retail space along both Chestnut and 38<sup>th</sup> Streets.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



### **CDR Committee Comments**

The CDR Committee had the following comments:

The Committee noted that this is a very elegant and simple building in terms of the material palette and is a good addition to the neighborhood.

The Committee had a few comments concerning the building's retail space. They agreed with the RCO comments regarding wanting more retail space. The Committee also encouraged the project team to create a more direct entry to retail spaces for loading as there is no direct path currently without going through the lobby.

The Committee commended the project team for pursuing LEED Platinum certification. Committee members reminded the project team that they can also get bonus LEED points if they provide additional bike amenities like showers.

While the Committee had positive comments on the building's sustainability, they remarked that the same level of caretaking should be extended to the public realm. The Committee also asked for continuous tree pits, noting that there may be underground utilities to contend with, but they would allow for an increased plant palette.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, [mdesigns@msn.com](mailto:mdesigns@msn.com)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Jamie Gauthier, Council District 3, [jamie.gauthier@phila.gov](mailto:jamie.gauthier@phila.gov)  
Andrew Goodman, Representative to Council District 3, [andrew.goodman@phila.gov](mailto:andrew.goodman@phila.gov)  
Craig Sobeski, Perkins & Will, [Craig.Sobeski@perkinswill.com](mailto:Craig.Sobeski@perkinswill.com)  
Peter Kelsen, BlankRome, [peter.kelsen@blankrome.com](mailto:peter.kelsen@blankrome.com)  
Alex Adarichev, Botanic Properties, [aadarichev@botanicproperties.com](mailto:aadarichev@botanicproperties.com)  
Barry Grossbach, Spruce Hill Community Association, [b.grossbach@gmail.com](mailto:b.grossbach@gmail.com)  
Timothy Reimer, 27th Republican Ward, [timothy\\_reimer@hotmail.com](mailto:timothy_reimer@hotmail.com)  
Netrisa Dockery, Parkside Area Community Association, [netrisat@yahoo.com](mailto:netrisat@yahoo.com)  
Kyle Sampson, West Philadelphia Economic Development Council, [publicpolicy@gmx.com](mailto:publicpolicy@gmx.com)  
Gary Jonas, Drexel Area Property Association, [dapaboard@gmail.com](mailto:dapaboard@gmail.com)  
Ang Sun, Ph.D., West Philly United Neighbors, [WPUNRCO@gmail.com](mailto:WPUNRCO@gmail.com)  
Nicole Ozdemir, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [nicole.ozdemir@phila.gov](mailto:nicole.ozdemir@phila.gov)  
Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [cheli.r.dahal@phila.gov](mailto:cheli.r.dahal@phila.gov)  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, [michelle.brisbon@phila.gov](mailto:michelle.brisbon@phila.gov)



Department of Planning and Development

## Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

---

Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, [kisha.duckett@phila.gov](mailto:kisha.duckett@phila.gov)

Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, [jeanien.wilson@phila.gov](mailto:jeanien.wilson@phila.gov)

Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)

Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)



**December 14, 2022**

Frederick Marshall  
Department of Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, Concourse  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Andrea Gonzalez  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Clarissa Redding, RA  
Leonidas Addimando  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

**Re: Civic Design Review for 4040 Walnut Street (Application # ZP-2022-007683)**

Dear Frederick Marshall,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use building at 4040 Walnut Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project is a 12-story, mixed-use proposal with over 160,000 square feet. The proposal includes 5,000 square feet of retail space at the ground level, over 15,000 square feet of office space at the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor, and over 130,000 square feet of residential space at floors 3-12 with 135 new dwelling units provided. 23 vehicle parking spaces and 48 bicycle parking spaces are provided. The existing zoning is CMX-3. The proposal does not require variances and is making use of the mixed-income housing bonus, payment in lieu.

At its meeting of December 6, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: (27<sup>th</sup> Republican Ward; Spruce Hill Zoning Association; West Philly Plan + Preserve; Andrew Goodman on behalf of Councilmember Gauthier)**

Each of the groups present noted the applicant's willingness to meet with community members and meaningfully respond to concerns. The RCOs are eager to continue to engage with the team to ensure the project is built to the same high quality as what is currently being proposed.

**CDR Committee Comments**

The Committee was appreciative of the team's efforts to work improve the proposal based on community feedback and staff concerns. The improved materials and removal of the Walnut Street curb cut are particularly laudable. The Committee noted the opportunity to continue to give attention to the 41<sup>st</sup> Street façade to make it more inviting and less linear. Landscape or play elements were suggested as potential opportunities to achieve this. The continued development of the proposed public open space off Walnut Street is encouraged to ensure it is welcoming and vibrant. It was likewise suggested that the team give more consideration to the potential traffic impacts of the proposal to Chancellor Street, and opportunities to

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



further break up the bulk of the building massing. Overall, the response to the proposal was positive.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Councilmember Gauthier, Council District 3, jaime.gauthier@phila.gov  
Andrew Goodman, Director of Equitable Development to Council District 3, andrew.goodman@phila.gov  
Brian O'Connor, Cube 3, info@cube3.com  
Ron Patterson, Klehr Harrison et al, rpatterson@klehr.com  
Barry Grossbach, Spruce Hill Community Association, b.grossbach@gmail.com  
Timothy Reimer, 27th Republican Ward, timothy\_reimer@hotmail.com  
Mary McGettigan, West Philly Plan + Preserve, westphillyplanpreserve@gmail.com  
Kyle Sampson, West Philadelphia Economic Development Council, publicpolicy@gmx.com  
Gary Jonas, Drexel Area Property Association, dapaboard@gmail.com  
Ang Sun, Ph.D., West Philly United Neighbors, WPUNRCO@gmail.com  
Nicole Ozdemir, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, nicole.ozdemir@phila.gov  
Frederick Marshall, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, frederick.marshall@phila.gov  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov