



August 3, 2022

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Kelsey, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

Re: Civic Design Review for 500-10 S Broad Street (Application # ZP-2022-001570)

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 500-10 S Broad Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a 1.67-acre unity of use over 10 lots located between South and Lombard Streets with frontage on S Broad Street. The site includes the former Health Center 1, which is on the local Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The proposal includes a 516,907 square foot residential tower on the southwest corner of Broad and Lombard Streets containing 468 residential units. The proposal also includes the renovation of the former Health Center into 60,565 square feet of commercial space, 208 bike parking spaces, and 30 below grade parking spaces. 20 parking spaces are provided off-site at 404-14 S. Watts Street. The site is zoned CMX-4. With the usage of the underground parking and green building zoning bonuses, this proposal is by-right.

At its meeting of August 2, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (Center City Residents Association)

The Center City Residents Association had no specific design comments but noted that they are working with the development team on a community benefits agreement and that their previous design concerns have been incorporated into the design.

RCO Comments: (South Street West Business Association)

The representative from the South Street West Business Association expressed support for the project's design and attention to detail and encouraged the development team to work with SEPTA to better incorporate the subway entrance into the design.

CDR Committee Comments

Before the committee offered feedback to the development team, a considerable number of residents of the nearby Symphony House expressed concerns with the scale of the development.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



Although the committee was largely supportive of the project's design, it was noted by the chair that it is problematic that a large group of nearby residents feel they have been left out of the RCO process. However, the committee noted that Civic Design Review is not the best outlet for these concerns.

Members of the Civic Design Review committee expressed appreciation for the slim tower design as well as for the restoration of the facade of the existing medical building. However, members felt that the plaza design is too simple and expressed a desire for more greenery and the inclusion of public art.

One member of the committee thought that a project of this scale should make a greater gesture towards walkability with well detailed pedestrian amenities.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Kenyatta Johnson, 2nd District, kenyatta.johnson@phila.gov
Christopher Sample, Office of Councilmember Johnson, christopher.sample@phila.gov
Frantz Pierre, Office of Councilmember Johnson, frantz.pierre@phila.gov
Robert Fluehr, The Goldenberg Group, RFluehr@goldenberggroup.com
Paul Badger, The Badger Group, plb@thebadgergrouppllc.com
Kevin Smith, Stantec, kevin.smith@stantec.com
Antonio Fiol-Silva, SITIO, afs@SITIOau.com
Ronald Patterson, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, rpatterson@klehr.com
Travis Oliver, Center City Residents Association, centercityresidents@centercityresidents.org
Marcus Ferreira, South Street West Business Association, excomm-sswba@googlegroups.com
Madeline Shikomba, North of Washington Ave Coalition, northofwashingtonavenuecoalition@gmail.com
Paulose Issac, Department of Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Ian.Litwin@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



August 5, 2022

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP
Clarissa Kelsey, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

Re: Civic Design Review for 619 N Broad St (Application #: ZP-2021-016023)

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 619 N Broad Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The proposal is for a mixed-use building totaling 118,746 square feet containing 119 dwelling units, 3,791 square feet of commercial space, 34 below-grade automobile parking spaces, and 40 class 1A bicycle parking spaces. The proposal is by-right under CMX-4 zoning.

This proposal was reviewed at CDR on June 7, 2022 and August 2, 2022. At the August 2 meeting, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments (14th Ward Democratic Executive Committee):

The 14th Ward Democratic Executive Committee had two main concerns with the proposal. The first was the use of gray bricks and yellow accents. The RCO prefers the use of red brick to maintain continuity with community. The second concern was with the lack of affordable units.

CDR Committee Comments

After some revisions were made by the design team in response to feedback provided at the June 7 CDR meeting, the CDR Committee was still not pleased with the design of the project, the applicant's interaction with the RCO, and the minimal changes made to the design.

The chair of the CDR Committee expressed frustration that the design, even after revisions, is not in keeping with the quality expected of developments on Broad Street. It was noted that only minor changes were made in response to CDR Committee comments despite two months' time between CDR meetings. The Committee was specifically disappointed that their comments relating to arcade column spacing and the arrangement of ground floor uses was misunderstood. A member of the committee clarified that residential units on the ground floor should be removed, reduced in number, or reconfigured to allow for larger retail spaces and more bike parking. This change would also allow for residential units to be aligned with the columns of the arcade.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



The committee agreed with the concerns of the RCO that material choices are out of context. Furthermore, the committee didn't think the proposed arcade was successful in disguising the boxy and flat appearance of the building.

Lastly, the committee commented on the floorplans provided for one-bedroom units. The committee was disappointed that the development team prioritized unit count over well designed units.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Council President Darrell Clarke, Council District 5, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Sharla Russell, Neighborhood Development/Planning Specialist, sharla.russell@phila.gov
Mary Jones, Legislative Counsel, mary.jones@phila.gov
Katherine E. Missimer, Esq., Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, kmissimer@klehr.com
Tim Lux, Tierview Development, tim@tierviewdevelopment.com
Jordan Mrazik, Bright Common, mrazik@brightcommon.com
Diane Monroe, 14th Ward Democratic Executive Committee, Diana.Davis@comcast.net
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com
Vivian VanStory, Community Land Trust Corporation, communitylandtrustcorp0@gmail.com
Paulose Issac, Department of Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Ian.Litwin@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



August 2, 2022

Roland Ngaba
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Kelsey, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

Re: Civic Design Review for 1807-27 E Huntingdon Street (Application # ZP- 2022-004084)

Dear Mr. Ngaba,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed industrial and residential mixed-use development at 1807-27 E Huntingdon Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes an addition and overbuild of an existing industrial building resulting in an industrial and residential mixed-use project of 115,596 square feet with 80 multi-family units, 38,158 square feet of industrial space, and 24 vehicular parking spaces. The site is bound by Huntingdon Street to the south, Harold Street to the north and private parcels to the east and west. To the west there is a structure on the Philadelphia Register of Historic places and at the end of the block is the Market-Frankford El transit line Huntingdon Station.

At its meeting of August 2, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments, which include Planning Commission staff observations adopted by the CDR Committee. A RCO representative was not present at the meeting, but a letter was received confirming the RCO meeting.

CDR Committee Comments

The Committee supported the architectural design and the development team's approach to a site with a legacy industrial building, including its incorporation and reuse as an industrial space. They noted the good scale of the architectural elements, the use and mix of building materials and the façade design, which has a play of form and space that works well with the sidewalks and street, especially at the main residential entry. The committee noted how the structure created good connections to and relationships with the old and new elements of building.

The committee supported the design and placement of plantings and landscape elements, including planter boxes at the windows and roof gardens at the decks. They encouraged the applicant to pursue more native plantings and avoid fountain grasses. They also encouraged the applicant to add more street trees and place them in continuous pits for the best growth. Street trees, either as replacement or

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



new trees should be species which support a good shade canopy. The committee notes that there are no overhead wires on these frontages which would limit tree size.

The applicant should also explore a unit mix which includes larger 2- and 3-bedroom units which support workforce housing for families. The project should also incorporate bicycle U-racks on Huntingdon Street which will support more bicycle use for occupants and workers in the industrial spaces.

For sustainable design, the committee encourages the installation of rooftop solar photovoltaic panels and notes that such installations are likely to become more economically feasible as energy prices continue to rise. The applicant is also encouraged to achieve more metrics from the sustainable design checklist and to pursue 3rd party sustainable design certification.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
City Councilmember Mark Squilla, mark.squilla@phila.gov
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov
Jennifer Slavic, Constituent Services Representative,
Jennifer.slavic@phila.gov
Jose Hernandez, JKRP Architects, johern@jkrparchitects.com
Steve Bertil, Troutman Pepper, Steve.bertil@troutman.com
Foster Hardiman, East Kensington Neighbors Association, info@ekna.org
Jessica Hoffman, New Kensington CDC, nwesterman@nkcdc.org
Roland Ngaba, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections,
roland.ngaba@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



August 3, 2022

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Kelsey, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

Re: Civic Design Review for 2300 Market Street (Application # ZP-2022-004497)

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed office building at 2300 Market Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes an office building totaling 192,706 square feet of gross square feet. This proposal renovates one existing building, demolishes one, and saves the front façade of the third one. It includes office, research and development spaces, 14 underground parking spaces, and three loading spaces. The parcel zoned CMX-4 is a by-right project and is utilizing underground parking and green building bonuses.

At its meeting of August 2, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: Center City Residents' Association (CCRA)

The RCO representative mentioned that there had been another proposal at this location for which Center City Residents' Association (CCRA) had entered into a Community Benefits Agreement with the developer. The RCO representative appreciated that the new owner had voluntarily asked CCRA for a new agreement that incorporated all of the benefits from the first proposal.

The CCRA representative expressed their satisfaction for the new building design, the welcoming ground floor, and the addition of green spaces as part of this proposal and mentioned that the community was unanimously in support of it.

CDR Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee chair mentioned it was gratifying to see how the development team had been willing to work with the community. The Committee chair agreed that the design of the building was commendable, and the building massing and materials were agreeable, mentioning that the new massing complemented the existing buildings, and the material differentiation and the horizontal gap between the existing and new construction is effective.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



One committee member discussed the current condition of the Market Street sidewalk in this area which is unsafe for walking. Another committee member asked the development team about which on-site renewable energy metrics they had considered for this proposal and mentioned that most of the surrounding buildings either had green roofs or solar panels. The development team responded that the project was seeking LEED Gold certification, however the abundance of mechanical equipment on the roof of the life science buildings made it challenging to consider more on-site renewable energy metrics like green roofs or solar panels.

Lastly, the CDR Committee adopted the Planning Commission staff comments:

Site Design

- Staff appreciate the addition of street trees on both Market and 23rd Street sidewalks.
- Please show planters on Market Street sidewalk consistently through the document per the Streets Department requirements. Please note that planters will require encroachment legislation. Also, consider maximizing the soil volume to ensure tree survival.
- Coordinate with PennDOT for the proposed two-way bicycle trail along Market Street (currently in the final design stage) and the possible connection of this site with the trail.
- Staff note that the internal bicycle storage is only identified in the previous zoning plan, please update the basement plan to include it. A ground floor location would be preferred.
- Staff appreciate the inclusion of a café on the Market Street as an amenity for the tenants and for the community use. Staff understands the grade change along Market Street, however, believes that a connection between this space and the sidewalk could be helpful.
- There are two bus stops around the perimeter of this development. Please look into the addition of a bus shelter where possible. Please reach out to Neil Garry neil.garry@phila.gov for coordination.

Building Design

- Staff commends the development team for preserving the existing building and supports the new building massing and materials which respect and highlight the existing building massing and materials.
- Staff appreciates the gap between the existing building and the overbuild to use as an outdoor space which also works aesthetically.

Parking Design

- Staff appreciates the location of parking and loading spaces in the basement and all the service areas on the Ludlow St side.
- Staff supports utilizing the existing curb cuts for the parking garage and the loading docks.
- Please illustrate how the trucks would maneuver inside the loading spaces.

Sustainable Design

- Staff applauds the development team for striving for LEED Gold certification.



- Staff appreciates coordinating with SEPTA regarding their subway facilities and with the Streets Department regarding the timing of sidewalk closures given other nearby developments.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Kenyatta Johnson, Kenyatta.johnson@phila.gov
Joshua Harris, Director of Legislation, Joshua.harris@phila.gov
Frantz Pierre, Legislative Assistant, Frantz.pierre@phila.gov
Jeremy Leman, Kieran Timberlake, jleman@kierantimberlake.com
Jared Klein, BlankRome, jared.klein@blankrome.com
Travis Oliver, Center City Residents Association, centercityresidents@centercityresidents.org
Matthew Whitehorn, Fidler Square Neighborhood Association, benkeys@gmail.com
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Ian.litwin@phila.gov
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



August 2, 2022

Paulose Issac
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Kelsey, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

Re: Civic Design Review for 3200-22 Arch Street (Application # ZP-2022-002438)

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 3200-22 Arch Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a commercial mixed-use building totaling 507,504 square feet of gross square feet. This proposal includes 423,450 square feet of office, medical lab and research & development space, 12,887 square feet of accessory uses, and 12,365 square feet of retail/commercial uses. The proposal also includes 56,802 square feet of accessory parking garage space. The parcel is zoned CMX-4 Core Commercial Mixed Use and is a by-right project.

At its meeting of August 2, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

RCO Comments: (Powelton Village Civic Association)

The RCO representative stated that the community in general had a very positive reaction to the proposed project. She noted the strong design of the building and appreciated how the project addresses both Cuthbert and 33rd Streets. The representative also noted their appreciation of the project team's commitment to LEED Gold and to preserving existing mature trees around the site. She did also highlight that 32nd Street is a heavily trafficked street and asked if anything further could be done to mitigate conflicts between pedestrians and vehicles.

CDR Committee Comments

The committee overall was very supportive of the proposal. They commended the project team for creating a project that was very strong in every element the CDR committee reviews, including design, public realm, urban design, architecture and sustainable design. The committee appreciated the thoughtful design and excellent choice of building materials.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



The committee stated that the project will be a welcome addition to the neighborhood. They particularly applauded the multipurpose space at 32nd and Cuthbert Streets but asked the project team to consider placing the secure student access point back into the interior of the building to allow greater public access to more of the amenities, noting that there are many other examples of institutional buildings that look nice but are closed to the public. They also noted that the planned Cuthbert Walk will serve the neighborhood well. The committee encouraged the project team to hire from the surrounding community to create a diverse workforce.

The committee asked the project team to remove Zelkova trees from the planting palette of the project.

Additionally, the committee incorporated staff comments, which focused on asking for safety measures along 32nd Street, seeking to minimize pedestrian and vehicle conflicts. 32nd Street is classified as a high-volume pedestrian street, and this is where the parking garage access and loading dock are located.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Gauthier, Council District 3, jamie.gauthier@phila.gov
Andrew Goodman, Representative to Council District 3, andrew.goodman@phila.gov
Stephanie Boggs Magagna, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, SBoggs@klehr.com
Scott O'Daniel, Robert A.M Stern Architects, LLP, s.odaniel@ramsa.com
John Phillips, Powelton Village Civic Association, president@poweltonvillage.org
Bernadette Ingrid Wyche, 24th Democratic Ward, biwyche1@gmail.com
Kevin Brown, People's Emergency Center Community Development Corporation, KevinB@pec-cares.org
Gary Jonas, Drexel Area Property Association, dapaboard@gmail.com
Nicole Ozdemir, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, nicole.ozdemir@phila.gov
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



August 5, 2022

Mark Griffenberg
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Andrea Gonzalez
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Clarissa Kelsey, RA
Leonidas Addimando
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA

Re: Civic Design Review for 4746-48 Spruce Street (Application # ZP-2021-006060)

Dear Mr. Griffenberg,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 4746-48 Spruce Street.

This letter is a summary of the Civic Design Review Committee's advisory recommendations. It is not an expression of the City Planning Commission's recommendation or opinion regarding zoning variances, special exceptions, or other discretionary approvals associated with this proposal.

The project proposes a 12-story mixed-use building totaling 192,141 gross square feet on a 0.6 acre site. This proposal includes 36,851 square feet of lobby and commercial space on floors 1 and 2, 170 dwelling units on floors 3-11, and 5,700 square feet of residential amenity space on floor 12. 28 automobile parking spaces and 76 bicycle parking spaces are provided in a below-grade garage. The parcel is zoned CMX-3 Community Commercial Mixed-Use and is a by-right project. A bonus for Mixed Income Housing is being utilized, providing payment to the fund in lieu of on-site affordable housing.

At its meeting of August 2, 2022, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

Jonas Maciunas, RCO Garden Court Community Association (coordinating)

Jonas Maciunas offered support for the proposal with several suggestions for improvements:

- Maciunas highlighted the group's concern about the curb cut on 48th Street for the required loading dock. He noted that this loading dock may result in the frequent obstruction of the sidewalk, which could pose a danger to pedestrian safety and bicycle routes.
- To the proposal's materiality, Maciunas asked that the team ensure the material palette for the sidewalk is high-quality, authentic, and durable, but suggested a reconsideration of the building materials, particularly at the lower floors, to better reflect the community context.
- Maciunas also suggested that a unit mix that included family style accommodations would better support the neighborhood.
- The lack of on-site affordable housing was also cited.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



Mary McGettigan, RCO West Philly Plan + Preserve

Mary McGettigan spoke to the proposal in the broader neighborhood context, noting:

- The proposal missed an opportunity to better relate to the existing building stock in its scale and material selection.
- McGettigan would like to see this, and other nearby development proposals better coordinated with accessible green spaces and the surrounding communities.

Andrew Goodman, on behalf of Councilperson Gautier's office

Andrew Goodman added that:

- The design decisions undertaken by this team are of amplified importance at this site given the proximity of community resources.
- Goodman asked for additional consideration of the civic condition created by how the building meets the street in terms of materiality, green space, and access.

Civic Design Review Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee echoed the RCO and Councilperson's concerns about the scale of the proposal, the materiality of building, and the need to better reference the neighborhood context. Additionally:

- The proposal was described as a residential building with the appearance of an office building. The inclusion of balconies was noted as a strategy to consider.
- The Committee reiterated the importance of a family-friendly unit mix to support families living in a transit and amenity-rich neighborhood, noting that these units would likely result in slower unit turnover as well. The inclusion of family friendly units would reduce the overall number of units, thereby also reducing overall parking demand in the neighborhood.
- The lack of on-site affordable housing is likewise a missed opportunity.
- The inclusion of underground parking and a strong commercial presence at the ground floor was applauded.
- While the commercial and retail included in the proposal was lauded, committee members noted the size and layout may not offer opportunities for smaller tenants.
- There were several comments regarding greening, encouraging the team to gang the soil for trees where possible and ensure the long-term care of the green wall is planned for to allow for both to be vibrant neighborhood amenities.
- The committee asked that the team support the safety of those traveling in the bike lanes however possible.
- Finally, the team was encouraged to pursue on-site renewable energy strategies, particularly photovoltaic panels. Members noted the investment would be minimal given the resulting savings in energy costs.



In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Gautier, Council District 3, jamie.gauthier@phila.gov
Andrew Goodman, Director of Equitable Development to Council District 3, andrew.goodman@phila.gov
Herb J. Schultz IV, PZS Architects, hschultz@hs4arch.com
Michael V. Phillips, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, mphilips@klehr.com
Mary Allegra, Garden Court Community Association, Zoning@gardencourtca.org
Denise Furey, 46th Republican Ward, denise.furey@wolfe.org
Mary McGettigan, West Philly Plan + Preserve, westphillyplanpreserve@gmail.com
Catherine Blunt, 46th Ward Democratic Committee, 46wardrco@gmail.com
Kyle Sampson, West Philadelphia Economic Development Council, publicpolicy@gmx.com
Ang Sun, Ph.D., West Philly United Neighbors, woshiang@gmail.com
Gary Jonas, Drexel Area Property Association, dapaboard@gmail.com
Nicole Ozdemir, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, nicole.ozdemir@phila.gov
Mark Griffenberg, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, mark.griffenberg@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov