June 29, 2022

Philadelphia Art Commission
1515 Arch St., 13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

RE: Art Commission Submission #2 – Broad Street/Germantown Avenue/Erie Avenue (BGE) Triangles
Broad Street (S.R. 0611), Germantown Avenue (S.R. 4005) and Erie Avenue (S.R. 1004),
City of Philadelphia, Philadelphia County, PA

Members of the Art Commission,

We are requesting to be placed on the July 13, 2022 Art Commission meeting agenda and will submit our presentation materials by Wednesday, July 6, 2022. This will be the second review of the City’s project at Broad, Germantown, and Erie.

Project Information:
The City of Philadelphia, including the Managing Directors Office, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability (OTIS), the Philadelphia City Planning Commission (PCPC), and the Commerce Department have identified and commenced a transportation planning/engineering and placemaking project which will improve the existing traffic operations and pedestrian/mobility functions in and around the expanded intersection of North Broad Street, Erie Avenue and Germantown Avenue in North Philadelphia.

The effort is conducted as a two-fold approach, with the initial portion concentrating on conceptual development and preliminary design - resulting in a recommended scheme/approach of improvements to be taken to the design stage. In addition to the roadway and traffic signal improvements, streetscape and landscaping improvements will be provided throughout the project site. Two triangles adjacent to the Broad Street/Germantown Avenue/Butler Street (Butler Triangle) and Broad Street/Germantown Avenue/Erie Avenue (Erie Triangle) intersections will be enhanced with new streetscape and landscape elements. It should be noted, the work on the Erie Triangle location is also being coordinated with the design being developed by SEPTA to provide elevator access to the Broad Street Line’s Erie Station.

Project Scope:
The Butler Triangle, which is bound by Broad Street, Germantown Avenue, and Butler Street is currently a combination of concrete sidewalk and grass/vegetation. Small businesses and restaurants are present along Germantown Avenue. Prior to 2021, the vegetation was overgrown and damaged, and no amenities were provided for sitting or gathering. The City installed temporary improvements to Butler Triangle in summer 2021, which had been presented to this Commission. The site has little to no safety from vehicles and also has various utility boxes and manholes within the space. The proposed plan is based on community feedback and includes a variety of seating opportunities, a lawn, specialty paving, overhead lights, planting, and bollards.
The Erie Triangle, which is bound by Broad Street, Germantown Avenue, and Erie Avenue is currently primarily concrete with a bus stop and shelter along Germantown Avenue. Many small businesses and some historical buildings surround the Erie Triangle. This triangle is smaller than the Butler Triangle, but the proposed plan includes some of the same materials such as seating, specialty paving, and planting to help tie the two triangles together and improve the experience of pedestrians, transit riders, and customers of the business corridor. The overall project construction costs are estimated to be approximately $6.5 million. The construction costs associated with the improvements to both the triangles is estimated to be approximately $1 million. We hope you find this submission package satisfactory.

Response to Concept Review Comments
In the first review of this project, the Commissioners provided a range of valuable feedback on our project that we have sought to address. Major comments from the review included:

- Ensure that adequate maintenance is in place to care for the space (e.g. lawn watering, trash cans, and litter removal).
  - We are developing a maintenance agreement with community partners. This will include lawn and plant watering, which is currently and will continue to be done using the fire hydrant, as well as daily sweeping and trash can emptying.
  - Plans have been revised to show trash can locations.

- Ensure bollards and ADA ramps meeting requirements.
  - We have ensured that sidewalks meet their required widths; bollards will be placed to ensure adequate access to the sidewalk and the SEPTA elevator; we chose not to realign the crosswalk ramp across Germantown Avenue at the SE corner of the Erie Triangle because doing so would create a longer pedestrian crosswalk.

- Increase tree canopy on Butler Triangle.
  - Larger species of trees were chosen for the tree pits along Butler Street
  - We were able to add one additional street tree along Broad Street but could not add additional vegetation or trees due to heavy utility conflicts and subway grates in the sidewalk area.

- Provide adequate shelter for bus passengers
  - We are updating our final bus shelter locations. Shelters will be provided at the H/XH stop at the NW corner, 53/56 stop on the SW corner, and the 53/56 stop on the NE corner. The northbound Route 23 stop on Germantown at Erie (in front of Max's Steaks) is too tight to add a shelter, but we will expand the sidewalk space with a bumpout here.
  - Regarding the southbound Route 23 stop on the Erie Triangle: SEPTA is currently considering alterations to the Route 23 as part of their Bus Revolution project. In lieu of installing a shelter here that could need to be removed in coming years, we have opted to build a landscaped seating area that also serves as an amenity for local restaurants by providing a comfortable place to sit outside. This has the added benefit of (a) providing much more seating than a standard bus shelter would provide and (b) allow us to add two trees and plantings to the Erie Triangle. Ultimately, while we understand that this does not provide a shelter structure at this location, we believe that the addition of a landscaped seating area will produce a greater benefit for all users of this public plaza than a single bus shelter would provide.
  - There was also a public comment requesting parking removal or a bumpout at the bus stop at the Butler Triangle. This was unable to be accommodated because SEPTA buses currently must pull into the parking lane there in order to change drivers. Given this is an important operation for SEPTA and a convenient location next to the BSL, we felt this could not be altered.
  - Lastly, we are also now planning to include two new Transit Kiosk products in this project. The two kiosks at BGE will provide real-time bus arrival information as well as public service
announcements and advertising space. These will be owned and maintained by the City through its street furniture contract. If, for some unforeseen reason, these kiosks are not available for this project on our construction timeline, we will opt to integrate digital signage into the bus shelters to provide real-time information for passengers.

If you have any questions, or if you require additional information, please contact Andrew Simpson at andrew.simpson@phila.gov.

Sincerely,

Andrew Simpson
Transit Project Manager, Office of Complete Streets
Managing Director’s Office of Transportation, Infrastructure, & Sustainability
Broad, Germantown, and Erie Project

Art Commission Presentation

July 13, 2022
Project Overview
The intersection is a public transportation hub and shopping district, with remarkable architecture, rich history, and a strong community.

Previous investment in the area has not reflected this.

In 2017, the Mayor formed the Broad, Germantown, and Erie Task Force to build on the community's work to correct this disparity.
BGE Project Site

- Two new plaza spaces for neighbors, transit users and broader community
- Bike and Bus lane improvements on Erie Avenue
- Vision Zero safety improvements along all three corridors
- New SEPTA elevator (Art Commission to review at a later date)
- Percent for Art integration (Art Commission to review at a later date)
Traffic Safety

- Intersection and traffic signal upgrades at Broad & Erie & Germantown
- New traffic signal at Erie & 13th
- Separated bike lanes and bus-only lanes on Erie Ave
- Floating bus islands on Erie Ave
- Vision Zero pedestrian safety improvements along all three corridors (safer crosswalks; extended pedestrian medians on Broad; speed tables on Germantown)
What we heard on April 13
Key Comments from April Art Commission Meeting

- Consider bus transit riders and ways to incorporate bus shelter(s)
- Need for maintenance plan, trash cans and watering/irrigation
- There are additional opportunities for greening and larger trees
- Review locations of bollards, ADA ramps, planters
- Consider starting % for Art engagement sooner
Butler and Erie Triangle Improvements
Transit Amenities

- High-Rider Shelter (1)
- Standard Shelter (2)
- Transit Kiosk (2 - Pending Availability)

Furniture not to scale; Final locations will be submitted for administrative approval
Transit Amenities

Transit Kiosk
(Pending Availability)

Standard Shelter

High-Rider Shelter
EXISTING CONDITION
EXISTING CONDITION: BUTLER TRIANGLE

NEED TO PROTECT SITE FROM VEHICLES

INTERSECTION IS BUSY AND LOUD

OVERGROWN VEGETATION

UTILITY BOX AND MANHOLES ON PROPERTY LINE

DAMAGED STREET TREES
EXISTING CONDITION: ERIE TRIANGLE

MAJORITY OF BUSINESSES ARE RESTAURANTS

HISTORIC BUILDINGS

BUS STOP PROPOSED TO REMAIN

MANY SMALL BUSINESSES
DESIGN PROPOSAL: PREVIOUS PLAN RENDERING

ERIE TRIANGLE

- N BROAD ST
- GERMANTOWN AVE
- ERA
- WMH

- Elevator Entrance
- Concrete Unit Pavers
- Metal Planter
- Precast Concrete Seat Wall
- Cube Seating
- Bike Rack
- Bollard
DESIGN PROPOSAL: CURRENT PLAN RENDERING
MATERIALS AND FURNISHINGS

BIKE RACK

BENCH

CUBE SEATING

BOLLARD

METAL PLANTER

CONCRETE UNIT PAVERS

ERIE TRIANGLE
PLANTING

Nyssa sylvatica

Lysimachia nummularia

Echinacea purpurea

Waldsteinia fragarioides

Diervilla lonicera 'Copper'

Sporobolus heterolepis

Rudbeckia fulgida var. fulgida

Amsônia 'Blue Ice'

Nepeta 'Early Bird'

Liriope muscari

Panicum virgatum
DESIGN PROPOSAL: CURRENT PLAN RENDERING

- Concrete Unit Pavers
- Curved Bench
- Permeable Tree Trench
- Lawn
- Bistro Seating
- String Lighting
- Cube Seating
- Curved Bench
- Bike Rack
- Trash Receptacle
- Bollard
- Tree Grate
- Precast Concrete Seat Wall

BUTLER TRIANGLE
MATERIALS AND FURNISHINGS

- String Lights and Poles
- Bike Rack
- Precast Concrete Seat-Wall
- Bistrot Seating
- Cube Seating
- Curved Bench
- Tree Grate
- Permeable Tree Trench
- Concrete Unit Pavers
- Bollard
- Butler Triangle
NORTH TRIANGLE PLANT SCHEDULE

DESIGN PROPOSAL: PLANTING PLAN

Canopy Trees
1. Platanus x acerifolia 'Bloodgood'
   - Botanical Name: Platanus x acerifolia
   - Common Name: Bloodgood London Plane Tree
   - Size: 3" - 3 1/2" cal.
   - As Shown: Specimen Quality, B&B

2. Gleditsia triacanthos inermis 'Skyline'
   - Botanical Name: Gleditsia triacanthos
   - Common Name: Skyline Honeylocust
   - Size: 3" - 3 1/2" cal.
   - As Shown: Specimen Quality, B&B

3. Nyssa sylvatica
   - Botanical Name: Nyssa sylvatica
   - Common Name: Blackgum
   - Size: 3" - 3 1/2" cal.
   - As Shown: Specimen Quality, B&B

Ornamental Trees
2. Amelanchier grandiflora 'Autumn Brilliance'
   - Botanical Name: Amelanchier grandiflora
   - Common Name: Autumn Brilliance Serviceberry
   - Size: 10' - 12' ht.
   - As Shown: Specimen Quality, B&B, Multistem

Shrubs
30. Hypericum kalmianum
   - Botanical Name: Hypericum kalmianum
   - Common Name: St. John's Wort
   - Size: #2
   - As Shown

Ornamental Grasses
42. Carex vulpinoidea
   - Botanical Name: Carex vulpinoidea
   - Common Name: Fox Sedge
   - Size: #1

Perennials
91. Asclepias tuberosa
   - Botanical Name: Asclepias tuberosa
   - Common Name: Butterfly Weed
   - Size: #1

28. Echinacea purpurea
   - Botanical Name: Echinacea purpurea
   - Common Name: Purple Coneflower
   - Size: #1
PLANTING

Platanus × acerifolia
Gleditsia triacanthos
Nyssa sylvatica
Amelanchier grandiflora
Hypericum kalmianum
Carex vulpinoidea
Panicum virgatum ‘Shenandoah’
Asclepias tuberosa
Echinacea purpurea
Waldsteinia fragarioides

BUTLER TRIANGLE
DESIGN PROPOSAL: VIEW 1

PERSPECTIVE FROM CORNER OF BROAD AND BUTLER
DESIGN PROPOSAL: VIEW 4

PERSPECTIVE FROM SIDEWALK AT GERMANTOWN
DESIGN PROPOSAL: VIEW 5

PERSPECTIVE FROM SIDEWALK AT BROAD LOOKING NORTH
Timeline and Next Steps
Budget

• Total approx. project cost: $6.5 mil

• Butler and Erie Triangle approx. cost: $1 mil
Construction Timeline

• Begin % for Art Process – Fall 2022
• Bid/Award – Late 2022
• Construction start – Early 2023
• Construction complete – Late 2023/Early 2024
Thank you!