



Minutes  
The Philadelphia Art Commission  
April 13, 2022 - 9:30 a.m.  
Remote – Zoom Meeting – Hosted by DPZ

The Philadelphia Art  
Commission

Established 1911

Members Present: José Almiñana, Deborah Cahill, Sarah McEneaney, Carmen Febo San Miguel, Raed Nasser, Pepón Osorio, Mario Zacharjasz, and Robert Roesch

Robert Roesch

Chair

José Almiñana

Deborah Cahill

Carmen Febo San Miguel

Sarah McEneaney

Matthew Miller

Raed Nasser

Pepón Osorio

Mario Zacharjasz

**Meeting of the Philadelphia Art Commission**

*Beige Berryman – staff member of the Art Commission – introduced the Zoom platform and remote Art Commission process, noting that the meeting is being recorded and those participating in the meeting are giving their consent to be recorded. A link to the recording, will be posted on the Art Commission website and the meeting agenda and materials can also be found on the website at: (<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/>).*

*Ms. Berryman polled the commission via roll call announcing a quorum, then stated a few instructions for the public. Members of the public may comment on agenda items during the meeting. When the agenda item that you are interested in is being discussed, you can use the “raise hand” feature and staff will unmute you during the public comment period. If you’re joining by phone, you can also use the hand raise feature by dialing \*9 during the public comment period, and if you have any submitted comments through email, staff will read those emails at the appropriate time. Thank you.*

*Chair Roesch called the meeting to order at the minute mark (00:02:28).*

C. Beige Berryman

Staff

**Minutes**

- March 9, 2022, meeting minutes.

Hearing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the March minutes and took a consensus vote.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, the Commission voted unanimously to approve the March minutes.*

## Report of the Sign Committee – March 23, 2022

1. **52-22**  
**Jefferson University Gibbon Building pedestrian bridge signage**  
111 S 11 Street, a.k.a. 1000 Chestnut Street
2. **53-22**  
**One Two Three South Broad**  
123 S Broad Street
3. **54-22**  
**Brooklinen**  
1703 Walnut Street
4. **55-22**  
**Kung Fu Tea**  
2000 Hamilton Street
5. **56-22**  
**Citizens Bank**  
248-50 Market Street
6. **57-22**  
**Delancey Street Parking Garages**  
708 and 711 Delancey Street

Hearing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the recommendations of the Sign Committee from March 23, 2022 (00:30:46).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve Sign Committee Report (8-0).*

## Administrative Agenda

1. **68-22**  
**Annual Sculpture Conservation**  
**Various locations, 30 sculptures**  
Review Type: Public art maintenance  
Project Details: General cleaning and maintenance treatments  
Applicant: Association for Public Art

Ms. Berryman presented the administrative items. First, the Annual Sculpture Conservation proposal, which includes 30 pieces that will undergo general cleaning and conservation treatments during the spring, summer, and fall of 2022.

Hearing no questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve administrative item for the sculpture conservation (00:05:15).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Annual Sculpture Conservation item (8-0).*

## 2. 71-22

### **Lemon Hill Mansion Rehabilitation**

#### **1 Lemon Hill Drive**

Review Type: Minor construction on City property

Project Details: Side porches and main roof maintenance

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Ms. Berryman continued her summary, describing the restoration for this project includes rehabilitation of the side porch structures and the rehabilitation of the main roof at the historic Lemon Hill Mansion.

The exterior visual impact of the roof maintenance is minimal due to the limited visibility of the roof from ground level. The restoration of the side porches includes roof maintenance and selective replacement-in-kind of the wood details of the railings. Lighting on the side porches will be more discreet, and the resulting impact of this work will be no change and exterior appearance or historic character. The scope of work has been approved by the Philadelphia Historical Commission.

Hearing no questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the Lemon Hill Mansion restoration (00:08:31).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser, and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Lemon Hill Mansion rehabilitation (8-0).*

## **Presentations for Final Review**

### 1. 196-20

#### **Vare Recreation Center**

#### **2600 Morris Street**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Site improvements, building renovations, new construction

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Make the World Better Foundation

Alizé Allison, Ian Smith, and Lauren Elachi began the presentation at the minute mark (00:09:30). Mr. Allison gave an overview of the revisions since the last review including the site furnishings details, grading and lighting plan, and support for the Percent for Art project.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:13:26).*

Commissioner Almiñana asked if there was a perimeter fence and inquired about street trees. There is a perimeter fence, and due to constrained space along 27th Street, new trees are proposed along the field edge, interior to the property line. Commissioner Cahill advocated to increase the number of trees being planted to the extent possible, and if budget is a concern, decreasing the herbaceous material would be an agreeable approach for meeting the budget.

*Questions and comments from the public*

Cybee Bloss shared concern about the heat on playing field and advocated for more trees as an alternative.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch suggested the Commission grant final approval with the proviso that the applicant submit their final tree planting plan to staff (00:29:19).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Zacharjasz, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval with the proviso (8-0).*

## **2. 213-21**

### **Paschalville Library 6942 Woodland Avenue**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Site and building improvements

Applicant: Free Library of Philadelphia

Presenter: BFW Group

Cassie O'Donnell, Jim Pecora, Matt Funk, and Sara Schuh presented the project at the minute mark (00:31:07). Mr. Funk reviewed the revisions since the last review including railing details, grading and drainage details, entry reconfiguration materials, the Philadelphia Historical Commission approval, and the Percent for Art plan. Ms. Schuh reviewed the landscape design including "story circle", and planting area near the entry ramp.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:43:03).*

Chairperson Roesch inquired about the maintenance of the plantings and Commissioner Cahill asked if there were a commitment from the library for the maintenance work. A maintenance guide will be provided from the designers.

Commissioner Zacharjasz asked about the lighting and metal railing details as the drawings were unclear. Further discussion continued on the subject.

Chairperson Roesch clarified that the Percent for Art piece would be located in the story circle. Commissioner Almiñana recommended a more generous spacing of the outdoor seating.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for final approval (00:58:31).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (8-0).*

### 3. **43-22**

#### **Fotteral Square 2400 N 11th Street**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Site and amenity improvements

Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

Presenter: Rebuild

Angela Dixon began the presentation at the minute mark (00:59:45). She clarified the tree strategy plan included new caliper replacements to exceed those removed, gave details on the central plantings and grading along 11<sup>th</sup> Street, and the activation of the park space along 11<sup>th</sup> Street through pathways and benches. Finally, she presented details on the Portland Loo amenity.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (01:07:20).*

Chairperson Roesch thanked the presenters for such a comprehensive report. Commissioners Nasser, Zacharjasz, and Febo San Miguel inquired about the maintenance and lighting for the loo. Commissioner Osorio recommended that the “public restroom” sign be in Spanish as well.

Commissioner Zacharjasz asked for more details about the fence and ramp structures near the corner of 12<sup>th</sup> and York Streets. Pedestrian safety protection near the baseball fields is needed here. He asked for additional drawings to be submitted to staff.

Commissioner McEneaney inquired about the Percent for Art requirement, a strategy for which is being worked on between the Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy and Rebuild.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for final approval with the proviso to provide the additional drawing (01:20:51).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval with the proviso (8-0).*

**4. 45-22**

**OY/YO Sculpture**

**5th and Market Streets, near the Weitzman National Museum of American Jewish History**

Review Type: Construction within Independence Hall Area and in public right-of-way

Project Details: Sculpture location

Applicant and presenter: Weitzman National Museum of American Jewish History

Josh Perelman began the presentation at the minute mark (01:22:06). He confirmed that the Streets Department and SEPTA approvals had been granted, and the community partners, including the various Independence Mall organizations, continue to give their full support. The artwork's location on the sidewalk is setback as much as possible, and the "Yo" message is facing outward as it is the more welcoming phrase. Platform details were described.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at minute mark (01:30:54).*

Commissioner Almiñana asked about drainage details for the base plate. Commissioner Febo San Miguel inquired about the languages that any audio or visual interpretations would include. English would be provided first, with others to follow. Commissioner Roesch clarified that the installation was for one year but hoped that permanent display would be possible in the future.

Commissioner Cahill raised concerns about the flow of pedestrian traffic and ADA accessibility. The applicant confirmed that no conflicts for circulation exist for the proposed location.

*Questions and comments from the public (01:36:21).*

Stephen Katovich, historian with Independence Mall, stated they have no objections to the sculpture.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for final approval (01:36:46).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (8-0).*

**5. 148-21**

**Cobbs Creek Golf Course Improvements – Driving Range and Youth Golf Center  
7400 Lansdowne Avenue**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property  
Project Details: Site and building improvements  
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation  
Presenter: Blackney Hayes Architects

Prior to the presentation, Commissioner Febo San Miguel asked for clarification because the project was listed on the agenda as a second review, but the two specific buildings – the driving range and youth golf center – had not been heard yet. Chairperson Roesch responded that the Commission heard the concept review for the overall master plan of the project in September 2021, but this was in fact the first review of the two specific buildings.

Jeffrey Shanahan and John Hayes presented the project at the minute mark (01:39:20). Background of the overall project, community engagement efforts, and phasing were generally described. The specifics of the driving range and education center were then presented. The driving range structure has an agricultural vernacular and includes 84 hitting bays and technology for electronic play. Elevations, materials, and plantings were presented. Likewise, plans, elevations, materials, and plantings were presented for the youth educational center.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (02:00:00).*

Commissioner McEneaney supported the youth center concept, but voiced concern that the related par-3 course for children was not planned until much later in the project. She also asked about funding, if plans for providing discounts for youth were being considered. Commissioner Osorio inquired about transportation access for nearby youth.

Commissioner Almiñana then inquired about the tree replacement strategy for the overall master plan and the irrigation plan. He asked how these two specific buildings were contributing to the tree replacement plan. He asked how the creek restoration, flooding, and the reservoir were related.

Commissioner Zacharjasz observed the large scale of the proposed driving range, and asked for clarification on the location of the natural grass tee-off area.

*Question and comments from the public at the minute mark (02:14:14).*

Candace Jeffries requested that the Commission deny any phase of the project until approval of the streambank restoration is in hand (02:14:14).

Larry Szmulowicz commented on the lack of community engagement and outreach since July 13, 2021.

Timothy Reimer requested that the Commission deny any phase of the project until the restoration plan has been approved.

Danielle Ford requested that the Commission deny the permits until an environmental plan is in place.

Sara Schuh commented on the environmental impact and tree density and type, and asked for more transparency in the process.



Raina Satija had concerns about environmental impact, sustainability, and public use.

Bethany Teigen echoed the environmental concerns and requested for denial of the project.

Shereen Chang asked the Commission to deny approval of the project.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at minute mark (02:29:47).*

Commissioner Zacharjasz voiced gratitude for the public comments. Commissioner Febo San Miguel voiced concern about the lack of clarity on what the Commission is being asked to approve. Commissioner Nasser shared the same concern. Commissioner Zacharjasz asked how the two specific buildings relate to the larger project as a whole. Commissioner Cahill observed the disconnect between the community's comments and the presentation. In terms of inclusion, Commissioner Osorio reiterated his concern about access to the space.

Chairperson Roesch summarized the concerns heard in the discussion including the PA Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) permit approval status, creek restoration details, lighting details, an accounting of tree removal and tree replacement, timeline uncertainty, and the community's disconnect with the process.

In response to Commissioner Febo San Miguel's request for clarity on jurisdiction, Claudia Becker, Counselor for the Art Commission, stated that the driving range and the youth golf center were seeking concept approval. She acknowledged that today's discussion included a wider dialog about the proposal. She summarized the Commission's action in September 2021; the Commission granted concept approval for certain elements within the overall masterplan, including the clubhouse renovation, maintenance facility construction, cart and utility building construction, creek restoration, and pumphouse and reservoir improvements. Lastly, she recommended that the commissioners defer to the experts in the various environmental fields, and perhaps base their decision on the assumption that all required environmental regulations will be followed by the applicant.

Commissioner Almiñana asked a summarizing question, how are these two individual building components contributing to the larger project? Not enough information has not been presented for us to render an informed decision.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for concept approval for the two buildings (02:42:05).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Zacharjasz to approve the two buildings and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana, Ms. Berryman polled the commissioners who all denied the motion: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to deny concept approval (8-0).*

*Commissioner Zacharjasz was not present for the remaining items on the agenda.*



## **Presentations for Concept Review**

### **1. 73-22**

#### **Butler Triangle and Erie Triangle**

#### **Expanded intersection of Broad Street, Germantown Avenue, Erie Avenue**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Construction in the public right-of-way

Applicant: Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability

Presenter: Ground Reconsidered

Matt Wysong from the City Planning Commission introduced the project team and gave an overview of the community engagement (02:44:39). Hope McManus from Ground Reconsidered then described the plaza and landscape design.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (02:58:42).*

Chairperson Roesch asked who would be tending the park. The team is actively involved with the Call to Serve organization who provides maintenance.

Commissioner Almiñana thanked the team for a clear presentation and then asked if the concrete wall was protected from skateboards and bikes, if maintenance vehicles can fit within the walkways, and if the lawn was irrigated.

Commissioner Cahill wondered if the North Broad Street sidewalk needed to be so wide as more green space is preferred. Commissioner Almiñana recommended replacing the two trees to the north of the plaza with one, larger canopy tree. Commissioner Febo San Miguel inquired about managing trash. Commissioner Osorio advocated to keep the bus shelter, as it offers critical protection for people. Commissioner McEneaney asked if the Percent for Art component could start sooner and Commissioner Osorio observed that there may be existing public art on Butler Triangle.

*Questions and comments from the public at the minute mark (03:10:36).*

Heather McClain asked if parking would be allowed on Germantown Avenue and was concerned about maintaining sight lines and visibility with the addition of the landscaping.

Chairperson Roesch summarized the recommendations including planting one large canopy tree, providing more details about trash and recycling, and investigating keeping the bus shelter.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for conceptual approval (03:12:52).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Robert Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for conceptual approval (7-0).*

**2. 74-22**

**Philadelphia Zoo Restroom Improvements**

**3400 W Girard Avenue**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Restroom facility alterations

Applicant: Philadelphia Zoo

Presenter: Woodcock Design, Inc.

The presentation was started by Janice Woodcock, along with Sara Pevaroff Schuh and Julie A. Good at the minute mark (03:14:19). The restroom and landscape improvements span four areas, the North Gate, Bear Country Plaza, Watering Hole, and Trading Post. The goals for the designs at each location are the same, to improve hospitality, respond to surroundings, respect the existing architecture, and use native plantings.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (03:22:04).*

Commissioners did not have any reservations about the project and observed that the infill locations presented opportunities for informational graphics and images, but the brick material was acceptable as well.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch suggested a motion for final approval.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (7-0).*

**3. 72-22**

**Attunement**

**1900 Benjamin Franklin Parkway**

Review Type: Construction within Parkway Area and in public right-of-way

Project Details: Sound sculpture installation

Applicant and presenter: Academy of Natural Sciences of Drexel University

Pete Angevine presented this proposal for a temporary art installation on behalf of the Academy of Natural Sciences of Drexel University (03:27:56). The installation is titled “Attunement” and it is one component of a collection called “Watershed Moment.” The installation will be on-site from August through October 2022.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at minute mark (03:31:35).*

Chairperson Roesch asked how the sculpture will be attached to the sidewalk and what interpretative signage will be included, more details are needed. Further discussion continued between the Commissioners and Mr. Angevine about how the water will move through the

piece, wind conditions at the location, and the distance the water will need to travel. Chairperson Roesch cautioned that protection of the parts at “grabbing level” is needed.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for conceptual approval (03:37:17).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for conceptual approval (7-0).*

*Commissioner Almiñana was not present for the remaining items on the agenda.*

#### **4. 70-22**

##### **Mary McLeod Bethune Schoolyard Improvements 3301 Old York Road**

Review Type: Construction project paid with City funds

Project Details: Schoolyard renovation

Applicant: Philadelphia School District

Presenter: Trust for Public Land

The presentation began at the minute mark (03:38:10) by Kari Sannino, Trevor Lee, and Evan McNaught. The existing conditions of the schoolyard were described and the student engagement process was detailed. An overview of the design components was given, including rain gardens, new play equipment, track, plantings, site furniture, and picnic grove.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at minute mark (03:48:37).*

Commissioner Febo San Miguel asked if the schoolyard would be open for community use and asked about lighting. The space is open to the community and lighting is not included.

Commissioner Cahill inquired about the heat of the artificial turf, and if the shade trees could be moved closer to it. She also asked about seating near the outdoor classroom and if exercise equipment could be added.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked if there was a motion for concept approval (03:54:46).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for conceptual approval (6-0).*

#### **5. 69-22**

##### **Cohocksink Recreation Center Improvements 2901 Cedar Street**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property  
Project Details: Site and building improvements  
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation  
Presenter: Community Ventures

Aaron Rowlett presented the project with an overview of the proposed improvements to the Parks and Recreation Center. Improvements include baseball and football fields, basketball court, play areas, and building renovations. This project has just finished schematic design and currently mobilizing for design development (03:55:43).

*Questions and comments from the Commission at minute mark (03:48:00).*

Chairperson Roesch inquired about the Percent for Art requirement and the inclusion of an all-gender bathroom (04:02:54).

Claudia Becker, Counselor of the Art Commission, requested confirmation of the “bundling” strategy that the Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy and Rebuild are creating in order to meet the public art requirement. The request was acknowledged by Angela Dixon, Deputy Director of Design and Construction for Rebuild.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel inquired about the lighting. Commissioner Cahill raised concerns about the circulation pattern and the need for a more detailed planting plan.

Chairperson Roesch suggested conceptual approval and summarized the items that needed to be addressed at the next review including lighting, planting and grading plan, spectator benches, and circulation patterns.

*Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Commissioner Febo San Miguel made a motion for concept approval and it was seconded by Commissioner Nasser. Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (6-0).*

*Seeing no further comments or questions, the Art Commission adjourned at (04:16:27).*

This concluded the April 13, 2022, Philadelphia Art Commission.

**The next Art Commission will be held Wednesday, May 11, 2022, at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom.**