



Minutes
The Philadelphia Art Commission
May 11, 2022 - 9:30 a.m.
Remote – Zoom Meeting – Hosted by DPZ

The Philadelphia Art
Commission
Established 1911

Robert Roesch
Chair

José Almiñana
Deborah Cahill
Carmen Febo San Miguel
Sarah McEneaney
Matthew Miller
Raed Nasser
Pepón Osorio
Mario Zacharjasz

C. Beige Berryman
Staff

Members Present: José Almiñana, Sarah McEneaney, Carmen Febo San Miguel, Raed Nasser, Pepón Osorio, Matthew Miller, and Robert Roesch

Meeting of the Philadelphia Art Commission

Beige Berryman – staff member of the Art Commission – introduced the Zoom platform and remote Art Commission process, noting that the meeting is being recorded and those participating in the meeting are giving their consent to be recorded. A link to the recording, will be posted on the Art Commission website and the meeting agenda and materials can also be found on the website at: (<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/>).

*Ms. Berryman polled the commission via roll call announcing a quorum, then stated a few instructions for the public. Members of the public may comment on agenda items during the meeting. When the agenda item that you are interested in is being discussed, you can use the “raise hand” feature and staff will unmute you during the public comment period. If you’re joining by phone, you can also use the hand raise feature by dialing *9 during the public comment period, and if you have any submitted comments through email, staff will read those emails out loud at the appropriate time. Thank you.*

Minutes

The April 13, 2022 meeting minutes were postponed.

Report of the Sign Committee – April 27, 2022

Second Reviews:

1. 225-21

Sugaring NYC

1909 Chestnut Street

First Reviews:

1. 80-22

Cross Country Mortgage

33 S 16th Street

2. **81-22**
Paulie Gee's Slice Shop
412 S 13th Street
3. **83-22**
Kilwin's Chocolate
141-145 S. 13th Street
4. **78-22**
Samuel's Delicatessen
1523 Sansom Street
5. **79-22**
Gorjana
1630 Walnut Street
6. **82-22**
Madewell
1729 Walnut Street

Hearing no questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the recommendations of the Sign Committee from April 27, 2022 (00:03:56).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Sign Committee Report (5-0).

Administrative Agenda

1. **92-22**
**Conservation of City of Philadelphia Public Art Sculptures
Various Locations**
Review Type: Public art maintenance
Project Details: General cleaning and maintenance treatments
Applicant: Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy

Ms. Berryman presented five administrative items. The first one is the annual sculpture conservation for city owned works. The Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy is preparing 22 public art sculptures to undergo conservation treatments during 2022. General inspection and routine cleaning will occur, in addition to the specific repairs needed for individual pieces.

Hearing no questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the administrative item (00:05:15).

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4674 Telephone

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Conservation of City of Philadelphia Public Art Sculptures (5-0).

2. 91-22

Pollock Elementary School Renovations
2951 Welsh Road

Review Type: Minor construction project using City funds
Project Details: Routine interior and exterior maintenance
Applicant: School District of Philadelphia

The Pollock Elementary School scope of work will include renovations and repairs to the interior of the building. Exterior repairs include replacing windows and doors, resurfacing the roof, minor masonry repair, brick repointing, select milling and repaving of the parking area. Utility upgrades include electrical services, boilers, and ventilators. A chiller is being located on the roof to support air conditioning. Lastly, there's a separate modular classroom building that is receiving a new roof.

Hearing no questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the administrative item (00:06:33).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve Pollock Elementary School renovations (6-0).

3. 93-22

Bus Micro-shelter Installation
6 locations

Review Type: Encroachment in the public right-of-way
Project Details: 6 new micro bus shelters for installation
Applicant: Office of Transportation, Infrastructure, and Sustainability

Ms. Berryman reminded the Commission that at their September 2021 meeting, the Art Commission approved the design of the bus micro-shelter furniture and installation at six pilot locations. The six locations have now been confirmed and staff simply reviewed their placement on the sidewalk regarding the Complete Streets standards.

Hearing no questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the administrative item (00:07:39).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the bus micro-shelter pilot installations (6-0).

4. 94-22

**Fairmount Park Organic Recycling Center Milling Barn
3850 West Ford Road**

Review Type: Minor construction on City property
Project Details: Barn to protect log milling equipment
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation

This proposal is for a utilitarian equipment barn for milling logs at the Fairmount Park Organic Recycling Center. The barn is critical to protecting sensitive, heavy equipment from inclement weather and drying milled wood. It will not require any electric or plumbing infrastructure. It will be located at the facility's back of house processing area and cannot be seen from Ford Road.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission or Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve administrative item (00:09:02).

Commissioner Almiñana asked for confirmation that the barn was in the service area, and not a public area. Ms. Berryman asked the Parks and Recreation representative to respond. Marc Wilken confirmed that the area is currently cleared, not visible to the public, and is where they already process their wood.

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner McEaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Miller, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the Fairmount Park Organic Recycling Center milling barn (7-0).

5. 95-22

**SEPTA Mainline Ductbank Relocation
20th Street Portal and the Schuylkill River Bridge**

Review Type: Minor construction on City property
Project Details: Temporary rail infrastructure
Applicant: SEPTA

Lastly, SEPTA is proposing a temporary relocation of cables associated with improvements to the mainline between the 20th Street portal and the Schuylkill River Bridge. This is part of the elevated rail line connecting Suburban Station to 30th Street Station. The existing duckbank is severely deteriorated and needs to be replaced to avoid impacts to SEPTA operations. This is an administrative review for Phase I, the temporary relocation of cables to allow for the duckbank repair without disturbing service. Steel poles will be temporarily installed parallel to, and south of, the SEPTA mainline. Phase II, the permanent duckbank structure and associated repair work will return to the Art Commission at a future date.

Hearing no questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the administrative item (00:12:00).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Miller, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve the SEPTA mainline ductbank relocation (7-0).

Presentations for Final Review

1. 72-22

Attunement

1900 Benjamin Franklin Parkway

Review Type: Construction within Parkway Area and in public right-of-way

Project Details: Sound sculpture installation

Applicant and presenter: Academy of Natural Sciences of Drexel University

Pete Angevine presented on behalf of the Academy of Natural Sciences for final approval of the Attunement installation, which is one component of a multi-tiered collection of exhibitions and programs focusing on the Schuylkill River watershed called “Watershed Moment.” The installation would run from July through November, and has received approvals from the Streets Department and Licenses and Inspections. All structural components have been approved by an engineer, signage is included in the installation, and finally camera surveillance is also included.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:16:17).

Commissioner Almiñana stated that is a terrific addition and commended the Academy for bringing the exhibit outdoors and available to everybody. Additionally, the subject is important for the city of Philadelphia and for all its citizens, and is a great way to introduce the public to this subject. Commissioner Febo San Miguel agreed.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve (00:16:59).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEneaney and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Miller, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (7-0).

Presentations for Concept Review

1. 96-22

Lewis C. Cassidy Elementary School 6523 Lansdowne Avenue

Review Type: Construction project paid with City funds
Project Details: New school building
Applicant: Philadelphia School District
Presenter: Ewing Cole

Andrew Donaldson-Evans presented a brief overview of the existing site, existing building, proposed changes to the site and then the proposed building design for Cassidy Elementary School (00:18:02). The proposal is to modernize the facility and contribute thoughtful landscaping to the two-acre site. Site furniture is integrated into the landscape, the building's elevation includes the school's logo in a "subtle but large" manor, and the playground has a bright and cheery palette but is natural.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:31:57).

Chairperson Roesch commended on the beautiful project and it's unique positioning on the site. He inquired about fencing, only the rear would have a 4'-6' wrought iron fence. He inquired about the project's Percent for Art obligation. It was not identified at this time, but the project's funding source regarding the Percent for Art obligation needs further clarity.

Commissioner Almiñana asked about their rationale for demolishing the existing building. A preservation study was conducted, but remediation of the structure to meet modern standards was not financially feasible. He then asked if the building was meeting any certifications, and it is being designed to LEED Gold levels. Lastly, he inquired about the orientation of the building regarding sun exposure, suggesting treatment is needed on some of the large expanses of glazing.

The design features an interior "canyon" space, which allows the classrooms to receive natural light. Details were described about the windows, including that security gates would not be needed and fritting on the glass would be used to help prevent bird strikes. It was clarified that the majority of the stormwater would be handled by a sub-surface detention basin.

Chairperson Roesch summarized that the Commission would like to see studies on the shading and light levels on the front glazing, details on stormwater management, clarification on native plant species, and a night rendering to illustrate the lighting.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for conceptual approval (00:52:57).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Miller, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (7-0).

2. 97-22

SEPTA Erie Station Accessibility Improvements

BSL Erie Avenue, Broad Street and Germantown Avenue Triangle

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: New elevator on the sidewalk

Applicant: SEPTA

Presenter: JMT Architecture

Chantal Frances, along with others, presented an overview of the project - an accessibility upgrade for the Erie Station on the Broad Street Line. The project is for an elevator headhouse on the sidewalk to access the station.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:59:08).

Commissioner Almiñana began with a series of questions about seating, safety barriers around the bike lane, and how the depressed bike lane and ramping was coordinated. He voiced concern about the lack of clarity of how the SEPTA improvements and the other site improvements that were presented to the Commission last month were working together.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel voiced concern about the removal of the existing bus shelter.

Chairperson Roesch asked if the height of the elevator headhouse could be lower. Ms. Frances responded that they would look into this possibility. Commissioner Almiñana mentioned concerns about the overall visual impact of the entire project, and if the streetscape would appear busy and crowded.

Commissioner Osorio raised concerns about the walk from Germantown Avenue and Broad Street and requested clarification on the impact of the design elements within the available space. While improved access is commendable, he was also concerned about the project appearing too crowded on the street.

Chairperson Roesch suggested when the project returns, the applicant should include a night rendering, investigate lowering the roof so the structure is not so imposing, and investigate keeping the bus shelter. Future presentations of the both triangle site improvements and SEPTA's improvements should be coordinated.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for conceptual approval (01:17:44).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Miller, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (7-0).

3. 98-22

**Blanche A. Nixon Cobbs Creek Library
5800 Cobbs Creek Parkway**

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4674 Telephone

www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/

Review Type: Construction project located on City property
Project Details: Building and site improvements
Applicant: Free Library of Philadelphia
Presenter: Community Ventures

Linda To presented the construction budget, community engagement, and Percent for Art plans before handing over the presentation to Matthew Funk to present the design (01:18:58). He described the building's construction type and the exterior envelope repairs that are needed. Katrina Rogus presented the landscape, site design, amenities, and accessibility components.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (01:37:10).

Commissioner Febo San Miguel asked to see more lighting design details. Commissioner Almiñana commented on the challenges of the project, but that the proposal is a terrific addition to the neighborhood. He then expressed concerns about resolving the grade change, the proposed steps towards Baltimore Avenue, ramp, and play pods could be better integrated. The entrance sequence should be considered a community gathering point.

Commissioner Osorio agreed with Commissioner Almiñana concerning the budget challenges and mentioned the importance of “keeping” the new library visitors during the colder months. An interior gathering space may be needed. He also inquired about restrooms for children. Mr. Funk addressed the inquiries and stated that restrooms are not supported by the budget.

Commissioner McEaney inquired about fencing and lighting. Commissioner Miller requested clarification on the engagement process that led to the Karakung Play Pod concept. Ms. Rogus explained that several options were presented to the community and there was a desire to fold many narratives, historic, natural, etc., into the design.

Chairperson Roesch summarized when the project returns for final review, the presentation should include lighting details, further investigation into the entrance design and ramping, and integration of the play pods into the landscape.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for conceptual approval (01:51:46).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner McEaney and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Almiñana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner McEaney, Commissioner Miller, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (7-0).

**4. 99-22
Lawncrest Recreation Center and Library
6000 Rising Sun Avenue**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property
Project Details: Site and building improvements
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation and Free Library of Philadelphia
Presenter: Community Ventures

Katrina Rogus of Salt Design Studio and Patrick Isaac of Community Ventures presented these two projects, the Lawncrest Recreation Center and library are co-located facilities. The site amenities are generally degraded and the Recreational Center will receive a new gymnasium and clubhouse with a new access point. The library will receive more minimal improvements, including the removal of the security gates at the windows.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (02:10:47).

Chairperson Roesch asked for a night rendering, including the field lighting, fencing details, planting details, and the Percent for Art details.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel observed that this is a very large project and scope of work. More information on the landscape elements, including tree canopy, is needed.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for concept approval (02:15:41).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Miller, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to approve (5-0).

**5. 100-22
Scanlon Recreation Center
1099 E Venango St**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property
Project Details: Outdoor site improvements
Applicant: Philadelphia Parks and Recreation
Presenter: Heckendorn Shiles Architects

Jared Bookhamer began the presentation at the minute mark (02:17:05). The project team is working closely with Snyder Hockey and Parks and Recreation to renovate the outdoor areas that are immediately adjacent to the existing building. These include a new outdoor rink, playground equipment, sports wall, landscaping, and play surface. The goal is to reinvigorate the existing outdoor recreation space to help create a safe and engaging experience for the community.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (02:31:48).

Chairperson Roesch was concerned about the heat in these outdoor spaces during the summer months, suggesting that more landscape is needed.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4674 Telephone

[www.phila.gov/departments/
philadelphia-art-commission/](http://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/)

Commissioner McEneaney agreed, adding that a general “softening” of the design is needed. She also voiced concern about the site’s circulation patterns, the activities might have conflicting circulation needs.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel agreed that more details on lighting, greening, and tree plantings is needed.

Commissioner Roesch summarized that the Commission found the proposal to be under developed was concerned about the lack of critical amenities such as more landscape and shade, stormwater design, circulation through the site, and lighting.

Hearing no further questions or comments from the Commission or Public, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to continue (02:40:54).

Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner McEneaney, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner McEneaney, Commissioner Miller, Commissioner Osorio, and Chairperson Roesch. The Commission voted unanimously to continue the concept review (5-0).

Seeing no further comments or questions, the Art Commission adjourned at (02:41:34).

This concluded the May 11, 2022, Philadelphia Art Commission.

The next Art Commission will be held Wednesday, June 8, 2022, at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom.