



Budgeting for Racial Equity

Fiscal Year 2023

Table of Contents

Budgeting for Racial Equity – FY23 Process Recap	4
Appendix A	7
FY23 Operating Budget Call & Racial Equity	7
FY23 Racial Equity Budget Questions	9
FY23 Racial Equity Budget Questions Cheat Sheet	10
Appendix B - Completed Questionnaires Submitted by Departments	13
Completed Questionnaires Submitted by Departments	13
Art Museum	13
Auditing Department (City Controller)	16
Board of Pensions	19
Board of Revision of Taxes (BRT)	22
City Treasurer’s Office (CTO).....	24
Commerce.....	28
Department of Behavioral Health and Intellectual disAbility Services (DBHIDS)	30
Department of Fleet Services	35
Department of Human Services.....	39
Department of Labor	52
Department of Licenses and Inspections (L & I)	55
Department of Planning and Development.....	58
Department of Public Health	65
Department of Public Property (DPP).....	71
Department of Records.....	75
Department of Revenue	78
District Attorney’s Office	82
Division of Aviation	88
Fire Department.....	96
First Judicial District of Philadelphia	99
Free Library of Philadelphia	103
Law Department	109
Managing Director’s Office	112

Mayor’s Office.....	127
Mural Arts	132
Office of Children and Families	135
Office of Community Empowerment and Opportunity (CEO).....	140
Office of Homeless Services.....	145
Office of Human Resources	151
Office of Innovation and Technology.....	154
Office of Sustainability	159
Office of the Chief Administrative Officer	165
Office of the Director of Finance	171
Office of the Inspector General	176
Parks & Recreation.....	178
Philadelphia Commission on Human Relations (PCHR).....	181
Police Department	184
Prisons.....	187
Procurement Department	189
Register of Wills	191
Sheriff Department	193
Streets Department	198
Water Department.....	207
Appendix C	210
Equity and Results Top Ranking Requests	210
Appendix D.....	211
Cabinet Racial Equity Top Ranking Requests.....	211
Racial Equity Committee Budget Equity Top Ranking Requests.....	211

Budgeting for Racial Equity – FY23 Process Recap

Our vision for this budget cycle and beyond is a budget that enables investments that provide quality government services and infrastructure while maintaining the City’s long-term fiscal health, reducing racial disparities among Philadelphians, and advancing equitable outcomes for all Philadelphians.

We believe in a Philadelphia where all residents and visitors are safe, healthy, and have all basic needs met necessary to achieve their dreams. We envision a city where race is not a determinant of success, and everyone thrives, including LGBTQ+ individuals, women, people with disabilities, low-income households, and other historically marginalized and underrepresented groups in Philadelphia.

To help us align our budget decisions with that vision, the FY23 budget process incorporated the steps below to expand who is involved and altered how the process works. The changes below are intended to produce budgetary decisions that have measurable impacts on reducing racial disparities.

Participation Goal Setting Embedded in The Budget Process

For the second year, the Office of Economic Opportunity participated in the individual meetings between departments and the Budget Office used to discuss the funding for the upcoming year. This provided an opportunity to link a department’s overall expenditure plans to their contracting goals with minority, women, and disabled-owned enterprises

Racial Equity Questionnaires

As part of the budget development process, all City agencies were asked to respond to the Racial Equity Questionnaire. This document and its guidance materials, presented in **Appendix A**, asked departments to respond to questions about the intersection of current spending and operations with racial equity. The form was developed jointly by the Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion, the Budget Office and an outside racial equity consultant. To support departments in completing the questionnaire, a “cheat sheet” with definitions and instructions was provided and the City’s outside racial equity consultant held office hours to assist departments in assessing and communicating their contributions and opportunities to reduce racial disparities. In addition to completing the Racial Equity Questionnaires, departments submitting requests for new money and outlining how expenditure reductions would be handled were asked about the impacts on racial disparities as part of those submission. **Appendix B** contains the completed Questionnaires submitted by departments.

Racial Equity Rubric

The City’s outside racial equity consultant evaluated the Questionnaires submitted by each department and the nearly 300 requests for increased funding by departments. All but 40 of the requests had been identified as having an impact on racial equity by the department that submitted them. The firm scored each request on 10 metrics, divided between Department Core Metrics and New Justification Metrics (which were specific to the individual request):

Department Core Metrics – Based on the Racial Equity Questionnaire

- **Core Competencies** – The ability to coherently articulate what a department understands as its core areas of competency to reduce racial disparities.
- **Evidence of Impact** – Evidence of racial equity impact in historical and current programs and policies.
- **Inclusive Workplace** – Degree to which role as an employer is working to improve racial equity internally.
- **Stakeholder Engagement** – Degree to which department improves transparency and decision making in partnership with communities most impacted.
- **Mayoral Alignment** – Degree of alignment with mayoral anti-racist imperative and vision

New Justification Metrics – Based on New Funding Requests

- **Disparity Focused** – Degree to which race equity is explicitly named and factored in design
- **Performance Impact** – Degree to which anti-racist implementation appears clear, direct, viable and within the stated budget.
- **Leverages Partnerships** – Degree to which justification leverages partnerships, current and potential.
- **Structurally Sustainable** – Degree to which proposal is designed with an eye to root causes and works to undo harm of systems.
- **Mayoral Alignment** – Degree of alignment with mayoral anti-racist imperative and vision.

In addition to scoring the requests, the racial equity consultant team categorized the area of impact of each justification as:

- **Inclusive Workforce** - Internal focused activities to diversify and/or retain a racially diverse workforce, including recruiting, hiring and training, and EEO staff and worker protections.
- **Diversity, Equity, Inclusion Infrastructure** - Internal and external focused structures or positions in service of systematizing racial inclusion, including data collection, community engagement or assessment, and DEI leaders or planning.
- **Social Services Safety Net** - Government direct or community subcontracted services directly and explicitly aimed at improving the material well-being of Philadelphians of color.
- **Reparative Public Policy or Practice** - Activities or infrastructure explicitly intended to redress past racial harms and/or reimagine existing government systems with racial equity at its center.

Once all new funding requests were scored, they were ranked to reveal the top tier justifications. Additionally, the consultant shared key trends and considerations, such as whether DEI infrastructure and inclusive workforce investments should be pursued with a centralized approach or distributed among departments, as both a policy and budgetary matter. Scoring was provided to the Budget Office, Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion, the Mayor’s Office, the Budget Equity Committee, and the Cabinet and is used as an input for making budget decisions. **Appendix C** contains the top tier justifications based on the scoring from the Racial Equity Rubric.

Budget Equity Committee & Cabinet Budget Equity Process

The Budget Equity Committee (BEC) is a cross-departmental group of City employees that provides feedback about big budget decisions using a racial equity framing. Initially convened when the impacts of COVID-19 required a dramatic revision to the FY21 budget, the participants prioritize what new investments are the most important from a racial equity perspective and which cuts we should try hardest to avoid due to the impact on racial disparities. At times there has been weighing of various tax/revenue proposals to assess the impacts on racial disparities.

For the development of the FY23 budget, the size and composition of the group was changed to expand participation to a larger, diverse group of employees that were not already in top City leadership positions. This included creating a separate Budget Equity Process for Cabinet members and having them no longer participate in the Budget Equity Committee.

BEC members would participate in sessions to equip them to evaluate budget request and create opportunities of discussion. These sessions occur in January and February in the short window between when departments submit their funding requests, and the Budget Office presents a draft budget to the Mayor for his review. While the tight timeline is challenging, it is designed to make sure that the group is weighing in on the key decisions to be made in real time.

Budget Equity Committee Sessions

- **PHL Budget Bootcamp** – This session reviewed how the budget is structured and the process of getting it passed each year.
- **FY23 Context & Challenges** – Covered current fiscal condition and other factors influencing the choices for the upcoming year.
- **FY23 Options Briefing** – Provided an overview of funding requests submitted by departments; participants asked questions and discussed priorities.
- **FY23 Racial Equity Rubric** – Led by the City’s racial equity consultant, this session covered the structure of the racial equity rubric and how it was applied to the new requests from departments.
- **FY24 Options Prioritization** – This session collected participants feedback about which are the top priorities to get funding, particularly in the context of urgency and likelihood of success.

The Cabinet Racial Equity process skipped the PHL Budget Bootcamp and collapsed the FY23 Context and Options Briefings into a single session. As with the BEC, the Cabinet had separate sessions on the Racial Equity Rubric with the City’s racial equity consultant.

Following the final sessions, individual Budget Equity Committee members and Cabinet members each identified their top \$50 million in new investments they ranked as most impactful for racial equity in Philadelphia. Their feedback was shared with the Mayor and informed the funding decisions for FY23. **Appendix D** contains the top ranking requests from the BEC and Cabinet for FY23.

Appendix A

FY23 Operating Budget Call & Racial Equity

Background

On December 2, 2021, City of Philadelphia departments will receive the FY23 Operating Budget Call. Department are asked to submit information about the costs related to continuing existing service, provide justifications for requests for funding for new or expanded programs, and develop spending reduction scenarios. Our vision for this budget cycle and beyond is a budget that enables investments that provide quality government services and infrastructure while maintaining the City's long-term fiscal health, reducing racial disparities among Philadelphians, and advancing equitable outcomes for all Philadelphians.

We believe in a Philadelphia where all residents and visitors are safe, healthy, and have all basic needs met necessary to achieve their dreams. We envision a city where race is not a determinant of success, and everyone thrives, including LGBTQ+ individuals, women, people with disabilities, low-income households and other historically marginalized and underrepresented groups in Philadelphia.

To help us align our budget decisions with that vision, we will be asking a set of questions about racial equity as part of the budget call. **Racial equity means that race does not predict one's social, health, and economic success.** We seek to be more diligent and intentional about creating conditions to reduce historical inequities, while also improving outcomes for everyone.

Racially equitable budget requests may include:

- Those that support programs or services designed to advance equity,
- increase transit and mobility options,
- improve access to facilities and programs,
- increase diverse representation at all leadership levels and advance a more inclusive workspace,
- or minimize negative impacts for communities of color, and other marginalized groups.

Departments without public-facing services have a role in improving racial equity, through programs, policies, support to other agencies to fulfill their missions and racial equity work, and as a diverse, inclusive workplace. Projects that are data-driven and disaggregate data by race and/or gender in collection, analysis, and reporting, and include historically disadvantaged stakeholder groups and individuals in leadership roles in the conceptualization, design, and implementation are preferred.

Racial Equity Values

All budget submissions will be evaluated with the following set of core racial equity values in mind to help guide our actions and investments and ensure maximum and sustainable impact.

✓ **Naming Equity and Disparity in Design** – We will focus on budget proposals that are race-explicit, with strategies, programming, or interventions that are explicitly designed for racial equity. As a method

to advance racial equity, this approach prioritizes those most impacted by structural racial inequity to improve universal outcomes for all. As opposed to a focus on individual behaviors, centering our focus on racial inequity draws both our analyses and interventions to systems and structural barriers that impede the ability to achieve universal outcomes not predictive by race/ethnicity.

✓ **Transparency** – We will focus on budget proposals that are supported by a plan for, or historical indication of outreach, engagement, and validation by those most impacted by the proposals. While we understand the timeline for budget proposals will not typically allow for robust outreach or engagement, we value departmental submissions that reflect a transparent relationship between departmental activities and equitable community desires, including your workforce. We acknowledge that quantitative data related to racial equity is not always readily available or able to fully capture impact; for these reasons, thoughtfully selected qualitative data metrics may be helpful in telling your department’s story.

✓ **Performance Accountability** – We will focus on budget proposals that tie spending to performance measure of “better-off” impact for racial equity, both historically and looking forward. We understand the data collection constraints and capacities of many departments and yet will prioritize budget proposals that reflect a bona fide effort to capture internal departmental measures for advancing racial equity values.

✓ **Collaboration** – We will focus on budget proposals that reflect cross-agency collaborations and innovative use of funding across departments. In the context of federal resources in connection with COVID recovery, infrastructure investments, and the social safety net, we are increasingly being asked to think across traditional silos to advance equity. We understand this may require leadership on the part of cabinet members, deputy managing directors or others tasked with leading collaboration efforts for their own verticals, as well as working with peers across cabinets.

✓ **Sustainability** – We will focus on budget proposals that are designed with an eye to address root causes of inequity, working to heal or undo the harm caused to Philadelphia communities disproportionately impacted by inequity, particularly racial inequity. We look to prioritize the use of funding on proposals that clearly lay out policies, programs, or practices that might shift inequitable systems and cultural norms.

FY23 Racial Equity Budget Questions

(Please keep each response to 250 words or less)

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1.** Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?
- 2.** What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?
- 3.** Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?
- 4.** How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?
- 5.** Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

FY23 Racial Equity Budget Questions Cheat Sheet

This document provides definitions for key terms and additional guidance to support departments in completing the FY23 Racial Equity Budget Questions. We understand that parts of this process are a challenge area or area of growth for most, if not all, City agencies. The Budget Office and the Mayor's Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) are happy to work with your department on completing your responses.

Key Terms¹

Equity: Equally high outcomes of access, opportunities, and success for all individuals, regardless of any social or cultural factor or grouping.

Racial Equity: Racial equity means that race does not predict one's social, health, and economic success.

Anti-Racism: The affirmative and visible act of interrupting racism. Antiracism involves: rejecting false notions of human difference; acknowledging lived experiences shaped along racial lines; learning from diverse forms of knowledge and experience, and challenging systems of power that uphold racial inequity.

Inclusion: Authentically bringing traditionally excluded individuals and/or groups into processes, activities, and decision/policy making in a way that shares power.

Response Guidance

1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?

About this question: This is a question about WHAT your department understands as its core area of competency to reduce racial disparities, including the structural root causes of racism it aims to solve.

- This may include external facing challenges and/or internal workforce and culture-related challenges. The Budget Office seeks to understand how your department thinks of its mission relative to broader racial equity goals.
- You may link your answer to one or more of the following Mayoral priorities but should also provide a more detailed description of WHAT the racial equity problem or opportunity looks like for your department: (a) Health Equity for All, (b) Quality Education for All, (c) Inclusive Economy and Thriving Neighborhoods, and/or (d) Diverse, Efficient, and Effective Government.

2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.

¹ Derived in part courtesy of Racial Equity Tools, available [here](#), and DEI Glossary, available [here](#), each an open-source resource for equity practitioners.

About this question: This is a question about WHAT your department is concretely doing to reduce racial disparities through your existing budget.

- The Budget Office seeks to understand how your department is using its resources to impact areas of racial disparities related to the work of your department.
- Please think about direct service delivery, as well as systems, policies, or environments.
- For departments without public-facing work, you may want to think about your workplace environment, hiring, and professional development.

2a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.

About this question: This is a question about WHAT your department qualitatively knows about critical program or policy impacts, and/or any impending challenges or threats to those impacts, including if funding is reduced.

- The Budget Office seeks to understand how your department is using its resources to leverage what works as well as mitigate harm or risk for the intended beneficiaries.
- In the case of cut scenarios, your answer to this question will help the Budget Office weigh pros and cons of difficult program and policy reductions.
- There are many competing priorities in our work and in some instances meeting one priority may result in a negative impact on racial equity, especially when we have to reduce spending. If your cut scenario may worsen or continue existing racial disparities, please share ways those impacts could be lessened.

2b. For each critical program or policy referenced above in Question #2, please briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?

About this question: This is a question about HOW both (a) your department understands racial equity impact and (b) tracks and utilizes quantitative or qualitative data to measure impact. Do you have program data disaggregated by race?

- It is okay to not have rigorous evidence, but please think about how you could evaluate the impacts of programs and policies and its impacts on racial equity if funding is approved.
- Please share a data point that captures how this funding, if granted, will improve or worsen racial disparities. Note that services or changes that improve conditions or service quality/quantity equally without regard for race should be considered as having a neutral impact on racial disparities.
- You might also identify specific impact data support needed to adequately respond to this question in coming years. We understand that this is a challenge area or area of growth for most, if not all, City agencies.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

About this question: This is a question about HOW your department is working in its role as an employer to improve racial equity in more qualitative detail.

- We want to hear about trainings, professional development, executive leadership capacity building, hiring practices designed to create a diverse and inclusive environment. If possible, please provide data about your spending in this area.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

About this question: This is a question about HOW your department is working to improve transparency and inclusion with respect to critical program and policy decision-making, whether with the public, internal staff or other agencies.

- Who is involved in developing programs and policies matters, and this question is designed to help the Budget Office gain insights into how decisions are made about what programs to pursue?
- Think about whether the team developing the response to the budget call reflects diverse community priorities, what data and information they rely on, and whether that have information about racial disparities, and if there have been opportunities for public or employee input through formal or informal mechanisms.
- You may also want to note if communities of color were involved in designing the programs or services and whether that process was equitable and inclusive.
- You may want to include whether you have used racial or economic data to prioritize resource distribution in your existing budget.
- For more internal-facing departments where external community engagement may be less appropriate, consider describing how internal groups most impacted by your budget proposals for racial equity are included in the idea, design, implementation and/or evaluation. How is your department learning from diverse forms of knowledge and experience in its effort to interrupt systems of racial inequality?

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

About this question: This is an intentionally open-ended question to allow your department space to elevate any other critical insights or concerns not otherwise covered.

Appendix B

Completed Questionnaires Submitted by Departments

Art Museum

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The museum's core mission is to preserve, enhance, interpret, and extend the reach of its great collections in particular, and the visual arts in general, to an increasing and increasingly diverse audience as a source of delight, illumination, and lifelong learning. Ensuring that the museum is considered a place for all is central to that mission. As a result, the museum has committed to centering diversity, equity, inclusion and access into everything it does from programming and collecting to staffing and procurement.

The museum's Deputy Director of DEIA is currently leading the museum's first equity audit, which are organizational assessment and learning tools used to map the landscape of institutional actions, measure impacts on target audiences and provide strategic direction on the path forward. Equity Audits give leaders the information needed to make value-aligned decisions that prioritize impactful work, advance institutional equity and deliver results. This process will inform museum leaders of equitable policy and practices happening across the museum; amplify inclusive practices that deliver results and foster collaboration; and prioritize institutional and individual actions and/or decisions that mitigate harm, align with core values and support historically underrepresented stakeholders within and beyond the museum.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?

The equity audit process will focus on five focus areas for which the museum's future budgets will support and data will be collected in furtherance of enhanced diversity and equity.

1. Audience engagement – The museum's ability to collect and utilize all relevant information to attract, develop and sustain diverse publics.
 2. Art and programmatic diversity – Demonstration of the museum's ability to embrace a fuller and more authentic context in which to present, prioritize, and enhance the presence and contributions of historically underrepresented artists and their works through its galleries and public platforms.
 3. Employee wellness – The museum's ability to meet the needs of its internal workforce through policies and practices that seek to redress and/or eliminate harm, promote equitable outcomes, support for holistic personal and professional development, identity affirmation and more.
 4. Talent acquisition/optimization – The museum's ability to create more representational diversity by engaging inclusive best practices in employment, educational opportunity, talent recruitment, hiring, promotion and career advancement.
 5. Engagement and promotion of MWDVBE and LGBTQ+ owned vendors/supplier/contractors – The museum's ability to deepen its solicitation and create more pathways for partnerships with historically underrepresented business entities.
- 3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

As part of its commitment to DEIA, the museum is using its budget to actively shift cultural practices and policies to make the institution more inclusive and equitable. In FY21 and FY22, the museum implemented an institution-wide workshops to create spaces for shared learning on issues related to diversity, equity, inclusion and access. As part of this program more than 95% of staff participated in two half-day workshops with a trained consultant and completed an assessment to test each person's intercultural proficiency. The program concluded with a departmental assignment that asked each department to consider at least one practice that is marginalizing to those who are not in the dominant culture and make a recommendation for how to change that practice.

The assignments will serve as the foundation of the inaugural equity audit, which is scheduled to be completed in summer 2022 and will then be reported on annually to demonstrate improvements and areas for growth and change.

Further, in FY21 the museum created a permanent endowed Deputy Director of DEIA position. Alphonso Atkins Jr. joined the museum in August 2021 and is leading the inaugural equity audit.

Finally, regarding hiring and promotion, the museum is in the process of implementing new hiring practices that have been proven to increase staff diversity. These new institution-wide practices include establishing search committees for all external positions, utilizing structural interviews, expanding job posting locations and more. Additionally, the museum's Human Resources department is thinking critically about when an open position should be posted externally, in order to provide the greatest amount of opportunity to recruit diverse candidates.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

As a 501(c)(3) nonprofit organization, the museum does not engage external stakeholders in the budgeting process. However, the museum's Deputy Director of DEIA is involved in the budgeting and exhibition processes and setting forth priorities for where and how funding should be allocated.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)? N/A**

Auditing Department (City Controller)

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

As the City's financial watchdog, the Office of the City Controller works to promote the effective and efficient operation of Philadelphia City government. Under the leadership of City Controller Rebecca Rhynhart, the Controller's Office has worked to integrate the issue of racial equity into everything the office does. The Controller's Office has committed to improving racial equity through the day-to-day operations of the Administration, Audit, Pre-Audit, Finance, Policy and Data, and Investigations divisions. This includes providing meaningful analysis of issues that have a direct impact on historically disadvantaged communities and communities of color. Additionally, the Controller's Office plans to incorporate equitable service delivery, when applicable, to upcoming analyses, similar to the office's recent report on sanitation metrics.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

The Controller's Office does not administer programs or deliver services to the public in the traditional sense. However, the office undertakes policy analysis that directly addresses underlying racial equity issues. For example, each year the office compiles a report on the racial diversity of all exempt workers employed by the City of Philadelphia, including breakdowns of all staff, executive staff, new hires, and new executive level hires across department under the mayor's authority as well as all independently elected offices. Tracking this data over time allows departments and offices to better understand whether their hiring practices are resulting in a more diverse and more reflective of the city workforce.

- 3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

The Office of the City Controller makes conscious and thoughtful decisions using an inclusive and anti-racist lens to inform actions we take from assigning overtime to distribution of new equipment to employee discipline to the hiring and promoting of employees. For class 100 spending around exempt salaries, the department follows the hiring guidelines when hiring exempt employees to ensure inclusive and diverse hiring. When hiring interns, the office works with local colleges and universities to promote the intern opportunities, including local Historically Black Colleges and Universities, Cheyney University of Pennsylvania, and Lincoln University. When procuring professional services for class 200 the office proactively engages minority and women owned businesses. The office has worked to increase minority participation on contracts, as well as display contact information for the EEO officer in public areas. The office promotes an employee newsletter to share the work of the Department, acknowledge new hires, promotions, and employee news. In the next few months, there will be implicit bias training provided for all employees.

When filling vacancies, particularly in the hard to fill Auditor Trainee position, the office has intentionally expanded recruitment of potential candidates to include those from Lincoln University, University of Delaware, West Chester University, Neumann University, Eastern University, Chestnut Hill College, and other institutions by either posting the job announcement on the college or university online job portal or by direct email to the college or university. The office works with the Office of Human Resources to ensure that the panels rating the Auditor Trainee exam are diverse and ensure that successful candidates who are certified are interviewed by a diverse panel. The office details for newly hired Auditor Trainees the steps they need to take to be promoted in the Controller's Office, drawing particular attention to the salary they can expect with each promotion.

The Controller's Office is mindful of employee demographic data. The office is deliberate about ensuring minority representation at all levels among exempt and civil service staff when recruiting/hiring/promoting employees. With input from labor unions and staff, the office evaluates/modifies internal processes to encourage and facilitate professional development with the intent of promoting an inclusive and anti-racist workplace.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The Controller's Office has engaged several external community groups during the Finance, Policy and Data division's work on gun violence. Prior to the release of the report on the economic impact of homicides, the office engaged a violence prevention organization who reviewed the report and provided crucial feedback. The office has ongoing conversations about the Department's gun violence work with several community leaders and community organizations.

Additionally, as part of the investigation into the City’s response to civil unrest in May and June 2020, the Controller’s Office created a Community Advisory Accountability Council. The Council brings together clergy members, community leaders, business owners and residents of Philadelphia to advise and support the review.

Similarly, the office will create a Community Advisory Accountability Council to support the review and analysis of the Philadelphia Police Department. This coalition of community leaders, religious leaders, business owners and residents will provide valuable insight throughout the review process. With the support of the community council, the review will help reimagine public safety in Philadelphia and make improvements so that all residents feel safe, when historically, that has not been the case.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

N/A

Board of Pensions

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Subject to duties established by the Charter, Code, and fiduciary/trust and other applicable law, the Board of Pensions and Retirement (Board of Pensions) administers the Retirement System and manages the assets of the City’s Pension Fund (Fund). By law, the Board of Pensions must ensure that the Fund is always able to cover current and future payments of retirement benefits to eligible members or their beneficiaries or survivors. The Board of Pensions must also use the assets of the Fund for the exclusive benefit of members and their beneficiaries or survivors and solely for the purpose of defraying expenses related to the administration of the Retirement System and management of the Fund.

Although not public-facing or serving, the Board of Pensions has adopted and diligently and intentionally implemented policies and practices that advance racial equity in the investment management space and has created and fostered a diverse and inclusive workforce at the Board (see answer to #2). As of the end of FY21, the Board’s overall workforce is 71% diverse by race/ethnicity and 69% diverse by gender. Of its Executive Exempt employees, 55% are diverse by race/ethnicity and 36% by gender. The Board has made internal promotion of diverse employees to key management positions a hallmark of its workforce plans. For example, during the first half of FY22, the Board made 3 promotions, all of which were diverse employees.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

To assess and advance use of diverse investment managers, the Board conducted a utilization study. The most recent study revealed that only 8.7% of the universe of investment management firms who meet the investment criteria established to satisfy fiduciary duties are diverse under the Executive Order 1-21’s definition of M/W/DSBE.

As a result of the Board of Pensions’ policies and practices, at the end of FY22 Q1, 22 or approximately 30% of the Board’s 75 investment managers are diverse. In addition, the Board

has invested Fund assets with diverse managers in a total amount over \$1.4 billion or more than 20% of the total value of the Fund.

Two investment managers, who do not technically meet the EO definition yet have combined diverse ownership, currently manage nearly \$3.1 billion in fund assets. Rhumblin, an index firm that is 53% owned by women and minorities, currently manages roughly \$3 billion in Fund assets. Causeway, an international equity firm that is more than 50% owned by women and minorities, handles approximately \$97.4 million in assets.

Also, the Board has a policy and practice to encourage (and monitor whether) managers subject to investment management agreements use approved diverse brokers to meet a goal of directed broker commissions of at least 35% during a calendar year. As of November 2021, the Fund's equity managers had directed 45% to diverse/local brokers for the quarter, and 49% YTD.

Under the Board's Investment Policy Statement (IPS), MWDBE firms are granted flexibility to apply using reduced initial screening criteria. Also, under the IPS, Staff is mandated to consider at least one (1) MWDBE manager in each search.

Further, when screening, interviewing, and evaluating all managers, the Board ensures that at least one (1) person on the Staff is diverse by race/ethnicity and/or gender.

The Board carefully monitors all existing and prospective managers regarding diversity and inclusion in their workforce by requesting and analyzing demographic data reports at various levels in the organization (e.g. C-suite, investment team, partner, middle management, firmwide).

The Board is active in multiple organizations (e.g., National Association of Securities Professionals, The Thirty-Percent Coalition) and uses its shareholder power to support the advancement of diverse persons in the financial industry. These efforts include, but are not limited to, the filing of proposals at various corporations seeking greater diversity on their boards and/or further disclosure of employee demographic data.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

As of end of FY21, the Board's overall workforce is 71% diverse by race/ethnicity and 69% diverse by gender. Of its Executive Exempt employees, 55% are diverse by race/ethnicity and 36% by gender.

The Board has made internal promotion of diverse employees to key management positions a hallmark of its workforce plans. For example, during the first half of FY22, the Board made 3 promotions, all of which were diverse employees. Out of the Board's new hires in FY22, 60 % were diverse by race/ethnicity.

The Board has approved and funded attendance by diverse employees at educational and networking conferences that seek to educate, encourage, and empower diverse employees in the pension plan investment and administration space. The Board's promotion of diverse employees internally to management/executive positions, e.g., Deputy Director; HR/Administrative Services Director; Pension Program Administrators; Head of Capital Markets etc., provides mentors and role models for diverse staff.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

Because the Board, by law, must always act for the exclusive benefit of the members of the Retirement System or their beneficiaries and survivors, the Board does not involve external stakeholders in its budget process or planning. However, the Board maintains constant communication with City Council through Council's representative on the Board and presents its budget process and plans, its benefit administration and investment policies or practices, and workforce and investment manager demographic reports and other data, to Council each budget season. A diverse group of Pension Executive Team employees participates in the budget process.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

No, see answers 1-4.

Board of Revision of Taxes (BRT)

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Core functions of the agency continually intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. Every property owner in the city, has the right to appeal their property assessment regardless of property type and the value of the parcel. The Board of Revision of Taxes (BRT) office hears appeals from all property owners, from hotels and warehouses to single family row homes and vacant ground. BRT ensures that every appellant has equal access to the department and to the appeals board. The office continually strives to share information, filing instructions and forms via web, in-person or by mail. BRT also accepts applications via email, mail or by walking in. BRT uses their account with the United Language Group to offer translation services so there are no barriers to the appeal process, regardless of race or ethnicity. COVID-19 has altered the landscape in which it performs. BRT faced new challenges on how to serve the city and not exclude any group based on access. But, a couple months into the pandemic the office was able to “reopen” in a manner where the team could safely service every property owner in the city, regardless of access to technology.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

The BRT hears appeals of real estate market value and of eminent domain. The appeal hearing and its outcome is not determined by one's socio-economic status or any cultural factor. Beginning February 2022, the individual board members will have a hybrid schedule where they’ll work in-person and remotely, depending on the day. The office has found that hearing preferences vary across racial groups. In this new initiative, board members will be present in-person and remotely.

Each appellant can choose their preferred method of attending a hearing. In each instance the BRT board and staff will be accessible in-person, via phone or by Zoom. The costs associated with this initiative have been minimal and are not expected to increase over time. Therefore,

potential cut scenarios should not negatively affect this initiative. Thus far, the only threat is tied to a greater dependence on technology and resolving new, different issues that arise.

The impact has been substantial. Thousands of property owners would have been left out of the hearing process, faced extensive delays or would have unresolved real estate tax bills if BRT had not incorporated hearing procedures to service every property owner, no matter their race, socio-economic level, language or access to technology.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

The Board of Revision of Taxes uses its class 100 funds to create an inclusive and anti-racist workplace. BRT staff are hired in a variety of ways to consider all potential applicants. Annually, BRT hires a variety of temp staff to work during the busy season and often they come on-board for fulltime employment. The office also hires Service Representatives from citywide and open-competitive lists in order to interview and hire people with diverse backgrounds. The board members are elected by the Common Pleas Court Board of Judges. The collective differences among board members keep BRT effective and able to hear and consider all salient points during an appeal hearing. The board decisions are not skewed in one direction. The office is pleased the Board of Judges considers this at every election. The board members are highly qualified and represent different races, gender, age and sexual orientation. BRT is hopeful that the professional development course, for Pennsylvania assessment appeals board members will resume in FY2023.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The BRT board members and administrative team develop departmental programs and policy. Bi-annually, the office assess strengths and weaknesses, and how they impact the organization. The office considers board members, BRT staff, city of Philadelphia property owners and the city agencies the department communicates and shares information with. The administrative team is mindful of the diversity in the city and how it's reflected in property assessments and appeals of those assessments. The office team gathers feedback, throughout the appeal year, regarding the filing process and the forms of communication that work best for each group. The office strives to develop process that serve every resident especially when assessments range from three thousand to three hundred million dollars. The fiscal operating budget is just over one million dollars, and the office takes pride in eliminating waste and operating on what is necessary to efficiently serve property owners of the city. The budget is made available to the public and BRT leadership fully considers SWMBE when purchasing goods and services.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

The BRT and the Office of Property Assessment has been working with The Pew Charitable Trusts, as they collect citywide data on property assessments, appeals and appeal outcomes on how they vary across racial and economic boundaries. Although this study has no impact on the budget, it is directly aligned with the city's vision of equity and inclusion.

City Treasurer's Office (CTO)

Existing Spending and Operations

1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?

The City Treasurer's Office (CTO) safeguards all City funds and serves as the main relationship manager for banks and financial institutions. CTO's policies and practices around racial equity can influence the private sector.

For Debt Management, CTO has the opportunity to work with senior and co-senior underwriting firms to issue City debt and create designation policies to ensure opportunity for all members of the syndicate team. Designation policies are rules for how compensation is distributed among participating underwriting firms on a debt transaction. The City also selects and appoints joint legal counsel and financial advisors on bond transactions to ensure diverse participation and thorough coverage on bond transactions.

The City's Investment Policy institutionalizes a commitment to considering approved M/W/DSBE firms when making allocation decisions and the approved pool of vendors includes 5 (of 12) certified M/W/DSBE firms.

The CTO also publishes the [Annual Lending Disparity Study](#). This study highlights home and small business lending trends, lending performance, and bank branch patterns of the financial institutions (authorized depositories) conducting business with the City. While banks are regulated by federal and state agencies and the City cannot direct bank lending activity, this study provides the City and other stakeholders with an opportunity to see how the financial institutions conducting business with the City lend. This information can inform business decisions made by the City and others based on patterns of racial inequity and inform discussions between CTO and the depositories during relationship reviews.

2. **What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
- a. **For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity. See above**
 - b. **For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity? See above**

CTO issues debt on behalf of the City, Airport, Water Department and PGW to support infrastructure investments across the City. All debt issued by CTO involves a group of underwriters, financial advisors, bond and disclosure counsel firms. CTO has established diverse pool of firms to work with, including diverse firms from traditionally marginalized groups of color. CTO also selects co-counsels and co-advisers, pairing a majority- and minority-owned firm to divide the required work on transactions. CTO's focus on developing firms that understand the City's bond ordinances and needs and provide strong coverage helps increase marketplace competition and helps those firms grow/further establish their respective practices (a, c). Selecting co-counsels and managing a large number of contracts requires more administrative work for CTO but yields better outcomes (b, no d identified).

As mentioned in the first response, CTO manages all depository banking relationships for the City and produces an annual study on lending disparities and banking trends. The report includes a wealth of data and measures changes over time (up to 10 years), and CTO regularly discusses the results of this study with each bank in relationship review meetings (a, c). The study is dense and can be challenging to summarize given the nuances being examined (b); however, CTO is working to make the study more accessible to a broader audience. Banks are regulated state and federal agencies (b).

CTO's commitment to building a diverse group of pre-approved financial professionals has helped CTO increase its participation rates on City-related expenditures (a). Three (3) of the top 10 underwriters utilized since 2016 are minority-owned firms (ranking 2, 4, 6); in the national rankings, none of these firms are in the Bond Buyer's top utilized firms by par size. Currently, 24% of all City cash is invested with diverse-owned firms - 5 of the City's 12 overall managers (42%). In national utilization studies, only approximately 9% of firms have more than 50% of

diverse or female ownership and meet the City’s criteria to participate in opportunities. (Criteria – 3-year track record, \$100M in assets under management).

In October 2021, CTO also issued the City’s first ‘Social’ designated bonds for the Neighborhood Preservation Initiative. The ‘Social’ designation showcases the nature of the programs funded and also requires departments who receive the funds to report on impact metrics. This effort will track spending and departmental determined outcomes for programs designed to improve housing affordability, reduce homelessness, address longstanding private infrastructure challenges in low-income communities and invest in commercial corridors (a, c).

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

CTO strongly believes in an inclusive and diverse workforce. In order to create an anti-racist workplace, CTO uses a hiring committee made up of a diverse group of staff. The staff members that make up this committee include members of traditionally marginalized groups. CTO also strives to interview a diverse slate of candidates.

CTO leadership also works to institutionalize and directly speak to/remind staff of policies around vendor selection and contracting to prioritize diversity and inclusion across professional services used.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The Budget team for the City Treasurer’s Office is a racially diverse team. Budget decisions are made with the intention of allocating available funds (or cuts) in the most equitable way possible.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

See response to question 6.

Commerce

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Department of Commerce helps businesses—large and small—thrive in Philadelphia. In order to foster inclusive growth in the city, Commerce has programs and services to support under-resourced communities, grow small businesses and draw new companies to Philadelphia.

Commerce contributes to equitable neighborhood revitalization by:

1. Strategically investing to build vibrant commercial districts
2. Supporting small businesses by providing trusted guidance
3. Increasing access to capital and contracting opportunities for minority-, women-, and disabled-owned businesses
4. Driving job placements in growth industries and positions that pay family-sustaining wages

Commerce also works to retain and attract new businesses through business incentives both domestically and internationally, elevating Philadelphia’s global competitiveness and positioning Philadelphia’s economy for long-term growth.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

At Commerce, the vision is to be the economic catalyst for the City of Philadelphia by creating equitable wealth-building opportunities through strategic investments, resources, and ecosystem partnerships. In 2021, Commerce administered nearly \$33.6 million in financial relief programs to small businesses adversely impacted by COVID-19. On average, 60% of awardees were minority-owned businesses. Commerce also expanded its cleaning program in the City’s busiest, most littered commercial corridors partnered with local small businesses and organizations to provide employment opportunities and workforce training for the cleaning program in addition to providing programs an increase in public safety and reduce crime on the neighborhood commercial corridors. At Commerce, the office partners with employers to drive job placements in growth industries and to jobs that pay family-sustaining wages and build wealth in communities of color by leveling the playing field through access to capital and contracting opportunities.

- 3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

The Commerce Department uses its budget to hire a diverse and talented staff, which focuses on serving a diverse community of entrepreneurs, business owners, and opportunity seekers. 80% of Commerce's staff is racially diverse. When new positions are available, it is a requirement that the hiring committee is diverse. Program design is informed by principles of diversity, equity, and inclusion. While the office supports inclusive economic growth across the city, the department focuses on helping marginalized communities in low to moderate-income neighborhoods.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

The Commerce Department regularly engages with community members and stakeholders on program design and implementation. This includes engaging the diverse chambers, BIDs and CDCs, minority business owners, job seekers, and other groups. The Commerce Department's budget process considers this feedback and information, but the process is mostly internal. Commerce's executive leadership, like the rest of the department, is racially diverse and therefore the budget process is informed by a diverse group of economic development professionals from within the department.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

All of the programs were designed to reduce racial barriers. Any new funding for staff will increase job growth and capacity across for programs that provide one-on-one assistance and advocacy for small business owners, support commercial districts throughout the City, increase access to capital and contracting opportunities for minority-, women-, and disabled-owned businesses, drive employment for the underemployed population and strive to attract and retain businesses in Philadelphia.

Department of Behavioral Health and Intellectual disAbility Services (DBHIDS)

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

DBHIDS is a department under the City of Philadelphia's Health and Human Services cabinet that oversees behavioral healthcare, intellectual disability supports, and early intervention services in one integrated system. Through a network of providers, partners, and community members, the office funds treatment and deliver services that promote recovery, resilience, and self-determination by empowering the entire community to take charge of their health and wellness. The office's mission is to educate, strengthen, and serve individuals and communities so that all Philadelphians can thrive. DBHIDS believes in a city where everyone can thrive, be authentic and included, has a voice, and feels valued. The office celebrates differences and advocate for equity and justice. The office strives to shift the culture boldly by collecting, reporting, and monitoring data and building partnerships and collaborations with various stakeholders. Above all, DBHIDS recognizes that addressing structural trauma within the department is necessary to implement DEI strategies externally successfully. The department's DEI guiding principles represent an inward and outward commitment to advancing racial equity.

Some major areas of opportunity for the department to advance racial equity as part of DBHIDS core work objectives are:

- Increase Minority/Women/Disabled-owned contracted providers within the service network to ensure cultural humility and linguistic competencies in service delivery.
- Fiscally sustain federally entitled language access services (LAS) under the 1964 Civil Rights Act Title VI for people with limited English proficient (LEP).
- Expand demographic data characteristics to embrace the vast array of cultures and identities among Black, Indigenous, and people of color (BIPOC) and sexual orientation and gender identity (SOGI) to neutralize the racial language of color for a more inclusive focus.
- Secure funding for positions needed to lead and sustain initiatives designed to promote racial equity, such as the Reimagined Internship program, Immigrant Refugee Wellness Academy, Women and Girls of Color, etc.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**

b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?

DBHIDS has multiple critical programs and policies to improve racial equity across its seven divisions. Due to the limited word capacity, highlighted are a few administered with the office's current budget.

- ATD Reentry Project
 - Community Wellness Engagement Unit
 - Crisis Intervention Response Teams (CIRT)
 - Crisis System Transformation the Philadelphia Crisis Line (PCL) Program
 - Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Steering Committee (DEISC)
 - Forensic 360 Project
 - Grants & Procurements,
 - Minority/Women/Disabled-owned Business Enterprises (MWDSBE)
 - The Trauma Response and Emergency Preparedness (TREP) to include Network of Neighbors.
- a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.

ATD Reentry supports timely and comprehensive care to address trauma, a critical component for successful community reintegration for people returning from jail to reduce arrest and recidivism.

Community Wellness Engagement Unit (CWEU) is a multilingual engagement team assessing individuals in Philadelphia's most challenged neighborhoods. Linking them to the appropriate services and addressing barriers to treatment and wellness.

Crisis Intervention Response Teams (CIRT) aim to prevent trauma during arrest and incarceration by offering de-escalation and triage services.

Crisis System Transformation the Philadelphia Crisis Line (PCL) prevents re-traumatizing those in crisis, promoting more effective coping techniques. Increasing access to zip codes where treatment options are lacking, expanding Crisis Response Centers (CRCs) and Mobile Teams, and 24/7 behavioral health urgent care centers for the entire city.

DEI Steering Committee (DEISC) modeling DEI best practices is a six-month rotating committee to ensure diverse perspectives, creative viewpoints, and innovative ideas of staff from 7- divisions and varying levels.

Forensic 360 project promotes equity within the justice system by getting past services and trauma diagnoses information to treatment staff to provide continuity of care to Philadelphians.

Grants & Procurement assists every unit in putting out RFPs that include language encouraging MWDS businesses to apply. Increasing the number of places these RFPs are posted to reach more minority businesses in the city.

Minority/Women/Disabled-owned Business Enterprises (MWDSBE) increasing the capacity of MWDSBE providers within the service contract network. To promote racial equity and inclusion of diverse providers to ensure access to service delivery with cultural humility and linguistic competencies.

Trauma Response and Emergency Preparedness (TREP) is comprised of two subunits. The emergency preparedness division supports the Office of Emergency Management by providing behavioral health support during natural disasters, emergency planning, and other unique circumstances. And the **Network of Neighbors** responding to Violence. The Network provides trauma & evidence-informed, and community-directed support to Philadelphia's neighborhoods and communities impacted by violence, trauma. TREP utilizes trained community volunteers to support both subdivisions.

ATD Reentry provided 167 encounters in 11/2021. Of those served, 55% were African American and 6% Caucasian, 27% of those served were classified as "unknown," and 7% identified as of Hispanic or Latinx ethnicity. As African Americans make up about 75% of the jail population, ATD Reentry may be serving an equitable proportion as more work is being done to identify those classified as "unknown."

Community Wellness Engagement Unit (CWEU) launched in 7/2019, CWEU is reducing barriers to racial and cultural equity neighborhood by neighborhood driven by the community's voice. CWEU is committed to hiring individuals who culturally and linguistically reflect the communities that are served.

Crisis Intervention Response Teams (CIRT) began delivering services alongside CIT-trained officers in April 2021. Through November 2021, CIRT provided 398 behavioral health encounters. Of those encounters, served were 42% African Americans, 31% Caucasians, and 6% Bi-racial. Of those served, 13% identified as of Hispanic or Latinx ethnicity. These racial proportions align with the City's overall racial demographics.

Crisis System Transformation the Philadelphia Crisis Line (PCL) interfaces with the whole of the city. PCL has reviewed 302 data to assess equity and intentionally implement metrics that track this measure. Most PCL hires are individuals from ethnic minority groups.

DEI Steering Committee (DEISC) the 1st rotation helped to operationalize the DEI guiding principles.

Forensic 360 jail treatment provider Centurion was provided access to Forensic 360 in 11/2021, allows clinicians to view DBHIDS MH claims. The jail is changing behavioral health treatment providers to Corizon 1/1/22.

Grants & Procurement increased the number of places these RFPs are posted to reach more diverse businesses in the city and continues to collaborate w/communications to advertise contracting opportunities.

Minority/Women/Disabled-owned Business Enterprises (MWDSBE) eliminated the financial barrier by covering the M/W/DSBE non-refundable application and annual renewal fees for qualified County contractors and sub-contractors.

Trauma Response and Emergency Preparedness (TREP) - Network of Neighbors responds to citywide request for assistance; most requests and supports are provided in—communities of color (approximately 80%). Most trained volunteers are also people of color (about 75%).

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

Some of the ways DBHIDS uses its budget to advance racial equity throughout its department are by:

- Hiring with intentionality, individuals who culturally and linguistically reflect the communities served.
- Improving its employee headcount percentage in the Asian, Black, and Hispanic ethnic groups, over 83% of its workforce identifies as an ethnicity other than white/Caucasian.
- Establishing broad guiding policies and principles, i.e., DE, Language Access and Service Excellence policies, DEI Vision statement, DEI Guiding Principles, etc.
- Collecting baseline data quantitatively and qualitatively characterizing aspects of equity, i.e., DEI Employee Survey, Workforce Diversity Gap Analysis, etc.
- Creating leadership positions to advance its DEI culture shift, i.e., Senior Director of Clinical Quality for that Management of DEI, Director of Multicultural Affairs, Director of Immigrant/Refugee Affairs, and Language Access Services, etc.
- Developing initiatives that promote a sense of belongingness and inclusion. i.e., Engaging Males of Color, Women, and Girls of Color, Peer Institute, Immigrant Refugee Wellness Academy, LGBTQ+ Task Force, Faith and Spirituality, Employee Resource Groups (ERG)DEI Steering Committee, etc.
- Promoting the DBHIDS DEI Awareness strategies, i.e., virtual platforms, DEI SkillUP, DEI ChatUP, & The Healing Space, communications banners, Celebrating Diversity, Advocating for Equity, & Conscious Awareness, DEI Best Practice and Person-first Language reference guide, etc.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

DBHIDS' goal in alignment with the office's strategic framework — Prioritizing to Address Our Changing Environment (P.A.C.E.) is to develop cohesive action plans, with clear goals and metrics for advancing trauma, racial equity, and community engagement—to inspire and set the course for internal & external stakeholders. DBHIDS exercises with transparency for budget deliberations and prioritization in data collection and analysis concerning racial equity impact by including diverse perspectives and perceptions in collective decision making regardless of race, gender, religion, gender identity, sexual orientation, ethnicity, abilities, disabilities, or health care needs. Some focus areas are:

- Ensuring policies, procedures, and practices are inclusive.
- Creating an environment that empowers individuals to contribute authentically.
- Promoting a culture of belongingness.
- Developing internal mechanisms to manage and monitor DEI performance.
- Mitigating disparities by advancing racial and justice equity throughout the department, the provider network, and the City's most vulnerable, marginalized, and historically resilient communities, by expanding outreach efforts, i.e., Homeless, Community Wellness, Immigrant/Refugee, Trauma/ Crisis Response, etc.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Increased funding for the office's department's racial equity efforts to:

- Expand staffing capacity to support and sustain initiatives, projects, and programs
- Provide stipends to community volunteers to help address community economic health and racial disparity.
- Consider MWDSBE certification eligibility for non-profit contractors. 90% of contracts are non-profit and unable to contribute to the office's 35% equity goal.

Department of Fleet Services

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Department of Fleet Services (DFS) ensures that City vehicles and other automotive equipment are available, dependable, and safe to operate so that City departments and agencies can deliver services. DFS does not directly interface with the public, however, there are several capital and operating funding investments which DFS initiate to enhance the delivery of services by city departments to various sections of the city.

DFS's investment in the Fire Dept's core mission equipment such as Fire Medic Units, Fire Pumper Trucks (Engine), Tiller Ladder and other specialized equipment is vital to assist in medical emergency calls, fire incidents and reduce wait time for public health and safety responses. These capital investments will allow for the timely delivery of critical services particularly to disadvantaged neighborhoods.

DFS's investment in the Street Dept's aging Trash Compactor fleet will allow Sanitation to continue on-time trash collections. The investment in Compressed Natural Gas (CNG) trash trucks through grant and city capital funding along with a CNG fueling station will allow the city to deploy newer and cleaner trucks for operations in disadvantaged neighborhood and environmental justice areas along with enhancing quality of life issues in the southwest section of the city.

DFS's investment in Litter Vacuums, Street Sweepers and Hook Lift Trucks will enable neighborhood cleanup initiatives targeting disadvantaged neighborhood enhancement endeavors emphasized by the Administration.

DFS's investment in Fuel Tank Replacement Project is vital to the neighborhood to provide cleaner and safer living environment. DFS has 61 fuel sites strategically located throughout the city, of which 32 fuel sites and underground tanks that meet or exceed the Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection's (DEP) mandated replacement cycle. Steady and continuous investment is very important to provide safe and cleaner environment to the citizens of Philadelphia.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**

b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?

The DFS is currently administering the following programs which will improve the racial equity.

- 1) High School Internship and Automotive Apprentice Program.
- 2) Employees Training and Development.

High School Internship and Automotive Apprentice Program: In 1993, DFS in partnership with the School District of Philadelphia initiated the High School Internship Program. The program focused on inner city youth who are enrolled in Philadelphia Vocational High Schools with an automotive or autobody shop trade. This program sets a career path for predominantly Black and Hispanic students from the 11th grade into adulthood. Upon the successful completion of the 2-year internship program, students will be hired as Automotive Apprentice which is a permanent civil service position with opportunity for career advancement. This program provides access to secure pay, health benefits, pension plan, and training & development, which reduces and eliminates the obstacles around possible poverty, access to good jobs, and quality education. In addition, through this program, DFS is developing highly qualified Technicians to service the City department's vehicle and equipment.

Employees Training and Development: DFS is committed by its mission to create an equitable and challenging work environment that creates opportunity for growth and success. DFS is committed to provide Vehicle and Equipment Manufacture's training which will be purchased from the Manufacturer during vehicle acquisition process. DFS currently participate in the Employee Credential Based Bonus program, provide Commercial Driver's License (CDL) training through the Streets department, and reimburse employees for success in passing the Automotive Service Excellence (ASE) certifications. The department provide study materials for ASE's and facilitate opportunity for study time prior to examination. Through these training programs, employees receive most up to date information and knowledge in the automotive industry which enable the employees for career advancement. Challenges of the training program is lack of employee participation and loss of well-trained Technicians to competitors.

High School Internship and Automotive Apprentice Program: Since 1993, DFS provided automotive internship training to 134 high school students from the Philadelphia School District. At present, DFS is providing automotive training to 15 interns and apprentice through this program. Over the next five years, DFS will enroll 45 students to continue the automotive training program. Currently, the office has 33 full time employees as Automotive Technicians, Team Leaders, Supervisors and District Manager who have started their automotive career through the

internship program. This program will help to reduce the racial disparity among the automotive technical staff. DFS encourages and focuses on hiring minority students to the internship program. Historically 88% of the interns were hired from minority groups, which enabled DFS to reduce the racial disparity among automotive technical staff.

Employees Training and Development: Training and Development program is critical to the Fleet operation. The training and development opportunity allows the employee to stay up to date and knowledgeable about newer technologies in the field, which will help the employees career development. Also, the automotive technician's training and development is very significant, as certain facets of the automotive industry evolves particularly around technology and clean fuel standards. Fleet employee training and development is continuous from the time of hiring until retirement. Through the training and development, DFS continuously strives to encourage all employees to pursue management track within the department. Over the past few years, DFS have been able to promote a number of minorities to higher level positions.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

The Department always seeks to hire a diverse workforce. DFS's technician's recruitment strategies includes attracting potential candidates straight out of trade school and encourage women, minorities, and Limited English Proficient (LEP) candidates in the recruitment process. To attract diverse applicants for critical positions, DFS members attend and participate at job / career fairs sponsored by area trade schools in addition to the recruitment engagements that are facilitated by other community workforce development organizations. In the past, the office has advertised in the AL Día Spanish newspaper, which requires the office to coordinate the timing of advertisement to align with a civil service job announcement. This is an option DFS is willing to pursue again.

DFS will also continue the High School Student's Internship Program with higher focuses on increase in minority participation. Over the next five years, DFS will enroll 45 students to continue the automotive training program. Upon the successful completion of the 2-year training program, these students will be hired as Automotive Apprentice with career advancement opportunities. This will enable DFS's to be a higher-level inclusive workforce in the future. DFS continually encourage the current employees to retain and/or earn ASE Master Certifications which will enable the employees to attain the promotional opportunities.

DFS's current staffing level is 326 employees of which 180 (55.21%) employees are Minorities and 146 (44.79%) employees are Caucasians. Of the total 326 employees, 6 (1.84%) employees are exempt hired, and 320 (98.16%) employees are hired by civil service regulations. At present, DFS has 54 Fleet Maintenance Team Leaders and Fleet Maintenance Supervisors of which 39 (72.22%) are Caucasians and 15 (27.78%) are Minorities. DFS's current promotional opportunities and hiring are based on civil service regulations which minimize the opportunities for minority

candidates. Moving forward, the revised civil service hiring regulation will enable DFS to provide more promotional opportunities to the minority candidates.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

DFS does not directly interface with the public, however, there are several capital and operating funding investments which DFS initiate to enhance the delivery of services by city departments to various sections of the city. DFS continually interact with operating department to support their objective and priorities related to vehicle and equipment to serve the public at large. Also, DFS employees’ feedback on vehicle and equipment maintenance will be considered while making investment decisions.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Vehicle acquisition budget reduction will impact DFS’s ability to pursue its Optimal Vehicle Replacement Strategy particularly public health and safety vehicles. Steady and continuous investment in vehicle and equipment acquisition will enable DFS to provide safe and reliable vehicle and equipment for the public health and safety operations throughout the city particularly more vulnerable populations.

The department also recognizes the negative impact due to low wages/salary, therefore, continues to have discussions about automotive technician’s pay increases.

Department of Human Services

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The mission of DHS is to provide and promote safety, permanency, and well-being for children and youth at risk of abuse, neglect, and delinquency. DHS is also guided by Improving Outcomes for Children, Philadelphia's model of delivering child welfare, juvenile justice, and child abuse and prevention services. The goals of IOC are:

More children and youth are safely in their own homes and communities

More children and youth are reunified more quickly or achieve other permanency

Congregate (or residential) care is safely reduced

Improved children, youth, and family functioning

Child Welfare and Juvenile Justice involvement disproportionately impacts Black youth in Philadelphia, research shows that social and structural factors are driving these racial disparities. Findings from the Entry Rate and Disproportionality Study show that:

- Black children are over-represented in reporting to the Hotline, and this disparity remains constant across all levels of the service trajectory (such as in-home and placement services, congregate care, and juvenile justice involved youth).
- The majority of these reports to DHS are for poverty-related or other well-being concerns that do not require a safety service.
- This over-reporting is clustered in North Philadelphia, the Lower Northeast, and South and Southwest Philadelphia, where there are the highest poverty rates and where many families of color live.

The Entry Rate and Disproportionality Study highlights that communities and families in Philadelphia who experience over-surveillance and systems-involvement are the same communities that were Redlined decades ago are the same as those experiencing disproportionate poverty and reporting today. This over-reporting to DHS not only reflects an inefficient system that does not adequately meet the needs of most children reported, but it also reflects harm done to Black families through over-surveillance and reports of alleged abuse and neglect against individuals living in poverty. Based on evidence in the literature, it can be inferred to be true of youth and communities with greater juvenile justice involvement.

Based on the overwhelming evidence that the disparities are driven by structural racism, the integral work to keep more children safely in their families and communities, reduce the number of families who are separated and improve well-being of families is explicitly anti-racist. The programs and initiatives described in the next question detail how the office is working to mitigate the impact that structural racism has on disparate system involvement and the trauma that DHS-involved families experience.

The Department of Human Services has also identified the following opportunities to advance racial equity:

- Hire a Diversity Equity & Inclusion/ Recruitment Manager to strengthen HR's infrastructure to further diversify the workforce on all levels with an intention to attract and on-board candidates who are underrepresented within the office's workforce.
- In conjunction with DHS' work on "SOGIE" (Sexual Orientation Gender Identity and Expression), DHS is moving forward in building infrastructure to track diversity in the following areas: gender, ethnicity, and race along with taking a closer look at current systems and practices related to gender & sexuality.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
- a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

The Department of Human Services (DHS) has several major initiatives currently being undertaken to improve racial equity across policies and services and eliminate racial disparities in child welfare and juvenile justice involvement in Philadelphia. The examples below exemplify DHS' commitment to being an anti-racist system by understanding and correcting the social and structural inequality that drives disparate involvement of Black youth and families in the Philadelphia system.

Efforts to Right-Size the Child Welfare and Juvenile Justice Services Systems: DHS has made targeted efforts to reduce the population of children, youth, and families who are involved with formal child safety services or juvenile justice services. Since Black children and families are disproportionately impacted by out of home placement and congregate care, reducing the population of youth receiving these services has significant equity implications. The office has achieved sizable reductions in the foster care population through targeted strategies such as additional units on the DHS hotline to evaluate and screen families out at the point of report, funding programs that provide supportive services to safely divert children from formal child

welfare and juvenile justice involvement, and targeted efforts to safely step down and reunify children in congregate care.

Entry Rate and Disproportionality Study: Racial disparities observed in Philadelphia’s child welfare system prompted DHS to develop the Entry Rate Study, conducted in partnership between DHS, the University of Pennsylvania, and Casey Family Programs. The purpose of this study is to examine ethno-racial disparities and disproportionality associated with children entering out-of-home care to inform targeted efforts to reduce Philadelphia’s rate of entry to out-of-home care (or foster and congregate care). DHS led Phase One, and conducted quantitative analyses describing service trends for children reported to DHS Hotline at the individual, family, case, and neighborhood level. Phase two is being completed by the University of Pennsylvania who surveyed 500 staff and interviewed 100 birth families, resource parents, and staff with lived experiences in the child welfare system to augment the Phase I quantitative findings. Phase Three will be conducted in partnership with Casey Family Programs and is a national scan of best practices that reduce the use of out-of-home care with an eye toward Philadelphia’s local context.

City-Wide Disproportionality Workgroup: DHS has led a Cross-Agency Disproportionality Workgroup to eliminate the over-reporting that occurs in Philadelphia and primarily impacts families of color living in poverty. The office group has representatives from the City’s Health & Human Services Cluster (Housing, Behavioral Health, Public Health, Economic Opportunities), the School District of Philadelphia, and the Children’s Hospital of Philadelphia. The key strategies of the workgroup are to address City-wide poverty through a SupportLine, modify mandated reporter training to address implicit bias and better train reporters to distinguish between safety and poverty, and assess and change internal policies and external laws that may contribute to disproportionate reporting.

Federal Grant for Family Support Through Primary Prevention: This year DHS applied for and was awarded a federal grant funded by the Children’s Bureau. DHS was one of 6 demonstration sites for 5-year projects of national significance that demonstrate integrated, cross-sector approaches to developing comprehensive child and family well-being systems that are co-designed with families and communities. This grant will be used to more effectively respond to non-safety concerns related to poverty outside of the DHS Hotline through the following recommendations that were developed by the Disproportionality Workgroup:

- Expanding the Philly Families CAN SupportLine through a partnership with Philadelphia’s Department of Public Health to serve all families with children up to 17 to provide connections to home visiting and prevention services.
- Providing targeted service slots in neighborhoods with the most reporting to DHS’ Hotline, which are also the neighborhoods with the most poverty and are predominantly inhabited by families of color. Services will include OCF funded services such as WorkReady and PHLprek as well as housing and behavioral health.
- Using services from Benefits Data Trust, a professional paid service, to connect families in traditionally underserved communities to all public benefits for which they are eligible.

Strengthening Diversion Services and Use of Evidence Based Programs: Stressors related to poverty are far-reaching in Philadelphia, and upstream prevention and diversion strategies are needed to reduce parental stress, meet concrete needs, and build strong communities of support for children and families. Recognizing the need for greater investment in quality diversion services that reduce the need for intensive child welfare intervention, DHS partnered with Mathematica, a large research firm, to conduct several effectiveness studies for a few major diversion programs, including: Family Empowerment Centers (FEC), Family Empowerment Services (FES), and Rapid Service Response (RSR). Per the studies, diversion services that addressed families' concrete needs were most effective at reducing the need for formal safety services, highlighting the importance of addressing poverty-related stressors for families reported to DHS.

Center for Study of Social Policy Work: The Center for the Study of Social Policy (CSSP) is a national nonprofit organization recognized for its child welfare expertise, commitment to advancing anti-racist policy and practice, and leadership in reforming public systems. DHS is working with CSSP to address inequities within the child welfare system through a multi-phased approach. To support this work, CSSP will provide technical assistance to:

- Develop recommendations for front-end system policies that are grounded in equity with a goal of reducing placements for children of color.
- Supporting DHS' leadership team to establish a shared understanding of anti-racist policy and build capacity to promote equity and anti-racism in policy and practice.
- Identifying stakeholders who are not typically at the table who could further work on eradicating disproportionality in the child welfare system

As a result of this work, DHS will identify policies that perpetuate and contribute to inequities and disparate outcomes for children and families of color. Further, DHS will develop next steps for developing and implementing policy moving forward that is anti-racist and promotes positive outcomes for children and families of color.

Additional short-term project goals include:

- DHS leadership team will develop a shared understanding of anti-racist policy.
- DHS will establish a process and identify key tools that must be used to review any policy (existing or new) to ensure that policy is anti-racist.
- DHS will establish a process for engaging key stakeholders, including community members and those with lived experience, in reviewing, developing, and implementing policy.

The Department of Human Services will also prioritize and invest in professional development of its entire workforce. The department offers in-person training (before Covid) and on-line training to promote continuous learning that not only enhances employees' knowledge and skills to perform their current jobs but provide for opportunities to learn new skills. DHS equally invests in emerging leaders through DHS' Philadelphia Child Welfare Leadership Academy (CWLA) through a partnership with Performance Plus International (PPI) that is inclusive of all position levels across the DHS workforce.

The Department of Human Services,

- Cultivates partnerships with colleges and universities in and surrounding Philadelphia area. The office is building on those relationships around recruitment of a more diverse and racially equitable workforce through creating a pipeline of employment through internships and sharing job opportunities with students and alumni. The office is also building up the DHS 'profile in Handshake, a national online collegiate platform for job opportunities for students & alumni.
- Plan to bring on a DEI/ Recruitment Manager/Director within the next year to strengthen HR's infrastructure and centralize DHS works to further diversify its workforce on all levels.
- DHS has underrepresented candidates whose gender identity is he/him, bilingual candidates and candidates who represent various religious, culture, and ethnicities; without developing the leadership potential in workforce or without a focus to recruit underrepresented candidates, its threatens the office's ability to advance racial equity as well as aim to have a workforce that represents the communities served.

Front-End Services

- Use of Hotline Field Screening units to safely divert families reported to the Hotline from being accepted for investigation.

Prevention Services

- In 2019, building on the success of diversion at the Hotline, DHS initiated mandatory use of Diversion Case Management (i.e., Rapid Service Response, Family Empowerment Services) in the Investigations Divisions. Diversion Case Management services concurrently work with the family alongside the investigation team. The paradigm shift gives focus to the Department's efforts to right size with the intent of mitigating identified safety concerns and threats during the time-limited investigation process. Community-based Family Empowerment Centers were created to allow families to receive diversion services in a single location in the community.

Family Engagement Initiative (FEI) Implementation

- The Family Engagement Initiative FEI is a statewide collaboration between the Administrative Office of Pennsylvania Courts and Child Welfare to enhance meaningful family involvement in the child welfare system (CWS). The premise is that meaningful family involvement increases the likelihood that children will safely remain in their homes or will be placed with kin if out of home placement is necessary. FEI represents a paradigm shift in Investigations and Case Management. The three major components of FEI are: 1) Enhanced Family Finding; 2) Crisis/ Rapid Response Family Meetings; and 3) Enhanced Legal

Representation. DHS will work to extend elements of the FEI model for juvenile delinquent youth which include youth crossover population. FEI is also aligned with the goals of the Family First Prevention Service act regarding preventing out of home placement and qualitative programming. With the implementation of the Family Engagement Initiative (FEI), the Department has put measures in place to improve meaningful family engagement and create and involve supportive connections for youth. In addition to other benefits of FEI for children, youth, and families, increased kin involvement increases the likelihood of children and youth remaining in their own homes or being placed with kin if out-of-home placement is necessary.

Development of Community-based Juvenile Justice Services Options

- In stakeholder discussions, development and utilization of Philadelphia county's community-based options have been recognized repeatedly as a strength of the system. The availability of these options mitigates the county's need for and dependence on congregate detention options. The availability of community-based options has allowed the juvenile justice system to reduce the use of congregate settings during the COVID-19 pandemic by giving judges alternatives to these settings. Community-based options have many advantages including greater family cohesiveness and participation in interventions. Studies have shown that youth are more receptive to interventions rendered in a community-based setting and have far better outcomes as a result. Another advantage is the ability for youth on probation to participate in the DHS Community Service and Restitution initiative to perform services that can translate to dollars through the initiative to pay restitution fines and allow their cases to be closed. The longer a youth is on probation due to their inability to satisfy these court-imposed restitution fines, the greater the probability of the youth committing a technical violation of their probation which can result in a deeper penetration of the juvenile justice system.

Notwithstanding JJS and JPO's success in reducing congregate care and offering diversionary programming, disproportionality remains a critical problem. DHS, in collaboration with University of Pennsylvania and other local stakeholders, will conduct a further study and analysis of youth specifically in the juvenile delinquent system to understand the pervasiveness of disproportionality regarding racial, ethnic, and sexual orientation disparities. JJS will need support to sustain this work and create interventions to address disparate outcomes for youth concerning arrests, court dispositions, length of placement, and quality of treatment.

DHS has a robust research and evaluation team in the division of Performance Management and Technology who are responsible for monitoring performance and system trends with a specific focus on racial equity. This team was responsible for conducting the Entry Rate and Disproportionality study which has informed many of the current initiatives to eliminate racial disparities in DHS. This team also produces a Quarterly Indicators Report which is a public

document which tracks progress towards the goals of Improving Outcomes for Children and includes service data disaggregated by race. The office's monitoring work has revealed the following impacts:

Right sizing the system: reducing the population in dependent congregate care by over half, the juvenile justice congregate care population by over 80%, and the number of children in out of home placement by over a third in the past five years.

Safe Diversion of Children: In recent fiscal years the majority of families that complete diversion services (89-95%) do not have formal child welfare involvement in the year following program completion.

While these advances represent an overall reduction in the number of Black youth and families with system involvement, the office recognizes that the disparate percentage of families and youth who are Black remains roughly the same. In the coming years the research and evaluation team will continue to support office initiatives to eliminate racial disparities through monitoring and performance management in the following ways:

- **Implementation of Evidence Based Programs**-Our team will use implementation science and information gleaned from the second phase of the Entry Rate and Disproportionality study to inform the use of Evidence Based Programs with a specific equity focus such as Effective Black Parenting Program to help bolster prevention programs to keep youth safely with their families and communities.
- **Monitoring for the Federal Primary Prevention Grant**-The office is responsible for assisting in implementation and evaluation of the Federal Grant for Family Support Through Primary Prevention: to ensure the implementation of programs using an equity framework and obtaining the desired outcome of safely diverting families from unnecessary child protective services to other needed supports to address poverty and well-being concerns.
- **More Robust Evaluation of All Programs:** This team is currently improving and standardizing the evaluation procedures for contracted providers of diversion, juvenile justice, and foster and congregate care services. Specifically incorporating quality measures informed by national best practices and youth and family voice to ensure that the services provided improve youth and family functioning reducing the need for future DHS involvement.

As to date, DHS has established a joint collaborative with universities and colleges who have partnered with the department by way of providing discounted tuition and/or internship opportunities for bachelor and master's level degrees, certifications programs and licensure renewals. The collegiate collaborative includes Bryn Mawr college, Alvernia University, Thomas Jefferson University, Widener University, and Temple University. The office is currently working on expanding the network to include Community Colleges and Historically Black Colleges & Universities (HBCUs).

DHS has an extensive catalog of 275 virtual Professional Development trainings for all DHS and CUA staff can access through the Learning Management System (LMS).

As to date, DHS' Child Welfare Leadership Academy has graduated one hundred (100) DHS and CUA staff across all division, titles, and positions.

As a department, the office is moving towards centralizing, managing, and tracking recruitment efforts across the department.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

The Department of Human Services does the following:

- DHS Executive Leadership host monthly healing sessions that engage all DHS staff to promote community and self-care through an organic delivery. Staff from across all DHS divisions share self-care tips and testimonials of community support.
- In 2019, DHS conducted an AAR (After Action Review) to assess the response to Covid 19 Pandemic as a system and within that assessment, the office received employee feedback of work/workplace satisfaction. In response to employee feedback, DHS has moved to reinvest in services to continue to offer all-staff workforce trauma informed training, trauma-informed practice training, vicarious trauma training for group and individuals, and crisis debriefing in real time.
- DHS host "All Staff meetings that are held annually to connect with staff and provide updates on the organization's priorities and successes.
- DHS University's initial, ongoing, and leadership development program promotes continuous learning at all levels.
- The Employee Recognition Program recognizes employees monthly for their service and performance based on DHS values. Winners are given a paid day off!!
- New Hire Check-In interviews are conducted with new hires at end of first month, third month, and sixth months about their onboarding experience.
- DHS offers a mentoring program within DHS division of Child Welfare Operations that pairs Social Service Manager graduates from the Employee Education Program with newly hired Social Service Managers for 6 months; likewise, DHS division of Juvenile Justice Services pairs seasoned Youth Detention Counselors with newly hired Youth Detention Trainees to support the transition into the division, to cultivate a learning environment and a safety culture.
- DHS has a Morale Committee that is operated by staff and supported by DHS Leadership.

- DHS conducts STAY interviews with seasoned employees to learn from them why they continue working at the Department.

Center for the Study of Social Policy (CSSP) Policy Assessment

Philadelphia Department of Human Services (DHS) is consulting with the Center for the Study of Social Policy (CSSP) to achieve the following goals:

- Assessing and rewriting policies with a racial equity lens around removals that lead to a decrease in placements.
- Assessing and rewriting policies with a racial equity lens concerning children in placement.
- Identifying stakeholders who are not typically at the table who could further work on eradicating disproportionality in the child welfare system
- Informing DHS with strategies and next steps to build internal awareness and capacity

To begin this work, CSSP is working with DHS to develop an inclusive process for reviewing, assessing, and rewriting policy so that all DHS policy is anti-racist, advancing equity for children and families of color. This work will consist of four phases.

As a result of this work, DHS will identify policies that perpetuate and contribute to inequities and disparate outcomes for children and families of color. Further, DHS will develop next steps for developing and implementing policy moving forward that is anti-racist and promotes positive outcomes for children and families of color.

Additional short-term project goals include:

- DHS leadership team will develop a shared understanding of anti-racist policy.
- DHS will establish a process and identify key tools that must be used to review any policy (existing or new) to ensure that policy is anti-racist.
- DHS will establish a process for engaging key stakeholders, including community members and those with lived experience, in reviewing, developing, and implementing policy.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

DHS incorporates feedback of multiple stakeholders including the youth and families who receive services, mandated reporters, the provider community, and advocates and experts to inform future policies and programs. Below are some examples of efforts to incorporate stakeholder input into program and policy design:

Entry Rate and Disproportionality Study: The second and current phase of the Entry Rate & Disproportionality Study prioritizes the voice of staff and families, many of whom are people of color and have lived experiences in DHS' child welfare system (either as providers or recipients of services). Phase II of the study is being conducted by a team of research colleagues and partners from the University of Pennsylvania and is funded by a major child welfare foundation, Casey Family Programs. Penn conducted over 500 staff surveys and over 100 semi-structured interviews with birth families, resource parents, and staff with lived experiences in the child welfare system to augment Phase I quantitative findings. The qualitative findings from the study will be used to inform the implementation of future strategies, including the use of Evidence-Based Programs supported by Implementation Teams for families of color. Additionally, the findings on the prevalence and causes of racial disparities from the first phase of the Entry Rate Study have largely informed the current efforts to eliminate racial disparities such as the City-Wide Workgroup, Children's Bureau grant, and mandated reporter trainings.

Family and Youth Voice Project: This year, DHS worked to systematically incorporate stakeholder feedback into evaluations through the Family and Youth Voice Project. The office piloted collecting parent feedback through a qualitative interview process with parents of children in placement to evaluate their experience with their CUA case management services. The office also began regularly surveying youth about their experiences in congregate care settings. Information from both of these groups will eventually be included in the annual evaluation measures of providers of congregate care and case management services.

Mandated Reporter Focus Groups: In order to strengthen implementation of the SupportLine through new federal grant from the children's bureau, DHS plans to retrain mandated reporters to address implicit bias and also to provide clear guidelines about when to use the SupportLine and when to report safety concerns to the Hotline. To inform these updates, DHS completed focus groups with school personnel, and this summer, and medical personnel; the two largest groups of mandated reporters who report the most families to DHS' Hotline according to findings from the Entry Rate Study. Participants of these focus groups provided recommendations to modify the training, developing implicit bias trainings, and insights on the need for more family resources and strengthening social and structural supports for families in underserved communities.

External Partnerships with Experts in the Field: DHS has many external partnerships with child welfare and juvenile justice experts to help us improve policies and programs with a specific focus on prevention and racial equity. In addition to the work described above with the Center for the Study of Social Policy, DHS also partners with experts such as Casey Family Programs and Mathematica to improve service delivery and prevention programs, and research experts such as the University of Pennsylvania’s Child Research Center and Drexel University’s Juvenile Justice Research and Reform Lab.

Child Welfare Oversight Board Meetings: DHS and its Child Welfare Oversight Board hold quarterly public meetings in which service trends data are presented to ensure transparency and accountability towards meeting the goals of Improving Outcomes for Children. Attendees of these meetings include child welfare and juvenile justice experts, parent and child advocates, the provider community, and families currently or formerly receiving services. These meetings are an opportunity for these stakeholders to review the data (including data disaggregated by race) and to make recommendations for areas for improvement.

The Department of Human Services is:

- Developing a system-wide framework for DHS to support the integration of Bio-Parent and Youth voice with lived experience. This integrated framework will establish a shared vision for substantive change in the culture and institutional barriers to success that impact the city’s child welfare and juvenile justice systems.
- Partnering with national experts to assess and amend anti-racist language that may exist in policies and procedures across the Philadelphia system.

As mentioned in response to question#1, Philadelphia’s Department of Human Services (DHS) partnered with the University of Pennsylvania, and Casey Family Programs to conduct the Entry Rate & Disproportionality Study. Development of requests in the annual Needs-Based Plan and Budget submission for the state, relies in part on the finding of that study and recognition of the need to reduce the numbers of children of color, particularly African American children, who become involved in the formal child welfare system and the juvenile justice system and who are placed out of home, particularly in congregate care because of neglect, juvenile justice contact, and other socio-economic factors. In addition, as a standard practice for the last three years in development of the state Needs-Based Plan and Budget narrative, members of the provider community, including Community Umbrella Agency leadership, and members of the advocate community representing children, parents, and the District Attorney’s Office have been engaged to provide their assessment of the needs of youth, identify best practices and gaps in services. The Court and Juvenile Probation Office are required by regulation to be active participants in

determining the needs of the system. The office is also required by regulation to hold a public hearing and to make a draft of the budget narrative available to the public for comment.

Regarding involvement of development of programs and policies, so that the services to achieve safe and timely reunification are relevant to families' lived experiences, DHS is seeking funding for the development of a Parent Advisory Council and a Youth Advisory Council empowering person with lived experience to provide feedback and guidance on policy development, practice implementation, program monitoring and evaluation. These advisory boards will be sustained and supported as subject matter experts to guide child welfare practices across the system. This forum will provide parents the opportunity to influence specific services and programs designed to keep children safe and families together. The office is committed to be responsive to the needs of families expressed by their lived experiences and perspectives.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

In addition to addressing ethno-racial disparity and disproportionality and equity, Philadelphia DHS is addressing disproportionality regarding services and outcomes for LGBTQ+ youth involved in the system through Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity and Gender Expression efforts. There is a lack of data specific to youth who identify as LGBTQ+ across systems. Data on foster youth, particularly LGBTQ+ foster youth, are lacking in several overlapping areas, including health care, mental health care, juvenile justice, and education. Without reliable information about the service population, a lack of front-end awareness compromises the well-being of LGBTQ+ youth. In 2017, DHS contracted with a consultant through Case Family Programs to review current Philadelphia DHS systems and practices related to gender and sexuality and develop a set of recommendations for DHS about how to approach system change in the short and long term. The review consisted of stakeholder interviews, document/system review, best practices research, and staff focus groups and resulted in a report with three main recommendations:

1. **Dedicate Full-Time Staff to SOGIE Efforts:** Like any other Department-wide change effort, moving a system as large and complex as the Philadelphia child welfare and juvenile justice system requires sustained, focused energy over time. Dedicated staff are needed to effectively drive the work.
2. **Develop Policy & Practice Guidance:** Developing written policy and practice guidance is the most impactful content creation DHS could complete at this time. Written guidance will strengthen existing activities and assets, and policy is the most common foundational piece needed to inform other high-impact activities.
3. **Build a More Affirming Workplace Culture:** Because of unaddressed bias in the workplace, many LGBTQ+ staff across the organization are not open about their identities at work.



Addressing the workplace culture is a priority as it influences both staff and client experience, and it will influence all aspects of project implementation.

Department of Labor

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

All core functions in the Department of Labor directly underpin the City’s commitment to racial equity. The Labor and Employee Relations operations are internal facing and ensure that City of Philadelphia employees are expressly aware of EEO protections; employees, managers and administrators are clear on their responsibility and accountability to racial equity; and administer EEO protections as specifically required by Philadelphia Home Rule Charter. The Labor Policy and Compliance operations are outward facing and ensure that all workers in Philadelphia can access their protections under the law; and city employers are compliant with worker protections regulations, particularly those which combat racially disparate outcomes.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

Consistent with the Department’s purpose as stated in Home Rule Charter, the Department is responsible for administering “programs pertaining to city employee protections, including investigation of complaints concerning workplace discrimination...and educate and train City managers and employees with respect to rights and responsibilities under law providing protections to city employees”. Consequently, all functions of the Employee Relations Unit are critical to the improvement of racial equity:

- The ERU develops and delivers EEO Training
 - SWOT Analysis – The delivery of training is a strength of the department, empirically the number of training sessions conducted has generally increased over the last 3 years, although FY 2021 realized a decrease in delivery due to a temporary pandemic related pause. However, staff shortages are a significant threat to this function. The lack of resources has hampered both delivery and development of training necessary to educate and improve compliance.
- ERU Investigates complaints of discrimination

- SWOT Analysis – Again the lack of sufficient resources to shorten investigation completion and administration of corrective action undermines the effectiveness of this function. Having complaints heard, discriminatory behavior identified and corrected directly impacts racial equity. An inability to review complaints timely and thoroughly is the result of suspended hiring, budget reductions, and pay disparity with comparable private employer positions. Anecdotally, as investigation outcomes are communicated and corrective action effected, the office will experience an increase in reporting.
- Customer Services
 - SWOT Analysis – Over the past 3 years, the ERU has experienced increased department intervention needs. Several Departments have engaged the ERU to assess workplace practices, facilitate implementation of employee relations best practices, conduct training and counsel managers and supervisors. The FY 23 budget request includes additional funding for Employee Protection Engagement Specialists. In FY 2022, the ERU has created a comprehensive department audit function to ensure EEO protection compliance. This function not only addresses current complaints of discriminatory practice but identifies practice which may increase likelihood of disparate outcomes. The approval of this funding will allow for more proactive identification of policies and practices that are inconsistent with racial equity.

The Office of Worker Protection does work which advances racial equity. Outreach is focused on low-wage and non-English speaking workers and actively partner with outside organizations to ensure that all workers in Philadelphia have access to worker protections provided by law.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

The department utilizes all best practices related to inclusive hiring and promotional practices.

The Office of Employee and Labor Relations advances racial equity work not only through the investigative and training functions of the ERU, but through its partnership with the City's Unions, the EEO taskforce, OHR work groups and the Office of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion. The Department's budget (particularly relative to salary expenditures) is and has been used to influence policies relative to employee benefits, supervisory responsibilities relative to employee protections, pandemic response protocols, hiring practices, to include interviewing and vetting procedures, and ensuring equity in negotiated collective bargaining agreements across all City Unions. Absent the contributions and efforts of OLR staff, decision-making would have been bereft of relevant information on city-wide complaints, inclusive labor perspectives, and evolving EEO practices. This was especially evident during the initial decision making at the onset of the pandemic in April 2020. Consequently, the work, and by extension the budget, of OLR is integral to the creation and administration of inclusive and anti-racist policies and procedures.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The department works closely with external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in the office program/policy design. Among other projects, the office manages the Domestic Worker Taskforce and the Worker Relief Fund. A strategic goal for FY 23 is to establish a community re-grant program that will allow us to partner directly with community organizations.

Additionally, OLR works with PCHR and EEOC to improve understanding of evolving protections and their application. Through participation in the City’s EEO taskforce, OLR relies on the input of many internal stakeholders to include Office of DEI, Office of Domestic Violence Strategies, all City Unions, all city CRG’s, City Council, the Commission on Women, Office for People with Disabilities, Office of LGBT Affairs, and the Offices of Human Resources and the Chief Administrative Officer.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

The integral role of labor relations staff in the negotiation of any racial equity policy or practice effected by city departments cannot be understated. An example of this is the implementation of Goal 3 (which reimagined the delivery of PPR programs and services to improve access to and better benefit underserved communities) by the Philadelphia Parks and Recreation Department. As a result of the labor relations work of PPR’s OLR business partner, PPR and the Union reached agreement and Goal 3 was advanced consistent with the department’s racial equity initiative.

Department of Licenses and Inspections (L & I)

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

External

Philadelphia’s majority Black neighborhoods continue to suffer the effects of historical disinvestment and underinvestment and today are often used as staging grounds for activities that would not be tolerated in upscale white neighborhoods. Poor neighborhood conditions contribute to violence, fire risks, and physical and mental health issues and make life harder for residents.

Core L&I functions directed at improving material conditions in these neighborhoods include:

- Responding to service requests from residents
- Proactive inspection programs targeting specific threats to safety and quality of life (e.g. auto repair businesses, tire dealers, large vacant commercial and industrial properties)
- Proactive blight-reduction programs shown to correlate with decrease in violent crime (e.g. “doors and windows”)
- Abating crime and fire danger by sealing abandoned properties against trespass
- Demolishing properties in danger of collapse

Internal

L&I participated in the first cohort of the Citywide Racial Equity Initiative. The department’s RE Team identified internal inequities tied to the root cause of valuing white Construction Inspectors over units with majority Black employees staff including Code Enforcement Inspectors and Clean and Seal staff. The Team identified need for culture change and a number of strategies to build a more equitable department. In addition, L&I Leadership has been and continues to pursue pay parity for inspectors and supervisors as between these units.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**

Current budget:

External

- respond to complaints
- proactive inspections
- clean and seal
- demolition
- partnership w Jumpstart Germantown
- partnership w Black Contractors Association
- participation in Urban Institute Health Impact Assessment

Internal

- Continue implementation of broadband structure for Code Enforcement inspectors – improving pay equity
- Right-sizing and institutionalizing Racial Equity Committee
- Continuing dialogue between Committee and management
- Review career ladders for (primarily Black) employees in non-inspector/non-plans examiner positions – address missing pathways to higher-paying, mgmt. positions or unnecessary qualifications requirements w disparate impact

External

- a) Strengths – Some excellent leadership and staff; higher level of eCLIPSE mastery among staff
- b) Challenges/weaknesses – high volume of complaints; high volume of trash/weeds complaints; inspector understaffing; IT/data understaffing; limited tool box (code enforcement process vs just fixing it, not enough Law Dept attys to take enough cases to court, properties can't be fixed b/c owner is broke and/or tangled title)
- c) Opportunities – innovations including SVNs (site violation notices) and well-received mobile app and devices expanding enforcement options, flexibility; planned shift towards proactive program inspections; figure out how to staff administrative enforcement to extend reach of department
- d) Threats – budget crunch; significantly increased cost for materials impact quantity of demolitions and Clean & Seals that can be performed within existing budget; City Council; return of COVID; enormity of problems (e.g. landlords take advantage b/c lack of affordable housing)

Internal

- a) Strength – good RE Team members drawn from across department; Exec Team members on RE Team; Commissioner, Deputy Commissioner buy-in

- b) Challenges/weaknesses – lack of expertise, direction, consensus; next steps unclear; Team members lack time and are run down; employees (people in general) exhausted, stressed from COVID; persistence of old patterns; budget; weakened connections over past years as people working from home/field
- c) Opportunities – supports, resources, and technical assistance from central Racial Equity; new trainees
- d) Threats – budget; how engage scattered staff in difficult conversations; see challenges above; Retention of staff.
 - Have not disaggregated external data by race in the past but there are opportunities to use census districts, zip codes as proxies
 - Do have disaggregated employee data by race but have not done deep analysis w racial lens. The offices does know that efforts to shrink pay disparity have in fact resulted in higher pay for BIPOC employees.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

- Broadband – narrowing pay gap
- BIPOC promotions, hires (e.g. Deputy Commissioner, new IT Director, new position created eCLIPSE Support Manager, Manager of Litigation Support Unit, Manager of Nuisance Property Unit, etc)
- Exec staff identification of Black candidates for advancement
- More frequent internal communications with more content on opportunities, resources for BIPOC employees
- Participation in Racial Equity Initiative
- Participation in community meetings, webinars, etc.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

- Racial Equity Initiative Team proposal
- Priorities driven by feedback and input from community through complaints, neighborhood walkthroughs, community meetings.
- Participation in Health Impact Assessment to inform rental housing regulation

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

For large parts of budget there is very limited discretion. Dollars must be directed to fulfill legal mandates: e.g. licensing, permitting, construction inspections, administrative appeals must conform to state Uniform Construction Code and Phila Building and Construction Codes.

Department of Planning and Development

Existing Spending and Operations

1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?

The Department of Planning and Development (DPD) aligns the City’s agencies whose missions relate to the built environment. DPD works in collaboration with communities to promote, plan, preserve, and develop successful neighborhoods for all. DPD includes the Divisions of: Executive Administration, Housing and Community Development (DHCD), Planning and Zoning (DPZ), and Development Services (DS). The office strives to promote equity through well-planned communities, supporting the production and preservation of affordable housing and development of healthy and vibrant neighborhoods for residents and businesses alike.

The Department recognizes that to advance the City’s vision for racial equity, bold and dramatic steps need to be taken to reverse the impacts of decades of policies that have perpetuated racial injustice. This is not easy work and requires us to take a deeper approach that involves listening to and involving residents in decisions from the outset of any plan, policy, development proposal, or legislation. It requires consistent involvement with residents- meeting them where they are, hearing their concerns, and gaining their trust. Examples where the office has begun this work include a three-year public process to build a plan for public lands in Eastwick, the largest urban renewal area in the country, significant public engagement over the past decade on the city’s comprehensive plan, and a commitment to include public engagement for all redevelopment and planning projects moving forward.

The intentional effort to restructure Philadelphia’s government by bringing the Philadelphia City Planning Commission (PCPC), Zoning Board of Adjustment (ZBA), Philadelphia Historical Commission (PHC), Developers Services (DS), and Division of Housing and Community Development (DHCD) together allows us to leverage, DHCD’s long history of supporting over 75 non-profits, including PHDC, to develop new and preserve existing affordable housing; create jobs, and strengthen neighborhoods. This includes working with our network of Housing Counseling Agencies, CBOs, and Neighborhood Advisory Committees (NACs) to provide direct programming and outreach to connect community residents to services to meet their needs.

DPZ develops long-range plans and policies, offers professional recommendations to the Mayor, City Council, and the Zoning Board, and determines priorities for city investment and preservation. DPZ is astute at supporting residents to articulate their vision for their communities and educating residents on public administrative processes; our technical and community engagement skills are in high demand from residents, elected officials, and city leadership, yet the current levels of staffing are inadequate for meaningful and sustained engagement. Together, the office can further advance racial equity in the City by investing in DPZ's capacity and enhancing DHCD engagement with communities to consider all the quality-of-life factors in our work that are important to residents – infrastructure, transportation, historical and cultural assets, land uses, access to jobs, and technology that impact the trajectory of communities.

Lastly, DPD is committed to investing in our staff's skills, knowledge, and experiences to promote racial awareness and ensure our team reflect the diversity of our city. DPD continues to work and explore means for eliminating procedural barriers and unnecessary and outdated job requirements that restrict our ability to hire, retain and promote diverse, qualified staff.

2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.

Today, DHCD currently administers the City's CDBG and HOME funding as well as our CDBG-CV funding. DHCD's current budget of approximately \$150M in Federal, State and Local funding supports a wide range of redevelopment projects and assistance programs that include supports for residents living in racially and ethnically concentrated areas of poverty. DPD also works to prevent displacement of low-income residents by supporting preservation projects and programs in neighborhoods with rapidly appreciating housing markets. Although approximately more than 80 percent of beneficiaries of these projects and programs collectively are minority, there are many groups that still do not have a voice.

As a step toward meeting this need, in January 2021, DHCD, in partnership with planning staff and CEO, secured a grant from the Urban Institute to participate in its *Upward Mobility Project* – designed to assist cities in using metrics, evaluation and community outreach strategies to engage a broader and more diverse range of residents to provide opportunities to hear their concerns and adjust policy and programs to meet their needs.

As DPD continues to align our work, new opportunities will arise to direct community development resources to address changing needs that may come to light as a result of the PCPC comprehensive planning process. While PCPC included a significant public engagement component in its previous work, as the office begins a new comprehensive planning effort, the department is practicing deep listening with an advisory team that represents a wider and more diverse cross-section of Philadelphians. Because planning as a field has a history of systemic racism, PCPC and its staff are particularly attuned to the need to reverse the effects of that history. PCPC is leading a nationwide campaign for equity in planning and adopted the principles outlined in the **Commitment to Change** manifesto. Crafted by planning leadership in major cities

with a goal to transform communities into places of opportunity for everyone; the commitment is to change practices, policies, regulations, and actions to create inclusive and diverse neighborhoods and cities that equitably meet the needs of all residents, especially Black, Indigenous, and people of color (BIPOC).

The Philadelphia Historical Commission (PHC) has already begun to change its preservation efforts by responding to calls to recognize Black and Brown histories; expanding outreach; and nominating more representative assets to the local historic register. With grant-funding, PHC is creating a cultural resource survey plan that is driven by authentic engagement and includes not just buildings, but tangible and intangible resources.

The Zoning Board of Adjustment (ZBA) is working with the CAO's Service Design Studio (SDS) to examine their practices and bring to light opportunities to improve transparency, efficiency, and reduce racial disparities.

DS is particularly attuned to the barriers facing developers of color, working collaboratively with PHDC and PIDC, staff work to streamline processes and offer advice and support navigating through regulatory processes and accessing incentives and resources available to support projects.

Lastly, DPD supports and encourages employees to participate in the City's Racial Equity Committee. DPD's Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion committee work to provide an inclusive workplace. For civil service recruiting strategies, the office will attend career fairs and present at schools to expose students of diverse communities to civil service positions. DBD will participate in HBCUs career events and target alumni networks of HBCUs. Our recruitment strategy for exempt positions includes advertising with diverse professional organizations. DPD also promotes participation in City Resource Groups, select diverse panels when reviewing resumes/participating in reviews, and provide our diverse staff mentoring opportunities and resources to join diverse professional organizations.

The DPD Director exemplifies leadership creating an anti-racist environment for the department, she has an open-door policy, engaged an external DEI consultant to solicit input from staff on the issues and challenges of working at DPD and hosts quarterly town hall meetings where all staff are invited and encouraged to raise concerns and propose solutions. Additionally, the DPD Director regularly attends the DEI committee meetings to listen and encourage staff to implement their ideas. She has also reached out to the Department of Behavioral Health for additional support and resources to support the DEI Team to support courageous conversation among staff. She enforces existing city policies related to respect, equity, and fairness.

School Presentations:

Strength: Exposes students to careers they may never knew existed; introduces students to strategies to engage with city government to promote civic life

Weakness: Long term strategy- no quick fix; our capacity is limited and there is no 'one size fits all' approach

Opportunity: Develop tailored curricula for elementary, middle school, and high school students; include examples that are relevant to the students; partner with school district and with institutions of higher education to develop continuous education and a pipeline for entry into the fields

Threat: Lack of diverse planners today limit our ability to connect with residents' issues and concerns; and lack of a long-term research partner or system to track student involvement

Comprehensive Planning:

Strength: Including and amplifying voices of diverse range of residents in the comprehensive planning process will help center city priorities, policy, and action around their needs rather than promoting the needs of people who are already in power

Weakness: There is no single community or group that represents the voices of all communities. Including these voices involves a commitment to deep listening; there is a lack of capacity across city government to conduct deep engagement

Opportunity: Build the capacity of city government to elevate the voices of black and brown residents; amplify their voices and design public plans and policies around peoples' needs; develop trust of residents; increased capacity to document community needs and values now can help inform not only plans and policies, but can also inform future development decisions

Threat: Because the City is often forced to react to immediate needs, it does not often invest in resources that will drive deep, long-lasting change

Leveraging CBOs and NACs

Strength: There is a strong network of neighborhood groups – housing counseling, legal services, NACs and CBOs – that currently works within the community to engage residents and connects to broad range of services and programs. In addition, over the past several months the Upward Mobility team has engaged several City partners including, Office of Engagement and Volunteer Services, OHS, DBHIDs, Commerce Revenue, and Reentry Partnerships. External partners such as PHS, were also engaged.

Weakness: Pre-pandemic these partner groups lacked the funding needed to expand to ensure broader and more meaningful engagement. Crushing number of most vulnerable residents are facing eviction/foreclosure and these groups have had to focus efforts with very little increase in funding.

Opportunity: Existing network that with additional flexible funding for these groups and outreach strategies, more residents could be reached to improve long-term sustainable change. These partners could also be leveraged to assist in the Comprehensive Planning process.

Threats: Lack of capacity/resources and increasing needs caused by the pandemic.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

- Regarding recruitment, the office utilizes the budget to promote vacant exempt positions on diverse networking group websites and support our diverse professional staff to participate in professional networks to build awareness of DPD and encourage candidates to consider opportunities at DPD.

- Recently, DPZ had the opportunity to discuss diverse hiring strategies with the City of Baltimore. As a result of that conversation, DPD has requested a compensation survey of the City Planner job classification series and will be recommending revisions to the job education and experience requirements with the goal for increasing the number of diverse candidates.
 - DPD has used and will continue to use a portion of its training budget to secure consultants with DEI expertise to train staff. Past trainings have included recognizing internal biases and adopting a manifesto to ensure that the office is truly listening to and creating safe spaces for BIPOC both internally and with external stakeholders. Future sessions with consultants will include more specialized trainings about how to host diverse and inclusive workshops.
 - DPD uses a portion of all grant awards to secure DEI consultants and public engagement firms with expertise in anti-racism to develop scopes of work, RFPs, and designs of processes before proceeding with program design and execution. This ensures that the office is being inclusive from Day 1 of any project.
- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget**

Internal Processes:

- DPD’s Director and Deputies solicit input from staff at all levels to identify unmet budgetary needs, consider how to provide a better workplace experience, and where to adjust funding to address inequities. For example, DPD savings during COVID for office supplies is allowing us to allocate funding to translate materials into additional languages and respond to the changing Philadelphia population. Lastly, our research staff closely tracks program participation levels, and communicate to program administrators to allow us to adjust marketing and outreach resources to ensure that those served by our programs, are representative of the Philadelphia populations in greatest need.
- DPD allocates funding to support: DEI Training, the work of our DEI committees and professional association fees for our diverse staff. DPD is seeking to support innovation in the civil service regulations by revising the skills necessary for advancement. DPD is continuing to work with OHR to align job specs with the work, ultimately supporting diverse staff advancement within the department.

External Processes:

- To ensure the department aligns its services and resources to respond to front line organizations, DPD produced a Housing Action Plan (HAP). The HAP was produced in the Fall of 2018 with the support of external consultants and solicited input from residents, service providers, housing policy experts and developers. It set ambitious 10-year goals and reports quarterly bi-annually
<https://www.phila.gov/departments/division-of-housing-and-community-development/about/housing-action-plan/housing-action-plan-dashboard/>
- DHCD is also required every year to undergo a public engagement process to produce an Annual Action Plan that includes proposed budget and plan for the use of \$150M in Federal

CDBG; HOME; HOPWA; ESG and Local General Funds and Housing Trust Funds. This begins with a public Needs Assessment hearing and 1-2 additional hearings on the proposed and final plan. DHCD works with outward facing staff in multiple city department to increase awareness of the proposed plan, ensure it is accessible to diverse populations and encourage public feedback. Every 5 years, DHCD produces an Assessment of Fair Housing (AFH). This year that process will include a survey, stakeholder engagement and TRF will provide data analysis to identify barriers to housing opportunities and recommendations to address those barriers.

- The CAO's Service Design Studio has engaged several internal and external stakeholders in its current effort to map business processes and identify issues within the operations of the Zoning Board of Adjustment. The Team interviewed all City agencies that interact with the ZBA, the development community, attorneys, pro se applicants (not represented by an attorney), and a variety of Registered Community Organizations (RCOs). This effort helped to inform our budget requests around improving transparency and efficiency to improve interactions between the Board and marginalized communities of color and less-resourced homeowner and small business applicants.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

There's a pressing imperative for how DPD conducts business to better serve residents, especially those who have been historically underserved and suffered because of racial inequities. This new era of work is built on the principles of recognition of our diversity to ensure inclusion for all to foster and sustain an equitable city. No longer a profession of static maps and reports, the planning landscape has changed. Past planning practice undermined equity. Today, the new planning landscape is dynamic and focused on implementation of policies to create just and equitable communities. Philadelphia is rife with examples of systemic racism in planning and development.

Reversing the effects of decades of racism and disinvestment is neither easy nor quick. It requires gaining the trust of the residents who have been abused for years. It requires not just advertising a public meeting and opening the doors, as was done in the past. It requires meeting residents where they are, hearing their concerns, and gaining their trust. Only then will an invitation to participate be seen as an opportunity to engage rather than a box to be checked. In short, Philadelphia is unlikely to navigate the tension between new development and residents and the current residents who see both as a threat, without investment in the capacity of the organization whose role it is to navigate it. Similarly, Philadelphia is unlikely to replace historic inequity with equitable development without the staff who will make that their goal.

Building community capacity is critical to complement City engagement- DHCD supports this through our funding to NACs, housing counseling agencies and other community non-profits. Additional, CPI and PCPC staffing, can ensure that neighborhood leaders who participate in NACs or other CBOs gain an understanding of public sector processes and build cross-city relationships to effectively advocate for equitable public access to resources and services.



The mission of DPD is to work in collaboration with communities to promote, plan, preserve and develop successful neighborhoods for all. Bluntly, the Department cannot accomplish that mission at its current staff level. Mass communications – social media, advertising, flyers, and mailers – cannot gain the trust of a community. Only people can do that. DPD doesn't have enough people to perform this outreach and engage communities to the level our residents so richly deserve.

Department of Public Health

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Department of Public Health's mission is to protect and promote the health of all Philadelphians and to provide a safety net for the most vulnerable. The Department's public health programs disproportionately serve people of color in the city. This includes programs focused on reducing the health harms associated with HIV/AIDS, gun violence, tobacco use, maternal and infant mortality and morbidity, obesity, air pollution and asthma, and more. Ambulatory Health Services (AHS), the department's largest division, operates eight health centers across the city serving approximately 80,000 low-income, uninsured Philadelphians, a majority of whom are people of color, per year.

The areas of opportunity to advance racial equity in the department's core work are 1) the hiring of the department's first Chief Racial Equity Officer (candidate selected; vetting in process) who will lead the creation of a health equity plan for the department including the announcement of racism as a public health problem and strategic objectives and goals for addressing that problem, including both internal and external goals; 2) the creation of a plan for expanding and coordinating community outreach and engagement work to strengthen relationships with grassroots community groups and leaders; 3) the development of equity-focused preparedness including a focus on improving communications with communities that have experienced historic racism and disinvestment; 4) AHS aims to increase access to services by building a new health center and expanding Health Center 3. This infrastructure investment is imperative to ensure that patients, who come from historically underinvested neighborhoods, have access to services in facilities that look and feel safe, secure and inviting; 5) expansion of AMS' team to address environmental justice concerns through exploration of cumulative impact, support for citizen science initiatives, and development of more effective strategies for communicating with communities at highest risk during air quality emergencies; and 6) work as part of the departmental health equity plan to address workforce diversity, including pipeline to jobs, promotions, and mentoring, advisory boards and contracting.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**

b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?

The Department strives to improve health equity and lessen health disparities for Philadelphia's non-white and distressed populations. Multiple divisions and programs offer solutions to encourage sustainable health practices and living environments.

AHS's health centers provide medical and dental services to all despite financial or language barriers. In a city that is 60% non-white, the City health centers serve a population that is 90% non-white.

Maternal, Child and Family Health (MCFH) addresses the racial disparities in Black maternal and infant mortality and childhood asthma through its Maternal Mortality Review Committee (MMRC), Infant Mortality Community Action Network (CAN) and Room2Breathe.

Covid Containment (CoCo) co-manages the City's Isolation and Quarantine site, which serves an unsheltered population that is disproportionately African American. These services also support persons experiencing loss of income due to COVID-19 through a grocery delivery program during the isolation or quarantine period as well as provision of information in multiple languages, masks, and free at-home COVID-19 PCR tests. CoCo also manages an epidemiology and data program that informs policy, decision-making and implementation with a focus on racial equity.

Disease Control (DDC) implements a broad vaccination strategy to achieve sustainable and equitable vaccine access across the city. This is accomplished through the use of community engagement tools, deploying several vaccination clinics models (e.g. mobile sites, pop-up clinics, mobile teams, community vaccination clinics, etc.) in locations selected based on the lowest vaccinated census tracts, and continued community collaboration. Additionally, in partnership with the CDC Foundation, the Immunization program recently hired a dedicated Health Equity Program Manager to evaluate existing programs and develop a comprehensive Health Equity Plan for the division.

The Lead and Healthy Homes Program (LHHP) works to improve the health and safety of housing in Philadelphia by working with families, homeowners, and landlords to reduce lead hazards in homes and providing home inspection and remediation to eligible families.

AHS offers health center patients services on a sliding pay scale with interpretation assistance. All health centers were able to adjust its operations to continue safely during the pandemic. However, wait times for an appointment is at least a year. The delay in services prevents

intervention and relief for patients who have lacked consistent preventative services. There is an opportunity to expand service capacity by building a new health center and investing in Health Center 3.

MCFH's MMRC has convened a team of experts and community members for a multidisciplinary approach to reviewing maternal deaths and recommend action. However, there isn't a surveillance system in place to review severe maternal morbidity or life-threatening complications. Such a system will enable MMRC and its Organizing Voices for Action team to understand near-misses and what actionable steps can be taken to prevent them.

CoCo has organized outreach, services and recruitment practices around local racial and ethnic communities. It must continue to adjust its services as new information is learned about COVID-19 and restrictions are adjusted.

DDC's Vaccine Barriers workgroup identified seven key threats to advancing racial equity in COVID vaccination including: technology, transportation, mistrust/hesitancy, process, accessibility, vaccine confidence, and outreach communication and engagement. To address these barriers, the program implemented: in-person tabling events to answer questions and register the community for vaccines, provided transportation and transportation passes to vaccination sites, an at home vaccination program for people with disabilities and vaccination clinics located in low vaccination census tracts. Vaccine hesitancy based on historic and present-day racism remains a barrier to equity in vaccination rates, although disparities for those 45 and older have closed.

LHHP experienced COVID-19 barriers, including limited access due to COVID-restrictions and safety concerns.

The Department recognizes the importance of reaching communities that have historically lacked adequate attention and care. Therefore, the Department strives to keep robust quantitative data to maintain performance accountability and ensure the office is reaching communities of color. The office's data reflects it is effective, however there is room for improvement.

Of the patients AHS has served, 56% are Black or African America, 22% Hispanic or Latino and 12% Asian; 50% of the patients are uninsured. Furthermore, AHS is the largest user of language interpretation services in the City through the Mayor's Office of Immigration Services. AHS clinics (excluding the separate PDPH vaccine clinics) gave 29,916 COVID vaccinations of which 60% went to African Americans, 17% to Latinos, and 10% to Asians, while continuing to provide full service primary care throughout the pandemic, including sick visits at a time when many primary care offices declined to see their own patients when ill.

The latest [report](#) from the MMRC has detailed information on pregnancy-related and pregnancy-associated deaths disaggregated by race and ethnicity. Based on discussions with partners across the city, MCFH has begun work on a collaborative effort to enroll 50% percent of eligible patients in Heart Safe Motherhood, a remote postpartum blood pressure monitoring program, across all Philadelphia delivery hospitals. The CAN recently identified that the biggest area for intervention to address Black infant mortality is to focus on prematurity. MCFH is working to complete the Perinatal Periods of Risk assessment, which it will use to define further activities of the Community Action Network. To date, 394 children have been enrolled in Room2Breathe, a home asthma intervention program for children who have had multiple hospitalizations and/or ER visits for asthma and of new enrollees this past quarter, 33% identified as Black, 20% as Latinx.

The Division of COVID Containment (CoCo) has succeeded in maintaining workforce diversity to strategize and implement COVID-19 initiatives. It's staff demographics include: 53% Black, 22% White, 13% Asian, 11% Hispanic/Latino, and 1% other. Among that group: 30% are fluent in another language, 35% first general college student, 26% born outside US and 21% LGBTQ+. By hiring from diverse communities across Philadelphia, CoCo has improved their ability to reach those who may have received too little information or misinformation about COVID-19.

Through targeted efforts, COVID vaccination rates for Black Philadelphians continue to rise and disparities for Philadelphia 45 and over have been closed. As of December 17th, 61% of Black residents, 73% of White residents, 80% of Hispanic residents, and over 95% of Asian residents aged 12+ have received at least one dose of COVID vaccine. Census tract data is used to identify neighborhoods with low vaccination rates as well as highlight clusters of under-vaccinated residents within highly vaccinated zip codes. The data further informs policies and programming that directs outreach initiatives, community canvassing efforts, and the deployment of vaccination sites.

LHHP serves approximately 85% minority families.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

The department aims to hire and retain a workforce that reflects the racial makeup of Philadelphia. Additionally, the office aspires to have a collaborative environment that intentionally engages a diverse group in decision-making, outreach, and validation. A Chief Racial Equity Officer position was created to participate in the Department's executive team, help set programmatic and policy direction, and participate in budget planning decisions. PDPH has also created an internal health equity committee made up of members from each division and 2 members of that committee served on the hiring committee for the Chief Racial Equity Officer.

Several divisions have convened their own internal staff-run Health Justice Committees that collaborate with the internal health equity committee. The goals of these internal committees are to:

- Integrate diversity, equity, and inclusion work into staff meetings
- Expand professional development opportunities for staff including trainings, mentorship, and promotional opportunities
- Hold monthly learning labs to engage staff in discussions and provide a space to share ideas

The Department's Workforce Development Plan prioritizes Equity and Professionalism, and focuses on strategies to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace. In addition, the Department has implemented several internship and fellowship programs, including the Urban Health Policy Fellowship and the Philly Forward Internship, each of which target new professionals or college students interested in public health. The program has attracted racially and ethnically diverse participants and provides the Department with an opportunity to diversify its workforce. The Department has hired as permanent staff a number of the Urban Health Policy Fellows, several of whom have earned promotions. Additionally, the Department plans to conduct research and analysis on employee compensation to ensure equal pay.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The transparent involvement of internal and external stakeholders is a key part of the Department's programs and budget planning:

- AHS health centers are governed by the Health Center Patient Board, 53% of whom are patients at the health centers. The Board has the authority and responsibility of annually approving the Ambulatory Health Services budget, which is the Department's largest, at over \$50 million in general fund appropriations. Among Board members who reported data, 75% identify as Black, 17% as White, and 10% as Hispanic/Latino. Among Board members, 67% identify as female.
- One of the Department's biggest budget and program priorities is assuring a successful and equitable COVID-19 vaccination effort. To achieve this goal, the Department prioritized vaccine administration based on an equity-based risk assessment that considers race, socioeconomic status, language access, health insurance status, and other factors, and prioritizes vaccination resources accordingly. In addition, the Department convenes a COVID-19 Vaccine Advisory Committee (VAC), which is combined with the Racial Equity Response Team. The committee includes a panel of experts and leaders from community-based organizations and healthcare systems that represent key stakeholders in

Philadelphia. Membership on the VAC includes representatives from the Black Doctors COVID-19 Consortium, Esperanza Health Center, the Mayor’s Commission on People with Disabilities, Nationalities Service Center, the Philadelphia Corporation for Aging, Puentes de Salud, Project HOME, the Urban League, and more than a dozen other organizations. The VAC continues to meet monthly and to advise PDPH on strategies for continuing to improve equity in the pandemic response.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Serving a city that is majority minority, the Department considers racial equity across all divisions. The aforementioned Chief Racial Equity Officer will strategically organize health equity efforts across divisions to ensure cohesion and efficacy. Health Equity strategy and work by other divisions, not mentioned prior, is worth noting. In 2020, the AIDS Activities Coordinating Office (AACO) produced a Community Plan to End the HIV Epidemic in Philadelphia along with a Health Equity Policy. The plan committed to work with community providers to reduce stigma and practice in their outreach efforts. The accompanied policy pledged to focus their efforts and intentions beyond the disparities, aiming at where they foment first by addressing the social determinants of health inequity.

Chronic Disease and Injury Prevention launched its injury prevention unit to support healthier communities by reducing gun violence. Their work is designed to take a public health approach to the prevention of gun violence and includes the creation of a first in the country Hospital-based Violence Intervention Program collaborative across all the trauma centers in Philadelphia as well as collaborations with city and community-based organizations. Gun violence in Philadelphia disproportionately affects communities of color. As of December 2021, gun violence statistics in Philadelphia shows that 84% of victims Black, 9% Hispanic and 1% Asian.

Department of Public Property (DPP)

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

As mandated in the Home Rule Charter, the Department of Public Property (DPP) manages, maintains and cleans the buildings where City employees work, and city residents come to conduct city business in person. DPP’s mission is to responsibly serve the City’s workforce and community by providing quality facilities and workspaces of which the office is proud about. While DPP does not keep employee statistics based on race, DPP anecdotally knows that there are many black, indigenous and people of color (BIPOC) working in city facilities on a daily basis and that by following DPP’s mission and improving the conditions where those employees work will lead to a more positive work experience.

DPP also does not keep statistics on who uses the numerous services in city facilities, but anecdotally, DPP is aware that many city residents who need in person services need them for reasons that threaten their livelihood – to avoid water shut off, to avoid eviction, to report a bad landlord, to pay taxes, to request emergency services, etc. Most of the residents coming into city facilities in person do so because they have no access to online services. Many people who feel this negative impact of the digital divide are BIPOC. Improving the experience of those BIPOC residents using the City’s in person services by better maintaining facilities would create a more positive experience for people who are coming in out of great necessity.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

DPP plans to maintain and clean the neighborhood facilities with the existing budget, which includes 113 various Police and Fire stations and will account for \$15.4 million in FY23. 41% of Fire facilities and 35% of Police facilities are in zip codes where 50% or more of the BIPOC population of Philadelphia reside. Work orders for fire facilities in areas that have a majority of BIPOC residents account for 41% of all work orders. Work orders for police facilities in areas that have a majority of BIPOC residents account for 51% of all work orders. Eight of the top 20 fire facilities where DPP performs the most maintenance are in areas where the BIPOC population resides. 13 of the top 20 police facilities where DPP performs the most maintenance are in areas where the BIPOC population resides. Some examples of opportunities to make a positive impact on these facilities include servicing public restrooms, cleaning common areas, ensuring the facilities are well lit, ensuring temperature levels are comfortable, providing clean and welcoming reception areas, and ensuring the facilities are leak proof. Underfunding these core services is a threat that does a disservice to the BIPOC population, as well as to the BIPOC employees who work in these locations. Providing inadequate, unclean workspaces to employees decreases morale and could consequently lead to hostile encounters with residents.

DPP plans to maintain and clean the Quad-plex and the new Public Services Building with the existing budget which will account for \$23.6 million in FY23. A majority of the customers that use city services in person are people who have no access to technology. A large number of those people are assumed to be BIPOC. DPP has the opportunity to provide these residents clean, functional, welcoming buildings if funded properly. Additionally, almost 10,000 City employees work in these five locations. DPP anecdotally knows that there are a large number of BIPOC employees who work in these locations. Underfunding core maintenance and cleaning functions is a threat that does a disservice to the employee population, potentially leading to morale issues as mentioned above.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

DPP intends to work with OHR in improving recruitment practices, which is going to entail adequately paying trades employees. Trade workers in DPP are paid on average \$51,000 annually. Trade workers in trades unions make substantially more money, but do not have the job security of working for the City, which is an area where the City should focus its recruitment efforts. DPP would like to partner with OHR to increase the pay scale and to then recruit in areas of the city that may not historically been aware of City job opportunities. 40% of the trade workers are BIPOC, and the office could increase that number through more

recruitment efforts now that the Rule of Two has been changed. In the past DPP has recruited from Edison High School for high school apprentices who would be hired full-time in DPP upon successful completion of their high school requirements. This program has been met with mixed success, and the office would like to increase these opportunities in the future and feel partnering with OHR to market the possibilities of city employment will be beneficial. DPP's promotional opportunities remain the same as the Rule of Two has been the official rule of promoting from within since the inception of the Home Rule Charter. DPP intends to use the expansion of this rule as it promotes internal candidates in the future.

For years, DPP had a robust employee engagement program that included surveys and randomly selected individual conversations with DPP employees to discuss areas of equality, race, diversity and promotional opportunities. These surveys and conversations led to training programs in areas such as multicultural and generation understanding in the workplace. These surveys and conversations were put on hold two years ago as DPP thought it was going to be placed in the more structured DEI cohort. DPP has recently learned that it was not placed in that cohort, so DPP is working with the Office of DEI to reestablish these surveys, conversations and trainings until such a time when DPP will be involved with the more formal cohort.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The Commissioner works with the leaders of each division to create the annual budget. These division leaders reach out to their respective staff members to get ideas throughout the year, and those ideas are rolled up into the budget requests. The budget justification requests are a direct result of DPP staff members informing their respective division supervisors and managers what is needed to adequately fulfill the maintenance and cleaning obligations of the department.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Cutting the maintenance budget has an indirect negative impact on racial equity. For every dollar cut in preventive maintenance, maintenance is deferred in facilities to the point where

the neglect becomes a capital expense. Capital projects come with hefty price tags, and debt obligations that city residents will have to pay off for years. This Administration paid \$1 million for a facilities maintenance master plan that it committed to fund. That plan has not been adequately funded on the capital side and is not nearly funded properly on the operating side, to eliminate some of the issues before they become a capital expense. If capital debt obligations were decreased, the payments for these debt obligations could be better used on funding programs focused on racial equity and poverty.

Department of Records

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The first core function is the recorder of deeds, which oversees the recordation of deeds, mortgages, and other documents. Related to this function are the issues of deed fraud and tangled title, each of which disproportionately affect communities of color, and deprive families of the enjoyment and orderly transfer of generational wealth. Records continues to expand upon innovative partnerships with community stakeholders in the nonprofit, educational, legal, and law enforcement arenas, and with the Register of Wills to educate the public about these issues and provide tools to prevent or resolve them.

The second core function is the City Archives, one of the largest and oldest municipal archives in the United States. The Archives has a vital role to play in inclusively expanding community outreach to a more diverse group of residents than have traditionally accessed the Archives. Beginning with a permanent indoor interactive mural installed in 2018 highlighting the issues of redlining, and resistance to housing discrimination, and enslavement in Philadelphia, the Archives has reimagined how to expand from being largely a professional research facility to one actively creating a dialogue with Philadelphia communities on the history of marginalized groups in the city. The Archives has been doing so through exhibits, a panel series, and now with the 7th Ward Tribute, a project being developed with a grant from Pew Charitable Trust, and an upcoming RFP to digitize genealogical records.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

With respect to deed fraud, Records has retained a local MBE public relations firm to develop the first ever citywide outreach campaign to educate the public on deed fraud, placing particular emphasis on communities of color, which have the disproportionate share of victims. Regarding tangled title, Records is continuing and expanding its partnership with the Register of Wills’ Probate Deferment Initiative which defers probate fees and waives recording fees for qualified individuals experiencing tangled title, the large majority of which reside in communities of color.

The challenge of these efforts is continuing to reach enough residents in meaningful ways to have a measurable impact.

The City Archives 7th Ward Tribute will consist of a series of permanent art installations in the community over the next two years, highlighting the culturally vibrant Black community that flourished in the 7th Ward in the early twentieth century. This is the Archives' historic first effort to expand beyond the office's four walls and bring the Archives into the communities across the city. The challenge and opportunity of the Tribute is to ensure that the office structures it an inclusive manner that incorporates input from community stakeholders and historians in order to present an equitable and meaningful experience. Finally, Archives will be issuing a concession RFP this spring to digitize over 11 million genealogical records from the city's collection, with the goal of making them available online (in addition to in-person) at no cost to Philadelphia residents. This will permit Philadelphia residents to access their family histories in a way previously unavailable. The challenge of the project is to ensure equitable access to this digitized material.

Regarding deed fraud, during the two years of the pandemic Records has seen a substantial reduction in deed fraud reports submitted to us (from about 145 to 55). However, it remains to be seen the extent to which this reduction is pandemic related. Ultimately, the goal is to see a sustained annual reduction over time. In the meantime, the goal is that the outreach campaign will increase participation (currently approximately 1,500) in the office's Fraud Guard service, a free email alert service that notifies subscribers if a document is recorded with their name in it. Regarding tangled title, the office seeks to increase participation in the Probate Deferment Initiative through continued public outreach efforts with the Register of Wills and increase the number of tangled titles resolved through the program (currently resolved almost 15 tangled titles). Regarding, Archives is in the process of determining how to measure impacts for the 7th Ward Tribute. Regarding the digitization RFP, the office ultimately will measure the number of city residents who access the online genealogical records.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

- As part of addressing a COVID-related deed recording backlog, Records began offering cross-training opportunities to anyone interested in the department to learn deed recording. Over twenty team members have or will be cross trained, which opens up potential career path options in this higher skilled position.
- Records has also begun identifying team members who have or recently received bachelor or more advanced degrees for potential growth and leadership opportunities in the department.
- The office continues to offer a variety of trainings to team members in relevant areas from the Law Department, law enforcement, and related government agencies.
- The office has also begun to offer opportunities to the team to participate in the development and creation of public presentations given by the Commissioner or Deputy

Commissioner. This has included the opportunity to co-present with department leadership. For example, in September 2021, members of the Archives researched and created a PowerPoint presentation given to a statewide real estate industry association, and then co-presented with the Commissioner to a group of over two hundred people.

- Records continues to offer team members the opportunities to represent the department at a few dozen community outreach events annually to answer questions about deed fraud, tangled title, and other deed recording questions encountered by members of the public, who often may be unrepresented by real estate professionals.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

All of the programs described above and the budgets underlying them involve extensive engagement with internal and/or external stakeholders. With respect to deed fraud, Records has partnered for several years with the Philadelphia Bar Association Fraudulent Conveyance Task Force, a diverse and inclusive group consisting of representatives from the nonprofit legal services community, the courts, law enforcement, housing nonprofits, local law school clinics, state and local elected officials, and other related state, local, and nonprofit agencies. Regarding tangled title, Records continues its partnership with the Register of Wills to perform community outreach to train community leaders, elected officials, and residents on tangled title on how to preserve their generational wealth. It has also included outreach to learn best practices from other jurisdictions where tangled title disproportionately impacts communities of color, such as southeastern Louisiana and Puerto Rico. Finally, Archives’ 7th Ward Tribute will involve extensive input from community stakeholders, and a diverse group of historians and experts on how develop the Tribute in a manner that fosters an inclusive experience for Philadelphia residents.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Not currently.

Department of Revenue

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Department of Revenue's mission is to collect tax and non-tax revenue due to the City and tax revenue due to the School District of Philadelphia which serves children and communities of color. Revenue's collection work generates the funds required by other departments to deliver services to citizens.

While generating and collecting revenue is essential to Revenue's mission, the Department is also committed to promoting racial equity through its services and programs. The Department provides over \$170 million in Real Estate Tax relief and water-bill affordability to Philadelphians and continues to focus outreach efforts for these programs to BIPOC communities.

The Department supports the financial stability of BIPOC communities by building better engagement with community organizations and ensuring that its collection strategies are aligned with the DEI goals of the City. This will be achieved by Implementing innovative engagement strategies that ensure eligible customers/taxpayers are informed and educated about all available assistance programs, utilizing existing data sources to increase and simplify enrollment, and extending payment agreements and tax credits and exemptions to all who are eligible.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

One of the City's strengths is its safety net for vulnerable residents and small businesses. The Department of Revenue has championed some of the most progressive assistance programs and innovative outreach in the country. One weakness is the Department's previous limitations in collecting racial demographic information. This gap means that focusing assistance programs to BIPOC communities can be more difficult. With the implementation of the Philadelphia Tax Center, the Department will be able to collect this information, albeit on a voluntary basis.

- **Commitment to innovative outreach** to bolster enrollment in taxpayer and water customer assistance and credit programs, such as partnerships with City Council and community organizations to pilot texting and robocall campaigns to reach BIPOC taxpayers who are on the other side of the digital divide.
 - **Administer the Owner-occupied Payment Agreement (OOPA) program that protects vulnerable homeowners from Sheriff Sale in rapidly changing neighborhoods.** OOPA allows all homeowners to make affordable monthly payments on property taxes that are past due. Nearly 8,000 households are enrolled in an OOPA, with over \$78 million under agreement. Some homeowners qualify for a \$0-a-month payment agreement.
 - **Administer Water Affordability Programs.** Revenue is committed to removing barriers to water affordability programs and continues to pursue cross enrollment collaborations within the Department and with other local and state agencies:
 - **Senior Citizen Discount Program (SCD):** 22,000 households are enrolled in SCD, which offers a 25% discount on water bills to eligible, low-income seniors.
 - **Tiered Assistance Program (TAP):** 17,000 households are enrolled in TAP, which offers affordable water bills based on household income and offers debt forgiveness on previous water account balances once the customer makes 24 complete monthly payments.
 - **Creating more equitable enforcement policies:** The Law Department is pivoting enforcement toward higher-dollar tax and water cases, and away from away from small-dollar tax and water cases. This improves the equity of its litigation by decreasing the number of cases in which the taxpayer/customer is unrepresented.
 - **Commitment to language access to multi-lingual BIPOC communities:** Revenue is currently conducting a multi-year project to improve outreach to vulnerable immigrant communities. The project includes creating a directory of community organizations and interventions to reduce the amount of delinquency and protect homeownership in BIPOC communities.
3. **Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

The Department participated in the FY21 Racial Equity Cohort and allocated \$40,000 in its FY22 budget towards racial equity initiatives and strategies. This funding is a recurring budget item. Training has always been a priority for the Department, but Revenue is being more intentional about providing tools and resources to all employees, and in particular supervisors and managers to ensure they have the skills necessary to lead and meet the needs of diverse staff.

This past summer, the office launched the Supervisor Training Exemplary Program (STEP). The STEP program is mandatory for all supervisors and provides opportunities to build foundational leadership skills that will position them for success as they advance in their professional careers. Additionally, through various training and development vendors and colleges, diversity, equity

and inclusion training is a primary focus. Budgeted dollars will also be used to relaunch Revenue’s mentorship program in FY23 which first launched in FY21, but was interrupted by the COVID-19 pandemic. The mentorship program is an opportunity for employees to be paired with mentors for professional coaching and development.

All hiring panels for exempt and Civil Service positions comprise of diverse interviewers.

Structured questions are developed so that all candidates are asked the same questions. Revenue confers with HR and Talent to ensure that the Department is advertising and recruiting with diverse organizations and universities and develops more targeted recruitment strategies when necessary.

Racial Trauma Initiative –Through the Racial Equity Strategy work, Revenue is developing an inwardly focused strategy to address racial trauma that Revenue employees may have or are experiencing. Revenue is currently partnering with the Department of Human Services to develop a platform to understand racial trauma and its impact, offer listening sessions, develop training and establish a resource hub for those impacted. Focusing on racial trauma will address the needs of Revenue’s employees and will produce positive outcomes for them and the customers served by the Department.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The team that developed the Department’s programmatic budget and participates in the annual operating budget submission and assistance program policy/initiatives are a diverse group of executive leaders, directors and managers, including LatinX and African Americans.

Through Revenue’s Racial Equity Strategy work, Revenue used Census data to evaluate where tax delinquent accounts are located, overlaid with racial demographics of city neighborhoods. Initial analysis showed strong delinquencies in LatinX and African American neighborhoods. This allowed the Department to explore root causes and begin to collaborate with external and internal stakeholders around potential systemic changes to programs and procedures to advance racial equity.

One of Revenue’s major program initiatives that launched in FY2022 was the implementation of the City’s new tax system of record, including a new public-facing website to file and pay taxes, the Philadelphia Tax Center. As part of the project, a team of Revenue employees of diverse backgrounds convened a Community Impact Workgroup to work on the PRISM design, develop and propose internal and external communication, and collaborate with the Racial Equity Team on strategies to improve department transparency. A primary focus is the impact the new tax

system will have on stakeholders, especially those of color, from change management, design impacts, and external outreach perspectives.

Additionally, for the first time, the new system has the ability to voluntarily capture racial demographics of taxpayers. The Department plans to analyze this data to better meet the needs of BIPOC customers. The system also includes a feedback feature, allowing the public to provide timely comments for the department to review and act upon more promptly than in the past.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

The Department does not have anything else to share that is not covered in its responses to the other questions.

District Attorney's Office

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Philadelphia District Attorney's Office (DAO) is working to build a safer, fairer, and more just Philadelphia. The more than 600 lawyers, detectives and support staff of the DAO are committed to serving the 1.5 million residents of Philadelphia and are responsible for the prosecution of over 30,000 criminal cases annually. The DAO is organized in eight programs: Pre-Trial, Trial, Investigations, Juvenile, Law, Narcotics, Detectives, and General Support & Community Engagement.

The DAO core functions include the evaluation of evidence, filing of criminal complaints, prosecution of crime, prevention of crime and community engagement. The department is guided by facts, evidence, and the law as the office seeks justice every day. Prosecutors are relentless in the pursuit of justice on behalf of victims of crime and the communities served. DAO is also mindful of the impacts of the decisions on individuals, families, and communities. The office engages in scientific review of case outcomes to assess performance and seek to learn from prosecutors and law enforcement from around the country.

DAO is focused on restoring balance to the criminal justice system, ending the era of mass incarceration, and moving beyond the false promises of overly punitive policies.

Decades of evidence shows that the criminal legal system plays a large role in creating and addressing inequalities disproportionately leaving communities of color with inadequate access to quality public education, healthcare, and housing. Over incarceration is an ineffective and costly response to complex social problems like homelessness, mental illness, and substance use disorders—These health determinates continue to disproportionately impact people of color throughout the city.

Philadelphia can and must do better to improve racial equity and the team at the DAO are committed to doing it's part.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**

b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?

A critical program addressing racial equity is grant-giving initiative funding to community-based organizations focused on gun violence. Most of the awardee organizations are led by people of color and serve people of color. Through this initiative the office was awarded over \$800K in grants to 28 community-based organizations in FY22. DAO is focused on a progressive approach to criminal justice that is implemented through numerous new policies, practices, people, and initiatives all rooted in race, gender, and socioeconomic equity.

The office is committed to replacing overly punitive sentences that disproportionately affect people of color and poor people. A system that holds people accountable, enables them to show remorse and repair harm, and empowers them to live productive lives after completing their sentences or supervision ultimately makes us all safer. Mass incarceration and mass supervision create and further racial inequity.

The historical legacy of racial discrimination in the criminal justice system places a burden on individuals who carry this legacy as Criminal History Information Records of arrest, prosecution and conviction. The DAO has many policies focused on reducing the impact of the criminal legal system, criminal records and collateral consequences on people. Seeking more flexibility and smarter alternatives to prosecution based on expanded eligibility requirements for defendants, including mental illness or substance addiction. Additionally, expungements, clean slate motions, pardons, commutations, and exonerations. The office is also addressing criminal records by removing barriers to diversion programs and increasing diversion for juveniles.

A critical program the office administers is the multifaceted approach to preventing and responding to gun violence. This violence points to inequities that must be addressed because it is concentrated in Philadelphia's poorest neighborhoods, and disproportionately impacts residents who are Black and people of color. DAO knows that even if this violence does not regularly reach all of the city's neighborhoods, its affects are felt city-wide, and residents share a desire to see this crisis resolved with safety and relief brought to every block. Th office shares that desire, and also are resolved to see the underlying causes of this crisis repaired for the benefit of all.

Grants to Community-Based Organizations

This program strengthens communities by returning funds obtained through civil asset forfeiture back into the community in the form of grants to community-based organizations. A challenge is that the capacity to deliver funds to communities doing vital work to support their neighbors is currently confined to these funds, when the need and potential benefit to residents that would come from increasing this type of initiative greatly exceeds the current availability.

The DAO is committed to advocating for other forms of resource allocation to neighborhoods in need to supplement this tremendously successful critical program.

Replacing Overly Punitive Sentences, Minimizing Trauma and Collateral Consequences of System Involvement

The host of policies the office has implemented to replace overly punitive sentences and minimize collateral consequences of system involvement with new policies aimed at holding individuals accountable are essential to advancing racial equity in the city for the reasons stated above in Question 2. As one touchpoint in a system that is deeply embedded with inequities, one challenge DAO faces is the limits of the office's ability to advance racial equity without the cooperation and commitment of other actors in the system. However, the office has and will continue to focus on opportunities to collaborate with other stakeholders to create a system that offers equal access to safety and justice to all residents.

Seeking more alternatives to incarceration and prosecution where appropriate.

Diversion can occur at various stages of prosecution from pre-conviction as an alternative to a trial through post-conviction alternatives to incarceration. These interventions include accepting treatment as a form of accountability for substance abuse to connecting Veterans to their well-earned benefits and services. Providing people with the services they need to address the underlying issues or unmet needs that drove their behavior is an approach that helps residents while decreasing the likelihood of people experiencing the burdens referenced above in question 2. As with the goal of replacing overly punitive sentences and minimizing trauma and collateral consequences of system involvement, this effort is enhanced through active collaboration with other stakeholders. The office will continue to pursue opportunities for these types of collaborations, to promote equal justice and access to services and supports for all residents.

The DAO is accountable to all residents and stakeholders in the pursuit of building a safer, fairer, and more just Philadelphia. The office is committed to continuous open and frank conversations with community members and stakeholders about the impacts of policies.

The office is committed to transparency and believe strongly that the public deserves to know about the impacts of the office's policies. That's why in 2018 the DAO created a new unit to track criminal justice measures on a consistent and ongoing basis. These metrics readily available to the public and evaluate their effectiveness to create and revise policies to ensure public safety. The office calls it the DATA Lab (District Attorney's Transparency Analytics).

The DATA Lab provides public transparency to the work of this office, which has historically been lacking in prosecution offices nationwide. Anyone in Philadelphia and beyond can access real-time data about the impacts of the office's critical programs or policies via the [DAO Data Dashboard](#). The following reports are currently publicly available on the dashboard:

- [Incidents](#)
- [Arrests](#)
- [Charges](#)
- [Bail](#)
- [Case Outcomes](#)
- [Case Length](#)
- [Future Years of Incarceration](#)
- [Future Years of Supervision](#)
- [Summary Arrests](#)
- [Summary Charges](#)
- [Summary Case Outcomes](#)
- [Summary Case Length](#)

The DATA Lab also regularly publishes Data Stories to highlight the impact of some of the office's key policies and programs and facilitate presentations to stakeholders interested in having an open dialogue about the impacts of policies and programs. These efforts seek to contextualize data made available through the dashboard, to make this information more accessible and legible to anyone interested in the impacts of the office's work.

[An archive of all of our published Data Stories can be found here.](#)

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

Because more diverse ADAs will contribute to reduction in racially biased outcomes, the DAO has made equitable hiring and recruitment practices a top priority. DA Krasner identified and corrected historic wage and salary discrepancies associated with race, gender, and other biases by creating a tiered pay-scale based on years of experience within nine months of taking office. This compensation adjustment combined with expanded applicant searches has produced some of the most diverse and inclusive incoming ADA classes ever.

In 2020 the DAO launched eight Affinity Working Groups dedicated to addressing issues of racism, sexism, and classism within the DAO. These Affinity Working Groups create and implement trainings, policies, and suggested resource allocations for the DAO in partnership with external affinity groups. In the last year, the Affinity Working Groups have continued to advise DAO leadership on internal policies and procedures to continue to create a more inclusive and anti-racist workplace. The office is retaining employees of color at a slightly higher rate (69.6%) than the retention rate overall (68.5%), and want to continue to improve diversity, which the office knows can help foster inclusion. The overall goal is to improve retention rates to expand and build upon gains in diversity as the office continues to rectify decades of discriminatory hiring practices at the DAO.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The DAO is committed to serving Philadelphia as a partner in building safer communities but recognize that this is the work of movements and the work of many hands, not ours alone. The office takes seriously it’s responsibility to work in collaboration with external stakeholders including marginalized communities and value the expertise that people outside of the office have in influencing both internal operations and external policies and practices for the better.

The office works in partnership with community members and with community-based organizations through

- Returned over \$800K in money obtained from Civil Asset Forfeiture Fund via grants to 28 community-based organizations.
- Community Engagement Unit’s monthly One-Stop job and Resource Fairs, tabling at community events and outreach through virtual and in-person engagement.
- Victim services facilitated by the grant-funded Crisis Assistance, Response, and Engagement (CARES) unit, whose Peer Crisis Responders help connect families to resources in the immediate aftermath of a homicide. CARES Peer Crisis Responders also work in partnership with community-based organizations to refer residents in need to long term supportive services.
- Data CoLab initiative which supports community-based organizations in utilizing data to enhance their work, supports organizations interested in participatory research to examine the impact and outcomes of their work, and offers space for community-based organizations and those they serve to provide direct feedback on policies and their impact on residents.

Internally, the office is continuing to support eight Affinity Working Groups dedicated to addressing issues of racism, sexism, and classism within the DAO decision making. These groups continue to implement trainings, policies, and suggest resource allocations for the DAO in partnership with external affinity groups.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Over the past several fiscal years the DAO has made improvements in diversity and inclusion by focusing on talent attraction, recruitment, training and retention. The office continues to attract and recruit large, diverse classes of new ADAs that better reflect the diversity of the city. Diversity in hiring for all positions has been a priority across the board, but in order to retain these staff, the office will have to fairly and equitably compensate them. 47% (174) of the employees hired and retained since 2018 are people of color. Th office is retaining employees of color at a slightly higher



rate (69.6%) than the retention rate overall (68.5%), and want to continue to improve diversity, which the office knows can help foster inclusion.

In FY19, the DAO was allocated funds which helped us establish an equitable salary structure based on talent, experience and merit for all DAO staff, correcting decades of bias and imbalance. The starting salary for a new Assistant District Attorney (“ADA”) is now a more competitive \$63,135 (compared with the \$52,000 it was in 2017) and support staff salaries start at \$42,800. While these figures don’t allow us to compete with private firms, having a fair salary structure sets the basis for fiscal predictability, and supports the efforts toward equity.

The office must reiterate that having a fair salary structure to support efforts toward equity. Due to the pandemic and the resulting revenue shortages, budget allocation has not allowed us to stay true to the commitment of awarding annual cost of living adjustments as well as annual experience and merit-based increases. This has seriously undermined the efforts toward equity and has negatively impacted attorney retention. In FY23, the office intends to rectify this by compensating the entire staff commensurate with where they would have been if the office had been able to award the annual increases in FY21 and FY22 that the DAO committed to when many of these talented, passionate, and hard-working employees were hired.

Division of Aviation

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Division of Aviation (DOA) maintains a steadfast commitment to advancing racial equity and it begins with our PRIDE values.

- **People First** - Our employees, stakeholders, and passengers
- **Respect** - To ourselves, our customers, and our environment
- **Integrity** - We hold ourselves responsible for what we do, say and think (Talking the talk, walking the walk)
- **Diversity** – Purposefully Inclusive and accepting of all
- **Excellence** - We hold ourselves to the highest standards of service, innovation, and efficiency.

The award-winning Office of Business Diversity (OBD) offers several programs and initiatives designed to reduce existing and historic racial and social inequities in access to contracting opportunities, environmental justice, limited English proficiency, accessibility, supporting neurodiverse individuals and Title VI nondiscrimination for travelers and LGBT travelers.

Aviation stood up the Racial Equity Advisory Council (REAC) in June 2020 to drive meaningful change and lasting impact throughout the airport community. REAC’s efforts have garnered local, regional, and national awards and recognition. Aviation’s broad impact doesn’t stop there, with several employees holding leadership positions that help drive more equitable outcomes. Api Appulingam, Deputy of Aviation – Capital Development, currently serves as Chair for the American Association of Airport Executives (AAAE) Northeast Chapter DEI Committee and Vice Chair for AA AE’s overarching DEI committee. Kathleen Padilla, Deputy Director of Aviation for Diversity and Inclusion, and Deatrice Isaac, Deputy of Airport Procurement, both serve on the Philadelphia Chamber of Commerce’s newly formed Diverse Procurement Collaborative (DPC) as two of four co-chairs. The DPC program was created to facilitate the exchange of best practices, build a community of business leaders committed to diverse procurement practices, and create accountability through benchmarking.

Aviation was also part of the Citywide Racial Equity Strategy Implementation Plan’s first cohort of departments. Led by The Mayor’s Office of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion, the strategy is an important step to ensure that race is not a determinant of success and all Philadelphians can thrive.

The office’s workforce development programs support incumbent Aviation employees through upskilling/opportunities for promotion, create career pathways for external jobseekers and raise awareness about employment opportunities at PHL. The Human Resources unit offers a variety

of training modules and professional development opportunities that support DEI, health and wellness, skill building and more.

Aviation is home to an award-winning Arts and Exhibitions program that features locally and nationally renowned artists who reflect the diversity of Philadelphia’s residents and the airport’s travelers.

Looking ahead to 2022, the aforementioned programs and initiatives present tangible opportunities to continue advancing racial equity throughout the workforce, the airport, and beyond.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

Business Diversity

Contracting Opportunities

Aviation operates several diverse business programs. Aviation coordinates with the Office of Economic Opportunity (OEO) on diversity contracting for locally funded projects and OBD has direct responsibility for several federal diversity contracting programs: The Federal DBE Program, the Federal ACDBE Program, the Federal Certification Program, and the new SBE Program (Small Business Enterprise). Recently approved by a charter change, Aviation has also implemented the Local Business Purchasing Initiative (LBPI).

For locally funded projects, Aviation works with the OEO to set ranges and monitors M/W/DSBE individual contract ranges, payments, and overall goal. For Federal (US DOT) funded projects, OBD sets contract level goals and overall goals, monitors projects and payments, certifies firms for the federal program, reviews RFP and bid submissions for DBE participation, and reviews concession leases for ACDBE participation.

Aviation is a member of the US DOT Business Diversity Program which includes 60 transportation agencies statewide that receive funds from the FAA, the FHWA and the FTA. Aviation also serves on the Diversity Contracting Committee of the National Transportation Research Board helping to develop policies nationwide and subjects to get funding for studies in this area.

Concessionaire Pandemic Support

Aviation provided flexibility with lease payments for businesses, forgiving and delaying some payments and renegotiating some terms with firms. For concessionaires that remained open or opened during the CY 2021 pandemic recovery period, Aviation waived minimum annual guarantee requirements and reduced percentage rents, resulting in \$48.1 M in sales earned by ACDBE vendors, accounting for 43.4% of total food, beverage, and retail program sales from January through December 2021.

Business Opportunity Forum (BOF)

Aviation hosted its ninth annual Business Opportunity Forum on October 8th, 2021. The forum was held virtually in conjunction with the City of Philadelphia’s Minority Enterprise Development (MED) Week. The forum was attended by 300 participants representing businesses and partnering agencies. This year’s event included a Business Resource Expo, a PHL Cargo-focused General Session, 10 Breakout Sessions, and a Question-and-Answer driven Closing Session followed by Networking. Of the participants registered: 56% represented minority or women-owned business enterprises, while 38% noted they are currently under contract with the Airport.

Business Diversity Outreach Events and Workshops

Aviation partners with a diverse cross-section of stakeholders for outreach events and workshops. During the pandemic, many of Aviation’s efforts to support diverse businesses engagement have been incorporated into operations and outreach. Efforts over the past year include:

- A series of Small Business Roundtables; providing opportunities to network in a personal setting with Prime Contractors at PHL.
- Concessions Pandemic Recovery event with PHL, PIDC and the SBA.
- Relief, Regulations and Resources Workshop to help diverse businesses access pandemic resources and plan to help businesses qualify for PPP loan forgiveness.
- Preparing for Capital Project Opportunities at PHL Airport Workshop
- Doing Business with Regional Transportation Agencies Workshop
- Financial Strategies for Success – Access to Capital and Cashflow Workshop
- Are You Ready for Prime Time? Workshop
- DBE Considerations – You’re Certified – What’s Next? Workshop
- How to Structure Concessions Joint Ventures for ACDBE Firms
- Software Solutions to Manage Your Business

Business Diversity Awards

- FAA 2021 Civil Rights Advocate and Partner Award (Kathy Padilla)
- Leon C Watkins Guardian Award (Kathy Padilla)

- MEDWeek Philadelphia’s Office of Economic Opportunity (OEO) Advocate of the Year Award (Kathy Padilla)
- Philadelphia Business Journal Diverse Business Leader of 2021 (Kathy Padilla)
- Transportation Research Boards’ Airport Cooperative Research Program (ACRP)

Racial Equity Advisory Council (REAC)

REAC’s approach to cultivating an increased sense of understanding/awareness, comradery and belonging amongst staff is built on four main pillars: Information Gathering, Creating Safe Spaces, Building Awareness and Education.

Information Gathering

- Annual Surveys
- REAC Email Address
- REAC Voicemail
- REAC Webpage

Create Safe Spaces

- State of the Culture
- REAC Roundtable
- Safe Spaces for Community Healing
- Airport Empowerment Groups

Build Awareness

- Book Club
- Podcasts
- Cultural Celebrations
- Current Event Spotlights

Education

- Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Training
- Foundational Learning

REAC Awards

- WTS Philadelphia Chapter 2021 Diversity Award
- ACI-NA Social Media Campaign Award

Citywide Racial Equity Strategy

Aviation’s participation in the Citywide Racial Equity Strategy implementation plan’s first cohort aligned with REAC’s existing efforts to drive more equitable outcomes for all DOA employees. Involvement in the first cohort included departmental racial equity self-assessments, preliminary racial action planning, foundational racial equity knowledge-building, and final department anti-racist impact frameworks. Participating departments generated a result statement, indicators, hot roots, and strategies connected to each root.

- Result Statement
- *All people in Philadelphia Thrive*
- Indicators
- *Median Household Income by Race*
- *Unemployment Rates by Race*
- *Internal Salary Disparity at DOA by Race*
- Hot Roots
- *Systems of Exclusion – White privilege (Internal)*
- *Systems of Exclusion – People fear what they don’t know or understand (Internal/External)*
- *Systems of Exclusion – Policies that appear race-neutral but have adverse impact (External)*

- Strategy Connected to Hot Roots
- *White Privilege -> Workforce Development Program (Apprenticeship, Internal upskilling, external engagement/career awareness, tuition reimbursement/employee development)*
- *People fear... -> Foundational Education and Awareness (Exec level, Managerial and Supervisory, and all staff DEI/Racial Equity Training, Airport-wide Anti-Hate Awareness Campaign)*
- *Policies that appear... -> USDOT Waiver to set Black/Hispanic goals for Airport Concessions Program*

Arts and Exhibitions

The Exhibitions Program is responsible for organizing and presenting rotating exhibitions that are located throughout the Airport. The exhibits change throughout the year to provide a variety of educational and cultural programs. This forum for presenting visual arts attests to the Airport's commitment to supporting arts and culture.

The Exhibitions Program provides millions of visitors from around the world access to a wide variety of art forms by artists and arts institutions from the Philadelphia area.

Business Diversity

- A) Increased connectivity for M/W/DSBE businesses with Aviation representatives, more opportunities for businesses to work with the airport
- B) Establishing rapport and building relationships virtually, limited resources due to the pandemic

- C) More collaboration with ethnic Chambers of Commerce, A hybrid approach to events (Virtual Content/Information-sharing and in-person networking)
- D) Businesses lacking resources to build their companies due to the pandemic

REAC

- A) Buy-in from CEO, Support from the Mayor’s Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion; Short-term wins, and foundation-building for long-term impact
- B) Lack of trust and patience from Aviation employees, staff turnover, consistent communication
- C) A comprehensive calendar of programs, initiatives, and events for 2022; mandatory training and development, increased staff participation
- D) Lack of interest/pushback from Aviation staff, inadequate resources, staff turnover

Arts and Exhibitions

- A) Dynamic talent showcased throughout the airport, collaboration with diverse artists
- B) Artist availability
- C) Building more relationships with Philly-area art hubs
- D) N/A

Business Diversity

- 1) Business Opportunity Forum – 300 Attendees, 56% represented minority or women-owned business enterprises and 38% noted they are currently under contract with the Airport.
- 2) Concessions – 76% diverse partner or sole ownership participation, 35% of reopened concessions are 100% ACDBE-owned.
- 3) From January-December 2021, \$48.1 million in sales were earned by ACDBE vendors. That figure accounted for 43.4% of total food, beverage, and retail programs throughout the year.
- 4) Participation Goals

Program	FY 21 Goal	FY 21 Achieved
PHL OEO	30%	33%
PHL Federal DBE	17.93%*	17.3%
PHL Federal ACDBE	19.4%	40%
PHL ACDBE Marketplace Storefront Concessions	19.4%	43.0%

*PHL’s Federal DBE Goal has been raised to 17.93% going forward. Our Federal ACDBE Goal is currently being revised.

REAC

- 1) Townhall Discussions on Racial and Social Justice – 108 Attendees
- 2) Staff-led Moments of Solidarity – Approx. 100 attendees
- 3) Racial Equity Survey – 77 responses
- 4) Other data will be provided soon

Arts & Exhibitions

Approximately 30 exhibits by minority and female artists were displayed throughout the airport this year. There are always 22 exhibitions on view at PHL. In December 2021, 16 out of 22 exhibitions featured minority artists, equaling 73% participation. That percentage is very typical of any calendar year. Out of the 16 opportunities for solo/single artist exhibitions, 100% featured minority artists.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

Aviation anticipates adding to its workforce with a goal of increasing diversity at all levels of the organization. Funds are budgeted for the recruitment of diverse, qualified candidates. Budget will also support different workforce development programs (apprenticeships, small-scale career exposure experiences, external stakeholder engagement, etc.).

Budget is allocated for tuition reimbursement and professional development programs for line staff, supervisors, and managers; Resources and Information for Supervisory Enrichment (RISE), Stars and Leads, Leadership Academy, Supervising with Pride.

DOA offers platforms to encourage employee engagement: Thurs-yay (virtual water cooler conversations), book club, safe spaces for processing vulnerability, surveys, suggestion boxes, townhalls, unit check-ins and PHL WELL (wellness program).

Third-party relationships have been established to support employees, including partnerships with: Employee Assistance Program (EAP), Penn Behavioral Health, Health Department, Nationwide, TriZen, DBHIDS, Equity and Results, and MyActiveHealth.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

Aviation maintains consistent communication with airlines, near neighbors and various internal/external stakeholders regarding various airport matters. Examples include a comprehensive Community Engagement Strategy, Guest Experience Council, Airport Advisory Board meetings, Projects Controls Meetings, collaboration with Airlines, etc.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

The breadth of Aviation’s commitment to racial equity is reflected throughout our budget proposal. Aviation is proud of its existing and prospective programs, initiatives, and businesses practices.

Fire Department

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Racial equity is embedded in Philadelphia Fire Department's core mission of providing dedicated service 24x7x365. When anyone calls 911, the department ALWAYS respond – no questions asked. The PFD never says no. Although the office is one of the most diverse fire departments in the U.S., the department continues to work with the City's Office of Human Resources to recruit, hire, promote, and retain a workforce that better reflects the racial makeup of Philadelphia. Building a diverse workforce starts at the beginning with entry-level positions – especially in a department like the PFD where all promotions originate from those entry-level jobs. PFD and OHR take great care with announcing each new firefighter application and recently spent considerable time and effort to ensure the testing process yielded a diverse field of candidates. Further, PFD has expanded its own Recruitment Unit over the years to conduct direct outreach to interested candidates, reach untapped communities, and target hard-to-fill positions.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

The department's core service is providing firefighting and emergency medical services (EMS). The office responds 24x7x365 no matter who calls 911. The department is the medical safety net for the entire community, providing EMS care hundreds of times a day for everyday traumas and illnesses as well as for many of the city's COVID patient, opioid overdose survivors, and gunshot victims. The office protects the city's affordable housing stock, small businesses and corner stores, and homes in every neighborhood. However, fires and fire deaths disproportionately affect communities of color and marginalized populations. The reasons for this are systemic, deep-rooted and complex, and mostly beyond the PFD's control; factors include the city's high poverty rate and the quality and age of the built environment. Improving outcomes in these neighborhoods will require a coordinated approach and infusion of resources across several City departments. Budget cuts will exacerbate the already inequitable harm caused by fires.

As the second-busiest fire department in the nation (with the busiest ambulance in the nation), the service level is not where the office wants it to be despite the City's reinvestment in the PFD

over the past five years. While the department gratefully acknowledges the increased resources, the PFD budget is still not where it needs to be. Philadelphia still has a disproportionately high number of fire deaths compared with its peer cities; tragically, middle-aged black women are most likely to die in fires here. Fires killed 36 Philadelphians and injured another 200 in FY21; in addition, more than 2,000 people were burned out of their homes. Those grim statistics would be higher if PFD members did not risk their lives to rescue others and protect property; the numbers would be exponentially greater with the types of cuts we've been asked to discuss in the past but, thankfully, have not occurred.

The department has offered vaccination clinics in neighborhoods across the city; opened new office/training space in West Oak Lane/East Mount Airy that allowed us to increase the size of the Recruitment Unit and youth Explorers program; continue to teach teens about careers in fire/EMS through the academy at Randolph High School and annual summer camps; and partnered with local workforce development agencies to offer free community EMT training programs.

Although the robust Fire Prevention Division has been hampered somewhat by COVID restrictions, the office has continued to educate hundreds of students; assist more than 1,300 residents displaced by fires; and install thousands of smoke alarms in vulnerable communities (including 1,100 in December 2021). The department would love to do more with prevention, but that's hard to do while also discussing the possibility of cutting core services.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

Nearly all of PFD's members are governed by hiring and promotional policies administered by OHR and/or the Civil Service Commission. Because the majority are uniformed, civil service positions that go through successive internal promotional opportunities, the PFD focuses on entry-level positions. As noted in the DEI plan, the department wants to ensure that the eligible lists established for Civil Service ranks are diverse and reflect the larger community; the City's new residency requirement can help us get there. The office also works closely with OHR to find a testing partner for the firefighter Civil Service exam that the department hopes will reduce testing biases and produce a list of candidates that better reflect Philadelphia. One internal promotional effort involved uptraining EMTs, who are the lowest-paid uniformed members in the department and have the highest rate of diverse backgrounds among employees.

Also, per the submitted DEI plan, the hiring strategy for exempt positions follows many of the steps previously outlined in the Exempt PHL Diversity Recruitment Guide, including advertisement of open positions on City-sanctioned sites, use of social media to distribute information about open positions, use of diverse interview panels, etc.

If the city wants to have the internal culture change that the department wants, the city has to offer training when members are off-duty because otherwise they are too busy responding to emergencies. Training the entire workforce for one day costs about \$4 million in overtime. Given concerns and cuts in the overtime budget, the department is looking for workarounds to continue that conversation. In prior years the office developed and provided TLC training (Teamwork, Leadership and Communication) to supervisory staff, comprising about 800 members. This program included representatives from the Human Relations Commission and OHR creating a conversation around issues including DEI.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

Representatives from the Spanish American Professional Firefighter Association and Club Valiants (for Black firefighters/EMS providers) are represented in the Commissioner’s Leadership Council, which meets monthly and is apprised of budget discussions.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

The department does not need to be convinced of the value of DEI & Belonging. Those principles have been key components of everything the office engages in going back more than a century; where members risk their lives every day to help people, no questions asked. The challenge for the department is the gap between the discussion and commitment to racial equity and the resources to do it at the level we’ve promised to the city residents.

First Judicial District of Philadelphia

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

While the Philadelphia Courts are a coequal and independent branch of the City’s government, FJD’s core functions intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. The overall mission of the First Judicial District of PA is the delivery of fair, timely, and accessible justice to the City and County of Philadelphia. “Fair”, as mentioned in the office’s mission statement, includes a commitment to racial equity. Like the City, the office believes that racial equity will be achieved when race alone no longer predicts one’s socioeconomic, political, or life outcomes in Philadelphia. This pertains, both, to employees and the public served. In keeping with the FJD commitment, the office recently added a Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI) Office to court administration to assist with DEI goals and strategies, including racial equity.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

The FJD has a newly created Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion (DEI), a newly created DEI policy, Project Pipeline, and a virtual suggestion box (Suggestion Ox).

Office of DEI: This is a newly created office created to increase DEI within the FJD.

- a) Strengths – The Office of DEI is working on a number of strategies and initiatives to promote diversity, equity, and inclusion. The Office of DEI is working closely with the Office of Human Resources to update FJD policies from a DEI perspective. This includes using gender-inclusive language in office policies as embracing cultural differences. The Office of DEI is also reviewing all pre-employment and promotional exams. The Office of DEI oversees the newly formed DEI Advisory Committee, which provides employees throughout the District with the opportunity to highlight issues of importance to staff and court users. Strategies and initiatives from the Office of DEI must be approved by the Administrative Governing Board (AGB). The Office of DEI also serves as a “safe space” for all FJD Employees. The Office of DEI is working with procurement

department to hire consultants/trainers so that their team can provide continued DEI training to FJD employees.

- b) Challenges – Changing ingrained belief systems surrounding racial equity, diversity, and inclusion. As well as challenging any preconceptions of the notion that “things have always been done this way.”
- c) Opportunities – The Office of DEI has been granted a wide berth to continue to provide strategies and initiatives to the AGB that will improve racial equity.
- d) Threats – Impactful DEI strategies and initiatives can be costly.

DEI Policy (*In addition to our Non-Discrimination Policy*): This is a newly created policy which makes clear that the FJD is committed to fostering, cultivating, and preserving a culture of diversity, equity, and inclusion.

- e) Strengths – The policy is in writing and applies to all FJD employees. It sets the tone for all FJD employees to embrace, among other things, differences in race and ethnicity.
- f) Challenges – Changing ingrained belief systems surrounding race and ethnicity can be challenging and will require extensive training.
- g) Opportunities – This written policy incorporated DEI into the fabric of the FJD’s culture.
- h) Threats – Politics and finances. Some people believe that DEI goals are politically motivated. Additionally, DEI trainers and resources can be costly.

Pipeline Project – The FJD is providing a professional learning series that is accessible to **all** FJD employees. The first in a series of trainings offered was a Microsoft Excel course led by a certified Microsoft trainer. By making training available to all employees, the office helps increase the skillsets of the entire workforce, including people of color. The trainings are free to the employee, and the office places a certificate of completion into the employee’s HR file.

- i) Strengths – The training is free and accessible to all FJD employees. The skillsets that are gained through this program can be used for career advancement or promotions.
- j) Challenges – The trainings are optional. People who do not participate will not gain the additional skillsets.
- k) Opportunities – This presents the opportunity for the FJD to cultivate and retain great talent. Additionally, it keeps employees engaged. By continuing to provide programs that allow employees to build their skillsets, employees feel less stagnant.
- l) Threats – As the office branches out to provide more complex trainings, the cost of the programs could become a threat.

Suggestion Ox – This is a virtual suggestion box open to all FJD employees. Employees can ask questions, raise concerns, including on matters related to diversity, equity, and inclusion. Employees have the option to submit questions anonymously.

- m) Strengths – This increases transparency between all FJD and court administration. Many of the questions received from employees are answered on the office FAQ page.
- n) Challenges – Some questions may be outside the scope of the FJD.
- o) Opportunities – This level of transparency helps to promote virtual equity by giving everyone a voice. The virtual suggestion box is open to all FJD employees.
- p) Threats – n/a

The Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion is a newly created department. Surveys have not been sent to employees regarding the Office of DEI. The DEI policy is a newly created policy that has been approved by the Administrative Governing Board (AGB). It was recently provided to all FJD employees and there is no data on its impact. Survey data from Project Pipeline suggests that FJD employees value the training sessions and find them helpful for developing their skillsets. The FJD responds to inquiries and comments from the Suggestion Ox.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

The Office of Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion has worked closely with the Office of Human Resources to create a new hiring policy. The First Judicial District (FJD) recruits, employs and promotes the most qualified applicants without regard to their political affiliation, race, color, age, national origin, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity or expression, religion, disability, or other non-merit factors or considerations. All hiring and employment-related actions must comply with the UJS Policy on Non-Discrimination and Equal Employment Opportunity. The newly created hiring policy promotes racial equity by providing a more streamlined process for hiring. The goal of this policy is to reduce and prevent hiring practices based on nepotism or favoritism. Studies show that nepotism reduces diversity and racial equity. This new policy provides several steps that a department must take before posting a job. It also recommends a three-person interview panel for most positions. The utilization of panels reduces the likelihood of a person unilaterally hiring an unqualified friend or family member. In addition, the FJD is seeking trainers to provide courses on topics related to racial equity, such as allyship, and other DEI related topics.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget

process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

Beyond what is outlined above, the DEI Office, Court Administration, and Human Resources is involved in developing programs and policies that can improve racial equity. The programs and policies require approval from the AGB and the Financial Services department handles the budget. The FJD plans to provide a series of DEI Trainings to all employees. The FJD also realizes that mid-level managers need specific DEI training to reduce bias in their decision making and evaluations. By training and developing a more conscientious staff, the office will be better suited to support the entirety of employees and the general public.

Additionally, as mentioned previously, the FJD has developed a committee of internal stakeholders that is diverse in race, sex, and job title. This committee helps the DEI office in identifying programmatic and policy-related solutions regarding issues of racial equity.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Ideally, it is the office's goal to incorporate ongoing DEI training into the onboarding process. Additionally, FJD would like to offer DEI-themed training throughout the year. The FJD understands that while DEI training is costly, it needs to be ongoing and consistent.

Free Library of Philadelphia

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The mission of the Free Library of Philadelphia is to advance literacy, guide learning, and inspire curiosity. Its vision is to build an enlightened community devoted to lifelong learning. In order to ensure the mission is authentic for the residents of Philadelphia, the office must align our work and commitment with the City's Racial Equity Vision Statement in addressing ways to dismantle institutional and structural barriers that impede residents from experiences provided by the FLP in equitable ways: resources, services, and engagement. It is incumbent of our leadership to review and revise policies and practices with the goal of permanently eliminating racial disparities. This intersection with the City's vision for racial equality is a guide for all members of the FLP staff to understand, regardless of role, they have a part and responsibility in the promotion of opportunities for the betterment of all Philadelphians.

What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?

Internally, the FLP can advance racial equity through the hiring process. This includes the development of positions and position announcements, the use of both broad marketing as well as targeted recruitment strategies, and diverse candidate review committees. For promotions and other internal opportunities, timely notifications of open opportunities, clear and measurable requirements, and encouragement from leadership to ensure a diverse pool of candidates.

Externally, the FLP should seek to provide to the residents of Philadelphia, 6-day service at the many branches in the provision of access, services, experiences, and resources. The FLP resources and programming should be fully funded to address and begin to correct inequities caused by systemic racism across City neighborhoods.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

Career Ladders

The Free Library's Human Resources Department and the Library's Diversity and Inclusion Steering Committee worked with the City's Office of Human Resources (OHR) to create Career Ladder documents to outline career paths available to various job classifications in the Library. OHR hosted focus groups with library staff to present initial drafts and to get feedback directly from staff in those roles. OHR presented at staff town halls via zoom to staff across the organization to raise awareness of potential opportunities as well as to promote career paths to staff in order to increase diversity in promotional job classes.

DEI Action Plan

In March of 2021, the FLP Board of Trustees received and approved the FLP's Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Action Plan. This plan outlines steps necessary to achieve the shared vision of a more diverse, equitable, and inclusive institution. The DEI Action Plan, with actions and next steps, will move the Library toward its aim of a more diverse workforce at all levels, full participatory inclusion, and equitable application of policies and process. The DEI Action Plan represents a roadmap to advance the mission and values of the Free Library of Philadelphia by leveraging existing successful initiatives and embracing new innovative initiatives.

A. SWOT

- i. **Strength:** The DEI Action Plan sets the foundation for the development of DEI goals and objectives which become markers for evaluation of change and success;
- ii. **Challenge:** As with change, there may be resistance, disinterest, or inattention to the importance of equity within the workplace or in services provided;
- iii. **Opportunities:** By broadening perspectives and addressing barriers, more people have the prospect to be included, become more involved, and be a part of the direction the library;
- iv. **Threats:** Distrust both within and external to the organization, DEI implementation challenges (budgetary & procedural), short-term focus & long-term failures. As a service agency, the office seeks to respond to a diverse array of community members, affinity and cultural groups, and community members with high needs. Oftentimes, responding to one may cause conflict or concerns with others. It is important for us to recognize those concerns, seek balance, but always be responsive.

B. Since the adoption of the DEI Action Plan, the FLP executive staff have developed a series of DEI goals and objectives which serve as a major step in addressing issues related to racial barriers and eliminating racial disparities. Examples include the increasing of response time to

concerns from staff, ensuring equity within job classes, reviewing the Performance Excellence Process, and the reviewing of all policies to ensure the application of equity.

Library Collections

The Materials Management staff recognize that building diverse collections is critical to serving our diverse community. Our collections must not only reflect the diversity of each community, they must also represent the greater diversity of the world in order to address unexpressed information needs.

Over the past year, Materials Management Units have been working to increase our knowledge of best practices in building and describing diverse collections. Throughout Spring 2021, the Catalog and Collection Development Units met to discuss barriers to discovery of our diverse collections.

- Collection Development staff have conducted diversity audits of collections and are routinely auditing purchasing to analyze the % of new materials added by diverse and underrepresented authors and topics. Our branch collections are currently assessed as having 16.2% DEI related materials. [Publishing data from 2020](#) estimated that 95% of books published between 1950 and 2018 were by white authors.
- 100% of Materials Selectors attended training on building diverse collections.
- Spending for individual locations has been re-examined with an equity lens. More of our lists are now being sent with equal budgets for all locations to receive new titles (career, periodical, and DVD lists, for example). Some lists still recognize physical space differences in locations, but the range of spending is now more compact than previously. All Regional Libraries now have equivalent budgets.
- Selectors curated a list of works by Black authors in the ebook format which have been added to the collection and purchased to fulfill holds at a faster pace than our standard operating procedure, allowing for greater access to the titles. This has been expanded to include other under-represented diverse titles.
- Catalog unit staff have taken classes addressing description issues in cataloging and diversity
 - [Decolonizing the Catalog: Anti-Racist Description Practices from Authority Records to Discovery Layers](#)
 - [Language and Injustice](#)
- Catalog and Special Collections staff have met to discuss issues around racism and prejudice in historic collections

- Catalog unit staff are working on creating local authority records to replace dated and racist terminology in LCSH (ex. Illegal Aliens is still an “official” subject heading; CAT to replace with Undocumented immigrants)

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

In 2020, the FLP allocated funds to create the position of the Chief Diversity and Inclusion Officer. The Chief Diversity & Inclusion Officer is a senior-level management position reporting directly to the President& Director and serves as a member of the Library’s Executive Leadership Team. The Chief Diversity & Inclusion Officer leads the development and implementation, and evaluation of a proactive diversity, equity and inclusion plan in support of the Library’s strategic plan to create a learning and working environment where all have an opportunity to succeed and realize their full potential. The position champions the importance and value of a diverse and inclusive library environment and leads the development of a vision and effective strategy to create a culture for equity, diversity, and inclusion, as well as actively engaging all staff to further behaviors, attitudes, and policies that support diversity, equity and inclusion. This position will work with staff members in all job classes and departments in identifying their roles and responsibilities in advancing DEI within the library and in service provided to patrons.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The Free Library has solicited feedback from both staff and customers to gauge the impact of any changes to the budget and as a result, to offerings. The office has also reviewed independent market research that has been conducted for the library, which surveyed staff, Board members, cardholders, the Friends, and non-users. Of note, the results are remarkably similar across all audiences.

A special meeting with the Friends of the Free Library was convened to discuss budget issues, and a written survey was sent afterwards. The participants included representatives of Joseph E. Coleman (Germantown), Falls of Schuylkill, Overbrook Park, Queen Memorial (Point Breeze), Rodriguez (6 & Spring Garden), South Philadelphia, Torresdale, Wadsworth, Walnut St, and Whitman (2 & Snyder).

In conversation, the Friends were unanimous in their belief that the most important thing for the Library to do is to keep all branches open, in every neighborhood, and to keep them clean and maintained. They focused on a “recovery list,” i.e. what will be needed when the library re-opens all locations for full access, and pointed to job search and resume assistance, and computer access and support. Also mentioned were LEAP, Summer Reading, and physical materials.

This discussion was followed by a survey to all participants. When asked what the Library should focus on, the top four responses were branch maintenance; community outreach; diversity, equity and inclusion; and job search assistance. Following those priorities were LEAP, the Library’s afterschool program; school partnerships; storytimes; and teen programming.

Staff was surveyed too in order to determine their priorities and preferences. The office received 226 responses within three days. Responses are anonymous and thus cannot be reported on the racial or other makeup of responders. Considering the consistency of the data, however, the office feels confident that these responses are roughly representative. The top three areas that staff said the Library should focus on are: branch maintenance and repairs (67% of respondents), diversity, equity and inclusion (58%), and providing internet access (41%) (The numbers do not add up to 100 as staff selected eight areas from a list of 35). The next categories noted were: community outreach, digital literacy, and job search and resume assistance.

Several years ago the Library contracted with an independent market research firm to survey staff, Board members, city leaders, cardholders, and non-users. Some key findings show that the community, whether a cardholder or not, value, in order of importance: “local branches throughout the city,” “literacy for kids,” “access to computers,” and “books for all.” Staff had similar responses though in slightly different order: “access to computers,” “local branches throughout city,” “books for all” and “afterschool programs.” When asked what roles the Library should play, the groups responded identically on the top two priorities: “a safe place for anyone to come to” and “a community resource.”

Additionally, the FLP asked the market research firm to do some targeted surveying – an “oversample” in the areas around Lucien Blackwell (52 & Sansom), Frankford, Nicetown-Tioga, and Greater Olney libraries. Respondents were 93% non-white with a household income average of \$34,500. Ninety-five percent said that “having an active Free Library system for all residents of Philadelphia” is vitally important. The most important services to these respondents are local branches throughout the city, literacy for kids, and access to computers.

Ultimately the Executive staff will take into account all of this information and determine how to make any required cuts. Executive staff is currently 30 percent people of color. The team is pleased to have welcomed Guy Sims to this group on December 14, 2020 and look forward to his insight and contributions.

Demographics of the Library’s Board of Trustees (18 current members):

Female - 8; Male - 10

African American or Black – 8, Hispanic/Latino - 1, Caucasian/White - 7 Unknown - 2

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

About this question: This is an intentionally open-ended question to allow your department space to elevate any other critical insights or concerns not otherwise covered.

The Free Library has consistently met or exceeded the commitment to providing contracts to M/W/DSBE.

	FY18	FY19	FY20	FY21	FY22	FY21 YTD (Q1 & Q2)
Total amount of contracts	\$834,702	\$891,286	\$638,177	\$1,838,576	\$785,000	\$439,605
Total amount to M/W/DSBE	\$401,252	\$351,038	\$394,401	\$668,860	\$314,000	\$236,810
Participation Rate	48%	39%	62%	36%	40%	54%

The library serves patrons who are both homeless, experiencing home insecurities, with some exhibiting mental health concerns. FLP currently has a social worker from the Department of Human Services on staff, but it would benefit our patrons to have our staff trained on aspects of homelessness/mental health issues and steps to aid as appropriate. It is important to establish collaborative relationships with both the Departments of Human Services and the Department of Homeless Services.

Law Department

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

To counsel its clients of the City of Philadelphia, the Law Department researches, collaborates, and anticipates outcomes. These functions enable Law to encourage diverse, efficient, and effective government as an advisor to its clients, the various departments of the City. Clients seek advice from Law in a variety of subject areas, from labor and employment, child welfare, and legislation, among others. Each assignment affords an opportunity to counsel clients in how to potentially achieve their desired outcomes advancing racial equity. As a provider of legal services who outsources certain work, Law will continue to increase contracting with M/W/DSBE firms and will continue its practice of encouraging firms who do not qualify as M/W/DSBE to assign minority partners and associates to City contracts through its outside counsel policy. Additionally, as a government entity in the City of Philadelphia with over 300 employees, Law can advance racial equity through its hiring and professional development practices. Specifically, Law's greatest areas of opportunity are in promoting racially diverse individuals at all leadership levels, hiring racially diverse individuals, and creating a more inclusive workplace. Racial minorities are underrepresented in the practice of law due to historically exclusionary education and licensing processes. Through increasing its hiring and promotion of racial minorities, Law can lessen some of the structural barriers to minority success in the legal profession, especially as compared to private sector counterparts, as Department employees' experience them highly credentialed and desired.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

As Law is not a public-facing department, its efforts to improve racial equity focus on the hiring, retention, and professional development of people of color. To that end, Law's participation and adherence to the Mansfield 2.0 requirements for diverse hiring panels and percentages of diverse candidates considered for any opportunity is a critical policy. Additionally, our training program incorporating anti-racist principles and diversity, equity, and inclusion topics, and

professional development are critical to enhancing Law's internal culture. a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity. Mansfield: (a) How consistently it is applied; (b) Ensuring that racially diverse candidates apply to the positions at the outset and that the diversity goals being met are not skewed towards gender diversity; (c) Spreading the word about participation in this policy to highlight Law's commitment to diversity; (d) Any obstacles that prompt diverse hires not to remain at Law. Training Program: (a) Employees' desire for training; (b) The inconsistent occurrence of the trainings; (c) Making the training intervals more consistent; (d) Employees who do not internalize the principles in the trainings. b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity? Mansfield: All hiring processes of 2021 met Mansfield rule requirements, meaning that Law considered at least 50% historically underrepresented lawyers for all of its vacancies. Training Program: Law saw a reduction in behavioral issues of employees who completed DEI trainings. This enhances the internal culture of Law and hopefully encourages racial minorities to remain at the Department.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

To create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, Law is spending a portion of our budget acquiring on-demand training for all managers on anti-racist principles and diversity, equity, and inclusion topics. Coordinating this training and facilitating its application to Law employees is accomplished by Law's Director of Professional Development, Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion. This Director continues to expand outreach efforts with law schools, minority-based affinity groups, and national diversity pipeline programs to fill vacant positions and create a more robust internship program. These community partnerships will also provide managerial and developmental training opportunities for existing staff. Law continues to participate in the Diversity Lab's Mansfield Rule Legal Department Edition 2.0, a national certification process recognizing Law's commitment to Diversity & Inclusion efforts. As a result, Law has considered at least 50% historically underrepresented lawyers for at least 70% of its vacant positions. Law is also obtaining executive leadership capacity building training and shifting internal practices by creating more visible metrics for professional advancement. Separately, Law is using a new communication tool to celebrate the efforts and achievements of its employees and raise the profile of diverse attorneys across the Department.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The Executive Team of Law is a diverse leadership team in race, gender, and sexual orientation, among others. The Executive Team has considered the proposed budget and has consulted members of middle management regarding their needs for operation. Often, the needs communicated from middle management reflect the observations of their teams of supervisees, as each middle manager is asked to consult their respective teams to suggest needs of the Department. Because Law is not a public-facing department, to enhance this process, Law could directly consult diverse internal stakeholders on proposed budget items and include a period of review and comment.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)? N/A

Law's greatest strength is its employees. Given the skill sets and experience of Law's attorneys and staff, employees are constantly approached by potential employers with the lure of more compensation. For the amount and quality of the work that they do, our staff is paid under the market rate, and any allowances to offer increases to our employees would do well to entice our talented employees to remain with the City. Law is consistently reviewing salaries and increases for parity and equity across employees with comparable experience, and its budget proposals and requests reflect that. Further, Law's budget proposals reflect a concerted effort by its Executive Team to ensure that every round of increases and promotions includes diverse individuals.

Managing Director's Office

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Managing Director's Office (MDO) is tasked with oversight of the City's operating departments and furthering Administrative priorities especially as it relates to reducing racial disparities and improving the lives of all Philadelphians. The MDO has programs or initiatives that touch upon all Mayoral priorities as it relates to racial equity and inclusion including:

- Health Equity for All,
 - Quality Education for All,
 - Inclusive Economy and Thriving Neighborhoods for All,
 - Diverse, Efficient, and Effective Government.
- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

The MDO administers many important direct services and programs that aim to improve racial equity and support the Administration's goals of a safer more just Philadelphia; health equity for all; inclusive economy and thriving neighborhoods; as well as a diverse, efficient, and effective government.

Within MDO, major initiatives, programs or policies are highlighted below

- **Office of Criminal Justice & Public Safety (CJPS)**
 - Police Assisted Diversion (PAD)
 - 911 Triage & Co-Responders Strategy
 - Philadelphia Roadmap to Safer Communities (PRSC) & Transitional Jobs Program
 - Safety & Justice Challenge
 - Office of the Victim Advocate (OVA)
- **Office of Violence Prevention (OVP)**
 - Community Crisis Intervention Program (CCIP)
 - Group Violence Intervention Program (GVI)
 - Community Expansion Grants (CEG)
 - Targeted Community Investment Grants (TCIG)

- **Police Advisory Commission (PAC) & Citizen Police Oversight Commission (CPOC)**
- **Opioid Response Unit (ORU)**
- **Community Life Improvement Program (CLIP)**
 - Same-Day-Pay Program
 - Vacant Lot Stabilization Program
 - Graffiti Clean-up Program
 - Hazardous Materials Clean-up Program (partnership with HHS/DPH)
- **Office of Immigrant Affairs (OIA)**
 - Philadelphia Family Unity Project: Immigrant Legal Defense
 - Language Access Program
- **Municipal ID Program (MIDP)**
- **Health & Human Services**
 - Eviction Prevention
 - Right to Counsel
 - Shared Public Spaces
 - Commission on Aging
- **Office of Arts, Culture & the Creative Economy**
 - Illuminate the Arts Grant Program
 - Neighborhood Arts Program
 - Support for Philadelphia Cultural Fund (PCF) and the African American Museum of Philadelphia (AAMP)
- **Town Watch Integrated Services (TWIS)**
- **Office of Transportation, Infrastructure, and Sustainability (OTIS)**
 - Safe Routes to School
 - Indego Bike Share and High-Quality Bike Network
 - Clean Fleet Implementation (in coordination with OOS, OFM)
- **Rebuild**
 - Workforce development programs
 - Renovations to community recreation centers, parks, and library facilities in underserved or marginalized communities of color.
 - M/W/DSBE participation rates far exceed mayoral targets
- **Office of Criminal Justice & Public Safety (CJPS):**
 - **Police Assisted Diversion (PAD)**, first launched during FY18, PAD has expanded capacity over the last several years which enables the program to provide services to additional areas of the City at-large. The MDO has completed a formal program evaluation and has identified key opportunities to continue strengthening the impact of the program and removed criminal history as an exclusionary criterion for program participants to promote racial equity.
 - **911 Triage & Co-Responders Strategy**: first launched during FY22, improves outcomes for people who call 911 for reasons related to a behavioral health crisis. This effort has successfully embedded a Behavioral Health Navigator at Police Radio to inform the triage process. This has been identified as an opportunity to expand

this program in coordination with PFD to pair Behavioral Health Navigators with EMS and first-responders.

- **Philadelphia Roadmap to Safer Communities & Transitional Jobs Program:** In 2021, Philadelphia had one of the highest homicide rates on record. Investments in education and other protective factors are critical to reducing violence over time, but today the city faces a growing public health crisis that is claiming a generation of young people – last year homicide was the leading cause of death for Black men ages 15 to 43 and Latinx men ages 15 to 31 in Philadelphia. Solutions guided by the Philadelphia Roadmap to Safer Communities must expand to match the scale and urgency of the problem. This includes the launch of the Rapid Employment and Development Initiative (READI). The model, currently deployed in Chicago, relentlessly engages those highly at-risk and connects them to cognitive behavioral therapy, paid transitional jobs, and support services. Investments in FY22 have laid the groundwork to deepen engagement in FY23.
 - **Safety & Justice Challenge:** this initiative originally launched through funding granted to the City by the MacArthur Foundation to support the criminal justice reform effort. The program aims to reduce pretrial incarceration, improve case processing times, reduce violations of probation, and reduce racial inequity. Beginning with FY21, the MDO began to offset program funding with general fund support to sustain and the life of the program. This program has been directly related to the reduction in the local jail population and closing of the City's House of Corrections. Additional program successes include the FY22 launch of a mini-grant program to 20 community organizations working to address racial, ethnic, and economic disparities and reduce the likelihood of incarceration. The MDO continues to explore the opportunities created by this program by offsetting costs through general fund support.
 - **Office of the Victim Advocate (OVA):** through funding approved for FY22, the Office of Criminal Justice & Public Safety has identified and selected a qualified and diverse candidate to represent and lead the Office of the Victim Advocate with planned expansion through FY22 into FY23. OVP will be tasked with advocating on behalf of victims and co-victims with an emphasis on addressing the pervasive and devastating effects of gun violence and will play a crucial role in cross-agency coordination. Victims of gun violence are often of racially or culturally diverse background whose voices often go unheard. Successful advocacy on behalf of victims of gun violence will result in a safer and more just Philadelphia and begins to address some of the systemic deficiencies of government that lead to racial inequity.
- **Office of Violence Prevention (OVP):**
 - **Community Crisis Intervention Program (CCIP):** Launched in FY20, Community Crisis Intervention Program (CCIP) is a violence prevention strategy that uses credible messengers from neighborhoods vulnerable to gun violence to engage and disrupt violence by reducing tensions and mediating conflicts among those most likely to be victims of shootings or shooters themselves. Since its launch, CCIP made 3,866

home visits and responded to 910 incidents. Its teams have connected victims and their families with needed services and support, while building relationships with at-risk men and women with the goal of reducing the likelihood that they become a shooting victim or ever pick up a gun. Expansion of these services and deepening of case management support will be critical to be able to serve all the individuals in need of support.

- **Group Violence Intervention Program (GVI):** In Group Violence Intervention, the small percentage of individuals who are connected to the groups driving gun violence are directly engaged. Traditionally individuals are called into a large group meeting and told a simple message: The violence must STOP. If it continues, every legal tool available will be used to ensure they face swift and certain consequences. Individuals are simultaneously connected to social services, employment, and community support to assist them in changing their lives. This message is delivered by a team composed of a gun violence victim's family, law enforcement, and a social worker. Because of COVID, GVI in Philadelphia has been modified to deliver the message through home visits by the team, which has shown significant initial success. Since its launch in August 2020, GVI Philadelphia's rate for individuals accepting supportive services on their way to choosing a different path is 32%, compared to a national average for GVI of 10%. The most successful of these programs have reduced violent crime in cities by an average of 30%. This program has continued to be impacted by COVID, since group call-ins are the more traditional approach.
- **Community Expansion Grants (CEG):** To achieve and sustain a reduction in gun violence and improve the quality of life in communities most affected by gun violence, the City launched the Anti-Violence Community Expansion Grant Program, which invested in organizations with proven track records of delivering quality anti-violence interventions, helping them to expand and strengthen their efforts. In CY 2021, the Community Expansion Grant program distributed \$13.5 million to 31 local organizations doing impactful anti-violence work. This was a one-time investment, and will require longer term support for the organizations to assist with data collection and impact analysis.
- **Targeted Community Investment Grants (TCIG):** Targeted Community Investment Grants supports community based violence prevention activities that support public safety and build a stronger sense of community. Over the last two years, this initiative has funded over 150 projects with a combined award of over \$3 million, and will add additional \$500,000 of investment in FY22. In the most recent completed round of projects, the program received high marks on levels of satisfaction and sense of safety from participants and grantees: 88% of participants in the funded projects said that the programs made them feel safe in their communities, 96% of participants and 85% of grantees felt that TCIG gave them an opportunity to build more trusting relationships with neighbors and community members, 98% of participants would like to see more programs like this one, and 83% of grantees would lead future projects like this one. The office is looking for ways to support programs that would enable them to be able to further scale work that is making an impact.

- **Police Advisory Commission (PAC) & Citizen Police Oversight Commission (CPOC):**
 - PAC and the continued transition to CPOC directly supports the Administration’s Safer and More Just Philadelphia goal. This program has seen success as it relates to providing greater accountability for police officers, improves police-community relations, and ensures greater transparency which are all issues that directly impact marginalized communities of color and decreases racial inequity.
 - MDO recognizes both the opportunity and threat to advancement of racial equity associated with the expansion of and transition to the CPOC model. Careful consideration, engagement with internal and external stakeholders, adequate funding, and proper oversight are all required to take opportunities to improve upon the inadequacies and distrust many members of marginalized, racially diverse communities have for the police departments at national and local levels.

- **Opioid Response Unit (ORU):**
 - Since the ORU’s launch in FY21, it focuses on preventing and treating opioid use disorder, as well as helping communities recover by ensuring City departments operate within a unified strategy and share resources. The Opioid Response Unit manages four Strategic Initiatives that bring together many city departments to collaborate. The four Strategic Initiative groups within the ORU are Treatment, Prevention, Community Support, and Public Safety.
 - 639 people died of a drug overdose in Philadelphia between January and June 2021. During the first six months of 2020, the Health Department recorded 582 drug overdose deaths. This increase puts Philadelphia on a trajectory to record the highest number of drug overdose deaths in a calendar year, including a significant increase in overdoses among Black and Hispanic/Latino/a/x Philadelphians. In 2020, overdoses deaths among white individuals decreased by 10 percent. However, fatal overdoses among Black non-Hispanic individuals increased 29 percent.
 - ORU supported the launched the Kensington Community Resilience Fund (KCRF)—a public-private-community partnership between community members, the City, and regional funds to explicitly address the community impacts of the opioid crisis in Kensington. KRF issued its first round of grants, totaling \$200,000 to 20 organizations. Separately, six mini-grants were awarded to organizations that serve Black and Latinx populations in neighborhoods with high rates of drug use and overdose to improve treatment and prevention messaging in communities of color.
 - Targeted Mobile Efforts: ORU supported the launch of targeted mobile trailer efforts to reduce overdoses that are now underway in areas with the highest need based on overdose data, in addition to Kensington. The Mobile Outreach Recovery Services Team is now completing substance use disorder screenings alongside the Prevention Point Philadelphia Teams who can also induct on buprenorphine. Induction is the clinical process related to beginning a course of buprenorphine as Medication Assisted Treatment for Opioid Use Disorder and involves monitoring

Clinical Opioid Withdrawal Scale (COWS) numbers and providing patients with buprenorphine in response.

- Addressing the scale of the opioid crisis continues to be a challenge. The office hopes that the opioid lawsuit will help to provide new resources.

- **Community Life Improvement Program (CLIP):**
 - CLIP remains one of the MDO's most racially and culturally diverse workforce. CLIP prioritizes the hiring and mentoring of young adults which frequently include previously-incarcerate individuals. Recent successes within CLIP include the launch of the Same-Day-Pay Program that provides payment in return for boots-on-the-ground support in communities disproportionately affected by gun violence and substance abuse disorders across Philadelphia. CLIP has requested funding to maintain and expand this program for FY23 and beyond. Other long-running successes include vacant lot stabilization, graffiti clean-up, and alleyway tree removal.
 - CLIP is extremely efficient with the funding they are provided throughout the course of a fiscal year but has been heavily impacted by budget reductions beginning with FY21. New Normal funding has enabled CLIP to maintain or expand some areas of operation through FY21 and FY22 but will have to curtail these programs without additional funding support.

- **Office of Immigrant Affairs (OIA):**
 - OIA's core mission is to promote the wellbeing of Philadelphia's immigrant communities and provide opportunities, services, and information touching on all the mayoral priorities for racial equity. OIA's impact on racial equity is both internal and external facing
 - OIA's Language Access Program provides access to translation services for non-English speaking Philadelphians and translated documents on all matters including public health and education. In addition, OIA works towards ensuring a diverse, efficient, and effective government by coordinating access to language access services across City departments.
 - OIA played a critical role during the Afghan Refugee operation at the Philadelphia International Airport by ensuring the availability of translation services
 - The Family Unity Project by funding legal services for members of immigrant communities. Funding for the initiative has increased since its launch in FY19. Legal counsel has been provided to 105 residents facing deportation, with 32 percent of the cases completed in immigration court granting approval to stay within the U.S.
 - Opportunities for OIA to further increase racial equity include a request to expand availability of language access collateral including a wider variety of translated documents available to the public and a request to further grow the Immigrant Legal Defense Fund.

- **Municipal ID Program (MIDP):**
 - MIDP was launched during FY19 and has issued over 12 thousand IDs to-date. This program provides a direct service to all Philadelphians and directly impacts members of racially and culturally diverse communities. By providing Philadelphia residents access to official City-issued identification, MIDP reduces the barriers for accessing critical services.
 - MIDP has engaged with different organizations and City departments to target Philadelphians more effectively and most in need. Examples include returning citizens, members of immigrant communities, individuals effected by the opioid epidemic, elderly, youth, survivors of domestic violence, and individuals experiencing homelessness.
 - By providing official identification, MIDP positively reinforces all mayoral priorities as it relates to racial equity and inclusion. Access to health services, education, and other City services can be tied to the ability for an individual to provide official documentation.
 - MIDP sees opportunities to further grow in the coming fiscal years and plans to expand mobile pop-up sites and targeting underserved or marginalized communities. MIDP will also continue to add benefits available to Philadelphians that acquire City-issued identification.

- **Health & Human Services:**
 - Eviction Prevention: In FY21 and FY22, HHS worked with the municipal court, City partners, and legal service advocates to advance eviction protections and maintain housing stability for tenants impacted by COVID-19, which included a partnership with the court to require eviction diversion, a court-ordered moratorium on lockouts for those with a complete rental assistance application and increased legal representation for tenants facing eviction. Through this collaboration, eviction filings decreased from 19,368 in 2019 to 5,595 in FY21. Evictions disproportionately impact Black women with children. Rental assistance is anticipated to decline as COVID-related federal support is being phased out.
 - Right to Counsel: In FY22, HHS finalized Right to Counsel regulations and launched the Right to Counsel in two Philadelphia zip codes that were most impacted by evictions. Right to Counsel guarantees free legal representation to low-income renters if they are facing eviction. This right includes proceedings to evict, terminate tenancy, or terminate a housing subsidy. This may also be put at-risk by the elimination of federal rental subsidy.
 - Shared Public Spaces: HHS and partners completed a strategic plan for the Same Day Work and Pay (SDWP) program, the establishment of CEO as the backbone of a new SDWP collective impact model, and the expansion of the SDWP program to include two program operators in Kensington. HHS also finalized the zero-tolerance tent and structure policy and procedures, completed briefings for leadership and program staff, and peacefully resolved encampments at the PATCO concourse on Locust Street, 3200 Kensington Avenue, and 1800 E. Lehigh Avenue. COVID

requirements continue to make finding housing and shelter spaces more challenging.

- **Commission on Aging:** The Commission on Aging leads the development of policy and strategies to support health, safety, and security for Philadelphians ages 55 and older. MCOA also operates the Senior Community Service Employment Program and APPRISE, a Medicare insurance counseling program. These programs overwhelmingly serve individuals of color, and are almost entirely funded by state and federal grants.

- **Office of Arts, Culture & the Creative Economy (OACCE):**
 - OACCE strives to close the gap in access to quality cultural experiences and creative expressions and highlights artists and creators of racially and culturally diverse backgrounds. OACCE promotes engagement between City government, the arts community, and the population at-large by providing safe, accessible, and culturally diverse experiences for all Philadelphians. OACCE also provides funding to support and maintain the operations of the Philadelphia Cultural Fund and the African American Museum of Philadelphia.
 - **Illuminate the Arts Grant Program (ITAG):** OACCE has distributed over \$1M to 645 local artists, small and mid-sized nonprofit organizations, and small creative enterprises. One of the main goals of ITAG is to financially uplift Philadelphia’s creative sector with a focus on proposals from within disadvantaged communities and communities of racial and cultural diversity. ITAG launched during FY21 and continues in FY22 with OACCE preparing to launch the next round of grant funding availability. 62 percent of funding distributed during the first round of the ITAG program was awarded to individuals from disadvantaged communities and 55 percent awarded to artists of color. Many of the individuals or organizations awarded funding would have been otherwise unable to support the projects proposed. With additional funding for ITAG, OACCE would be able to continue the program by providing direct financial support to creative individuals, organizations, or projects and further developing efficient and effective ways to implement operations. By awarding direct funding, OACCE seeks to improve racial equity within the arts community and City at-large.
 - **Neighborhood Arts Program:** OACCE supports effective, efficient government by prioritizing funding to support public events offered free to all Philadelphians and provides direct payment to performers and creators. Some Neighborhood Arts Program initiatives also provide an educational experience to attendees and are often focused on spotlighting performers and creators from racially and culturally diverse backgrounds.

- **Town Watch Integrated Services (TWIS):**
 - TWIS’s core mission is to directly address quality of life issues through community policing and participation which leads to a safer and more just Philadelphia and a more diverse, efficient, effective and government. TWIS operates within many

communities across Philadelphia and is focused on areas that are racially and culturally diverse and heavily involves participation and input members of the community. In recent fiscal years, TWIS has expanded or enhanced their operation within the Kensington, Port Richmond, Frankfort, Southwest, West, East, Northwest neighborhoods of Philadelphia.

- MDO and CJPS have identified opportunities for TWIS to further enhance their operation and have requested funding for FY23 to develop a strategic plan to grow the program, increase capacity, and more effectively target communities in need. A safer and more just Philadelphia for all includes a robust Town Watch program connecting community members and City government to impact positive change most effectively.

- **Office of Transportation & Infrastructure (OTIS):**
 - Quality systems of transportation and infrastructure are vital to developing an Inclusive Economy and Thriving Neighborhoods, improves access to health and education services for all. OTIS seeks to improve the quality of life, accessibility, and safety for all Philadelphians through several key initiatives and often targets neighborhoods that have historically been underserved or marginalized communities of racial and cultural diversity. Successful oversight and management of OTIS projects and initiatives leads to advances the goal of providing a Diverse, Efficient and Effective Government for all.
 - **Safe Routes Philly:** launched by OTIS in April 2021, this program seeks to develop and improve the transportation network and provide safe and efficient routes to educational institutions for educators, students, and families across Philadelphia. Advancements in racial equity become increasingly challenging for diverse or underserved communities they are isolated or disconnected due to the lack of a high-quality transportation network.
 - **Indego Bike Share & High-Quality Bike Network:** with each fiscal year, OTIS continues to expand access and availability of the Indego Bike Share program and further develop a high-quality bike network across the City. A city-wide, high-quality bike network increases safety of riders when travelling by bike and encourages Philadelphians to use these systems with more regularity.
 - **Clean Fleet Implementation:** OTIS, in coordination with the Office of Sustainability and Office of Fleet Management, launched the Clean Fleet initiative in October 2021. This initiative is designed to transition the City-owned fleet from gasoline powered to electric powered vehicles over the course of the next several years. This initiative will not only reduce the carbon footprint of Philadelphia’s Municipal Government but will also provide future cost savings by reducing the demand for gasoline to fuel City-owned vehicles. Cost savings realized through this initiative may be repurposed to support other initiatives that may more directly impact and improve racial equity and ensures that the City of Philadelphia proactively seeks to improve efficiency and effectiveness of tax generated funding of City operations.

- **Rebuild**
 - The Rebuild program has been a cornerstone of the current Administration and has seen many successes over the past several fiscal years. As it relates to racial equity, the demographics of Rebuild’s Workforce Development Program include a 98 percent participation rate of people of color, with 92 percent of graduates from its initial cohorts being accepted into Union apprenticeships.
 - Rebuild has also found success as it relates to M/W/DSBE participation rates. Rebuild far exceeds mayoral targets and has awarded 67 percent of contract dollars to firms owned by minorities, women, and disabled owned business enterprises. Rebuild has also worked to successfully register at least 92 diverse local businesses in its business support program.
 - In the coming years, MDO and Rebuild have the opportunity to increase capacity for Project Management to ensure the planning, design, and construction for as many recreation centers, parks, and library facilities are able to move forward during the program’s lifetime. These improvements across the City will have a lasting and measurable impact on current and future residents, many of whom will be racially and culturally diverse.

- **Office of Criminal Justice & Public Safety (CJPS)**
 - **Police Assisted Diversion (PAD):** since its launch, PAD has provided measurable successes as it related to improving racial equity by diverting low-level, non-violent offenders away from the criminal justice system. Expansion of services and service area have enabled PAD to increase the impact and further improve racial equity.
 - **911 Triage & Co-Responders Strategy:** measurable successes for this initiative include the training for 911 call-takers, implementation of mandatory behavioral health screening questions for 911 call-takers, and the expansion to six field teams. Further implementation and integration of this program will lead to additional measured successes in future years.
 - **Philadelphia Roadmap to Safer Communities (PRSC) & Transitional Jobs Program:** While still getting underway, the transitional jobs program anticipates serving 222 individuals in FY22 with career readiness, job training and placement. The programs are targeted to those who are most at-risk for engaging in gun violence, and will overwhelmingly serve people of color.
 - **Safety & Justice Challenge:** examples of measured successes for this program include a mini-grant program awarded to 20 community organizations working to further improve racial equity and economic prosperity, 25 housing slots for individuals transitioning from Philadelphia Prisons to civilian life, and a robust pre-trial advocacy system designed to reduce incarceration or reincarceration.
 - Office of the Victim Advocate (OVA)

- **Office of Violence Prevention (OVP)**

- Community Crisis Intervention Program (CCIP): In 2020, CCIP engaged 2,797 individuals in high violence neighborhoods, and lead 23 anti-retaliation negotiations. Between GVI and CCIP, 39 highly at-risk individuals were placed in paid training and work readiness programs. The office is currently compiling data for 2021.
 - Group Violence Intervention Program (GVI): As mentioned above, since its launch in August 2020, GVI Philadelphia’s rate for individuals accepting supportive services on their way to choosing a different path is 32%, compared to a national average for GVI of 10%.
 - Community Expansion Grants (CEG): CEG-funded programs began in December 2021. Key measures include number of highly at-risk individuals served, and participation in activities that have been indicated to reduce risk of violence, such as engagement in behavioral health services and career readiness skill building, but will differ across the 31 programs funded.
 - Targeted Community Investment Grants (TCIG): TCIG programs are intended to help build capacity in communities. Key measures include impact on participants. In 2020, 88% of participants in the funded projects said that the programs made them feel safe in their communities, 96% of participants and 85% of grantees felt that TCIG gave them an opportunity to build more trusting relationships with neighbors and community members, 98% of participants would like to see more programs like this one, and 83% of grantees would lead future projects like this one.
- **Police Advisory Commission (PAC) & Citizen Police Oversight Commission (CPOC)**
 - PAC continues to work to transition to the Citizen Police Oversight Commission. Currently, PAC measures success based on the number of complaints reviewed and responded to. It has also launched a mediation process between police and citizens. This is in addition to policy work it does to improve the transparency and accountability of the Philadelphia Police Department. In FY22, this included recommendations for adjustment to the Police Board of Inquiry.
- **Opioid Response Unit (ORU)**
 - ORU works in coordination with agencies across City government. Key measures of success are individuals connected to treatment, overdose reversals, connections to housing, and quality of life supports delivered for communities (vacant lot clean up, exterior repairs, etc).
- **Community Life Improvement Program (CLIP)**
 - **Same-Day-Pay Program:** CLIP has seen measured success with this initiative and has offered full-time employment as CLIP Crew Members to 19 participants to-date and has promoted 2 participants to CLIP Crew Chief.
 - **Vacant Lot Stabilization & Graffiti Clean-up:** CLIP has seen measured success with the Vacant Lot and Graffiti Clean-up Programs and has worked to maximize the

impact and continue the programs though recent budget reductions. Expansion of these programs further improve racial equity by providing employment for racially and culturally diverse candidates and by visually improving neighborhoods across Philadelphia disproportionately affected by blight, gun violence, or the opioid epidemic.

- **Office of Immigrant Affairs (OIA)**
 - **Immigrant Legal Defense Fund:** OIA has seen measured success through this initiative since its launch during FY19. OIA has been able to support over 100 individuals facing detention or deportation with 32 percent of clients with cases processed through immigration courts approved to stay within the U.S. It's likely that many of the clients supported by this initiative would have been unable to do so without City support.
 - **Language Access Program:** OIA has seen measured success through this long-running program and continues to coordinate with City departments to ensure availability of translation services and documents. OIA targets a total of 65 thousand translated documents per year and is on track to meet that goal in FY22.

- **Municipal ID Program (MIDP)**
 - Since its launch, MIDP has issued over 12 thousand City IDs. Access to official identification is often required to access critical services and often disproportionately effects racially or culturally diverse individuals. MIDP continues to expand partnership agreements to increase the benefits afforded to Philadelphians using the City-issued ID as their primary identification. Costs for this program are offset by revenue collected during standard ID issuances. Partnership agreements are often formed to offset or eliminate the initial costs for individuals or communities most impacted by systemic inefficiency and racial inequity.

- **Health & Human Services**
 - **Eviction Prevention:** Eviction filings decreased from 19,368 in 2019 to 5,595 in FY21. Evictions disproportionately impact Black women with children.
 - **Right to Counsel:** In FY22, HHS finalized Right to Counsel regulations and launched the Right to Counsel in two Philadelphia zip codes that were most impacted by evictions. Right to Counsel guarantees free legal representation to low-income renters if they are facing eviction. This right includes proceedings to evict, terminate tenancy, or terminate a housing subsidy. Measures of success will include the number of eviction filings and rate of evictions in the prioritized zip codes.
 - **Shared Public Spaces:** Measures of success include individuals served through Same Day Work and Pay, and the number of individuals placed in housing through encampment resolutions

- **Commission on Aging:** Measures of success include the number of people served through Senior Community Service Employment Program and APPRISE, a Medicare insurance counseling program.

- **Office of Arts, Culture & the Creative Economy**
 - OACCE has seen measured successes and advances in racial equity through the ITAG and Neighborhood Arts programs. Public attendance at OACCE sponsored or organized events has begun to increase as COVID-19 related restrictions continue to ease. OACCE projects exceeding attendance targets for FY22 with over 20 thousand attendees fiscal year-to-date. Fiscal year-to-date, OACCE has been able to support over 1,400 local artists financially many of whom are from racially diverse backgrounds and underserved communities.

- **Town Watch Integrated Services (TWIS):**
 - TWIS has seen measured success related to increased community engagement at monthly meetings, management of six safe corridors for schools in the Kensington neighborhood, launch of Town Watch groups in three new neighborhoods, and the revitalization of Town Watch groups in another five neighborhoods.

- **Office of Transportation, Infrastructure, and Sustainability (OTIS)**
 - OTIS has successfully installed protected bike lanes and intersection improvements across a total of 24.5 bike-lane miles with another 5 bike-lane miles currently under construction. Over 100 schools have been trained as a part of the Safe Routes Philly initiative and Indego's Bike Share Network continues to expand with record ridership achieved during FY21. The announcement and implementation of the City's Clean Fleet Initiative was announced in January 2021 with additional information released to the public in October 2021. OTIS is working towards achieving 100% procurement participation by 2025.

- **Rebuild**
 - Rebuild has recently held ribbon cutting ceremonies to celebrate the completion of projects including the Miles Mack Playground in Mantua, East Poplar Playground, and 8th & Diamon Playground. Rebuild recently broke ground and started construction on over \$36 million of projects including sites like Olney Recreation Center—slated for over \$15 million in investment—to Capitol Playground—receiving over \$1 million in improvements. Rebuild's Workforce Development Program has seen 92 percent of participant graduates accepted into union apprenticeships.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

The MDO uses many different aspects of its yearly operating budget to advance racial equity priorities and create an inclusive and anti-racist work environment. MDO actively encourages employees to attend professional development seminars or trainings related to racial equity, diversity, and inclusion. In addition, MDO encourages employees to attend City-lead Community Resource Groups, with supervisor approval, during working hours.

MDO has hosted all-staff meetings during times recent times of crisis or instability with the intention of providing an open-forum for employees of all backgrounds and position types within the department at-large to speak directly to senior leadership without judgement or repercussions.

When going through the process of filling an open position within the MDO, a racially diverse panel is assembled to partake in the interview process. The MDO is working to continue to expand it's reach when posting positions publicly so that more qualified candidates of diverse backgrounds can apply for a role with the department. In certain instances, the MDO has coordinated with outside support when attempting to identify qualified candidates of diverse backgrounds and experience.

MDO reviews and responds to all accusations of cultural, racial, or demographic biases and behaviors accordingly. MDO-HR is actively working with departmental and programmatic leadership to develop tools and provide additional support to enhance the working environment with a focus all issues related to racial equity, diversity, and inclusion.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The MDO's leadership team and workforce at-large consists of many racially diverse individuals that bring a wide-ranging perspective to the impacts of racial equity and inclusion. In addition, The MDO serves as a cabinet-level department tasked with the oversight of the City's operating departments which allows us further to implement structural change to the systems and services that impact all Philadelphians on a regular basis.

MDO regularly engages with internal and external stakeholders in key issues including but not limited to police reform, gun violence, opioids, and the COVID-19 response. As a part of the budget process, MDO leadership considers how to balance funding to align with Administrative priorities in a way that preserves or expands services to members of marginalized communities.

A portion of the MDO's budget is dedicated to the direct delivery of services and quality of life improvements for members of marginalized communities of color with another portion

allocated to development and implementation of policies and practices designed to reduce racial inequity.

The MDO encourages and supports active engagement with internal and external stakeholders through community-based forums which are often focused on delivering targeted support to racially diverse or underserved communities, internal steering committees or working groups, and by sharing the successes and opportunities of MDO programs and initiatives within the cabinet, across City government and with members of the public.

Examples of this work include, but are not limited to, the expansion of the Police Advisory Commission as it continues to transition into the Citizen Police Oversight Commission, the launch and expansion of the Police Assisted Diversion Program, 911-Triage & Co-Responders Strategy,

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)? N/A

The Managing Director's Office prioritizes matters of racial equity, diversity, and inclusion and incorporates the Administration's principles and goals into all requests for additional funding, budget reduction scenario proposals, and when reviewing the operations of existing programs or initiatives. The office believes that any plan to counter racial inequality and structural root causes of racism must be highly coordinated across different aspects of City government to best affect positive change.

The MDO has implemented many programs and initiatives with the intention of reducing or eliminating racial inequity and continues to review the efficiency and effectiveness through program evaluation. The office encourages engagement of internal and external stakeholders and have worked hard to create an inclusive and respectful workplace and will take immediate action to correct any behaviors or practices that may cause a negative impact on the Administrations priorities and goals to improve racial equity.

Mayor's Office

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Office of the Mayor is tasked with ensuring the Mayor's priorities are disseminated to the rest of the Administration for implementation, and clearly communicated to City Council, other governments, and the people of Philadelphia. The Mayor's Office has the opportunity to effectuate racial equity in three main ways:

- 1) Policy and legislation** – as the final decisionmaker on City policy and legislation, the Mayor's Office has the opportunity to advance and adopt policies that reverse the long history of governmental policymaking that has disadvantaged Black and brown residents, and other historically marginalized groups, across a wide range of areas: from criminal justice and public safety to housing and tax policy.
 - 2) Budget** – the Mayor's Office, together with the Finance Department, determines how the City will propose to spend its annual budget; this presents the opportunity to invest in city services and capital projects that are most likely to improve the safety, economic well-being, and health of Black and brown residents.
 - 3) Leadership and Communications** – the Office has the opportunity to use the Mayor's high profile both as the leader of an organization with approximately 27,000 employees who interact with residents every day and as a public official to draw attention to racial inequality and ways to reverse it.
- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**
 - Citywide Racial Equity Strategy** – the Mayor's Office leads a citywide racial equity strategy, consistent with Executive Order 1-20, that is working to support all Departments to create Racial Equity Action Plans by 2023.

- **Workforce Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Strategy** – the Mayor’s ODEI, in partnership with the Office of Human Resources and City Departments, works with departments quarterly to support their intentional efforts to increase underrepresented diverse talent, implement diverse recruitment strategies, and build an inclusive culture. This work includes efforts by the Mayor’s Office for People with Disabilities and Mayor’s Office of LGBT Affairs to create a workspace where everyone feels valued, including people with disabilities and the LGBTQ+ community
- **Public Engagement** – OPE works to ensure that systemically excluded communities have a chance to connect with and to inform the City’s work; this work has included the development of an Equitable Engagement Toolkit for Departments to use, creation of the Community Resource Corps to reach community members where they live, support of the Pathways to Reform, Transformation and Reconciliation group, leadership of the Strategy Group to Address AAPI Hate and Violence and planning for the creation of an Indigenous/Native Commission.
- **Policymaking** – The Mayor’s Office has supported policy making to advance racial equity including antipoverty and economic security work such as fines and fees reform, advocacy at the state and federal level on public benefits and tax policy (such as the Child Tax Credit) that will make the lowest income Philadelphians, who are predominately Black and brown, more economically secure. Other work includes supporting planning for future spending, such as the federal Infrastructure Bill, in ways that will reverse the effects of longstanding disinvestment in black and brown communities in the city.
- **Integrity** – By supporting decision-making across the government that is consistent with the City’s ethics rules and by offering workforce-wide guidance documents, training and consultation, the Mayor’s Office seeks to empower City employees who may historically have been excluded from traditional power and access structures. As legal advisors the Integrity staff are challenging traditional interpretations of ethics rules using race equity as an analytical factor.
- **Communications and Events**– the Mayor’s Office uses the Mayor’s voice to communicate with Philadelphians and the world about the continued racial inequities in the City and country, to call for the need for continued work to reverse the effects of centuries of structural racism, and to lift successes for celebration. Additionally, the Office of the City Representative works to celebrate the contributions of extraordinary Black and brown Philadelphians, and other historically marginalized groups, through producing events that uplift the contributions of extraordinary residents today and throughout the city’s history.
- **Citywide Racial Equity Strategy** – The capacity of City departments to understand and advance a racial equity framework has been strengthened through the collaborative work of the FY21 Cohort of ten departments and current FY22 Cohort of 13 departments. Challenges remain with how capacity is then operationalized across departments’ major services and/or strategic initiatives. As the FY21 Cohort goes through its first budget cycle since completing its cohort work, there is an opportunity for some departments to commit resources to operationalize and achieve strategies identified in their Racial Equity Action Plan. The FY22 Cohort may be eyeing the next budget cycle for resources, to the extent strategies will be identified and finalized at the completion of Fiscal Year 22. Without department leadership

investment in the citywide racial equity strategy, it will be difficult for departments to gain support and traction needed to achieve identified strategies. The Racial Equity A-Team series has been developed to address this potential gap, but more work needs to be done to achieve senior leadership impact across all departments. Key decisions around resources (budget dollars) will also impact achievement of some strategies identified by departments.

- **Workforce Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Strategy** - Significant progress has been made in diversifying the exempt workforce, particularly for Asian and Latino, Hispanic employees. Overall, many departments are paying increased attention to diverse recruitment and hiring. Departments are also focusing more on building an inclusive environment, supportive of all employees, including people with disabilities and the LGBTQ+ community. More work needs to be done around diverse recruitment and hiring strategies inclusive of Black and African American residents, as well as other underrepresented diverse talent. Additionally, more targeted strategies focused on supporting departments in handling concerns or complaints related to protected categories, including race, are required to build an inclusive culture.
- **Public Engagement** - The current infrastructure for public engagement includes community-driven Mayoral Commissions that create an opportunity for residents to regularly participate in advising the Administration on policy matters with an equity lens. Commissions are made up of historically systemically excluded populations, as well as leaders and populations (including faith leaders) who are key in reaching these populations. A challenge is creating an effective system for recommendations from Commissions to be applied to the broader City structure and departments.
- **Policymaking** - A policymaking strength is that Administration leaders and City Council are often aligned ideologically on the goal of reversing the effects of structural racism, but challenges arise when in practice that means advantaging some communities now and not others. Other challenges include the City's overall revenue picture and the large portion of the City budget that are fixed costs including salaries, both of which constrain the ability to make large changes in the way the city spends.
- **Integrity** - A strength within the Integrity Office is significant prior operating department experience which lends to the ability to give practical advice. A challenge - and this is for any City-wide communication - is reaching City employees without City email accounts. In other words, managers and leaders must rely on paper postings or in-person communication for a significant portion of the City workforce. This has implications for race equity within the workforce and hinders outreach.
- **Communications** - The office's comprehensive communications efforts aim to inform the public about City government programs, policies, resources, and initiatives available to them. That involves a multi-pronged approach, usually focusing on getting the word out through press (media relations), on digital channels (social media and Phila.gov), and through direct outreach and community engagement. There are benefits and challenges to each: with press, the office has less control over the story the team wants to tell but a greater reach; the department can also target outlets for specific programs (such as targeting local diverse ethnic media outlets for a particular program available to minority-owned businesses, for example). Digital media offers us the ability to directly control the message the office is trying to get to the public, and how it gets out; however, continuing to grow reach and engagement with non-white and non-English speakers has been an ongoing

challenge. Direct outreach is one of the most impactful ways to reach the public but can involve significant time and capacity commitments. This is why partnership with other City departments and the Office of Public Engagement is crucial.

- **Citywide Racial Equity Strategy:** this work is aimed at increasing the capacity of City departments to promote racial equity through their operations, including through their service provision, resource allocation, procurement, and community engagement efforts. In FY21, ten departments completed Racial Equity Action Plans. In FY22, an additional 13 departments are on target to complete Racial Equity Action Plans. All remaining departments will complete Plans by the end of FY23. In addition to the completion of Plans by all departments, a substantial cohort of employees have participated in comprehensive learning to incorporate a set of racial equity principles into operations, with at least 100 employees committing each year to the strategy. Also, the Budget Office’s incorporation of the Racial Equity Questionnaire, Budget Equity Committee, and other infrastructure have improved processes as a means to achieve equitable outcomes.
- Potential new outcome metric: Resident perceptions that “the City of Philadelphia government is looking out for my needs” (impact): *not currently measured - this is new data that would need to be collected in order for this to serve as a performance measure. We would want to identify and reduce any racial disparities in residents’ perceptions.*
 - **Workforce Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Strategy**
- All departments have created Workforce Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Plans. (output)
- Increase in representation of Black or African American, Hispanic or Latino, Asian, and other non-white employees among exempt and executive exempt workforce. (impact) Impact to date:
 - Compared to the start of the Kenney Administration in FY16, there has been a 3.83 percentage point increase in the number of diverse employees in the exempt workforce, with people of color comprising 50.29 percent of the exempt workforce in FY16 and 54.12 percent of the exempt workforce in FY21.
 - Compared to the start of the Kenney Administration in FY16, there has been a 7.30 percentage point increase in the number of diverse employees who earn \$90,000 and above in the exempt workforce.
- Potential new outcome metric: Sense of belonging/inclusion among City employees (impact). *This is not currently measured, would require new effort to collect this data and disaggregate by race.*
 - **Public Engagement**
- Number of engagement events and participants. Year-to-Date 65 and 1,137 (output)
- Number of volunteer service hours. 38,718 (output)
- Potential new outcome metric: Resident perceptions that “the City of Philadelphia government provides an opportunity to give input on policies and programs that impact our diverse and systemically excluded communities (impact) : *not currently measured - this is new data that would need to be collected in order for this to serve as a performance measure. We would want to identify and reduce any racial disparities in residents’ perceptions.*

- **Policymaking**
- race-specific analyses to support policymaking in pandemic-related programs: PHLRentAssist, the Worker Relief Fund and multiple rounds of small business assistance (output)
- Child poverty rate by race, related to Child Tax Credit outreach work (impact): data pending
 - **Integrity**
 - Number of advisories distributed to workforce (policy statements, general guidance, FAQs). (Output – current performance metric for budget)
 - Potential new outcome metric: Awareness of ethics rules among City employees (impact). *Not currently measured.*
 - **Communications**
 - Response time to constituent inquiries. 10 days (output)
 - Potential new outcome metric: Resident perceptions that “the City of Philadelphia government is looking out for my needs” (impact): *not currently measured - this is new data that would need to be collected in order for this to serve as a performance measure. We would want to identify and reduce any racial disparities in residents’ perceptions*

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

The Mayor’s Office has devoted its budget to supporting the Citywide Racial Equity Strategy, has added staff to the Office of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion to increase the capacity devoted to implementing anti-racist policies. The office follows best practices presented in OHR’s hiring guide including seeking a diverse pool of candidates and ensuring the department has a diverse selection panel. The Mayor’s Office staff is currently more diverse than prior administrations.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

Together with the Budget Office, the Mayor’s Office supported the addition of racial equity questions as a part of the Budget Call in FY22 and FY23, and the creation of a Budget Equity Committee to help increase the focus on racial equity as a part of spending decisions. The Policy Office is preparing to procure a standing contract for community surveying that will ensure that when City Departments want to survey residents about policies and city services survey participation does not underrepresent Black and brown residents. The Mayor’s Office of Civic Engagement and Volunteer Services has created a new Community Resource Corps which will engage community leaders to connect residents with anti-poverty resources.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts

of your budget proposal(s)?

N/A

Mural Arts

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Mural Arts generates impact within individuals, communities, and systems with a focus on five areas: youth development, criminal justice reform, wellness, environmental sustainability, and civil discourse. Our key innovations include: 1) building long-term collaborations between artists, community members, and cross-sector institutions that establish trust and shared values, and generate capacity needed to address complex needs and opportunities; and 2) combining art education, public art project production, and other social supports to holistically address needs and generate multiple impacts simultaneously.

We serve geographic and affiliated communities throughout the entire city of Philadelphia. More than half of our program participants are low to moderate income, and approximately 80% of our mural projects are created in low to moderate income communities. 87% of the students enrolled in our Art Education program come from families that qualify for governmental assistance. We serve court-involved adults through our Restorative Justice program and adults struggling with mental illness, trauma, and chemical dependency through our Porch Light (Behavioral Health) program. Most of these individuals come from low income backgrounds. On average, participants are: 51% women, 48% men, and 1% gender unreported; 45% Black, 13% Hispanic/Latinx, 31% White, 7% Asian/Pacific Islander, 2% multi-racial, 1% Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander and 1% American Indian/Alaskan Native.

The Restorative Justice program focuses on addressing systemic issues faced by justice impacted individuals, and the newest initiative of the Porch Light program, Color Me Back, a Same Day Work and Pay Program, combines participatory art-making and access to social services in a unique model offering individuals who are experiencing economic insecurity an opportunity to earn wages.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**

- a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.
- b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?

Below is a list of our most impactful programs that directly address equity, equal opportunity, and systemic racism.

Launched in Spring 2021, the Restorative Justice' **Women's Reentry Program** serves the unique needs of returning women and their families. This program is planned by justice-impacted women, and the intention is to train participants and grow a foundation of education, wellness, the power of art, relationship development, and career exploration and work attainment. This year will be the first full year of the program and Mural Arts is aiming to engage 50 individuals. The most critical challenge at this point is securing sufficient funding to continue the program.

Founded in 2008, the Restorative Justice' **Guild Program** is a paid apprenticeship that provides a supportive, arts-based learning environment where participants are paid while they build job readiness and other practical skills through training with professional instructors, assisting with community public art and revitalization projects, and mentorship from employment specialists and peers. The outcomes of the Guild are powerful: 85% of Guild graduates are employed or enrolled in education programs one year after graduation and the one-year recidivism rate for Guild graduates is 10% - compared to Philadelphia's one-year unified recidivism rate and state average of 34%. A current challenge we face for the Guild is a combination of funding and capacity.

In 2019, Mural Arts embarked on its most ambitious outreach - to those experiencing economic and housing insecurity - in a no-barrier opportunity to earn wages, uniquely combining participatory art-making and access to social services, in a Porch Light program entitled **Color Me Back: Same Day Work and Pay**. Differing from most workforce programs, participants are accepted without condition to work for \$50 a day within a trauma-informed environment alongside staff and peer support specialists. Over 1,000 individuals have engaged with the program and over \$235,000 has been paid in wages to participants since its start. Color Me Back requires partnerships with the City, with other service providers, and with private funders. Should the partnerships not continue, the program could suffer.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

In spring 2020 Mural Arts completed a DEI plan with Tammy Dowley-Blackman Group, LLC to develop programming and procedures that will foster a positive organizational culture, embedding all elements

of diversity, equity and inclusion across the institution. As a result of that process, there is now an established DEI Committee with a year-long program of events, trainings and workshops for all staff. Additionally, the DEI Committee has provided the organization's executive team with a list of recommendations to further provide transparency and equity in the areas of:

- Recruiting and hiring
- Salaries
- Professional development
- Artists' pipeline

With the completion of the staff's DEI plan, Mural Arts Advocates' Board of Directors realized they too could play an important role in fully exploring and embedding DEIAB across the organization. The Board's DEI Plan was completed in June 2021 and included a list of recommendations which are currently being implemented.

In August 2021 Mural Arts was awarded a Pew Center for Arts and Heritage Recovery Grant titled **Envisioning Equity: Building the Next Generation of Participatory Public Artists**. The premise of the 18 month grant is that Mural Arts will adapt organizational systems to better recruit, develop and retain artists of color, building a diverse next generation of participatory public artists. We are currently in the midst of this initiative.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

At Mural Arts, processes such as the establishment of the FY23 budget, follow steps where all individuals in the organization are engaged - including staff members and program participants. Each program area is responsible for identifying the areas of work which both address the organization's mission and values, and respond to the needs identified by the community. Once the needs are identified, financial resources are allocated, when available, to support the work.

Our priorities for this year are: providing work opportunities, creating opportunities for people to heal, creating opportunities for people to grow as leaders in their communities, and across all of these, meeting the specific needs of and advancing opportunities for BIPOC.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Mural Arts' specific approach is embedded in racial equity and includes four key components:

The work of Mural Arts starts with a genuine curiosity about what makes Philadelphia tick. We look for the issues that drive and make our city, and we look for the problems Philadelphia and its residents are grappling with daily.

Listening as part of change is about learning and understanding. Each project begins with active listening: we ask questions, and foster dialogue among disparate groups. This is the listening that makes sure that everyone is heard, the listening that amplifies voices that have been muted.

Connections begin when people picture themselves in each other's shoes. Once we have found our inspiration, we mobilize our partners and build a team of individuals—artists, participants, residents, nonprofit leaders, funders, policymakers—anyone who wants to help us make change happen. We connect people and institutions who normally do not talk to each other, and build bridges of dialogue over long standing chasms of misunderstanding, distrust, or ignorance.

The art is simply the most visible part of a long and complicated process of collaboration, which in itself leads to substantive change. Mural Arts creates resources and opportunity, and moments for reflection and celebration. Mural Arts creates hope and optimism about a different future. Mural Arts' process of collaborative art making becomes a powerful vehicle for inspiring these other creative forces.

Office of Children and Families

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Office of Children and Families (OCF) ensures that policies, resources, and services for children and families are aligned and coordinated in partnership with the School District of Philadelphia (SDP), City departments and community partners. OCF includes the Department of Human Services, Parks and Recreation, the Free Library, Early Childhood Education, Adult Education, and school-based services such as attendance supports, Out of School Time (OST), WorkReady and Community Schools. Racially equitable access to quality education and family support services is central to the OCF mission and is a guiding principle that drives policy and program design, data gathering and resource allocation.

OCF's work is focused on keeping all children safe, families strong, creating exceptional community hub schools and joyful learning opportunities in all libraries, recreation centers, parks and neighborhoods in Philadelphia. The office works across OCF departments and with partners to design programs focused on children's whole well-being. OCF monitors closely goals and outcomes to ensure that there is constant feedback with the families who are served and a refinement of programs to maximize impact where it is most needed. As part of our children and families core focus, OCF support parents' life-long learning goals through job training and adult education programs. OCF food security partnerships support nutritional health and family stability

by providing both immediate and long-term resources. All programs are designed to be situated where they are most needed as the office affirmatively work to identify and dismantle racial inequities and create a more inclusive City.

2. **What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. **For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. **For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

OCF programs, PHLPReK, Community Schools, Diversion and Adult Education, all exist to improve racial equity. It is the policy of OCF that all programs conduct extensive data analysis and stakeholder engagement at every stage of program design and deliver resources to children and families most in need of support services. The programs are designed to be critical components of building a more racially inclusive and equitable Philadelphia. The Performance Management and Technology division of OCF (PMT) run continuous assessments so that all programs have reliable performance metrics and feedback from families served. Data-driven resource allocation situates services in prioritized communities in direct furtherance of the City's goal of addressing racial disparities and creating a more inclusive future. Below is a brief description of OCF's core programs and how it furthers the City's racial equity goals.

- **PHLPReK:** Students who attend preschool programs are more prepared for school in core math and literacy areas, are less likely to be identified inaccurately as having special needs or be held back in elementary school when compared to children who did not attend preschool. (*What does the Research Really Say About Preschool Effectiveness? Learning Planning Institute, 2019*; see also, *University of North Carolina Early Education Evaluation 2020*). This means that the creation of PHLPReK in 2017 and its continued growth is fundamental to preparing children for enduring academic success and participation in all social, economic and civic opportunities.
- **Community Schools:** Comprehensive community schools represent a powerful equity strategy because they are designed to identify inequitable outcomes in schooling, disrupt the systems that perpetuate education disparities and increase opportunities in prioritized areas of Philadelphia. The community school hub model aims to connect all social systems that shape a family and child's experience so that barriers are removed. (*Community Schools: A Powerful Strategy to Disrupt Inequitable Systems, Learning Planning Institute, 2018*).
- **Diversion Programs:** Out-of-School-Time (OST), school attendance programs, WorkReady and other early intervention programs are designed to support academic success and divert

families away from Truancy Court and the formal child welfare system. People of color are significantly overrepresented in the formal child welfare system for reasons including mandatory reporter bias and systemic barriers that disproportionately impact communities of color. Intentional early interventions directed to the impacted communities disrupts the perpetuation of racial disparities. The programs stabilize families and provide resources that keep families safely intact.

- **Adult Education:** Adult education is fundamental to providing life-long learning that enriches individuals' lives and generates a more resilient and inclusive economy in Philadelphia. The Adult Education team does this by integrating all learning opportunities in one seamless system for residents; sustaining continuous feedback with partners and learners; and sharing data systems, metrics, and outcomes.

In Philadelphia there are statistically significant differences between racial/ethnic groups in educational attainment. Among adults aged 25 or older, Blacks have the highest proportion without a high school diploma or its equivalent. Hispanics have the second highest proportion (Source: U.S. Census Bureau, American Community Survey, five-year estimates, 2014-2018). Additionally, in the 2014-2018 American Community Survey the US Census found that nearly 17% of Philadelphia residents aged 25 or older were immigrants (~190,000). Although Puerto Ricans are U.S. citizens, 33% in Philadelphia lack a high school diploma or its equivalent (~21,500) and 10% of Puerto Ricans (age 25+) in Philadelphia speak English less than “well” (~9,500). These factors become lasting barriers for communities of color that call for sustained attention and resource allocation.

Each OCF program has outcome measures related to equitable resource allocation. PHLPreK, for example, looks at all preK slots to understand the landscape and to ensure PHLPreK is in preK deserts. PHLPreK defines need with the recognized data points that comprise early childhood risk factors, such as: preterm, low birth weight, inadequate prenatal care, teen mother, low maternal education, lead exposure, homelessness, and child maltreatment. The programs are then equitably situated where there is the highest need.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

OCF continues to build on its internal DEI work to strengthen an inclusive and anti-racist workplace, in policy and practice. OCF has assigned a director level staff person to lead this effort in partnership with the Mayor’s Office of Diversity, Equity and Inclusion.

The Diversity Equity and Inclusion (DEI) field of research instructs institutions to recognize internal bias, both individual and institutional. It instructs organizations to normalize conversations that reflect on structural manifestations of bias that perpetuate racial inequities and to design policies that dismantle racial barriers. Key areas of continued internal work at OCF include DEI data gathering and feedback from staff to identify improvements in hiring, promotions, onboarding,

retention, and professional development opportunities that promote a diverse and inclusive work environment.

OCF's programmatic success depends on attracting and retaining diverse talent that is representative of Philadelphia. OCF has an internal hiring guide with clear instructions on how to identify bias and implement tools to eliminate them at every stage of the hiring process. In the next stage of development, OCF will create a survey to gauge new hires' experiences of support and inclusivity and create a space to share suggestions on how to improve workplace culture.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

OCF uses racial, social, educational and economic demographic data to prioritize distribution of critical programs. Each program area also involves internal and external stakeholders in its design and improvement processes. Internally, each program engages with OCF leadership, OCF-PMT division and the Mayor's Policy Office.

Additionally, PHLPreK works with the Pre-K Advisory Board, Pennsylvania Department of Education, community partners and participant families to gather feedback and improve services. The Advisory Board has representatives from local providers, the School District of Philadelphia, research organizations and representatives from City Council. In addition, OCF's Early Childhood team partners with PHMC and professional development organizations to generate and support a more diverse workforce. PHLPreK has also developed a partnership with the William Penn Foundation and the University of Pittsburgh to advance teaching methodologies that foster *Positive Racial Identity Development in Early education (PRIDE)*.

Community Schools and Diversion Programs are situated in schools and community organizations identified to need educational and early intervention services. The programs systematically engage each community organization, the School Advisory Council, students, principals, teachers and the School District leadership. Meetings to improve services take place biweekly and larger gatherings take place monthly.

Given the range of adult education needs in Philadelphia OCF is focused on highlighting the value of life-long learning to residents' personal objectives and the City's goal of building a more

inclusive society and resilient economy. As part of this multi-prong engagement strategy, OCF funded a report (released January 2021) about how to connect adult education services across city government. Focus groups and surveys were conducted with all stakeholders. As a continuation of this project, a communications consultant is now in the process of engaging learners and educators to identify the most impactful models. OCF is also working with PhilaWorks, Careerlink sites, the William Penn Foundation, Pennsylvania Department of Education (PDE) and SNAP 50/50 (federal matching funds program) to align investments with the goal of creating seamless virtual and in person educational and job-training opportunities.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)? N/A

N/A

Office of Community Empowerment and Opportunity (CEO)

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Office of Community Empowerment and Opportunity (CEO) supports the economic growth of Philadelphia by providing leadership on issues of economic justice and advancing racial equity and inclusive growth to ensure that all Philadelphians might share in the city's prosperous future. CEO carries out its mission by funding and piloting new programs, engaging in advocacy, supporting policy research and analysis, and convening local and national stakeholders. CEO is the city's Community Action Agency, and as such the office prioritizes the prevention of poverty and work to address its root causes in communities. In Philadelphia, close to 25% of our population lives in poverty and those communities most affected are largely communities of color. Our strategic framework is rooted in racial equity, and through successful implementation of the priorities outlined in it the office seeks to:

- Align program funding directly tied to our mission to promote economic mobility through racial equity.
 - Contribute to citywide initiative and policy development where CEO has experience, data, or perspective.
 - Research best practices and develop model programs or practices for promoting economic mobility out of poverty.
 - Offer training, technical assistance, and project management to provider partners and community members to support their capacity to address economic mobility and equity issues.
 - Develop performance metrics to evaluate equity goals for CEO.
 - Ultimately create the most equitable recovery for those communities who have seen the most disparate impact in the last two years
- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**

- b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

CEO's work is centered in economic mobility through racial equity. The Administration's priorities for FY23 and CEO's efforts to bring those priorities to fruition are below. CEO collects data in each of the program initiatives that staff run directly or through providers. Data is collected and submitted through various systems including COPOS—Community Organization Planning and Outcome System, America Learns. All data can be disaggregated by gender, age, and race. Because CEO's work is focused on Racial Equity, in the list below we share just a few performance indicators.

- Safer & More Just Philadelphia
 - Benefits Access work providing individuals critical support for maximizing receipt of eligible benefits
 - Financial Inclusion work supporting returning citizens
 - Supporting the City's GVI program
 - Serving as the backbone for Same Day Work & Pay Program
- Quality Education for All
 - Youth Strategies and family support work through Promise Corps
- Benefits Access work Inclusive Economy & Thriving Neighborhoods
 - Financial Inclusion work
 - Key indicator: Since 2013, the Financial Empowerment Centers have helped the most vulnerable Philadelphians grow their wealth. Over 15,000 Philadelphians have visited the FECs. These Philadelphians have collectively improved 2,100 credit scores by at least 35 points, reduced debt by \$18M, improved savings by \$3.6M, and opened 600 safe and affordable bank accounts. Of the 15,000 people who have visited the FECS, 73% were women, 78% were Black or Latin, and 77% had incomes below 200% of the Federal Poverty Level.
 - Neighborhood Initiatives work through Promise Zone and Housing Security Working Group leadership
 - Family Support and Basic Needs work (CTC, Workforce)
 - Key indicator: Our work to maximize the number of Philadelphians receiving the Child Tax Credit focuses explicitly on the lowest income Philadelphians that earn so little (\$12,400 or less for a single individual) and do not file taxes with the IRS, thus are not automatically receiving \$3,000 or more per child in CTC payments for which they are eligible. Black and Latino households are disproportionately represented in this group, and more than 90% of the households that have received tax prep services from our partners are Black, Latino, Asian, or mixed race.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

CEO's core values and mission drive our organizational work toward Racial Equity as a central focus. Additionally, the CEO Human Resources team operates with Racial Equity as a central focus. Below are examples of this work in action:

- Professional development: Results Oriented Management and Accountability (ROMA) training started in 2021
 - Gain insight, skills, and tools to better plan, manage, and evaluate our programs with an outcomes-based approach
- Monthly All Staff meetings and with City partners to present on important topics such as racism, mental health, and current events
- Regular resources and support meetings for all hiring managers during their hiring process, including review of Diversity Hiring practices
- 90-day onboarding process inclusive of orientation, introductory meetings with all Senior Leaders, 30-60-90-day plan, and regular check-ins with HR and new employee's direct manager
- Diverse panel interviews
- Introduction of an Engagement Advisory Council made up of employees to promote socialization tied to CEO's and the City's missions
- CEO Hiring and Onboarding Guide
- In 2022, CEO will implement Leadership Academy for staff professional development

Additionally, CEO regularly receives guidance, training, and support from both the Community Action Association of Pennsylvania and the National Community Action Partnership on issues related to racial equity and economic mobility, and makes these resources available to staff, board members, and partner providers in the form of professional development.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

CEO seeks to engage in an inclusive and transparent budget process as well as program and policy design and delivery. This is undertaken through our diverse staffing, the Oversight Board membership and processes, and in the program providers who fund for our critical programs.

CEO Staff

- Many CEO staff contribute to the building of our budget, programs, and policies, and these reflect a diverse staff including
 - 30 CEO: 17 female, 13 male; 1 Asian, 19 Black or AA, 3 Hispanic/Latino, 7 White
 - 3 PMHCC: 1 female, 2 male; 1 Black/AA, 2 White
 - 8 VISTA: 3 female, 4 male, 1 undisclosed; 1 Black/AA, 7 White

CEO Oversight Board

- As a Community Action Agency, CEO's Oversight Board is structured in compliance with the Community Services Block Grant Act to assure decision-making and participation by low-income individuals in the development, planning, implementation, and evaluation of programs.

The board receives financial reports at each regular meeting and has input into the CSBG budget process.

Partner/Providers

- CEO follows the provisions of the City's Antidiscrimination Policy when issuing Requests for Proposals and encourages responses from M/W/DSBE applicants. All Applicants are required to exercise "Best and Good Faith Efforts" in response to the M/W/DSBE participation ranges specified by the OEO.

Nonprofit Applicants are required to document their diversity policies using the City's Diversity Report of Nonprofit Organizations.

Community Engagement

CEO prioritizes community engagement at the local, national, and organization level to ensure broad understanding of community need, best practices in serving those needs, and collaborative efforts toward shared racial equity goals.

- In 2022, CEO will resume community roundtables that were discontinued due to covid. This provides us a valuable opportunity to engage directly with the communities the office serves around topics and initiatives that directly impact them.
- CEO Executive Director meets monthly with up to 70 nonprofit leaders serving BIPOC communities in the region to discuss needs, trends, impact and coordination efforts.

- CEO Executive Director sits on the board of the Community Action Agency of PA and the Racial Equity Taskforce. Additionally, he serves as an Atlantic Philanthropies Senior Fellow for Racial Equity.
- CEO activates expertise to achieve change at scale through partnerships like Policy Link and Urban Institute.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Our mission is embedded into promoting racial equity and eradicating the intergenerational cycle of disparities. Understanding our unique role as a Community Action Agency, and a public agency, is critical to understanding the opportunities CEO must bridge the gap between city government and the individuals, families, and communities the office serves. Particularly in a city such as Philadelphia that continues to try to make gains in decreasing the number of people living in poverty, CEO strives to walk alongside the city seeking economic mobility for those most impacted.

Office of Homeless Services

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Homeless services advance racial equity. They are essential for achieving the vision of being a city “where all residents and are safe, healthy, and have all basic needs met.”

Homelessness is overwhelmingly experienced by people who are Black or African American: 43% of the City’s people are Black while 78% of those who experience homelessness are.

Homelessness cannot be separated from deep and abiding racial inequity the roots of which lie in America’s history of racist laws and policies: enslavement, displacement, government sanctioned stealing of Black-owned property, Jim Crow, redlining, housing discrimination and urban renewal that destroyed Black neighborhoods and stole Black wealth combined with an 80% reduction in federal investments in publicly supported housing.

Homeless services interrupt and reverse historic inequities. They are definitionally – and deliberately – antiracist. People who are housed have the basic necessary foundation for health, education, wealth, employment, family, and community.

Providing safe, stable housing is the core function of OHS. OHS services improve outcomes.

- 86% of those who get long-term housing are people of color
- 42% reduction in family homelessness over the past 3 years
- 19% reduction in chronic homelessness over the past 3 years

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a) For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b) For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

OHS funds and provides three core services: Homelessness Prevention and Diversion, Emergency/Temporary Housing, and Long-Term Housing (formerly known as permanent housing). All have a direct positive impact on racial equity.

1. Homelessness Prevention and Diversion helps households at imminent risk of homelessness stabilize and prevent shelter admission. Services are counseling, mediation, and financial assistance (rental assistance). In FY21, 1873 families got homelessness prevention services. Homelessness Prevention works. In a two-year lookback no one entered shelter after getting these services. The department can meet the need of about 25% of those who request it.
2. Emergency, Temporary Housing includes both shelter and transitional housing. Shelter keeps people alive. It provides immediate, short-term beds, meals and caring services for people experiencing literal homelessness.

The City has 38 shelters, 3784 beds that operate 24 hours a day, 365 days a year. With COVID, the number of beds has been reduced to 2337 beds for social distancing; 6 additional sites are open for winter providing 201 more beds. In FY21, 10,246 people were sheltered. 36% exited to permanent housing; 37% increased their incomes through their stay. If there were more affordable housing, more would exit to permanent housing.

OHS has 1016 transitional housing beds which serve mostly young parents and people in recovery. Best practice today is to replace transitional with long-term housing except for sites where conversion is prohibitively costly and there is proven benefit, such as for young parents and people in recovery.

3. Long-Term Housing refers to safe, affordable, and accessible housing to resolve homelessness. Housed people are not homeless. OHS has two main long-term programs: Rapid Rehousing and Supportive Housing.

Rapid Rehousing is a 1–2-year subsidy with housing case management. It has an 85% success rate in preventing a return to homelessness. In FY21, 486 households moved in bringing the total to 1918 served.

Supportive Housing is a long-term subsidy combined with wraparound services for people who are chronically homeless and have disabilities (mostly behavioral health). It has a 90% success rate. FY21, 1014 households moved into supportive housing. OHS now has 5131 supportive housing beds, an increase of more than 400 since 2018 thanks to city funds.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all.

OHS made an early commitment to diversity in hiring and promotions beginning in 2016 with an action plan that the department has been implementing since then. 72% of the leadership team and 85% of the exempt workforce are people of color. Actions and practices include the following:

- Provided unconscious bias training to all staff and managers.
- Removed higher educational requirements for positions to level the playing field for people of color who are less likely to be able to afford college.
- Prioritize promotions and hiring from within to provide opportunities for professional growth among the largely minority workforce.
- Use screening and interview committees that are diverse and representative, not just by race and ethnicity, but of all levels of staffing – people help hire their peers and bosses.
- Established salary ranges rather than linking salary to past earning levels which are more prone to reflecting and perpetuating racial bias.

OHS continues to struggle to find and hire people who are Hispanic/Latino/a/x. The office recently secured a grant to establish a workgroup from the Hispanic community to assist with this goal.

OHS strives for and values an inclusive workplace culture. Recognizing that people of color may be reluctant to speak up to white senior leadership, OHS pays constant and close attention to creating avenues for safe self-expression. The office strives for representation in leadership, not tokenism but real partnership in decision-making, and modeling of “speaking truth to power” as an acceptable part of workplace culture. Managers have an open-door policy to encourage relationship building and open communication. OHS locates input and authority for program design and policy as close to those who implement it as possible.

In 2020 in the wake of the George Floyd murder, OHS established an internal, staff-led racial equity committee with four working groups based on staff input: 1) Color of Law book club explores the historical roots of modern-day housing disparities and the call for a new civil rights movement. (They provided the summary of historic racist policies of budget documents. 2) Alternative dispute and conflict resolution training and team for matters that fall outside of the usual grievance processes; 3) Right to self-care workshops, especially for BIPOC led by Reverend Naomi; and 4) Policy change focusing on the employee handbook. Each group has a budget to use at their discretion to support their work.

In fall 2021, OHS joined Cohort #2 of the Citywide racial equity work and looks forward to implementing their proposed actions. OHS enthusiastically welcomed the training, support, and assistance of the City's DEI team as the office continues to work toward a diverse workforce and an inclusive workplace culture.

Finally, OHS has been working with technical assistance provided by HUD to assess and interrupt racial disparities throughout the homeless service system. They provided Racial Equity training for the leadership and community. The continuum of care board, the Roadmap to Homes, voted to use an anti-racist screen for the new Emergency Housing Vouchers to ensure that people who have historically been marginalized benefit. The office has also established a Racial Equity Committee and are now moving to integrating Racial Equity Vision Holders in all committees, leadership, and board to institutionalize antiracist values, policies, and practices.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

OHS has been deliberately and explicitly including external stakeholders in budgeting, policy, and programs by design for several years. OHS established the strategic plan, the Roadmap to Homes, with the input of over 400 stakeholders over the course of a year and have been working systematically to implement in since. It is governed by a community-elected board that meets bimonthly with committees that also meet bimonthly and have broad community representation.

In the past year OHS has further solicited extensive community input on spending priorities, policy, and programs through a landlord survey that over 400 rental property owners and managers responded to, and a stakeholder survey that 683 stakeholders responded to, nearly 1/4th of whom were people with lived experience. Since this was an internet survey, the department augmented it with input sessions with people with lived experience and service providers through the citywide network. OHS also hosts regular community meetings and biweekly provider meetings to keep the community informed and given them opportunities for input. Again, OHS staff is accessible and has an open-door policy to allow for informal input and feedback.

The result of this input is overwhelmingly that the community wants us to prioritize permanent affordable housing, when possible, using vacant, blighted, and abandoned stock to house people who are literally homeless. They also expressed deep concern for victims/survivors of domestic violence and youth and were interested in helping those who are facing imminent

homelessness such as couch surfing. You see these priorities represented in the spending patterns for the office and programs as described throughout. Housed people are not homeless. Housing interrupts and reverses the predictive power of race and improves life outcomes.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

OHS is facing a \$14.5M funding gap in FY23 which would directly hurts people of color, especially those who are Black or African American.

The FY21 OHS budget was reduced by over \$16M knowing that funding from the federal CARES Act of 2020 would enable us to sustain services and staffing. The CARES Act funding also allowed us to expand Rapid Rehousing, add 5 non-congregate shelters for those who are elderly and/or have chronic underlying health conditions that make them more vulnerable to COVID, sustain Supportive Housing, add one social services Encampment Resolution Team as an alternative response to police, security to Kensington Avenue, and commit to two Tiny House pilots.

In FY22, thanks to critical support from the Budget Office, nearly \$13M in City funding was restored. However, this still leaves a gap from the original pre-pandemic funding. And costs have increased: largely African American female shelter workforce still largely makes less than \$15/hour, food, leases, and security costs have all gone up. Level funding essentially translates to budget cuts.

OHS has been asked to expand Supportive Housing and add an Encampment Resolution Team to help constructively respond to the continuing Opioid crisis while sustaining the service levels are providing. The CARES Act funding phases out in September 2022. The funding gap is essentially an accumulated shortfall, the result of rising labor, food and security costs, and the desire on the part of the administration to continue to invest in proven health and housing services to people of color who directly benefit.

- 1. Homeless services, particularly Rapid Rehousing and Supportive Housing, reverse the predictive power of race. Housing is the foundation for recovery, health, family stability, employment, and education.**
 - People who are Black or African American comprise 43% of the City’s population, but 78% of those who experience homelessness.
 - Philly’s Homeless Assistance System does a good job centering racial. For example, exits to long-term housing are higher for people who have been historically marginalized, especially Black, African American, and mixed race, than for the system.
 - 85% of the exempt workforce are people of color as is 72% of the leadership team. The office promotes from within and create opportunities for people of color to assume leadership roles.
- 2. Investments in the homeless service system, especially in long-term housing (we no longer call it permanent) WORK. Housed people are not homeless.**

- The number of people who are unsheltered went from 1083 in 2018 to 700 in 2021 with the increased investment in long-term housing.
 - The total number of people experiencing homelessness, sheltered and unsheltered, went down by 24% between 2017-2021.
 - OHS has closed two family shelters to date and largely reinvested in higher impact, more cost-effective rapid rehousing.
 - The number of people who are chronically street homelessness went down 19% through the pandemic as a result of smart investments in non-congregate sheltering and prioritizing housing through use of CARES and FEMA funds.
- 3. Budget cuts jeopardize the work of an office that primarily serves Black and Brown citizens and the progress that we have made over the past 5 years in addressing historical disparities. Budget cuts to OHS mean:**
- More young persons of color will experience trauma, generational poverty, and homelessness.
 - How can one say: “Black Live Matter” and not adequately fund the work of an office that primarily serves Black and Brown citizens and addresses historical racial disparities?
 - Cutting homeless services calls into question the city’s commitment to undoing structural racism and improving the lives of citizens of color.
 - One can’t talk about the unhoused and homelessness without analyzing the impact of racism in the country.
 - One can’t effectively manage budgets without acknowledging that they are moral documents that reflect priorities - what’s important and who’s important.

Office of Human Resources

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Office's mission is to attract, select, and retain a qualified, diverse, and effective workforce to support the goals of the City. All the functions and activities in HR from the perspective of this mission has, as a core principle, of advancing equity and diversity across the workforce. In collaboration with the CAO, the office progresses policies and initiatives to promote an inclusive workforce.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

Mobile Recruitment initiative – partnering with libraires, mobile tech lab,

- Strengths – understand the employment needs of the city, have specific data on diversity, know where applicants are
- Weakness – limited capacity
- Opportunities – increase profile of the city as an employer, generate excitement in neighborhoods that can carry through word of mouth, reinforce community partnerships
- Threats - education level of residents, misconceptions of city employment
- Expand Recruitment – The city of Philadelphia has no staff dedicated to recruitment for civil service positions. This does not allow the office to develop and implement strategies to drive expansion of a candidate base or drive diversity in recruitment initiative. The Mobile initiative is a specific the SWOT analysis for this initiative specific strategy but will supplant the need for a fully serviceable recruitment function. The budget submission for FY 23 includes a request to establish minimum resources to begin to guild that function. THE SWOT analysis for this request is similar to that of the Mobile initiative.
- Professional Development – There is no comprehensive leadership development program for the city which hampers the office's ability to build the skills necessary in department managers and supervisors to manage our diverse workforce. Working with the office of Diversity and inclusion OHR has identified one position to assist with establishing a program that will address

the skills needed to be built from a DE&I perspective and assist with developing a more extensive leadership program built on the values of inclusion. This work will be limited by the fact this adds limited resources.

- Strengths – upskilling, support diverse workforce for promotion
- Weakness - resources
- Opportunities – Change trend to see more diverse leadership
- Threats – Limited opportunities
- Employee Health & Welfare benefits – The office will continue the DE&I strategy that focuses on 3 main pillars, maintain dialogue with major vendors by holding bi-annual meetings with each provider, identifying new care programs that have impact on minority populations such as diabetes management program, and to manage costs and reduce disparity related to out-of-pocket expenses.
- Strengths – Strong network in the benefits community including providers and peers to benchmark against.
- Weakness – lack of people and system resources
- Opportunities – A strong focus on developing strategies to impact minority communities.
- Threats – Pandemic impact on health community and uncertain economic recovery
- Mobile recruiting and Recruitment Office – will reach candidates where they live, pilot that will include disenfranchised neighborhoods and develop strategies and initiatives to expand the ability to recruit qualified and diverse candidates.
- Professional development – effective succession planning and knowledge transfer, improved culture of inclusiveness and respect.
- Expanded programing focused on the health of minority employees

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

A prime focus of OHR is to build an inclusive workforce through recruitment, selection, and retention. Significant areas of the operating budget such as hiring services and employee benefits have this as a primary goal of their mission.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

OHR has reached out and continue to reach out to community organizations and other key stakeholders such as CCP and local universities to expand partnerships. The office will, where possible work with stakeholders to support and leverage any training/upskilling to assist BIPOC to be more successful in City assessments for job opportunities

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

OHR continues to under source administrative support services, such as HR, while expanding operational functions and initiatives, this leads to additional pressures on the resources directed to the support people centered practices.

Office of Innovation and Technology

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Office of Innovation and Technology leads the City's efforts to close the digital divide. Since 2016 a core operation at OIT has been to advance digital equity starting with the administration of a \$700,000 grant program for the Philadelphia Digital Literacy Alliance. OIT and the DLA have funded 40 different innovative digital literacy programs created by community-based organizations around the city, with particular emphasis on communities of color. In 2020, OIT teamed up with the Mayor's Office of Education to launch PHLConnectED and to date the program has achieved over 18,000 free internet connections for pre-K-12 households. Outreach for household participation is focused on six priority ZIP Codes of disadvantaged communities of color.

OIT will continue to advance digital equity through the launch of a citywide digital equity plan in 2022. The plan will call for OIT to coordinate on the use of City building assets to incentivize and attract entrants into the local broadband market as a way to encourage more low-cost broadband service offerings and to potentially launch community-run, low cost or free, neighborhood WIFI programs.

OIT can advance racial equity by working with the Law and Risk Departments to lower the barriers to entry when contracting with the City by MWDBEs. Currently, the City attempts to transfer all risk to contractors. This risk transfer puts significant legal and insurance cost burdens on small technology companies that disincentivize participation in RFPs/RFIs that lead to contracts. The most impactful work on racial equity by OIT will be to make contracting with the City more readily attainable by small businesses, especially Black and brown technology entrepreneurs and all MWSBEs.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

With its current budget OIT will continue to fund two staff positions that run PHLConnectED and (to be newly named) Office of Digital Equity. In 2021, survey work by the City's Office for the Aging and in a broadband internet study of household use commissioned by OIT provided statistics that the predominate users of PHLConnectED are low-income and non-white households. OIT's Office of Digital Equity, to be established by Mayor's Executive Order in January 2022, will seek to coordinate with OTIS, OCF and PPR for the application for federal infrastructure dollars to fully equip approximately 100 staff recreation centers with high-capacity broadband and WIFI services. The City's recreation centers are predominantly located in and serve low income and Black and brown communities. In addition, the Office will focus on implementing the objectives of the City's Digital Equity Plan (to be released in January 2022) including establishing a program to fund community owned and operated WIFI services in low-income, Black and brown communities by leveraging the use of City building assets to attract entrants into the Philadelphia broadband market.

The strength of OIT's digital equity programming is derived from the years of experience attained by OIT staff in this field and the trust the team has cultivated among a network Philadelphia's community-based organizations, who predominately serve minority communities. A challenge is the complexity of coordination required to enlist departments to participate in a process of leasing City's building or other capital assets for use by potential entrants into the local marketplace for low-cost broadband delivery and in establishing community operated WIFI programs to serve neighborhoods where there are high rates of "subscription vulnerability" (I.e., the inability to temporarily pay monthly low-cost internet bills) as documented by household broadband internet study.

There is no threat to advancing equity, as the pandemic has only strengthened the resolve of philanthropy, community organizations, politicians and City government to close the digital divide – which mostly impacts communities of color.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

OIT's directors of software development and user-experience (UX) took it upon themselves to evaluate the racial diversity of their programs in 2020. While diverse, they saw an opportunity to strengthen that participation, as hiring for IT talent is precarious and is negatively impacted by higher prevailing wage rates in the private sector. The directors conceived an apprenticeship for software engineers and UX designers that would recruit from existing city staff, with an emphasis on racial diversity and equity for women participants. The directors have committed their own time to plan, recruit and select applicants and will provide the mentoring for 4 new positions for the next two years. OIT will budget for the out-sourced training cost and salary for apprentices starting in FY24. FY23 funding is covered by the Operations Transformation Fund, to whom the work of apprentices will be dedicated.

OIT leadership will plan for mentorship program for team managers with focus on a diversity cohort starting in FY23. This genesis for this program is the annual “Coffee with the CIO” sessions where department priorities are discussed, but also skills critical to performance are workshopped, such as how to engage with the different communication and learning styles of coworkers to improve team performance and manage conflict. Currently in the planning stages, the cohort of unit managers would meet for multi hour sessions on a quarterly basis to allow for workshopping of skills and to tackle complex issues in the workplace that arise from race such as disenfranchisement or situations that inhibit Black, brown and women managers from acting on their best knowledge or professional instincts.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

By nature of its role within government to support the operations of many public facing departments, OIT already has an established method for soliciting feedback about its budget from the departments. With regards to its public facing operations of Digital Equity and SmartCityPHL, those programs are already designed with public participation and equity in mind. The Digital Literacy Alliance is a diverse group of community and industry stakeholders that determine the use of grant awards and weigh-in on the design of programs created by OIT, such as the Digital Navigators. SmartCityPHL has an external board appointed by the mayor, made of a highly diverse group of individuals representing community groups, academia and industry. Additionally, OIT formed an artificial intelligence advisory community made up of a diverse slate of advocacy groups, academia and technologists from around the country to guide OIT in how to vet, interrogate and utilize A/I in both public and internally facing operations, ethically.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

No.

Office of Property Assessment (OPA)

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Office of Property Assessment (OPA) is responsible for determining the value of all real property in Philadelphia and is dedicated to doing so in a fair, equitable, and understandable way. OPA’s primary goal, through ongoing assessments, is to improve the accuracy and uniformity of all property values. This ensures that property owners have an equitable level of assessment regardless of the type of property they own or the location of the property.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

OPA’s primary goal, through ongoing annual re-assessments, is to improve the accuracy and uniformity of all property values throughout the City. State Law prohibits OPA from considering demographic information such as race, gender, and income when determining property values or evaluating which properties need to be re-assessed.

Strengths: OPA has a very diverse workforce that reflects the diversity of the citizens of Philadelphia.

Challenges: OPA participates in community outreach events to explain the property assessment process to taxpayers, but certain communities may be hard to reach if they do not know to ask the OPA to attend their event.

Opportunities: OPA can be more proactive in reaching out to neighborhood and community organizations where the office has not attended any events and offer to speak to their group about the assessment process.

Threats: Communities of color are underrepresented in some jobs in the private real estate sector that provide experience needed to qualify for the office’s Evaluator positions. This is not a problem now but may eventually present a problem in the future if OPA does not have a diverse pool of candidates for its positions.

OPA uses Price-Related Differential (PRD) to measure value related inequities in the assessments, referred to as regressivity or progressivity. Appraised values are regressive if high value properties are under appraised relative to low value properties and progressive if high value properties are over appraised relative to the low value properties. While no differential (a PRD of 1) is considered perfect, PRDs tend to have an upward bias due in part to assessment time lags. A PRD between .98 and 1.03 is considered to be within industry standards. OPA's last calculated PRD was 1.01.

- 3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

OPA has conducted mandatory diversity and inclusion trainings for staff and ensures that hiring panels for positions at every level are comprised of a diverse mix in terms of gender and race/ethnicity. OPA has been successful at maintaining a diverse workforce at every level, including senior management.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

OPA did not involve external stakeholders in the budget process. Internal stakeholders at every level of the department can offer input on budget needs and priorities. Specifically, the senior leadership team that helped design the programs and policies is a diverse group in terms of gender and race/ethnicity.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

N/A

Office of Sustainability

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Climate change is an issue of racial and social equity. While low-wealth communities of color contribute the least amount to the causes of climate change, they are more likely to be exposed to climate risks- such as increased heat and severe storms or food shortages or disruptions. Climate change is also a multiplier of existing risks, such as neighborhood instability, food insecurity, poverty, and violence. Taking serious action on climate change will result in a safer and more just Philadelphia, a healthier city, and create thriving neighborhoods

OOS's efforts to reduce carbon emissions are a key part of achieving environmental and racial justice for the city and ensuring those benefits are distributed equitably. These actions also provide a variety of co-benefits from reducing air pollution, to lowering energy costs, to cleaner neighborhoods and therefore help to reduce racial disparities.

Advancing citywide climate adaptation and resiliency planning is critical to rectifying historic and current environmental injustices that contribute to the disproportionate climate vulnerability experienced by communities of color. By using a place-based approach, the office aims to demonstrate the ability to address climate inequities experienced by specific communities as part of a broader framework for rectifying historic and current social, economic, and environmental injustice.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

- Food Policy Advisory Council (FPAC)
 - Strengths- FPAC has a strong foundation with over a decade of operations and has led or contributed to a variety of successful policies and programs. FPAC is deeply committed to racial and social justice and continues to invest in the leadership of poor and working class residents of color, specifically those working in restaurants, struggling with food insecurity, growing food, and running neighborhood-based food businesses. As of 2021, the members of FPAC identified as 73% BIPOC and 33% Poor & Working Class. FPAC recently completed an equity-focused strategic planning process to ensure its operations support and center the people who are most impacted by food injustice to advise the Mayor and local government to create a more just food system.
 - Challenges/weaknesses- Although FPAC provides the City with equitable food policy recommendations that address racism and transfer power and resources to historically disinvested communities (see [Summary of FY23 Recommendations](#)), adequate staffing and infrastructure do not exist within the City for implementation. With only one full-time staff person compared to the average of 3-4 food policy staff in comparable cities like Baltimore and Washington D.C., FPAC struggles to balance much needed resident engagement, interagency collaboration, and coordination with state and national food policy work.
 - Opportunities- FPAC's convening of the City Food Staff Working Group and the Strategic Initiative has demonstrated that there is tremendous potential in creating more intentional collaboration among City agencies around food policy. One area of opportunity is the adoption and implementation of a Good Food Purchasing Policy to be applicable in City food purchases following a 4-year scale-up process that takes into consideration (1) local economies, especially small-scale producers of color, (2) environmental sustainability, (3) nutrition, (4) a valued workforce, (5) animal welfare, and (6) cultural relevance.
 - Threats- For most of its history, FPAC has relied solely or primarily on grant funding to support staff and operations and is still underfunded compared to other city food policy councils. FPAC cannot sustain its current workload with a sole staff person.
 - Performance measures- FPAC's performance measure captures the number of residents engaged in FPAC events or programs; it has increased by 277%, from 1548 to 4299 residents, since FY2019. Its full impact is harder to measure in terms of access to nourishing food, usage of food benefits programs, access to land for farming or gardening, improved working conditions for food workers, and more.
- Beat the Heat Hunting Park
 - Strengths- The project invested in building relationships with community organizations that already had trust in the community. OOS continues to maintain those relationships and has helped advance some of the recommendations of the plan

- Challenges/weaknesses- Building the capacity of the community organizations to carry heat work forward, and scaling the lessons learned in Hunting Park into other heat vulnerable communities
- Opportunities- The federal infrastructure bill could help fund weatherization, cool pavement and other solutions identified by the community
- Threats- If recommendations are not implemented, residents may lose trust in the City
- Performance measure- This work contributes to OOS's overall engagement performance measure, although the full impact is harder to measure in terms of improved resiliency against heat events, access to utility programs, increased tree cover and more.
- Eastwick Strategic Planning & Alignment
 - Strengths- This work demonstrates the City's commitment to rectifying historical and current injustice as a critical step to creating more resilient communities in the future
 - Challenges/weaknesses- Limited alignment between current City-sponsored Eastwick projects has hindered efforts to deliver a holistic solution while at the same time amplifying residents' doubts about the earnestness and efficacy of the City's approach.
 - Opportunities- An Eastwick-focused interagency initiative, initiated in Summer 2021, has begun to demonstrate that having a point agency to cultivate pathways for sharing information across departments, empower decision-makers and streamline stakeholder engagement boosts capacity to achieve desired outcomes. In addition, setting clear goals to guide collective action will strengthen internal capacity to apply for, receive, and utilize federal funding that the Biden Administration has allocated to communities experiencing environmental injustice (i.e., Justice40 commitment)
 - Threats- An historic level of new development and infrastructure investments planned for the surrounding area of the city that have the potential to either exacerbate Eastwick's issues. Furthermore, the present unabated pace by which the climate is changing increases the likelihood that Eastwick will experience a highly disruptive extreme weather event like Tropical Storm Isaias in August 2020.
 - Performance measure- This work contributes to OOS's overall engagement performance measure, although the full impact is harder to measure in terms of improved resiliency against storms and flooding events
- Community Resilience Grants Program
 - Strengths- Strengthens the capacity of residents to participate as co-creators in the development and implementation of interventions to meet local needs
 - Challenges/weaknesses- Only a handful of communities will receive funding each year, which mean many communities will continue to experience the structural barriers that constrain their capacity to self-define solutions most relevant to the unique climate challenges they face.

- Opportunities- Enabling communities to participate as co-creator in the development of and implementation local interventions will ensure their alignment with the vision and strategic priorities of communities historically excluded from decision-making processes. Threats- Successful projects may not be able to scale up without a commitment to larger pots of funding
- Performance measures- The office has established a new performance measure to capture the number of projects funded through this program.
- Environmental Justice Advisory Commission-
 - Strengths- In order for the City to move towards meeting its racial equity goals, the voices of marginalized and frontline communities must be centered in City decision-making processes, which is exactly what the Environmental Justice Commission is intended to do and why the office has been dedicated to laying the groundwork for the Commission's success.
 - Challenges/weaknesses- Building trust with communities that have historically and currently experience environmental injustices
 - Opportunities- The Commission can help building stronger connections between marginalized communities and City agencies to ensure activities reflect the perspectives of communities experiencing environmental injustice.
 - Threats- The Commission will need to receive ongoing support in order to achieve its maximum potential
 - Performance measure- OOS does not currently have a performance measure related to the Commission, but will consider whether to add one next year with the input of Commission members
- Energy Burden
 - Strengths- Addressing energy burden sits at the intersection of climate, housing and equity work
 - Challenges/weaknesses- It is known from past attempts that home weatherization alone is insufficient and that holistic home interventions are more effective, but more expensive
 - Opportunities- Greenlink has provided Philadelphia with free access to the Greenlink Equity Map and data layers to help target outreach to those most burdened
 - Threats- Some residential energy policies can contribute to worse outcomes for lower income residents, renters or other populations, there must be deeply interrogated policies to assess for impact
 - Performance measure- OOS does not currently have a performance measure related to energy burden, but will consider whether to add one next year
- Building Energy Performance Policy
 - Strengths- This program will reduce carbon emissions equivalent to taking 40,000 cars off the road and create 500-600 jobs
 - Challenges/weaknesses- Enforcement for the program will be critical to ensure compliance

- Opportunities- There is a great opportunity to ensure that job and economic opportunities created through this program go to local, minority-owned firms and help to create pathways in the building trades for those who have historically been excluded. The School District has over 100 buildings that will need to comply, creating an opportunity to train students in building energy systems while school buildings come into compliance.
- Threats- Businesses from New York and other regions are already prepared to take on this work and will be competing against local firms
- Performance measures- OOS has added a new performance measure to track compliance with the program

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

- OOS engaged local racial equity consulting organization AORTA in undertaking an equity audit of OOS policies and operations and the creation of an equity action plan. As part of this action plan, OOS has improved office hiring, onboarding and retention policies, finalized the office's Theory of Change, updated office priorities and the organizational chart and aligned workplans and salaries accordingly, and recently joined the Office of Diversity, Equity and Inclusions' second racial equity departmental cohort.
- In the coming year, OOS will update the office professional development policy to ensure equitable access to professional growth, create a mentorship program to support staff growth, and launch a paid equity-focused summer fellowship program
- OOS reviewed the FY23 budget cuts and justifications against the office Theory of Change with a goal to better align spending with corevalues

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

- OOS launched the Beat the Heat Hunting Park pilot in partnership with Esperanza, Hunting Park Neighborhood Advisory Council and other neighborhood partners to produce a community-led heat resiliency plan for Hunting Park.
- OOS held three focus groups with residents of six of the most energy burdened communities in order to hear directly from those most impacted on what policies and programs they would most like to see to address energy burden. Residents were compensated for their time and have been kept in the loop with program development, so they know how their feedback has been utilized.

- The Environmental Justice Advisory Commission will operate with autonomy from OOS, but it is the office's hope that the Commission will be willing to provide OOS with feedback and recommendations on office priorities and budget submissions
- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

N/A

Office of the Chief Administrative Officer

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The work of the Office of the CAO very closely intersects with section D of the Mayor's vision for racial equity: diverse, efficient, and effective government. Kicking off the \$10 million Operations Transformation Fund, CAO has focused on diverse stakeholder engagement and supporting projects that advance racial equity. The PHL Service Design Studio will continue to co-design and create better programs and services in partnership with departments throughout the City and implement the Equitable Community Engagement Toolkit, using participatory design principles to create accessible, equitable, and trauma-informed services. CAO will continue to focus on legislative and regulatory reforms that make it easier for local and minority-owned firms to do business with the City, by strengthening the Local Business Purchasing Initiative; implementing Transparency in Business; and expanding Vendor Pay. Through HR&T, the CAO will provide enterprise recruitment support and guidance to help attract diverse and qualified talent; provide professional development through the LEAD Academy, the City's new, internally developed, virtual leadership seminar and discussion series that seeks to engage, educate, and develop emerging leaders while instilling the City's vision and values of racial equity and inclusion. Also through HR&T, the office seeks to hire a Director of DEI Professional Development who will collaborate with employees, HR partners, ODEI and other stakeholders to coordinate and deliver diversity, equity, and inclusion training focused on learning and development programs that support employee performance and service delivery. This position will serve a critical role in designing and administering programs that educate City leaders on diversity, equity and inclusion. Lastly, the Office of Administrative Review administers hearings where fines, bills, and violations issued by the City may be disputed by petitioners. OAR is a diverse group that provides accessible, fair, and equitable hearings conducted in an efficient and effective manner. OAR recognizes the relationship between the digital divide and race and has focused on offering hybrid onsite, remote hearings, where the petitioner can appear and participate in their virtual hearing on an onsite computer. OAR is continuing to work with OIT to create remote hearing access through the OAR website. OAR has also redesigned and standardized communications and forms to make administrative processes more user-friendly, accessible, and easy to understand by using plain language. Lastly, the CAO will use its role within government to continue to advocate and implement practices and policies that improve employee morale and help to recruit and retain a diverse workforce, including such things as expanded parental leave, improved testing and selection processes, in particular for civil service job opportunities, and alternative work schedules.

2. **What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. **For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. **For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

Equitable Community Engagement Toolkit

- **Description:** The Equitable Community Engagement Toolkit is a City-wide initiative that will transform how the City of Philadelphia thinks about, plans for, and facilitates engagement with the communities the office aims to serve. To build the Toolkit, CAO has partnered with the Mayor’s Office of Civic Engagement and Volunteer Service and are collaborating with City engagement practitioners, community groups, and community members who’ve been historically marginalized by government actions.
- **Need:** Communities of color, people with disabilities, people who have limited English proficiency, people who lack digital access, people who have low digital literacy, and historically marginalized groups are refused entry into engagements with the City because the office haven’t created the conditions for them to engage with us. As a result, many of our policies, services, and programs reinforce marginalization as the people most impacted by our decision-making don’t have the opportunity to give voice to their needs. Also, City engagement staff — who have responsibilities on top of their department’s community engagement work — desire to collaborate with communities in equitable ways, but struggle with limited budgets, competing departmental priorities, and opaque City processes. While the Mayor’s Office of Civic Engagement and Volunteer Service convenes City-wide engagement practitioners monthly, there are gaps in training and coordination that could make engagements with communities more consistent and intentional.
- **Evidence-building:** For the past 18 months, the PHL Service Design Studio has been collaboratively designing aspects of the Toolkit with 65 City engagement practitioners across 35 departments; 26 trusted messengers from community groups who work with multi-racial, immigrant, disability, and digitally disenfranchised community members; and 51 multi-racial residents who represent redlined zip codes and have lived experiences with digital, language, and disability access engagement issues as well as mistrust government because

of our racist practices.

Some of what was heard from City engagement staff:

“As government, we shouldn’t be making decisions without the people who are most affected by those decisions. Not just at the table, but fully embedded in decision-making. Our goal is to support and help people realize the agency they have, so they are making those decisions collaboratively.” — City engagement staff

“Honesty needs to begin in the pre-engagement stage. How much power are we retaining? What decisions have been made? What’s still up for discussion? We’re often signaling that there’s more need for engagement than there is. [This] can lead to a negative result of the community getting invited to participate, but then nothing happens.” — City engagement staff

Some of what we heard from community groups:

“Interactions between communities and government...are impersonal and can feel inhuman.” — Community group

“I think departments [need to] do the groundwork before beginning engagement. I appreciate what you're doing here [in this Toolkit workshop]. [Departments] need to make sure that what they have to offer is actually of interest to the community they're hoping to engage.” — Community group

Some of what was heard from community members:

“I would say staff within the City need to be trained on how to work with persons with disabilities. You know, I don't have a contagious disease. I am a person who works full time and pays bills. And even if I did, I'm still human. And I still deserve to be provided services, with a smile, like everybody else.”

— Community member from the disability community

“A couple years ago there was a plan to develop a parking lot on [street names] ... and they held a couple community meetings and invited Chinese community members from Chinatown. I attended and found not a lot of Chinese community members were there because it was held in English.”

— Community member discussing language access needs

- **Opportunity:** The Equitable Community Engagement Toolkit project intends to create the conditions so equitable forms of engagement can occur between the City and the communities CAO serves. The Toolkit will provide specific guidance, resources, and training that addresses digital, language, and disability access issues with engagement. Also, it will offer strategies on how to repair trust through engagement efforts with communities marginalized by government actions, specifically Black, Brown, immigrant, and Indigenous communities.

Operations Transformation Fund

In the first round of grant awards which totaled \$4.7 million, the Operations Transformation Fund (OTF) specifically sought to fund projects that would advance racial equity or otherwise reduce racial, social, or economic disparities. Eight of the 11 projects that received funding have goals explicitly related to racial equity. For example, OTF funds will be used to make the City's workforce more representative of Philadelphians, improve contracting equity for infrastructure projects, build departments' capacity for equitable community engagement and planning, and make City information and services more accessible to people for whom English is not a first language. For the second round of OTF grants, the CAO will again seek proposals that will advance racial equity, and continue to make the application and funding process more equitable by increasing access and transparency.

3. **Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

CAO and OAR, with our existing budget and budgeted positions, follow the procedures developed in CAO-HR&T's "Exempt Hiring Guide for Building a Talented, Diverse Workforce" to help recruit diverse candidates and create a diverse, inclusive, and anti-racist workplace. CAO also allocates approximately \$80,000 for staff to support enterprise recruitment efforts and maintain relationships with local diverse colleges and academic institutions to support creation an inclusive, anti-racist workplace across the enterprise.

LEAD Academy is an emerging leaders program that supports the development of a diverse group of new City leaders and takes them through a 6-month seminar addressing diversity, equity, inclusion and public service leadership. The program provides a space for leaders to discuss and problem-solve challenges and goals of the administration through workshops. The program is designed so that each core topic (budget, leading through uncertainty, managing remote teams, conflict management) addresses the role of diversity, equity and inclusion.

The Hiring Manager’s Playbook (formerly Exempt Hiring Playbook) is being revised and redistributed to supplement the interview training and will provide tools and resources that standardize diverse interview panels and provide guidance on developing job description to help promote racial equity. This playbook will be distributed FY22 Q3 to the HR manager community and all hiring managers.

Interview Training for Hiring Managers is a program that will educate and engage both civil service and exempt managers on structured interview processes, diverse interview panels, and provide interview questions bank that will include racial equity questions for leadership positions. Providing this training and tools will help counter various biases associated biases that impact racial equity.

In addition, CAO has and will continue to work with the Office of Human Resources on critical changes to the “Rule of 2”: such hiring can be inclusive of a larger, more diverse pool of qualified candidates when departments are hiring for civil service positions.

Across the projects selected for this round of Operations Transformation Fund grants, approximately 17 new positions will be created. The office are working closely with departments to ensure hiring practices follow the City’s guidelines as a model employer for hiring diverse talent.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

CAO has and will continue to involve internal and external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in program and policy design and implementation. Examples of this work in the past include the development of LBPI, where various chambers of commerce and disadvantaged businesses provided feedback that shaped the policies and regulations, and stakeholder engagement and user testing in the development of Discover Benefits pilot (now the Unified Benefit Application), the Mail-In Ballot Voter Guide, and the Equitable Community Engagement Toolkit.

As OAR is customer-facing, customers provide direct feedback on processes. Additionally, OAR has partnered with CAO’s PHL Service Design Studio in developing service improvements; focused on providing accessibility to hearings and providing better information online regarding services provided. The Service Design Studio utilizes participatory design in designing services.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**



The office feels that this work is fundamental to supporting the racial equity work that is taking place in departments across the City. CAO supports this work by bringing our service design, project management, and human resource management expertise to help departments deliver more effective and efficient services

Office of the Director of Finance

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Finance strives to ensure that the City maintains long-term fiscal stability while meeting its policy goals. It does this by overseeing the City's financial, accounting, and budgetary functions, including establishing fiscal policy guidelines, overseeing the City's budget and financial management programs, adding financial capacity throughout the government, and recording and accounting for all City financial activities. Finance administers the City's payroll activities and risk management functions, issues financial reports, and oversees expenditures and reports on all grants.

These functions are critical to the City's vision for racial equity, given the extent to which the City's fiscal stability and allocation of scarce resources form the basis for the City's ability to make any investments. By embedding a racial equity lens in budgetary decision-making in particular, the City can better ensure that the City's vision for racial equity permeates all City departments and functions.

Finance's budget also includes a substantial financial contribution to the Community College of Philadelphia (CCP), supporting both general College operations and the Octavius Catto Scholarship. CCP is a minority-serving postsecondary institution working to ensure that it has the appropriate supports in place for its student body to succeed, both at CCP and in future pursuits. The Catto Scholarship provides last-dollar tuition, basic needs, and enhanced faculty supports to low-income CCP students, helping to ensure that these students who face barriers to college access can attend CCP for free and have enhanced supports while in attendance at CCP, helping to increase Scholars' persistence and graduation rates. Finance leadership spent a substantial amount of time working with CCP and the Mayor's Office on the design and funding of the Scholarship.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

Using its existing budget, Finance will administer the programs below.

- **Budget**: continue to ensure that racial equity is embedded in the City’s budget process and resulting budget
 - *Strengths*: designated resources for this purpose, including dedicated staff and consultant support
 - *Challenges/weaknesses*: the City’s budget has high fixed costs and other financial constraints that limit Finance’s ability to change City spending.
 - *Opportunities*: creation of budget metrics to mark progress across the city, and addition of GIS tools in budget analysis to better explore data about how the City’s investments are allocated geographically.
 - *Threats*: competing financial needs and a high level of legacy costs.
 - *Performance impacts*: will be felt in the resulting budget
- **Community College of Philadelphia (CCP)**: continue to support College operations and the Catto Scholarship, serving a diverse cohort of college students
 - *Strengths*: partnership with CCP subject matter experts and practitioners; investment from other City leaders around this once-in-a-generation investment; designated resources for the Catto Scholarship
 - *Challenges/weaknesses*: enrollment has lagged initial projections using pre-pandemic data; along with peer institutions, CCP is experiencing depressed enrollment
 - *Opportunities*: CCP continues to staff up to support the Catto Scholarship, refining the staffing, support, and enrollment model to meet student needs as more data becomes available; the return to in-person classes should also help the program.
 - *Threats*: continued enrollment challenges at CCP and other community colleges.
 - *Performance impacts*: CCP and the City are working together on a robust performance evaluation, aiming to increase enrollments, graduation rates, and persistence rates among Catto Scholars, while also ensuring that a racial equity lens is used in the evaluation and any ongoing program changes
- **Capacity-building among City fiscal staff**: continue to increase dialogue with fiscal staff across the City and roll out additional training content for fiscal staff for the first time via regular Citywide fiscal staff calls, creating a space for fiscal staff to meet, learn from, and support peers and colleagues in their own and other departments
 - *Strengths*: buy-in from subject matter experts in Finance
 - *Challenges/weaknesses*: staff turnover can make it challenging to reach the right people; SMEs who are “in the weeds” of their respective work streams may find it difficult to meet fiscal staff where they are
 - *Opportunities*: calls have naturally begun to shift away from reporting out on process changes to more interactive and proactive capacity-building to better support fiscal staff
 - *Threats*: SMEs are busy and have historically prioritized expedience and more pressing matters over more proactive communications and supports

- *Performance impacts*: attendees (and return attendees); fiscal staff having a common base of knowledge and competencies
- Paying out Risk claims: continue to pay out claims to members of the public who have been harmed by the City, serving a diverse cross-section of Philadelphians and ensuring that they are made whole. In addition, for Employee Disability, Risk has requested race and ethnicity data to examine work-related injury data to identify any structural and/or unintended bias.
 - *Strengths*: well-established existing program and expertise
 - *Challenges/weaknesses*: data quality and formats; paper-based processes; staffing turnover
 - *Opportunities*: addition of GIS tools in claims analysis to better explore data
 - *Threats*: continued staffing turnover
 - *Performance impacts*: dollar impacts of claims broken down geographically.
- OPAL: continue to implement the City’s project to replace its legacy financial and procurement systems with a modern Enterprise Resource Project (ERP) solution, improving existing processes and ensuring that critical functions, like paying small, minority vendors, can happen more expediently. A faster payment process would make it easier for a wider group of businesses to work on City contracts.
 - *Strengths*: OPAL is a well-resourced, cross-departmental effort with buy-in from City leadership
 - *Challenges/weaknesses*: institutional resistance to change
 - *Opportunities*: process redesign and modernization
 - *Threats*: continued institutional resistance to change
 - *Performance impacts*: paying vendors faster, meaning better outcomes for timely vendor payment (which helps small businesses and MWDSBES)

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

With its limited budget, Finance focuses on embedding anti-racist practices in hiring. Finance leadership has worked with Human Resources and Talent to implement recruitment best practices for exempt positions, ensures that hiring panels are diverse, and posts positions on diverse job boards (budget-permitting). For civil service positions, the department has less flexibility to implement anti-racist practices. Changes in the City’s Home Rule Charter become effective in April, enabling new flexibility in hiring from civil service eligible lists. Finance will work with OHR to use new opportunities, such as recent changes to the number of candidates that can be interviewed from a hiring list, to expand the pools of candidates for civil service jobs in order to increase diversity among civil service positions.

Finance has also taken steps to change the department’s culture around supporting fiscal staff in other departments. Historically, Finance has struggled with clear and consistent

communication to and dialogue with fiscal staff. As part of the shift to remote work during the pandemic, Finance leadership and Deputies have implemented a recurring fiscal and administrative staff call, bringing together 200+ employees from across the City to discuss policy and process changes, collect and integrate feedback, share best practices, and foster community across the City’s fiscal and administrative titles. By establishing and sustaining these communication channels, the various units of Finance have begun to embrace the opportunity to engage more directly with fiscal staff. Finance will continue to work to routinize this cultural shift. These meetings grew out of focus groups that Finance leadership had with financial staff from throughout the City. Financial staff made it clear that regular communication with central Finance was very important to them.

Lastly, Finance has adopted permanent remote work, reflecting the department’s overwhelming preference to sustain predominantly remote work, as identified in a spring 2021 survey of Finance staff. As part of this effort, leadership has engaged a diverse committee representing each unit, has given up office space, and is exploring how best to repurpose existing offices and cubicles into “hoteling” space that is geared towards more intermittent remote work.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

To develop its annual budget, Finance leadership engages directly with its diverse Deputies, each of whom is asked to identify priorities, goals, and new funding asks for the upcoming year.

In addition, as part of the Budget Office’s participatory budgeting work, Finance engages directly with members of the public regarding their budgetary priorities and preferences. Finance’s FY22 budget includes funding for a participatory budgeting contract and a Participatory Budgeting Specialist position.

Lastly, in developing the Catto Scholarship at the Community College of Philadelphia (CCP), Finance worked closely with diverse subject matter experts at CCP on program design, taking steps to ensure that the program would meet low-income students where they are and give them some of the supports that they need to succeed in college and beyond. The program design was also informed by similar successful programs at peer community colleges.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Over the last several years, Finance has proposed and has been asked to sustain cuts to its budget. These cuts were important as the City faced ongoing challenges, but back-office departments like Finance are critical to all City operations. For example, if Finance is slow on payment issuance or claims processing, this can have negative ramifications for existing disparities. Further, having no cushion in Finance’s personnel budget undermines the



department's ability to hire and support future Finance leaders when the need for a new position to address an operational need arises.

The cuts over the last several years have negatively impacted departmental capacity and agility in responding to issues and challenges that arise, many of which have ramifications for other departments and operations and make it difficult to invest in the professional development of existing staff, many of whom are people of color.

Office of the Inspector General

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

First, the OIG is continually focused on the department’s own internal structure and decision-making processes. Within the office, there is a commitment to a diverse and inclusive workspace. The department is constantly conversing with the entire team and evaluating the department’s structure, as well as the office’s own internal administration presents a major opportunity for us to contribute to this goal.

Second, the OIG’s mission is to “enhance public confidence in government.” Substantively the office is primarily focused on fraud and corruption, but much of the investigative and enforcement roles touch on racial equity. Any time there is possible violation of a City process or an established work rule, the office is able to hold people accountable. And many of the City processes (most directly contracting) are designed to enforce decision making that is objective and free from conscious or unconscious bias.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

The OIG’s contract compliance function is oriented toward this goal, specifically. In this area, the investigations seek to protect the contract award process and the OEO M/W/DSBE participation process. The department’s work in this area has led to several contractor debarments and disposition agreements for those entities and/or individuals who have been shown to be less than truthful about their commitment to the City’s goals. The use of so-called “pass through” entities or sham minority firms greatly detracts from opportunities available to honest minority-owned businesses that are trying to enter a competitive market.

- 3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

First, in the last 18 months the office elevated several Black and brown employees to leadership/supervisory roles. Previously the office lacked diversity at the upper levels, and now the office is in a much better place with respect to representation in leadership. Second, the office anticipates some hiring efforts in the coming fiscal year and intends to fully leverage the support of the DEI office to ensure that the office is recruiting in a manner that optimizes the department's ability to enhance diversity with quality candidates.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

Now that the office has strong representation at the senior-level, all budget decisions involve these stakeholders. Nothing here is decided unilaterally, and the office has made a concerted effort to dialogue with the entire leadership team at every stage in the process. The office also has a continual dialogue with the DEI office, HR and Labor Relations to ensure that metrics track the overall goals of the City.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

For FY23, the office has submitted a modest request for additional resources in both Class 100 and Class 200. The department is committed to using these resources, if approved, in a way that enhances and outwardly highlights the office's commitment to racial equity. Without these resources, however, the internal structure will likely be fixed for a significant period.

Parks & Recreation

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

As one of the city's most active public-facing departments with sites, programming, and places in every neighborhood, Philadelphia Parks & Recreation Department's FY23 budget request is focused on ensuring that the right structures, staffing, and approaches are in place to best engage with our constituents daily, especially communities of color. Most of our users are vulnerable youth and working families in/around under-invested neighborhoods. As part of the department's racial equity action plan, PPR will be piloting new engagement strategies and capacity building efforts focused on engaging youth of color. In addition, PPR has heard from focus groups with teenagers and young adults of color that more resources are needed to support safe, clean, and welcoming spaces and recreation centers especially in disenfranchised areas.

One of the department's top FY23 priorities will be an investment in operation enhancements to provide enhanced maintenance and care across the system. This is especially needed to support an increased demand for outdoor space due to the pandemic and a longer parks and recreation season due to climate change. As part of the Citywide racial equity framework, PPR reworked its Recreation Leader Trainee job specification to ensure staff working in communities are reflective of the community they serve. This effort helped PPR hire through the Civil Service process, the most diverse group of new Recreation Leaders in the department's history. As part of our FY23 budget, these new Recreation Leaders will be assigned to pilot Community Service Areas in more PPR districts in communities of color. Staff in the areas would also receive additional DEI and customer service training and capacity development.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

The COVID-19 crisis continues to demonstrate how critical parks and recreation centers are to delivering fundamental social services to communities. Record numbers of residents visited parks and open spaces for health, local food, and connection during COVID-19. PPR's FY23 budget request includes an investment in focused operations enhancements to better provide

safe, clean, ready to use parks/public spaces responding to increased demand/impacts of climate change as well as additional maintenance demands at and around Kensington parks and public spaces. Data and past experience show large users of outdoor spaces, athletic fields, and neighborhood parks are youth and families of color. In addition, working families depend on these amenities and programs to provide safe quality summer and after-school experiences.

Informed by the department's strategic planning process, a system-wide effort is underway to provide higher-quality programs and realign staffing structures to better serve communities of color. This includes using data to realign staffing, setting new programming standards, matching programs to local interests, and deploying a diverse group of staff reflective of the community. Designed with neighborhood-based data and racial demographics, Community Service Areas would be expanded to more PPR districts. These service areas would include clusters of PPR facilities and sites as well as a program crew to form new partnerships and programs to increase activations at unstaffed sites across the neighborhood. New investment would also be leveraged externally to advance equity of services and programming in neighborhoods, increase DEI training and capacity development, and extend hours to offer more safe, structured, and relevant programming to better serve all communities.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

A significant part of frontline PPR program division staff and managers' jobs are liaising with communities and creating/implementing programs that are relevant to the neighborhoods they serve. However, due to the systemic challenges within the Civil Service system, program staff have historically not reflected the racial makeup of Philadelphia and the communities they serve. This was especially clear during a review of PPR's District Manager test and the review of the Recreation Leader Trainee (RLT) hiring process. In collaboration with OHR, the department advanced a four-step process to overhaul hiring for the entry-level Program position Recreation Leader Trainee. This is an important position due to its closeness to community but also as a leadership pathway into the Civil Service system. This overhaul process included a robust recruitment effort targeting 32 different Philadelphia zip codes, outreach to historically black colleges and universities, as well as engaging internal subject matter experts to redesign the exam to make it fairer, allowing candidates to show a true affinity for the work. This resulted in a 64% increase in hiring people of color and a 52% increase in hiring of women. As part of our FY23 budget, these new Recreation Leaders will be assigned to additional Community Service Areas in PPR districts. Staff in the areas would also receive additional DEI and customer service training and capacity development.

As part of our department's strategic planning effort, PPR evaluated the history of our staffing model in our recreation centers which deprived neighborhoods, especially communities of color, of resources and high-quality programming. To help inform equity of services in neighborhoods, "heat maps" were created showing PPR staffing distribution by the racial demographic of neighborhoods. High numbers of unstaffed and understaffed PPR facilities are clustered in

communities of color while more prominent white neighborhoods saw higher numbers of staffed PPR facilities. In an effort to achieve a more dynamic, equitable staffing structure, additional neighborhood-based data sets (such as Harm Scores, Rebuild data, health/poverty metrics, facilities assessments) were layered onto the racial demographics of neighborhoods to determine high priority sites/facilities where staffing would be realigned and create new pilot Community Service Areas to create a dynamic staffing model to better match programs to local interests and needs developed in partnership with communities.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

As part of PPR's strategic planning process, the department's engagement effort included more than 500 participants in meetings, working groups, interviews, focus groups, surveys, and more. PPR's staff participated along with representatives of a range of interests, including District Council 47, non-profit program and event partners, and members of the Parks and Recreation Commission. The FY23 budget has been informed by neighborhood-based data and racial demographics including data sets such as PPD Harm Scores, Rebuild data, Census data, health/poverty metrics, facilities assessments/GIS layers. In addition, the work of PPR is supported by a diverse network of community volunteers and stakeholders.

In particular, the department regularly partners with Park Friends groups and Recreation Advisory Councils. Currently, there are more than 226 active Park Friends groups and Recreation Advisory Councils. Both are community-led organizations that work with PPR to create welcoming community spaces and foster positive experiences. PPR communicates regularly on a variety of projects, planning efforts, and programming with both groups. New investment in the urban forest and agriculture/community gardens will be informed by the city's first ever urban forest and urban agriculture planning processes, both guided by the principles of environmental justice, community engagement, and sustainability and will focus on deepening engagement with residents in neighborhoods of need and set forth new ways of working with residents to combat climate change.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Philadelphia Commission on Human Relations (PCHR)

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

At its core, racial equity involves uncovering and then eliminating systemic structures that contribute to racial disparities and discrimination against people of color. The Philadelphia Commission on Human Relations (PCHR) is one of the most critical agencies for the City goal of achieving racial equity as it administers and enforces the laws that prohibit discrimination, promote equality, and understanding throughout Philadelphia. In addition to investigating direct forms of discrimination, the Commission continues to expanded its responsibilities to include oversight of laws prohibit practices which lead to systemic oppression among BIPOC residents.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describes key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

PCHR was born out of legislative desire to “assure that all persons regardless of race, ethnicity, color... enjoy the full benefits of citizenship and are afforded equal opportunities for employment, housing and use of public accommodation facilities...”

PCHR’s Compliance Division is critical to enforcing the laws that prohibit race discrimination and promote equality. These include the Philadelphia Fair Practices Ordinance which prohibits direct and indirect forms of discrimination. Over the last decade, the scope of PCHR’s compliance division has also grown tremendously. It now includes enforcement oversight of laws that seek to uproot causes of racial inequity by identifying practices that are facially neutral yet have a disparate impact on racially marginalized communities. For example, numerous studies have shown that African American employees still earn less than their Caucasian counterparts. To remedy this inequity, the Wage Equity law prohibits employers from using a prospective employee’s salary history as the basis for determining their offered salary. Similarly, employers’ reliance on criminal background screening policies disproportionately affect people of color due to high incarceration rates. PCHR’s enforcement of the Fair Chance Hiring Law levels the playing

field, making it illegal for employers to inquire about an applicant's criminal history. Over the last, the agency has grown to enforce other progressive laws that seek to remedy practices that have disparate impact on communities of color including Cashless Retail Law, Renters Access Act (requiring more transparency and less discriminatory in the application process for prospective tenants), the Do Not Solicit Homeowner Protection Law (banning aggressive real estate solicitation in Philadelphia in neighborhoods with rising home values, especially in Black and Latinx communities), and the city's prohibition on pre-hire testing of marijuana (a key driver of mass criminalization in Black and Latinx communities). The unit also regularly educates businesses, housing providers, and the public about these laws. When a complaint is filed with the PCHR alleging a violation of these laws, staff conducts a thorough investigation and recommends a finding. If an investigation results in a finding of probable cause, PCHR Commissioners hold an adjudicatory hearing and issue a final order in the case that will remedy the discriminatory treatment. When necessary, the PCHR conducts educational hearings addressing discriminatory conduct or other issues of inequality.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

PCHR develops comprehensive guidance to illustrate ways employers can focus on systemic discrimination by establishing anti-racist policies that address racial disparities in the workplace, promote inclusiveness and diversity; and emphasize the importance of promoting dialogue about race, color, unconscious bias, and cultural issues at their workplaces. The agency conducts trainings, community meetings, and conferences discussing emerging issues in race discrimination such as intersectional discrimination, implicit bias, hiring and selection criteria, and employer best practices.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

PCHR plans to expand education and proactive enforcement of all the City's anti-discrimination laws, including targeted outreach to employers, housing providers, and places of public accommodation to ensure compliance. The agency will continue to work with community-based organizations to educate residents on their rights regarding discrimination in employment, housing, places open to the public. The Community Relations Division is also proactive in conflict resolution which seeks to engage the community through a variety of programs. These programs include leading and participating in outreach events and activities; organizing community dialogues; and conducting information sessions and skills workshops for community stakeholders. PCHR conducts anti-racism, cultural diversity and bias awareness trainings for schools, community groups, non-profit organizations, religious groups, city departments, and government-sponsored events.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Over the last year, the enforcement responsibility has grown tremendously. While PCHR's staff are eager and excited to lead the city charge in promoting equity and eradicating discrimination, budget reductions have limited overall staff capacity. As a result, the office currently has a backlog of discrimination cases that need to be scheduled and few administrative resources to assist. This scheduling is a priority for efficient case management, investigation, and for fairness and justice for both the Complainant and Respondent.

The PCHR needs an Intake Coordinator and a Human Relations Representative to accommodate the large influx of complaints that the office anticipates will result from recent legislation including the Renters Access Act, the Do not Solicit Homeowner Protection, and the city prohibition against pre-hire testing for marijuana.

The Intake Coordinator will be critical to conducting additional intake interviews to obtain facts and information related to complaints of alleged discrimination, neighborhood conflicts and unfair rental practices. This employee will provide administrative support and direct public concerns and information requests concerning discriminatory practices.

The Human Relations Representative will, likewise, be critical to interviewing and counseling individuals alleging discrimination. This employee will conduct field investigations, examine relevant records to ascertain the basis for the complaint; make recommendations for dispositions of complaints; and arrange and participate in conferences with employers, real estate brokers, representatives of community groups and others to reduce or eliminate discriminatory practices.

With these new positions the office will be able to streamline work and increase the quality and efficiency of the work this agency does. If PCHR is unable to receive funding for these positions the office will continue to vigorously pursue justice and equity however the agency's services will be less efficient, and likely be unable to proactively target discrimination and policy work necessary to effectuate the spirit of the Fair Practices Ordinance.

Police Department

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The core functions performed by the police department is to protect and serve all persons who live, work and visit Philadelphia. It is the department's mandate to complete this service with integrity. To follow is both the mission statement and oath of office that explains what the department does and the manner in which it is done.

The mission of the Philadelphia Police Department is to demonstrate excellence in policing by working in partnership with the community and others to:

- Fight and prevent crime, the fear of crime, and terrorism;
- Enforce laws while safeguarding the constitutional rights of all people;
- Provide quality service to all residents and visitors; and
- Create a work environment in which the office recruits, trains, and develops an exceptional team of employees.

Additionally, all officers take the following oath when they complete the training to become a police officer:

I solemnly swear that I will support, obey, and defend the Constitution of the United States and the Constitution of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, Home Rule Charter of Philadelphia, and ordinances of the City of Philadelphia; and abide by all the rules and regulations of the Philadelphia Police Department without consideration to a person's **race, color**, sex, gender identity, religious creed, sexual orientation, age, **national origin, ancestry**, handicap or disability; and that I will discharge the duties of my office with fidelity."

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**

- b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

Within the current budget the Police department currently offers training in the following areas:

Implicit Bias

A.B.L.E (Active Bystander for Law Enforcement)

Body worn cameras

Implicit Bias training is being taught to all sworn and non-sworn members of the department. The Police Department contracted with one of the most highly regarded experts in the field. Dr. Bryant Marks had personally trained 6,080 members of the department to recognize implicit bias in their own words and actions. The observable strengths are evident by the critiques by the officers and the evidence of learning and understanding that recognizing bias is the first step towards racial equity in all aspects of policing.

A.B.L.E (Active Bystander for Law Enforcement) training commenced in 2021 for sworn and civilian members of the police department. This training empowers members of the department to step in and end and observed abuse of a citizen by and officer. This will translate into better community trust and fair treatment for all citizens.

Body worn cameras – The body worn camera program continues to expand and will eventually expand to all numbered districts and uniform personnel in special units. This wearing of body worn cameras can lead to greater transparency and community trust, especially in communities of color. It is the hope of the PPD that it will also result in reduced complaints against police.

It is the intention to continue Implicit Bias training in the coming years. As a learning organization the PPD recognizes that in order to experience a shift in culture, it is necessary to constantly reinforce training and introduce new and relevant examples where bias has a negative impact on communities of color and the reputation of the department.

A.B.L.E training will also continue into FY23 and beyond. This training is part of the culture change as the PPD strives towards organizational excellence.

Body worn cameras and the storage of video is now embedded in policing and the transparency that the office and community can embrace. It is critical for the advancement for procedural justice and internal and external racial equity.

- 3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

The police department is using their budget to recruit, hire and retain officers of color as well as women to bolster the department's ranks. The PPD is in the process of hiring a Diversity, equity and Inclusion officer to assist in ensuring that all decisions are made through a racial equity lens. The promotional process is also viewed to ensure that there are opportunities provided to employees of color to ensure that they have a fair chance in career development and advancement.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

The PPD continuously looks through the racial equity lens with any requests for new expenditures. Areas that the department is currently exploring are additional bike and beat officers for business corridors in some of the more challenges areas of color. The PPD discusses the department needs through the formal and transparent process at city council and with internal and external stakeholders. All members from the executive team survey their commanders to determine additional needs to better serve the community and submit justifications through the formal budget process.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

I believe the budget department is aware that 95 percent of the police department's budget is salary and benefits. Any cuts to the police budget would significantly impact hiring. This impact would serve to retard the progress is hiring diversity in the areas of race and gender. This would have disparate impact on the communities that served.

Prisons

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Prisons seeks to continue its collaborative work with criminal justice partners of the MacArthur Grant to safely reduce the over reliance of jails and prisons and racial disparities for people of color. Further, Prisons will continue to provide services to the incarcerated population in support of reducing racial disparities and support positive reentry outcomes. Ensure equitable access to health care, substance use treatment, programs, education, and support the Senior Office of Reentry Services for post release services to ensure performance accountability.

Prisons will continue to address the racial disparities of the incarcerated population largely represented by people of color by continuing to provide programs and services during incarceration to support positive reentry outcomes through educational attainment, continuity of care for post release substance treatment and employment opportunities in partnership with the Office of Adult Education, Senior Office of Reentry Services and community-based treatment providers.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity. See above**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity? See above**

Prisons has partnered with Philadelphia Works, academia, chambers of commerce and faith-based communities to announce employment opportunities to attract a diverse candidate pool to fill vacancies. Prison will continue to promote corrections as a viable career against the backdrop of the COVID-19 pandemic. Prisons will continue its professional development training for all ranks and disciplines in support of succession planning and promotions.

Prisons will resume its diverse racial and gender group of uniform staff to conduct meeting and engage the workforce for ideas which promote morale and improve communication across

ranks. Ideas will be considered to inform policies and procedures that support the operations of the Department.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

Prisons continues to build off the Ethics survey of 2016/2017 that resulted in various “isms” (e.g., racism, sexism, nepotism) negatively impacting cultural practices, hiring and promotional opportunities within the Department. Prisons will resume its Implicit Bias Training which focuses on known and unknown biases and ensure staff participants are diverse in rank, gender and race. Prisons will build in diversity, equity and inclusion into its Implicit Bias Training to address the concerns of the workforce (e.g., “they are taking my job”). Prison will resume Performance Excellence Training for professional development of new and current supervisors to improve staff interaction, retention and operations.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

Prisons collaborates with internal and external stakeholders inclusive of criminal justice partners, advocates and coalitions to inform or revise policy and develop programs for the incarcerated population and uses feedback to identify opportunity for funding various programs and services pre and post release.

Prisons posts contract opportunities which may include dollar amounts, posts awards online and testifies before City Council at budget hearings. Prisons comply with the of Office of Economic Opportunity’s WMBDSE goals for primary and subcontract goals which ensure equity.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

Any reduction in funding will negatively impact the Prison workforce and incarcerated population because both represent people of color.

Procurement Department

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Procurement’s goal is to acquire services, supplies, equipment, and construction contracts through a fair and open process and at the best value to the City. This process has to be fair and open for all participating vendors including small, diverse, and local vendors. A major area where Procurement could advance racial equity includes the participation in additional outreach events about available contracting opportunities and resources.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

Procurement does not administer any programs to improve racial equity.

- 3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

N/A

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

At this time, Procurement has not involved internal/external stakeholders in the department’s budgetary process.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

No

Register of Wills

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Register of Wills as a department is very diverse. The major areas of opportunities to advance racial equity are training and promotion opportunities to leadership roles for all employees regardless of the race or color. Our hiring practices follow similar strategy. The hiring team consists of individuals from different cultural backgrounds that help promote diversity, and racial equity. In addition, we offer internship opportunities to students from different cultural background.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

The current administration in comparison to the previous is evaluating jobs description/duties and provides promotion opportunities to leadership roles in the office. The administration in conjunction with Human Resources and Finance has worked closely this past year to improve racial/gender equity in the office. The major is of improvement are leadership roles, compensation and equal competitive opportunities for all employees regardless of race and cultural background.

The Register of Wills is using the resources to address racial disparities in the workplace and to help reduce racial inequity throughout the communities of color with its office strategy. We promote diversity and feedback. We support our staff to take leadership roles in every opportunity that may arise as a public facing office. We face challenges when our funding is cut, and we try to work within the spending limits. The reduced spending has a negative impact on diversity and operations given that our budget is limited. We cannot possibly advance racial equity without funding. Racial disparities are higher when the department is smaller in

comparison to another department that can afford reduced spending. We are a public facing office and we cannot possibly mitigate risk/threats when funding is cut.

The Register of Wills Human Resources department in conjunction with Finance has evaluated job descriptions of our current staff members to help advance racial equity. We are doing so by providing training and exploring promotional opportunities into leadership roles for our staff members. This past year we helped more than ten employees advance either in a supervisory level or increasing compensation, a problem that was not addressed by the previous administration. We will continue to do so in the upcoming fiscal year however without funding we cannot possible do so.

- 3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?**

The Register of Wills Department is one of the most diverse departments in the City of Philadelphia. We support our staff by providing promotional opportunities to leadership roles, training guidance and by receiving feedback on how to improve a service or strategy. We host staff meeting where everyone can way in their opinion without any hesitation. The hiring team is compiled by a diverse group of individuals from different cultural backgrounds that decides on hiring of new staff.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

The Register of Wills has involved my stakeholders. Council members and public have all been included in this initiative. We also include the stakeholders in PDI events. The Register also hosts events in communities of color to inform the public of her initiative, current and future hiring opportunities to align with the mayor's vison.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

We need funding. Our funding has been cut at a 10% level and has yet to be restored. We cannot continue to advance racial equity without funding. This has an impact on the office moral and operations. We are not fully operating as we should. As a public facing department we can do so much more, however with limited funding it's very difficult to address racial disparities.

Sheriff Department

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The major areas of opportunity, through the community outreach and constituent services divisions, for the Office of the Philadelphia Sheriff, to advance racial equity, is through its' Home Asset Recovery Team, or HART program and the establishment of a HART investigations unit. This is a public facing operation, that is directly connected to the desired, Mayoral priority, of inclusive economy and thriving neighborhoods, within the City of Philadelphia.

In previous administrations most of these excess funds were never returned to the defendants. This program provides an opportunity for

affected property owners to recover economically and financially. The combined efforts, using awareness programs, that support methods, that aid in retention of homes subject to sheriff sales and give access to homeowner who are trying to retain their homes, clearly aligns with the mayor's priorities.

Beginning in 2012 the H.A.R.T unit, of the Sheriff's Office, more aggressively searched out those owed money, validating which defendants are eligible to receive a H.A.R.T. payment and connecting with those individuals to put a check in their hands.

Returning excess proceeds to homeowners promotes the mayor's priority for improving the economy and thriving neighborhoods, by allowing, the same homeowners, to re-obtain real property on an enhanced economic status in or around Philadelphia. Many of the properties sold are in economically depressed areas within the City of Philadelphia.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**

b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?

The critical programs that the office will administer, using the current budget, are the following:

HART Investigations Unit which will use all legal means to find the owner(s), of property, sold due to court-ordered actions. The strength of the program will be its ability to aggressively seek out and return excess proceeds which will impact the mayor's priority of inclusive economy and thriving neighborhoods.

The challenges or weaknesses of the program is that real estate and related documents, regarding the homeowner's location, possess conflicting information, which requires a team of experienced investigators to unravel.

In addition, the opportunities are the financial benefit to homeowners, who otherwise would not receive the proceeds. The major threat to this program, would be the inability, of this office, to acquire personnel, through the budget approval process, to adequately staff this unit.

HART performance impact has been that more individuals, in traditionally economically depressed neighborhoods, have received excess proceeds to rebuild their lives and return to homeownership, in some form. The link below provides estimates of HART proceeds return since 2012:

<https://www.officeofphiladelphiasheriff.com/en/real-estate/dart>

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

The Sheriff's office is always seeking to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace and promotes such through community outreach activities and via the office's website.

Sheriff Bilal, upon taking office, reorganized how both civilian and uniformed personnel are evaluated for hiring. Through this process, Sheriff Bilal has promoted men and women of color and/or of varied sexual orientation, based solely on their talent, potential or experience. An example of this is the hiring process for experienced personnel, which is based upon, best qualified candidates—making this process race/sexual orientation neutral.

Aggressive Recruitment of Uniformed Personnel:

The Philadelphia Sheriff's Office is now accepting applications from experienced qualified law enforcement professionals for the position of Deputy Sheriff. For professionals with five or more years' experience, the starting salary is \$60,273.

This initiative is to augment the lengthy hiring process, of an inexperienced applicant, that will require 19-weeks of training to qualify them for duty. The office actively seeks to recruit experienced personnel using the following criteria:

Requirements include but are not limited to one of the following:

- A current Deputy Sheriff Training Act II-114 certification OR Deputy Sheriff Training Act II-114 certification that was valid within a three-year period.
- Completion of the Deputy Sheriff's Training Act II-114 training under Pennsylvania Commission on Crime and Delinquency, through Deputy Sheriffs' Education and Training Program within the three-year period.
- Successfully completed a recognized Pennsylvania Municipal Police Officers' Education and Training Commission (MPOETC) Act 120 basic training course, within the City of Philadelphia, to reduce the 19-week training commitment located at Penn State University, required by deputy sheriff recruits, being considered by the department. An adequate level of training funds is necessary to establish such a course and open training opportunities, to the residents, within the City of Philadelphia. This will prevent hardships for single parent families, who otherwise wouldn't reply to the employment announcements that are published.
- Experience as a municipal police officer in Pennsylvania with either a current or past MPOETC certification card.
- Employment as a Pennsylvania State Police Officer as documented by a copy of academy graduation certificate and notice of retirement.

General Training:

Leadership Training via conferences, seminars and workshops

Law Enforcement conference, seminars and workshops

Uniformed personnel to special assignments or details with other City, State and Federal Agencies Procurement, Accounting and Inventory Management

Executive Leadership Development

The current issue is the inability to expand training for both the uniformed and civilian staff of the office because it is an **under-funded budget that restricts** overall capabilities to hire and retain suitable staff. The office is constantly restrained from obtaining accurate funding levels, which is causing an overtime expense, that is not allocated, by the current operating budget.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

The Office of the Philadelphia Sheriff has involved internal and/or external stakeholders, that represent marginalized communities of color, by using community outreach activities that occur monthly. These include, churches, community organizations, the Guardian Civic League, along with engaging city council representatives within the Sheriff's Office operating footprint.

The Sheriff uses her office to contact officials, within City Government, to enlighten them regarding how her staff functions, at the main office, and outside with the public.

The transparent processes, for budget deliberations, and prioritization, with respect to racial equity, is centered around those public facing activities the office is daily engaged in, which are civil enforcement matters (evictions); court-ordered sheriff sales and the return of excess proceeds to the affected property owner; gun control operations to reduce and recover weapons that are used in violent criminal activity.

Sheriff Bilal continues to administratively align her office in accordance with the Philadelphia Home Rule Charter and 1st Judicial District guidelines, for her responsibility to the Court Systems, within Philadelphia, and related civil procedures and practices as mandated by state law. Justifications, within past and current budgets, are utilized to detail why and where additional budget allocations are required. However, the office is constantly denied funds that impact the office's ability to hire uniformed personnel/civilian staff and add automation, to the office, in order move in into a true **21st century agency** status.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?

The core of racial equity impacts of the office's budget is centered around the return of excess proceeds to homeowners, who have been impacted, by court-order sale of their property. Inadequate funding, for automation, equipment, and personnel, lessen the impact of a program, which clearly enhances the mayors' priority of an inclusive economy and thriving neighborhoods, for which, the mayor is accountable to, along with his administration.

Streets Department

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City's vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

The Streets Department is perhaps the most routinely visible and impactful City department with the vast array of core services provided having a direct day-to-day effect on city residents. Virtually all of the department's core services, including trash and recycling collections, street cleaning, sanitation enforcement, roadway maintenance and repair, traffic engineering, maintenance and repair, street lighting maintenance and repair and transportation public works engineering and construction directly correlate with residents' quality of life, and the relative performance or under-performance of these services is immediately observed.

It is therefore incumbent on the Department to ensure these services are performed in an equitable manner, particularly given the importance of these services in predominately minority and economically disadvantaged areas of the city. Many minority residents reside in older and more condensed neighborhoods, where littering conditions are more likely to be exacerbated, transportation infrastructure tends to be older and in need of repair and crime activity tends to be higher, making quality of life improvements more impactful and necessary.

Streets has actively incorporated racial equity strategies in the delivery of all core-service functions. A review of the Five Year Financial and Strategic Five-Year Plan, for example, clearly demonstrates that it a primary strategic initiative. Specifically, the Department has strategically implemented a number of planning measures providing for a focused, data-driven approach to addressing core-service operations, primarily with a view towards providing equitable, efficient and effective services throughout the city, and, most importantly with a focus on areas most in need, most often correlating to predominately minority areas.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**

- a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.
- b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?

Trash & Recycling Collections & Street Cleaning: The Department's objective data-driven approach to addressing litter reduction needs is focusing more attention toward litter-reduction in predominately minority areas where older, smaller and more limited housing and geographic street layouts can exacerbate litter conditions. The successful full-scale implementation of a new Citywide litter indexing system, combined with GIS and GPS technology and camera surveillance systems, has ushered in an exciting and entirely new way to assess neighborhood litter conditions and prioritize and plan effective location-specific solutions, while effectively and efficiently deploying resources to address critical needs. This is most clearly exemplified with Streets' comprehensive curb-to-curb mechanical street cleaning program which is being significantly expanded over the next several years with the objective of performing cleaning activity on all streets throughout the city each year. While all city neighborhoods and communities are projected to receive street cleaning services once the program is fully implemented, primary emphasis, focus and recurrence will be based upon actual, objective litter conditions, as determined by the Department's objective litter index. This same litter-index based approach is being used to address trash and recycling collections and illegal dumping. The Department will enhance and improve the monitoring and identification of areas of the city where litter conditions are worst and establish location specific solutions to address these conditions.

- **Strengths:** The Department has received considerable new funding with a \$10.5 million dollar increase each fiscal year from FY22 through FY24 specifically for expanded mechanical street cleaning. In addition, the Department has received an infusion of funds necessary to support a significant increase in trash tonnage as a result of the COVID-19 epidemic from more residents remaining at home for longer periods of time and generating more trash, and, in prior years the Department had a dedicated Capital Program line item to sufficiently fund on-going sanitation compactor vehicle needs, resulting in a relatively well-conditioned and functional vehicle fleet. Streets' investments in GPS technology and camera surveillance systems to track trash and recycling collections and mechanical street cleaning performance and observe the condition of neighborhoods and communities in real time, as well as the utilization of the Department's litter indexing system collectively ensure resources are aligned properly for litter reduction in geographic areas most in need.
- **Challenges or Weaknesses:** Staffing attendance challenges remain the most salient concern as it pertains to trash and recycling collections and street cleaning. High absenteeism rates and pattern attendance abuse impacts the efficiency of Department operations resulting in collection and cleaning delays. Because delays create more exacerbated litter conditions in older, more condensed residential areas of the city, there is more of an impact in predominately minority neighborhoods.

- **Opportunities:** New GPS technology allows the Department to further improve operational efficiency beyond wide geographic areas and more efficiently deploy assets on individual routes, thus addressing high-volume litter areas in real time. The more efficient the Department can respond to high-volume litter conditions, the more likely areas most in need can be maintained regularly. In addition, the new collective bargaining agreement between the City and District Council #33 represents an excellent opportunity for the Department to address staffing and attendance challenges. Newly incorporated terms and conditions significantly improve management's capacity to monitor and control excessive absenteeism, thereby mitigating the occurrence of collections and cleaning delays.
- **Threats:** Recent decreasing investment in Capital Program funding for heavy duty sanitation vehicles represents a significant threat going forward. From FY15 through FY21, Streets enjoyed a dedicated and sufficiently funded Capital Program line item. This has not been the case since. It is imperative that the Department continue to maintain the sanitation vehicle fleet in a good state of repair to maintain efficient operations. An aging and poor-conditioned fleet will result in delayed and much more expensive operations as crews will need to be deployed after regular work hours at overtime rates due to non-functioning vehicles.

Paving & Roadway Maintenance & Repair: Similar to sanitation operations, the Department is also employing an objective, data-oriented approach towards strategically addressing roadway conditions throughout the City. New GIS and GPS technology and systems are being used along with objective assessment tools to rate and monitor the quality and condition of streets and roadways. The relative condition of streets and roadways are objectively assessed and rated. This is used as a basis in determining where planned resurfacing and comprehensive repair work is to be performed, thereby focusing work in those areas most in need. Streets' comprehensive paving plans, for example, are determined based upon this approach and aligned with roadway resurfacing work most needed, generally in areas with older transportation infrastructure and which tends to be in predominately minority areas of the city.

- **Strengths:** The City has invested significantly in roadway resurfacing over recent fiscal years, with increased funding in both the Department's operating and Capital Program budgets. This effectively provided for creation and resourcing of an additional, second paving crew, and funding for resurfacing materials and equipment, thereby considerably increasing the amount of streets and roadways resurfaced throughout the city. In addition, like sanitation operations, the Department is using GPS technology and surveillance cameras to track operations in real time and quickly assess conditions for maximum deployment of snow equipment, staff and resources. Snow and ice removal operations are, as a result, completed in a more timely and efficient manner.
- **Challenges or Weaknesses:** City streets and roadways must be resurfaced and maintained at optimal lifecycle intervals to maintain the local street network in a state of good repair. To effectively achieve this objective, 131 miles of resurfacing must be performed annually, as it represents the necessary benchmark for maintaining a well-conditioned local street network. Budget reductions necessitated due to the COVID-19 epidemic's impact on the city's economy

eliminated continued augmentation of Streets paving staff to reach three-paving crews. In addition, recent legal requirements required the diversion of significant resurfacing funds towards ADA ramp construction for all intersection curb ramps adjacent to roadway resurfacing. The combined impact of these occurrences prevents the Department from paving the desired annual 131 miles of streets and roadways and will likely reach only 50 to 70 miles annually going forward.

- **Opportunities:** Streets is actively exploring new, less expensive and more durable roadway resurfacing strategies and techniques to maintain surface quality and extend the life cycle of the street network as much as possible. In addition, the Department is researching innovative and less-expensive installation methods for ADA curb-ramps, the savings for which can be diverted to more resurfacing.
- **Threats:** Costs increases in asphalt and other necessary resurfacing materials, as well as in contractor support costs for roadway repair and ADA installations threaten to significantly reduce the amount of roadway resurfacing and repair work that can be performed going forward. To the extent inflationary pressures continue to impact these costs long-term, there will be an inevitable decrease in the amount of resurfacing and roadway repair work the Department can perform.

Traffic Engineering Maintenance & Repair: The Department is implementing traffic calming and safety initiatives based on objective traffic data identifying multi-module high-accident areas, often occurring in highly congested, smaller and more impoverished minority neighborhood areas, many areas of which correspond to the City's High-Injury Network. For example, Streets successfully implemented the Neighborhood Slow Zone Program, using an objective assessment for evaluating traffic safety improvements in specific zones of the City rather than individual blocks. Traffic speeds were significantly reduced as a result of these zone improvements.

- **Strengths:** Streets has been extremely successful in obtaining competitive grant awards for a variety of transportation-improvement projects, including multi-modal projects. A total of \$34 million in potential grant funding was awarded for 2021, and an overall total of more than \$200 million in active potential grant funding has been awarded since over the last ten years. It is projected that Streets will continue to be successful in this regard going forward, particularly with increased funding provided over the last several fiscal years for a grants management staff contingent and the ability of the Office of Transportation Infrastructure and Sustainability (OTIS) in obtaining grant awards on behalf of Streets projects.
- **Challenges or Weaknesses:** The most immediate challenge the Department faces in maintaining and improving traffic assets is staffing levels. Currently, staffing is not sufficient to maintain and repair the vast array of traffic signals and signs throughout the city. A recent assessment of current staffing needs indicates that more than 40 additional positions would be required to adequately address the City's on-going traffic maintenance and repair needs.
- **Opportunities:** The Department plans to continue enhancement and expansion of its Traffic Operations Center (TOC) to fully integrate the city-wide traffic signal network and further centralize traffic control and intelligent transportation systems throughout the city. A fully integrated and operational TOC will allow for real-time signal adjustments to improve driver

and pedestrian safety, increase the efficiency of the city's street system and lead to significantly reduced less congestion and increased traffic egress along city roadways, In addition, the Department anticipates additional upcoming grant funding due to projected revenues from the recently implemented state automated speed enforcement program, a significant portion of which, estimated at \$9 million annually, is expected to be received by the Department. This funding will provide for significant investments in traffic safety initiatives, particularly along the Roosevelt Boulevard corridor.

- **Threats:** The great majority of the Department's traffic signals are aged and operated by antiquated and increasingly difficult and costly equipment to obtain. Unless the Department invests heavily in upgrading traffic signal equipment and incorporating the system as part of the Traffic Operations Center's integrated network, maintenance and repair costs will continue to rise, as equipment continues to deteriorate. Over time, high costs for existing and archaic equipment will also mitigate the Department's capacity to modernize and integrate the traffic network.

Street Lighting Maintenance & Repair: Expanded LED lighting efforts are actively being targeted in troubled, high-crime areas, often located in predominately minority populated neighborhoods. This provides greater visibility relative to their older incandescent lighting counterparts, as well as an increased sense of safety, and better conditions for residents, pedestrian and vehicular traffic. Streets strategically works with the Managing Director's Office to objectively and equitably identify and plan on LED installation opportunities for those areas most in need of increased visibility to deter crime. For example, Streets previously installed more than 2,100 new LED lights along streets branching off from Kensington and Alleghany Avenues along the Market-Frankford Elevated Train corridor. The new lighting was installed for four blocks both ways on major streets, such as Lehigh Avenue, and for two blocks on minor streets to provide enhanced visibility within this high-crime corridor area.

- **Strengths:** The Department has been highly successful in implementing a comprehensive program involving city-wide placement and utilization of distributed antenna systems (DAS) on City-owned pole assets throughout the city with associated fees. DAS systems provide for an antenna network of wireless service within a geographic area and are highly sought after by wireless service providers. Streets successful management of this program has resulted in 2,800 new installations this past year and over \$1.6 million in associated revenue fees, which, if rededicated to the Department could be diverted to further resourcing street lighting maintenance and repair operations.
- **Challenges or Weaknesses:** Similar to the Department's Traffic maintenance and repair efforts, the Department's street-lighting operations are significantly understaffed. Only 29 approved positions are funded to cover maintenance and repair of all City streetlights throughout Philadelphia. Approximately 26 additional positions are required to provide a sufficient level of coverage based on a recent internal staffing assessment.
- **Opportunities:** Streets, partnering with the City's Office of Transportation Infrastructure and Sustainability (OTIS) and Philadelphia Energy Authority (PEA), continues to move forward on a highly anticipated and ambitious plan to modernize and convert the entire citywide street

- lighting system to more energy-efficient and effective LED lights through an innovative performance contract with an energy service company (ESCO). The ESCO performance contract will provide for large-scale LED conversions within a several year period, with the energy savings shared between the ESCO and City. Reduced costs from energy savings shared between the ESCO and City are expected to be significant as lighting maintenance contract activities would no longer be necessary. Over 100,000 streetlights are expected to be converted to LED lighting within a three-year horizon.
- **Threats:** Absent the City's ESCO initiative, the Department would have no alternative but to convert streetlights to LED lighting incrementally over a prolonged period of time, up to 20 years, as there would be no available resource to fund conversion efforts more fully. It is therefore imperative that the ESCO initiative be successfully implemented as soon as possible.

Public Works Engineering & Construction: The Department works closely with the Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability (OTIS) to streamline an objective, data-driven capital project prioritization process that aligns with long-term transportation goals and objectively informs the prioritization of projects with funding opportunities. This will effectively provide for the establishment of a long-term transportation project plan and a process that focuses on the most critical projects going forward, often located in more disadvantaged, minority-populated areas.

- **Strengths:** The Department maintains a highly effective and successful public works engineering and construction program currently managing a total of 70 Capital Program and grant-funded transportation projects in FY22, either in the design or construction phases, representing a total project value of more than \$250 million. A very well-trained and capable staff of senior-level project engineers ensures the Department's engineering design and construction work moves forward efficiently and effectively. In addition, a resourced and very effective, grants and projects management staff maximizes the effectiveness and efficiency of overall grant funding obtained for construction and design projects. These efforts yield a significant return on investment (ROI) in both expanded utilization of available grant funds, as well as more increased and efficient federal and state reimbursement for eligible completed projects.
- **Challenges or Weaknesses:** While the Department's engineering and grants and project management staff are extremely productive and capable, overall staffing resources and experience is a significant concern. Key senior-level directors have either retired, are expected to retire soon or are currently eligible for retirement. A pronounced talent and experience gap currently exists within the staff which will be exacerbated as additional retirements take place. This combined with the increasing availability of more grant funding making it possible to complete a higher volume of public works projects, creates a definitive resource deficiency which needs to be addressed going forward.
- **Opportunities:** The recent federal Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act (IIJA) is expected to infuse up to \$1 to \$3 billion in transportation-related public works project funds to the Streets Department for much needed roadway, bridge and traffic infrastructure reconstruction and upgrades. This translates to a minimal assessment of approximately \$250 million in funding

each fiscal year throughout the duration of the federally provided funding. The scope and level of such funding represents a tremendous opportunity to stabilize and extend the life of transportation infrastructure assets across the city and to meet a host of desperately needed infrastructure repairs that would otherwise not be monetarily possible. Such a massive infusion of funding is anticipated to yield a significant return on investment (ROI), thereby financially supporting an increase in both staff and consultant capacity which will include a combination of newly hired staff, additional consultant support and development of current employees.

- **Threats:** The state of much of the city’s overall transportation infrastructure is antiquated and in a poor state of repair. Infrastructure conditions will continue to get worse if not addressed necessitating ever increasing reconstruction or repair over time. For example, the average age of City-maintained bridges is over 70 years old. Of the city’s 160 major vehicular bridges (span length over 20 feet), approximately 25 percent are structurally deficient. There are also 78 known common private retaining walls in the city, many of which are in a critical state of disrepair. Much of the city’s street and roadway network is in a poor state of repair as well, and while it should be repaved at optimal life cycle intervals, current funding levels and federal requirements preclude this from occurring. Plans to address such critical transportation infrastructure needs need to be established.

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

As part of the Department’s DEI plan, Streets intends to implement a comprehensive initiative fostering and supporting organizational diversity, equity and inclusion throughout all facets of the organization. This will incorporate several coordinated approaches targeted towards establishment and maintenance of a diverse and inclusive culture that fosters respect, dignity and professional growth for employees. Plans include surveying and interviewing staff to obtain information and feedback on the workplace environment, followed by the effective integration of communication, recruitment and hiring, training and development, succession planning and workforce development efforts to achieve DEI objectives.

Employee Survey: The Department will survey and interview staff to obtain information and feedback on the workplace environment (including diversity and inclusion), commitment to the Department’s mission, tools and resources available to perform the job, training and development opportunities, organizational communication and job satisfaction. From the information obtained, the Department will evaluate results and endeavor to implement new initiatives to encourage and foster a diverse and inclusive environment.

Future Track Workforce Development Program: Streets effectively re-established the highly successful Future Track Workforce Development program during FY22. The program was previously eliminated as part of the City’s COVID-19 budget reductions the previous fiscal year, but the Department leveraged the opportunity of available funds to bring back the program in support of street cleaning operations. The program provides a pathway to permanent full-time

civil service employment for participants through formal classroom training, career development resources, program selection assessments and meaningful work experience. Bridge employment to City civil service positions will continue to be an objective for all successful participants, the majority of whom are minority candidates.

Intern-to-Hire Program: The Department has also established a new and innovative internship-to-hire program for engineering interns which uses the internship as part of the civil service assessment process necessary to be placed and hired from a civil service list. This initiative provides for increased diversity for hard-to-fill and diversity-challenged entry-level engineering positions.

Succession Planning Program: The Department continues to improve and develop a succession planning program to address future workforce planning needs in a systemic and structured fashion. The increasing retirement of experienced employees, particularly those in key leadership or essential positions, has resulted in a significant institutional knowledge and experience gap in Streets' workforce. A comprehensive succession planning approach is being utilized which targets prospective candidates for critical and leadership positions. It includes a focus on expanding a diverse base of potential candidates for these jobs so that they may successfully transition into the critical and/or leadership roles.

4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department's budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?

Many Streets Department initiatives involve community input from stakeholders. The Zero Waste and Vision Zero priorities, for example, were largely derived from stakeholder engagement, including significant representation from area communities. This was done through community meetings and neighborhood forums, as well as direct input via social media venues. Beyond this, Streets' data-driven and long-term strategic approach in providing core services allows the Department to plan and dedicate the resources necessary to reduce litter and improve transportation safety in objectively identified geographic areas, thereby helping to achieve racial equity in addressing these needs. This also ensures the Department's work is focused in an equitable fashion, thereby greatly benefiting those most in need, which are primarily located in minority populated areas.

5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?



Streets' budget and resource allocation priorities continue to be focused on a data-driven approach to strategically planning, managing and implementing work activities and operations, properly aligning these with overall departmental goals and objectives. New technology and data metrics will be further explored and developed and aligned with operational performance measures to evaluate and manage operations and to proactively identify and implement improvements and resource allocation. This approach will further enhance efforts to objectively evaluate work and ensure it is primarily focused in an equitable fashion on those areas and services most in need.

Water Department

Existing Spending and Operations

- 1. Please briefly describe how the core functions of your agency intersect with the City’s vision for racial equity. What major areas of opportunity are there for you to advance racial equity as part of the core work your department performs?**

Services Provided by the Philadelphia Water Department (PWD) are not racially determined. PWD provides equal access to safe drinking water and wastewater services to all Philadelphia residents. There are however program initiatives that PWD implements such as Expanded Student Employment Opportunities, Powercorps, Apprenticeship Programs and Minority Business Opportunities that targets minority communities and institutions to improve diversity in the workforce and in contracting for goods and services. There are also income-based customer assistance programs that, although not specifically designed for racial equity, helps to ensure affordable water services to low-income customers. These programs will be discussed in more details below.

- 2. What critical programs or policies does your office administer (or plan to administer) with your current budget to improve racial equity? Please make sure to reference any critical workforce equity programs or policies.**
 - a. For each critical program or policy briefly describe key observable (a) strengths, (b) challenges or weaknesses, (c) opportunities, and (d) threats relative to advancing racial equity.**
 - b. For each critical program or policy briefly describe performance impacts. In the case of continuing programs or policies, please provide information on impact to date. What impact have they had on output and outcomes measures related to racial equity?**

As stated before, PWD’s operations are not racially determined. However, certain customer assistance programs such as Tiered Assistance Program (TAP), the Senior Citizen Discount Program (SCD) and others that benefit low-income customers help reduce service delivery disparity across racial groups. As PWD is fully aware of the economic conditions faced by some residents of the city, PWD will continue to work with the Revenue Department, OIT, community partners to implement and enhance customer assistance programs that support the Mayor’s poverty reduction initiative. This year, PWD has expanded promotions of assistance programs, intentionally engaging media that targets Black, Latino, and other non-English speaking communities. The Applications for most programs listed above are currently available in the top

ten languages requested for translation in Philadelphia: Chinese (traditional and simplified), Vietnamese, Russian, Arabic, Cambodian (MonKhmer), Portuguese and Italian, in addition to English and Spanish. To date, there are over 40,000 customers benefitting from the income-based water billing assistance programs with approximately \$30 million of benefit in FY21 alone. The Department is also providing \$750 thousand for Low Income Conservation Assistance program and \$950 thousand for Community Engagement thus providing **Inclusive Economy and Thriving Neighborhood**

3. Please briefly describe how is your department using its budget to create an inclusive, anti-racist workplace, including shifting internal cultural practices, and hiring and promotional policies, if at all?

PWD will ensure that personnel recruitment, placement, training, career development, and safety programs are consistent with long-term needs of the Department and the City's goals for **diversity and inclusion**. The department plans to continue to coordinate with OHR to fill critical vacancies, reach out to minority communities, colleges, training institution, and professional societies such as the Society for Black Engineers and Society for Women Engineers to encourage minority recruitment and internship. The Department provides \$246,000 in annual funding and support to PowerCorps PHL, a subsidiary of Education Works aimed at providing work-readiness training to 18–30-year-old Philadelphians with significant barriers to employment. In total, 96% of apprentices hired were minorities. Forty-four (or roughly 65%) of participants in the program have promoted to permanent Civil Service positions in the fields of: electrician, engineering aide, electronics technician, HVAC mechanic, machinery mechanic, and green stormwater maintenance. PWD apprenticeship and internship programs have provided opportunities to 232 individuals since 2014.

The establishment of a Workforce Development Unit will enable the growth of the Department's talent pipeline through recruitment, internship, and apprenticeship programming. Staff in this unit coordinate with internal management and external community partners to source, retain, and train a diverse array of qualified candidates to provide gainful, upwardly mobile, meaningful careers at all levels of the organization.

The Department also supports minority participation in all aspects of PWD's business operations. For major contracts, PWD's minority participation rate of 38% in FY 2021 exceeded its 33% goals thereby providing greater opportunities to minority businesses.

- 4. How has your department involved or how do you plan to involve internal and/or external stakeholders, including marginalized communities of color, in your department’s budget process and program/policy design? What are your transparent processes for budget deliberations and prioritization with respect to racial equity impact?**

To enhance **diversity, efficiency and effectiveness in governance**, budgeting at the PWD begins at the unit level. Each unit presents its needs to PWD Finance for compilation and review. Each unit defends its budget before the PWD executive team at a scheduled meeting with major emphasis on justification of budget increases, program achievement and constraints in the implementation of the programs. After the units’ presentation, the executive team meets and make final decision considering current operational needs, funding constraints and strategic alignment.

The Philadelphia Water Department has a dedicated team of outreach and communications specialists, and the office has developed a comprehensive education and community engagement workflow. PWD works very closely with communities throughout Philadelphia during the planning, design, and construction phases of many capital projects, especially green stormwater infrastructure projects associated with the Green City, Clean Waters program to reduce combined sewer overflows.

- 5. Is there anything else you would like the Budget Office to know about the racial equity impacts of your budget proposal(s)?**

Due to the nature of PWD non-race base service delivery, most racial equity issues revolve around hiring of staffs and award of contracts which are share responsibilities involving several departments such as OHR and Procurement. However, PWD with work with other departments and organizations to ensure racial equity in its operations.

Appendix C

Equity and Results Top Ranking Requests

★ Fully Funded

★ Partially Funded

Dept Name	Justification Title	Subtotal - Dept	Subtotal - Justification	Overall Score (0-25 scale)	Category of Impact	FY23 \$ Impact
★ Managing Director's Office	Vacant Lot Maintenance & Stabilization	3.70	3.63	13.41	Reparative Policy/Practice	\$ 1,500,000
★ Mayor's Office	Comprehensive Racial Equity Leadership Strategic Planning and Development	3.88	3.13	12.11	DEI Infrastructure	\$ 350,000
Human Services	Out of School Time (OST) Site Based Case Mgrs	3.25	3.38	10.97	Services Safety Net	\$ 906,376
★ Managing Director's Office	MacArthur Sustainability: Increase Support	3.70	2.80	10.36	Reparative Policy/Practice	\$ 510,983
★ Managing Director's Office	Increase Support for Immigrant Legal Defense	3.70	2.80	10.36	Services Safety Net	\$ 100,000
★ Health	Children's Environmental Health Plan - Lead and Healthy Homes Staff	3.30	3.13	10.31	Services Safety Net	\$ 462,402
★ Managing Director's Office	Community Crisis Intervention Program Expansion	3.70	2.75	10.18	Services Safety Net	\$ 1,500,000
★ Department of Behavioral	Justice and Mental Health Collaboration Program (JMHCP) with Criminal Justice	3.60	2.80	10.08	Services Safety Net	\$ 65,384
★ Homeless Services	Restoration of support for opioid related programs	3.80	2.63	9.98	Services Safety Net	\$ 5,500,000
★ Homeless Services	Funding to cover cost inflation at emergency shelters	3.80	2.63	9.98	Reparative Policy/Practice	\$ 1,310,338

Appendix D

Cabinet Racial Equity Top Ranking Requests

★ Fully Funded ★ Partially Funded

Top Ranked Requests		\$
★	Violence Prevention DHS	\$801K
★	Prison Food Service	\$2.3M
★	Vacant Lot Maintenance	\$1.5M
★	PPR Community Goal 3	\$1.395M
★	GVI Expansion	\$1M
★	Illegal Dumping Crew	\$2.5M
	Cyber Security*	\$2.3M
★	CEO Same Day Pay	\$651K
	PPD Implicit Bias Training	\$600K
★	Kensington CLIP Expansion	\$2.5M

* May be handled with existing funds

Racial Equity Committee Budget Equity Top Ranking Requests

★ Fully Funded

★ Partially Funded

Top Ranked Requests		\$
★	Health Centers*	\$3.6M
★	Vacant Lot Maintenance	\$1.5M
★	Immigrant Legal Defense	\$100K
★	911 Triage/Co-Responder	\$1.395M
★	Middle Manager Coaching	\$100K
★	Home Lead Remediation	\$462K
★	Leadership Strategy Plan	\$350K
★	MacArthur Sustainability	\$511K
★	GVI Expansion	\$1M
★	CEO Same Day Pay	\$651K

*Separate from adds for St. Christopher's (\$2.5M) and Black Doctors (\$500K). Ongoing discussions about RevMax.