

PHILADELPHIA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

MEETING VIA ZOOM

MINUTES DECEMBER 9, 2021

PRESENT:

Anne Fadullon, Chair

Joseph Syrnick, Vice Chair

Ximena Valle

Patrick Eiding

Marisa Waxman

Garlen Capita

Charlotte Castle

Cheryl L. Gaston

Dawn Summerville

Eleanor Sharpe

NOT PRESENT:

Catherine Lamb

Maria Gonzalez

Michael Johns

Commission Chair, Anne Fadullon called the Philadelphia City Planning Commission to order at 1:00 p.m.

Matt Wysong, of the Philadelphia City Planning Commission, (PCPC) – introduced the Zoom platform and remote City Planning Commission process. We are hosting this meeting on Zoom. We may also have some people join us by phone.

During today's meeting, each agenda item will be presented by a member of the staff. Following each presentation, the Chair will ask the Commissioners for questions or comments. The Chair will then ask the audience for questions and comments. After that, the Commissioners will finish their discussion and vote.

Those of you who are joining us on Zoom will have two options to ask questions and comments. If you would like to speak, click, or tap on the "RAISE HAND" button on the menu bar on the bottom of your screen at any time during the agenda item. You will be called on and will have the opportunity to speak to the Commission and the audience.

If you prefer to type your question or comment, click, or tap on the "Q&A" button on the menu bar at the bottom of your screen at any time during the agenda item. Once all attendees have had an opportunity to speak, I will read out loud any written questions and comments that have been posted to the Q&A.

For those joining by phone, we're unable to take spoken testimony, however, you can email your questions and/or comments to the Commission at Planning@phila.gov. This meeting will be recorded and posted to our website.

Mr. Wysong turned the meeting over to the Commission Chair Anne Fadullon, to begin the meeting.

1. Approval of Minutes from October 21, 2021

Motion duly made by Commissioner Eiding and seconded by Commissioner Gaston to approve the October Minutes as written (00:02:36). Motion carried unanimously to approve (7-0).

2. Executive Director's Update.

A. Item in Accord with Previous Policy

- i. Streets Bill 210930: Amending Section 5 of an Ordinance (Bill No. 200423) approved November 10, 2020, entitled "Authorizing Keystone Property Group ('Owner') to construct, own, and maintain a proposed exterior building ramp at 100 South Independence Mall West, Philadelphia, PA 19106 ('Property'), all under certain terms and conditions," by extending the period for compliance with the terms and conditions stated therein.

The purpose of this Bill is to extend the time line for compliance with the terms and conditions of the original bill, Bill No. 200423, which was to permit the construction of an exterior building ramp at 100 S. Independence Mall West. The Planning Commission approved Bill 200423 on October 20, 2020.

The Planning Commission approved the original Bill No. Bill 200423 on October 20, 2020.

ii. Streets Bill 210931: Amending Section 5 of an Ordinance (Bill No. 200092) approved March 11, 2020, entitled "Authorizing Independence Park Hotel ('Owner') to construct, own, and maintain a proposed exterior building ramp at 235 Chestnut Street, Philadelphia, PA 19106 ('Property'), all under certain terms and conditions," by extending the period for compliance with the terms and conditions stated therein.

Purpose of this Bill is to extend the time line for compliance with the terms and conditions of the original bill, Bill No. 200092, which was to permit the construction of an exterior building ramp at 235 Chestnut Street. The Planning Commission approved the original Bill No. 200092 in February 2020.

iii. Streets Bill 210932: An ordinance authorizing various encroachments on North Broad Street in the vicinity of 1344-1348 Arch Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107, under certain terms and conditions.

A proposed building ramp, located along the east Right-of-Way line of North Broad Street, from a point approximately ten feet eleven inches (10'-11") north of the Cuthbert Street north Right-of-Way line to a point approximately twenty-nine feet one inch (29'-1") farther north and encroaching upon the east footway of North Broad Street approximately eight feet three inches (8'-3") toward the west (the "Encroachment").

A minimum eleven feet (11'-0") of clear passable sidewalk space is to remain after installation.

Staff recommendation is for approval on all Items in Accord with Previous Policy.

Ms. Sharpe commended the Commission members, who didn't miss a beat as they continued the in-person meetings in a remote setting and thanked them for continuing their dedication to serving the City of Philadelphia. Additional thanks to the staff of Planning & Development, in particular, staff of the Planning Commission and additional staff of the division of Planning & Zoning, who not only transitioned quickly to remote work to recreate new processes and platforms for their work to continue but, has done it so shinningly. Further remarks continued.

Chair Fadullon added that staff have just been above and beyond amazing. They kept the wheels turning in the city, and a lot of the positives that they see coming out of the pandemic, directly related to the work that they see coming from the staff. It's been an incredible time and it's just been very amazing and humbling too, to watch the staff rise to the occasion and cannot thank them enough.

3. **Announcement**

Chair Fadullon stated that Action Item: Kensington North of Lehigh (Auburn) Redevelopment Area Plan Amendment had been removed from the agenda. Rather than having the properties disposed of through the Redevelopment Authority and the Redeveloper Agreement, those properties are being transferred to the Land Bank and they will be disposed of through the Land Bank.

4. **Action Item: Zoning Bill 210926: An Ordinance to amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Crispin Street, Willits Road, Academy Road, and Frankford Avenue. Introduced by Councilmember O'Neill on November 18, 2021. (Presented by Keith Davis)**

Staff recommendation is for approval.

Seeing no further questions and comments from the Commission or Public, Chair Fadullon asked for a motion at the minute mark in video (00:13:01).

Motion duly made by Commissioner Eiding and seconded by Commissioner Gaston to accept staff recommendation for approval.

Chair Fadullon polled the Commission for the vote: Commissioner Valle, Commissioner Eiding, Commissioner Waxman, Commissioner Capita, Commissioner Castle, Commissioner Gaston, Commissioner Syrnick, and Commissioner Summerville. Motion carried unanimously to approve (8-0).

5. **Action Item: Zoning Bill 210922: An Ordinance to amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Fountain Street, Umbria Street, Paoli Avenue, Ridge Avenue, Livezey Street, Valley Avenue, and Henry Avenue. Introduced by Councilmember Jones on November 18, 2021. (Presented by Ron Bednar)**

Staff recommendation not for approval.

This Bill proposes to change the zoning designations of land along Ridge Avenue from CMX-2.5 Commercial Mixed Use to CA-1 Auto Oriented Commercial. This area has seen a significant uptick in development projects that are changing the established development patterns of the neighborhood.

The Commission staff recognizes the concerns of residents and the demand that the increased density has on the existing community. We would like to continue to work with the Council office and neighborhood to address these ongoing concerns through additional mapping and updating the text of the existing Neighborhood Commercial Area overlay to create a long-term solution for the community.

The proposed action will encourage low-density auto-oriented commercial uses on the affected properties. The action is likely to cause a net reduction in available housing on this corridor relative to the existing zoning.

The Lower Northwest District plan made several recommendations for Upper Roxborough along Ridge Avenue to encourage a pedestrian-oriented commercial corridor. Previous legislation changed the zoning to CMX-2.5 and updated the NCA for the area to promote this type of development and get away from the CA-1 type of small-scale auto-oriented commercial with parking lots along Ridge Avenue.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark in video (00:16:55).

Commissioner Waxman wanted to know about the zoning change: if the current land uses were auto oriented and what were the current uses. Chair Fadullon explained Commissioner Waxman question: what the existing uses were currently on the sites, that were proposed to be rezoned. Mr. Bednar stated that the existing use, is CMX-2 and the uses were mixed. Further information was added by Ms. Sharpe.

Commissioner Valle wanted to know if someone could comment on the perspective of the zoning Bill and what was being presented as a reason behind doing that. Ms. Sharpe and Mr. Bednar explained.

Questions and comments from the Public at the minute mark in video (00:23:43).

Mark Zachary spoke not in support of staff recommendation.

Celeste Hardester would like to discuss how to modify the overlay.

Alison Weiss stated perhaps, part of the problem might be the height of these CMX developments and the lack of parking in already congested areas.

Seeing no further questions and comments from the Commission or Public, Chair Fadullon asked for a motion at the minute mark in video (00:29:25).

Motion duly made by Commissioner Syrnick and seconded by Commissioner Eiding to accept staff recommendation of not for approval.

Chair Fadullon polled the Commission for the vote: Commissioner Valle, Commissioner Eiding, Commissioner Waxman, Commissioner Capita, Commissioner Castle, Commissioner Gaston, Commissioner Syrnick, and Commissioner Summerville. Motion carried unanimously to approve staff recommendation of not for approval (8-0).

6. **Action Item: Zoning Bill 210933: To amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Snyder Avenue, Weccacoe Avenue, Wolf Street and Swanson Street. Introduced by Councilmember Squilla on November 18, 2021. (Presented by Jonathan Goins)**

Staff recommendation is for approval.

This remapping was requested by a private party, to facilitate the redevelopment of the site consistent with the proposed zoning district, ICMX. The proposed development scheme features auto-oriented retail.

PCPC Staff drafted the Bill at the request of the private party, in coordination with the council office.

The South District plan recommended no change to the existing industrial zoning for this site, as the existing building on the site was still in active industrial use. Surrounding industrially zoned properties were remapped in 2013, primarily to ICMX or CA-2, and the proposed ICMX zoning, and proposed auto-oriented retail for this site are consistent with the general vision for appropriate uses in the area as laid out in the South District Plan.

Potential Impacts: A remapping to ICMX would preclude the current medium industrial use on the site.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark in video (00:32:23).

Commissioner Gaston verified that CMX was Commercial Mixed-Use and asked if it would support the proposed development. Mr. Goins said yes, but it would not allow what was there previously. Discussion continued on the topic.

Questions and comments from the Public at the minute mark in video (00:34:09).

Ron Patterson commented on the environmental conditions, proposed supermarket, and light industrial self-storage use on the property.

They met with the Whitman Council Civic Association and obtained their support, with some understandings and conditions that they will certainly continue to return to them to show progress of the project and what the actual uses will be once they're secured.

Seeing no further questions and comments from the Commission or Public, Chair Fadullon asked for a motion at the minute mark in video (00:35:32).

Motion duly made by Commissioner Syrnick and seconded by Commissioner Eiding to accept staff recommendation for approval.

Chair Fadullon polled the Commission for the vote: Commissioner Valle, Commissioner Eiding, Commissioner Waxman, Commissioner Capita, Commissioner Castle, Commissioner Gaston, Commissioner Syrnick, and Commissioner Summerville. Motion carried unanimously to approve (8-0).

- 7. Action Item: Zoning Bill 210957: To approve amendments to the University of Pennsylvania Master Plan in the area bounded by Walnut Street, 34th Street, Spruce Street, and 40th Street, related to the Graduate School of Education building at 3700 Walnut Street. Introduced by Councilmember Gauthier on December 2, 2021. (Presented by Keith Davis)**

Staff recommendation is for approval.

The University of Pennsylvania wishes to consolidate adjacent entrances to the existing GSE and Stiteler building by renovating the entrances and redeveloping the adjoining courtyard.

The project will renovate 16,900 sq. ft of existing building and create 16,200 sq. ft of new space to support new student collaboration space, mixed-use classrooms, an innovation lab, and offices.

University of Pennsylvania staff met with PCPC staff to introduce the project and discuss next steps on September 17, 2021. It was determined that the project's size and scope was below the threshold that would require PCPC's Civic Design Review.

This proposal is consistent with *Philadelphia2035* objective 2.3.1. "Encourage institutional development and expansion through policy and careful consideration of land resources". Further, with the addition of the proposed project, the University of Pennsylvania remains compliant with its SP_INS District regulations governing floor area ratio, occupied area, and parking requirements (see Supporting Materials, below).

Potential Impacts: The Master Plan process inherently promotes urban infill by encouraging development within institutional boundaries, and subsequent SP_INS District development regulations help ensure that parking demands are met.

This project qualifies as a Major Amendment to a Master Plan because it introduces more than 2,500 sq. ft of new gross floor area, per 14.304.4 of the Philadelphia Code.

Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark in video (00:42:03).

Commissioner Summerville requested clarification if the utilities were along 37th Street, or the courtyard, along the walkway. Mr. Davis responded that there's a 60-foot right-away, and 60-foot clearance between the Stiteler Building and the Annenberg School to account for the utilities, This proposal will take the Graduate School of Education will align with the Stiteler Building and preserve the 60-ft. right-away between the Annenberg Center, and this new project. The utilities [gas and water] are under the 37th Street walkway. Commissioner Capita expressed that the rendering shows that it could be a really nice project, and a way to update the building, as well as the use.

Seeing no further questions and comments from the Commission or Public, Chair Fadullon asked for a motion at the minute mark in video (00:43:50).

Motion duly made by Commissioner Capita and seconded by Commissioner Valle to accept staff recommendation for approval.

Chair Fadullon polled the Commission for the vote: Commissioner Valle, Commissioner Eiding, Commissioner Waxman, Commissioner Capita, Commissioner Castle, Commissioner Gaston, Commissioner Syrnick, and Commissioner Summerville. Motion carried unanimously to approve (8-0).

This concluded action items of the December 9, 2021, Planning Commission.

Chair Fadullon asked for a motion to adjourn at the minute mark in video (00:45:00).

Motion duly made by Commissioner Eiding and seconded by Commissioner Summerville to adjourn. The Commission voted all in favor, to adjourn the December Planning Commission.

**The next Planning Commissioner will be held Thursday, February 17, 2022, at 1:00 p.m.
via Zoom Platform.**

SUMMARY

1. Approval of Minutes from October 21, 2021

APPROVED

2. Executive Director's Update. A. Item in Accord with Previous Policy

- i. Streets Bill 210930: Amending Section 5 of an Ordinance (Bill No. 200423) approved November 10, 2020, entitled "Authorizing Keystone Property Group ('Owner') to construct, own, and maintain a proposed exterior building ramp at 100 South Independence Mall West, Philadelphia, PA 19106 ('Property'), all under certain terms and conditions," by extending the period for compliance with the terms and conditions stated therein.

- ii. Streets Bill 210931: Amending Section 5 of an Ordinance (Bill No. 200092) approved March 11, 2020, entitled "Authorizing Independence Park Hotel ('Owner') to construct, own, and maintain a proposed exterior building ramp at 235 Chestnut Street, Philadelphia, PA 19106 ('Property'), all under certain terms and conditions," by extending the period for compliance with the terms and conditions stated therein.

- iii. Streets Bill 210932: An ordinance authorizing various encroachments on North Broad Street in the vicinity of 1344-1348 Arch Street, Philadelphia, PA 19107, under certain terms and conditions.

3. Announcement: Kensington North of Lehigh (Auburn) Redevelopment Area Plan Amendment was removed from the agenda.

4. Action Item: Zoning Bill 210926: An Ordinance to amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Crispin Street, Willits Road, Academy Road, and Frankford Avenue. Introduced by Councilmember O'Neill on November 18, 2021. (Presented by Keith Davis)

APPROVED

5. Action Item: Zoning Bill 210922: An Ordinance to amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Fountain Street, Umbria Street, Paoli Avenue, Ridge Avenue, Livezey Street, Valley Avenue, and Henry Avenue. Introduced by Councilmember Jones on November 18, 2021. (Presented by Ron Bednar)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION NOT FOR APPROVAL, WAS APPROVED

6. Action Item: Zoning Bill 210933: To amend the Philadelphia Zoning Maps by changing the zoning designations of certain areas of land located within an area bounded by Snyder Avenue, Weccacoe Avenue, Wolf Street and Swanson Street. Introduced by Councilmember Squilla on November 18, 2021. (Presented by Jonathan Goins)

APPROVED

7. Action Item: Zoning Bill 210957: To approve amendments to the University of Pennsylvania Master Plan in the area bounded by Walnut Street, 34th Street, Spruce Street, and 40th Street, related to the Graduate School of Education building at 3700 Walnut Street. Introduced by Councilmember Gauthier on December 2, 2021. (Presented by Keith Davis)

APPROVED

Attended	User Name (Original Name)	Email	Join Time	Leave Time	Time in Session (minutes)	Country/Region Name
Yes	Citizens Planning Institute	donna.carney@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:48	46	United States
Yes	Greg Waldman (PCPC Staff)	gregory.waldman@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:06	12/9/2021 13:47	42	United States
Yes	Juanda Myles	theameaglewillfly@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:14	12/9/2021 13:48	34	United States
Yes	Hal Schirmer	halschirmeresq@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:21	12/9/2021 13:47	26	United States
Yes	Jason Wallace	jasonwallace747@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:25	23	United States
Yes	Jason Wallace	jasonwallace747@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:25	12/9/2021 13:26	2	United States
Yes	Jason Wallace	jasonwallace747@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:28	12/9/2021 13:47	20	United States
Yes	Jason Wallace	jasonwallace747@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:47	12/9/2021 13:48	1	United States
Yes	Alex Smith	alex.smith@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:12	12/9/2021 13:48	36	United States
Yes	Ron Patterson	rpatterson@klehr.com	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:39	37	United States
Yes	Kacie Liss (she/her)	katherine.liss@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:09	12/9/2021 13:48	39	United States
Yes	Dawn Summerville	dawn.summerville@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:04	12/9/2021 13:05	1	United States
Yes	Dawn Summerville	dawn.summerville@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:12	12/9/2021 13:12	1	United States
Yes	diane fiske	dianefiske@eaerhlink.net	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:48	46	United States
Yes	Celeste Hardester	celestehardester@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:48	45	United States
Yes	Mason Austin	mason.austin@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:04	12/9/2021 13:48	44	United States
Yes	Sarah Chiu# Planning Commission	sarah.chiu@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:48	45	United States
Yes	Brett Feldman	bfeldman@klehr.com	12/9/2021 13:04	12/9/2021 13:48	44	United States
Yes	Jametta Johnson	jametta.johnson@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:05	12/9/2021 13:48	43	United States
Yes	greta cooney	grcooney@upenn.edu	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:48	45	United States
Yes	Mo Rushdy	mrushdy@riverwardsgroup.com	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:15	12	United States
Yes	Brian Wenrich	brian.wenrich@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:06	12/9/2021 13:08	3	United States
Yes	Brian Wenrich	brian.wenrich@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:16	12/9/2021 13:48	32	United States
Yes	Eva Lew	evalew@upenn.edu	12/9/2021 13:43	12/9/2021 13:48	5	United States
Yes	a weiss/SoLo	awfromhh5@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:48	45	United States
Yes	Michele Gaffney (She/Her)	michele.ann.r@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:18	15	United States
Yes	Laura Spina	laura.spina@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:40	12/9/2021 13:47	8	United States
Yes	Kelly Yan	kyan@pennrose.com	12/9/2021 13:14	12/9/2021 13:48	34	United States
Yes	mark zachary	zachary587@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:48	45	United States
Yes	Ian Litwin	ian.litwin@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:21	12/9/2021 13:48	27	United States
Yes	Ian Hegarty (PCPC Staff)	ian.hegarty@phila.gov	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:48	45	United States
Yes	Hadji Maloumian	hamaloumian@gmail.com	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:18	15	United States
Yes	Ke Feng	kefeng@upenn.edu	12/9/2021 13:03	12/9/2021 13:48	46	United States