



The Philadelphia Art  
Commission  
Established 1911

## Minutes The Philadelphia Art Commission November 10, 2021 - 9:30 a.m. Remote – Zoom Meeting – Hosted by DPZ

Robert Roesch  
Chair

Members Present: Carmen Febo San Miguel, Deborah Cahill, José Almiñana, Matthew Miller, Pepón Osorio, Raed Nasser, Robert Roesch, Sarah McEneaney

José Almiñana  
Deborah Cahill  
Carmen Febo San Miguel  
Sarah McEneaney  
Matthew Miller  
Raed Nasser  
Pepón Osorio  
Mario Zacharjasz

### **Meeting of the Philadelphia Art Commission**

C. Beige Berryman  
Staff

*Beige Berryman – staff member of the Art Commission – introduced the Zoom platform and remote Art Commission process, noting that the meeting is being recorded and those participating in the meeting are giving their consent to be recorded. A link to the recording, will be posted on the Art Commission website and the meeting agenda and materials can also be found on the website at:*

*(<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/>).*

*Ms. Berryman polled the commission via roll call announcing a quorum, then stated a few instructions for the public. Members of the public may comment on agenda items during the meeting. When the agenda item that you are interested in is being discussed, you can use the “raise hand” feature and staff will unmute you during the public comment period. If you’re joining by phone, you can also use the hand raise feature by dialing \*9 during the public comment period, and if you have any submitted comments through email, staff will read those emails out loud at the appropriate time. Thank you.*

*Chair Roesch called the meeting, then Claudia Becker, Art Commission counsel, completed the swearing in for Commissioner Deborah Cahill. Ms. Becker, Chairperson Roesch, and the Commission congratulated and welcomed Commissioner Cahill.*

*Commissioner McEneaney recused herself from the November agenda items.*

## Minutes

- October 13, 2021 meeting minutes

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked if there was a motion to approve the minutes and did a consensus vote of the Commission at (00:04:54).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Osorio, the Commission voted unanimously to approve the October minutes (7-0).*

## Report of the Sign Committee – October 27, 2021

Second Reviews:

1. **165-21**  
**Sugar Factory**  
1214 Chestnut Street

First Reviews:

1. **195-21**  
**Compass**  
1430 Walnut Street
2. **196-21**  
**TD Bank**  
399 Market Street
3. **197-21**  
**&pizza**  
1800 Chestnut Street
4. **198-21**  
**Jeni's Ice Creams**  
1901 Chestnut Street
5. **199-21**  
**Federal Donuts + Goldie**  
112 S 19 Street
6. **200-21**  
**T Mobile**  
1500-1506 Walnut Street
7. **201-21**  
**American Vegan Center**  
17-19 N 2nd Street

**8. 202-21**  
**Villekebabs**  
1722 Sansom Street

**9. 203-21**  
**Children's Dental and Orthodontic Associates**  
615 Chestnut Street

**10.204-21**  
**Giant**

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion to approve the Sign Committee recommendations (00:06:06).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner José, Commissioner Cahill, Commissioner Carmen, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Miller, Commissioner Pepón, and Chairperson Robert. The Commission voted unanimously (7-0).*

### **Administrative Agenda**

**1. 205-21**  
**Bus Shelter Upgrades – batch 3**  
**Various locations**

Review Type: Encroachment in the public right-of-way  
Project Details: 6 locations around the city  
Submitted By: Intersection

Ms. Berryman presented five administrative items beginning at (00:07:20).

This is the third batch of replacement bus shelters that staff have reviewed this year. Structures with the outdated design will be replaced with the current bus shelter design. Six locations throughout the city are being considered with this submission and all six location locations are proposing new shelters where currently no shelters exist. Staff have reviewed each location in terms of Complete Streets standards. While the recommended walking zone dimensions cannot be met at all locations, the shelters offer improved conditions.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked if there was a motion to approve the administrative item at (00:08:00).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Miller, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner José, Commissioner Deborah, Commissioner Carmen, Commissioner Raed, Commissioner Matt, Commissioner Pepón, and Chairperson Robert. The Commission voted unanimously (7-0).*

**2. 211-21**

**Southwest Pollution Control Plant  
8200 Enterprise Avenue**

Review Type: Minor construction project located on City property

Project Details: Site improvements

Submitted By: Trans-Pacific Engineering Corp.

This item is submitted on behalf of the Philadelphia Water Department. This project will improve the treatment facility with the following scope of work: utility relocations, building a dumpster bay addition, installing a reinforced concrete driveway, bollards and curb cut features, and routine building facade repair work. All exterior work has very low visibility without significant impact on the public realm.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked if there was a motion to approve the administrative item at (00:09:19).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner José, Commissioner Deborah, Commissioner Carmen, Commissioner Raed, Commissioner Matt, Commissioner Pepón, and Chairperson Robert. The Commission voted unanimously (7-0).*

**3. 210-21**

**Carpenters' Hall  
320 Chestnut Street**

Review Type: Construction project located with Independence Hall Area Overlay

Project Details: Routine exterior restoration

Submitted By: Mills + Schnoering Architects

This scope of work includes exterior renovations for routine maintenance, as well as roof repairs, foundation waterproofing, and mechanical electrical and plumbing upgrades. The Historical Commission has approved this work already. The exterior restoration will include repointing, painting, and window and trim repairs. The project will have no impact on the current exterior appearance of Carpenters' Hall.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked if there was a motion to approve the administrative item at (00:10:46).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner José, Commissioner Deborah, Commissioner Carmen, Commissioner Raed, Commissioner Matt, Commissioner Pepón, and Chairperson Robert. The Commission voted unanimously (7-0).*

**4. 209-21**

**Engine 72**

**1127 W. Loudon Street**

Review Type: Minor construction project located on City property

Project Details: Interior renovation

Submitted By: Blackney Hayes Architects

Attorney Claudia Becker clarified at the start of this item why Commissioner McEneaney was recused from the November agenda items. Commissioner McEneaney learned that being a Judge of Elections is not permitted as a commissioner. Commissioner McEneaney is planning on resigning from the Judge of Elections position immediately in order to continue her service on the Art Commission.

Ms. Berryman continued. Engine 72 is proposing to renovate a storage room at the rear of the building to create a decontamination suite. The work includes an upgrade of electrical services, minor roof repair, the installation of louvers in an existing first floor window opening on the east façade, and plumbing, mechanical, and electrical work to support these items. The work is primarily interior. Exterior portions are hidden from view from the street.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked if there was a motion to approve the administrative item at (00:13:23).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner José, Commissioner Deborah, Commissioner Carmen, Commissioner Raed, Commissioner Matt, Commissioner Pepón, and Chairperson Robert. The Commission voted unanimously (7-0).*

**5. 212-21**

**Engine 56**

**832 Rhawn Street**

Review Type: Minor construction project located on City property

Project Details: Routine exterior restoration

Submitted By: Department of Public Property

This project includes exterior maintenance such as masonry cleaning, repointing, and repair work as needed. However, the hose tower will be demolished for structural safety. The building is not on the local historic register.

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked if there was a motion to approve the administrative item at (00:14:43).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner*

*Deborah, Commissioner Carmen, Commissioner Raed, Commissioner Matt, Commissioner Pepón, and Chairperson Robert. The Commission voted unanimously (6-0).*

*Commissioner Almiñana recused himself from this item.*

## **Presentations for Concept Review**

### **1. 214-21**

#### **Police District 17**

#### **1201 S 20<sup>th</sup> Street**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Exterior improvements

Submitted By: Department of Public Property

The Paschalville Library team needed more time before presenting, therefore Chairperson Roesch moved to the next item which was Police District 17.

Kim Colyar, of SMP Architects and Michelle Shuman from the City's Department of Public Property began the presentation at (00:20:40) and presented both Police District 17 and 35 projects. These are existing police district buildings that are not currently ADA accessible, so they are proposing accessibility improvements to their entrances.

At Police District 17, there is not enough room inside to provide a new ramp, so an exterior ramp and new steps are being proposed. Street tree replacement and tree pit improvements will be needed in association with this work. The ramp will be concrete and recessed lights will be installed in the new steps. The vestibule exterior door will also be replaced.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:23:13).*

Chairperson Roesch asked for clarity about the location of the lights and if they were flush with the face of the steps when recessed.

Commissioner Cahill inquired about the street trees, their species, form, and about any improvements to the tree pits. Commissioner Almiñana expressed concerns about the overhead electrical wires and asked about the height of proposed trees. Both the height between the sidewalk and the overhead wires, and the narrow width of the sidewalk are considerations for determining the replacement tree type.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for conceptual approval, with the requests to come back with additional information on the tree species, tree pit improvements, light fixture details, and height between overhead wires and the sidewalk.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Almiñana, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner José, Commissioner Deborah, Commissioner Carmen, Commissioner Raed, Commissioner Matt, Commissioner Pepón, and Chairperson Robert. The Commission voted unanimously for conceptual approval (7-0).*

**2. 215-21**

**Police District 35**

**5960 N Broad Street**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Exterior improvements

Submitted By: Department of Public Property

Ms. Colyar began the presentation at (00:31:13). This proposal is also for an exterior accessible ramp with recessed step lights, as well as door and entry storefront replacement, but at this location the North Broad Street sidewalks are considerably wider, so concerns with the clearances are not as severe.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:32:14).*

Commissioner Almiñana asked about the space between the building and the ramp, but it was clarified that the ramp is flush with the building. He then asked if street trees can be added. The possible restraints of the subway would need further investigation. Planters could be a viable alternative but would need a maintenance plan. The project team will look into these options more fully.

Chairperson Roesch inquired about the materials of the ramp, and if the fascia could be upgraded to brick to match the building rather than concrete.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked for a motion for conceptual approval with requests to come back with additional information on the possibilities of including large planters and a brick fascia (00:37:24).

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Almiñana and seconded by Commissioner Cahill, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner José, Commissioner Deborah, Commissioner Carmen, Commissioner Raed, Commissioner Matt, Commissioner Pepón, and Chairperson Robert. The Commission voted unanimously for conceptual approval (7-0).*

**3. 213-21**

**Paschalville Library**

**6942 Woodland Avenue**

Review Type: Construction project located on City property

Project Details: Significant site and building improvements

Submitted By: GFW Group

Elizabeth Ackerman and Matthew Funk gave the presentation. The Paschalville Library is at the corner of Woodland Avenue and 70th Street. The site is bounded on three sides by streets and the back of the property sits against the property line. Mature trees surround the building.

The interior will undergo renovations, including improving the central skylight to mimic the effect of natural light. Mechanical and electrical systems will be upgraded. Serious water infiltration issues will be addressed around the perimeter. Community engagement has been part of the process thus far.

The main entrance from 70th Street will be improved to include a universal entrance, which is the primary goal of the proposal. The new ramp does not attach to the building and its design maintains the symmetry of the building's elevation. A new bench sits in front of the ramp and reuses existing granite piers. The ramp is clad in limestone and the railing is metal. In order to eliminate a change in height between the upper landing of the ramp and the interior floor level, the main door has been lowered, resulting in a reduction of the height of the transom window above the door.

One of the challenges with this project is water infiltration along the east elevation. Window wells will be removed to help resolve this, but the trim work around the enclosed windows will remain.

Matthew Funk continued to describe the landscape plan, including a plaza, planters, and street trees.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (01:14:03).*

Chairperson Roesch asked if the Percent for Art requirement applies to this project, which it does. He then asked about the visual appearance of the horizontal railing interrupting the beauty of the doorway, it appears very heavy in the rendering. The drawing will be corrected. Further conversation continued between Chairperson Roesch, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, and Mr. Funk about raising the level of the doors and the transom window adjustment, exterior window replacement, and the transparency of the railing design. Lastly, a request was made to add figures on the drawings for a better sense of scale.

Commissioner Almiñana stated that he would like to see a grading and drainage plan for the site to understand how the improvements around the building are going to be implemented to avoid intrusion of water. Also, he would like to see how the proposed planters were drained since there are adjacent windows.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel asked if the project had been already submitted to the Historical Commission and approved.



Ms. Ackerman responded that they had a preliminary discussion with staff to get general feedback on proposal. They have not had a formal review. Counsel to the Art Commission, Claudia Becker, added that the Philadelphia Historical Commission's approval must be obtained before the final Art Commission approval. The current Art Commission review is for conceptual approval consideration.

Seeing no further questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Roesch asked if there was a motion for conceptual approval and gave a summary of the requests made for the next review. Additional information should be provided about the grading and drainage, planter details, more detailed renderings of the railings, and a general idea about the Percent for Art component. Finally, the Philadelphia Historical Commission's review should be completed before returning to the Art Commission.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Nasser, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission: Commissioner José, Commissioner Deborah, Commissioner Carmen, Commissioner Raed, Commissioner Matt, Commissioner Pepón, and Chairperson Robert. The Commission voted unanimously for conceptual approval (7-0).*

The November 10, 2021 Art Commission was adjourned at the minute mark (01:26:26).

**The next Art Commission will be held Wednesday, December 8, 2021 at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom.**