Progress on the City’s Racial Equity Strategy

First Cohort of Ten City Departments, 2021
By 2023, all City of Philadelphia departments will complete a racial equity action plan, identifying strategies to produce greater racially equitable impact relevant to each agency’s mission. Over the past year, with technical assistance from the City’s consulting partner Equity & Results, the first ten City departments participated in the multi-year strategy to identify root causes of disparate outcomes and implement customized strategies for implementation based on departmental capacity and vision consistent with the Mayor’s directive for a more racially equitable Philadelphia.

These ten departments include:
- Office of the Mayor
- Department of Commerce
- Department of Licenses & Inspections
- Department of Planning and Development
- Department of Public Health
- Department of Records
- Department of Revenue
- Philadelphia International Airport
- Philadelphia Parks and Recreation
- Procurement Department
City of Philadelphia Racial Equity Strategy

FY21 Objectives

- Assess key practices, procedures, and policies to advance racial equity.

- Develop and implement action plans intended to produce racial equity related to agency mission, internally and externally.

  Learn and internalize an anti-racist results-based-methodology ("RBA") to improve impact

  Solve for culture change required internally

  Build the "muscle" to continuously incorporate racial equity principles into organizational work

  Create customized priority strategies for sustainable implementation consistent with Mayor’s vision

  Serve as models/champions for other Departments challenged by implementation
Racial Equity + Results Based Accountability

Racial Equity: a process + outcome

- **As an outcome**, we achieve racial equity when race no longer predicts one’s socioeconomic, political, and life outcomes.

- **As a process**, we apply racial equity when those most impacted by structural racial inequity, including communities and employees of Color, are meaningfully involved in the creation and implementation of the institutional policies and practices that impact their lives.

Results-Based Accountability:

- A data-driven, decision making process that offers a rigorous way of thinking and taking action to improve the conditions of the people we serve (**RESULT**), in which the process starts with the **RESULT** and works backward towards means-strategies for getting there.
Result(s): Condition(s) of well-being for all people

Indicators

Root Causes

Programs
Policies
Functions
Whole org

Better off measures

Population Level

Performance Level
Definitions of Terms

**Result:** A condition of well-being for children, adults, families or communities. Babies Born Healthy, Children Succeed in School, Safe Communities, Clean Environment, Prosperous Economy

**Racial Equity Indicator:** A measure to help quantify the achievement of a result. Rate of low-birth weight babies, high school graduation rate, crime rate, air quality index, unemployment rate

**“Hot” Root Cause:** Critical factors that contribute to racially disproportionate, systems-level outcomes for communities of color.

**Better Off Measure:** A performance measure of how well a program, agency or service system is working.

**Priority Strategy:** The key strategies employed by departments to address the root causes and advance greater racially equitable outcomes.
Office of the Mayor: All residents and visitors in Philadelphia feel safe and secure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RACIAL INEQUITY INDICATOR</th>
<th>“HOT” ROOT CAUSES</th>
<th>BETTER OFF MEASURES</th>
<th>PRIORITY STRATEGY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Poverty Rate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(by race/ethnicity + persistent disparity for Black and Latinx households)</td>
<td>Citywide culture where initiating racial equity practice not lifted up within and across departments (siloed acts)</td>
<td>#/% of departments explicitly advancing results-driven racial equity strategies</td>
<td>Departmental Citywide Racial Equity Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conversations on race not normalized across government</td>
<td># of employees’ capacity to (a) discuss and (b) implement racial equity practices through their work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of widespread leadership understanding and resources to prioritize Equity vs Equality</td>
<td># of racial equity programs/policies implemented</td>
<td>PHL Racial Equity Impact Lab Elevate examples of racial equity programming to more depts for leadership, including through A-Team, Cabinet, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>City distribution of resources and decision making processes around racial equity are vague (gatekeeping culture)</td>
<td>#/% of city leadership center race in departmental conversations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>% increase feeling of inclusivity among black and brown staff members</td>
<td>% employee sense of inclusion</td>
<td>TBD Senior Leadership Accessibility &amp; Transparency Forum for staff-senior leaders interaction + decision tree dashboard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>City distribution of resources and decision making processes around racial equity are vague (gatekeeping culture)</td>
<td># of employee-driven program and policy changes implemented</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Office of the Mayor
# Department of Commerce: All Philadelphians are economically stable.

**Not Final — Work in Progress**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RACIAL INEQUITY INDICATOR</th>
<th>&quot;HOT&quot; ROOT CAUSES</th>
<th>BETTER OFF MEASURES</th>
<th>PRIORITY STRATEGY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Unemployment / Labor Force Participation Rate** *(by race/ethnicity + persistent disparity within DOA)* | • Departmental internal “weeding out” and credentializing process; culture that perpetuates “hiring people like them [white people]”  
• Departmental “weeding out” of external partners through grantmaking processes and culture that excludes by race | • TBD (anti-racist hiring as a part of performance reviews)  
• TBD (managers supported around culturally responsive feedback and conflict management) | TBD - Internal Racial Equitable Hiring Process & Leadership Accountability  
(e.g. 360 degree reviews across dept., hiring accountability scorecard, manager-focused training) |
| | | | TBD - Grant-Awards Strategic Redesign Process  
(e.g. race-explicit strategic logic model, grant distribution accountability to racial disparities, funding source waivers/analyses) |
Department of Licenses & Inspections: All Philadelphians are safe.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RACIAL INEQUITY INDICATOR</th>
<th>“HOT” ROOT CAUSES</th>
<th>BETTER OFF MEASURES</th>
<th>PRIORITY STRATEGY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Gun Violence Rates        | • Departmental culture that systematically fails to invest in largely BIPOC workforce | • % increase in BIPOC sense of belonging (employees)  
• # of BIPOC employees developed for leadership roles  
• % of BIPOC employees sense of inclusion in decision-making process of department | BIPOC staff development and advancement strategy  
(sub-elements below) |
|                           |                   |                     | Racial Equity (Supervisors and Managers) Training |
|                           |                   |                     | Create / Hire Racial Equity Coordinator |
|                           |                   |                     | BIPOC Employee Advancement Pathway  
• BIPOC employee survey/gap analysis  
• Re-evaluate/re-engineer career ladders for targeted fields  
• Leadership/management pathway for eligible employees |
### Department of Planning & Development: All Philadelphians are healthy, secure and successful in their homes and neighborhoods.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RACIAL INEQUITY INDICATOR</th>
<th>“HOT” ROOT CAUSES</th>
<th>BETTER OFF MEASURES</th>
<th>PRIORITY STRATEGY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Housing Cost Burden</strong></td>
<td>• Traditional city planning and development practices increase white wealth that has been built on suppressing Black wealth</td>
<td>• Wealth gap shrinks (residents)</td>
<td>TBD - Black Neighborhood Repairative &amp; Preservation Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Affordable housing strategies and programs have further marginalized BIPOC communities and not built wealth</td>
<td>• More BIPOC city planners (department employees by race/ethnicity)</td>
<td>e.g., anti-displacement zones ensuring existing residents benefit from growth, pay community members for policy design, cross-train and advance PHDC to DPD, Development Services give more community support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Department structures are complicit in gentrification: The city is “pro-development.”</td>
<td>• More BIPOC homeowners (residents)</td>
<td>TBD - Homeownership and Wealth Building Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• TBD (department employees by race/ethnicity)</td>
<td>e.g., dollar house program, institutions subsidize homeownership opportunities for nearby residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Affordable housing strategies and programs have further marginalized BIPOC communities and not built wealth</td>
<td>• #/% increase of BIPOC developers acquiring and developing land (developer)</td>
<td>City Land Distribution Racial Equity Policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• More (Equitable) Neighborhood Conservation Overlays (local resident measure)</td>
<td>Race-explicit, transparent, staff-resourced RFPs/dispositions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Department of Planning & Development**
Department of Public Health: All Philadelphians are free, with the right to live to their fullest potential.

• **Priority Strategy**: Implement anti-racist policies as part of the effort to promote more African Americans and other people of color to management positions.

• **Priority Strategy**: Improve quality of health care facilities and services in the African American and Hispanic, Latino/a/x communities.
### Department of Records: All residents are confident, secure, and experience wealth (transferred).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Racial Inequity Indicator</th>
<th>&quot;Hot&quot; Root Causes</th>
<th>Better Off Measures</th>
<th>Priority Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Citywide Deed Fraud       | • Unprotected and non-probated estates of deceased BIPOC homeowners  
                           • Gentrifiers allowed to steal BIPOC homes | • % reduction in deed fraud reports received by department  
                                                                 • # of fraudsters prosecuted  
                                                                 • TBD (strengthened notary system) | Enhanced Fraud Guard (for BIPOC)  
                         Expanded searchable database, regulations, notary collaboration, fraud alert notice |
|                           | • Absence of priority coordinated educational outreach with BIPOC re: deed fraud/stolen wealth | • % reduction in deed fraud reports received by department  
                                                                 • TBD (impact measure with public relations firm) | Culturally Responsive Public Relations Campaign  
                         Public relations firm, media campaign focused on BIPOC seniors |
|                           | • Deed fraudsters move with impunity across gentrifying areas in the City | • % increase in deeds rejected due to flags (deceased owner and focal community)  
                                                                 • % reduction in deed fraud reports received by department | Deed Rejection Implementing Regulation  
                         State vital statistics, deed examiner training, new policy |

**Department of Records**

---

**Equity & Results**
Department of Revenue: All Philadelphians feel financially stable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RACIAL INEQUITY INDICATOR</th>
<th>&quot;HOT&quot; ROOT CAUSES</th>
<th>BETTER OFF MEASURES</th>
<th>PRIORITY STRATEGY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Median Household Income    | • Delinquency processes highly concentrated in African American and Hispanic neighborhoods  
                              | • Departmental culture of providing services BIPOC communities need vs "treating everyone the same (equity vs equality) | • % change in Department utilization of baseline data for racial equity-focused decision making (internal mapping)  
                              |                                                                                  | • % increase in BIPOC utilization of assistance programs / agreements  
                              |                                                                                  | • % decrease in BIPOC real estate referrals | **Auto-Enroll BIPOC Resident Strategy**  
                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                   | Assistance program targeted expansion |
|                            | • Racial trauma of BIPOC employees within Department not supported or addressed    | • % increase in BIPOC job satisfaction  
                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                  | • % increase in BIPOC employee satisfaction with Department response to racial trauma/ trauma-informed practices | **Culturally Responsive Communications Campaign**  
                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                   | Communications collaboration with BIPOC stakeholders for tax or water fees support |
|                            |                                                                                  |                                                                                   | **Racialized Trauma Training & Resource Hub**  
                              |                                                                                  |                                                                                   | Self-assessment, public health partnership, and BIPOC-led HR resource center |
### Divison of Aviation: All people in Philadelphia thrive.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Racial Inequity Indicators</th>
<th>&quot;HOT&quot; Root Causes</th>
<th>Better Off Measures</th>
<th>Priority Strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Median Household Income (by race/ethnicity + salary disparity within DOA) | • Historical systems that exclude people of Color  
• Historical systems that preserve white privilege | • Reduction in salary disparity within DOA  
• Increased individuals of color in exempt, managerial and supervisory roles  
• Increased entry points for job seekers at DOA  
• Sustained employee engagement | Equity-Driven Workforce Development Program  
(Apprenticeship program, internal upskilling, external engagement initiatives, career awareness and employee development) |
| • Systems that perpetuate an individual fear of knowledge or understanding regarding race issues | • Passing course exams by a certain percentage  
• Understanding and practical application of content  
• Increased engagement with staff to measure progress | Foundational Learning/Training Program  
(Beginning with senior leadership and expanding to all DOA staff, Anti-Hate awareness campaign with PHL stakeholders) |
| • Policies that appear race-neutral but have adverse racial impact | • Eliminate disparities (gross receipts and # of businesses) for Black/Latinx/Hispanic business owners  
• Opportunity to create generational wealth through opportunities to grow businesses  
• More job opportunities for individuals from respective communities  
• Precedent-setting effort (First in the nation) | U.S. DOT Waiver Strategy in Concessions  
(Allows DOA to set Black/Latinx/Hispanic goals for Airport Concessions Program) |

**Division of Aviation**
Philadelphia Parks & Recreation: All people in Philadelphia feel pride and peace, experience joy and laughter, and can create good memories in public spaces.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RACIAL INEQUALITY INDICATOR</th>
<th>&quot;HOT&quot; ROOT CAUSES</th>
<th>BETTER OFF MEASURES</th>
<th>PRIORITY STRATEGY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Violent Crime Rate (disproportionately affecting BIPOC) | • Departmental pattern and practice of failing to engage teenage youth of color  
• Youth have valuable (and ignored) community knowledge/solutions | • % increase in transitioning summer job participants to year round  
• TBD successful engagement measure (teens)  
• TBD communications/social media measure | Philadelphia Youth Network  
Racial Equity Partnership  
Near-term action focus groups with current PYN teens |
|                          | • Departmental sites in BIPOC communities challenged by sustainable staffing and employee perceptions of safety | • % improvement in staff perception and observation of target sites  
• Resident perception of issue resolution  
• Facilities measure - site changes or improvements  
• % decrease in staff isolation / increase in sense of collaboration with community | Staffing Expansion and Reorganization Strategy  
"Hot spot" identification, ranger utilization/expansion, stewardship, training |

**Parks & Recreation**
**Procurement Department**

All residents and businesses in Philadelphia experience equality and opportunity.

### Racial Inequity Indicator

**City Contracting Dollars Awarded**

(by race/ethnicity; MBEs awarded less than 18% of all contracts)

### "Hot" Root Causes

- Citywide deference to "race neutral" "lowest bidder" regulation across all major contracts
- Culture of nepotism in subcontracting
- Lack of internal City integrated racial equity vision for contracting and participation
- BIPOC businesses feel disconnected and/or lack access to competitive contracting resources

### Better Off Measures

- TBD (policy change measure)
- TBD (organizing/participating measure)
- %/# increase $’s awarded to MBEs as prime contractors (long term)
- TBD cross-department measure (collaboration, etc.)
- # increase MBE subcontractors on contracts
- % increase in new BIPOC subcontractors awarded projects (including value)
- % increase in BIPOC awareness/engagement with contracting resources
- Increase in new MBE contractors bidding on City opportunities

### Priority Strategy

- **Lowest-Bid Policy Change Stakeholder Organizing Strategy**
  - Convene and organize stakeholders, community town halls, regulation redesign
- **Internal Economic Opportunity Task Force**
  - Procurement/OEO expanded collaboration focused on BIPOC subcontractors and policies
- **Culturally Responsive Social Media Campaign**
  - Communications and visual aids to increase awareness of City resources

---

**Procurement Department**
Thank you