OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the properties at 1400, 1406-18 and 1420 S. 3rd Street, known as the Sacred Heart of Jesus Church and associated rectory and former convent buildings, and list them on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

Under Criteria C, D, and H, the nomination contends that the complex exemplifies the evolution of the “Picturesque Eclectic Style” by incorporating variations of architecture associated with the movement across the three buildings. The nomination also argues that the siting of the nominated properties, along the expanse of Moyamensing Avenue, provided a welcome open space close to the congestion of Washington Avenue, further demonstrating how the complex reflects the “Picturesque Eclectic Style.”

Under the Criterion E, the nomination argues that the church building is significant for its association with the prolific architect Edwin F. Durang, whose designs shaped ecclesiastical architecture in Philadelphia.

The steeple of the church has been removed, but the complex is otherwise in nearly in original condition.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the properties at 1400, 1406-18 and 1420 S. 3rd Street, satisfy Criteria C, D and E, but not Criterion H.
1. **ADDRESS OF HISTORIC RESOURCE** (must comply with an Office of Property Assessment address)
   - Street address: 1400, 1406-18, and 1420 S. 3rd Street
   - Postal code: 19147

2. **NAME OF HISTORIC RESOURCE**
   - Historic Name: Sacred Heart of Jesus Church
   - Common Name: as above

3. **TYPE OF HISTORIC RESOURCE**
   - Building
   - Site
   - Church with contributing Rectory and (former) Convent

4. **PROPERTY INFORMATION**
   - Condition: [ ] excellent [ ] good [ ] fair [ ] poor [ ] ruins
   - Occupancy: [ ] occupied [ ] vacant [ ] under construction [ ] unknown
   - Current use: Worship site; residence for clergy (Rectory).

5. **BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION**
   - Please attach a plot plan and written description of the boundary.

6. **DESCRIPTION**
   - Please attach a description of the historic resource and supplement with current photographs.

7. **SIGNIFICANCE**
   - Please attach the Statement of Significance.
   - Church only:
   - Period of Significance (from year to year): from 1872 to
   - Date(s) of construction and/or alteration: 1872-1877; 1887.
   - Architect, engineer, and/or designer: Edwin F. Durang
   - Builder, contractor, and/or artisan: James Doyle (builder/contractor)
   - Original owner: Archdiocese of Philadelphia
   - Other significant persons: -----
CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION:
The historic resource satisfies the following criteria for designation (check all that apply):

(a) Has significant character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth or Nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past; or,

(b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or,

(c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style; or,

(d) Embodying distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen; or,

(e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or,

(f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials or craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation; or,

(g) Is part of or related to a square, park or other distinctive area which should be preserved according to an historic, cultural or architectural motif; or,

(h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community or City; or,

(i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or

(j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the community.

8. MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES
Please attach

9. NOMINATOR
Organization ____________________________ Date ________________

Name with Title: Celeste A. Morello, MS, MA Email _______

Street Address 1234 South Sheridan Street Telephone 215.334.6008

City, State, and Postal Code Philadelphia, PA 19147-4820

Nominator ☐ is ☑ is not the property owner.

PHC USE ONLY

Date of Receipt: 2 June 2021

☑ Correct-Complete ☐ Incorrect-Incomplete Date: 29 July 2021

Date of Notice Issuance: 30 July 2021

Property Owner at Time of Notice

Name: OFFICE OF PROPERTY SERVICES ARCHDIOCESE OF PHILADELPHIA

Address: 222 N. 17TH ST

City: PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103 State: PA Postal Code: 19103

Date(s) Reviewed by the Committee on Historic Designation: 30 August 2021

Date(s) Reviewed by the Historical Commission:

Date of Final Action: 3/12/18
BOUNDARIES:

As of May, 2021, Sacred Heart of Jesus' parking lot is still listed for sale.

Measurements of the parcel on left are those from the actual real estate listing from the broker.

Below, the corresponding aerial view with property and buildings' (original) dimensions.

(Sources: Multiple Listings Service(MLS) and GoogleMaps.)
The combined boundary description for the properties at 1400, 1406-18, and 1420 S. 3rd Street is as follows:

Beginning at a point at the southwest corner of Reed and S 3rd Streets thence West along Reed Street approximately 77 feet; thence South approximately 93 feet; thence West approximately 76 feet; thence South approximately 69'; thence East along Gerritt Street approximately 170 feet to the northwest corner of Gerritt and S 3rd Streets; thence North along S 3rd Street approximately 199 feet to the point of beginning.
SACRED HEART of JESUS NOMINATIONS

The Church is the primary, with flanking contributing buildings constructed after the Church.
Above: Northward view to show succession of additions behind Sacred Heart Convent along Gerritt Street.

Left: Unidentified projection at northwest corner of Sacred Heart Church, on Gerritt Street, looking northeast.

20th century addition: Chapel. (Non-contributing.)
Below: Lot presently (May, 2021) for sale is not contributing. (It will probably be sold by the time of review by the PHC.) View is southward from Reed Street. Addition at northwest corner of Rectory is a space above a car-port. Modern garage is not contributing.

Church's north transept and clerestory are seen in distance, behind fencing/wall.
Several photographs of Sacred Heart church are in the c.1910 "Album" of architect Edwin F. Durang, such as this one. (Catholic Historical Research Center, Philadelphia.) This photo was taken before Durang's 1904 contracted work to the Convent's south wall.
DESCRIPTION:

The three(3) nominated properties will be separately described and include information not on record and information to correct the Pennsylvania Historic Resource Survey Form of August 20, 1980. (Survey Code 061-87860-01406.) All of the properties are in "fair" condition, with attrition from the neglect in providing basic cleaning, painting and concrete patching to certain areas of the exteriors. All buildings face South Third Street in a row.

SACRED HEART of JESUS CHURCH: Design by Edwin F. Durang in 1872; dedicated in 1877. James Doyle, contractor/builder, erected the "Picturesque Eclectic/Victorian Gothic" design; southern transept is longer than northern; pentagonal roof over apse with flat western (altar) wall. The church building is elevated above ground/street level by about 4' with two separate flights of granite stairs leading from the two portals (north, at the tower; center/main) to the north side aisle and nave respectively. The basilican nave, side aisles under clerestories and gable roof bear Gothic exterior elements; shallow buttresses between the windows (installed 1945-1946 by the PJ Reeves Studios, Philadelphia); Gothic arches in the doorways and various window frames; pitched roof of variegated slate and patches; oculus under facade gable, but within larger Gothic shaped window.

The quirky appearance includes an asymmetrical facade and how the architect's design moved southward and then wrapped the south tower around for a portal within a cylindrical unit with an octagonal tower above. This whimsical feature has diamond-shaped colored glass in the narrow windows. The tower is shorter than the northern tower which typifies Gothic ones (but usually has its "companion" tower opposite). Three stages with different designs

and number of windows or aperatures with Gothic arches are divided by horizontal courses of slate, or "Ohio limestone," as noted in the 1877 news report. Originally, a steeple was atop the tower, but as removed, has a masonry crown finishing the rims on the tower. Additions at the church's west side include a 20th century concrete chapel and unrecorded attachments, some utilized.

The two portals on Third Street are individually designed, but coordinate with the steep pediments over archivolts holding quatrefoils (in "shadow" on the main portal because it was damaged and not repaired) and the tower portal at the north where the quatrefoil enrobes the Sacred Heart of Jesus bas relief. (Refer to page 19.)

The church's ashlar masonry is intact, well-pointed and of a gray granite. Variations in the color scheme are: Aberdeen reddish granite on the main portal's column shafts; Pennsylvania bluish granite on the columns in the tower porter and supporting the Gothic window over the main portal. Capitals are the "Stiff leaf" design. Stone corbel tables run from the main portal's gable while smaller dental mouldings line the cornices in stone at the clerestories.

This dental moulding is one of the unifying details seen on all three buildings.

SACRED HEART CONVENT: No verified information was available on the architect or builder. Durang's "Album" did not name this building, but the additions at the Convent's south (Gerritt Street) wall were by Durang. The convent dates from c. 1875 for the parish clergy. By 1893, after renovations to extend the western side, this building became the "Convent" when the priests moved to the new Rectory, leaving this building for the teaching Sisters.

Prominent among the building's architectural characteristics is the mansard roof with rounded corners. Decorated dormers are on the third level, above two levels with Tudor arches at the windows. The same gray stone matches the church. The placement of the

---

4 See Tatman, S. and Moss, R., Biographical Dictionary of Philadelphia Architects, p. 490 where George Lovatt in "1898" did "add't'l bld."
5 Mahony, D., Historical Sketches...1895, p. 130; Kirlin, Rev. J., Catholicity in Philadelphia. 1909, p. 400.
unremarkable main portal to the Convent is at the north wall, hidden but for a narrow space between the convent and south tower of the church. (See page 18, right, bottom.)

The recent photograph (April, 2021) on left was made to compare to Durang's "Album" photo below which details his south wall additions: the projecting bay windows supposedly installed in "1904" (T&M, p. 233; Kirlin, p. 473.)

There are six bays on this convent building proceeding westward, with most in need of repairs. The building appeared to be unoccupied/unused from its unkempt appearance.

There did not seem to be any space between the west wall and church and the additions to the church. The PHC will determine which bays merit designation.
SACRED HEART RECTORY: There was no available, verifiable information on an architect or builder, but the architect of the Sacred Heart School, William P. Regan of Lawrence, Massachusetts was named in the 1946 "Diamond Jubilee Book"(no record). A priest lives in this 37' by 71' gray stone three-story building with several additions: the three-story veranda/porch on the south wall; the one-story wooden passageway at the southwest corner attached to the mid-point of the church; the car-port with a second level space; a one-story polygonal addition. (See page 22). The garage or Reed Street is non-contributing. The parking lot at the west of the Rectory is currently "for sale" and would not be part of this nomination.

The Rectory's design holds many neoclassical details decorating its pleasant symmetrical facade. The portal on the first level is between spaced windows, leaving attention to the groupings of windows on the second and third levels which form units under canopies and slightly project to the single windows on the floors above the double portal. There are no remarkable arches, but the window units' masonry encircle each group and have a classical bas relief in the center embellishment. Pilasters with curving volutes at the top flank the facade's bay while the dental moulding under the cornice adds the final touch. The roof is flat. The photos on the next page (taken in April, 2021) show that the gray stone is limited to the facade while the rest of the building is red brick. There is space between the Rectory and Church, accessed by a contemporary Samuel Yellin-like wrought iron gate with flowers in iron as the main motif. There are many areas that need concrete patching, especially the west and north walls. Basic cleaning and painting (with caulking) are long in need.

There is a basement level; concrete; the church is elevated about 30" above ground level. The building needs care.
Recent (April, 2021) photographs are the realistic depictions of a rectory building in need of fundamental cleaning, painting (with caulking) and concrete patching.

This building has an office on the first level and the residential areas for the pastor, the sole occupant.

Left: south wall and space. Church is to left.
Below: Decorative late 19th century wrought iron gateway.
STATEMENT of SIGNIFICANCE:

The three nominated buildings of Sacred Heart of Jesus parish in Pennsport represent two of the three phases in the "Picturesque Eclectic Style" which concurrently was used in England and in the United States through most of the 19th century. The Picturesque Eclectic involves the Gothic (generically), but deviates from the medieval conventions for designs that are "irregular," "asymmetrical," have "variety" and "intricacy" of the forms in creating the whimsical buildings that are identifiable to that Victorian Era. Art historians have placed our City Hall, the Pennsylvania Academy of the Fine Arts and the Ebenezer Maxwell mansion within the Picturesque Eclecticism: they are unusual, have a spontaneity in their components and move from the classical strictures in architecture.

Sacred Heart church's architect, Edwin F. Durang was in the early years of his career where he would become the Archdiocese of Philadelphia's main designer in ecclesiastical, then institutional buildings for clergy to administer. From about 1867 to about 1873, in at least four churches in Philadelphia, Durang used the Picturesque Eclectic Style for church design, where his peers used it in public secular buildings. Tracking the work of Frank Furness, Durang pursued his path to notoriety by these four Roman Catholic churches, where their constructions were overlapping and gaining attention to his skills. At the time, he was competing against the architects chosen to participate in designs for the Centennial Exposition at Fairmount Park.

Durang's choice of the Picturesque Eclectic was proper in consideration of the church's location on the expansive Moyamensing Avenue, which is a grand open space from busy Washington Avenue: this is the proper context for a Picturesque Eclectic grouping.

Sacred Heart of Jesus parish buildings...

(c) Reflect the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style:

PICTURESQUE ECLECTIC

and they

(d) Embody distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style which

(h) Owing to the unique location... represent the established and familiar visual feature of the Pennsport neighborhood.

The three aforementioned criteria interrelate where the Picturesque Eclectic is very distinguishable on buildings and the style is mainly applied to buildings which are sited in very noticeable areas to enhance what the architectural style articulates.

Yale University art historian Meeks's research on the origins of the Picturesque Eclectic Style relied upon the "Essays" written by Sir Uvedale Price, which were published in London from 1794 to 1810. Price's Essays named "the Picturesque" and he was able to discern how the style repudiated lingering Neoclassicism in England. This style would eventually arrive in the United States and be used in residential architecture just prior to institutional application. Meeks categorized the five architectural characteristics which define Picturesque Eclecticism as:

1. "roughness": building surfaces and a textural quality;
2. "movement" in the flow of the architectural elements;
3. "Irregularity" and "asymmetry" in the forms of the building;
4. "variety" of forms, with the addition of "polychromy" (colors);
5. "Intricacy" of the architectural forms in how they interrelate.

There are also three "phases" of the Picturesque Eclectic:

a) 1840s-1850s: mainly in residential architecture;
b) 1860s-1870s: "the period of maximum exuberance"; and,
c) 1880s-1900s: return of classicism; Richardsonian influences.

Meeks, pp. 227-228; 232, with reference to the style in the United States.
The scenic qualities in the Sacred Heart of Jesus parish buildings have been consistent from the church's construction in 1872-1877:
The Durang photo on right is c.1910, with the April, 2021 image below to compare. The removal of the steeple is the only change, but still the buildings hold the broad perspective on the street to keep attention to the buildings.
Some familiar Philadelphia buildings were culled by art historians as examples of the Picturesque Eclectic Style, to wit: The Ebenezer Maxwell Mansion (1859) which Webster described as having an "irregular silhouette," "archvolt treatment of the recessed entrance," and combination of "Romanesque" with "French Renaissance." The construction is "rough" (as Meeks would write), with varied shapes of windows. Webster also calls the design "High Victorian Eclecticism."\textsuperscript{9}

City Hall (1871-1881) was chosen by Meeks as an "(O)utstanding example(s) of the second phase" of Picturesque Eclecticism. Webster agreed, adding the "Second Empire style" with it. Of particular curiosity to Meeks was the City Hall tower: "highly inventive."\textsuperscript{10}

Then there is the Pennsylvania Academy of the Fine Arts (1872-1876) which Brown called a "Ruskin-inspired mélange of materials and textures--rusticated brownstone..." This art historian phrased the Picturesque Eclectic as "an imaginative pseudo-Gothic manner in which medieval details were manipulated for picturesque effects."\textsuperscript{11}

Of the Roman Catholic churches which uncharacteristically bore the Picturesque Eclectic, they were all by Edwin F. Durang and they fall within the second phase: 1860s to 1870s. These will be discussed at criterion (e). These four Catholic churches deviated from the traditional "Catholic" styles (Romanesque, Gothic and Baroque) in their purity, and combined the styles, added the qualities which Price identified for "picturesque" designs, and apparently established Durang within the architect community.

The pages following have details of Picturesque Eclecticism in all three Sacred Heart parish buildings, to which passages from Meeks' paper for "The Art Bulletin" (1950) are attached for reference.

\textsuperscript{9} Webster, op.cit., p. 253.
\textsuperscript{10} Meeks, p. 234; Webster, p. 140.
\textsuperscript{11} Brown, op.cit., p. 252.
Looking southwest, these photos show French Gothic and English Gothic elements within the Pictoresque Eclecticism of irregularity and variety of forms.

The closer detail of the portal at the church's south wall, is one to compare with the north tower's portal with its Gothic arch, but within a square, not cylindrical form. The French Empire convent to the left of the church presents another type of style to distort from angled to rounded corners, and with Tudor (English) arches over the windows, not the usual rounded.
Architectural elements such as these rounded and polygonal forms are why Meeks called the 1860s and 1870s "a period of maximum exuberance" in the Picturesque Eclectic. He began his discourse on the second phase by noting that "American architecture through most of the nineteenth century... was English." John Ruskin's writings also were imprinted on the Picturesque with ENGLISH Gothic. This period was also one of "experimentation" with architecture and the result of combining styles and forms became labelled as Picturesque Eclecticism.

In the second period certain treatments allow which had been gradually evolving. These include: the rejection of frontality, the wider use of asymmetry, and the dominance of verticality. One of the tests of the presence of the picturesque is the degree to which frontality has been eliminated. The academic principle of considering a building as made up of one or more façades to be seen from a distance on an axis perpendicular to the plane of the façade, gave way, in the fully developed picturesque, to a desire to have the building seen in the round and from many points of view, from each of which the various masses would compose differently.

(p.233)

Quotes from pages 232-233.
Below, the two facade portals are dissimilar, even in the colors of their columns' shafts and placement. But, these units demonstrate Durang's ability to combine the components so that they can articulate well together, despite the differences in the French Gothic elements from the English Gothic capitals and shafts. (Fletcher, p. 504)

Intricacy is the fifth quality. It is the opposite of Woëflin's classical "clearness." It is an outgrowth of the baroque "unclearness." It signifies that the forms and their relationships are complex and not immediately discerned, that curiosity is aroused, that the beholder must make an effort to decipher them and that his interest will be provoked by his temporary perplexity. Ruskin's "redundance" with its implications of "lavish, or abundant" is related.

In the 1850's another element was added to the repertoire. Fostered by Ruskin's crusade for honesty in the use of materials, polychromy, in the form of constructive coloration, became a popular method of increasing variety. Examples are the Oxford Museum and Waterhouse's Assizes, followed in this country by the buildings of Peter B. Wight, Ware, and Van Brunt, etc. What had begun as a desire for truthful expression of material led to an exhibitionistic display of varied materials, contrasting voussoirs, and patterned slate roofs.
Art historian Sir Bannister Fletcher provided more definition to the generic Gothic with the English ones below which are different from French or German or others. Sacred Heart church's north portal is incorporated within the square tower, as those below, imitating the stages and fluted steeples.

The French Gothic arch was adapted by the English.

Portals within individual towers are in English Gothic churches.

English Gothic churches often divorced facade towers to a single unit, whereas the traditional French maintained a tripartite, uniform set of portals.
### COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

This comparative table contrasts the differences in the development of the Gothic style in France and England.

#### FRENCH GOTHIC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PLAN S. (p. 560A, 561.)</th>
<th>Cathedrals are short, wide, and lofty.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Length about four times the width.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloisters rare, except in the south, owing to the lay origin of French cathedrals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transsepts have slight projection, as at Paris (p. 5316) and Amiens (p. 560B), or they are absent, as at Bourges (p. 561A).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lateral chapels numerous for the popular worship of saints and the saying of masses (p. 5633).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The apsidal east end developed into the 'chevet' by addition of processional aisle and chapels (p. 560B). Laon, Dijon, and Poitiers are exceptions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aisles are sometimes double, as at Notre Dame, Paris (p. 532A).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### ENGLISH GOTHIC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PLAN S. (p. 560A)</th>
<th>Cathedrals are long, narrow, and low.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Length about six times the width.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cloisters usual, owing to monastic origin of many English cathedrals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transsepts have bold projection and secondary transepts are found, as at Salisbury (p. 560A), Lincoln (p. 410A), Canterbury (p. 411B), and Rochester (p. 412B).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lateral chapels rare in those cathedrals which were designed for monks and not for laymen.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The square east end replaced the apse, while the 'Chapel of the Nine Altars', at Durham, forms an eastern transept.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Westminster has the French 'chevet'.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aisles are both in sanctuary and the characteristic west front is that of Wells Cathedral (p. 403B).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### FRENCH GOTHIC

| COLUMNS. | Plain cylindrical piers are characteristic, as at Paris (p. 531F, 532A, 5560), where the vaulting shafts start awkwardly above the square abaci of the arcade columns (p. 567A, C). Square piers, with attached three-quarter columns, owing to Roman tradition (p. 564A), are found in the south. Piers are sometimes without capitals, as at Lieuson, when the arch mouldings die into the cylindrical piers, and the vaulting shafts rest on corbels. |
| MOULDINGS. | Large, less varied (p. 566B), and not so ornate as in England and often at some distance from window openings. In the late Flamboyant period mouldings were almost as deeply undercut in stone as in wood and only limited by the granular nature of the material. |
| ORNAMENT. | Decorative figure sculpture reached its greatest perfection in the cavernous doorways of the west fronts of Paris (p. 532A), Amiens, Rheims, (p. 543), and in the north and south porches of Chartres (p. 566B, E), where numerous tiers of statues in niches surround the arches (p. 538F, 557). |

#### ENGLISH GOTHIC

| COLUMNS. | Clustered piers are special features, as in Salisbury and Exeter (p. 530B, q), and were preferred to cylindrical piers. The adoption of ornamented shafts to continue the lines of the vaulting ribs largely determined the form of piers and avoided the difficulty met with in France, and the characteristic evolution of moulded piers in each period was controlled by the increasing number of vaulting shafts (p. 593). |
| MOULDINGS. | Bold, rich, and of great variety and applied to bases, capitals, and pier arches, as well as door and window openings (pp. 503, 557). Mouldings show gradual development from the pronounced bow ties and deep hollows of the early period to the flat bracket moulding of the late period. |
| ORNAMENT. | Decorative figure sculpture was not as freely used, or of such high quality as in France, and was not confined to portals, but was spread over whole façades, as at Wells, Lichfield, and Exeter. The 'dog-tooth' baluster, and Tudor rose enriched the hollow mouldings (p. 508). |

Stained glass was developed on similar scales.
Sacred Heart Rectory is of the last phase of the Picturesque Eclectic, "a swing toward more classical detail," and Richardsonian styling. (Meeks, p. 234)

These two extensions demonstrate how the architects compromised with a second phase addition (below) with the (left) at the Rectory.

The final phase of the picturesque extending from the 1880's to World War I was characterized by a rejection of the extreme verticality of the preceding decades and a swing toward more classical detail. Movement of the masses was more restrained and the number of parts used reduced. These changes can be observed in the silhouette which subsided from the jagged effect of the second period. The stupendous roofs of the Victorian Gothic and the Second Empire are lowered, and often omitted. The main mass is predominantly horizontal. The skyline is still an important consideration but the earlier bristles and spikes are replaced by stumper blocks terminating in bubbles as in the Reichstag or the War Office in London. An American example is the Library of Congress. Richardson's works of the eighties show the same subsidence. His round-arched Romanesque motifs are as appropriate for the new phase as the classical arches and squared domes of the Beaux-Arts vocabulary. Both systems were associated in the Chicago Fair of '93.
Sacred Heart church, the primary nomination...

(e) Is the work of a designer, architect...whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City...

EDWIN F. DURANG
(1829-1911)

Past nominations on buildings designed by Durang focussed on the architect's successful career as the Archdiocese of Philadelphia's main designer of churches, especially during the time when Archbishop Patrick J. Ryan was in charge, from c.1884 to his death in 1911.

This discussion will, for this nomination, present information relevant to the years when Durang had designed his first Roman Catholic churches: c.1867 to the 1870s in the City, drawn in Picturesque Eclecticism. An examination of Durang's life during those years, and what may have influenced his choice of style, will be likewise addressed. Sacred Heart of Jesus' parish buildings are certainly part of this personal account of Durang, and are significant in the architectural history of the City at the time of the church's construction.
According to the list compiled by Tatman and Moss on local architects, Durang's profession as an architect began with one project in "1859," with the next in "1863." There had to be more work credited to him, but not available on record. Thus, Durang is hired for three public schools before he obtains his first commission for an ecclesiastical building: Our Mother of Sorrows church in West Philadelphia. Tatman suggested that when Durang apprenticed with John E. Carver in 1857, upon his death in 1859, Durang continued in his office, with some experience in ecclesiastical architecture. Carver had designed but one Roman Catholic church, St. Paul's in South Philadelphia, a Gothic in the mode of Samuel Sloan's designs for the carpenter-builder. St. Paul's is a country-style Gothic: Carver's St. James the Less Protestant Episcopal Church (1846-1850) was described by Webster as a "re-creation of a 13th century English country parish church." (p. 294) Durang's St. Andrew's Roman Catholic Church (below) imitates Carver's designs from the 1840s. Then, Durang's pupil, Frank Watson copied Durang's St. Andrew's design for St. Leo's in 1884. (Inset)

St. Leo's in Tacony, recently arsned.

St. Andrew's was in Newtown and razed for a mid-20th century design.
Prior to St. Andrew's in Bucks County, Durang had opportunities in Philadelphia to learn what his peers were doing, especially as the City prepared for a "Centennial" celebration. West Philadelphia, where the country's one-hundredth anniversary would be the stage for various exhibition areas, had been developing into a suburban-like residential community with groups of the descendants of the Irish famine refugees advancing economically. Their movement was east to west; Roman Catholic churches were to follow where residential development began. Durang, with but few building designs to his credit by about 1866, was hired to design a church for a parish to be named to honor Our Mother of Sorrows. It would be a church in a east-west orientation and facing a large park, with excess land to the church's west which later would become Cathedral Cemetery.

Durang was also commissioned for a design of "St. Johannaes (sic) Lutheran Church,\textsuperscript{12}" in the Spring Garden area of North Philadelphia. Not far from there, on Broad Street was a project by a young Frank Furness (1839-1912), ten years Durang's junior and about to be "the city's leading architect" in a few years.\textsuperscript{13} Furness had designed an unusual, asymmetrical Romanesque, very ornate and with projections at the facade, including an exotic "onion" dome atop its single tower. The design was for the Rudolf Shalom Synagogue (now demolished for another, later design), an Orthodox Jewish site. Durang had to have noticed it en route to his supervision of the St. Johannes church--the Furness building drew attention with every architectural part. (Refer to page 29.)

Durang was nearly 40 and had very little in his portfolio. Furness' reputation at the same time, was one of promise and he would gain more commissions in his own way, and by determination and ambition in his drafts. Furness' work meant progress in the profession of architecture, coinciding with the newly formed American Institute of Architects by Thomas U. Walter here in 1857.

\textsuperscript{12} Tatman and Moss, op.cit., p. 230.
\textsuperscript{13} Webster, op.cit., p. 48.
"The Public Ledger" on October 2, 1871 named the City's most active and reputable architects who rallied behind the American Institute of Architects (AIA) Rules to assert their profession and why James H. Windrim's plans should be credited to him and implemented by him, and not subsequently given to Furness.

Below is the Ledger report, with "Edwin F. Durang" between John McArthur (of City Hall's design) and Thomas U. Walter (U.S. Capitol dome designer). Both of these architects had also had experience in the awarding of contracts for City-owned properties. All of the architects named in the report, essentially were opposing Furness. Durang had not been an AIA member as the others.

It was during this litigation and time of observing Furness' projects closely when Durang was hired to design Sacred Heart church.
Durang left no journals or personal records on his life as a Roman Catholic architect in a City where Protestants and Quakers held prominence in the skilled professions. Thomas U. Walter strove to place architects into a class apart from the carpenters who used the "pattern books" such as those composed by Sloan for the self-employed and self-taught. However, in a lawsuit brought against the City by James H. Windrim, the architect of the Philadelphia Masonic Temple and many commercial and institutional buildings, the City's premier architects sided in support of Windrim, and against Frank Furness, the defendant with the City. An Injunction was filed before a trial in which it was alleged that the City used Windrim's drawings for a new House of Corrections and then gave Windrim's work to Furness, who claimed Windrim's work was really his.14

In Windrim vs. The City (1871), Durang crossed into Furness yet again, but this time as near adversaries, not competitors. "The Philadelphia Inquirer" and "The Public Ledger" would name the architects who provided affidavits, and Walter's AIA's Rules of the profession were some of Windrim's evidence against Furness. Named as those supporting Windrim were: "John McArthur, Jr., Edwin F. Durang, Thomas U. Walter, Samuel Sloan, Henry A. Sims, Addison Hutton, Isaac Hobbs, John Crump and Stephen button." Furness had denied that "he is using Mr. Windrim's drawings."15

In the 1884 History of Philadelphia, the authors, Scharf and Westcott, wrote an inconclusive statement to what ensued, never faulting Furness. The young architect's talent was difficult to ignore and his commissions continued through litigation. He would design the Northern Saving Fund (1872) which Webster assigned to "picturesque," namely as with Furness' "Entrance Pavilions" at the Zoo. (1875-76).16 Durang's work during that time also mirrored Furness' in causing one sensation after another with the Picturesque Eclectic in

14 "The Philadelphia Inquirer," February 8, 1872.
15 "The Public Ledger," October 23, 1871.
16 Webster, op.cit., pp. 238; 297-298.
the City's newest Roman Catholic churches: after Our Mother of Sorrows was St. Charles Borromeo (1868-1876), St. James (1870), then Sacred Heart of Jesus in 1872. The design was a stark advancement in ecclesiastical architecture for Roman Catholic churches accustomed to preparing the faithful spiritually by the visage of the church's exterior. With Picturesque Eclecticism, the materiality and loss of perfection in classicism contrasted with the seriousness of the rites in Latin inside. The exteriors of these churches could not be reconciled with the buildings' purpose, yet four(4) Roman Catholic churches in this popular style were constructed in the City. (Refer to pages 29 and 31.)

The Picturesque Eclectic churches had been built during the tenure of Archbishop James Wood, in whose stead was the Vicar who hired (supposedly) James McArthur to design a new rectory at St. Paul's (the Carver design).17 The rectory has a mansard roof, just as Sacred Heart's rectory would have by about 1875. (But there was no record to verify if by Durang.) Archbishop Wood or the Vicar would have had the ultimate choice to approve of Durang's designs in the Picturesque Eclectic. The church buildings would have many crosses, religious bas reliefs and other decidedly "Roman Catholic" decoration for the religious distinction.

To emphasize how impressionable the Picturesque Eclectic Style was on Roman Catholic churches, the now-existing churches constructed prior to 1865 reflect a conservative, almost stunted and limited choice of architectural styles:
--St. Philip Neri (Napoleon LeBrun) Neoclassical; 1840.
--St. Paul's (Carver); Gothic; 1843.
--St. Augustine's (rebuilt by LeBrun) Neoclassical; 1848.
--St. Vincent de Paul (Koecker) Italianate; 1849.
--St. Alphonsus; Neoclassical; 1850;
--Annunciation, BVM (no architect) Gothic; c.1861.18

17 St. Paul's Rectory was nominator's submission, approved in 2019.
18 All of these churches are PHC-approved.
Are these two designs similar in the lithographs below? Furness designed the synagogue in the mid-1860s, just before Durang was hired for Our Mother of Sorrows church building. Both are Picturesque Eclectic with Romanesque, the style too closely aligned with classicism and not usually combined with the picturesque.
This is an interesting old view of St. Alphonsus' Church, as it was finished originally, before the outer stone steps were constructed.

Catholic church design underwent a significant development in the City from the 1840s to 1860s.

St. Alphonsus' church, a Neoclassical dating from the 1850s was just one block west from Sacred Heart, at Fourth and Reed Streets.

Durang's photo of the unfinished Sacred Heart church below offered diversity in design to the rows of red brick Victorian homes around both churches.

St. Alphonsus was a German national church; Sacred Heart was for those of Irish ancestry in the vicinity to the Delaware River.
Two of the four Picturesque Eclectic Catholic churches by Durang, late 1860s-early 1870s.

Saint Charles Borromeo

Above: Archdiocesan photo.

ST. JAMES CHURCH, THIRTY-EIGHTH AND CHESTNUT STREETS, PHILA.
The Philadelphia Historical Commission already approved these Roman Catholic churches designed by Durang, along with ancillary parish buildings:

Our Mother of Sorrows  St. James
St. John the Evangelist  St. Peter Claver
St. Mary Magdalen de Pazzi  St. Francis Xavier
Immaculate Conception  St. Laurentius
St. Veronica's and these churches previously submitted by the undersigned:
St. Charles Borromeo  Church of the Gesu
St. Peter the Apostle  St. Gabriel
Nativity, BVM  St. Thomas Aquinas
St. Veronica's first church/school

Edwin F. Durang's successes in ecclesiastical architecture (or in his entire professional life) rose considerably whether he was following Frank Furness' bold designs in the Picturesque Eclecticism, or architectural trends. Durang's work only had gained notice as his projects for the Archdiocese in the late 1860s to early 1870s broke with tradition and held the Picturesque Eclectic which was not "Roman Catholic" nor articulating the emotional response which the Church wanted: when at the 1877 dedication, the Sermon by Father Monahan said that "great reverence is due to God's house,"and that Sacred Heart was "dedicated forever to God." The Durang design was lauded, too: "The caps of the columns seem to blosom (sic) with stone flowers ..."("Catholic Standard and Times" October 6, 1877)(headline, right.)
Sacred Heart of Jesus' parish buildings have changed little at their facades over the decades, retaining the Picturesque Eclecticism with the French Gothic, English Gothic, Second Empire or Richardsonian. The buildings are instructional on portraying the second and third phases of this style and how effective it was in capturing the Victorian Era's varied architectural trends. They also provide the alternative to the traditional "Roman Catholic" styles in their strict conformity. Architect Durang keenly applied the Picturesque to his church design, and whomever designed the convent and rectory continued same, never allowing one building to dominate, except the church in the center.

The location of Sacred Heart's parish buildings complements these designs. Moyamensing Avenue's extra-broad and clear expanse also provides an excellent setting for the three buildings: they are a visual for a neighborhood of nondescript buildings dating from the 18th to 21st centuries, but never encompassing the architectural value as the Sacred Heart buildings.

For all of the foregoing, Sacred Heart of Jesus Roman Catholic church, and the contributing convent and rectory, qualify for historical designation by the Commission.

Celeste A. Morello, MS, MA
May, 2021
(Still during COVID limitations)
BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES: (Primary and Secondary):


Mahoney, D., Historical Sketches of the Catholic Churches...1895.


Other sources:

Catholic Historical Research Center, Philadelphia: (CHRC)

"Catholic Standard and Times" Durang's "Album"

Parish files: Our Mother of Sorrows Sacred Heart (Phila.)
St. Alphonsus St. Chas. Borromeo
St. Andrew's (Newtown) St. James

On-line: Google; pab.org.; NewsBank; Multiple Listings Service.
The exterior of this grand Roman Catholic Church is fullblown Durang at his best, a powerful interplay of rectangular and cylindrical volumes, with a curvy corner stair tower set against a massive square tower, mediated by the gable of the nave. Span buttresses, and pointed windows with wood tracery accent the front. A corbel table borders the upper edge of the gable. Next door, the rectory follows the theme of massive stone, in the rounded corners, crowned by a curved corner mansard.

The foregoing PHC nomination corrects claims on this form

This spectacular complex is the work of the most prominent post-Civil War Catholic church architect, Edwin Forrest Durang. Here Durang is at the top of his form in this rollicking and powerful scheme.

Clio Index 0008492
NOT until 1871 was St. Philip's parish divided. In the latter part of this year Bishop Wood decided to establish a new parish out of its southern end, and appointed Rev. Thomas F. Hopkins to take charge of the work. Ground for a church had already been purchased from Michael Trainer. This tract, on the west side of Third Street below Reed Street, is now covered by the church, the pastoral residence and the convent.

At first a temporary frame chapel was erected on the present site of the new pastoral residence. It was 60 feet wide and 75 feet long, and had seats for 500 persons. This structure was dedicated on December 10, 1871. Shortly afterwards ground was broken for the permanent church immediately south of it, and work was begun on the building as soon as possible. The corner-stone was blessed and laid by Bishop Wood on the feast of Pentecost, May 20, 1872, in the presence of a very large assemblage, which included the members of the literary societies of St. Philip's and St. Teresa's parishes. Very Rev. Dr. Moriarty, O.S.A., preached the day's sermon. Father Hopkins continued the work, and had the building under roof when he left in 1874. The present rector, Rev. John J. Ward, had temporary charge of the parish for a brief interval, until Rev. Thomas Quinn, late of Plattsburg, was appointed pastor. He remained for a little over two years, and was succeeded, on November 24, 1876, by Rev. James J. Fitzmaurice, who had previously been pastor of St. Agnes', West Chester. It was Father Fitzmaurice's fortune not only to have the church completed, but to build the pastoral residence, now the convent, south of it. The priests had, before the erection of this house, occupied a rented dwelling farther south on the same side of Third Street.

On September 30, 1877, the new church was dedicated, though not for nearly ten years later did it present its present imposing external appearance, when the building of the spire was finished. It then became an imposing edifice. It is designed in the Gothic style, and its massive walls are constructed of Ohio stone. It is 126 feet long and 70 feet wide. The spire is 180 feet high. A feature of the interior, besides the tasteful decoration, is the great size of the high altar, which is especially beautiful.

Mahoney, D., Historical Sketches... Philadelphia, 1895.
Sacred Heart Church, 1871

The southern part of Philadelphia had been the scene of great building operations from the consolidation of the city in 1854, and in 1871 the district to the south of St. Philip's parish was apportioned into a new parish by Bishop Wood, and the Rev. Thomas Hopkins appointed pastor. A tract of ground on the west side of Third Street below Reed Street was purchased, and work was begun on the erection of a church, the cornerstone of which was blessed on the Feast of Pentecost, 19 May, 1872, by Bishop Wood. The Very Rev. Dr. Moriarity, O. S. A., preached the sermon. In 1874 the building was almost completed, when the Rev. Thomas Quinn was appointed pastor. After two years, on 24 November, 1874, the Rev. James J. Fitzmaurice, who had been pastor of St. Agnes's, West Chester, was put in charge of the parish. He built a pastoral residence and completed the church, which was dedicated on 30 September, 1877, under the title of the Sacred Heart. Father Fitzmaurice continued the work on the church, a stone structure in Gothic style, 126 feet by 70 feet, surmounted by a graceful spire 180 feet high.

St. Elizabeth's Church, 1872

The north-western section of Philadelphia toward the Schuylkill River was a section of the city most backward in improvements at that time. The district was an open waste, filled with ponds and abandoned clay-pits. There were but one or two streets in the whole district, along Ridge Avenue, which formed a thoroughfare from the Falls of Schuylkill and Manayunk. Joseph Singerly owned most of the land in this vicinity, and, as he was anxious for the improvement of the unpromising neighborhood, he offered a suitable lot as a gift to any denomination that would erect a church within a year. Nearly every denomination of the city was asked, and refused, but Bishop Wood, with his proverbial foresight, knew that the building of a Catholic church would be a nucleus for a settlement, and therefore gladly accepted Mr. Singerly's gift. In July, 1872, the Rev. Bernard Dornhege, the present rector, who was then pastor of a German congregation at St. Clair, Schuylkill
handsome three-story frame-house, which was completed and occupied by the priests in January of 1902. The church had suffered much in the long years, and, aided by the generosity of his friends, Father Rooney completely renovated the building, by tasteful ornamentation throughout, new pews, confessionals, artistic stained glass windows, and the new main altar. A mission was opened on 15 November, 1908, at Byberry Farms, an annex to the Philadelphia General Hospital, and there Mass is said every Sunday and holiday.

Sacred Heart Church

In July 1887, Father Fitzmaurice was promoted from the pastorate of the Sacred Heart Church to the irremovable rectorship of St. Michael’s, and was succeeded by the present rector, the Rev. John J. Ward, who had been pastor of St. Mark’s Church, Bristol, for nearly nine years. Father Ward has erected one of the finest schools in the Diocese at the north-east corner of Moyamensing Avenue and Reed Streets, the corner-stone of which was blessed by Archbishop Ryan, 26 June, 1892, the sermon being preached by the Rev. Hugh T. Henry. The building was blessed 27 November, 1892, by Bishop O’Farrell of Trenton. In the following January it was opened for use, and placed under the charge of the Sisters of the Immaculate Heart of Mary. Father Ward also built the new pastoral residence on the north side of the church, and converted the old rectory south of the church into a convent for the Sisters. On 8 April, 1896, Father Ward celebrated his silver jubilee in the priesthood. On 17 May, 1903, a handsome chime of bells, the gift of the relatives of the rector, was blessed by Bishop Prendergast. During the same year Father Ward completely renovated the interior of the church, which was re-opened for divine service, 27 November, 1903, with Solemn Mass, sung by the Right Rev. Mgr. Turner, D. D., V. G. The following year the school and convent were enlarged.