



July 22, 2021

Cheli Dahal  
Department of Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, Concourse  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED-AP  
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, RA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 200 Spring Garden St (Application # ZP-2021-003489C)**

Dear Ms. Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at 200 Spring Garden Street.

The proposal is for a 13-story, 315,000 square foot mixed-use building with 360 residential units, 21,000 square feet of retail space, 83 auto parking spaces, 122 bike parking spaces, and a 12,600 square foot Public Space (to be used to qualify for a height bonus). This development will replace the existing one-story retail building currently on the site. This project is being developed in conjunction with the proposal for 412 N 2nd Street as the first phase of a coordinated redevelopment of 2nd Street between Spring Garden and Callowhill Streets by National Real Estate / KRE.

200 Spring Garden Street is zoned CMX-3 within the East Callowhill and Transit Oriented Development overlays. The base height limit is 65 feet. The proposal does not require any zoning variances and takes advantage of the following height bonuses available in the East Callowhill Overlay:

- Retail Space (+24' of height)
- Stormwater Management (+48' of height)
- Public Space (+12')

At its special meeting of July 20, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: Northern Liberties Neighborhood Association (NLNA)**

The representative from NLNA thanked the development team for making changes to their proposal in response to community feedback and for meeting with the community multiple times in advance of the CDR meeting. The redesigned ground floor better activates 2nd Street, but NLNA encourages further activation including additional retail spaces on 2nd Street.

NLNA likes the curved nature of the building design but would like to see more relief on the facades along both 2nd and Spring Garden Streets. In addition, NLNA feels that pedestrian access to the proposed public space is too limited and that the design of the auto driveway makes the space look like a private courtyard. They also commented that the commercial uses facing the interior courtyard could activate the public streets if reoriented.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



### **CDR Committee Comments**

The CDR Committee had several comments about the project and recognized the RCO's concerns. Committee members praised the playfulness of the design, specifically the interpretation of historical precedent in a modern design. In addition, the committee praised the development team for taking advantage of the bonuses available in the East Callowhill Overlay.

Most of the discussion focused on the proposed Public Space and its connection to Spring Garden Street. The committee asked the development team to redesign the entrance to the Public Space to be more inviting to pedestrians, and to "extend public amenities to all sides" of the proposal. They also underscored the importance of programming for these spaces to be successful. Planning Commission staff must approve the design of the Public Space before a building permit can be issued and are already working with the development team to address these concerns.

One committee member asked the development team to incorporate more of the playful art and landscaping elements from the public space into the public realm design for 2nd Street. Lastly, the committee amplified the staff comment that there should be a connection between 2nd Street and the Public Space.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

**Eleanor Sharpe**  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Councilmember Mark Squilla, mark.squilla@phila.gov  
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov  
Peter Epstein, National Real Estate Development, pepstein@natrealestatedevelopment.com  
Jordan Minno, KRE, jminno@thekregroup.com  
Carl St. Pierre, Pennoni Associates Inc., carlstpierre@pennoni.com  
Gary Handel, Handel Architects, ghandel@handelarchitects.com  
Ronald Patterson, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, rpatterson@klehr.com  
Stephanie Boggs, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, sboggs@klehr.com  
Ian Clark, 5th Republican Ward RCO, ianclark93@gmail.com  
Larry Freedman, Northern Liberties Neighborhood Association, larryfreedman@comcast.net  
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov  
Cheli Dahal, Department of Licenses and Inspections, cheli.r.dahal@phila.gov  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org  
Paula Bums, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



July 27, 2021

Mr. Paulose Isaac  
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-  
AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, AIA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 412 N 2nd Street (App. No. ZP-2021-003040C)**

Dear Mr. Issac:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of the proposed development of **412 N 2nd Street**.

This proposal was reviewed as part of a special meeting considering four distinct proposals within the East Callowhill Overlay (/ECO) district. It is located at the corner of N 2<sup>nd</sup> Street and Callowhill Street, immediately adjacent to I-95 with an onramp that crosses the southeastern edge of the property. The proposal includes a 23-story tower with 397 residential units above an amenity deck and over 20,000 square feet of retail space. The proposal does not require any variances and utilizes the following bonuses available in the /ECO, garnering an additional 144'-0" feet of height above the 100'-0" base allowable:

- +24'-0" Green Building 14-702(10)
- +24'-0" Stormwater Management Open Space 14-702(14)(a)
- +48'-0" Stormwater Management System 14-702(14)(b)
- +48'-0" Retail Space 14-202(1)

The Civic Design Review Committee voted to conclude the CDR process at its meeting on **July 20, 2021**. Kristine Kennedy, a representative from coordinating RCO Northern Liberties Neighborhood Association, was in attendance along with Andrew Ross of Franklin Bridge North. Mr. Ross' comments focused on the missed opportunity to activate 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, with additional concerns about the traffic impacts of the project as proposed. Ms. Kennedy commended the development team for being engaged and receptive to ideas, though she too was concerned about the proposal's internal nature, and potential conflicts from traffic exiting onto Callowhill. She was appreciative of the inclusion of murals and suggested that a dedicated drop-off zone been incorporated (per discussions at past meetings).

The CDR Committee expressed support for the project and the level of detailing shown, while also making recommendations for improvements, particularly to the pedestrian experience. The Committee had mixed impressions of the plaza proposed for the corner of Callowhill and 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, suggesting continued attention to the sound experience to ensure it is an inviting space. The team was encouraged to work with an acoustic consultant for both the plaza space and the residential tower to ensure sound was ameliorated in both locations. As with the RCO comments, the Committee asked that the team look for ways to improve the pedestrian experience along 2<sup>nd</sup> Street, suggesting lighting as one option. The focus on the proposed woonerf was commended.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



However, the team was encouraged to consider permeability through the retail spaces and site to promote more pedestrian activity beyond this woonerf area.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

**Eleanor Sharpe**  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org  
Paula Bums, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov  
Councilmember Mark Squilla, 1st Council District, mark.squilla@phila.gov  
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant to the 1st Council District, sean.mcmonable@phila.gov  
Ronald J. Patterson, Esq., Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, rpatterson@klehr.com  
Stephanie Boggs, Esq., Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, sboggs@klehr.com  
Peter Epstein, National Real Estate Development, pepstein@natrealestatedevelopment.com  
Larry Freedman, Northern Liberties Neighborhood Association, larryfreedman@comcast.net  
Ian Clark, 5th Republican Ward RCO, ianclark93@gmail.com  
Robert S. Gurmankin, Franklin Bridge North Neighbors Inc, franklinbridgenorthneighbors@gmail.com  
Paulose Isaac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.isaac@phila.gov



July 22, 2021

Paulose Issac  
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, RA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 416-38 Spring Garden Street  
(Application No. ZP-2021-004239)**

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **416-38 Spring Garden Street**.

This proposal is to build a total of 321,794 square feet comprised of one twelve-story mixed-use building including 329 residential units, 13,960 square feet for retail spaces, 87 vehicular parking spaces, and 111 bicycle parking spaces.

416-38 Spring Garden Street is zoned CMX-3 within the East Callowhill and Transit Oriented Development overlays. The base height limit is 65 feet. The proposal does not require any zoning variances and takes advantage of the following height bonuses available in the East Callowhill Overlay:

- Retail Space (+24' of height)
- Stormwater Management (+48' of height)

At its meeting of July 20, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments.

**RCO Comments: Northern Liberties Neighborhood Association (NLNA)**

At the meeting, the RCO representative mentioned that the proposal had been very well-received. The active corner of Spring Garden and N 5<sup>th</sup> Street, and the outdoor areas including café seating and amenities for the residents were among the positive elements. Also, it was mentioned that the wall art idea had not been discussed in the RCO meeting, however the RCO was very supportive of that.

The representative then mentioned that they would have liked to see additional public spaces that were not linked to the retail functions. Also, while appreciating the hidden parking on N 5<sup>th</sup> Street, they recommended dedicating some parking spaces to the commercial use. It was also mentioned that, due to multiple overlapping uses on parking entry driveway, the drive aisle near the loading zone should be expanded.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



### **CDR Committee Comments:**

At the meeting, the Civic Design Review Committee appreciated the use of bonuses and commented that their use had improved the design. The committee agreed that the proposal was a very attractive addition to the neighborhood. The use of the set back to create generous sidewalks and the variety of tree choices were greatly appreciated by the committee.

The CDR committee chair asked how the proposal was able to cover the parking area with roof top outdoor amenity space and meet their open space requirements. The development team described that since they had set the building back on two street frontages, they had met the minimum open space requirement.

A CDR committee member asked about tree pit sizes and soil volume and asked the development team to consider making larger tree pits for trees to help them live longer, specifically for the trees along the parking since the development team controls this space entirely. It was also mentioned that since N 5<sup>th</sup> Street is dangerous for bike riders, anything that the development team could do to make it safer would benefit everyone.

One committee member suggested that an empty area of the roof is a great opportunity for solar panels and ask the development team to consider adding larger green roof areas to maximize ecological and economic benefits. The development team said they would look at the possibility of adding solar panels and explained that the green space on the roof had been designed to maximize the view of the Center City including turf surfaces to take advantage of the sun while the second floor amenity space accommodated pool and park areas for residents.

Lastly, the CDR Committee adopted the Planning Commission staff comments:

#### **Site Design**

- Staff appreciates the activated ground floor including outdoor seating areas.
- The sidewalk width along 5<sup>th</sup> Street is undersized. Please ensure the sidewalk width is 12'.
- Staff appreciates addition of trees and vegetation as part of this development to enhance the public realm.
- Staff recommends differentiating the building massing/material to further define the residential entrance.

#### **Building Design**

- Staff commends the development team for an appealing and well-articulated building massing and composition, activated ground floors, and building materials. Staff supports the façade patterns in conformity with the surrounding neighborhood character.
- Staff notes concerns regarding dark stucco material and the amount of vision glazing on the south façade.
- Staff acknowledges the development team's plan on relocating the wall art that's being removed from the existing building.

#### **Parking Design**

- Staff appreciates locating the parking spaces behind the building.



- The loading path creates conflicts with the parking driveway. Staff suggests an interior hallway location for the loading corridor.
- Staff notes that the curb cut on N 5<sup>th</sup> Street creates conflicts with pedestrian and bike movement.

### **Sustainable Design**

- The proposal meets most of the sustainable design metrics, staff encourages the team to invest on on-site renewable energy to ensure a more sustainable development.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, [mdesigns@msn.com](mailto:mdesigns@msn.com)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Mark Squilla, [Mark.squilla@phila.gov](mailto:Mark.squilla@phila.gov)  
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, [sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov](mailto:sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov)  
Alexandra Schabel, Solomon Cordwell Buenz, [alexandra.schabel@scb.com](mailto:alexandra.schabel@scb.com)  
Hercules W. Grigos, Esq., Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, [hgrigos@klehr.com](mailto:hgrigos@klehr.com)  
Larry Freedman, Northern Liberties Neighbors Association, [larryfreedman@comcast.net](mailto:larryfreedman@comcast.net)  
Ian Clark, 5th Ward Republican RCO, [ianclark93@gmail.com](mailto:ianclark93@gmail.com)  
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [ian.litwin@phila.gov](mailto:ian.litwin@phila.gov)  
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [paulose.issac@phila.gov](mailto:paulose.issac@phila.gov)  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, [michelle.brisbon@phila.gov](mailto:michelle.brisbon@phila.gov)  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, [kisha.duckett@phila.gov](mailto:kisha.duckett@phila.gov)  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, [jeanien.wilson@phila.gov](mailto:jeanien.wilson@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)