



**July 9, 2021**

**Samia Akhtar**  
**Department of Licenses and Inspections**  
**Municipal Services Building, Concourse**  
**1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard**  
**Philadelphia, PA 19102**

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, RA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 23 W Girard Ave (Application # ZP-2020-007580)**

Dear Ms. Akhtar,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential development at 23 W Girard Ave.

The proposal is for a 6-story mixed-use building to replace a one-story convenience store with associated surface parking at the northwest corner of Girard Avenue and Leopard Street. The proposal is for 104,160 total square feet consisting of 5,400 square feet of retail space, 107 dwelling units, and 29 parking spaces on the first floor of the building. The site is zoned CMX-3 and there are no variances required.

The project was first heard at the June 1, 2021 CDR meeting and was asked to return. At its meeting of July 6, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: Fishtown Neighbors Association and Fishtown District BID**

At the June 1 CDR meeting, the RCOs expressed disappointment that the design of the public realm does not meet the importance of the site and that sustainable design falls short for such a prominent new project. In response, potential locations for rooftop solar energy generation were shown at the July 6 CDR meeting.

At the June 1 CDR meeting, the RCOs expressed concern about shading due to the massing of the proposed project and asked if the project incorporate setbacks to mitigate these concerns. This issue was not addressed by the design team due to cost concerns involved with changing the construction method.

At the June 1 CDR meeting, the RCOs shared concerns about the proposed locations for vehicular access on Stiles Street and loading dock on Leopard Street. Near neighbors preferred parking access also occur Leopard Street. However, the Streets Department requested that vehicular access occur on Stiles Street.

In response to RCO concerns, the design team updated the proposed elevations include additional brick detailing prior to the June 1 CDR meeting. The RCOs still had concerns with the two-story corrugated metal detailing on level six. This detail was not modified for the second CDR meeting.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



### **CDR Committee Comments**

The CDR Committee had several comments about this project and recognized the RCOs concerns.

At the June 1 CDR meeting, the Committee had numerous Site Design and Complete Streets concerns. The committee stated that the public realm design lacked detail and that proposed design for the plaza on Leopard Street is a missed opportunity to provide more green space. In addition, they requested more greening on Leopard Street and a continuous tree trench for Girard Avenue. In response, new drawings were shown at the July 6 CDR meeting which showed more planting located in window boxes and the potential for a tree trench on Girard Avenue pending approval from the Streets and Water Departments.

At the June 1 CDR meeting, the Committee had a limited number of Building Design concerns and appreciated the proposed brick detailing changes made prior to the meeting. Similarly to the RCOs, members of the CDR Committee asked if the building could be redesigned to reduce its scale to the north, away from Girard Avenue, and remove the heating and cooling units to simplify the facade design. At the July 6 CDR meeting, changes were not made to address these concerns.

At the June 1 CDR meeting, a member of the CDR Committee expressed concern that too much of the ground floor was dedicated to parking and alternatively parking should be below grade to allow for a more active ground floor. At the July 6 CDR meeting no changes were made to address this concern.

Lastly, at both CDR meetings staff and the Committee expressed a desire to see the design meet more sustainable design metrics and that sustainability should be taken more seriously given the project's transit-oriented design.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Council President Darrell Clarke, Council District 5, darrell.clarke@phila.gov  
Corey Bell, Representative to Council District 5, corey.bell@phila.gov  
Rachael Pritzker, Pritzker Law Group LLC, rachael@pritzkerlg.com  
Richard Stewart, JKRP Architects, rstewart@jkrparchitects.com  
Virginia Bravo, Bohler Engineers, vbravo@bohlereng.com  
Ian Wilson, Fishtown Neighbors Association, zoning@fishtown.org



Jessica Hoffman, New Kensington Community Development Corp, [jhoffman@nkcddc.org](mailto:jhoffman@nkcddc.org)  
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, [bjchavous@gmail.com](mailto:bjchavous@gmail.com)  
Larissa Staszkiw, Riverside of Fishtown Neighbors Association, [larissa.staszkiw@gmail.com](mailto:larissa.staszkiw@gmail.com)  
Marc Collazzo, Fishtown Kensington Area Business Improvement District, [marc@fishtownbid.org](mailto:marc@fishtownbid.org)  
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [david.fecteau@phila.gov](mailto:david.fecteau@phila.gov)  
Samia Akhtar, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [samia.akhtar@Phila.gov](mailto:samia.akhtar@Phila.gov)  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, [michelle.brisbon@phila.gov](mailto:michelle.brisbon@phila.gov)  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, [kisha.duckett@phila.gov](mailto:kisha.duckett@phila.gov)  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, [jeanien.wilson@phila.gov](mailto:jeanien.wilson@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)



**July 8, 2021**

**Paulose Isaac**  
**Department of Licenses and Inspections**  
**Municipal Services Building, Concourse**  
**1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard**  
**Philadelphia, PA 19102**

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, RA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 31 E Columbia Avenue (Application # ZP-2021-000615)**

Dear Mr. Isaac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential development at 31 E Columbia Avenue.

The project proposes to demolish an existing one-story structure and replace it with a new eight-story, mixed-use multi-family building with 70 units, an interior parking garage with 10 vehicular spaces and 30 bicycle parking spaces, and 1,035 square feet of ground-floor retail within 63,255 square feet of new gross floor area. The project will be on the same parcel as an existing five-story existing multi-family residential building, that was recently renovated from a former light-industrial use. The site is located at the corner of Front Street and Columbia Avenue. The project requires no zoning variances.

At its meeting of July 6, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: Fishtown Neighbors Association**

The RCO supported the project overall but noted several concerns at the July 6 meeting, specifically regarding the limited activation of the Front Street façade. The RCO expressed concerns that the parking lot and limited commercial space will not bring much pedestrian traffic to the Front Street commercial corridor. The RCO suggested relocating the parking garage to a nearby space off-site and replacing it with an expanded commercial space and/or visitable residential units and suggested pedestrian lighting and security cameras if the parking lot cannot be relocated.

The RCO representative noted that the project would be improved with a loading space, which would allow rideshare and delivery vehicles to access the site without blocking the right-of-way. However, neither the RCO nor the CDR Committee were able to propose an appropriate location for this loading space.

The RCO expressed support for some aspects of the project, including the use of high-quality materials, the site's integration of the existing building at 21 E Columbia Avenue, the addition of bollards to prevent sidewalk parking, and the number and placement of street trees, flower boxes, and landscaped green areas. The RCO noted that the project could be improved with additional planters at the base of street trees.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



### **RCO Comments: Fishtown-Kensington Business Improvement District**

Fishtown Neighbors Association, the Coordinating RCO, was joined by Fishtown-Kensington BID on the CDR Committee. The RCO stated support for the relocation of the retail entrance from Columbia Avenue to Front Street.

### **CDR Committee Comments**

The project was well received overall by the CDR Committee, which had several comments and recognized the RCOs concerns.

The CDR Committee agreed with both PCPC staff comments and the RCO comments noting that the project should do more to activate the Front Street corridor, and explore expanding the retail frontage along the commercial corridor. The Committee noted that parking and other building functions are required by code but agrees with RCO comments that ten interior parking spaces may not be necessary for the site. The Committee also agreed with staff comments that additional pedestrian lighting and street furniture could make the corridor more vibrant and secure, and setting back upper floors more than just the one foot as proposed would increase light and air to the corridor. Nonetheless, the Committee noted that the design of the parking garage entrance is “elegant”.

The Committee agreed with staff comments regarding the project's Columbia Avenue frontage and ground floor. Notably, the Committee appreciates the reuse of the existing former industrial building that will be incorporated into the project. The Committee also appreciated that the project enhances the pedestrian space along Columbia Avenue, by setting the new building back, which allows the new building to meet required sidewalk width along Columbia Avenue, as well as the removal of two existing curb cuts and placement of four bicycle U-racks in the furnishing zone. The Committee notes that common shared space with two benches provides a welcoming entrance to the project and the two courtyards together create a functional and aesthetically pleasing space between the new and existing buildings. However, the Committee agrees with staff in questioning how well the Juliet-balconies this close to the Market-Frankford Line will be used due to noise from passing trains.

The Committee noted that a landscape management plan is needed to maintain the public spaces and encouraged the development team to use continuous tree trenches, which would allow adequate rooting and long-term viability of street trees.

Lastly, the CDR Committee encouraged the design team to incorporate art by local artists into the project and to pursue additional sustainable design benchmarks beyond those that the project earned by virtue of the transit-accessible nature of the site's location.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.



Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, [mdesigns@msn.com](mailto:mdesigns@msn.com)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Maria Quiñones-Sanchez, Council District 7,  
[maria.q.sanchez@phila.gov](mailto:maria.q.sanchez@phila.gov)  
Sloane Folks, Representative for Council District 7, [sloane.folks@phila.gov](mailto:sloane.folks@phila.gov)  
Sean Whalen, DBA, Vintage Law LLC, [sw@vintage-law.com](mailto:sw@vintage-law.com)  
Ian Wilson, Fishtown Neighbors Association, [zoning@fishtown.org](mailto:zoning@fishtown.org)  
Jessica Hoffman, New Kensington Community Development Corp.,  
[jhoffman@nkcdc.org](mailto:jhoffman@nkcdc.org)  
Marc Collazzo, Fishtown-Kensington Area Business Improvement District,  
[marc@fishtownbid.org](mailto:marc@fishtownbid.org)  
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, [bichavous@gmail.com](mailto:bichavous@gmail.com)  
Greg Waldman, Philadelphia City Planning Commission,  
[gregory.waldman@phila.gov](mailto:gregory.waldman@phila.gov)  
Paulose Isaac, Philadelphia Department of Licenses and Inspections, [paulose.isaac@phila.gov](mailto:paulose.isaac@phila.gov)  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, [michelle.brisbon@phila.gov](mailto:michelle.brisbon@phila.gov)  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, [kisha.duckett@phila.gov](mailto:kisha.duckett@phila.gov)  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, [jeanien.wilson@phila.gov](mailto:jeanien.wilson@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)



July 6, 2021

Jais Skaria  
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, RA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 813 N Broad Street  
(Application No. ZP-2020-01112)**

Dear Jais Skaria,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential development at **813 N Broad Street**.

This proposal is to build 58,139 square feet comprised of 63 multi-family units, amenities, and 13 vehicular parking spaces. The site is bound by Broad Street to the west, Parrish Street to the north and private parcels to the east and south. The site is zoned CMX-4. There is a special exception for the use of surface parking and above grade enclosed parking in a CMX-4 zoning district.

At its meeting of July 6, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**1. 14<sup>th</sup> Democratic Ward Executive Committee:**

Nearby neighbors did not have too many concerns with the proposed project. The RCO also noted that they reached an agreement with the applicant to store trash and the dumpsters within the project limits and not in sight of pedestrians. The RCO asks for assurances going forward that this agreement will be followed.

**2. CDR Committee Comments:**

At the meeting, the CDR Committee offered the following comments, which include Planning Commission staff observations adopted by the CDR committee.

The Committee supports the proposal's inclusion of street trees and vegetation and urges more refinements to ensure their success. They urge the applicant to explore tree trenches for the street trees to achieve better long-term results. Additionally, the tree selection should include species that can achieve a significant canopy and create shade. The committee appreciates the proposed green wall as a way to reduce the impacts of urban heat island effects and encourages the applicant to explore drip irrigation and using recycled water for irrigation of this element.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)





The Committee expressed concerns with the ground floor use at the corner of Broad and Parrish Streets. The prominent corner is very public in nature and the applicant should consider a ground floor plan and use that activate the public realm. This could include a public function such as retail, the residential building lobby, and/or residential amenities.

The committee encouraged the applicant to explore a wider range of unit types, including larger units that could support families. The applicant could also do more to support sustainable design by achieving additional metrics, especially those for indoor air quality. This has great importance since the site is adjacent to a highly trafficked state roadway. Additionally, the applicant should be aware that the enclosure of the parking garage will be subject to Planning Commission staff review at the time of building permits.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, [mdesigns@msn.com](mailto:mdesigns@msn.com)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Darrell L Clarke, [darrell.clarke@phila.gov](mailto:darrell.clarke@phila.gov)  
Corey Bell, Constituent Services Representative, [corey.bell@phila.gov](mailto:corey.bell@phila.gov)  
Agata Reister, Landmark Architecture, [agata@landmarkaia.com](mailto:agata@landmarkaia.com)  
Sean Whalen, Vintage Law, LLC, [sw@vintage-law.com](mailto:sw@vintage-law.com)  
Diane Monroe, 14<sup>th</sup> Ward Democratic Executive Committee, [Diane.Davis@comcast.net](mailto:Diane.Davis@comcast.net)  
Tanya Diggs, Richard Allen New Generation, [diggstonya@gmail.com](mailto:diggstonya@gmail.com)  
Vivan VanStory, Community Land Trust Corporation, [communitylandtrustcorp0@gmail.com](mailto:communitylandtrustcorp0@gmail.com)  
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, [bjchavous@gmail.com](mailto:bjchavous@gmail.com)  
Jais Skaria, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [jake.skaria@phila.gov](mailto:jake.skaria@phila.gov)  
Andrew Kulp, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [Andrew.kulp@phila.gov](mailto:Andrew.kulp@phila.gov)  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, [michelle.brisbon@phila.gov](mailto:michelle.brisbon@phila.gov)  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, [kisha.duckett@phila.gov](mailto:kisha.duckett@phila.gov)  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, [jeanien.wilson@phila.gov](mailto:jeanien.wilson@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)





July 8, 2021

Mathew Wojcik  
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, RA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 922 N Broad Street (Application No. ZP-2021-004117C)**

Dear Mr. Wojcik,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **922 N Broad Street**.

This proposal is to build a total of 156,360 square feet comprised of one seven-story mixed-use building including 134,600 square feet for residential use (201 dwelling units), 21,760 square feet for retail spaces, 44 vehicular parking spaces, and 67 bicycle parking spaces. The site is zoned CMX-4 and there are no zoning refusals for this proposal.

At its meeting of July 6, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments. It should be noted that there were no representatives from the RCOs in attendance at the meeting.

**CDR Committee Comments:**

At the meeting, the Civic Design Review Committee agreed that the proposal was very attractive, the density was appropriate, and the façade articulation as well as the material selection were successful. One CDR committee member specifically mentioned that the transition from adjacent one-story buildings to the higher mixed-use development was interesting. The committee member discussed that although the two-story façade articulation of glazing was appealing, limiting the glazing for the residential units above the retail space would be important for privacy.

The CDR committee emphasized the importance of adding trees and tree trenches along the Broad Street sidewalk while also understanding the limitations caused by underground utilities. The committee asked the development team to look at other nearby blocks and add trees to Broad Street sidewalk where possible. They appreciated the trees along the perimeter of the rooftop. The committee also asked the development team to add bike racks to the sidewalk and integrate the existing bike share station into their building.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



The committee asked about the trash removal from the site and how the trucks would be circulating, and suggested that the development team look at loading more closely and avoid using Broad Street.

CDR Committee chairperson appreciated the underground parking, mentioning it could be a great opportunity and amenity for the residents, however asked the team to ensure they have car charging stations for electric cars. Also, it was discussed that for a project of this size on this prominent location, the opportunity for rooftop solar panels is affordable.

Lastly, the CDR Committee adopted the Planning Commission staff comments:

#### **Site Design**

- Please include a ground floor plan with Complete Street dimensions and identify everything in the public right-of-way.
- The walking zone along Girard Avenue is undersized. Staff recommends widening the sidewalk.
- Staff recommends including bike racks on the sidewalk for the customers of commercial spaces.
- Staff appreciates the building set back around the SEPTA station entrance, however, staff encourages the design team to look at better ways of articulating the relationship between the building and the SEPTA station entrance.
- Please clarify whether the commercial space is going to accommodate one tenant or many and how this will affect the public realm.

#### **Building Design**

- Staff commends the development team for activating the ground floor with addition of retail and transparent windows and supports the building massing and composition as well.
- Staff notes concerns regarding how the retail space would work on N Carlisle Street and suggests a different use for ground floor on this side to conform with the context.
- Staff recommends replacing the dark ground floor material with a lighter, more contextual one.

#### **Parking Design**

- Staff appreciates underground parking and inclusion of off-street loading, however, recommends separating the two curb cuts and relocating them from Broad Street to perhaps N Carlisle Street.
- Please consider relocating the bike storage to a more accessible location on ground floor.

#### **Sustainable Design**

- Staff suggests that the development team continue conversations with OTIS for guidance on how to incorporate the existing bike share station into the design.



- Staff appreciates inclusion of green roof and encourages the development team to meet more sustainable metrics in the energy and atmosphere category.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, [mdesigns@msn.com](mailto:mdesigns@msn.com)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Darrell Clarke, [darrell.clarke@phila.gov](mailto:darrell.clarke@phila.gov)  
Corey Bell, Constituent Services Representative, [corey.bell@phila.gov](mailto:corey.bell@phila.gov)  
Sergio Coscia, Coscia Moos Architecture, [scoscia@cosciamooos.com](mailto:scoscia@cosciamooos.com)  
Michael Phillips, Klehr Harrison, [mphillips@klehr.com](mailto:mphillips@klehr.com)  
Louise Bundy, Friends of the 47th Ward, [LouiseBundy1@comcast.net](mailto:LouiseBundy1@comcast.net)  
Darlene Cerullo, United Francisville Civic Association, [zoning@unitedfrancisville.com](mailto:zoning@unitedfrancisville.com)  
Vivian VanStory, Community Land Trust Corporation, [communitylandtrustcorp0@gmail.com](mailto:communitylandtrustcorp0@gmail.com)  
Joseph McLaughlin, Francisville Neighborhood Development Corp, [joe.mclaughlin@sodexo.com](mailto:joe.mclaughlin@sodexo.com)  
Drew Kondylas, Friends of Ogden Park, [kondylas@gmail.com](mailto:kondylas@gmail.com)  
Lewis Nash, MAP Holistic CDC, [map.nashsr@gmail.com](mailto:map.nashsr@gmail.com)  
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [David.fecteau@phila.gov](mailto:David.fecteau@phila.gov)  
Mathew Wojcik, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [matthew.wojcik@phila.gov](mailto:matthew.wojcik@phila.gov)  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, [michelle.brisbon@phila.gov](mailto:michelle.brisbon@phila.gov)  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, [kisha.duckett@phila.gov](mailto:kisha.duckett@phila.gov)  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, [jeanien.wilson@phila.gov](mailto:jeanien.wilson@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)



**July 9, 2021**

**Paulose Issac**  
**Department of Licenses and Inspections**  
**Municipal Services Building, Concourse**  
**1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard**  
**Philadelphia, PA 19102**

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, RA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 949-77 Marshall St (Application # ZP-2021-002050)**

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential development at 949-77 Marshall Street.

The proposal is for 34 single-family row homes to replace a one-story commercial building between Marshall and 6th Streets, mid-block between Poplar Street and Girard Avenue. The proposal is for 98,854 total square feet across 34 dwelling units and 68 parking spaces. The site is zoned RM-1 and there are four variances as follows:

- Off street parking (front accessed) is prohibited in RM-1
- ADA spaces: 3 required, 0 proposed
- ADA van accessible space: 1 required, 0 proposed
- Class 1a parking spaces: 12 required, 0 proposed

At its meeting of July 6, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

The CDR Committee, including the 14th Democratic Ward RCO, had several comments and suggestions for improving the project's layout. Feedback on the proposed architecture was positive.

The Landscape Architect on the CDR Committee noted that some of the planting areas at the ground floor are too small, and that maintenance will be an issue. Window boxes were mentioned as a better approach.

The Committee agreed with Planning Commission staff's comment on the lack of accessibility to the proposed pocket park both for some of the development's units and for the neighborhood at large. A suggestion was made to redesign the southern end of the project to match the northern end. This would allow the project to have two cross-block pedestrian connections and open the pocket park to the larger community. The RCO representative did not see this as an issue citing the numerous parks in the area. In addition, it was suggested that the internal drive aisles be paved with a higher quality material than asphalt.

Lastly, it was requested that the developer add an option for solar power generation on the roofs of these homes for potential buyers.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Council President Darrell Clarke, Council District 5, darrell.clarke@phila.gov  
Corey Bell, Representative to Council District 5, corey.bell@phila.gov  
Katherine Missimer, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, KMissimer@klehr.com  
Gabe Deck, Gnome Architects, gabe@gnomearch.com  
Leslie Cunningham, P.E., Cornerstone Consulting Engineers, lcunningham@cornerstonenet.com  
Tyler McNeil, Catalyst City Development, tyler@catalystcitydev.com  
Diane Monroe, 14th Ward Democratic Executive Committee, Diana.Davis@comcast.net  
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com  
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov  
Paulose Issac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@Phila.gov  
FROM: C. Beige Berryman, AICP, Urban Design Division, Philadelphia City Planning Commission  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



July 8, 2021

Ms. Cheli Dahal  
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-  
AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, RA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1314 N Broad Street (App. No. ZP-2020-009805)**

Dear Ms. Dahal:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of the proposed development of **1314 N Broad Street**.

The proposal is located on the site of the historic Blue Horizon boxing venue, vacant since 2010. The historic mansions on North Broad Street are being preserved and incorporated into the proposal though the rear building including the auditorium space is to be demolished. The proposed development includes over 100,000 gross square footage with 208 dwelling units in a 13-story addition to the rear of the property. The proposal requires variances for both parking (none currently provided) and floor area in excess of maximum allowable. The exterior façade facing Broad Street is locally designated and the proposal will require Historical Commission review at the building permit stage.

The Civic Design Review Committee voted to conclude the CDR process at its meeting on **July 6, 2021**. An RCO representative from coordinating RCO MAP Holistic CDC was unable to attend the meeting in person but expressed support for the project in a letter submitted in advance of the meeting.

The CDR Committee was supportive of the project, recognizing that the property is a difficult adaptive reuse that is appropriately handled and well thought out. The Committee applauded the retention of the historic fabric, the efforts to include materials to continue to tell the story of the building, and the significant setback of the residential tower from Broad Street. There were many comments regarding the ground floor experience, where the team was encouraged to investigate opportunities to incorporate more amenities and allow for circulation of people, light, and air. Coordination with adjacent property owners and potential narrowing of the addition were both suggested. The loading as proposed was also suggested for reconsideration to ensure building servicing is feasible. At the Broad Street frontage, the team was asked to look for more opportunities to include street trees. Also, the main residential entry was recommended for continued aesthetic development and articulation. As this is also the only accessible entrance, the team is asked to ensure it is both welcoming and clearly defined.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov  
Councilmember Darrell Clarke, darrell.clarke@phila.gov  
Curtis Wilkerson, Director of Constituent Services, curtis.wilkerson@phila.gov  
Christine Brown, Beech Community Services Incorporated, cbrown@beechinterplex.com  
Louise Bundy, Friends of the 47th Ward, LouiseBundy1@comcast.net  
Peter Crawford, Temple Area Property Association (TAPA), peter@crawfordgroup.org  
Dorothy Kelly, The Good News Community Organization, Louise159@verizon.net  
Lewis Nash, MAP Holistic CDC, map.nashsr@gmail.com  
Vivian VanStory, Community Land Trust Corporation, communitylandtrustcorp0@gmail.com  
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, david.fecteau@phila.gov  
Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, cheli.dahal@phila.gov





July 8, 2021

**Cheli R. Dahal**  
**Department of Licenses and Inspections**  
**Municipal Services Building, Concourse**  
**1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard**  
**Philadelphia, PA 19102**

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA  
Clarissa Kelsey, RA  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 6126, 6134-46R Wayne Avenue (Application # ZP-2020-009471)**

Dear Ms. Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed residential development at 6126, 6134-46R Wayne Avenue.

The project proposes several new buildings to be built on an existing vacant lot including a five-story, multi-family residential building with 60 units, and 9 duplex townhomes with an additional 18 units, totaling 78 units within 70,762 square feet of new gross floor area. The project proposes 24 surface parking spaces. The site is accessed through a private street owned and currently maintained by SEPTA. The project has one special exception and no variances.

The project was first heard at the June 1, 2021 CDR meeting and was asked to return. At its meeting of July 6, 2021, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**RCO Comments: West Central Germantown Neighbors (WCGN)**

The RCO noted several concerns at both the June 1 and July 6 meetings, specifically stating that the new multi-family building is too tall, too dense, and does not fit into the surrounding neighborhood context. The RCO representative noted concerns with the dark façade material palette proposed and had a number of questions regarding access to the site both for pedestrians and those traveling by vehicle to SEPTA's Chestnut Hill West Line - Tulehocken Station.

At both meetings, the RCO representative noted that the current sidewalk condition leading to Tulehocken Station is not ADA-accessible and encouraged the applicant to provide a new accessible route to both the new residential buildings and the SEPTA regional rail station. Additionally, the RCO representative requested that new sidewalks be built from Wayne Avenue and connect to Walnut Lane.

During the first meeting on June 1, the WCGN representative noted concerns with heritage tree loss and canopy coverage removal. Additionally, there were concerns about how trash, loading and deliveries would impact vehicular access to Station Drive specifically during train arrivals. The community also felt strongly that this proposal would negatively impact parking within the SEPTA parking lot and surrounding streets.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



The RCO encouraged the project team to find ways to positively impact the public realm, either by enhancing the train station or adding additional amenities.

### **CDR Committee Comments**

The CDR Committee had several comments about this project and recognized the RCOs concerns.

During both meetings, the CDR Committee agreed with both PCPC staff comments and the RCO comments noting the importance of addressing access issues from Wayne Avenue. The Committee noted that there should be an ADA accessible route from Wayne Avenue and the design should reflect the City's Complete Street Standards. Additionally, it was strongly encouraged that the applicant work with SEPTA to improve accessibility, and create a loading and trash plan to avoid conflict between SEPTA riders and new residents. PCPC staff noted that formal agreements should be created between SEPTA and the development team.

At the June 1 meeting, the CDR Committee noted that the design did not seem complete. The Committee also noted inconsistencies between drawings. During the July 6 meeting, several drawings were updated, but the committee still had concerns with the building design, specifically requesting the applicant to add a second elevator within the multi-family building and asked the applicant to consider opportunities for neighborhood and transit-oriented amenities.

At both meetings the committee encouraged the design team to enclose the exterior balconies and create a better sense of arrival for residents and guests. The applicant added a lobby space to the ground floor as part of their second submission but made no changes to the exterior balcony design. The applicant team was encouraged to rethink the exterior balconies and bedroom locations within the multifamily building.

At the meeting of June 1, the Committee noted a desire for lighter colored façade materials, and to add windows. The applicant added several windows and lightened the material palette for the July 6 presentation.

At the meeting of July 6, the Committee noted the inherent challenges of the site, and applauded the development team for creating a delicate and careful landscape plan. The plan proposes to save several large trees, and includes a new woodland planting scheme that could be successful if well maintained and cared for within the first several years. The Committee also recommended investigating solar panel opportunities for the multifamily and duplex buildings.

Lastly the CDR Committee requested the applicant continue to work with near neighbors, SEPTA and local RCOs as the building begins construction to make sure that access is provided for all users.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.



Department of Planning and Development

## Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, [mdesigns@msn.com](mailto:mdesigns@msn.com)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Cindy Bass, Council District 8, [cindy.bass@phila.gov](mailto:cindy.bass@phila.gov)  
Charles Richardson, Representative for Council District 8, [charles.richardson@phila.gov](mailto:charles.richardson@phila.gov)  
Tyrone Barge, Council District 8, [tyrone.barge@phila.gov](mailto:tyrone.barge@phila.gov)  
Leslie Smallwood-Lewis, Mosaic Development Partners, [ls@mosaicdp.com](mailto:ls@mosaicdp.com)  
Rachael Pritzker, Pritzker Law Group LLC, [rachael@pritzkerlg.com](mailto:rachael@pritzkerlg.com)  
A Luke Smith, West Central Germantown Neighbors, [alukesmith@gmail.com](mailto:alukesmith@gmail.com)  
Patrick Jones, 59th Democratic Ward, [patwjones@gmail.com](mailto:patwjones@gmail.com)  
Ruffian Tittman, Friends of the Wissahickon, [tittmann@fow.org](mailto:tittmann@fow.org)  
Ian Hegarty, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [ian.hegarty@phila.gov](mailto:ian.hegarty@phila.gov)  
Cheli R. Dahal, Philadelphia Department of Licenses and Inspections, [Cheli.R.Dahal@phila.gov](mailto:Cheli.R.Dahal@phila.gov)  
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, [michelle.brisbon@phila.gov](mailto:michelle.brisbon@phila.gov)  
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, [kisha.duckett@phila.gov](mailto:kisha.duckett@phila.gov)  
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, [jeanien.wilson@phila.gov](mailto:jeanien.wilson@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)