



December 16, 2020

Caitlin Mest
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Elise Vider

Re: Civic Design Review for 650 Fairmount Avenue (Application # ZP-2020-003739)

Dear Ms. Mest,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **650 Fairmount Avenue**.

The proposal is for a series of single family, two-family, triplexes and two multifamily buildings with ground floor commercial within a 4.07 acre site. The applicant proposes 21 single family units at 56,450 square feet, 56 two-family units at 102,000 square feet and 327 multi-family units within two buildings at 265,500 square feet. There is also 18,410 square feet of commercial and retail functions on the ground floor of both mixed-use buildings. The site is zoned RM-2 (residential multifamily) and has 7 zoning variances including six setback refusals and the development is over their maximum FAR (Floor Area Ratio) allowance. 70% FAR is allowed, this project proposes 239% FAR.

At its meeting of December 10, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments

There were two registered community organizations for this project. The coordinating RCO was 14th Ward Democratic Executive Committee and West Girard Progress. Both RCOs had representatives to speak to the project and provided the following comments.

The 14th Ward representative mentioned the following:

- They were not able to have an in-person meeting for this project due to COVID. The RCO representative noted that many nearby residents do not have access to internet, so meeting was not as well attended.
- During the virtual meeting there was no negative comments or opposition to this project.
- Reopening Marshall Street would be seen as a positive for many older residents who remember when Marshall Street previously existed on site.
- They would like to see the number of curb cuts reduced to help limit traffic around the surrounding neighborhood blocks.
- Please consider additional green space noting that the current apartments have more open space which is used by the neighbors and community as a whole.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



- The 14th Ward representative would like the proposed brick color to match the immediate context as the community does not want the design and color of bricks to be out of context with neighborhood facades.
- They would like to see additional affordable housing units built as part of this project to help displaced tenants of the existing apartments.
- Lastly the 14th Ward requested a traffic study for this proposal.

The West Girard Progress Representative noted the following:

- This proposal is a very large project and there needs to be more discussion about displacement of neighbors.
- The material colors selected for this project and the overall design is fantastic.
- The WGP representative also requested that the applicant include additional diversity in workforce and project contracts, as well as add diversity to the design team for a project of this size.

2. CDR Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee had a number of positive comments and generally agreed that this proposal was commendable. The Committee provided the following comments which included many of the PCPC staff comments:

- The Committee believed that 6th Street was an appropriate location for the proposal's commercial components. This differed from PCPC Staff comments which recommended locating the commercial uses along the existing commercial corridors.
- The Committee noted that this project is a great example of a large redevelopment proposal. They emphasized that the site design was thoughtful, the height and density are appropriate for the location, the material composition is very well thought out and the project fits well within community. The Committee noted that there was a post-industrial feel to the design which highlighted the site's past uses. The Committee agreed that from an urban planning standpoint, this proposed project is well considered.
- The Committee also noted that the applicant team provided a very thoughtful presentation and appreciated the design detail of the interior of the site. The Committee agreed with the RCO and liked the idea of restoring Marshall Street, mentioning it will help break down the mega-block scale.
- The CDR Committee did note that the proposed site layout design does not currently have places for neighbors to gather. The Committee recommended review of the interior row home blocks, which may have additional opportunities to create new gathering and public spaces to use collectively. The development team was encouraged to think of ways to activate these spaces beyond looking nice and passing through.
- The CDR Committee noted this project is an exemplary case for design features including hiding parking, activating street frontages and providing generous space for pedestrians on the sidewalks. The CDR Committee noted that the applicant should respond to more of the community comments, specifically including creating a variety of open space options and



reducing the height in parts of the proposal. Once Committee member also asked the development team to consider unit types as a way to vary of the design and appearance of the housing.

- The CDR Committee noted their appreciation of the development team to continue to work with community beyond the CDR process.
- The Committee requested to incorporate PCPC staff comments including:
 - a. Add curb bump outs at all corners to increase pedestrian sidewalk space and create safer crossings for all users
 - b. Reduce the number of curb cuts along portions of the site
 - c. Consider how the design can further discourage mid-block crossings on both 6th and 7th Streets, which have high speeds from traffic coming from Interstate 676 and the Ben Franklin Bridge.
 - d. Consider additional green space options to better reflect the open space that exists currently.
 - e. Encourage removing the surface parking and loading along the interior of Marshall Street to create larger, connective pedestrian spaces.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Council President Darrell L. Clarke, Council District 5, Darrell.Clarke@phila.gov
Corey Bell, Council District 5 Representative, Corey.Bell@phila.gov
Hercules Grigos, Esq., Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, hgrigos@klehr.com
Stephanie Boggs, Esq., Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, sboggs@klehr.com
Brian Phillips, Interface Studio Architects (ISA), brian@is-architects.com
David Perlman, PRDC Properties, david@prdcproperties.com
Anthony Maras, PRDC Properties, tony@prdcproperties.com
Diane Monroe, 14th Ward Democratic Executive Committee, diane.davis@comcast.net
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov
Caitlin M. Mest, Philadelphia Department of Licenses and Inspections, Caitlin.mest@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



January 7, 2021

Cheli R. Dahal
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Elise Vider
Nancy Rogo Trainer

Re: Civic Design Review for 1001-29 S Broad Street (Application # ZP-2020-007085c)

Dear Ms. Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1001-29 S Broad Street**.

The proposal is for a 15-story residential and commercial mixed-use building with 1,111 residential units totaling 857,394 square feet. The project proposes several ground floor commercial spaces totaling 59,897 square feet, as well as 199,288 square feet of office space on the first and second floors. The project includes 417 underground parking spaces. There are several covered public spaces along portions of the ground floor and numerous loading spaces interior to the site. The proposal sits on a CMX-5 zoned parcel and thus is a by-right project.

At its meeting of December 10, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments

There were two registered community organizations for this project. Hawthorne Empowerment Coalition (HEC) and Point Breeze Community Development Coalition (PBCDC). HEC was the only RCO in attendance for the CDR meeting on December 10 and was also coordinating RCO. The HEC representative provided the following comments.

- ☐ The RCO representative commended the development team for the great work and lovely proposal. The representative noted appreciation for working with their community group for over three years on this project, highlighting the community engagement process they have had with the applicant for many years and many meetings.

2. CDR Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee had a number of comments and generally agreed that this proposal was commendable. The Committee provided the following comments which included the PCPC staff findings as well:

- ☐ There was discussion about the covered public spaces on the ground floor, with particular focus for the public space to the northeast corner of this

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



- development. The current proposal shows a lush vegetated space, but the CDR Committee questioned the viability of this covered green spaces.
- Several Committee members questioned the landscape and vegetated beds asking the applicant how the vegetation will grow and thrive within these covered spaces. The Committee was not convinced that the planting areas in these spaces would be able to survive without additional considerations.
 - The CDR Committee recommended the applicant consider ways to bring additional light into this public space amenity. Several Committee members recommended adding grow-lights to allow for growth or to look at increasing the open air lightwell that may allow for additional light.
 - One Committee member noted that the way the building is designed now, the open light well would get limited sun exposure down to the ground level based on where the buildings residential towers are located.
- Some Committee members noted appreciation for the proposed art and pedestrian scaled light fixtures throughout the plaza spaces on the ground floor, expressing that this will bring a liveliness for the covered pedestrian spaces and streetscape.
 - The Committee mentioned that the spaces for pedestrians along the sidewalk and interior to the site are rendered well and noted that if built as well as they are rendered, these areas will be active spaces clearly marked as pedestrian space.
 - The CDR Committee and PCPC staff had concerns with the location of the density and height in the northeast corner of the site which will block and shade the public pool across Carpenter Street. The Committee also noted concern for the adjacent three-story row homes and the impact of the proposed tower's height will have on buildings across 13th Street.
 - One of the CDR Committee members noted that high density projects like this are helping Philadelphia grow. The committee member commended the density along one of Philadelphia's premier transit corridors and acknowledged that density and the number of parking spaces were appropriate for the site.
 - The Committee, along with PCPC staff comments noted the high-quality materials. The Committee applauded the various material choices which provide a wide variety of colors and textures, creating interest in the facades along all street frontages.
 - There was discussion about both Washington Avenue and S Broad Street sidewalks. The Committee appreciated the streetscape design and relationship the building had with the sidewalk.
 - But several Committee members also asked the applicant to consider potential impacts of vehicular parking and loading within some of the plaza spaces and along these prominent streets. It was requested that loading functions not take place on-street and that off-street loading access was available for both commercial and residential tenants.
 - The committee requested that a project of this size and scope further their sustainability metrics going for either LEED or third-party certification.
 - Lastly, the Committee requested to included PCPC staff comments including the following:



- The design should consider the “canyon effect” that will be built along 13th Street on both sides, noting just a 50’ Right-of-Way and 11 stories with limited setbacks along the street edge.
- As mentioned above, PCPC staff acknowledged that the current design of the building allows for sunlight for private residential amenities but negatively impacts adjacent public amenities. Therefore, they encouraged the density and height of the proposal to shift towards Washington Avenue. Staff also recommended stepping the building back along the north and east sides of this proposal to better reflect the scale of the neighborhood to the north.
- Staff noted the opaque louver system that is proposed along portions of each street frontage and requested that the fenestration and window pattern be reviewed for additional articulation to reduce the overall scale of that façade element and to consider more transparency.
- PCPC staff noted the well-designed series of building facades along each street frontage and commended the well-articulated material palette and use of high-quality materials for this project.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee’s action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Kenyatta Johnson, Council District 2, Kenyatta.johnson@phila.gov
Joshua Harris, Council District 2 Representative, joshu.harris@phila.gov
Ronald Patterson, Esq., Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, rpatterson@klehr.com
Bart Blatstein, Tower Investments, Inc., bblatstein@towerdev.com
Tina Roberts, Tower Investments, Inc., tinaroberts@towerdev.com
Britt Chapman, Post Brothers, bchapman@postcre.com
Jack Boarman, BKV Group, jboarman@bkgvgroupdc.com
Raed Nasser, Hawthorne Empowerment Coalition, Zoning@hecphila.org
Albert Hicks, Point Breeze Community Development Coalition, pbcdczoning@gmail.com
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov
Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Department of Licenses and Inspections, cheli.r.dahal@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 15, 2020

Reeba Babu
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1021 N Hancock St
(Application No. ZP-2020-004719C)**

Dear Ms. Babu,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1021 N Hancock Street**.

This proposal is for a 231,676 sf mixed-use building. This includes a 6,064 sf ground floor commercial space on Germantown Avenue, 280 dwelling units on floors two through thirteen, and 134 bicycle parking spaces. The project's parking requirement is fulfilled off-site, within 1,000 feet. The site is zoned CMX-3 and does not require any zoning relief.

At its meeting of December 10, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments: West Girard Progress:

The RCO representative commended developer for their commitment to diversity and inclusion for both their workforce and retail tenants. The RCO representative felt that the design fit well in the neighborhood and that the developer's larger plans will benefit the neighborhood.

2. RCO Comments: Northern Liberties Neighborhood Association(NLNA):

A representative from Northern Liberties Neighborhood Association was unable to attend the CDR meeting. They provided design comments in a letter, as follows:

- We applaud the use of high quality materials, though we are concerned with the use of light colored materials in terms of how these facades will wear.
- We applaud the generous pedestrian walkways. We would like to see a bike lane on Hancock. Given the large number of added pedestrians we would like to see efforts made to encourage safety.
- As the tallest building in the neighborhood, we encourage a public amenity on an upper floor.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



3. CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee shared their appreciation for the design and programming of the project. The members of the committee expanded upon their appreciation with the following specific comments:

Members of the committee endorsed the use of a masonry façade for a building of this scale. It was stated that the project features beautiful architecture that is perfect for its location – not the typical steel and glass curtain wall design.

Members of the committee stated that the columns in the covered plaza space can be a dynamic design element if well-lit and could help the plaza become an interesting urban space. This opinion different from that of PCPC staff.

Members of the committee requested a more robust planting plan for this project and across all of the Post Brothers projects in Northern Liberties. One member felt that the ground plane is treated generically and suggested slight level changes, bollards, and street furniture to help denote pedestrian and auto spaces. A different member of the committee took it further requesting that cars be kept to the Hancock St right-of-way to limit auto space and dedicate more space to pedestrians. The development team assured the committee that an overall landscape plan, and an application for LEED for Neighborhood Development, is forthcoming.

Lastly, the committee expressed their appreciation for the developer's commitment to diversity and inclusion in all aspects of the development.

The Committee also recommended incorporating staff comments including:

- a. Staff commends the design team for producing a unique work of architecture that takes influences from its surroundings and incorporates them into a modern, urban apartment tower
- b. Staff commends the design team for pursuing a LEED rating
- c. Staff felt that some elements from the existing building could be utilized in order to pay respect to the context or the beautiful building that's been demolished.
- d. Staff felt that, as currently designed, the plaza on Hancock Street prioritizes auto access over pedestrian space and lacks landscaping.
- e. The driveway for this project, a driveway for the Piazza, and a lay-by lane are all in close proximity on Hancock Street. Paving materials on Hancock Street and within the driveways can help slow traffic and denote pedestrian and auto zones.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.



Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Mark Squilla, Council District 1, mark.squilla@phila.gov
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov
Larry Freedman Northern Liberties Neighbors Association, larryfreedman@comcast.net
Mike Cibik, 5th Ward Republican RCO, macam@ccpclaw.com
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com
Ron Patterson, Klehr Harrison, rpatterson@klehr.com
Sarina Rose, Post Brothers, sarina@postcre.com
Britt Chapman, Post Brothers, bchapman@postcre.com
Jules Dingle, DIGSAU, jdingle@digsau.com
Jeff Goldstein, DIGSAU, jgoldstein@digsau.com
Cornelius Brown, Bohler Engineers, cbrown@bohlereng.com
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov
Reeba Babu, Licenses and Inspections, reeba.babu@phila.gov



December 15, 2020

Paulose Issac
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1104 N Hancock St
(Application No. ZP-2020-008569C)**

Dear Mr. Issac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1104 N Hancock Street**.

This proposal is for an addition to an already approved project (1043 Germantown Avenue and 1102 N 2nd Street - application #860182). This application is for 209,738 gross sf of residential space (1,255,041 sf total) consisting of 270 additional dwelling units (1,131 total). In addition, this application includes a new rooftop amenity space on the parking garage at 145 W. Wilkey Street. The site is zoned CMX-3 and does not require any zoning relief.

At its meeting of December 10, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments: West Girard Progress:

The RCO representative commended developer for their commitment to diversity and inclusion for both their workforce and retail tenants.

2. RCO Comments: Northern Liberties Neighborhood Association (NLNA):

A representative from Northern Liberties Neighborhood Association was unable to attend the CDR meeting. They provided design comments in a letter, as follows:

- Neighbors have concerns about traffic on Wilkey (currently two-way with parking and shown incorrectly on the renderings). This street will need to be changed to accommodate the added density and traffic. We would like to see a commitment to working with the neighborhood and Streets on this point.
- Neighbors appreciate the residential scale at the sidewalk with setbacks to higher levels on Hancock as well as the fact that the lighting is of a residential type.
- The shadow cast by the new building will impact the properties to the Northwest of Front and Girard and is not insignificant.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



- We appreciate that the amenity space is for residents and not a commercial public space serving food and drink and would like it to remain as proposed.
- We are disappointed to see no affordable housing component to this project given that we are talking about adding more units to an already large project. Smaller projects that have come before us have included affordable housing.
- We appreciate the ambition to reach LEED Gold and would like to see the project achieve this.
- Given the large amount of retail space in the project as a whole, we encourage the developer to meet with the NLNA and the Northern Liberties BID to develop a strategy for encouraging a variety of uses in addition to restaurants that benefit quality of life.

3. CDR Committee Comments:

Since this application is for an addition, the CDR Committee reiterated staff comments made for application #860182, as follows:

- Space of courtyard will be much better without bridge and to consider alternative ways of creating urban rooms such as landscape features
- Approval of the materials selections with the range of well subtleties of material colors, limit use of EIFS
- Appreciate creation of public spaces tied back to community and transit hubs
- Encouraged to use the upcoming Philadelphia building codes for energy usage
- Quality of design very high with a variety of spaces, scales, and materials
- Hancock street - committee recognizes complexity of zoning that contributes to differences in scale and encourages further work with community to mitigate these
- Traffic study needs to be done for impact of 500+ cars and the impacts of new development on adjacent streets and infrastructure such as traffic signals.

In addition, the CDR Committee shared their appreciation for the design of the project. Members of the committee then made the following new comments:

Members of the CDR committee expressed appreciation for the use of quality materials and the reduction in the amount of EIFs proposed for the project.

There was discussion about the need for a mid-block crosswalk to connect the Piazza to the Piazza Terminal on Germantown Ave. The applicant assured the committee that this is included in their design for a Woonerf on the private portion of Germantown Avenue.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.



Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Mark Squilla, Council District 1, mark.squilla@phila.gov
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov
Larry Freedman Northern Liberties Neighbors Association, larryfreedman@comcast.net
Mike Cibik, 5th Ward Republican RCO, macam@ccpclaw.com
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com
Ron Patterson, Klehr Harrison, rpatterson@klehr.com
Sarina Rose, Post Brothers, sarina@postcre.com
Britt Chapman, Post Brothers, bchapman@postcre.com
Jack Boarman, BKV Group, jboarman@bkgvgroupdc.com
Cornelius Brown, Bohler Engineers, cbrown@bohlereng.com
Paulose Issac, Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov



January 7, 2021

Cheli R. Dahal
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Elise Vider
Nancy Rogo Trainer

Re: Civic Design Review for 1223-45 Washington Avenue (Application # ZP-2020-007222c)

Dear Ms. Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1223-45 Washington Avenue**.

The proposal is for a 11-story residential and commercial mixed-use building with 375 residential units totaling 209,720 square feet. The project also proposes a ground floor commercial space totaling 6,766 square feet as well as 32,711 square feet of office space on the first and second floors. The project includes 78 underground parking spaces. The proposal sits on a CMX-5 zoned parcel and is a by-right project.

At its meeting of December 10, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments

Hawthorne Empowerment Coalition (HEC) was the coordinating RCO and provided the following comments.

- ☐ The RCO representative commended the development team for the great work and lovely proposal. The representative noted appreciation for working with their community group, highlighting the community engagement process they have had with the applicant for many years and many meetings.

2. CDR Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee had a number of comments and generally agreed that this proposal was commendable. The Committee provided the following comments which include the PCPC staff findings as well:

- ☐ The Committee agreed with PCPC staff comments noting that the applicant should consider adjusting the tower location towards Washington Avenue rather than to the north along the smaller Kimball Street. PCPC staff and the Committee noted that the current design and site layout allows for full sun throughout the day for the private residential amenity terrace, but casts large shadows on the existing community assets, specifically the Hawthorne Cultural Center and associated playground.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



- The CDR Committee recommended exploring a massing scheme that includes two taller towers on both the east and west sides of the site rather than the proposed U-shaped building which would allow for additional light and air to reach the blocks to the north. The blocks to the north consist of the Cultural Center and several rowhome units along both 13th and Kimball Streets.
- While many Committee members noted they would rather see the tower and greater density along Washington Avenue, they expressed that the proposed Washington Avenue façade is well detailed with high quality materials. The Committee recommended continuing to use these materials along Washington Avenue but apply them to a massing scheme that places higher density on the avenue.
- One Committee member noted that a project of this size and scope is an amenity to the city. It was mentioned that projects like this bring growth to the city as well as various housing options for residents. Lastly, commercial opportunities are also made available to the general public.
- There was consensus by both the RCO and CDR Committee that workforce inclusion and diversity for projects of the size and scope should be encouraged and promoted.
- Lastly, the Committee requested to include PCPC staff comments including the following:
 - The design should consider the “canyon effect” that will be created along 13th Street on both sides, noting that the existing 50’ Right-of-Way has a proposed 11 stories with limited setbacks along its street edge.
 - As mentioned above, PCPC staff acknowledged that the U-shape building allows for sunlight for the proposed private residential amenities but encouraged the density and height of the proposal shift towards Washington Avenue. Staff also recommended stepping the building back along Kimball Street to reflect the scale of the neighborhood to the north.
 - Staff noted that the shadows of this project will impact the light and sun for the Hawthorne Cultural Center which is a public resource for the neighborhood.
 - Staff noted the unfriendly, blank two-story façade along Kimball Street which is the adjacent elevation to the Cultural Center and several row homes.
 - PCPC staff noted the well-designed series of building facades along each street frontage and commended the well-articulated material palette and use of high-quality materials for this project.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee’s action.

Sincerely,



Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc:

Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, garofalod@rowan.edu
Councilmember Kenyatta Johnson, Council District 2, Kenyatta.johnson@phila.gov
Joshua Harris, Council District 2 Representative, joshua.harris@phila.gov
Ronald Patterson, Esq., Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, rpatterson@klehr.com
Bart Blatstein, Tower Investments, Inc., bblatstein@towerdev.com
Tina Roberts, Tower Investments, Inc., tinaroberts@towerdev.com
Britt Chapman, Post Brothers, bchapman@postcre.com
Jack Boarman, BKV Group, jboarman@bkgvgroupdc.com
Raed Nasser, Hawthorne Empowerment Coalition, Zoning@hecphila.org
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov
Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Department of Licenses and Inspections, cheli.r.dahal@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 14, 2020

James Cunningham
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1801 N American Street
(Application No. ZP-2020-001604)**

Dear Mr. Cunningham,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1801 N American Street**.

This proposal is to build a mixed-use building on a parcel currently used for material storage. The site is zoned ICMX, is 157,304 square feet, and a use variance will be required. The applicant proposes 110 dwelling units and two commercial spaces, 64 vehicle parking spaces and 39 bicycle parking spaces for a total gross floor area of 190,722.

At its meeting of December 10, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments:

Representatives from South Kensington Community Partners and West Girard Progress attended and offered the following comments:

- The density proposed is appropriate for the site.
- There is concern about the size of the proposed studio units.
- There is appreciation for proposed affordable units.
- There is concern about a one-story building fronting on American Street which the RCOs believe could handle more height.
- There is concern about safety and lighting in a proposed walkway from 2nd Street to American Street.
- There is concern about diversity and inclusion in the workforce on the site and contracts let for construction.

2. CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee offered the following comments:

The Committee agreed with the RCO comments that the proposed one-story height on N. American Street could be increased and suggested the addition of vertical elements along the N. American Street façade.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



They voiced concern about the “dog-leg” parking arrangement which proposes to enter and exit the site from American Street and asked if this arrangement could be simplified to improve pedestrian safety.

They also recommended fencing and/or screening between this proposal and the warehouse to the north. This could help mitigate adjacent industrial uses for future residents.

The Committee suggested the installation of photovoltaic panels on the expansive roof to increase the sustainability of the project. Lastly, they commended the development team for proposing affordable units.

The Committee accepted staff comments which included:

- The project team should be commended for making the 2nd Street and Montgomery Avenue facades as transparent as possible.
- The proposed sidewalk width on Philip Street does not meet Complete Streets standards.
- We are concerned about an additional curb cut on N American Street.
- Street trees should be planted in the sidewalks on Montgomery Avenue and on Philip Street.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, FAIA, Chair, Civic Design Review Committee, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Maria D Quiñones-Sánchez, maria.q.sanchez@phila.gov
Sloane Folks, Commercial/Zoning Services, sloane.folks@phila.gov
Eric Bodzin, Legislative Director, eric.bodzin@phila.gov
Rustin Ohler, Harman Deutsch Architecture, rustin@hdarchitecture.com
Marco Gorini, South Kensington Community Partners, marco.l.gorini@gmail.com
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bichavous@gmail.com
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, david.fecteau@phila.gov
James Cunningham, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, jim.cunningham@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 14, 2020

Haoying Ye,
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 2750R Aramingo Ave,
(Application No. ZP-2020-003503)**

Dear Ms. Ye,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **2750R Aramingo Avenue**.

This proposal is for 282,853.5 S.F. of new residential construction. The applicant proposes total of 231 residential units in ten multi-family residential structures-eight of which are attached- along with 84 interior parking spaces and 127 bicycle parking spaces. The site is zoned I-2, and the only zoning variance for this proposal is for use, since multi-family household living is prohibited in the base zoning district.

At its meeting of December 10, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments- South Port Richmond Civic Association (SOPO):

The RCO representative asked about a prior discussion with the development team about the addition of an egress on Tulip street which was not shown in the presentation. The design team mentioned that it had been removed as part of the Streets Department review, however if it was something the community wanted, they would be willing to discuss.

2. CDR Committee Comments:

The CDR Committee acknowledged that the development team had considered diversity and inclusion in all the aspects of the development process and hoped to see that continue. One of the Committee members suggested looking at the capacity of public transportation and the necessity to increase it given the amount of large developments happening in the immediate vicinity of this proposal.

In addition, the Committee noted the following comments for the project:

One of the Committee members echoed the staff comment about the buffer between the gas station and the residential units, mentioning that the development is as close to the gas station as possible which made the buffer not effective enough. The

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



development team mentioned that they had done that to include a more extensive pedestrian circulation in the interior of the site which would not have been possible if they'd set the building back further from the gas station.

The CDR Committee commended the development team for including delicate details in the ground floor drawings and acknowledged that even though the space between the rowhomes and the apartment building was tight, the proposal had managed to include a nicely designed pedestrian pathway next to the private rear yards. One of the Committee members emphasized that they would not like to see more separation between the private yards and the pathway. The drawings seemed to show an 8' fence while the development team confirmed that there would be a shorter one.

The Committee also recommended incorporating staff comments including:

- a. Staff commends the development team for creating an enhanced pedestrian experience by providing public walkways all around the development as well as private amenity spaces for the residents. Moreover, staff appreciates the extensive green and permeable surfaces added as part of this design layout. Also, the trees added to the sidewalk play an essential part in making the area safe and pleasant for pedestrians.
- b. The elevated pedestrian walkway is semi-public. Staff is concerned about it not being ADA accessible from outside the development and being partially locked during nighttime.
- c. Staff supports the development team's effort in maintaining the open view beyond the railroad tracks while adding trees and green space as a buffer.
- d. Staff recommends replacing the "Building 2" entrance and lobby with the amenity space on the Tulip Street side for a more pedestrian friendly environment and a better use of the corner park.
- e. Staff supports the gradual increase in the density to conform with the neighborhood scale while recommending including some horizontal composition elements rather than vertical ones to emphasize on the scale of the surrounding area.
- f. Staff suggests revisiting the material palette to use materials with lower contrast.
- g. Staff recommends looking at upgrading rear facades to create more pleasant views for pedestrians. Improving the first-floor material on the façade behind the rowhomes for example, would be helpful to improve the pedestrian experience in the walkway.
- h. Staff appreciates the location of the parking spaces behind the building and underground.
- i. Staff is concerned about the trucks maneuvering out of the development safely and without interfering with auto and pedestrian movements
- j. Staff commends the development team for meeting so many sustainable metrics by adding substantial green and open space. Addition of more noise reduction elements along the rail line would be beneficial.



- k. Staff encourages the team to add a bike share station to benefit the residents given the size of the development and existing surrounding bike network.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, Chair, Civic Design Review, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Mark Squilla, Council District 1, Mark.squilla@phila.gov
Sean McMonagle, Legislative Assistant, sean.mcmonagle@phila.gov
Nicholas Fury, Somerset Neighbors for Better Living, snblzoning@gmail.com
John Kalicki, South Port Richmond Civic Association, zoning@sopocivic.org
Ken Paul, Port Richmond On Patrol & Civic Association, propac19134@gmail.com
Rolando Sanchez, Impact Community Development Corporation, rsanchez@impactservices.org
Jessica Hoffman, New Kensington Community Development Corp, jhoffman@nkcdc.org
Rustin Ohler, Harman Deutsch Ohler Architecture, Rustin@HDOArch.com
Adam Laver, Blank Rome LLP, laver@blankrome.com
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, David.fecteau@phila.gov
Haoying Ye, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, Haoying.ye@phila.gov
Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov
Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov
Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



December 10, 2020

Cheli Dahal
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 3705-25 N Broad Street
(Application No. ZP-2020-006530)**

Dear Ms. Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **3705-25 N Broad Street** (Residences at Beury).

This proposal is to redevelop a fast food restaurant site at the southeast corner of Broad and Butler Streets. The site is zoned CMX-3, and no zoning variances are required. The applicant proposes a six-story mixed-use building that contains 13,741 sf of commercial space, 114 dwelling units, and a 44-space surface parking lot at the rear.

At its meeting of December 10, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments:

A representative from Nicetown-Tioga Improvement Team (NTIT) was in attendance and offered the following comments:

- The amount of glass on the ground floor raises fear and concern of it being broken in the event of future social unrest
- The amount of parking may be insufficient, especially if more activity comes to Broad Germantown & Erie
- There is appreciation for the developer being community-friendly
- The community understands the need for new development, and there is a Community Benefits Agreement (CBA) with the developer being finalized that will ensure local hiring and minority participation for this project
- There is appreciation for the inclusion of affordable units

2. CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee generally agreed that this is a thoughtfully executed project with an attention to design detail that is fitting for the site's prominent location, and offered the following comments:

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



The amount of glass is a statement of optimism and is seen as beautiful, friendly, and welcoming. But there needs to be a focus on inclusion "behind the glass".

There was an appreciation for street trees on Broad St, but it is recommended they be planted in continuous tree trenches. In addition, the applicant should work with an arborist to determine whether it's appropriate to save the existing tree.

The Committee mentioned that this project could be a catalyst for the intersection and neighborhood as a whole. The development team has a good understanding of the project's context and it respects and enhances the adjacent Beury Building.

The Committee accepted staff comments which included:

- Overall, this is an attractive building design that has depth, creativity, and a thoughtful combination of materials. The design is appropriate for its location, creates ground floor activity at North Philadelphia's most prominent intersection, and complements the iconic Beury Building.
- Staff appreciates revisions to the ground floor facade on the east elevation
- The applicant should coordinate paving and landscape design along Broad Street with City's intersection reconstruction project
- The parking lot is appropriately located to the rear of the building, landscaped, and screened

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Michael Johns, FAIA, Chair, Civic Design Review Committee, mdesigns@msn.com
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Council President Darrell Clarke, Council District 5, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Mary Jones, Legislative Aide, mary.jones@phila.gov
Corey Bell, Constituent Services, corey.bell@phila.gov
Maria Sourbeer, Shift Capital, maria@shiftcapital.us
Cynthia Barnes, Nicetown-Tioga Improvement Team, cynthiab127@yahoo.com
Martin A Strom, 43rd Democratic Ward, mstrom011@gmail.com
Charles Lanier, Hunting Park Neighborhood Advisory Committee, hunting.parknac@verizon.net
Ariel Diliberto, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ariel.diliberto@phila.gov



Department of Planning and Development

Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, cheli.dahal@phila.gov

Michelle Brisbon, Streets Department, michelle.brisbon@phila.gov

Kisha Duckett, Streets Department, kisha.duckett@phila.gov

Jeanien Wilson, Streets Department, jeanien.wilson@phila.gov

Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org

Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov