



October 22, 2020

Yaniv Gal
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

Re: Civic Design Review for 113 – 121 S 19th Street and 1822-24 Chestnut Street (Application No. ZP-2020-002127)

Dear Mr. Gal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **113 – 121 S 19th Street and 1822-24 Chestnut Street**.

This proposal is to redevelop a number of existing mixed-use buildings and to erect a 50-story residential tower. The site is zoned CMX-5, and no zoning variances are required. The proposal totals 257,694 gross square feet including 30,180 square feet of commercial space, 183 residential units, 55 car parking spaces provided off-site, and 65 bike parking spaces.

At its meeting of October 22, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments:

A representative from the Center City Residents Association attended the meeting and stated the group was in support of the project and applauded the project team for working so well with the community. The representative praised the process and was pleased that even with a by-right project, the design maintains the character and vibrancy of the existing neighborhood.

2. CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee provided the following comments and voted to complete the CDR process for this proposal.

A member of the committee urged the design team to consider third-party certification for sustainable design.

Another member of the committee requested that u-racks be added to sidewalks for visitor bike parking.

Multiple committee members commended the design team for making the complex project fit so well within the existing historic and building context.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



They were also pleased to see the reuse of the smaller historic buildings along Sansom Street.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Council President Darrell Clarke, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Corey Bell, Constituent Services Representative, corey.bell@phila.gov
David Gest, Ballard Spahr, LLP, GestD@ballardspahr.com
Travis Oliver, Center City Residents Association (CCRA),
centercityresidents@centercityresidents.org
Kate Esposito, Center City Organized for Responsible Development, ccordrco1@gmail.com
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov
Yaniv Gal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, yaniv.gal@phila.gov



October 22, 2020

Mr. Jeffrey Tan
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 740 Green Street and 741 Spring Garden Street
(Application No. ZP-2020-000857)**

Dear Mr. Tan,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **740 Green Street and 741 Spring Garden Street**.

This proposal is to redevelop a surface lot with a billboard into a new 7-story mixed-use building. The site is zoned CMX-3, and no zoning variances are required. The proposal totals 99,114 gross square feet including 3,361 square feet commercial space on the ground floor, 146 residential units, 29 car parking spaces on the ground floor of the building (4 reserved for care share), and 72 bike parking spaces.

At its meeting of October 22, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments:

A representative from the 14th Ward Democratic Executive Committee attended the meeting and stated that a complete drawing package was not presented to the community and that the RCO and developer agreed verbally to use red bricks for the elevator shaft in addition to the first two floors of the building.

2. CDR Committee Comments:

At the meeting, the CDR Committee provided the following comments and voted to complete the RCO process for this proposal.

The committee's landscape architect recommended that the design team connect the proposed sidewalk tree pits to each other and to the green space on Perth Street to grow healthier street trees.

Another member of the committee recommended that the design team add street trees to the Spring Garden Street frontage and set the building back from Spring Garden Street to add more sidewalk space as an amenity for the retail space. It was also recommended that bike racks be included within the right-of way for retail users and visitors. The project architect stated that this

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



was included in response to Complete Streets comments from Planning Commission staff.

Another member of the committee echoed the staff comment that a lack of defined loading spaces could be an issue for building operations.

Multiple committee members complimented the Spring Garden Street façade's mix of materials and strong composition. However, the committee members echoed the staff comment that the long facades on both 8th and Perth Streets are dominated by ground floor parking and show the shortcomings of the project's design. It was noted that buried parking would allow for a more active ground floor and that the ground floor facades on 8th, Perth, and Green Streets will be subject to Planning Commission design review before a building permit is issued.

It was noted by a member of the committee that more attention should be paid to environmental sustainability for a project of this magnitude.

Lastly, after lengthy discussion, the development team agreed to use red bricks for the exposed elevator shaft if public art is not approved or does not get installed. However, it is their intent to work with Mural Arts to complete a vertical mural on the elevator shaft.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Council President Darrell Clarke, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Corey Bell, Constituent Services Representative, corey.bell@phila.gov
Ronald J. Patterson, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, RPatterson@klehr.com
Kelly Edwards, Arts + Crafts Holdings, kelly@artsandcrafts.holdings
David Urffer, JKRP Architects, durffer@jkrparchitects.com
Ted Mullen, Stantec Consulting Services, ted.mullen@stantec.com
Diane Monroe, 14th Democratic Ward Executive Committee, diana.davis@comcast.net
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, bjchavous@gmail.com
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ian.litwin@phila.gov
Jeffrey Tan, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, jeffrey.tan@phila.gov



October 26, 2020

Mr. Matthew Wojcik
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

Re: Civic Design Review for 209-11 Delmar Street. (Application # ZP-2020-000277)

Dear Mr. Wojcik,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed development at **209-11 Delmar Street**.

The site area is 44,028 S.F. and the proposal is for a lot adjustment, demolition of two existing single family residences, and the erection of two (2) semi-detached structures and three (3) detached structures for use as multi-family household living. The plans are for a total of twenty-three (23) dwelling units, with thirty-seven (37) accessory garage parking spaces, fourteen (14) accessory surface parking spaces, and twenty-three (23) bicycle parking spaces. The project site is zoned RSD-3 and is also located in the open space and natural resources (Steep Slope Protection) overlay as well as the Ridge Park Roxborough NCO district. The proposal requires multiple zoning variances including: number of principle buildings, use, and type, minimum open area, parking space requirements and dimensions, and NCO requirements.

At its meeting of October 22, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments – Ridge Park Civic Association

The RCO representative stated that the community was generally against this development. Their main concern is the size and density of this proposal which would add to the traffic issues that the current residents are dealing with due to the high amount of construction along the relatively narrow Delmar Street. It was noted that these parcels had been downzoned in 2017 to avoid addition of high-density developments to this area. The RCO then voiced concerns that there would most likely be future phases for this developer which would create more problems.

The RCO representative agreed with the staff comments about the unsuitability of the development character compared to the neighborhood. The material color, lack of green space and the large number of parking spaces were also among the issues the representative mentioned.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



Although the RCO agreed with the development team that there was no stormwater management system currently on this site, they believed that this proposal would exacerbate the stormwater runoff issues because of the removal of trees and green space and not having a good stormwater management system in place.

The development team then mentioned that they would be willing to adjust the number of units, materials and massing, as well as improve the walking path connection to the SEPTA station. However, the RCO representative explicitly mentioned that the community did not want any disturbance on the Germany Hill site because of the effects it would have on the stormwater runoff if any of that green space was touched.

2. CDR Committee Comments

The CDR Committee acknowledged that the project site was difficult and the proposal had both positive and negative aspects. The committee appreciated that all the parking spaces were in the back and mentioned that it was a good project located in the wrong neighborhood. The proposal seemed out of place, with its high-density layout along such a narrow street as Delmar, and did not reflect the current green and open dynamic of the neighborhood.

In addition, the Committee noted the following critiques of the project:

1. The committee emphasized the importance of stormwater management for such a steep site and recommended that the development team study that more carefully.
2. The committee echoed the staff comment about the inefficiency of the site plan and recommended considering the addition of an outdoor community space for the residents.
3. One of the committee members noted that there were some issues with the architectural typology of the proposal. While the units fronting Delmar Street had both front and backs, the ones that were located on the southern portion of the site lacked the front faces because of location of parking garages on their ground floors. The committee member then mentioned the importance of establishing a hierarchy of spaces that transition from strictly public to strictly private. Therefore it was recommended that the development team revise the layout reducing the number of units and parking spaces to resolve this issue.
4. The committee underscored the staff comment about the importance of the potential walking connection to the SEPTA station as a great amenity for the neighborhood, although as mentioned above, there was a disagreement from the RCO representative regarding this subject.
5. The Committee also accepted staff comments including:
 - a. The sidewalk along Delmar street is undersized and the building zone is not included. Staff recommends widening the sidewalk to 10' to avoid interruptions in the walking zones. It is also recommended to add trees to the furnishing zone along Delmar Street.
 - b. Most of the site surface is impervious and not enough vegetation is provided. Staff recommends removing some of the parking spaces and reducing the number of apartment units to accommodate a more



useful and enhanced outdoor amenity with more green space as well as private outdoor spaces for each unit to benefit the residents and the environment.

- c. The building massing and facades seem not to work well with the neighborhood character and the residential character of the development. It is recommended to break up the scale and massing and add elements to articulate the facades further.
- d. The dominating material seems too dark for this location. Staff suggests that the applicant works with the community to choose materials that work well with the character of the development and the neighborhood. (Please check the requirements of Ridge Park Roxborough NCO, as vinyl siding is not allowed in this area.)
- e. The trash pickup needs to be explained. The development team should determine how Su-30 trucks can turn into the development to pick up trash.
- f. Very few sustainable design metrics are met. The proposed green space is not enough to meet the pervious site surfaces, or heat island reduction metric. Staff recommends addition of more green space to accommodate for the amount that's been removed.
- g. It is recommended that the applicant invests on formalization of the trail with PPR in order to create a better connection to the SEPTA station and the bike network. Please follow up on the support of an established trail for all abilities with Robert.Armstrong@phila.gov and david.kanthor@phila.gov.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Martine Decamp
Deputy Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Curtis Jones Jr., Curtis.jones.jr@phila.gov
Joshua Cohen, Chief of Staff, Joshua.cohen@phila.gov
Marlene Schleifer, Ridge Park Civic Association, mgschleifer2@verizon.net
Matt Wysong, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Matt.Wysong@phila.gov
Mat Huffman, ALMA Architecture, mhuffman@almaarchitecture.com
David DeRienzo, Delmar Partners LLC, dderienzo@equityretailbrokers.com
Sean Whalen, Vintage Law LLC, sw@vintage-law.com
Matthew Wojcik, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, Matthew.Wojcik@phila.gov



Department of Planning and Development

Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov

Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org

Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



October 23, 2020

Cheli Dahal
Zoning examiner, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garafalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA
Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

Re: Civic Design Review for 2616 S 18th Street (Application No. ZP-2020-000828)

Dear Ms. Dahal:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed commercial building for 2616 S 18th Street.

The project is between Oregon Avenue and Skunk Street. It is bound by 18th Streets to the east and private parcels to the north, south, and west. The project proposes 53,460 square feet comprised of 22 attached single family units in two buildings. There are 44 surface parking spaces.

At its meeting of October 22, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the Civic Design Review process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments:

A representative from Girard Estates Area Residents (GEAR) attended and offered comments on the review process and the project design:

The RCO expressed support for the development stating the developer had answered community questions regarding the brick color and extra lighting. They also asked for darker material colors on the back of the houses and they felt that the site should have more greenery and landscaping. Regarding parking, the RCO expressed support for the proposed parking ratio of two spaces for every unit. They were opposed to any reduction in parking which they felt could result in the overuse of on-street parking, denying those spaces to current residents.

A representative from Girard Estates Neighborhood Association (GENA) also attended and offered comments on the review process and the project design:

They expressed support for the project and noted that the neighbors did not have many concerns. They agreed with Planning Commission staff comments that the backs of the buildings should be more compatible with the neighborhood. They also

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



expressed a concern that the residents of the new project should have more amenities and green spaces on the site. They encouraged the development team to consider reducing the number of units to achieve this, rather than reduce the parking ratio. They also wanted follow-through communications from the developer on the management of trash-removal to ensure that its operations does no harm to the surrounding neighborhood.

2. CDR Committee Comments

The Committee supported aspects of the project noting that the project's scale and heights were comparable to the surrounding community. The committee accepted Planning Commission staff comments which have been incorporated into the text below.

The committee expressed a range of views on parking and provided detailed comments for one point of view that encouraged the applicant to reduce the number of parking spaces. They noted that two parking spaces for each unit is luxurious in this urban location. Specific comments for parking included:

- Reduce the number of parking spaces to create deeper front and rear yards, which are needed amenities for residents of townhomes
- The development team should not prioritize parking over green spaces.
- Consider how the driveway ends to allow for better turn-around spaces

The committee encouraged the development team to balance concerns between maintaining parking and providing amenities by continuing the dialogue with the neighborhood associations.

The committee also felt that the development team could do more to articulate the facades facing 18th Street, noting that they front onto a public street. More could also be done to distinguish between public, semi-private, and private spaces in the parking court, noting that there is a lack of separation between automobiles and social spaces such as stoops and sidewalks. The parking court could also benefit from landscaping, shade cover, and paving materials that suggest a more residential use and sense of place. Finally, it is noted that few sustainable design metrics were being met and that the committee encourages the applicant to meet more of them.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe



Director of Planning and Zoning

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Kenyatta Johnson, Kenyatta.johnson@phila.gov
Frantz Pierre, Legislative Assistant, frantz.pierre@phila.gov
Scott Woodruff, Design Blendz, scottw@designblendz.com
Ron Patterson, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, rpatterson@klehr.com
Paul Rossi, Girard Estate Neighbors Association,
contact@girardestateneighbors.org
Jody Della Barba, Girard Estates Area Residents (GEAR),
cellinoatt@hotmail.com
Ayse Unver, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, ayse.unver@phila.gov
Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, cheli.dahal@phila.gov
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



October 13, 2020

Mr. David Cellini,
Department of Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, Concourse
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

Re: Civic Design Review for 3314 Fairmount Avenue (Application #1057577)

Dear Mr. Cellini,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **3314 Fairmount Avenue**.

The proposal is for a 6-story residential and industrial/commercial mixed-use building with 90 residential units on floors 2-6, totaling 82,776 square feet. The project also proposes ground floor industrial/commercial space totaling 5,200 square feet. The project proposes 16 parking spaces. The proposal is located on an IRMX parcel and is a by-right project.

The CDR Committee reviewed this project at two meetings, the first on September 8 and the second on October 22, 2020. The Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process at their Oct 22 meeting and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments – Mantua Civic Association

The RCO representative provided the following comments at both the September 8th and October 22 meetings, as the design of the building did not change between CDR meetings:

- The RCO representative noted overall disappointment with the outreach and public engagement process from the applicant. The RCO group felt that there was very little community engagement with very insufficient opportunities for input.
- The Community group noted that Melon Street is currently used as main connector street for children accessing adjacent schools and public spaces in the neighborhood, this type of density and building form would negatively impact this street.
- The representative noted that the adjacent alleyways are utilized by neighboring row home residents and asked how this building would impact their use.
- The RCO was frustrated with presentation documents, as they do not show the adjacent existing row homes and the neighborhood building scale around the proposed site.
- The RCO representative noted that the number of units and unit sizes are a concern. The RCO requested fewer units, as well as larger units to lessen the density of the proposal.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



- There was concern over the lack of affordable housing within this proposal.
- The RCO representative noted that 16 parking spaces are not enough for number of proposed units, and there is not enough bike parking
- There were also near neighbor concerns about potential contamination and construction impacts for this project. The RCO requested more investigation into contamination and a construction mitigation plan.
- The RCO representative was discouraged that the applicant did not meet with the community in between CDR meetings. Additionally, the RCO representative noted that none of their concerns were addressed between CDR meetings
- The RCO representative noted that the CDR process felt rushed and that COVID pandemic has impacted community engagement and access to information for proposals.
- Finally, the RCO requested additional meetings with applicant to discuss the project further, after the CDR meetings have concluded.

2. CDR Committee Comments

The Civic Design Review Committee had a number of comments from both the September 8th and October 22 meetings and provided the following comments:

- One CDR Committee member noted that the new development should be designed with the existing community in mind, specifically the scale of the design, architectural details and materials were noted as areas for improvement.
- The CDR Committee noted that this project is too large and should try to fit within existing neighborhood, specifically looking to step the building back to reflect community context.
- The Committee asked who the industrial space is intended for and how the ground floor design would impact the Fairmount Avenue streetscape. Additionally, the Committee asked how would industrial artists utilize the space as proposed? The CDR Committee requested the applicant consider future uses and design the Fairmount Avenue elevation to include a functional storefront or rolling garage windows.
- The CDR Committee noted that more communication with the Mantua community is needed. The Committee requested additional communication with near neighbors to create a better project for everyone
- One Committee member noted that it was disheartening to see IRMX being used for large scale multi-family housing
- There were several discussion points regarding vehicular circulation and vehicular access. It was noted that Fairmount Avenue will be the only access for vehicles, trash, loading and bicycles with pedestrian access focused along Melon Street for the residential lobby and units.
- The Committee recommended setting back the building façade a few feet adjacent to drive aisle to allow for the access drive to work better for people on the sidewalk.
- There was also a request to look at some of the interior functions of the building including
 - Consider incorporating a second elevator – large enough for move-in
 - Look at hallway and doorway locations, as there are currently several internal conflicts



- Consider a taller ceiling-to-floor height for the industrial spaces and parking/loading for better functionality of the interior space. Within the current design, there are operable windows that are adjacent to the 12' drive aisle, these conflicts and no direct loading space for the industrial users, make for an impractical use of the industrial space.
- The CDR Committee asked for the applicant to include street trees along the Fairmount Avenue frontage, making sure they have large tree pits
- Lastly, the CDR Committee asked the applicant to consider more two- and three-bedroom units and a greater unit type mix to benefit a more diverse community. Adding large unit types would also be a solution to decrease the project's density, which was a concern of the RCO.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, garofalod@rowan.edu
Councilmember Jamie Gauthier, Council District 3, Jamie.Gauthier@phila.gov
Andrew Goodman, Representative to Council District 3, Andrew.Goodman@phila.gov
Michael Mattioni, Esq., Mattioni LTD., MMattioni@mattioni.com
Hyon Kang, KCA Design Associates, hukang77@gmail.com
Logan Dry, KCA Design Associates, logan.dry@kcadesignassociates.com
Bernadette Ingrid Wyche, 24th Democratic Ward, biwyche1@gmail.com
DeWayne Drummond, Mantua Civic Association, mrdrumm25@gmail.com
James Wright, People's Emergency Center Community Development Corporation, jameswright@pec-cares.org
Brian Wenrich, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Brian.wenrich@phila.gov
David Cellini, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, David.Cellini@Phila.gov
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov



October 28, 2020

Mr. Frederick Marshall
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP
Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo
Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP
Tavis Dockwiler, RIA
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP
Elise Vider

Re: Civic Design Review for 5001 Umbria Street (App. No. ZP-2020-001619)

Dear Mr. Marshall:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **5001 Umbria Street**.

The proposal is for 253,994 new square feet divided between two structures. The lower structure facing on Umbria Street is five stories with parking and commercial space at the ground floor and 53 dwelling units above. The upper structure accessed from Paoli Avenue is six stories and contains residential amenities and 125 dwelling units. The buildings are joined by an enclosed walkway connecting the third floor of the lower building to the ground floor of the upper building. 113 parking spaces are provided between the enclosed ground floor of the Umbria Street structure and in a rear surface lot accessed from Paoli Avenue. This project requires variances both for use and for building within a steep slope protection area.

At its meeting of October 22, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

1. RCO Comments

Marlene Schleifer of the Ridge Park Civic Association was in attendance and expressed that the experience of working with this development team has been overwhelmingly positive for her organization. She stressed the team's willingness to meet with residents repeatedly and their responsiveness to concerns. By way of example, she mentioned the team's agreement to work with City agencies in order to provide a traffic light at the intersection of Umbria Street and Parker Avenue in order to facilitate safe pedestrian crossings to reach SEPTA's Ivy Hill Station. The resulting project is one for which Ms. Schleifer and her organization have complete support.

2. CDR Committee Comments

The Committee was enthusiastically supportive of the proposal, praising the design team for their thoughtful relationship with the community and for a terrific overall design. The building facing Umbria Street was lauded as adventurous and a rare example of historicism done well for its stylistic reference to the area's post-industrial past. The Committee did encourage the team to work to incorporate improvements to make sure the experience for bicyclists and pedestrians is as safe as possible.

One Parkway Building
1515 Arch St.
13th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone
215-683-4630 Facsimile

www.phila.gov/cityplanning



Some members of the Committee also advised the team to revisit the Umbria Street façade to ensure it is energized and inviting, and extend active uses of the ground floor to more of the street frontage. The entry off Paoli Avenue was also brought up as an opportunity for improvement. The team was encouraged to prioritize the addition of landscape and de-emphasize the parking and auto drop off to make a more welcoming appearance. Even with the suggestions for possible improvements, the Committee was immensely supportive of the project.

3. PCPC Staff Comments

PCPC staff has some reservations about this proposal that were not shared by the Committee. This location has been part of ongoing planning efforts, specifically as part of the Ivy Hill Station Focus Area in the Lower Northwest District Plan. The plan includes recommendations on public green space, building use and form which staff hopes the team will keep in mind moving forward. Significantly, the potential disruption from building the entire Umbria Street volume in an area of steep slope was not addressed or ameliorated in the proposal. PCPC staff greatly appreciates the views of both the community and Committee members. However, staff would also like to ensure that the proposal's impacts on stormwater, bicyclists, and the pedestrian environment are fully considered.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, dkgarofalo@gmail.com
Councilmember Curtis Jones, curtis.jones.jr@phila.gov
Joshua Cohen, Council Office Chief of Staff, joshua.cohen@phila.gov
Christopher Carickhoff, Studio C Architecture, chris.carickhoff@gmail.com
William O'Brian, lawyersonmain@gmail.com
Marlene Schleifer, Ridge Park Civic Association, mgschleifer2@verizon.net
Matt Wysong, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, matt.wysong@phila.gov
Frederick Marshall, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, frederick.marshall@phila.gov
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov