



The Philadelphia Art  
Commission  
Established 1911

## Minutes

### The Philadelphia Art Commission

Wednesday, October 7, 2020 - 9:30 a.m.

Remote – Zoom Meeting – Hosted by DPZ

Alan Greenberger  
Chair

Members Present: Alan Greenberger, Jose Alminana, Carmen Febo San Miguel, Raed Nasser, Robert Roesch, Mario Zacharjasz, Steve Hartner

José Almiñana

### Meeting of the Philadelphia Art Commission

Carmen Febo San Miguel

Bridget Collins-Greenwald

Joe Laragione

*Beige Berryman – staff member of the Art Commission – introduced the Zoom platform and remote Art Commission process, noting that the meeting is being recorded and those participating in the meeting are giving their consent to be recorded. The meeting recording will be posted on the AC website and the meeting agenda and materials will also be posted online at: (<https://www.phila.gov/departments/philadelphia-art-commission/>).*

Raed Nasser

Natalie Nixon

Robert Roesch

*Ms. Berryman stated a few instructions for the public. Participants may comment on agenda items during the meeting, comments can be made by using the “raise hand” feature during the public comment period. If you have submitted comments through email, Art Commission staff will read those emails out loud during the comment period. In addition, if you are participating by phone, you can activate the “raise hand” feature by pressing \*9 and staff will unmute you at the appropriate time.*

Mario Zacharjasz

Steve Hartner

*Lastly, the Art Commission will be voting by roll call, and Ms. Berryman will be asking commissioners for their vote verbally and individually at the end of each agenda item.*

C. Beige Berryman  
Staff

### Meeting Minutes

At 00:02:14, Chairperson Greenberger began the meeting with the administrative items: meeting minutes from July 22 and August 12, 2020 (combined document from the two special meeting dates) and September 2, 2020.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Seeing no questions or comments from the Commission, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve the minutes.

215-683-4674  
artcommission@phila.gov

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Roesch and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel, the Commission voted to approve the combined minutes from July and August, and September minutes. The Commission voted unanimously for approval.*

## **Sign Committee Report**

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve the sign committee recommendation.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Alminana and seconded by Commissioner Hartner (00:04:11), the Commission voted unanimously for approval.*

## **Administrative Agenda**

### **1. Mixed-use development proposal**

204 S. 12<sup>th</sup> Street

Review Type: Zoning Code public art bonus

Submitted by: Art Commission Counsel

At (00:04:45), Ms. Berryman began the Administrative Agenda. This agreement is for the development proposal to use the public art bonus in the zoning code and includes financial commitments, as well as timing commitments for the public art. The public art itself is required to return to the Art Commission for further review.

### **2. Conservation of Multiple Sculptures**

Various locations

Review Type: Artwork conservation paid by City funds

Submitted by: Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy

This is a submission from the Public Art Office for conservation work to be completed in October and November for four sculptures.

### **3. Weaver's Knot: Sheet Bend**

Delaware River trail between the Cherry and Race Street Piers

Review Type: Public art proposal

Submitted by: Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy

This public art was approved by the Art Commission at the June 2020 meeting. Due to unforeseen circumstances, installation at the original proposed location is no longer possible. The original location was south of Pier 3, and, the new location is proposed a little north between Cherry Street and Race Street Piers. At (00:06:50), Chairperson Greenberger added that the piece itself was not site specific to the original location.

### **4. Rudolph Blankenburg Elementary School**

4600 Girard Avenue

Review Type: Construction paid by City funds

Submitted by: The Sheward Partnership

This proposal is for a new cafeteria located in the basement of the existing school. The existing cafeteria building will be demolished. Associated mechanical equipment and venting will be necessary for the new basement location. Majority of the work will be on the interior and the project team worked with staff to provide some additional information and landscape screening for the exterior equipment.

**5. Office of Emergency Management**

400 N. Broad Street

Review Type: Construction paid by City funds

Submitted by: IEI Architects

The office is relocating to 400 N. Broad Street. The majority of the work is interior. There's new exterior rooftop equipment and all efforts to hide the rooftop equipment are being made. The Public Art Director confirmed that the scope of work does not trigger the City Percent for Art requirement.

**6. West Oak Lane Water Pumping Station**

1913 68<sup>th</sup> Avenue

Review Type: Construction paid by City funds

Submitted by: Trans-Pacific Engineering Corps

This is also a renovation and maintenance project that includes equipment replacement, various improvements to the site and the building. The Public Art Director confirmed that the scope of work does not trigger the City Percent for Art requirement.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve the Administrative Agenda.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Zacharjasz and seconded by Commissioner Roesch (00:09:29), the Commission voted unanimously for approval.*

**Presentations – Second Review**

**1. Anna B. Pratt School**

2200 N. 22<sup>nd</sup> Street

Review Type: Alteration of City property

Submitted by: GKO Architects

At (00:11:30), Susan Feenan began the presentation by describing the material details of the building and site elements that are being renovated including metal cladding, decorative fencing, exterior windows, exterior security screens, exterior painting and exterior doors. The color schemes were also described in detail.

*Questions and comments from the Commission begin at (00:20:07).*

The Commission commended the presentation as a great model for other applicants to follow. Commissioner Alminana inquired about the decorative fencing and asked where it was manufactured, then suggested looking into Jefferson University for another example of a similar fence. The fencing was manufactured in the Netherlands. Commissioner Roesch asked about the playground fencing and if it was going to be upgraded. After clarification that the rendering was not an accurate depiction of the existing conditions of the kindergarten play area, it was established that the fencing is original and is not going to change.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Hartner (00:22:27), Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Roesch, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (7-0).*

## **2. T. M. Peirce Elementary School**

2300 W. Cambria Street  
Review Type: Alteration of City property  
Submitted by: Blackney Hayes Architects

At (00:25:08), Kevin Blackney summarized the presentation followed by Carmen Bushong (00:36:45) who reviewed the details of the second review in greater depth. Commissioner Alminana asked a clarifying question about the direction that the playground area is facing. The presentation continued and mentioned that a focus group has helped to select the materials and play equipment and other elements of the playground that they desired.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (00:38:20).*

Chairperson Greenberger inquired about the surface material of the playground, as well as the life expectancy of asphalt. Some of the area is rubberized and the rest is painted asphalt. Commissioner Zacharjasz asked if there were any lawn areas. Except for where the trees are, it's all painted asphalt.

Commissioner Alminana asked about the type of trees that would be on the side of the building as the southwest exposure does not offer enough shade. Trees will be planted alongside 23<sup>rd</sup> Street and shade would be provided, but he noted that according to the plant schedule, the trees will not be especially tall. The underground stormwater management system precludes tree planting towards the interior of the site.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel inquired about the timeline on the project, which is to go out to bid shortly after the beginning of the year with an estimated opening in 2023.

Chairperson Greenberger voiced excitement that a new public school was being constructed, commended the materials, the presentation, and the community engagement. He suggested having some information in the lobby of the school explaining the story behind the T. M. Peirce name. Nicole Ward mentioned that some schools and principals are looking to rename schools after something that is more meaningful than a person's name, and this name may change in the future.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Alminana and seconded by Commissioner Roesch (00:52:18), Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Nasser,*

*Commissioner Roesch, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (7-0).*

### **3. Meredith School**

725 S. 5<sup>th</sup> street

Review Type: Alteration of City property

Submitted by: OZ Collaborative

William Collette began this presentation at the minute mark (00:53:23). The project is for a modular classroom building which will be an extension of the Meredith School. Chairperson Greenberger asked about the long-term timeline for replacement of the temporary structure, and if it was a capital project. Nicole Ward responded that when they usually build modular additions, it is to address immediate needs. In this circumstance, the project will be there for a while and is not in the capital budget.

*Discussion begins at minute mark (01:04:10).*

There was some discussion about the color of the structure as well as the bright metal railings. Commissioner Alminana discussed potential landscape treatments at the fence against Monroe Street and improvements to the yard. The response was that school has a limited budget and also limited space near the sidewalk edge for additional plantings.

During the conclusion of the discussion, the admission was made that the building was already constructed.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Alminana and seconded by Commissioner Hartner (01:07:42), Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Roesch, Commissioner Zacharjasz and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (7-0).*

*Chairperson Greenberger added if there's an emergency exception granted by L&I, make sure that is clear to staff in order for them to handle it administratively.*

### **4. Torresdale Water Pump Station**

8601 State Road

Review Type: Alteration of City property

Submitted by: Brown and Caldwell

Chris Patakis began the presentation at (01:09:17). Regarding the existing site conditions, the City owns the whole parcel and the eastside of the existing pump station building is the area that they are going to modify. They are going to match the architectural features of the new surge building to the existing gate house. Proposed materials for the pump station building are brick, granite and aluminum frame windows. The new rooms include office space, new pump rooms, and a new restroom and ADA restroom. The electrical transformers and security type fencing are on the east elevation.

Commissioner Roesch was concerned about the existing open bays being closed. It was for ventilation and now the new transformers will be on concrete pads exterior to the building, separate from the building, so enclosing the bays does not have any negative effects.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Zacharjasz (01:16:38), Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Roesch, Commissioner Zacharjasz and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (7-0).*

## **5. John F. Byrne Clubhouse**

9950 Leon Street

Review Type: Alteration of City property

Submitted by: Kimmel Bogrette

The presentation began at (01:17:30) by Joe Horan and William Hyndman. They operate two golf courses that are City properties. On November 1, 2019, they took over the John F. Byrne Clubhouse, which had been slated to close. They have a cost-efficient plan to renovate without tearing it down. Due to deferred maintenance through the years, they have to address exterior, interior, and accessibility issues. The proposed exterior materials are composite decking, vinyl railing system, fiber cement siding and existing brick.

Chairperson Greenberger extended appreciation to the team that the accessible path at the front entrance appeared more functional than at the first review. He clarified that on day one of reopening the facility, the Commission expects a legal and compliant method of getting into the building. In the longer term, budget may allow for additional landscaping to the entrance area.

Seeing no further questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Hartner (01:25:00), Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Roesch, Commissioner Zacharjasz and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (7-0).*

## **6. ADA Accessibility Ramp**

100 S. independence Mall West

Review Type: Construction in the right-of-way

Submitted by: L2P

Brett Feldman began the presentation at (01:27:10). Mr. Phillip explained the revisions made since the first review, including matching the brick paving pattern that exists in the sidewalk and the material change of the ramp's railing to glass.

*Questions and comments from the Commission at the minute mark (01:34:30).*

Chairperson Greenberger acknowledged the "balancing act" that is required to accommodate all users within a limited sidewalk width. Seeing no further questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Alminana (01:41:23).*

*Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Roesch, Commissioner Zacharjasz and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (7-0).*

## **Presentations – Concept Review**

### **1. FloatLab**

2901 and 3101 S. 56<sup>th</sup> Street

Review Type: Artwork placed on City property

Submitted by: Mural Arts Philadelphia

Maitreyi Roy began the presentation at (01:43:13) and Meejin Yoon continued. This is a partnership project with Mural Arts and Bartram's Garden. They have the opportunity to utilize the river for more water and educational programming. They are already engaging 10,000 school children every year about the necessity to keep the river clean. FloatLab is a sculptural barge, docked in the Schuylkill River adjacent to Bartram's Garden, which will uniquely frame the river and its ecological systems.

*Discussions began at the minute mark (01:57:57).*

Commissioner Roesch began by stating that FloatLab has a beautiful design but was concerned about the water quality in the center of the barge as the water might be stagnant. Commissioner Zacharjasz had additional questions including how would private boats be discouraged from docking, how would wakes from passing boats and waves from tides effect the structure, and how were the safety risks being addressed.

Commissioner Greenberger then inquired about the management of FloatLab and its related programming. Maitreyi Roy responded that Bartram's Garden staff will be managing visitors to the structure (restricting number of people on the barge, distributing life vests, including signage) and the paddlers. Trained paddling staff will balance the use of this proposed barge and their existing dock.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel praised the project and ask about the cost to participate in the programming. Maitreyi Roy confirmed that the programming will be offered for free.

Commissioner Alminana returned to the safety questions, wondering if there is a barrier in the water if people fall, and if the structure could be docked further west (closer to the shore) to avoid currents as much as possible. He stated the importance of working closely with the Department of Licenses and Inspections for this application.

A member of the public, Scott Lauer, commented that only having two spots for kayaks to dock may not be enough. The applicants responded that the existing dock will continue to function as the primary dock for their kayak program, and FloatLab will be primarily used by people on the lab, rather than paddlers in the water.

Seeing no further questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion for concept approval.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Nasser and seconded by Commissioner Zacharjasz (02:26:04)., Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Roesch, Commissioner Zacharjasz, and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (7-0).*

## **2. Rhawnhurst Elementary School**

7809 Castor Avenue

Review Type: Construction paid by City funds

Submitted by: Crabtree, Rohrbaugh and Associates

The presentation began at (02:28:39) by Amy Hunnicut and Jeffrey Straub. Rhawnhurst Elementary has 750 students and was built in 1948. The proposal is to add 34,000 square feet to the building, including 17 educational stations and 12 classrooms. The cafeteria and classroom addition face Large Street. The schedule for the project is for design to be completed in October 2020; SRC Board approval in January 2021; and construction to begin in February 2021 with 18 months of construction and finishing by August 2022.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel asked if construction would occur while school was in session. Module classrooms will be used during construction.

Commissioner Alminana asked some questions about the site plan, including if the trees that are being removed are getting replaced and what was the stormwater management plan. Trees that are being removed will be replaced with commensurate tree plantings and stormwater will be handled by underground tanks.

Chairperson Greenberger stated that the Commission would like to see the project again for second review with final materials and any value engineering adjustments that might be made.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion for concept approval.

*Upon motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Alminana (02:54:30), Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner,*



*Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Roesch, Commissioner Zacharjasz and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (7-0).*

### **3. Frank Glavin Memorial Playground Renovation Project**

2600 E. Westmoreland Street

Review Type: Construction paid by City funds

Submitted by: Pennsylvania Horticultural Society

Rae Vassar began the presentation at (02:57:35). Most of the changes to the building will be made to the interior, the exterior renovations are modest, including replacing two wood columns. Playground equipment changes and exterior site improvements are also part of the proposal. There was not clarity during the presentation whether playground improvements were within the Commission's review jurisdiction. Chairperson Greenberger suggested that the changes to the building, being fairly modest, could be approved today administratively but that further investigation about the playground review is needed. The future determination of the playground review would then impact if the remainder of the proposal would need to return to the Commission.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion for administrative approval of the building modifications only.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Febo San Miguel and seconded by Commissioner Nasser (03:00:08), the Commission voted unanimously for administrative approval for the building improvements.*

### **4. Penn Center Transportation Gateway**

Transit entrances and plaza between 1515 Market Street and Two Penn Center

Review Type: Public art restoration

Submitted by: Gannett Fleming

The presentation began at (03:01:09) with an introduction of the project team by Steve Deller: Center City District is the sponsor, project manager is Gannett Fleming Inc., KieranTimberlake is the architect, and a lighting design firm is also on the team. Paul Levy continued the presentation outlining the ownership of the spaces under consideration. The spaces are privately owned with several entities managing them. Negotiations with all the owners occurred to make the project a potential reality. The general project timeline includes bidding the project in the second or third quarter of 2021 and beginning construction shortly thereafter. From a budget standpoint, the design has shown an overall estimate of \$7 million, with the plan to fund it by CCD, the adjacent owners, and any grants that they are able to secure.

The proposal includes plaza improvements at both the sunken courtyard level and sidewalk level, potential renovations to the artwork (including relighting it), and staircase, elevator, and headhouse improvements. Currently the spaces are not well maintained and not well used. Together the proposal creates a vibrant transportation gateway that is very much needed for this high profile and busy location.

At (03:23:51) Mr. Levy briefly clarified the ownership circumstances around the site, all the land is privately owned but ownership of the artwork remains ambiguous at

this time. Additionally, renovations to the existing art are not defined as the artist has not agreed to the proposal. In order to fit stair access down into the sunken courtyard, modifications to the artwork are needed. Potential ideas for modification are to remove some of the western most benches and recreate them in the paving pattern and with lighting.

They went on to discuss details about the elevator, and headhouse design.

*Questions and comments from the Commission start at the minute mark (03:27:08).*

Chairperson Greenberger outlined three main aspects to the proposed design, the unified approach to the transit entrances, the iconic elevator headhouse, and modifications to the art.

Commissioner Alminana asked if the elevator design would change if the existing art was relocated, as the two elements visually relate. While the design may have to be minorly reconsidered, its sculptural form contrasts with the rigidity of the existing surrounding buildings, making the general intent of the design still applicable.

Commissioner Roesch inquired about the artist's preferences further. The current conflict is that the artist prefers the work to remain intact, or be relocated, but not modified. Some legal issues need to be investigated. He encouraged all parties to embrace the piece as if it were fully public art and modify it so that it may remain in place, as it is very site specific. There was general agreement from the commissioners that all the western benches should be treated in the same manner, using the bench top material in the surface paving and lighting the benchtop form was preferable. There was recognition that being flexible will be the key to the success of this project.

Commissioner Alminana critiqued the bronze railing treatment, wondering if the proposed railing guard design was too dark in color and too dense to achieve the visibility desired. He suggested that more transparency in the railing is needed.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion for concept approval.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Roesch and seconded by Commissioner Hartner (03:42:18), Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Roesch, and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for concept approval (5-0).*

## **5. Right Here, Stenton Museum Public Art**

4601 N. 18<sup>th</sup> Street

Review Type: Public art proposal

Submitted by: Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy

Presentation began at (03:44:15) by Laura Keim and artist Karyn Olivier. Neighbors do not feel welcomed into the site, and the proposed new 21<sup>st</sup>-century memorial to Dinah included community collaboration. The memorial elevates and commemorates Dinah's full story and humanity and addresses the national debate about monuments

and the absence of memorials to millions of enslaved Africans and African Americans, whose contributions to our history remain ignored or silenced in many public spaces.

*Discussion with the Commission began at the minute mark (04:00:06).*

Commissioner Alminana questioned the 3'-6" dimension of the pathway, as he is concerned that the dimension is not gracious enough to feel welcoming to everyone. The artist wants to create an intimate space, and so must balance that goal with the recommendation.

Commissioner Roesch asked about the visibility and legibility of the text on the plaque. The artist confirmed the large size and engraved method.

Commissioner Febo San Miguel expressed overwhelming support for the proposal noting that it is very timely.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked for a motion for final approval, with a note that the artist will check the pathway dimensions.

*Upon motion made by Commissioner Alminana and seconded by Commissioner Febo San Miguel (04:02:28). Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Febo San Miguel, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Roesch, and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (6-0).*

## **6. Osage Pine Public art**

6200 Block of Osage Avenue & Pine Street

Review Type: Artwork placed on City property

Submitted by: Office of Arts, Culture, and the Creative Economy

The presentation began at (04:04:37) by Shelley Spector. "We are here" is a multidisciplinary creative project that uses documentary in combination with text-based public artworks to encapsulate the words and memories of longtime neighbors of the 6200 block of Osage Avenue and Pine Street. The public art mimics typical street furnishings such as crosswalks, street signs and maintenance hole covers. Once installed, the physical artwork will be owned by the City.

Chairperson Greenberger asked about the interconnection between the physical artwork and the digital documentary. The connection is not made explicitly on the pieces, but they are going to create a multi-media website, which will host the documentary and other information. The artist stated they would consider the suggestion of adding something along the lines of a QR code to the signs, but also voiced concern that the art piece is primarily for the neighbors rather than for visitors.

Seeing no questions or comments, Chairperson Greenberger asked if there was a motion to approve for final approval.

*Upon the motion made by Commissioner Zacharjasz and seconded by Commissioner Alminana, Ms. Berryman polled the Commission. Commissioner Alminana, Commissioner Hartner, Commissioner Nasser, Commissioner Roesch,*

*Commissioner Zacharjasz and Chairperson Greenberger. The Commission voted unanimously for final approval (6-0).*

Chairperson Greenberger thanked everyone and the Commission. The October 7, 2020 Art Commission was adjourned at the minute mark (04:20:04).

*Ended at 1:50 p.m.*

**The next Art Commission will be held Wednesday, November 4, 2020 at 9:30 a.m. via Zoom.**