



September 21, 2020

Mr. Paulose Isaac  
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA  
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 3226-3258 Germantown Avenue (Application No. 1055801)**

Dear Mr. Isaac,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **3226-3258 Germantown Avenue**.

The proposal is for a mixed-use affordable housing development at the corner of Germantown Avenue and Westmoreland Street that includes the renovation of the Carman Gardens Building. The proposal is for a 58,970 square feet mixed-use building including 2,100 sf of new commercial space, 10,800 sf of commercial space in the renovated Carman Gardens building, 41 residential units, and 25 surface parking spaces.

The site is split zoned RM-1 and CMX-2; however, RM-1 applies to the entire lot because it covers more than 20% of the parcel. Due in part to the split zoning, the project will require four zoning variances, including height, use, parking lot access, parking lot location.

At its meeting of September 14, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**1. RCO Comments:**

A representative from the Nicetown Tioga Improvement Team (NTIT) attended the meeting and offered the following comments:

NTIT welcomes the new housing development as there hasn't been any redevelopment east of Broad Street in twenty years besides hospital related development. In addition, NTIT brought attention to the neighborhood's issues with increased summertime temperatures due to global warming and the urban heat island effect and asked the design team to include awnings to increase shade.

**2. CDR Committee Comments:**

At the meeting, the CDR Committee shared their appreciation for the design and programming of the project.

Members of the CDR committee shared their appreciation that the development team is building affordable housing and including the renovation of the existing Carman Gardens building in the proposed project.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



Members of the CDR committee shared with the design team their appreciation for the quality and mix of materials proposed for the project. They also appreciated the set-back proposed for the corner of Germantown Avenue and Westmoreland Street. However, a member of the CDR committee commented that a water table could help to improve the building façade design on Germantown Avenue.

The CDR committee's landscape architect advocated for a selection of native plants and for planters as large as possible with self-watering capabilities to help ensure the success of the plants.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Councilmember Darrell Clarke, [darrell.clarke@phila.gov](mailto:darrell.clarke@phila.gov)  
Nancy Bastian, Cecil Baker + Partners, [nbastian@cecilbakerpartners.com](mailto:nbastian@cecilbakerpartners.com)  
Leslie Cunningham, Cornerstone Engineering, [lcunningham@cornerstonenet.com](mailto:lcunningham@cornerstonenet.com)  
Josh Klaris, North10 Philadelphia, [josh@north10phl.org](mailto:josh@north10phl.org)  
Jared Klein, Esq., Blank Rome, [jklein@blankrome.com](mailto:jklein@blankrome.com)  
Cynthia Barnes, Nicetown-Tioga Improvement Team, [cynthiab127@yahoo.com](mailto:cynthiab127@yahoo.com)  
Tinamarie Russell, North Central Philadelphia Susquehanna CDC, [info@ncpcdc.org](mailto:info@ncpcdc.org)  
Norman Wooten, 12th and Cambria Advisory Board, [Rangesssab1@outlook.com](mailto:Rangesssab1@outlook.com)  
Martin A Strom, 43rd Democratic Ward, [mstrom011@gmail.com](mailto:mstrom011@gmail.com)  
Charles Lanier, Hunting Park Neighborhood Advisory Committee, [hunting.parknac@verizon.net](mailto:hunting.parknac@verizon.net)  
Ariel Diliberto, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [ariel.diliberto@phila.gov](mailto:ariel.diliberto@phila.gov)  
Paulose Isaac, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [Paulose.Isaac@phila.gov](mailto:Paulose.Isaac@phila.gov)



Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA  
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
Elise Vider

September 17, 2020

Ms. Cheli R. Dahal  
Department of Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, Concourse  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1030 West Girard Ave. (Application # 1055043)**

Dear Ms. Dahal,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed development at **1030 West Girard Avenue**.

The site area is 23,520 square feet and the proposal is for the demolition of an existing two-story warehouse and the erection of a six-story building including 142,250 S.F. of new gross floor area. The proposed uses are as follows: 120 residential units, five configurable commercial spaces, 55 underground parking spaces, and a roof garden. The project site is zoned CMX-2.5 and the proposal requires multiple zoning variances including: height, number of units, occupied area, and open space.

At its meeting of September 14, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**1. RCO Comments – 14<sup>th</sup> Ward Democratic Executive Committee**

The RCO representative agreed with the staff comments about the sidewalks' width being less than standard. There was a question raised about the community's reluctance to have black brick material on the façade because of inconsistency throughout Girard Avenue which the development team agreed to replace with red brick.

The representative then noted that the community had not had any negative comments and concerns about this proposal similar to the phase I which had been approved the previous year. Finally, the RCO representative mentioned that the development team had agreed with the items discussed in their public meeting which was included in the letter sent to the CDR Committee.

**2. CDR Committee Comments**

The CDR Committee supported the proposal overall and appreciated that the applicant had considered all four elevations as "fronts", creating the maisonettes, as well as continuing the character and materials of the surrounding area.

In addition, the Committee had the following recommendations for the project:



1. The Committee and PCPC Staff had concerns about the sidewalk width along Harper Street especially on the west side.
2. One of the committee members recommended that the applicant would select a different tree species other than zelkova, because of its lack of durability and the design team agreed to do so.
3. The Committee also accepted staff comments including:
  - a. PCPC staff appreciates the activation of the Girard Avenue with addition of transparent retail spaces and residential terraces on the upper levels as well as the roof deck amenity space.
  - b. The walking zone along Harper Street is undersized, inconsistent, and often interrupted via vehicular traffic and the 3.2' furnishing zone is less than standard and it is not suitable for trees to survive. Staff recommends provision of the minimum rear yard depth to give enough space for widening the sidewalk to 10'.
  - c. The maisonettes' entrances interfere with the public realm. It is recommended to add a buffer between the entrances and the sidewalk. The recommendation mentioned above would also benefit from resolving this issue.
  - d. The walking zone along 11th Street is undersized and interrupted via bus shelter and the 3' building zone. Staff recommends setting the building back to resolve this issue.
  - e. Multiple entrances to the residential tower on Girard Avenue and Harper Street is appreciated, however the design team agreed to combine the two entrances on N 11<sup>th</sup> street.
  - f. Staff recommends that 10 U bike racks be added for commercial use on W. Girard Avenue.
  - g. It is noted that the floor plan layout is very dense and therefore, staff recommends adding more open space to the ground floor and street level wherever feasible. Also, the feasibility of the vegetation on the courtyard level is concerning and has to be examined.
  - h. Staff commends the development team for locating the vehicular entrances to the rear side of the building.
  - i. Staff encourages the applicant to pursue LEED or third-party certification.
  - j. It is recommended to add a bike share station which could benefit the future residents of the neighborhood.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, [nrt23@drexel.edu](mailto:nrt23@drexel.edu)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Darrell Clarke, [darrell.clarke@phila.gov](mailto:darrell.clarke@phila.gov)



Corey Bell, Constituent Services Representative, [corey.bell@phila.gov](mailto:corey.bell@phila.gov)  
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, [bjchavous@gmail.com](mailto:bjchavous@gmail.com)  
Bernard Gorham, Richard allen New Generation, [diggstonya@gmail.com](mailto:diggstonya@gmail.com)  
Diane Monroe, 14<sup>th</sup> Ward Executive Committee, [diana.davis@comcast.net](mailto:diana.davis@comcast.net)  
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [David.fecteau@phila.gov](mailto:David.fecteau@phila.gov)  
Justin Coleman, sgRA Architecture, [permits@sgra.com](mailto:permits@sgra.com)  
Stuart Rosenberg, sgRA Architecture, [Jcoleman@sgra.com](mailto:Jcoleman@sgra.com)  
Adam Laver, Blank Rome LLP, [laver@blankrome.com](mailto:laver@blankrome.com)  
Cheli Dahal, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [cheli.r.dahal@phila.gov](mailto:cheli.r.dahal@phila.gov)  
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, [christopher.renfro@phila.gov](mailto:christopher.renfro@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)



Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA  
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
Elise Vider

September 17, 2020

Mr. Christopher Hartland  
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

**Re: Civic Design Review for 1121 N. Delaware Avenue (Application No. ZP-2020-000442C)**

Dear Mr. Hartland:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **1121 N. Delaware Avenue**.

The proposal is for 236,099 total new gross square feet including 116 total residential units distributed between 28 four-story single-family rowhomes and 2 six-story multi-family buildings with commercial ground floor space facing Delaware Avenue. 34 parking spaces are provided in addition to the 2-car parking at each rowhome. This project has no zoning variances and is by-right.

At its meeting of September 14, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**1. RCO Comments**

Nando Micale of the Central Delaware Advocacy Group was in attendance to discuss community concerns. Mr. Micale expressed frustration that none of the previous issues brought up by the community at the August 17<sup>th</sup> meeting were addressed by the design team. He itemized key concerns including a need to broadly rethink the pedestrian experience and the connection through the site to the Delaware River, the orientation and design of the rowhouses as a missed opportunity to promote activity, and the lack of thoughtfulness regarding the location of retail through the site.

**2. CDR Committee Comments**

The CDR Committee offered limited comments in recognition of the few substantive changes made by the design team in response to comments from the first meeting and generally expressed disappointment. The Committee encouraged the team to revisit the past comments. The design team was urged to reconsider the potential for retail located adjacent to the Delaware River Trail and to continue to develop the rowhome façade facing the river to offer more vibrancy and differentiation rather than the monolithic structure currently shown.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, [nrt23@drexel.edu](mailto:nrt23@drexel.edu)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Mark Squilla, [mark.squilla@phila.gov](mailto:mark.squilla@phila.gov)  
Sean McMonagle, [Sean.McMonagle@phila.gov](mailto:Sean.McMonagle@phila.gov)  
Marie Beren, [Marie.Beren@phila.gov](mailto:Marie.Beren@phila.gov)  
Stephen Maffei, Arbitare Design Studio, [stephen.maffei@abitareds.com](mailto:stephen.maffei@abitareds.com)  
Hercules Grigos, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, [hgrigos@klehr.com](mailto:hgrigos@klehr.com)  
Ian Wilson, Fishtown Neighbors Association, [zoning@fishtown.org](mailto:zoning@fishtown.org)  
Jessica Hoffman, New Kensington CDC, [jhoffman@nkcddc.org](mailto:jhoffman@nkcddc.org)  
Matt Ruben, Central Delaware Advocacy Group, [mruben@gmail.com](mailto:mruben@gmail.com)  
Larissa Staszkiw, Riverside of Fishtown Neighbors Association, [larissa.staszkiw@gmail.com](mailto:larissa.staszkiw@gmail.com)  
Barbara Pennock, West Girard Progress, [bjchavous@gmail.com](mailto:bjchavous@gmail.com)  
Craig Charlton, 5th Republic Ward RCO, [charlton\\_craig@hotmail.com](mailto:charlton_craig@hotmail.com)  
Dave Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [david.fecteau@phila.gov](mailto:david.fecteau@phila.gov)  
Christopher Hartland, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [christopher.Hartland@phila.gov](mailto:christopher.Hartland@phila.gov)  
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, [christopher.renfro@phila.gov](mailto:christopher.renfro@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)





September 16, 2020

Mr. Srivatsa Krishnan  
Department of Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, Concourse  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiler, RLA  
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 2224-50 Germantown Avenue (Application # 1042687)**

Dear Mr. Krishnan,

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **2224-50 Germantown Avenue**.

The proposal is for a 4-story residential and commercial mixed-use building with 72 residential units on floors 2-4. The project also proposes a ground floor commercial space. The project proposes 52 underground parking spaces. The proposal sits on a CMX-2 parcel and is a by-right project. The applicant is using the Fresh Food Market Zoning Bonus.

At its meeting of September 14, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**1. RCO Comments – Asociación Puertorriqueños en Marcha (APM)**

The RCO representative noted that their organization had several concerns with this project, specifically:

- Concerns about stormwater management – The RCO representative noted there is currently flooding in their neighborhood and wanted to make sure stormwater was managed correctly for this project as to not further the impact the surrounding blocks
- Concerns about proposed parking – The community believes there is not enough parking for this proposal based on the number of proposed units. The representative noted there are already parking challenges in the neighborhood and this project would bring new concerns specifically for visitors of the proposed food market.
- Affordability – Finally, the RCO representative noted that the community group had concerns with the lack of affordable units proposed. Many current residents are concerned that prices will be too high for surrounding community.

**2. CDR Committee Comments**

The Civic Design Review Committee had a number of positive comments and generally agreed that this proposal was commendable with many thoughtful decisions. The Committee and PCPC staff did provide the following comments:

- The Committee asked for further articulation and diagramming to further understand the utility and back of house functions of fresh food market. Some Committee

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)





- members and PCPC staff recommended creating more of an amenity courtyard space for residents. Other Committee members noted the need for back of house functions, especially for a fresh food market, but noted that more could be done to create an aesthetically pleasing back of house. It was noted that daily deliveries and loading need to be considered.
- The Committee responded to the RCO comments about affordability and asked the applicant to consider more of a residential unit mix, suggesting that the building could have 3-bedroom units in addition to 1 and 2 bedrooms, which allows for varying types of housing for the community.
  - The Committee noted an appreciation for the proposed materials noting the high-quality selection for the façade. One Committee member asked about the black corrugated metal color and it was noted by the applicant that the black metal siding is internal to the site, while the white brick and white metal panels are the public facing façade materials.
  - The Committee applauded the highly visible, full sized ground level windows, noting it will be great for the fresh food market to highlight items in the window. To further strengthen this concept, one Committee member asked the applicant to consider awnings along the commercial frontage. These awnings could provide shelter for outdoor displays and help pedestrians walking by see into market. Awnings are utilized in many commercial areas of the city and could help strengthen the market's appearance on the street.
  - Lastly, the Committee asked the applicant to consider adding larger shade trees along the street frontages. Currently there are no utility poles that would prohibit larger shade trees. The proposal shows several understory trees currently.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, [nrt23@drexel.edu](mailto:nrt23@drexel.edu)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Council President Darrell Clarke, Council District 5, [Darrell.Clarke@phila.gov](mailto:Darrell.Clarke@phila.gov)  
Corey Bell, Representative to Council District 5, [Corey.Bell@Phila.gov](mailto:Corey.Bell@Phila.gov)  
Michael Phillips, Esq., Obermayer Rebmann Maxwell & Hippel LLP, [michael.phillips@obermayer.com](mailto:michael.phillips@obermayer.com)  
Carey Jackson Yonce, CANNO Design, [carey@cannodesign.com](mailto:carey@cannodesign.com)  
Victoria Cubillos-Cañón, Asociacion Puertorriquenos En Marcha (APM), [RCO@apmphila.org](mailto:RCO@apmphila.org)  
Aviva Kapust, Village of Arts and Humanities, [rco@villagearts.org](mailto:rco@villagearts.org)  
Peter Crawford, Temple Area Property Association (TAPA), [peter@crawfordgroup.org](mailto:peter@crawfordgroup.org)  
El Amor Mapenzi Brawn Ali, 37th Ward Executive Democratic Committee, [deniselaurelanderson@gmail.com](mailto:deniselaurelanderson@gmail.com)  
David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [David.Fecteau@phila.gov](mailto:David.Fecteau@phila.gov)



Department of Planning and Development

## Civic Design Review

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA

---

Srivatsa Krishnan, Department of License and Inspections, [shivatsa.krishnan@phila.gov](mailto:shivatsa.krishnan@phila.gov)

Chris Renfro, Streets Department, [christopher.renfro@phila.gov](mailto:christopher.renfro@phila.gov)

Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)

Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)



September 15, 2020

Srivatsa Krishnan  
Plan Examiner, Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA  
Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 5350 Ogontz Avenue Keystone Street (Application No. 1044647)**

Dear Mr. Krishnan:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed mixed-use development at **5350 Ogontz Avenue**.

The proposal is for demolition of an existing armory and development of a 114,900-square-foot moving and storage building situated on the west side of Ogontz Avenue between Somerville and Fisher Avenues. The site is within an RSA-3 and SP-PO-A zoning districts. Five use refusals and one zoning (dimensional) refusal were identified.

At its meeting of September 14, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the CDR process and offered the following comments:

**1. RCO Comments:**

A representative from A Concerned Community Association (ACCA) attended the September 14<sup>th</sup> meeting and offered the following comments and recommendations:

- a. The RCO's primary concern is about access to and from the proposed building by car, especially during school drop-off hours and rush hours. The applicant agreed to consider limiting traffic to the site during these hours.
- b. The RCO noted that this property, which is partially wooded and adjacent to wooded parkland, has suffered from a lack of open space maintenance. The RCO expressed a hope that the operator of the proposed storage facility will establish a strong maintenance plan for the surrounding grounds. The RCO specifically requested that the applicant contact the Department of Parks and Recreation to discuss partnership in maintaining the grounds and nearby parkland. The RCO further requested that, if possible, under PPR rules or standards, the development team actively maintain the adjacent parkland in addition to its own property. The applicant agreed to contact PPR to make this request.
- c. The RCO requested additional information about how security will be handled at the building and in the surrounding property. The applicant answered that the property would be well-lit and committed to a continuing dialogue with ACCA regarding security.

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



## 2. CDR Committee Comments:

The CDR Committee offered the following comments and recommendations:

- a. The Committee would like to acknowledge that the existing Armory is listed on the National Register of Historic Places, and that losing this building is unfortunate.
- b. A brick façade would honor the legacy of the to-be-demolished armory and harmonize better with the surrounding wooded area. The Committee recommends reconsideration of the front façade material.
- c. The Committee asks the applicant to consider consolidating vehicular access to a single curb cut.
- d. The Committee notes that walk-up access is circuitous as designed and asks the applicant to create a direct walkway from Ogontz Avenue to the building entrance.
- e. The Committee requests that the design team reduce the size of the flatwall signs.
- f. The sustainable metrics checklist was blank for this submission. The Committee encourages the development team to consider including a photovoltaic array or other sustainable elements on the site.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, [nrt23@drexel.edu](mailto:nrt23@drexel.edu)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Cindy Bass, [cindy.bass@phila.gov](mailto:cindy.bass@phila.gov)  
Charles Richardson, Constituent Services, [charles.richardson@phila.gov](mailto:charles.richardson@phila.gov)  
Kevin Polit, Studio North, [kpolit@studionorthkc.com](mailto:kpolit@studionorthkc.com)  
Anthony Caponigro, Kimley Horn, [anthony.caponigro@kimley-horn.com](mailto:anthony.caponigro@kimley-horn.com)  
Katherine Missimer, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, [kmissimer@klehr.com](mailto:kmissimer@klehr.com)  
Sandra Broadus, ACCA, [accaphila@gmail.com](mailto:accaphila@gmail.com)  
Eric Brice, Logan Civic Association, [35dtwnet@gmail.com](mailto:35dtwnet@gmail.com)  
Srivatsa Krishnan, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [srivatsa.krishnan@phila.gov](mailto:srivatsa.krishnan@phila.gov)  
Ian Hegarty, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [ian.hegarty@phila.gov](mailto:ian.hegarty@phila.gov)



September 14, 2020

Matthew Wojcik  
Zoning examiner, Licenses and Inspections  
Municipal Services Building, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Eleanor Sharpe  
*Executive Director*

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP  
*Civic Design Review Chair*

Daniel K. Garofalo  
*Civic Design Review Vice-Chair*

Leonidas Addimando  
Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP  
Tavis Dockwiller, RLA  
Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP  
Elise Vider

**Re: Civic Design Review for 33 N 22<sup>nd</sup> Street (Application No. ZP-2020-000309)**

Dear Matthew:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed commercial building for 33 N 22<sup>nd</sup> Street.

The project is bound by JFK Boulevard to the north, private parcels to the east, Market Street to the south, and 22<sup>nd</sup> Street to the west. The project proposes 447,624 gross square feet of residential space and accessory uses with 341 residential units and 218 parking spaces. A portion of the parking garage is designated for use by an existing grocery store on an adjacent lot. The site is zoned CMX-5 and there is a zoning refusal for a special exception for an above ground parking structure.

At its meeting of September 14, 2020, the Civic Design Review Committee completed the Civic Design Review process and offered the following comments:

**1. RCO Comments:**

A representative from Logan Square Neighborhood Association attended and offered comments on the review process and the project design.

The RCO expressed an appreciation for the development team's willingness to respond to RCO comments made during the last review. They support the replacement of curtain wall glazing on the podium with porcelain panels. They felt that the design of Commerce Street, its ground materials and walkway, is an improvement over the previous scheme. They also felt that the ground floor design of the garage enclosure is an improvement over the previous scheme, but it presents an opportunity to do more. They encouraged more design investigation for this wall to consider other ways that it could help with the pedestrian experience of the place.

The RCO still has concerns over the traffic circulation and are awaiting the results of the Streets Department's review of the applicant's traffic study. The RCO asks for a clearer understanding and response to the known safety concerns, particularly for

One Parkway Building  
1515 Arch St.  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19102

215-683-4615 Telephone  
215-683-4630 Facsimile

[www.phila.gov/cityplanning](http://www.phila.gov/cityplanning)



pedestrians and loading zones. The RCO also notes that they are having ongoing discussions with the condominium association of the Murano building adjacent the project site regarding their traffic and development concerns.

## **2. CDR Committee Comments**

The Committee supported many of the changes that the project team has made since the previous review. The committee also accepted Planning Commission staff comments, which have been incorporated into the narrative below.

The committee had comments about the design of Commerce Street including related loading and bicycle parking areas. They support the material changes to the private drive of Commerce Street and ask if materials could also be used to help distinguish between one-way and two-way traffic. They encourage more thought to be given to the bicycle parking including ways of protecting it from loading activity with elements such as giant planters. Large planters could also be used to add greenery to the pathway from the Murano since it is likely that pedestrians will still use that route. The development team and the project ownership should consider creating an entrance to the grocery store from Market Street to relieve some of the concerns with pedestrian access on Commerce Street, including how to manage rideshare loading with services such as Lyft and Uber.

The project team is also commended for working with stakeholders and City agencies to improve the building's ground floor design of 22<sup>nd</sup> Street, the sidewalk connecting 22<sup>nd</sup> Street to the grocery store, and the connection between the parking garage and the grocery store. There is also support for the transparency shown along the ground floor of JFK Boulevard and the design team is encouraged to provide active programming for this frontage.

The project team is commended for meeting many of the sustainable design benchmarks and they are encouraged to follow-through on energy modeling and to consider third party sustainable design certification.

The committee also expressed support for the statements made by Blane Stoddard of the BFW Group, LLC. Blane urged the development team to commit to hiring minority contractors and vendors and to pursue inclusionary employment. Blane stated that these actions are necessary to address concerns with poverty and equity endemic to Philadelphia. The CDR committee noted that just because the development team does not have a legal requirement to meet from the Office of Equal Opportunity(OEO), it does not mean that they are prevented from pursuing the standards and goals of the OEO on their own.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the committee's action.



Sincerely,

Eleanor Sharpe  
Director of Planning and Zoning

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, [nrt23@drexel.edu](mailto:nrt23@drexel.edu)  
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, [dkgarofalo@gmail.com](mailto:dkgarofalo@gmail.com)  
Councilmember Darrell Clarke, [darrell.clarke@phila.gov](mailto:darrell.clarke@phila.gov)  
Corey Bell, Constituent Services Representative, [corey.bell@phila.gov](mailto:corey.bell@phila.gov)  
David Keller, Solomon Cordwell Buenz, [David.keller@scb.com](mailto:David.keller@scb.com)  
Anthony Forte, Saul Ewing Arnstein & Lehr LLP, [tony.forte@saul.com](mailto:tony.forte@saul.com)  
Travis Oliver, Center City Residents Association,  
[centercityresidents@centercityresidents.org](mailto:centercityresidents@centercityresidents.org)  
Drew Murray, Logan Square Neighborhood Association, [LSNApres@gmail.com](mailto:LSNApres@gmail.com)  
Ian Litwin, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [ian.litwin@phila.gov](mailto:ian.litwin@phila.gov)  
Matthew Wojcik, Philadelphia Licenses and Inspections, [matthew.wojcik@phila.gov](mailto:matthew.wojcik@phila.gov)  
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, [christopher.renfro@phila.gov](mailto:christopher.renfro@phila.gov)  
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, [casey.ross@phila.gov](mailto:casey.ross@phila.gov)  
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, [jdougherty@septa.org](mailto:jdougherty@septa.org)  
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, [paula.brumbelow@phila.gov](mailto:paula.brumbelow@phila.gov)