**Nomination of Historic Building, Structure, Site, or Object**

**Philadelphia Register of Historic Places**

**Philadelphia Historical Commission**

Submit all attached materials on paper and in electronic form (CD, email, flash drive). Electronic files must be Word or Word compatible.

### 1. Address of Historic Resource

*must comply with an Office of Property Assessment address*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street address:</th>
<th>5603-05 Germantown Ave</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Postal code:</td>
<td>19144</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2. Name of Historic Resource

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Historic Name:</th>
<th>Theodore Butcher Building</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Current/Common Name:</td>
<td>Smile Kiddie Shop/ The Weave Bar</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3. Type of Historic Resource

| Building ✓ | Structure □ | Site □ | Object □ |

### 4. Property Information

| Condition: | excellent □ | good ✓ | fair □ | poor □ | ruins □ |
| Occupancy: | occupied ✓ | vacant □ | under construction □ | unknown □ |
| Current use: | commercial/ residential |

### 5. Boundary Description

*Please attach a narrative description and site/plot plan of the resource’s boundaries.*

### 6. Description

*Please attach a narrative description and photographs of the resource’s physical appearance, site, setting, and surroundings.*

### 7. Significance

*Please attach a narrative Statement of Significance citing the Criteria for Designation the resource satisfies.*

- Period of Significance (from year to year): from **1908** to **1995**
- Date(s) of construction and/or alteration: **1854**
- Architect, engineer, and/or designer: N/A
- Builder, contractor, and/or artisan: N/A
- Original owner: Theodore Butcher
- Other significant persons: Chester A. Asher
CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION:
The historic resource satisfies the following criteria for designation (check all that apply):

☐ (a) Has significant character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth or Nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past; or,
☐ (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or,
☐ (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style; or,
☐ (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen; or,
☒ (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or,
☐ (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials or craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation; or,
☐ (g) Is part of or related to a square, park or other distinctive area which should be preserved according to an historic, cultural or architectural motif; or,
☐ (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community or City; or,
☐ (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or
☒ (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the community.

8. MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES
Please attach a bibliography.

9. NOMINATOR
Organization: Philadelphia City Planning Commission Date: January 27, 2020
Name with Title: Xue Fei Lin c/o Matt Wysong Email: matt.wysong@phila.gov
Street Address: 1515 Arch Street, 13th Floor Telephone: 
City, State, and Postal Code: Philadelphia, PA, 19102
Nominator ☐ is ☑ is not the property owner.

PHC USE ONLY
Date of Receipt: January 27, 2020
☑ Correct-Complete ☐ Incorrect-Incomplete Date: May 15, 2020
Date of Notice Issuance: May 15, 2020
Property Owner at Time of Notice:
Name: CH Pennsylvania Under 21 Holdings Inc.
Address: 31 East Armat Street

City: Philadelphia State: PA Postal Code: 19144
Date(s) Reviewed by the Committee on Historic Designation: June 17, 2020
Date(s) Reviewed by the Historical Commission: July 10, 2020
Date of Final Action: Designated July 10, 2020/Criteria for Designation D and J
☑ Designated ☐ Rejected
5. BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION

Beginning at a point on the Northeasterly side of Germantown Avenue at the distance of 18’ 2-1/2” from the Northwesterly side of Armat Street; extending Northwest along the Northeasterly side of Germantown Avenue 35’ 5-3/4” to a point at the corner of Germantown Avenue and Woodlawn (formerly Laurel) Street; extending Northeast along the Southeasterly side of Woodlawn Street 136’ 11 3/8” to a point; then extending Southeast at right angle to Armat Street 35’ 6-1/2” to a point; then extending on a line parallel with Armat Street 142’ 3-1/4” to the Northeasterly side of Germantown Avenue, the point and place of beginning.

Figure 1. Map with 5603-05 Germantown Avenue outlined in red. 2019. Philadelphia City Atlas.
BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION (CONTINUED)

Figure 1a. Parcel shown in blue. Philadelphia CityAtlas.

Figure 1b. Satellite image with parcel shown in blue. 2019. Philadelphia CityAtlas.
6. DESCRIPTION

The building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue is located in the Germantown neighborhood of Northwest Philadelphia. The building situates in the Southeast corner of the intersection between Germantown Avenue and E. Woodlawn Street. The building contains two primary facades, one fronting Germantown Avenue and the other facing E. Woodlawn Street. The building’s Northeast wall is attached to the building at 20-26 E. Woodlawn Street and its Southeast wall is attached to the adjacent building at 5601 Germantown Avenue. The building is rectangular in plan with the longer side running along E. Woodlawn Street.

The building consists of three massing blocks. The portion containing the building’s main façade fronting Germantown Avenue contains three stories with two storefronts on the ground floor. The upper stories are setback from the ground floor storefronts and are constructed in Italianate style with elaborate architectural details. The façades are painted in pale yellow and accentuated with decorative elements painted in red and white. A red box cornice supported by white brackets runs across the main façade. The cornice is further decorated with a row of dentals underneath. The main façade is
symmetrically arranged in three bays with two windows on the sides and an attached pair of window in the center on both the second and third floors.

On the second floor, the windows are each crowned by a corbeled entablature and supported with a sill below. The windows on the two side bays are four-over-four double-hung sash windows with an arched top sash. The space between the windows and the entablatures are left unpainted and the corbeled entablatures appear to be floating above the windows. The window frames, sashes, and entablatures are painted in red while the corbels, like the brackets along the roof, are painted in white. The central bay is marked by an attached pair of two-over-two double-hung sash windows with an arched top sash. Different from the two side windows, the space between the windows and the entablature in the central bay is filled in with red. The windows on the third floor of the main façade are slightly shorter in height compared to those on the second floor. Instead of the corbeled entablatures, windows on the third floor are crowned by arched hoods. The four-over-four double-hung sash windows on the two sides are decorated by a concentric arched hood right above the arched windows. The central bay of the third floor also contains a pair of attached two-over-two double-hung sash windows. The paired windows are decorated by a larger arched hood above, covering both windows. The space between the windows and the hood are also filled in with red. On the building’s Northwest façade fronting E. Woodlawn Street of this three-story portion, there are two less elaborate one-over-one double-hung sash windows on each of its second and third floors.

The two storefronts on the ground floor of this three-story portion of the building contain a slant frontage that is parallel to Germantown Avenue. The stores contain full-height metal-framed glazing and metal cladding behind store signages. The store occupying 5605 Germantown Avenue also contains a series of steel roll-up doors. The metal cladding and the steel roll-up doors wrap around the building to its Northwest façade.

The middle portion of the building contains two stories laid in Stretcher-bond brick. This portion is painted in the same pale yellow with a red cornice running along the roof edge. There are seven unequally spaced one-over-one double-hung sash windows on the second floor only. The ground floor contains outlines of previous windows that were filled in. Each of the windows is decorated with a flushed lintel above and a sill below painted in the same red. The windows are aligned with the second-floor windows on the front portion of the building. All windows on both portions of the building contain thick casings accentuated in a darker maroon color.
The rear portion of the building also contains three stories but visually contrasts from the Italianate style of the front and middle portions. This portion of the building is constructed in brick laid in Stretcher-bond but is unpainted. Each of its second and third floors contain one single and six groups of paired windows. All the windows are one-over-one double-hung sash windows with the single windows wider in proportion. All windows are supported with a brick sill and surrounded by a casing decorated with a simple arched pediment above. The two rows of vertical Stack-bond bricks above follow this curvature as decoration. The same arched brick pattern on the ground floor shows evidence of previous windows and possibly a door that were filled in with new English-bond brick. There is a metal exit door and a small square ventilating window located towards the rear end of the building.

Figure 3. View of the Northwest corner of the building at the corner of Germantown Avenue and E. Woodlawn Street. November 2019. Photo by Author.
Figure 4. View of the building’s main façade fronting on Germantown Avenue. November 2019. Photo by Author.

Figure 5. Detail of the central bay windows on the second and third floors of the building’s main façade. November 2019. Photo by Author.
7. SIGNIFICANCE

The building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue was first constructed in 1854 as the Theodore Butcher Building. In 1908, Chester A. Asher, founder of today’s Asher’s Chocolate Co., purchased the building and relocated his candy-making business here. The manufacturing plant remained in operation on the upper floors and the rear portion of the building until 1995, marking almost a century of commercial and family history at the same location. Although the building is most significant for its association with the long history of Asher’s Chocolate Co., throughout the 20th century the ground-floor stores were occupied by some of the most notable businesses in the U.S. at the time including Wheeler & Wilson and the Lerner Shop. The building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue, therefore, satisfies the following criteria for designation on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places as set forth by the Philadelphia Historic Preservation Ordinance, section 14-2007(5), of the Philadelphia Code:

D. Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;

J. Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the community.
Criterion J:

Asher’s Chocolate Co.

Asher’s Chocolate Co. is one of U.S.’s oldest and most notable chocolate and candy manufacturer with its headquarters now located in Souderton, Pennsylvania. The family-owned business was founded by Chester A. Asher in 1892 in Center City Philadelphia and was later relocated to Germantown where it remained and expanded for the next century. Chester A. Asher was a Scotch-English farm boy who emigrated from Ontario, Canada to the United States in 1890. In 1892, after working briefly in a candy factory in Boston, Asher founded his own candy factory in Center City Philadelphia at 262 S. 10th Street. Asher moved his business to its first location in Germantown at 5954 Germantown Avenue in 1900. In 1904, Asher relocated his factory again to 5623 Germantown Avenue and opened a second factory at 8620 Germantown Avenue in 1907. In 1908, Asher purchased the building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue. At this location, four generations of the Asher family expanded their candy manufacturing business for the next nine decades before ultimately moving out to the suburbs.

Before Chester A. Asher moved into 5603-05 Germantown Avenue, the building was owned by Elizabeth E. Fox, a baker who operated a bakery in the ground-floor store and lived upstairs at 5603 Germantown Avenue. During this time, Wheeler & Wilson Manufacturing Co., founded by Allen B. Wilson and Nathaniel Wheeler, sold and manufactured their world-renowned sewing machines at 5605 Germantown Avenue. In 1906, Elizabeth E. Fox passed away and 5603-05 Germantown Avenue, then contained two stores and dwellings upstairs, was listed for sale in 1907. By May 1908, Asher had purchased and began his business here.

The building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue was first constructed in 1854 as the Theodore Butcher Building. During this time, the building contained only the three-story Italianate portion fronting Germantown Avenue (Fig.7). Between 1871 and 1910, the building underwent two expansions.

---

2 Ibid.
behind the initial portion as illustrated in Fig. 8 and Fig. 9. By 1910, the middle two-story portion had been completed to match the Italianate style of the building (Fig. 10).

Figure 7. Samuel L. Smedley Philadelphia Atlas. 1862. Courtesy of PhilaGeoHistory. The footprint of today’s building is outlined in red.

Figure 8. G.M. Hopkins. Atlas of the late Borough of Germantown, 22nd Ward, City of Philadelphia. 1871. Courtesy of PhilaGeoHistory. The footprint of today’s building is outlined in red.

Figure 11. Photo of 5603-05 Germantown Avenue from the 1900’s showing the three-story Italianate Style portion and the completed two-story middle portion. Signs in the window of the corner store at 5605 Germantown Avenue advertise Asher’s chocolate eggs. Note that the two-story portion was not painted to match the front portion at this time. Courtesy of Germantown Historical Society.

After relocation to the larger quarters, Asher initially operated a retail bakery in the ground-floor store at 5605 Germantown Avenue. In addition to selling candies and chocolate, Asher also sold syrup, jams and jellies, ice cream, and other pastries and desserts.\(^9\) Between 1908 and 1921, multiple advertisements appeared on the Philadelphia Inquirer showing Asher’s looking for bakers and salesladies at this bakery. In 1914, Asher applied for two building permits to demolish the existing building and brick oven behind 5603-05 Germantown Avenue and erected a new three-story brick portion as the manufacturing plant to accommodate his growing business (Fig.10 and Fig. 12).\(^10\) This 1914 addition completed the building’s physical evolution despite several later façade alterations to the ground-floor stores. Despite the long history of Asher’s family business at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue and the surrounding properties, its retail store on the ground floor of 5605 Germantown Avenue did not last long. In March 1929, a magazine excerpt from Women’s Wear Daily showed that a new unit store of

\(^9\) "Asher's Chocolates, Inc."

the Lerner Shop will open in Philadelphia “on the Northwest corner of Germantown and Maplewood Avenues in about a month”\textsuperscript{11}. Although the exact year Asher’s moved out of the store is unclear, beginning in 1920 a few newspaper advertisements showed Asher’s selling equipment and furniture of the store.\textsuperscript{12} After closing the ground-floor retail, the upper floors of 5603-05 Germantown Avenue and the 1914 rear addition remained as manufacturing plants.\textsuperscript{13} Meanwhile, Asher operated another retail for his chocolate and candies at 5537 Germantown Avenue which remained in business until 1998, even after the plant had relocated to the suburb.

![Map of Germantown and surrounding areas](image)

\textbf{Figure 12.} G.M. Bromley. Atlas of the City of Philadelphia, 22nd Ward. 1923. Courtesy of Germantown Historical Society. The detached structure behind 5603-05 Germantown Avenue, as illustrated in Fig.10, was already demolished and a new attached portion had been already added by this time.

Under Asher’s fourth son, John Asher Sr. the family business saw some difficult times that the company was even near bankruptcy.\textsuperscript{14} In 1966, John Asher Sr. passed away, leaving the business to his two sons John (Jack) and Bob Asher.\textsuperscript{15} The company saw major recovery and expansion under the management of the third generation of the Ashers. Jack and Bob Asher transformed the company’s

\textsuperscript{13} A 1924 Sanborn Map with later revisions showed “candy manufacturing above” at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue. Philadelphia Planning Commission.
\textsuperscript{15} “Asher’s Chocolates, Inc.”
handmade tradition by introducing mechanization to the manufacturing process. Under their management, the company expanded to over 100 employees producing over 3.3 million pounds of candy per year. By 1966, John and Bob Asher had acquired a few properties behind 5603-05 Germantown Avenue and a small band box theatre across the street fronting Armat Street (Fig.12 and Fig.13). These buildings were linked to the band box theatre, which had been converted to a cooling room and warehouse, with an enclosed overhead conveyor (Fig.13). The converted theatre was also used for making shipments.

Figure 13. Franklin Survey Company. Atlas of Twenty Second Ward Philadelphia, Penna Volume II. 1955. Courtesy of Germantown Historical Society. The building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue is outlined in red and the other properties belonging to Asher’s manufacturing plant, including the band box theatre that will be later acquired, are outlined in black.

16 Ibid.
17 Ibid.
18 Ibid.
19 “C.A. Asher Candy Co., Inc., 1910”
Under the management of Jack and Bob Asher, the company continued to expand from within its Germantown plants. In the 1980s, the family business was joined by the fourth generation of Ashers. By this time, the business had outgrown the capacity of the facilities in Germantown and a second factory was added in York, Pennsylvania.\footnote{“Asher’s Chocolates, Inc.”} By 1995, the prolonged disinvestment in the Germantown neighborhood, Philadelphia’s complex tax systems, and obsolete facilities drove the company to ultimately relocate to a 31 acres farmland in Souderton, Pennsylvania, it had purchased in 1993.\footnote{Kerry Pechter. “Asher’s Candy ‘ Forced’ to Leave Germantown for Suburbs.” \textit{Small business news}. 1, no. 5 (March 1, 1995).} The retail shop at 5537 Germantown Avenue remained in operation following this major relocation but
eventually closed three years later in 1998, marking an end to a century of Asher’s history in Germantown.

Figure 15. Exterior photo of Asher’s retail store at 5537 Germantown Avenue taken on July 1, 1998, just one day before closing. Standing in front of the store are Jack Asher and the employees. Courtesy of Germantown Historical Society.

The Asher Family and the Germantown Community

In addition to the long history of Asher’s manufacturing plant in Germantown, the Asher family was also actively involved in the Germantown community since Chester A. Asher first moved his business and residence to Germantown in 1900. The Asher family were active members of the Germantown-Chestnut Hill Improvement Association and advocates for the preservation of Historic Germantown. The Germantown Historical Society’s Archive contains important sources illustrating the involvement of the Asher family in major events in the community including Germantown’s 300th anniversary celebration and President Karl Carstens of the Federal Republic of Germany’s visit to Germantown in 1983. When Jack Asher passed away in 2017, his funeral was held at the First
Presbyterian Church in Germantown, despite having moved out of the neighborhood for almost two decades. This also illustrates the family’s attachment to Germantown.

Figure 16. Photo of the members of the Germantown-Chestnut Hill Improvement Association in 1934. Chester A. Asher Jr., labeled 23, is standing in the third row in the photo. Courtesy of Germantown Historical Society.

The Lerner Shop

Although the building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue is recognized for its significant association with Asher’s company history, the Lerner Shop, a leading women’s fashion anchor during this time, remained on the ground floor for over three decades. The Lerner Shops were founded by Samuel A. Lerner in 1918 and were the predecessor of today’s New York & Company, Inc. By 1945, the Lerner Shops had expanded to include children’s wear. In 1985, the Lerner chain, which by this time had

about 800 stores across the U.S., was acquired by Limited Inc. In 1992, the name Lerner Shops was changed to Lerner New York before it was reformed and became New York & Company, Inc. in 1995.²⁴

The Lerner Shop first moved into 5605 Germantown Avenue in 1929. Between 1952 and 1958, after its business at 5605 Germantown Avenue for almost three decades, the Lerner Shop was replaced by Joy Kiddie Shop, a local chain of children’s wear.²⁵ During this time, 5603 Germantown Avenue was occupied by several businesses including a shoe shop, a curtain and drapery shop, and a lingerie shop.

Figure 17. Photo of the 5600 block of Germantown Avenue in 1948. The Lerner Shop is shown on the right. Courtesy of the Philadelphia Free Library Digital Collection.

²⁴ Ibid.
²⁵ An advertisement from 1952 showed that the Lerner Shop was participating in the Annual Germantown Sales Days. Another advertisement from 1958 showed that the shop was already occupied by Joy Kiddie Shop. The timeframe that the Lerner Shop moved out of 5605 Germantown Avenue can therefore be narrowed down to 1952 to 1958. Series of advertisements on the Philadelphia Inquirer from 1952 and 1958. Newspaper.com.
The Building’s Commercial History and the Central Germantown Business District

The commercial history at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue and the expansion and ultimate relocation of Asher’s Chocolate Co. to the suburbs also reflect the thriving development and disinvestment in the Central Germantown Business district. In 1832, the Germantown and Norristown Railroad, Philadelphia’s first steam railway, was constructed and connected Germantown to Center City Philadelphia.26 Another railroad to Chestnut Hill opened in 1854, the same year that German Township became officially incorporated under Philadelphia.27 The expansion of railroads and innovation in steam engine allowed raw materials to flow into many new factories in Germantown.28 The thriving manufacturing industry created many new jobs for the growing population in Germantown and also led to important commercial investment in the construction of new buildings along Germantown Avenue.29 As part of the National Register of Historic Places’ Colonial Germantown Historic District, 5603-05 Germantown Avenue, which was initially constructed as the Theodore Butcher Building, was recognized as a prominent example of this commercial transformation.

By the mid-1970s, Germantown saw significant urban decline. Most of the factories and mills in and around Germantown closed due to aging plants, foreign competition, and cheaper wages in Sun Belt cities. The growth of large shopping malls outside the boundaries of Northwest Philadelphia accelerated the decline of Germantown’s shopping district. Rising crime rates and deteriorating housing stock drove many middle-class families out to the suburbs.30 The relocation of Asher’s Chocolate Co. was also part of a declining trend in Philadelphia’s manufacturing business. Between 1984 and 1993, the number of manufacturers in Philadelphia dropped by 25% with a 37% decrease of employment in the manufacturing sector.31

Although the major businesses that once operated at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue were forced out of Germantown due to neighborhood disinvestment, they continued to grow or became absorbed into major corporations that are still active today. Wheeler & Wilson, which once occupied 5605 Germantown Avenue, was later purchased by the Singer Corporation, one of the country’s leading

27 Ibid.
28 National Register of Historic Places, Colonial Germantown Historic District, #66000678.
29 Ibid.
31 “Asher’s Candy ‘ Forced’ to Leave Germantown for Suburbs.”
sewing machine manufacturer today. The building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue, therefore, serves as a physical record of the early history of many of today's most notable businesses.

Criterion D

The building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue also merits architectural significance as an illustrative example of Italianate style that came to dominate the post-Civil War development along Germantown Avenue. Beginning in the early 1850’s, the adaptation of revival styles with local construction techniques influenced architectural styles in Germantown. The Italianate style in Germantown emerged under this trend. The Trinity Lutheran Church constructed between 1856 and 1857 by the builder-designers Jacob and George A. Binder exemplifies this movement.\(^{32}\) Italianate style continued its popularity in Germantown from about 1865 to 1900. Typical Italianate style houses and shops constructed during this time contained “two or more stories with flat roofs, bracketed cornices, and simply finished lintels”.\(^ {33}\) The original building at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue demonstrates an early example of this development trend and the later expansions also conform to the trend to establish a coherent style. The National Register of Historic Places’ Colonial Germantown Historic District identified many Italianate style buildings as contributing to the significance of the district. The five commercial/residential buildings at 5310-18 Germantown Avenue, constructed in 1877, illustrate later examples of this trend (Fig.18). These five buildings have also been designated on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Although the ground floor stores at 5603-05 Germantown Avenue have been altered to accommodate contemporary uses, the upper stories and the middle portion of the building still preserve architectural elements that characterize the Italianate style.

\(^{32}\) National Register of Historic Places, Colonial Germantown Historic District.

\(^{33}\) Ibid.
Figure 18 Street view of the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places designated Italianate style buildings at 5310-18 Germantown Avenue. Source: Google Maps. Street View. 2019.
8. MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES


"Building Permit #5148. On Woodlawn Street, Rear of 5605 Germantown Avenue", Jul. 6, 1914. City of Philadelphia Municipal Archives.


National Register of Historic Places, Colonial Germantown Historic District, #66000678.