**ADDRESS: 737 WALNUT ST**
Proposal: Construct six-story building with penthouse and decks
Review Requested: Final Approval
Owner: Sarah Investment LLC
Applicant: Stuart Rosenberg, Stuart G. Rosenberg Architects
History: 1955
Individual Designation: None
District Designation: Society Hill Historic District, Non-contributing, 3/10/1999
Staff Contact: Randal Baron, randal.baron@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**BACKGROUND:**
This application proposes to construct a six-story, mixed-use building with mezzanine and roof deck on the site of a non-contributing building in the Society Hill Historic District. The staff of the Historical Commission approved the demolition of the non-contributing building in October 2019.

The north side of the block, where this site is situated, has an important history as Sansom Row by Benjamin Latrobe, which marks the beginning of rowhouse development in Philadelphia in 1799. Before that time, builders only constructed houses individually or in very small groups. Twelve of the original houses still survive in the row, even if some have been modified. The row now consists entirely of three and four-story historic buildings clad in red brick, brownstone, stucco, and other masonry.

The design for the new building featured large industrial-style windows and metal panels. The east and west party walls, which would rise three stories above the adjacent historic buildings, would be clad in patterned Hardie Board panels.

The Architectural Committee reviewed the application at its February 2020 meeting and found that:

- the site is part of a significant streetscape;
- the proposed design is too tall;
- the proposed building elements are too large in scale;
- the proposed industrial windows and multicolor metal panels are not appropriate for the setting.

The Architectural Committee concluded that the proposed building does not satisfy Standard 9 because of its inappropriately large massing, the inappropriate scale of its openings, its metal and glass industrial materials, and its lack of relationship to its streetscape environment.

The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial, pursuant to Standard 9.

Following the Architectural Committee’s meeting, the applicants redesigned the building. The proposed building would now feature punched openings in a red brick facade. The designs of the east and west party walls were not changed. The massing has been modified with three-foot setbacks at the fifth and sixth floors and a 17’-8” setback at the seventh floor. The design does not respect the cornice or roof line of the original row as seen on the building at 735 Walnut Street, as requested by the Architectural Committee. Despite the revisions, it is the staff’s opinion that the proposed building is not compatible with the original row, owing to its height and massing. It is too tall and massive. Moreover, it lacks complete elevations and plans. The staff recommends that the Historical Commission deny both versions of the application.
**SCOPE OF WORK:**
- Construct six-story mixed-use building with commercial ground floor and setback fifth through seventh floor mezzanine and deck.

**STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:**
The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:
- **Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.** The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, proportions and massing to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
  - The proposed building is differentiated from the old, but is incompatible with the historic context of this block and the historic district in terms of materials, features, size, scale, proportions, and massing.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Denial, pursuant to Standard 9.
MEETING OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE
OF THE PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION

TUESDAY, 25 FEBRUARY 2020
1515 ARCH STREET, ROOM 16-029
DAN MCCOUBREY, CHAIR

CALL TO ORDER

START TIME IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:00:25

The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. The following Committee members joined
him:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee Member</th>
<th>Present</th>
<th>Absent</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dan McCoubrey, FAIA, LEED AP BD+C, Chair</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Cluver, AIA, LEED AP</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rudy D’Alessandro</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justin Detwiler</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nan Gutterman, FAIA</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suzanne Pentz</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amy Stein, AIA, LEED AP</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following staff members were present:
- Jon Farnham, Executive Director
- Randal Baron, Historic Preservation Planner III
- Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Laura DiPasquale, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Meredith Keller, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Allyson Meley, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Megan Cross Schmitt, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons were present:
- Stuart Rosenberg, SGRA
- James Conners, SGRA
- Gabriel Deck, Gnome Architects
- Robert Kramer, Society Hill Civic Association
- Jackie Gusic, InHabit LLC
- Alexandra Kaye, Penn Law
- Jennifer Robinson, Preservation Alliance
- Mary M. Kistler
- Ray Rola, Ray Rola Architects
- Elizabeth Stegner, University City Historical Society
- Kathy Dowdell
- Gerry Gutierrez, Group G
- Carolyn Crego
- Lavi Shenkman
- Jack Burns, JBA
- Kirsten Kimberg
AGENDA

ADDRESS: 737 WALNUT ST
Proposal: Construct six-story building with penthouse and decks
Review Requested: Final Approval
Owner: Sarah Investment LLC
Applicant: Stuart Rosenberg, Stuart G. Rosenberg Architects, P.C.
History: 1955
Individual Designation: None
District Designation: Society Hill Historic District, Non-contributing, 3/10/1999
Staff Contact: Randal Baron, randal.baron@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

BACKGROUND:
This application proposes to construct a six-story plus penthouse mixed-use building on the site of a non-contributing building in the Society Hill Historic District. The staff of the Historical Commission approved the demolition of the non-contributing building in October 2019. The north side of the block, where this site is situated, consists entirely of three and four-story historic buildings clad in red brick, brownstone, stucco, and other masonry. The proposed building’s façade on Walnut Street features large industrial-style windows and metal panels. The east and west party walls, which would rise three stories higher than the adjacent historic buildings, would be clad in patterned Hardie Board panels.

SCOPE OF WORK:
- Construct six-story mixed-use building with commercial ground floor and set-back seventh floor penthouse.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:
The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:
- **Standard 9:** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, proportions and massing to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
  - The proposed building is differentiated from the old, but is incompatible with the historic context of this block and the historic district in terms of materials, features, size, scale, proportions, and massing.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Denial, pursuant to Standard 9.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:00:25
PRESENTERS:
- Mr. Baron presented the application to the Architectural Committee.
- Architects Stuart Rosenberg and James Carver represented the application.

DISCUSSION:
- Mr. Baron noted that this row of buildings on Walnut Street along with those on Sansom Street represent the very beginning of rowhouse development in the City of Philadelphia. This row, constructed in 1799, survives basically intact. The scale of the row has also been largely preserved. He explained that he had met with the applicant and suggested that they honor the basic scale and design of the row even while building somewhat taller toward the back of the lot.
  - Mr. Rosenberg responded that there is a large variety of heights in nearby structures on Sansom and even across the street. He noted an eight-story building on Sansom Street.
- The Committee members noted that the Historical Commission has full jurisdiction over this site and asked that Mr. Rosenberg respect the cornice line above the third floor of the historic row on Walnut Street. They suggested that he set back any upper floors above that line and also reduce the overall height of the proposed building.
- The Committee members opined that the industrial aesthetic of the proposed building might be more appropriate for Old City. They asked that the applicant use red brick rather than metal panels on the facades and scale the windows based on the punched openings found on buildings in this row and in the Society Hill Historic District.
  - Mr. Rosenberg responded that community members seemed to prefer the industrial design but that he will adjust the design.

PUBLIC COMMENT:
- Robert Kramer of the Society Hill Civic Association said that his association does not support this design. He stated that the building looks too tall, particularly because of its narrow width. He said that he supports the staff recommendation and Architectural Committee’s comments.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:
The Architectural Committee found that:
- the site is part of a significant streetscape;
- the proposed design is too tall;
- the proposed building elements are too large in scale; and,
- the proposed industrial windows and multicolor metal panels are not appropriate for the setting.

The Architectural Committee concluded that:
- the proposed building does not satisfy Standard 9 because of its inappropriately large massing, the inappropriate scale of its openings, its metal and glass industrial materials, and its lack of relationship to its streetscape environment.

ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial, pursuant to Standard 9.
ITEM: 737 Walnut St  
MOTION: Denial, pursuant to Standard 9.  
MOVED BY: Nan Gutterman  
SECONDED BY: Amy Stein  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee Member</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Abstain</th>
<th>Recuse</th>
<th>Absent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dan McCoubrey</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Cluver</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rudy D’Alessandro</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justin Detwiler</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nan Gutterman</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suzanne Pentz</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amy Stein</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ADDRESS: 530 N 19TH ST  
Proposal: Construct roof deck  
Review Requested: Final Approval  
Owner: Benjamin A. Horst and Denny R. Kwak  
Applicant: Gabriel Deck, Gnome Architects LLC  
History: 1859  
Individual Designation: None  
District Designation: Spring Garden Historic District, Contributing, 10/11/2000  
Staff Contact: Randal Baron, randal.baron@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

BACKGROUND:  
This application proposes to construct a roof deck and pilot house on top of the main block of this twin house. An application proposing a roof deck and standard-height pilot house, in addition to other exterior alterations, was reviewed by the Historical Commission in January 2020. At that time, the Commission voted to approve most elements of the application, but deny the deck, pilot house, and deck railing, pursuant to Standard 6 and 9. This current application has been submitted in response, and proposes a pilot house that has been reduced in footprint and height, and a deck railing that has been set back from the north property line to the location that the staff has identified as “inconspicuous” from the public right-of-way.

SCOPE OF WORK:  
- Install roof deck and low pilot house.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:  
The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:
- Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, proportions and massing to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
  - The proposed deck and low pilot house complies with Standard 9. The height of the pilot house has been reduced and the railing has been pulled back so that both are inconspicuous from the public right-of-way.
737 WALNUT STREET, PHILADELPHIA, PA 19106

Architect: Stuart G. Rosenberg Architects
230 S. Broad Street
suite M 30 (Mezzanine)
Philadelphia, PA 19106
P: 215-564-1007
F: 215-563-3311

OWNER: Ascent Design & Builder
1000 W Girard AV
Philadelphia PA

SHEET LIST - SUPPLEMENTAL SUBMISSION
HC-00 COVER SHEET
HC-01 EXISTING CONDITIONS .................................................................
HC-02 HISTORIC PHOTOS AND SITE CONTEXT ........................................
HC-03 HISTORIC PHOTOS ........................................................................
HC-04 CONTEMPORARY PHOTO AND RENDERING ..................................
HC-05 SITE CONTEXT DIAGRAM ..............................................................
HC-06 BUILDING MASSING DIAGRAM .....................................................
HC-07 PROPOSED PLANS ........................................................................
HC-08 PROPOSED PLANS ........................................................................
HC-09 BUILDING SECTION ....................................................................
HC-10 ELEVATIONS ................................................................................
HC-11 ADDITIONAL 3D VIEWS .................................................................
HC-12 ADDITIONAL 3D VIEWS .................................................................
HARD BOARD PARTY WALL
WOOD / AZEK CORNICE
DOUBLE HUNG ALUMINUM WINDOWS
RED BRICK FACADE
CAST STONE STOREFRONT