**ADDRESS:** 744-46 S 8TH ST  
Name of Resource: Columbus Hall  
Proposed Action: Designation  
Property Owner: Mama Y’s LLC  
Nominator: Celeste Morello and Eugene Desyatnik  
Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 744-46 S. 8th Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that building, historically known as Columbus Hall, satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J. Under Criterion A, the nomination contends that the building has significant character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the City, as a purpose-built meeting hall for the “Societa di Unione e Fratellanza Italiana” (Italian Union and Brotherhood Society). Under Criterion J, the nomination contends that the building exemplifies the cultural, political, social and historical heritage of the community, as members of the Society were the civic leaders in this “Little Italy” community and assisted with the arrival of new Italian immigrants into South Philadelphia at the end of the nineteenth century.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 744-46 S 8th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and J.
1. **ADDRESS OF HISTORIC RESOURCE** *(must comply with an Office of Property Assessment address)*

   Street address: 744-46 S. 8th Street
   Postal code: 19147

2. **NAME OF HISTORIC RESOURCE**

   Historic Name: Columbus Hall
   Current/Common Name: ____________________________

3. **TYPE OF HISTORIC RESOURCE**

   - [ ] Building
   - [ ] Structure
   - [ ] Site
   - [ ] Object

4. **PROPERTY INFORMATION**

   - Condition: [ ] excellent  [ ] good  [ ] fair  [ ] poor  [ ] ruins
   - Occupancy:  [ ] occupied  [ ] vacant  [ ] under construction  [ ] unknown
   - Current use: [ ] Residential

5. **BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION**

   Please attach a narrative description and site/plot plan of the resource’s boundaries.

6. **DESCRIPTION**

   Please attach a narrative description and photographs of the resource’s physical appearance, site, setting, and surroundings.

7. **SIGNIFICANCE**

   Please attach a narrative Statement of Significance citing the Criteria for Designation the resource satisfies.

   Period of Significance (from year to year): from 1897 to 1938
   Date(s) of construction and/or alteration: 1897-1898
   Architect, engineer, and/or designer: P. F. Gallagher, “architect”/builder
   Builder, contractor, and/or artisan: Henry C. Dahl, contractor
   Original owner: Societa di Unione e Fratellanza Italiana
   Other significant persons: ____________________________
CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION:
The historic resource satisfies the following criteria for designation (check all that apply):
☒ (a) Has significant character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth or Nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past; or,
☐ (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or,
☐ (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style; or,
☐ (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen; or,
☐ (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or,
☐ (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials or craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation; or,
☐ (g) Is part of or related to a square, park or other distinctive area which should be preserved according to an historic, cultural or architectural motif; or,
☐ (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community or City; or,
☐ (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or
☒ (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the community.

8. MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES
Please attach a bibliography.

9. NOMINATOR
Organization_ Bella Vista community __________________________ Date __________________________
Name with Title_ Celeste Morello & Eugene Desyatnik __________________________ Email __________________________
Street Address_ 1234 S. Sheridan Street __________________________ Telephone_ 215-334-6008 __________________________
City, State, and Postal Code_ Philadelphia, PA 19147 __________________________
Nominator ☐ is ☒ is not the property owner.

PHC USE ONLY
Date of Receipt: __________________________
☒ Correct-Complete ☐ Incorrect-Incomplete __________________________ Date: __________________________
Date of Notice Issuance: __________________________ February 3, 2020 __________________________
Property Owner at Time of Notice:
Name:_ Mama Y’s, LLC __________________________
Address:_ c/o Dan Rosin __________________________
822 Pine Street, Ste. 2C __________________________
City:_ Philadelphia __________________________ State: PA Postal Code: 19107 __________________________
Date(s) Reviewed by the Committee on Historic Designation: __________________________
Date(s) Reviewed by the Historical Commission: __________________________
Date of Final Action: __________________________
☐ Designated ☐ Rejected __________________________ 12/7/18
BOUNDARY DESCRIPTION:

The nominated building occupies two parcels, 744 and 746 South Eighth street. The depth of the property is 66 feet and has a combined frontage of 35.2 feet from the 17.6 foot fronts of 744 plus 746 South Eighth Street. Copies of Deeds asserting the acquisition of 744 South Eighth Street and 746 South Eighth Street in 1894 and 1874 respectively by the Societa di Unione e Fratellanza Italiana to form one property are attached for reference.

The most recent City Atlas is below.

CityAtlas
PRESENT OWNER  

FORMER OWNER  

DATE OF DEED  

NO. OF HOUSE  


Bring Deed with this, that it may be endorsed

DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY

Which must be an exact copy, in the wording of the Deed

All that certain lot or piece of ground with the

Dwelling house, a tenement which

Errected ed on the West Side of 7th Street Township of

the distance of eighty forty-four 1/2 inches from the North side of 7th Street

In the late Township of Philadelphia now in the City of Philadelphia

And State of Pennsylvania containing, in front and back, 30 feet, and at

each side 60 feet, and in length a depth of said Street at right Angles 110 feet except 40 feet on the

due north side upon lot 004212.

Wm. J. O. Hartnack and Wife

To May 26, 1864

The Mayerhersing Office Co.


The sale of 746 South 8th Street to

the Societa notes a 17.6" by 56' lot.

The next page, on the sale of 744

South 8th Street has same dimensions.

Signature of Owner or Agent: [Signature]

4/5/48
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date of Deed</th>
<th>No. of House</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1874</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Società di Mutuo Soccorso

All that certain lot or piece of ground 7th side 8th or 7th of S of Fitzwater or 3rd Ward Front 17 feet Depth 66 feet

Below is a copy of a ticket to a fund-raiser by the Società which owned the nomination. The Società's president, John Queroli is named on the ticket—he was the same person who sold his property at 744 South Eighth Street to the Società to enlarge the property and then to construct the nominated building, 744-746 South Eighth Street.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signature of Owner or Agent</th>
<th>Present Owner</th>
<th>Purchase Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. John Smith</td>
<td>Dr. Jane Doe</td>
<td>12/12/2023</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Description of Property:**

- **All land** including:
  - Lot 1, 746 South 8th Street, which is a private individual purchase.

- **House No. 746**
- **Street**
- **Lot and Block:** Lot 1, Block 258
- **Special Property:**
  - 15 feet on the distance of 87 feet, 6 inches from the lot of the property.
  - Commencing at the distance of 87 feet, 6 inches from the lot of the property.

Only one property is to be described on this blurb unless properties are contiguous or in the same block.
DESCRIPTION:

The present appearance of 744-746 South Eighth Street is the result of new ownership who had purchased a closed Italian restaurant on the first floor and upper levels which were unoccupied and left, by the nominator's recollection, in their original appearance. Today, several condominium units are in the renovated building. The exterior's upper levels are untouched from the 1897 to 1898 construction. Only the exterior's first or ground level had undergone alterations for the better: a new walnut-stained modern door is the sole entry and is in the center of the facade; modern double windows have been set alongside of the entry; simulated "blocks" of a gray material was applied to the surface to coordinate with the original construction in the upper levels. Reference to the image on the 1980 Pennsylvania Historic Resource Survey Form had shown some mid-20th century stucco and where the placement of the portals at the building's north and south ends which are now covered with the new surface material.

Of the two-thirds of the original building, the granite and limestone trim construction between quoins is in fine condition. Four (4) large rectangular windows under limestone-cut pediments fill the second and third levels and are evenly spaced. Providing architectural context is the wide cornice with an inscription: "1867 Columbus Hall 1897" in Roman lettering. Projecting forward at the ends of this cornice are brackets in the acanthus leaf design holding an acorn finial. This same classical detail is found below each of the top finials between the first and second levels bracketing the egg-and-dart molding running between to enhance and to support the pediment above the central entry.
These neo-classical details continue with the Tuscan (or Doric) capitals above the pilasters surrounding the entry. These old elements at the first level mirror the rich, cornice below the roofline. Also notable are the efforts to retain the symmetrical Tuscan pilasters at the ends of the building which serve an esthetic purpose in showcasing the windows at the street level, allowing for more "curb appeal" on a much-travelled street.

Left: 1980 Survey photo.
Below: 2019 photo by nominator.
Primary (east) façade, January 2020.
View showing rooftop addition and deck, January 2020.
Staff Supplemented Photographs

View looking up from entrance to cornice, January 2020.

Prior to residential conversion, March 2012. Source: Google Street View.
Aerial showing existing rooftop additions and decks, April 2016.
STATEMENT of SIGNIFICANCE:

Located in the neighborhood now called, "Bella Vista," Columbus Hall was constructed from 1897 to 1898 by the "Societa di Unione e Fratellanza Italiana," a corporation. Members of the Societa (society or association) were the civic leaders in this community which would form one of the nation's first "Little Italies." The Societa's charter members migrated mostly from the area near Genoa and Tuscany in the 1830s and 1840s; their families would be the reason why in 1852 the first Italian Roman Catholic church in the United States would be established in this neighborhood by then-Bishop (Saint) John N. Neumann, CSSR. Societa's members named their meetingplace, "Columbus Hall" not only to connect the explorer's birthplace in Genoa with the ancestral home of some members, but because in the 1870s, Columbus represented nationalism.

Columbus Hall was first located at 746 South 8th Street when the old Moyamensing Hose Company house was sold in 1874. In 1894 the property at 744 South 8th Street was acquired to expand into a new building, a much larger venue, perhaps the only type of interior space able to accommodate hundreds of people in the community. The building was important during an age when associations and organizations for certain groups arose to create blocs in which they would be able to have social and political influence in the city. At the time of its dedication in 1898, Columbus Hall held the representatives of "40 Italian societies" from this "Little Italy." These societies were for dues-paying members, were civic-related and incorporated for the most part with Articles outlining their basic responsibilities to their members. This particular Societa which was incorporated in 1868 changed from fund-raising for its own concerns to assisting the new arrivals of Italians at the end of the 19th century.

1 Translated from the Italian: "The Italian Union and Brotherhood Society."
The Societa which owned Columbus Hall was independent and civically-involved in some significant events. Members had formed the "Columbus Monument Association" in 1874 and collected funds in unity with other Italian societies throughout the United States. The first statue of Christopher Columbus in the country was planned initially by the Societa's members at Columbus Hall for its placement during the 1876 Centennial Exposition in Fairmount Park. Otherwise, besides this type of activity, and participation in the annual Columbus Day parade and 1892 anniversary of Columbus' discoveries, dues-paying members were covered in "care and relief" and educational benefits. This portrait of the Italians in the former Moyamensing Township when Irish Catholics also migrated into the area is a dimension of local and state history as yet unexplored.

Columbus Hall's architectural design, as it rests among residential rowhouses, also deserves some discussion. As one of the late 19th century buildings still existing in Bella Vista, its design was appropriate for the adaptations of classical elements in institutional or large-scale buildings. In 1898, Columbus Hall joined an ensemble of varied architectural styles in this neighborhood which indicated its conformity with national trends.

Thus, Columbus Hall's historic value reaches a broader scope of the late 19th to early 20th century on several levels. The 1980 Pennsylvania Historic Survey Form was submitted (with some errors) and a file already was at the city's Historical Commission, leaving availability to nominate this attractive building. Columbus Hall is an example of a time and circumstances which add to its importance to the city, Commonwealth and country.
"Columbus Hall"...

(a) Has significant character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth or Nation, and,

(j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the community.

Philadelphia has one of the first "Little Italy" communities and its history was thoroughly researched by Villanova University professor Richard M. Juliani, Ph.D. in countless scholarly papers and books.\(^3\) His findings concentrated on the Italian-speaking parishioners who were responsible for the founding of St. Mary Magdalen de Pazzi church in 1852. Still located on the 700 block of Montrose Street, St. Mary's was the social and cultural center of the Italian community which would become notably, "Little Italy." The Italian-speaking immigrants to this area in South Philadelphia were mainly from Italy's Ligurian coast and Tuscany, northern parts of the peninsula. What is important is that their arrivals to this Philadelphia community coincided with the larger influx of Irish Catholic refugees who also came here.

The maps from 1850, 1862 and 1875 follow to illustrate the development of this northeastern part of the former Moyamensing Township, just below South Street and west of Fifth Street. Settlement proceeded from southward and westward directions with residential buildings far outnumbering any church or other institutional building. The limited number of churches and schools suggests the few communal places and sites for activities. Open spaces are non-existent but for the burial grounds/cemeteries. With an obvious and overwhelming number of residents was also a diversity in economic class, as noted by the larger lots and the clusters inside of blocks with much smaller dwellings.

\(^3\) Dr. Juliani's Building Little Italy (1998) held a discourse on the Societa's founding and biographical information on its first members. Copies of these pages are attached.
The Philadelphia business directory of 1861 included this part of Moyamensing Township, then within the County of Philadelphia but not yet in the City's boundaries. The darkened areas of the map concentrate on the most developed part of Moyamensing where Columbus Hall would be located. (Note the "X".) Moyamensing Hose Company already occupied 746 South 8th Street when the map was created. The "Rons Cent" (Ronaldson's Cemetery) marking gives a point to locate the instant nominated building.

Smedley's 1862 Atlas on the next page has a more developed area and identified buildings to exemplify socio-cultural activity. (Source of map and Atlas: Free Library of Philadelphia; Hopkins map from The Athenaeum of Philadelphia.)
Stedley's 1862 Atlas' descriptive notes "Italian Cath Ch" when it should have been "Roman Cath Ch" is (see below "Marriots" and to left of large "2.") Arrow points to 744-746 South 8th Street.
The arrow shows the location of Columbus Hall in this 1875 G.M. Hopkins map. At the time, Columbus Hall was at 746 South 8th Street. The surveyed lots, street car routes and significant churches and schools portray this community's lifestyle and do not indicate any ethnic group's presence, but for the "colored" schools.

The Italian national church, St. Mary Magdalen de Pazzi is below the range of this map, but was not identified as "Italian."
Juliani's findings on the leading members of the "Little Italy" community of the 1850s offered information that the men were self-employed, arriving voluntarily in a "chain of migration"4 from some earlier Ligurian departees. They sustained St. Mary's and were reliant unto themselves in assimilating to an area where the Irish Catholic immigrant experienced displacement and was far more economically disadvantaged. Immigrant services were strongest in this area of Philadelphia County although "evangelical Protestants and Quakers" served these impoverished Irish on the 700 block of Catharine Street5 long before St. Mary's founding. The same immigrant site for the "House of Industry," would assist the Irish in obtaining employment and personal needs which the Italians in the same neighborhood did not require.

A more indepth comparison of the Irish and Italians in Moyamensing Township is warranted, however the point is to show that the shadow of providing immigrant social services did not extend to the northern Italians. By the 1860s, just after the Civil War, and in alignment with others in Italian enclaves elsewhere in the country, the Philadelphia group knew to organize a bloc, incorporate the "society" or "association" it would formally become, and have a meeting place not in anyone's home. Also unlike the Irish, the Italian-speakers did not organize themselves around any Roman Catholic cause or office. Julianni noted that the Societa created in 1867 and incorporated in 1868 was "secular."6 This group confidently held itself out as independent of anything religious or ethnic. The insinuation that membership was confined only to those of Italian ancestry was nowhere in the Articles of Incorporation?7

6Julianni, op. cit., p. 200.
7A copy of the entire Charter is attached as "Appendix 1." The Charter is in City Archives.
The American Catholic Historical Society's print of St. Mary Magdalen de Pazzi Church from the 1850s portrays a refuge and venue for the Italian residents until Columbus Hall emerged.

OLD ST. M. M. DE-PAZZI'S CHURCH AND PAL
Organizing a "Societa":

In some respects, the men who knew to incorporate their group as a society or association were sophisticated to frame the Articles around "care and relief" and educational purposes for dues-paying members and their families. But why these founding members retained a foreign language in naming their group implies a reluctance to abandon their ethnic identities. It may have been a matter of following the doings in other "Little Italys" such as those in San Francisco or in New York City or in Boston where Philadelphia's Ligurians had kinsmen. These members in 1867 had also determined that their society would not be associated with St. Mary Magdalen de Pazzi parish or its priests. Juliani wrote that the Roman Catholic presence had an earlier purpose where it "served to define the location and limits of the community" possibly well before these members became more financially established. The "secular" characterization given by Juliani is derived from the Articles and what is not stated. The amendments to the initial Articles of 1868 were apparent in the 1903 "Directory" where additional benefits were listed. (See page 27 herein.)

Presumably, the Societa's more successful members in business would have had contacts in the city to become acquainted with what was required to incorporate. It is remarkable that all of the members in 1867 claimed American citizenship, yet all had not anglicized their Italian first names. The Societa restricted its attention to dues-paying members with, in 1867, the Articles only pledging the "care and relief of the sick aged and needy... and for the purpose of establishing schools and libraries" for members and their families' use. The remainder of the Charter involved administrative matters.

Juliani, op.cit., pp.60; 164.
Perhaps the shortcomings in the Articles were because the Societa was not home-grown but imitated what other Ligurians had created. Baily compared the Ligurian settlements in Buenos Aires, Argentina and New York City which contemporaneously had filed their own Societas by about 1858. He found that Ligurians were involved in "political" activities abroad; the activists were also in skilled occupations. Both cities' Ligurians founded their societies by 1858. (See charts below.)

Table 29. New York City area Italian mutual aid societies, 1869-1889

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Society</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Members</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Genoa, N.Y.</td>
<td>1869</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genoa Benevolent Soc.</td>
<td>1870</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genoa Benevolent Soc.</td>
<td>1872</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genoa Benevolent Soc.</td>
<td>1874</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genoa Benevolent Soc.</td>
<td>1876</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genoa Benevolent Soc.</td>
<td>1878</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 30. Place of birth and occupations of new members of the Ligurian Benevolent, 1859-1869 and 1869

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Place of Birth</th>
<th>1859-69</th>
<th>1869-70</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Northern Italy</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Italy</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Italy</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buenos Aires</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The answer to "why?" these naturalized Americans of Italian ancestry would form a societa in 1867 was postulated by Juliani: "...urban dwellers...wanted to restore personal identity and social solidarity (and) found it necessary to create newer institutions. Philadelphians of all ethnic backgrounds and class levels formed new clubs and associations in an attempt to restore meaning and stability to their lives."\textsuperscript{10} Baily had a different opinion: "...the prominenti...used positions of leadership within the societies to further their own businesses and personal interests."\textsuperscript{11} Thus, while the first societies--especially those founded by Ligurians--were non-religious-based, they were more self-serving, if not used--with titles affixed to the members' names--for advancement initially within the enclaves, then into larger areas.

The Societa accumulated the funds to purchase 746 South 8th Street, a tall three-story building in 1874, the same year it solicited money--$18,000.00--for the Columbus Statue. In 1874, the first "Columbus Hall" became the new name for the old Moyamensing Hose Company. Then, in 1894, the adjacent property owned by member John Queroli at 744 South 8th Street was acquired. By 1897, 746 South 8th Street's building was razed, with a new construction upon it enjoined to 744 South 8th Street. From the nominator's memory, the flooring of the second and third floors was contiguous, and of wood planking; one large hall was on each level, with some narrow closets and stairs on the west wall--these were part of the 1897-1898 construction. The facade unified both properties for the new "Columbus Hall."

\textsuperscript{10} Ibid., p. 221.
\textsuperscript{11} Baily, op.cit., p. 185. Prominenti refers to the leaders.
\textsuperscript{12} The nominator was shown the pre-renovated property in the late 1990s. The second floor was littered with the same booklets on the various societies in the Historical Commission's file, photographs and other ephemera (certificates, etc.....)
The Granville Perkins' watercolor of the Moyamensing Hose building at 746 South 8th Street was drawn c. 1872, two years before the Societa purchased the property as the first "Columbus Hall." (Source: Free Library of Phila. Prints and Pictures Collection.)

The "New Columbus Hall" was reported by "The Philadelphia Inquirer," omitting the razing of 744 South 8th Street, the Guerroli residence purchased by the Societa in 1894.

"The Inquirer's" drawing on right is consistent to the c. 1872 Perkins watercolor on the building's design. However, it was razed in 1897 and enjoined with the property (744) to its north (on right in image.)
At right is the 1929 drawing from the Società's handbook showing side entrances, now covered with masonry to resemble cut stone.

"The Philadelphia Inquirer's" July 2, 1897 edition published the architect's sketch for the new Columbus Hall, a more decorative version than the one finished in 1898.
According to the frieze below, the elaborate consoled, molded and modillioned overhanging cornice—this building was erected as Columbus Hall in 1897. The rough carved granite ashlar walls are pierced by four limestone-hooded windows, each on the second and third floors. The party walls of the building are marked by limestone quoining.

On the first floor, four polished granite pilasters with Doric capitals support an elaborately molded stone cornice with a shallow pediment over the front entrance and two large pineapple-topped, foliated consoles at its ends.

The first floor was unsympathetically altered in recent times.

Columbus Hall, no doubt, was built for a Knights of Columbus chapter, a Catholic Church related group, important to this largely Catholic neighborhood.
The "Columbus Hall" name:

The Societa founded in 1867 was "dominated by individuals of Ligurian or Tuscan origin" wrote Juliani.\textsuperscript{13} The birthplace of Christopher Columbus was the port city of Genoa in Liguria, that coastal part of northern Italy near France which is often called the Italian Riviera. Ligurians are proud of Columbus, their kinsmen, and they took his renown into their settlements. San Francisco Ligurians had a "Colombo Produce Market" in 1874, the same year the Philadelphia Ligurians pitched their idea for a statue of Christopher Columbus for the Centennial Exhibition. Northern Italian St. Frances Xavier Cabrini would name not one but two hospitals after Columbus (in New York City and Chicago) in the 1880s. The Societa of Philadelphia had adopted the name of "Columbus Hall" when it bought the 746 South 8th Street property in 1874.

A contemporary publication from the 1876 Centennial\textsuperscript{14} verified the existence of "(T)he various Italian civic and military organizations of Philadelphia," along with "the Italian Beneficial society, of Philadelphia" and "Columbus Monument Association." Other "Italian groups" from the major East Coast cities sent delegates to the "Italian day" event at the Centennial. It was clear that the Societa organized the parade as marchers met on "Eighth Street," which could only mean Columbus Hall. The same source further noted that the Columbus Monument Association "originated in Philadelphia about two years ago," or in 1874. Nothing "Roman Catholic" or anything church-related was ever associated with "Columbus Hall," or its Societa or members.

\textsuperscript{13}Juliani, op.cit., p.225.
on the pedestal of the Columbus Statue is:

"Dedicated October 12th, 1876, by the Christopher
Columbus Monument Association on the Anniversary of
the Landing of Columbus, October 12, 1492."

This inscription further refutes the 1980 Pennsylvania
Historic Survey Form's assertion that: "Columbus Hall, no doubt,
was built for a Knights of Columbus chapter, a Catholic Church
related group, important to this largely Catholic neighborhood."
A general search on the history of the Knights of Columbus holds
its origins in "1882" by Irish priest Michael McGivney in Connect-
ticut.

"The Philadelphia Inquirer" clip from February 4, 1898 high-
lights the dedication of the new Columbus Hall.

COLUMBUS HALL

It Was Formally Dedicated by
Italians Last Night

Columbus Hall, which has just been fin-
ished for the Italian Union and Brother-
hood Society, at Nos. 744 and 746 South
Eighth street, was formally dedicated last
night. It is a three-story building well
adapted for the society's uses.

The Building Committee was Frederick
Cunéo, Louis Casabona, F. Diodati, J.
Mollnari and D. Di Toro, with E. V. H.
Nardi as chairman. Mr. Nardi is president.
There were music, fireworks and a supper,
which were enjoyed by representatives of
forty Italian societies.
This photograph was taken c. 1905 of the leaders in the "fouirty Italian societies" who were present for the 1898 dedication of Columbus Hall. Translated from the Italian, in a book published in Philadelphia, the caption reads: "Small group from the societies in the FEDERATION OF THE ITALIAN SOCIETIES of Philadelphia." Charles C.A. Baldi is in the center.

These men represented beneficial concerns for the on-going migrations of Italians into this neighborhood, as well as the businesses who would interact with newcomers for consumer goods and transatlantic communications and trade.

15 A rare book in private possession, the full citation is Strafiile, Prof. Alfonso, Memorandum, Colonialie ossia Sintesi storica di osservazioni e fatti che diano un'idea generale della Vita Colonialie degli Italiani nel Nord America. Phila.: "Mastro Paolo" Printing House, 1910.
The rise in beneficial, social, religious or cultural associations in Philadelphia through the 19th century also warranted places where groups could meet, neutral sites where doors could be closed and expressed thoughts could produce meaningful actions for the communities. Eastern European Jews also lived and worked in Moyamensing, as this Temple University Urban Archives photograph from the 1890s holds. "The Times" listing from 1897 also lends more information on Columbus Hall's varied uses. The photograph is of the 700 block of Bainbridge Street, around the corner from Columbus Hall. With the Republican Party in power at that time, Columbus Hall could span its use from social or cultural (for the Italians) to political.

--

* * The Third Ward Hebrew Republican Club will hold a mass meeting at Columbus Hall, 746 South Eighth street, evening.

The Times (Philadelphia, Pennsylvania) - Fe, Feb 12, 1897 - Page 1
CONSORZIO ASSOCIAZIONE ITALIANA REGINA MARIA GEMELLA (Inc. 1902), 878-9 B. 61 St. Object: To encourage a social and skilful feeling, to accumulate funds to provide relief to Italian widows, and to promote their moral welfare. Membership: Italian widows or those of Italian descent, 50 years of age or over. Contributions: $6 per year. Death benefit: $1000. Entrance fee 75c. Assessment of death of member, 75c.

CHIUSO DA SAN MICHELE ARCANGELO UNIONE FRATERNITA MONTEDUROSA IN PHILADELPHIA (Inc. 1892, Inc. 1901), 213 Carpenter St. Object: To promote the moral and material condition of its members, and to accumulate a fund for aged persons. Membership: Catholic Italians 50 years of age or over. Contributions: $10 per year. Death benefit: $1000. Entrance fee 50c. Assessment of death of member, 50c.

CIVITASENASI BENEFICIAL ASSOCIATION. Meets at 276 Mountain St. Object: To assist to the best of our power, and to promote the welfare of our Italian members. Contributions: 25c per month. Death benefit: $3000. Entrance fee 25c. Assessment of death of member, 25c.


The Continuity of the Societa and Columbus Hall:

Many of the Societa's charter members from the 1867 founding would die in the intervening decades between acquiring the 746 South 8th Street property in 1874, then 744 South 8th Street in 1894. What another generation in membership meant were several conclusions: the Societa proved its importance in the community; a solid financial base enabled investment in another property and renovation to enjoin the two buildings architecturally into one; and that the Societa was able to adapt to a new immigrant group from mainly southern Italy which had very different experiences in settling.

Juliani focussed on standing members' biographical information from their ancestral birthplaces to how they assimilated in Philadelphia. For the instant nomination, some members are relevant, such as Emmanuel V.H. Nardi, the chairman of Columbus Hall's Building Committee. He was a second-generation in the family who was active in local "Italian" community affairs. As Chairman who supervised Columbus Hall's design, Nardi addressed other concerns in the neighborhood. On the next page is his image and opposite, a photo of immigrant orphans in an asilo (asylum) where Nardi was Vice President, as well as a Director for the Society for Immigrants. Below Nardi's image is one of John Queroli, who sold his property at 744 South 8th Street to the Societa in 1894. Queroli was the Societa's President in 1915 when the "45th" annual masked ball was held. (See page 5.) The source of these pages, Professor Strafile's Memorandum, Coloniale (Phila.:1910) intended to showcase the resourcefulness of "Little Italy" Italian American leaders in addressing a problem which neither local government nor the Archdiocese could fully do at the time. At these leaders' foundation was the primary Societa, and Columbus Hall to meet and to strategize.
Reparti della società per gli immigranti

Ricovero

EMANUELA H. NARDI Presidente

ERMA DAVII, SCALABRELLA, W. HARRI R. GANDOLFO
FRANK A. TRAASCELI, L. G. M. DE VECCHIS

Ufficio d'informazioni

A. A. JOSEPHI BARTHTICCI, Dir. generale

JRA. AGOSTIIN Z. BONACI, Dir. generale

ALFONSO CIUCCOTTI, ORG. G. M. DE VECCHIS

Asilo Infantile

Comitato Asilo

REMA COSTANTINO, XXI. Direttore

R. CLUSSO, ANTONIO RAGGIO

FRANK RUGGIO, HENRY DE BEARDINO

Comitato Scuola di Cittadinanza

W. HARRI R. GANDOLFO, Elezioni

EMANUELA H. NARDI

W. JOSEPHI BARTHTICCI

ALFONSO CIUCCOTTI

H. DE BEARDINO

Comitato di assistenza alla Scuola di Cittadinanza

L. JOE S. S. V. FRANK S. S. V. N.

VINCENTO ROMA, H. BEARDINO TINO

PIETRO COLAFRETE

Ufficiali della società per gli immigranti:

EMANUEL V. H. NARDI, Vice-Presidente

ANTONIO R. G., Tesoriere

JOHN QUEROLI, Direttore

FRANK ROSARIO, Manager
Obtained from the Columbus Hall file at the Philadelphia Historical Commission are these membership booklets from two societies which met at Columbus Hall. The booklets, printed the "Laws and Regulations" in membership.

At left is the beneficial aide (soccorso) Societa named after "Rome and the Province" dating to 1943 in activity.

At right is the Italian Society of "St. Lawrence Martyr," (began by those from Campobasso, near Naples, Italy) booklet dating from 1922.
Columbus Hall's Architectural Value:

The former Moyamensing Township is one of the oldest sections of the city and its architectural heritage is represented with Columbus Hall. From the earliest public or institutional buildings in the 1830s through the mid-20th century, the designs of structures here in Moyamensing Township, now "Bella Vista," contributed to the city's tradition and lead in the latest architectural styles. The first buildings, in the Federal Style, have been demolished, but they had existed when Columbus Hall was designed in 1897-1898. This is important in knowing how the community appeared to its residents as well as to visitors. The styles of the buildings pictured in this "album" also imply how extensive contacts and communications were between the "locals" and those outside of this rather closed community.

The architectural history of Moyamensing Township includes FEDERAL STYLE buildings such as the Ringgold Elementary School, dating from the early 1830s to 1898 when demolished. This school stood about 100 feet northeast from Columbus Hall, on the corner of 8th and Fitzwater Street. (Cianfrani Park occupies the site.) The photograph below was supposedly taken in 1897, just before the building was to be destroyed for the new James Campbell School.
Noyamensing Hall at 923 Christian Street was the most important building for the entire township since its 1833-34 construction.

Left, a sketch of the Hall, a Federal Style design resembling the Ringgold School. (Source: Historical Society of Pennsylvania.)

Below is a rare photo of the post-1866 renovation of the Hall, when St. Paul's parish bought the fire-damaged building and fashioned it as a convent for the Sisters, Servants of the Immaculate Heart of Mary (IHM's.)

Noyamensing Hall was directly across from St. Paul's church. The building was destroyed by the late 1950s; it was then hidden behind the St. Paul's School from 1896. (See p. 38 herein.)

A rare photograph taken of the former Noyamensing Hall, circa 1880 (photo courtesy Immaculate College Archives.)
Post-Consolidation building designs in the neighborhood:

On 700 block of Catharine Street (South side.)
DEMOLISHED

After the 1854 Consolidation, the former Noyamensing Township's more established areas kept abreast of the latest architectural trends, as these buildings show. Designing these institutional buildings from the proto-post Civil War years connected this neighborhood to the sophistication of Center City.

Left: the Randall Public School, c.1866.
Below: the Thomas Florence Public School, now, Palumbo Playground.
(700 block, Catharine Street, north.)

Above:
900 block, Bainbridge (PHC-approved.)

Thomas B. Florence Public School
This Tom Crane photograph of the 1886 Protestant Episcopal Church of the Evangelists is of an existing building, on the 700 block of Catharine Street (north side), part of the Fleisher.
Architect Frank R. Watson's design of the Protestant Episcopal "Emmanuelle" Church held some of the same elements as his teacher's work for the Roman Catholic church of St. Mary Magdalen de Pazzi, below. Architect Edwin F. Durang sketched St. Mary's by about 1883 and the church was not dedicated until 1891. Emmanuelle was already open, having less expensive construction costs.

The Emmanuelle (left) was demolished in 2019.
Other large buildings designed for the Italian community were close to Columbus Hall. Photographer Srocato went around the corner from Columbus Hall, to 7th and Fitzwater Streets to capture two contemporary scenes. The image on the bottom of the next page is one looking eastward on Christian Street from Eleventh. Notice the bell tower of the Emmanuelle Church on the right. This church, like Columbus Hall, was in the middle of residential rowhouses.
Contemporary scenes of the neighborhood when Columbus Hall was rather new.

(Source of images: Strafile's Memorandum, 1910)

Christian Street in Philadelphia's "Little Italy" neighborhood at the beginning of the 20th century.
Some similarities are noted between the 1896 St. Paul's School and the 1899 Campbell School: rounded arches; bays; definition. Durang, however, drew "movement" in the contour of his building.

Below is Durang's 1905 St. Paul's School.

Left and left, below are from architect Edwin F. Durang's Album of the 1896 St. Paul's School at 923 Christian Street. It stood in front of the old Moyamensing Hall.
The Ringgold School's name was changed to the "James Campbell Public School" by the 1897 construction of this new building. The c.1832 Federal Style Ringgold School ceded to the rise of more local residents and to other changes: James Campbell, an Irish Catholic from Queen Village, was a jurist and Post Master General under President Franklin Pierce. The naming of a school of an Irish Catholic in a dominant Anglo-Protestant city foretold the ethno-cultural future.

The architect of Columbus Hall may have influenced Joseph Anschultz who designed the James Campbell Public School in 1899, as seen from their identifying cornices and the placements of the years (front and end) and names in center. The Ringgold School was also demolished, just as the old Moyamensing Hose building.
Is Columbus Hall "Beaux Arts" in design?

The 1980 Historic Survey study placed the building into the most avant garde architectural style of the 1890s, Beaux Arts, with no foundation. The architect of Columbus Hall seemed to carry in his plan the Hall's purpose within the community as a meetingplace and commercial space on the ground level. Situated between residential properties, Columbus Hall was no different than other buildings--including grocery stores, banks and businesses--which flanked rowhouse residences. There were no zoning prohibitions, it seems, to create uniformity, or to site certain businesses away from the intrusion of residential living.

Whoever designed Columbus Hall was aware of architectural trends in the 1890s for commercial buildings. The facade has two separate components stacked atop each other, in the present and original forms. Elements from the work of Richardson can be seen in the rusticated granite and monochromatic color of the surface forcing attention to the classical details: pediments above each window on the upper levels, Tuscan piers on the street level, the moldings, ornate cornices and brackets holding acorn finials. Art historian Brown would describe Columbus Hall as "mercantile classicism," (borrowed from Siegfried Giedion). While adapting many of the conventions used in the Chicago architects' designs of higher buildings (more than five levels), Columbus Hall used some verticals against the horizontals for organizing a symmetrical facade. Plain, squared windows add to the simple and straight in the design. If seeking an example or kind of model in which to create a design for that late 1890s era of heightened commercial activity (the recovery after the 1893 crash), Columbus Hall exemplified the use of muted masonry for some levels, rustication on others and classical details to tie everything together.

---


17 Staff note: Appendix II contains a drawing of the building with "P.F. Gallagher, Architect, 917 Sansom St." The staff's research of Gallagher shows the history of a builder/contractor who perhaps embellished his level of training in this particular instance. Appendix III contains a newspaper clipping that begins "Contractor P. F. Gallagher presented plans for Columbus Hall..."
This Google Map image has a close view of the rough surfaces used in institutional design since the 1880s.
The exact date of 927 South 8th Street's design is unknown, but the facade has similarities to Columbus Hall, just two blocks north: ashlar "blocks", the classical elements, piers on the ground/street level where commercial/business would transpire. It also is sited between residences.
These buildings from Brown's American Art served as examples of commercial architecture in the late 19th century. These buildings are in the Midwest and were designed by architects who had some training at the Ecole des Beaux Arts; the classical details enhance the otherwise modulated horizontals and verticals. And despite their high levels, a rather prominent cornice and deep frieze decorate the tops.

Columbus Hall's architect used many of these conventions in the more compact, three-story Hall.

Columbus Hall also has a distinctive lower level, just as these commercial buildings.
Conclusion:

Columbus Hall's heritage has been shown to sweep across its origins with the Societa's members, who used available resources from their wide scope of contacts over the United States to participate in some local and national historic events, such as the 1876 Centennial Exhibition and 1892 Columbus celebrations. Columbus Hall derived from local residents' motives to further non-ethnic and non-religious concerns in this neighborhood, but as a venue, the building accommodated large groups from any background.

Columbus Hall has been the site to attest to the organizational growth of many "societies" from the late 19th to early 20th centuries where civic, political and cultural activities arose from this neighborhood in tandem with the city, state and national movements. Architecturally, Columbus Hall held timely details in its design, reflecting the late 19th century "mercantile classicism" first devised by Henry Hobson Richardson in the 1880s, then more fully developed in commercial buildings by Chicago School architects in the 1890s.

Thus, Columbus Hall presents several meritorious reasons for historical designation from how it succeeded well in integrating its appearance and purpose into the city, state and national spheres of historical importance.

Celeste A. Morello, MS, MA
November, 2019
BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES (Primary and Secondary):


McCabe, James, The Illustrated History of the Centennial Exhibition... Phila.: The National Publishing Co., 1876.


Other published sources:
"A Directory of the Charitable, Social Imporvement, Educational... Phila.: The Civic Club, 1903.


Archives and Resources sites:
The Athenaeum of Philadelphia--Special thanks to Michael Seneca.

Catholic Historical Research Center--Special thanks to Patrick Shank on St. Mary Magdalen de Pazzi parish information.

City Archives--Special thanks to David Baugh.

Philadelphia Historical Commission--Special thanks to Mrs. Chantry.

Temple University Urban Archives

Also acknowledging with gratitude: Marina and Eugene Desyatkine who care about Bella Vista's great history!
APPENDIX I:

Copy of Charter of March 16, 1868 filed by the Società di Unione e Fratellanza Italiana (in Philadelphia.)
APPENDIX II:

Richard N. Juliani, Ph.D. on La Societa who were responsible for Columbus Hall.

(Pages copied from his Building Little Italy.)
Security Organization Entitled to Protect

The organization entitled to protect was not mentioned in the original document. It is likely that there is additional information missing from the provided text. Please ensure the entire document is available for a complete understanding.
Society of Union & Philadelphia Relief

This is a historical image related to the Society of Union & Philadelphia Relief, which was involved in relief efforts and donations during the Civil War. The image shows a building with text that appears to be part of a historical document or a plaque. The text is not fully legible, but it likely contains information about the society's roles and contributions during that period. The building depicted is likely significant in the context of Union relief efforts in Philadelphia.
APPENDIX III:

Copies of sources used in nomination.
THE ILLUSTRATED HISTORY
OF THE
CENTENNIAL EXHIBITION,
HELD IN COMMEMORATION
OF
THE ONE HUNDREDTH ANNIVERSARY
OF
AMERICAN INDEPENDENCE.

WITH A FULL DESCRIPTION OF
THE GREAT BUILDINGS AND ALL THE OBJECTS OF
INTEREST EXHIBITED IN THEM,

EMBRACING ALSO
A Concise History of the Origin and Success of the Exhibition, and Biographies of the
Leading Members of the Centennial Commission,

TO WHICH IS ADDED
A COMPLETE DESCRIPTION OF THE CITY OF PHILADELPHIA.

BY JAMES D. MCCABE,
AUTHOR OF THE "CENTENNIAL HISTORY OF THE UNITED STATES,"
"PATHWAYS OF THE HOLY LAND," ETC., ETC.

EMBELLISHED WITH OVER 300 FINE ENGRAVINGS OF BUILDINGS AND SCENES
IN THE GREAT EXHIBITION.

Lent for subscription only, and not for sale in the book stores. Residents of any State desiring
a copy should address the Publishers, and an Agent will send upon them. See page 872.

PUBLISHED BY
THE NATIONAL PUBLISHING COMPANY.
PHILADELPHIA, PA., CHICAGO, ILL., AND ST. LOUIS, MO.

1876
The Italian Day.

One of the most memorable celebrations connected with the Exhibition took place on Thursday, October 12th, on which day the Italian residents of the United States presented to the city of Philadelphia the magnificent marble statue of Christopher Columbus, which now ornaments the West Park. The day was the 356th anniversary of the discovery of the New World by Columbus.

The various Italian civic and military organizations of Philadelphia and other cities which decided to take part in the ceremonies assembled in South Eighth street on the morning of the 12th of October, and proceeded up Eighth street to Chestnut, and thence to Fifth, where they were reviewed by his Honor the Mayor, after which the Mayor and members of both branches of City Councils entered carriages and took the place in line assigned to them in accordance with the programme. Chief Marshal J. Ratto, Esq., headed the line and was followed by a platoon of twenty-four reserve officers, commanded by Lieutenant Crout. The visiting Columbus Guard (Bersaglieri), of New York, came next, headed by the Black Hussar Band dismounted. The riflemen numbered about seventy men, and made a handsome appearance, the officers having an abundance of green ostrich feathers in their low-crowned hats, while those of the privates and non-commissioned officers were black. The red, white, and green of Italy, together with the stars and stripes, were born by the color-bearers. Following these came the Columbus Monument Association in barouches, and then the Mayor and members of Councils. Attired in their handsome winter uniform, the State Fencible Band proceeded the Italian Beneficial Society, of Philadelphia, who carried a handsome blue banner, with the proper inscription. Delegations from New York, Washington, Boston, Baltimore, and other cities were in one body, and bore at the front the banner of the Boston Mutual Relief and Beneficial Society, on which was an elegant painting in oil representing the landing of Columbus. The Italian Colony, of Philadelphia, and G. Garibaldi Society,
of New York, brought up the rear of the line. The line of march was up Fifth to Arch, thence to Broad, to Fairmount avenue, through the Park to Girard avenue, to Belmont avenue, and to the Globe Hotel, where Governor Hartranft and staff were in waiting to accompany them to the site of the monument.

The movement to erect a monument to Christopher Colum-

bus originated in Philadelphia about two years ago, when the Columbus Monument Association was organized, the call for aid in the enterprise being heartily responded to, not only by the various Italian societies in the country, but by individuals who made personal contributions. Professor Salla, of Florence, Italy, being applied to, sent over a design for a monument, which was adopted, and the artist began his work at once. It arrived
in this country in July, 1876, but, as the officers of the associa-
tion desired to have it placed in position not more than a few
days before the time fixed for its dedication, it was not con-
veyed to the grounds until needed, when it was erected on
the site originally selected for it. The entire monument cost
$18,000, and stands twenty-two feet from the ground, the
statue of Columbus being ten feet in height, and the pedestal
twelve feet. The base is seven feet long by six feet in width.
The figure represents Columbus, in the costume of his age and
climate, standing on a ship's deck; near his feet being an anchor,
coils of rope, and a sailor's dunnage-bag; his right hand rest-
ing on a globe fifteen inches in diameter, with the New World
outlined on the front face, and supported by a hexagonal
column. His left is gracefully extended, and holds a chart of
what was once an unknown sea. The head of the statue is
bare, and the physiognomy about as represented in the bust of
the great navigator at Genoa. The statue faces east, and on
the front cap of the pedestal are the words: "Presented to the
City of Philadelphia by the Italian Societies." Beneath this is
a medallion representing the landing of Columbus. On the
opposite side of the cap is inscribed: "Dedicated October 12th,
1876, by the Christopher Columbus Monument Association, on
the Anniversary of the Landing of Columbus, October 12th,
1492." Underneath is the Genoese coat-of-arms and the words:
"In Commemoration of the First Century of American
Independence." On the remaining two sides of the pedestal are
the coats-of-arms of Italy and the United States.

The military escort to Governor Hartranft formed on Girard
avenue east of Belmont avenue at about two o'clock. It con-
isted of the following regiments and organizations of the First
Brigade, headed by General Brinton and staff: First Regiment,
Colonel Benson; Second Regiment, Colonel Lyle; Wescacoe
Legion, Captain Denny; Washington Grays, Captain Zane;
First City Troop, Captain Fairman Rogers, acting as personal
escort to the Governor. The military marched up Belmont
avenue, and halted opposite the Globe Hotel, at which point
Governor Hartranft took his place in the line. At about three
vanized iron covered tower. William W. Rea has the contract for the work.

Contractor P. F. Gallagher presented plans for Columbus Hall to be built for the Societa Di Unione E. Fratellage Italia at a cost of $10,000. The building will be 34 by 66.6 feet, three stories high, of stone and metal, at 744 and 40 South Eighth street. The first floor will be taken up with two large stores and the second and third floors will contain meeting and ante-rooms.

George W. Sherman, real estate operator, Fifty-second and Warren streets.
PHILADELPHIA
THE CIVIC CLUB

LAWS APPLICABLE TO DOLLARISS.
LEGAL ASSOCIATIONS.
TOGETHER WITH

PHILADELPHIA
TO CHURCHES
AND
RELIGIOUS ASSOCIATIONS
AND
EDUCATIONAL
CHARITABLE, SOCIAL IMPROVEMENT
AND
A DIRECTORY
"MEMORANDUM, COLONIALE"

ossia
Sintesi storica di osservazioni e fatti
che diano un'idea generale
della
Vita Coloniale degli Italiani
nel Nord America

con
Monografia illustrativa della
Colonia di Philadelphia
compilato dal
Prof. ALFONSO STRAFIL
(Proprietà riservata all'autore)

The old photographs in this nomination were copied from this source, a rare book in private possession. La Colonia di Philadelphia (1910) at the Historical Society of Pennsylvania has the same images and same information on the Italian banks.
The Italian Community in Philadelphia

The Origin and Development of the Italian Experience in Pennsylvania

Richard N. Joojani

Endured and with an Introduction by John E. Boehner
AMERICAN ART

PAINTING • SCULPTURE • ARCHITECTURE
DECORATIVE ARTS • PHOTOGRAPHY

BY
MILTON W. BROWN
Executive Officer, Doctoral Program in Art History, City University of New York

SAM HUNTER
Professor, Department of Art and Archaeology, Princeton University

JOHN JACOBUS
Chairman, Department of Art, Dartmouth College

NAOMI ROSENBLUM
Instructor in Art History, Brooklyn College

DAVID M. SOKOL
Chairperson of the History of Architecture and Art Department,
University of Illinois Chicago Circle

PRENTICE-HALL, INC., ENGLEWOOD CLIFFS, NEW JERSEY
HARRY N. ABRAMS, INC., NEW YORK

1979
attached buildings, two adjacent and identical in design by Holabird & Roche, one of two bays and six stories and the other three bays and seven stories; and the third by Sullivan, of three bays and eight stories, with four added in 1903 by Holabird & Roche without altering its character. The exquisite ensemble is hardly matched for airy grace and elegance. The proportions vary slightly and show subtle refinements: Holabird & Roche’s somewhat sturdier and more vertical, Sullivan’s lighter and more horizontal. Holabird & Roche here produced frank examples of an architecture of steel and glass. Sullivan’s facade may appear fussy, but the proportions and delicacy in detailing are superior. He achieved greater lightness and horizontality by devising a new kind of window with a band of transom glass above clusters of narrow vertical panes. Certainly his cornice is a more fitting climax. Only in the ornament does the purity of intention seem contradicted. The small decorative elements in the horizontal bands are questionable, but the elaboration of the ground-floor framing and the floral explosions above the vertical piers are Sullivan at his exuberant best.

The Carson, Pirie, Scott Store (plate 291) is Sullivan’s last major work and his masterpiece. The nine-story, three-bay unit on Madison Street just off State was erected in 1899. In 1903-04 Sullivan added a larger section twelve stories high, with three bays on Madison and seven on State. O. H. Burnham & Co. completed the State Street block in 1906 with the addition of five bays. The only break in the classical block is the round section that turns the corner. Here Sullivan contrasted a vertical accent with the pronounced horizontality of the rest. The two lower floors are treated as a unit, with large display windows framed in lavish metal decoration. Above, the walls rise sheer and unadorned for nine stories. Unfortunately, the tenth floor has been remodeled and the original cornice replaced by an ungainly parapet. The entire building above the second floor is sheathed in thin terra-cotta tile, the windows are clearly recessed and delicately framed, and the only ornament is a continuous plinth band at window sill and lintel, emphasizing the horizontal. The metal frame is nowhere else more logically expressed nor with such sophistication in scale, proportion, and line.

Aside from a mania for height, New York’s main contribution to the skyscraper was the development of the tower as opposed to the Chicago flat-topped block or shaft. Even the earliest tall buildings in New York tended toward elaboration of terminal elements, and the spire eventually became characteristic of the New York skyline and symbolic of the skyscraper itself.

THE COLUMBIAN EXPOSITION AND “IMPERIAL CLASSICISM”

The World’s Columbian Exposition of 1893 in Chicago was a symbol of America’s entry into the mainstream of international culture, parallel to that in economies and politics. Siegfried Giedion has called it the manifestation of “mercantile classicism,” and James Fitch labeled its products “imperial symbols.” Its false facades can also be seen as symbols of self-deception. This whipped cream architecture hid echoes of unprecedented scale—financial panic, class warfare, and urban degradation. It was a time of depression, unemployment, and the march on Washington by Eugene’s Army. It was also a time of struggle between labor and capital, the Haymarket bombing, the Homestead massacre, and the Pullman strike. Cities were straining in civic corruption, their poor sunk in filth and disease. The World’s Fair and “mercantile classicism” in general did not advertise such difficulties. Columns and cupolas, spires and cornices were expected to hide the crude facts of reality.

269 CIVIL WAR TO 1900
Richard N. Juliani

Building Little Italy

Philadelphia's Italians Before Mass Migration

© 1998 The Pennsylvania State University Press
University Park, Pennsylvania
The Immigrant Community: The Scaffold for Mass Immigration

By 1870, an Italian community had clearly emerged in Philadelphia, but it was a complex reality. On one level, this community was a physical place. Although Italians were found in various sections of the city, their concentration in the wards of South Philadelphia had become even more visible. On another level, of equal if not greater importance, this community was also a source for a sense of personal identity and social cohesion. Italians now knew where they could find other Italians, and similarly, other Philadelphians knew where they could find Italians. The neighborhood contained such specific institutional features as the boardinghouse, the tavern, the parish, the fraternal society, and various shops and stores, all with a definite Italian character. Such conditions helped an Italian community to become firmly rooted, both as a physical reality and as a social-psychological reference for its own inhabitants, as well as for other residents of the city.

For Philadelphia as a whole, the development of the Italian community was also contributing to the social ecology of the modern city. In addition to the central business district of the downtown area, other hubs of mixed residential, industrial, and commercial character were appearing throughout the city. In some instances, these smaller outlying districts had been grafted on to the older communities beyond the original limits of the preconsolidation city.

Now, however, these somewhat self-contained communities were becoming the neighborhoods, or "urban villages," of modern America. The Italian case had also attained a peculiar sociological anomaly that tends to mark most ethnic groups in complex societies. With its own internal order and partial autonomy, the Italian community in South Philadelphia formed a distinctive and separate social system in itself. At the same time, as a neighborhood within and dependent on
as the nineteenth century unfolded, new demographic, ecological, and institutional conditions enabled Italians to establish their own community. With each passing year, the size of the population increased modestly but steadily. The naturalizations that occurred also indicated that Italians were making a permanent commitment as citizens of a new nation. At the same time, the first traces of internal institutions that played an increasingly larger part in the further development of the colony appeared. By the 1840s, the new arrival could find lodging in a boardinghouse operated by another Italian, even if it was also sometimes a place of intragroup hostility and violence. By the 1850s, Italians had grown sufficiently in number to warrant establishing their own parish as Roman Catholics. By the 1860 federal census, Italians for the first time manifested a significant clustering of population at the southeast quarter of the newly expanded city, a precursor of the huge concentration that settled in that area in subsequent years.

While some disappeared from the local scene either by moving elsewhere or by assimilation into American society, other Italians found opportunities in the growth of their own population. Instead of serving a broader public, as they had done in earlier years, Italians more often found one another and turned themselves into a centripetal direction. The earlier hacksters, statue vendors, street musicians, and rag dealers were first supplemented and then supplanted by retail merchants and shopkeepers. To meet the needs of more recent arrivals from their own homeland, they became macaroni manufacturers, grocers, wine importers, and tavernkeepers. Not all their business ventures succeeded; some resulted in bankruptcy and personal failure. In other instances, their efforts produced material success that could be consolidated and passed down within the same family from one generation to the next.

These business enterprises, usually small but sometimes quite formidable, served as a commercial anchor for the emerging Italian neighborhood. By means of the goods and services that they provided, these merchants made their area of the city more suitable for Italian immigrants. The same activities also established a neighborhood economy that generated opportunities for employment and income for the population. The visibility of these shops and stores, both for
power, the further acc power, the further acc have proceeded more ra have proceeded more ra factors emerged that int factors emerged that int

Nativism and N

The decade of the 1870s g the 1870s g

Rembrandt Peale in his Rembrandt Peale in his

g of going to Italy. Later going to Italy. Later

Philadelphia, and man Philadelphia, and man

From a trickle, within From a trickle, within veritable flood. As the veritable flood. As the

northern and central norther and central a arrivals, while no long arrivals, while no long

educated and less-skilled educated and less-skilled of earlier years.

of earlier years.

Beyond the extrinsic is virtually impossible of Italian immigrants, is virtually impossible of Italian immigrants,

escaped efforts of object escaped efforts of object not belong on any res not belong on any res

immigration, the eval immi immigration, the eval immi born became a serious born became a serious and the conclusions re and the conclusions re

with their new America with their new America

Italian immigrants arri Italian immigrants arri and her people seem the and her people seem the
toromantic and sentiment romantic and sentiment hostility. Italy was not by wealthy, privileged
t hostility. Italy was not by wealthy, privileged which ignorant and which ignorant and n

numbers each day.

What initially appe numbers each day.

What initially appe however, was perhaps
Immigrants in the
Lands of Promise

Italians in Buenos Aires and
New York City, 1870–1914

Samuel L. Baily

Cornell University Press
Ithaca and London

1997
The Adjustment of the Italians in Buenos Aires and New York City

the small number of successful and wealthy immigrants who established their control over the immigrant masses by providing some of the social and economic services their fellow countrymen needed (job placement, boarding houses, banks to send savings home, and so on) and felt they could not, at least initially, get elsewhere. The prominent, according to D’Azzo, generally had limited education and were conservative in social outlook and self-serving. One might argue that all elites are, at least to some extent self-serving, and those in Buenos Aires were no exception. However, the New York Italian elites were less educated and progressive in social outlook than those in Buenos Aires.

It is therefore not surprising that Progress reflected these attitudes of Barsotti and the prominent. It was, for example, generally, though not always, opposed to labor and social reforms. Barsotti was most concerned about his business interests and his own prestige and public image. Progress that might benefit the mass of working-class Italian immigrants threatened these things; he opposed them in his paper. Thus he could condemn the high child mortality rate and the white slavery trade in New York City, announce the meetings of Italian shoemakers, tailors, and bricklayers, and give sympathetic coverage to a tram strike, since these things did not conflict with his personal and business interests. But at the same time he opposed all efforts to reform labor recruitment and banking practices and spoke out against organizations created to protect immigrant workers from labor abuses.

A comparison of Barsotti with Basilio Cattaneo, founder and director of La Patria in Buenos Aires, helps clarify this point. Cattaneo was an experienced professional journalist committed to a number of social causes. La Patria consistently reflected his director’s commitment to serve the interests of the broader Italian community of Buenos Aires, including those of the working class. Barsotti, on the other hand, was a businessman involved in labor and recruitment and banking. He had little concern for the working class and the broader Italian community of New York. As a result of the difference between their views, the leading Italian-language newspapers in Buenos Aires and New York served their respective communities in distinct ways.

Italians in New York also organized mutual aid societies during this period—such as the Unione d’Italiani in 1858, followed by two in the 1860s; three in the 1870s; and at least several dozen more in the 1880s. Unfortunately, we know very little about the nature of these early societies and how they operated. Was the Unione d’Italiani, led by Italian republicans, or were businessmen and professionals as was the case with the Unione di Benevolentia? What was the occupational and social composition of the membership? Were these a monarchical or republican organization? And if the latter, did they deal with the

| Table 49. New York City area Italian mutual aid societies |
|---------------------------------|-------|
| Name                | Year |
| Unione d’Italiani (NY)    | 1858 |
| Fine di Benevolentia (NY) | 1863 |
| Benevolentia (NY)        | 1867 |
| Opera di Mutuo Soccorso (NY) | 1873 |
| Leggenda di Fratelli (NY) | 1877 |
| Unione d’Italiani di Fratelli | 1877 |
| Fratelli (NY)            | 1877 |
| Mazza (NY)              | 1877 |
| Italiano di Guardia (NY) | 1888 |
| Cattaneo (NY)           | 1888 |
| Società di Benevolentia (NY) | 1888 |
| Italiano d’Emigrati (NY) | 1888 |
| Cadorna (NY)            | 1888 |
| Italia (NY)             | 1888 |

The key to understanding the Italian community in New York is to understand its history and culture. The Italian community in New York was a complex and diverse one, with a variety of political, social, and economic interests. The Italian community was also divided along class lines, with the upper classes generally more interested in political and social reforms, while the working-class Italians were more concerned with immediate economic and social needs. The Italian community in New York was also divided along regional lines, with southern Italians more interested in political and social reforms, while northern Italians were more concerned with immediate economic and social needs. The Italian community in New York was also divided along religious lines, with Catholics generally more interested in political and social reforms, while Protestants were more concerned with immediate economic and social needs. The Italian community in New York was also divided along ethnic lines, with those of Italian descent generally more interested in political and social reforms, while those of other ethnic backgrounds were more concerned with immediate economic and social needs. The Italian community in New York was also divided along linguistic lines, with Italian-speakers generally more interested in political and social reforms, while English-speakers were more concerned with immediate economic and social needs.

Nevertheless, the information in published in the Italian-language press about the mutual aid societies' comparison with the mutual association's relative size of the Italian community and their mission to provide mutual aid to each other in times of need is limited. It was not until the late 19th century that the Italian community began to organize mutual aid societies in New York. These societies were primarily focused on providing financial aid to members in times of need, and they were generally run by Italian republicans who were interested in political and social reforms. The Italian community in New York was also divided along regional lines, with southern Italians more interested in political and social reforms, while northern Italians were more concerned with immediate economic and social needs. The Italian community in New York was also divided along religious lines, with Catholics generally more interested in political and social reforms, while Protestants were more concerned with immediate economic and social needs. The Italian community in New York was also divided along ethnic lines, with those of Italian descent generally more interested in political and social reforms, while those of other ethnic backgrounds were more concerned with immediate economic and social needs. The Italian community in New York was also divided along linguistic lines, with Italian-speakers generally more interested in political and social reforms, while English-speakers were more concerned with immediate economic and social needs.
unemployment benefits, social activities, and patriotic celebrations. Half of the societies were based on town or region of origin in Italy. The others were open to all Italian males. 5

Undoubtedly the political struggles between the republicans and the monarchists that were so evident in Buenos Aires existed to some extent in the Italian community of New York, but there is little information to document the precise nature of this conflict or its ebb and flow within the mutualist movement. The names of some of the societies—Legione Garibaldiana, Mazzini, Vittorio Emanuele—indicate the importance of Italian political issues to at least some; yet there is no available evidence of the fraternal fighting that took place within the Unione Beneficenza of Buenos Aires in the 1890s. If there were political tensions within the mutualist movement, they did not prevent the various societies from cooperating to celebrate Italian holidays, to coordinate protest movements, and to form a loose regional confederation—the Società Italiana Unita, with members in New York, Brooklyn, Hoboken, and Newark—to plan these occasions.

Rather, the divisions within the mutualist movement seemed to have been based more on personal rivalries among the prominenti, who used their positions of leadership within the societies to further their own business and personal interests. As Table 20 indicates, for example, Louis V. Fugazy—a leading immigrant banker, labor contractor, and notary public—was active in the creation and operation of a number of the early mutual aid societies, and this involvement expanded over the years. It is not hard to envision that membership in a Fugazy-dominated mutual aid society might well become the means for obtaining a job and various other services through Fugazy’s banks and agencies. Also, positions of leadership within these multi-class societies might well be used to control or minimize any threat by organized workers to the business interests of the prominenti. Other prominenti were active in the mutualist movement as well, and the competition among them for control of the societies inevitably led to conflict.

During the 1880s, when the Italian community grew from twelve thousand to forty thousand, the ethnic institutional structure expanded as well. Italian immigrants, increasingly from the South, created dozens of small village- or local-area-based mutual aid societies, and some of the older societies took new initiatives to help the immigrants. As in the 1870s, however, the prominenti were involved in the establishment and operation of many of these new societies, apparently using the organizations for their own purposes, and fought among themselves.

In 1882, for example, a few of the older societies established the Società Italiana di Beneficenza (Italian Beneficenza Society) to help the new arrivals and less fortunate members of the Italian community. Fugazy was elected president of the new society. The Italian consul in New York, Gian Paolo Riva—alarmed by the poor and destitute masses of Italians in New York—called on the intellectual response of the Beneficenza Home Society. Riva needed help to run however, and turned to Barsotti, Felice vanoni, and other prominenti not Beneficenza Society. The money was tap small hospital, relief and immigration in January 1891. The Italian Home Society—the Italian community and created a center for the needs of the increasing

A more successful initiative among the ethnic community during this period was the Italian Chamber of Commerce. At this number of commerce succeeded by the end major of the Italian businessmen in New York City.

Many Italians in New York did not found the pre-mass migration era, but those who did continued their activity to the present. Unlike those in Buenos Aires, have their own special ways of participating in the Catholic Church and organized labor. The Catholic Church in New York is composed of a large number of Italian businessmen in New York City.