

**THE MINUTES OF THE 689<sup>TH</sup> STATED MEETING OF THE  
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**FRIDAY, 10 JANUARY 2020  
ROOM 18-029, 1515 ARCH STREET  
ROBERT THOMAS, CHAIR**

**CALL TO ORDER**

**START TIME IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:00:00**

Mr. Thomas, the chair, called the meeting to order at 9:04 a.m. and announced the presence of a quorum. The following Commissioners joined him:

<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Present</b>	<b>Absent</b>	<b>Comment</b>
Robert Thomas, AIA, Chair	X		
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., Committee on Historic Designation Chair	X		
Kelly Edwards, MUP	X		
Steven Hartner (Department of Public Property)		X	
Josh Lippert (Department of Licenses & Inspections)	X		
Melissa Long (Division of Housing & Community Development)		X	
John Mattioni, Esq.	X		Arrived 9:17 am
Dan McCoubrey, AIA, LEED AP BD+C, Architectural Committee Chair	X		
Jessica Sánchez, Esq. (City Council President)		X	
H. Ahada Stanford, Ph.D. (Commerce Department)	X		
Meredith Trego (Department of Planning & Development)	X		
Betty Turner, MA, Vice Chair	X		
Kimberly Washington, Esq.	X		

The following staff members were present:

- Jonathan E. Farnham, Ph.D., Executive Director
- Randal Baron, Historic Preservation Planner III
- Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Shannon Garrison, Historic Preservation Planner I
- Meredith Keller, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Leonard Reuter, Esq., Law Department
- Megan Cross Schmitt, Historic Preservation Planner II

The following persons were present:

- Charles Kerr, Cadre Design
- Patrick Boyle, Spring Garden Civic Association
- Allen Rubin, Spring Garden Civic Association
- Justino Navarro, Spring Garden Civic Association
- Gwen McCauley, Manayunk Development Corporation

Lisa Lamprou, Manayunk Development Corporation  
Bill O'Brien  
Scott Denlinger, Wisler Pearlstine  
Paul Steinke, Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia  
Patrick Grossi, Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia  
Jim Cassidy, C2 Architecture  
Celeste Morello  
Steven Peitzman, East Falls Historical Society  
Nick Kraus, Heritage Consulting  
Michael Fulforth, ABC Sign Systems LLC  
Joe Gaglioti, Joseph Anthony Spa  
Karen Pelzer, Loews Hotel  
Danny Smith, Loews Hotel  
Nancy Pontone  
Gabriel Deck, Gnome Architects  
David S. Traub, Save Our Sites  
Kevin Block  
Jessica Senker  
Brian Donlen  
Jon Ratana  
George Poulin, University City Historical Society

**ADOPTION OF MINUTES, 688<sup>TH</sup> STATED MEETING, 13 DECEMBER 2019**

**START TIME IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 00:01:10

**DISCUSSION:**

- Mr. Thomas asked the Commissioners for any additions or corrections to the minutes of the preceding meeting, the 688<sup>th</sup> Stated Meeting, held 13 December 2019. Mr. Farnham requested revisions to the minute for 1734-54 W. Thompson Street.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None

**ACTION:** Ms. Turner moved to approve the minutes of the 688<sup>th</sup> Stated Meeting of the Philadelphia Historical Commission, held 13 December 2019, with the suggested revisions. Ms. Trego seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: Adoption of Minutes, 688<sup>th</sup> Stated Meeting</b>					
<b>MOTION: Approval</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Turner</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Trego</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni					X
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	9				4

## **CONTINUANCE REQUESTS**

### **JEWELERS' ROW HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Proposed Action: Designation

Nominator: Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the Jewelers' Row Historic District and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The proposed district is located on Sansom Street primarily between S. 7<sup>th</sup> and S. 8<sup>th</sup> Street, and along a portion of S. 8<sup>th</sup> Street between Chestnut and Walnut Streets. The nomination contends that the proposed district, which is composed of 57 buildings constructed between 1800 and 2015, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, E, G, H and J.

Under Criteria A and J, the nomination states that as the site of Carstairs Row, Printers' Row, and Jewelers' Row, the district has significant character, interest and value as part of the development, heritage, and cultural characteristics of Philadelphia and exemplifies the community's cultural, economic, and historical heritage. In support of Criteria C and D, the nomination asserts that the architectural resources of Jewelers' Row span more than two hundred years and include significant examples of multiple building types and architectural styles important to Philadelphia's history, including (but not limited to) Federal rowhouses, Victorian and early 20<sup>th</sup>-century commercial lofts, and Depression-era and postwar commercial fronts. The district includes surviving works by a number of architects whose careers have significantly influenced the architectural development of the City, including Thomas Carstairs, Collins & Autenrieth, Theophilus P. Chandler, Frank T. Watson, Louis Magaziner, and possibly even Frank Furness, supporting an argument for Criterion E. Furthermore, under Criteria H and G, the nomination contends that owing to its unique location along a block of Sansom Street offset from Center City's otherwise regular grid and distinguished by an iconic and distinctive streetscape, the district represents an established and familiar visual feature of Philadelphia and constitutes a distinctive area which should be preserved according to an historic, cultural and architectural motif.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the Jewelers' Row Historic District satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, D, E, G, H and J. The staff proposes updating 113-15 S. 8<sup>th</sup> Street as a non-contributing addition to 731 Sansom Street. The staff also proposes that all buildings be categorized as Significant, Contributing or Non-Contributing without separate determinations for façades and storefronts.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of the Jewelers' Row Historic District and remand it to the February 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

**ACTION:** See below.

**ADDRESS: 1810 CHESTNUT ST**

Name of Resource: Samuel T. Freeman & Co. Auction House  
Proposed Action: Designation  
Property Owner: The Business Known As "C"  
Nominator: Staff of the Historical Commission  
Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, meredith.keller@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1810 Chestnut Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criterion for Designation D. Under Criterion D, the nomination argues that architectural firm Tilden & Register designed the Samuel T. Freeman & Co. Auction House in 1923-24 in Renaissance Revival style; the building's style offered a sense of distinction and grandeur to a company with a legacy of auctioning the exclusive collections of Philadelphia's elite.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1810 Chestnut Street satisfies Criterion for Designation D.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of 1810 Chestnut Street and remand it to the January 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

**ACTION:** See below.

**ADDRESS: 1045-49 SARAH ST**

Name of Resource: Otis Elevator Company Boiler and Engine House  
Proposed Action: Designation  
Property Owner: Antal Group Inc.  
Nominator: The Keeping Society of Philadelphia  
Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1045-29 Sarah Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the former boiler and engine house of the Otis Elevator Company, built in 1904, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, G, and J. Under Criteria A and J, the nomination argues that the property is significant in the development of Fishtown/Kensington as part of the Morse Elevator Works and the Otis Elevator Company. Under Criterion C, the nomination contends that the building is representative of industrial power plant design of the early twentieth century. Under Criterion G, the nomination argues that the building is part of the earliest, extent, coherent industrial complexes in Fishtown, but does not propose to designate the complex as a district. Many of the other properties associated with the former Morse and Otis Elevator Companies were individually designated in 2015 and 2016.

The Committee on Historic Designation reviewed this nomination on March 12<sup>th</sup> and recommended that the property satisfies Criteria D and J. The owner, who did not attend the Committee's review, requested that the Historical Commission remand the nomination to the Committee to provide him with an opportunity to participate in the review. The Commission granted the request, sending the nomination back to the Committee.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of 1045-49

Sarah Street and remand it to the February 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

**ACTION:** See below.

**ADDRESS: 1617 WALNUT ST**

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Rosenberg Family Partners

Nominator: Staff of the Historical Commission

Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, meredith.keller@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1617 Walnut Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criterion for Designation D. Under Criterion D, the nomination argues that the Seeburger & Rabenold-designed building conveys the aesthetics of the Italian Renaissance Revival style through its classical temple form, verticality, and classical detailing.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1617 Walnut Street satisfies Criterion for Designation D.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of 1617 Walnut Street and remand it to the March 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

**ACTION:** See below

**ADDRESS: 315 AND 317 N 33RD ST**

Name of Resource: Marot-McIlvain Residence

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Caroline Millett

Nominator: Benjamin Leech, University City Historical Society

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 315 and 317 N. 33<sup>rd</sup> Street, located in West Philadelphia's Powelton Village, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The three-story residential twin, the former Marot-McIlvain Residence, was constructed circa 1860 in the Italianate Villa Style. The nomination states that the property meets Criteria C and D for its distinct architectural form and style, and also represents the least altered Italianate Villa style building with a central tower in the Powelton neighborhood. The nomination further contends that the property meets Criterion J, for its close association with the Marot and McIlvain families, two of Powelton Village's historically notable families.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 315 and 317 N. 33<sup>rd</sup> Street satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and J.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of 315 and 317 N. 33<sup>rd</sup> Street and remand it to the January 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

**ACTION:** See below.

**ADDRESS: 5250 UNRUH AVE**

Name of Resource: Tacony Worsted Mills

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: 5250 Unruh Avenue Assoc.

Nominator: Alexander Balloon, Tacony Community Development Corp.

Staff Contact: Megan Cross Schmitt, [megan.schmitt@phila.gov](mailto:megan.schmitt@phila.gov), 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 5250 Unruh Avenue and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J. Under Criterion E, the nomination argues that the Tacony Worsted Mills is an early and intact example of an industrial complex designed by Walter Harvey Geissinger, a prolific architect who designed several commercial and industrial buildings throughout Philadelphia. Under Criterion J, the nomination contends that the Tacony Worsted Mills was considered locally and nationally to be one of the finest and largest worsted yarn mills of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 5250 Unruh Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 5250 Unruh Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J.

**ACTION:** See below.

**ADDRESS: 1533-39 N 7TH ST**

Name of Resource: Trinity Reformed Church

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: 99 Real Estate LLC

Nominator: The Keeping Society of Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, [meredith.keller@phila.gov](mailto:meredith.keller@phila.gov), 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1533-39 N 7<sup>th</sup> Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the former Trinity Reformed Church satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J. Under Criterion D, the nomination argues that the church exemplifies the “inexpensive, but expressive” form of Gothic ecclesiastical architecture. Under Criterion E, the nomination contends that the church was designed by influential Philadelphia architect Samuel Sloan, who included an illustration of the building in his 1868 publication of *The Architectural Review and American Builders’ Journal*. The nomination further argues that the modest but expressive design reflects the cultural, economic, and social heritage of Philadelphia’s working-to-middle-class residents.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1533-39 N 7<sup>th</sup> Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that 1533-39 N. 7<sup>th</sup> Street

satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J, and that the property should be designated as historic and listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places.

**START TIME IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 00:03:00

**REASON FOR REQUEST:** The property owners of Jewelers' Row Historic District, 1810 Chestnut Street, 1045-49 Sarah Street, 1617 Walnut Street, 315 and 317 N. 33<sup>rd</sup> Street, 5250 Unruh Avenue, and 1533-39 N. 7<sup>th</sup> Street have requested that the Historical Commission continue the reviews of their nominations to provide additional time to evaluate the nominations and the implications of designation.

**PRESENTERS:** None.

**DISCUSSION:** None.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved to continue the reviews of the following nominations as noted:

- Jewelers' Row Historic District to the 19 February 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation;
  - 1810 Chestnut Street to the 17 June 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation;
  - 1045-49 Sarah Street to the 19 February 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation;
  - 1617 Walnut Street to the 18 March 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation;
  - 315 and 317 N. 33<sup>rd</sup> Street to the 18 March 2020 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation;
  - 5250 Unruh Avenue to the 8 May 2020 meeting of the Historical Commission; and,
  - 1533-39 N. 7<sup>th</sup> Street to the 9 April 2020 meeting of the Historical Commission.
- Ms. Edwards seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.



<b>ITEM: Continuance of reviews of nominations</b>					
<b>MOTION: Approval</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Edwards</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni					X
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	9				4

**THE REPORT OF THE ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE, 17 DECEMBER 2019**

Dan McCoubrey, Chair

**CONSENT AGENDA**

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:04:56**

**DISCUSSION:**

- Mr. Thomas asked the Commissioners for comments on the Consent Agenda.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**ACTION:** Mr. McCoubrey moved to adopt the recommendations of the Architectural Committee for the application for 106-8 and 110 Grape Street. Ms. Trego seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: CONSENT AGENDA</b>					
<b>MOTION: Adopt the Consent Agenda</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: McCoubrey</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Trego</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni					X
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	9				4

**AGENDA**

**ADDRESS: 106-8 AND 110 GRAPE ST**

Proposal: Construct four-story building

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Daniel Neducsin

Applicant: Daniel Flesher, Cadre Design

History: Buildings on site approved for demolition

Individual Designation: None

District Designation: Main Street Manayunk Historic District, Contributing, 12/14/1983

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**BACKGROUND:**

This application proposes to construct a four-story mixed-use building on what will be a vacant lot. The Historical Commission approved the demolition of the existing buildings on the site at its 8 November 2019 meeting, owing to a finding of financial hardship. The new building will house the headquarters of the Manayunk Development Corporation, in addition to offering retail space on the first floor, office space on the second and third floors, and a community meeting space on the set-back fourth floor. The design of the proposed building draws from the nearby industrial-style buildings of Manayunk and uses red brick as the primary façade material in addition to a schist veneer base and elevator enclosure.

**SCOPE OF WORK**

- Construct four-story mixed-use building.

**STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:**

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the*

*property. The new works shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

- The proposed building is differentiated from the old and is compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing of the Main Street Manayunk historic district.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Approval, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standard 9.

**ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:** The Architectural Committee voted to recommend approval, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standard 9, with the following comments:

- The materials should be simplified;
- The staff should review a mockup of the schist and cast stone systems;
- The siding should be a horizontally-oriented panelized metal system;
- The condensing units should be shown on a roof plan and should not be visible from the public right-of-way; and,
- The storm-water drainage system should be internal in lieu of external.

**ACTION:** See Consent Agenda.

**ADDRESS: 340 S 4TH ST**

Proposal: Create new openings; alter existing openings

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Colin and Katie Wetherill

Applicant: Jim Cassidy, C2 Architecture

History: 1805

Individual Designation: 4/30/1957

District Designation: Society Hill Historic District, Significant, 3/10/1999

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**BACKGROUND:**

This application proposes creating new openings and altering existing openings at the building at 340 S. 4<sup>th</sup> Street. It also proposes stuccoing a brick garden wall. The openings proposed for alteration are not be conspicuously visible from the public right-of-way.

**SCOPE OF WORK**

- Add two new windows to the first-floor rear west elevation.
- Expand existing first floor opening on south elevation.
- Alter sill heights of two existing rear windows on north elevation.
- Stucco brick wall in driveway area.

**STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 2: The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

- The south elevation was originally a party wall. The enlarged opening on the south elevation is behind brick wall in parking area and is not visible from the public-right-of-way.
- *Standard 3: Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*
  - The infill brick should be recessed slightly to reveal the alteration where the sill heights are being changed. This will visually communicate the change to this area of the building.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Approval, provided the brick is slightly recessed in areas where sill height is altered and brick wall in driveway is not stuccoed, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standards 2 and 3.

**ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:** The Architectural Committee voted to recommend approval of the door with sidelights and new window openings on the west elevation, provided the window locations align with existing door; and denial of raising the sills on the north elevation, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standards 2 and 3.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 00:06:12

**PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Mehley presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Architect Jim Cassidy represented the application.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

The Historical Commission found that:

- The first-floor windows on the north elevation are a distinctive feature of the historic rear ell and proposed interior changes could be designed in a manner that does not require alteration of the historic window openings and sills.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- Expanding first-floor opening with a new door and sidelights on the south elevation meets Standards 2 and 3.
- Adding two new windows to first-floor opening on the west elevation meets Standard 2 and 3.
- Altering sill heights of two existing, first-floor rear windows on north elevation does not meet Standard 2.

**ACTION:** Mr. McCoubrey moved to approve the door with sidelights on south elevation and new window openings on the west elevation, provided the window locations align with existing door; and deny raising the sills on the north elevation, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standards 2 and 3. Ms. Turner seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

**ITEM: 340 S 4<sup>th</sup> Street**  
**MOTION: Approval of most elements with conditions, but denial of raising the sills**  
**MOVED BY: McCoubrey**  
**SECONDED BY: Turner**

<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni					X
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	9				4

**ADDRESS: 1200 MARKET ST**

Proposal: Install signage

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Twelfth Street Hotel Associates, LP (Danny Smith, representative)

Applicant: Cindy Hamilton, Heritage Consulting Group

History: 1932; PSFS Building; George Howe & William Lescaze, architects

Individual Designation: 1/30/1968

District Designation: None

Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, meredith.keller@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**BACKGROUND:**

Designed by architects George Howe and William Lescaze in 1932 for the Philadelphia Savings Fund Society, the building at 1200 Market Street was the first International-style skyscraper in the United States. Today, the PSFS building stands as a National Historic Landmark, noted for its progressive design and importance in American architectural history. From an architectural perspective, it is one of the most significant buildings in the city and is known worldwide.

Since designating the building in 1968, the Historical Commission has approved minimal signage for the tenant spaces, and signage has been largely limited to the Market Street façade. The application notes that the storefronts were reconstructed during the 2000 rehabilitation for the Loews Hotel and, at that time, the fascia where the signage is proposed was replaced. The application furthers notes that the hotel cannot accommodate additional tenants beyond the current restaurant and spa.

The previous application presented two options for signage at the 12<sup>th</sup> Street ground-story fascia for a fifth-floor tenant. Option A included halo-lit letters individually attached to the fascia, and Option B included halo-lit letters attached to a backer box, which would then be attached to the fascia.

The application has been revised and presents two new options. Option 1 is similar to the options reviewed by the Committee, in which the halo-lit letters would be attached to a backer box and installed in the same location as previously proposed; however, the backer box would have a depth of 1-inch rather than 2-inches. Option 2 includes halo-lit letters attached to a 1-inch backer box but moves the sign off the jog of the fascia.

**SCOPE OF WORK:**

- Install signage at 12<sup>th</sup> Street elevation.

**STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
  - This application offers two options for signage at the ground-story of the 12<sup>th</sup> Street elevation. The proposed signage would be placed in the approximate location of the former Lerner signage. The staff finds that the individually attached letters, which are similar to other signage on the building, are more appropriate. The staff contends that while the backer box would require fewer penetrations into the fascia, the projection off the fascia would be less appropriate. The proposed signage under Option A complies with this standard.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Approval of Option A, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standard 9.

**ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:** The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial, pursuant to Standard 9.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 00:08:55

**PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Keller presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Preservation consultant Nick Kraus, signage consultant Michael Fulforth, business owner Joe Gaglioti, and Loews hotel representatives Karen Pelzer and Danny Smith represented the application.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

The Historical Commission found that:

- The application proposes two options that would include the attachment of halo-lit letters to a one-inch backer box that would then attach to the fascia of the storefront near the corner of 12<sup>th</sup> and Market Streets.
- The storefront historically contained various signage within the sign band, as evidenced by historic photographs.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The applicant’s preferred location for the signage, on the fascia that was originally intended to function as a sign band, satisfies Standard 9.
- Attaching the letters to a backer box would minimize the number of penetrations into the fascia, further satisfying Standard 9.
- The color of the signage should be black to be consistent with other storefront signage.
- The face of the backer box should be stainless steel rather than aluminum to reflect the material of the fascia.

**ACTION:** Mr. McCoubrey moved to approve the application with Option 1, with a one-inch-deep backer box in stainless steel and with all lettering in black. Ms. Stanford seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: 1200 Market St</b>					
<b>MOTION: Approval of Option 1 with conditions</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: McCoubrey</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Stanford</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

**ADDRESS: 530 N 19TH ST**

Proposal: Renovate building; construct roof deck with pilot house

Review Requested: Final Approval

Owner: Benjamin A. Horst and Denny R. Kwak

Applicant: Gabriel Deck, Gnome Architects LLC

History: 1859

Individual Designation: None

District Designation: Spring Garden Historic District, Contributing, 10/11/2000

Staff Contact: Randal Baron, randal.baron@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**BACKGROUND:**

This application proposes to add a roof deck and pilot house on top of the main block of this twin house. Because the adjacent house is set back from the street, this deck and pilohouse may be visible from the public right-of-way. A site visit may be useful to document visibility. The deck and pilot house may need to be redesigned to be inconspicuous from the street.

The application proposes to modify the basement windows and cellar well. The basement windows and well have already been modified. The modification to the cellar may be appropriate because the building base has already been modified and an egress well exists.

The application also proposes installing new doors and aluminum-clad windows but does not include sufficient details for review. The existing six-over-six windows were installed without a permit in 2017. The proposed windows and doors would meet Standard 6 if they are wood with ogee molding. The staff should review the details.

The applicant proposes to clad the rear wall in siding; it is currently stucco. The rear wall is visible from the street and the replacement of stucco with siding is not appropriate for a masonry building. Perhaps a panelized system would be appropriate.

**SCOPE OF WORK:**

- Install roof deck and pilot house, new door, windows, modify window well, clad rear

**STANDARDS FOR REVIEW:**

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and Guidelines include:

- *Standard 6: Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*
  - The windows, door, and door frame should match the historic elements in design and materials with staff to review details.
  - The cladding of the visible rear wall does not comply with this standard both in material and design.
- *Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
  - The proposed deck and pilothouse does not comply with this Standard. However, it could perhaps be modified to meet the Standard if it could be reduced to be inconspicuous.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Approval of the door and windows in wood; approval of the roof deck and pilot house if a mock up shows that they are inconspicuous from the street; denial of the rear cladding; with the staff to review details; pursuant to Standard 6 and 9.

**ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION:** The Architectural Committee voted to recommend denial as submitted but approval if the revisions outlined above are implemented, with the staff to review details, pursuant to Standards 6 and 9 and the Roofs Guideline.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 00:23:19

**PRESENTERS:**

- Mr. Baron presented the application to the Historical Commission.
- Architect Gabriel Deck represented the application.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- Allen Rubin, a neighbor, opposed the application.



- Patrick Boyle, the president of the Spring Garden Civic Association, opposed the application based on the high level of visibility of the deck and pilot house.
- Justino Navarro of the Spring Garden Community Development Corporation opposed the application based on the high level of visibility of the deck and pilot house.

**HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

The Historical Commission found that:

- The deck and pilothouse would be conspicuous from the public right-of-way.
- The window and door designs should be revised with assistance from the staff.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The deck and pilothouse do not satisfy Standard 9 and the Roofs Guideline.
- If revised appropriately, the window and door designs would satisfy Standard 6.
- The stucco would satisfy Standard 9, provided the staff that the color and texture are appropriate.

**ACTION:** Mr. McCoubrey moved to approve most elements of the revised application, but deny the deck, pilot house, and deck railing, with the staff to review details; pursuant to Standard 6 and 9.

<b>ITEM: 530 N 19<sup>th</sup> Street</b>					
<b>MOTION: Approval of most elements as revised, but denial deck and pilot house</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: McCoubrey</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

## **THE REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION, 5 DECEMBER 2019**

Emily Cooperman, Chair

### **ADDRESS: 2527-37 N BROAD ST**

Name of Resource: The E.A. Wright Bank Note Company

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: 2509 N Broad Street Assoc.

Nominator: The Keeping Society of Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 2527-37 N. Broad Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Built in 1913, the former E.A. Wright Bank Note Company building is a six-story, reinforced-concrete factory building with a stylized facade on North Broad Street. Under Criterion D and E, the nomination contends that the subject building was constructed during the formative phase of reinforced-concrete construction and was completed by William Steele & Sons Company during a period of great success for the firm. The nomination asserts that the E.A. Wright Bank Note Company building exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, and historical heritage of the printing and engraving industry in Philadelphia, specifically, the manufacture of bank notes, stock certificates, and diplomas, satisfying Criterion J.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 2527-37 N. Broad Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 2527-37 N. Broad Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 00:43:00

#### **PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Mehley presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- No one represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- Paul Steinke, Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia, spoke in support of the nomination.

#### **HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

The Historical Commission found that:

- The one-story structure, currently used as a garage, directly south of the main building, should be considered non-contributing to the historic property.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The building was constructed during the formative phase of reinforced-concrete construction, satisfying Criterion D.
- The building was completed by William Steele & Sons Company during a period of great success for the firm, satisfying Criterion E.

- The building exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, and historical heritage of the printing and engraving industry in Philadelphia, specifically, the manufacture of bank notes, stock certificates, and diplomas, satisfying Criterion J.

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 2527-37 N. Broad Street satisfies Criteria D, E, and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, with the garage structure to the immediate south of the main building identified as non-contributing. Ms. Trego seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: 2527-37 N Broad Street</b>					
<b>MOTION: : Designate, Criteria D, E, and J</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Trego</b>					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

**ADDRESS: 4017-21 CHESTNUT ST**

Name of Resource: New Tabernacle Baptist Church

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: West Park Church of Deliverance Association Inc.

Nominator: Arielle Harris, University City Historical Society

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 4017-21 Chestnut Street in the University City neighborhood of West Philadelphia, formerly known as New Tabernacle Baptist Church, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that New Tabernacle Baptist Church satisfies Criteria A and J by exemplifying not only what became a common practice of merging Baptist congregations in nineteenth-century Philadelphia but also the migration of Philadelphians to West Philadelphia in the mid to late nineteenth century. The nomination asserts that the New Tabernacle Baptist Church satisfies Criteria D and E as an important example of Gothic Revival architecture, designed by noted church architect and native Philadelphian Frank Rushmore Watson. In addition, the nomination argues that the church has continuously occupied this parcel along Chestnut Street since 1860, thereby satisfying Criterion H as a recognizable visual feature of its local community and City of Philadelphia.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4017-21 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, D, E, H, and J.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4017-21 Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, H, and J, but does not satisfy Criterion A.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 00:46:55

**PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Mehley presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- No one represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The nomination did not demonstrate that the property satisfies Criterion for Designation A.
- The church building exemplifies a common practice of merging Baptist congregations in nineteenth-century Philadelphia as well as the migration of Philadelphians to West Philadelphia in the mid to late nineteenth century, satisfying Criterion J.
- The church is an important example of Gothic Revival architecture, designed by noted church architect and native Philadelphian Frank Rushmore Watson, satisfying D and E.
- The church has continuously occupied the same parcel along Chestnut Street since 1860 and is a recognizable visual feature of its local community and City of Philadelphia, satisfying Criterion H.

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 4017-21 N. Chestnut Street satisfies Criteria D, E, H, and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Trego seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

**ITEM: 4017-21 Chestnut Street**  
**MOTION: : Designate, Criteria D, E, H, and J**  
**MOVED BY: Cooperman**  
**SECONDED BY: Turner**

<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

**ADDRESS: 4501, 4503, 4505, AND 4507 SPRUCE ST**

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owners: Bryce and Samantha McNamee (4501); Jessica Senker and Brian Donlen (4503); Sadequa Dadabhoy (4505); Joseph Marchaman (4507)

Nominator: University City Historical Society

Staff Contact: Megan Cross Schmitt, [megan.schmitt@phila.gov](mailto:megan.schmitt@phila.gov), 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the properties at 4501, 4503, 4505, and 4507 Spruce Street and list them on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the buildings satisfy Criteria for Designation A, D, and E. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the properties are significant for their association with Charles Mosley Swain, a prominent Philadelphia businessman and the land owner who constructed the row of buildings to galvanize development in West Philadelphia. Under Criteria D and E, the nomination contends that the row of buildings were designed in the Tudor Revival style, with characteristic half-timber framing and steeply pitched roofs, by one of Philadelphia’s best known architects, Wilson Eyre.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nominations demonstrate that the properties at 4501, 4503, 4505, and 4507 Spruce Street satisfy Criteria for Designation A, D, and E.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the properties at 4501, 4503, 4505, and 4507 Spruce Street satisfy Criteria for Designation D, E and J, with a period of significance of 1885 to 1910.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:50:31**

**PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Schmitt presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- George Poulin of the University City Historical Society represented the nomination.
- Jessica Senker and Brian Donlen represented the property at 4503 Spruce Street. Both were in support of the nomination.
- John Ratana represented the property at 4505 Spruce Street. He was opposed to the nomination.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

- David S. Traub of Save Our Sites supported the nominations.
- Paul Steinke of the Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia supported the nominations.

**HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

The Historical Commission found that:

- The four houses under consideration were designed by architect Wilson Eyre and constructed on the north side of Spruce Street west of 45<sup>th</sup> Street in 1885.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The nomination substantiates that the subject properties are the extraordinary design of an extraordinary architect, Wilson Eyre, satisfying Criteria for Designation D and E.
- The nomination supports the claim that the subject properties are representative of the unique architectural personality of West Philadelphia and contribute to the character of the neighborhood, satisfying Criterion for Designation J.
- The nomination fails to support the claim that the buildings are significant for their association with the developer Charles Mosley Swain and therefore does not satisfy Criterion for Designation A.
- The period of significance should be defined as 1885 to 1910.

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates the property at 4501 Spruce Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, with a period of significance of 1885 to 1910. Ms. Turner seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: 4501 Spruce Street</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate, Criteria D, E, and J with Period of Significance change</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Turner</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates the property at 4503 Spruce Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, with a period of significance of 1885 to 1910. Ms. Trego seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: 4503 Spruce Street</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate, Criteria D, E, and J with Period of Significance change</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Trego</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates the property at 4505 Spruce Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, with a period of significance of 1885 to 1910. Mr. Lippert seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: 4505 Spruce Street</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate, Criteria D, E, and J with Period of Significance change</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Lippert</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates the property at 4507 Spruce Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D, E, and J, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, with a period of significance of 1885 to 1910. Ms. Washington seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.



<b>ITEM: 4507 Spruce Street</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate, Criteria D, E, and J with Period of Significance change</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Washington</b>					
VOTE					
Commissioner	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

**ADDRESS: 2100 S 21ST ST**

Name of Resource: St. Edmond of Abingdon Roman Catholic Church and Rectory

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Archdiocese of Philadelphia, St. Edmonds Church

Nominator: Celeste Morello

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** This nomination proposes to designate the property at 2100 S. 21<sup>st</sup> Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that St. Edmond’s Roman Catholic Church and Rectory satisfy Criteria for Designation D and E. Under Criterion D, the nomination contends that the church and rectory embody distinguishing characteristics of the Romanesque Revival and Italian Renaissance Revival styles of architecture. Under Criterion E, the nomination argues that the buildings, designed by George I. Lovatt, Sr. beginning in 1923, are the work of an architect whose designs have significantly influenced the historical and architectural development of the City, Commonwealth or Nation.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 2100 S. 21<sup>st</sup> Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D and E.

**COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION:** The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 2100 S. 21<sup>st</sup> Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D and E.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 01:17:10

**PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Chantry presented the nomination to the Historical Commission.
- Celeste Morello represented the nomination.

- No one represented the property owner.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- The church and rectory embody distinguishing characteristics of the Romanesque Revival and Italian Renaissance Revival styles of architecture, satisfying Criterion D.
- The buildings are the work of George I. Lovatt, Sr., an architect whose designs have significantly influenced the historical and architectural development of the City, Commonwealth or Nation, satisfying Criterion E.

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved to find that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 2100 S. 21<sup>st</sup> Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D and E, and to designate it as historic, listing it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Ms. Trego seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: 2100 S 21<sup>st</sup> Street</b>					
<b>MOTION: Designate, Criteria D and E</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Trego</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

**COMMENT ON NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS**

**ADDRESS: 173 W BERKS ST**

Name of Resource: Peter Woll & Sons Factory

Proposed Action: National Register Comment

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** The Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission (PHMC) has requested comments from the Philadelphia Historical Commission on the National Register nomination of 173 W. Berks Street, historically known as the Peter Woll & Sons Factory. PHMC is charged with implementing federal historic preservation regulations in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, including overseeing the National Register of Historic Places in the state. PHMC

reviews all such nominations before forwarding them to the National Park Service for action. As part of the process, PHMC must solicit comments on every National Register nomination from the appropriate local government. The Philadelphia Historical Commission speaks on behalf of the City of Philadelphia in historic preservation matters including the review of National Register nominations. Under federal regulation, the local government not only must provide comments, but must also provide a forum for public comment on nominations. Such a forum is provided during the Philadelphia Historical Commission's meetings.

The nomination contends that 173 W. Berks Street, located in the Kensington neighborhood of northeast Philadelphia, is significant under Criterion A in the Area of Industry. The building historically operated as a factory for Peter Woll & Sons, an important manufacturer of curled hair and feathers, a lesser known but key business associated with the textile and upholstery industry in Philadelphia during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The period of significance for this building extends from its construction in 1885 until 1939 when the company sold the building. The significance of 173 W. Berks Street should be evaluated within the historical context established by the Multiple Property Documentation Form, *Industrial and Commercial Buildings Related to the Textile Industry in the Kensington Neighborhood of Philadelphia*.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 01:21:20**

**PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Mehley presented the National Register nominations to the Historical Commission.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

The Historical Commission found that:

- The building has a memorable historic use.
- The property was designated to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places in April 2019.
- The nomination for 173 W. Berks Street, historically known as the Peter Woll & Sons Factory, meets Criterion A in the Area of Industry with the period of significance identified in the nomination.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- It supports the National Register nomination for 173 W. Berks Street.

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved support the nomination and concur with its assertion that the property at 173 W. Berks Street is significant under Criterion A in the Area of Industry with the period of significance identified in the nomination. Mr. McCoubrey seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: 173 W. Berks Street</b>					
<b>MOTION: Support National Register nomination</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: McCoubrey</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

**ADDRESS: 1100-1102 N DELAWARE AVE**

Name of Resource: Edward Corner Marine Merchandise Warehouse

Proposed Action: National Register Comment

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

**OVERVIEW:** The Pennsylvania Historical & Museum Commission (PHMC) has requested comments from the Philadelphia Historical Commission on the National Register nomination of 1100-1102 N. Delaware Avenue, historically known as the Edward Corner Marine Merchandise Warehouse. PHMC is charged with implementing federal historic preservation regulations in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania, including overseeing the National Register of Historic Places in the state. PHMC reviews all such nominations before forwarding them to the National Park Service for action. As part of the process, PHMC must solicit comments on every National Register nomination from the appropriate local government. The Philadelphia Historical Commission speaks on behalf of the City of Philadelphia in historic preservation matters including the review of National Register nominations. Under federal regulation, the local government not only must provide comments, but must also provide a forum for public comment on nominations. Such a forum is provided during the Philadelphia Historical Commission’s meetings.

The nomination states that 1100-1102 N. Delaware Avenue, located in close proximity to the Delaware River waterfront, is significant under Criterion A in the Area of Industry. During its operation as the Edward Corner Marine Merchandise Warehouse it served as a prominent supplier and warehouse of marine-related goods such as rope, canvas, anchors, chains, boat supplies and more. The building’s location close to the Port of Philadelphia, Delaware River, and local shipyards enabled its successful operation at this location for almost 40 years. This building stands as a reminder of Philadelphia’s once-thriving, maritime-related, industrial corridor in this area of the city. The period of significance begins at construction in 1921 and ends in 1960 when the Corner family sold the building.

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 01:24:25**

**PRESENTERS:**

- Ms. Mehley presented the National Register nominations to the Historical Commission.
- Mr. Reuter presented an update to the Commission on the building’s make-safe work, structural condition, and current construction.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None.

**HISTORICAL COMMISSION FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS:**

The Historical Commission found that:

- The nomination for 1100-1102 N. Delaware Avenue, historically known as the Edward Corner Marine Merchandise Warehouse, meets Criterion A in the Area of Industry with the period of significance identified in the nomination.

The Historical Commission concluded that:

- It supports the National Register nomination for 1100-1102 N. Delaware Avenue.

**ACTION:** Ms. Cooperman moved support the nomination and concur with its assertion that the property at 1100-02 N. Delaware Avenue is significant under Criterion A in the Area of Industry with the period of significance identified in the nomination. Mr. Mattioni seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: 1100-02 N. Delaware Avenue</b>					
<b>MOTION: Support Nation Register nomination</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Mattioni</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

## **ADJOURNMENT**

**START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING:** 01:30:40

**ACTION:** At 10:35 a.m., Mr. Mattioni moved to adjourn. Ms. Cooperman seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<b>ITEM: Adjournment</b>					
<b>MOTION: Adjourn</b>					
<b>MOVED BY: Mattioni</b>					
<b>SECONDED BY: Cooperman</b>					
<b>VOTE</b>					
<b>Commissioner</b>	<b>Yes</b>	<b>No</b>	<b>Abstain</b>	<b>Recuse</b>	<b>Absent</b>
Thomas, Chair	X				
Cooperman	X				
Edwards	X				
Hartner (DPP)					X
Lippert (L&I)	X				
Long (DHCD)					X
Mattioni	X				
McCoubrey	X				
Sánchez (Council)					X
Stanford (Commerce)	X				
Trego (DPD)	X				
Turner, Vice Chair	X				
Washington	X				
Total	10				3

### **PLEASE NOTE:**

- Minutes of the Philadelphia Historical Commission are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the audio recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.
- Application materials and staff overviews are available on the Historical Commission's website, [www.phila.gov/historical](http://www.phila.gov/historical).