**Nomination of Historic Building, Structure, Site, or Object**  
**Philadelphia Register of Historic Places**  
**Philadelphia Historical Commission**  
Submit all attached materials on paper and in electronic form (CD, email, flash drive). Electronic files must be Word or Word compatible.

### 1. Address of Historic Resource  
*(must comply with an Office of Property Assessment address)*
- **Street address:** 4507 Spruce Street
- **Postal code:** 19143

### 2. Name of Historic Resource
- **Historic Name:**
- **Current/Common Name:** 4507 Spruce Street

### 3. Type of Historic Resource
- ✔ Building
- ☐ Structure
- ☐ Site
- ☐ Object

### 4. Property Information
- **Condition:** ✔ excellent  ☐ good  ☐ fair  ☐ poor  ☐ ruins
- **Occupancy:** ✔ occupied  ☐ vacant  ☐ under construction  ☐ unknown
- **Current use:** residence

### 5. Boundary Description
*Please attach a narrative description and site/plot plan of the resource’s boundaries.*

### 6. Description
*Please attach a narrative description and photographs of the resource’s physical appearance, site, setting, and surroundings.*

### 7. Significance
*Please attach a narrative Statement of Significance citing the Criteria for Designation the resource satisfies.*
- **Period of Significance (from year to year):** from 1885 to 2019
- **Date(s) of construction and/or alteration:** 1885
- **Architect, engineer, and/or designer:** Wilson Eyre
- **Builder, contractor, and/or artisan:**
- **Original owner:** Charles Moseley Swain
- **Other significant persons:**
The historic resource satisfies the following criteria for designation (check all that apply):

- (a) Has significant character, interest or value as part of the development, heritage or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth or Nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past; or,
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or,
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style; or,
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen; or,
- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth or Nation; or,
- (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials or craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation; or,
- (g) Is part of or related to a square, park or other distinctive area which should be preserved according to an historic, cultural or architectural motif; or,
- (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community or City; or,
- (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or
- (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social or historical heritage of the community.

8. MAJOR BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES

Please attach a bibliography.

9. NOMINATOR

Organization: University City Historical Society

Name with Title: Jennifer Loustau, Vice-President

Street Address: 4528 Regent St.

City, State, and Postal Code: Philadelphia PA 19143

Nominator ☐ is ☑ is not the property owner.

PHC USE ONLY

Date of Receipt: 5/2/2019; revised 10/23/2019

Correct-Complete ☑ Incorrect-Incomplete ☐ Date: 11/4/2019

Date of Notice Issuance: 11/4/2019

Property Owner at Time of Notice:

Name: Joseph Marchaman

Address: 8055 165th Lane, NE

City: Redmond State: WA Postal Code: 98052

Date(s) Reviewed by the Committee on Historic Designation:

Date(s) Reviewed by the Historical Commission:

Date of Final Action: 12/7/18

☐ Designated ☐ Rejected
Overview

This nomination proposes to designate four houses on the northwest side of Spruce Street beginning at the corner of 45th Street in West Philadelphia. Each house is nominated separately but they are attached physically, and stylistically work as a unity. The arguments for Criteria A, D, and E are the same for all four buildings; thus, the significance of the buildings is presented as an ensemble. The nomination contends that the houses are examples of speculative housing built for future growth in the neighborhood by an important Philadelphia businessman, Charles Moseley Swain. He hired Wilson Eyre, an up-and-coming young architect, to design the houses in the Tudor style. Eyre later went on to produce some of the finest architecture in Philadelphia and the eastern United States during the late 19th century and early 20th century. Altogether the four houses exemplify the intention of the Philadelphia business community to provide quality middle class housing in a variety of pleasing styles for the burgeoning population of Philadelphia.
Boundary Description: 4507 Spruce Street

Current map, philageohistory.org.

The property known as OPA #461012800, Map Registry # 0215020132:

Situate on the north side of Spruce Street at the distance of 75 feet 4 ½ inches westward from the west side of 45th Street in the 46th Ward of the City of Philadelphia.

Containing in front or breadth on the said side of Spruce Street 24 feet 7 ½ inches and extending of that width in length or depth northward 120 feet.

(Document #48613790, Philadelphia Office of Property Assessment)
Architectural Description: 4507 Spruce Street

The view of 4507 Spruce Street is largely obstructed by a large tree that also obscures a second floor balcony. The balcony is original, described in the original insurance document of 1885 and shown in a postcard photograph of 1907. The end wall has been plastered over. All other details are intact and featured in other photographs.

The side walls and rear walls are of brick. The east side shown in the above picture has a bump-out surfaced in original slate shingles. The rear of the house (shown in the righthand picture) shows the slightly ell-shaped three-story house with the “laundry” addition. 4507 is freestanding, with an arch connecting it to 4505 on the east, and airspace between it and the next house on the west side.
Reproduction of a 1907 postcard from Skaler, West Philadelphia University City to 52nd Street, page 54. The fourth house from the right is 4507 Spruce St. and the second floor balcony with a railing can be seen.

The side walls and rear walls are of brick. The east side shown in the above left picture has a bump-out surfaced in original slate shingles. The rear of the house (shown in the righthand picture) shows the slightly ell-shaped three-story house with the “laundry” addition.
**Statement of Significance**

The four houses at 4501, 4503, 4505, and 4507 Spruce Street, two freestanding houses and one twin between them, were constructed at the same time at the behest of the owner, Charles Moseley Swain, in 1885. They are presented together for this reason and because they are joined by brick arches spanning the walkways between them. Designed by architect Wilson Eyre, they are examples of Eyre’s very early work in the late nineteenth century Tudor style and they exhibit all the features of a desirable suburban home—only a trolley ride away from Center City Philadelphia—in the 1880's.

When the four houses were built, they perched on the edge of the city. To the west there were nothing but farms and estates. Given that the four houses were built in 1885 and didn’t go on the public market until after Charles M. Swain’s death in 1904, it is fair to say the houses were built as an investment, most likely used as rental properties for twenty years, while the neighborhood filled in around them. Today they stand out as an unusual example of Tudor in a neighborhood of predominantly Queen Anne and Colonial Revival homes.

**Criterion A. Have significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or Nation, or be associated with the life of a person significant in the past**

The environment of West Philadelphia in the late 1880’s and 1890’s required the most up-to-date housing for the upper middle class and middle class, with a sensitivity to the picturesque atmosphere of the suburbs as well as the desire for distinctive architecture in a variety of popular styles.

**The Impact of the public trolley system in the development of West Philadelphia**

The history of West Philadelphia is inextricably tied with the streetcar, and later the elevated train, which connected the City’s western bank of the Schuylkill with the commercial center east of the Schuylkill. “From 1850-1930....the area evolved from a fashionable, upper class, country retreat to a middle class streetcar suburb, largely commissioned by speculative developers, designed by some of the city’s most prolific architects, and occupied by a rising class of industrial managers and other professionals.”

---

Incorporated 1857, it was the second street railway to be chartered in Philadelphia. Electric trolleys replaced horses on the tracks in the 1890’s.

The obstacle of having to cross the Schuylkill River ended early, in 1805, with the construction of the first permanent bridge at Market Street. Development had already begun – in 1804 – with William Hamilton’s “Hamiltonville,” a development carved out of his extensive land holdings on the west bank of the river. The area west to 41st Street were incorporated into the City of Philadelphia in 1854. By the 1860’s, horsecar lines ran throughout the area and across the bridges into Center City which spurred evermore development in West Philadelphia. In 1866 there were two horsecar depots in West Philadelphia, one at 49th and Woodland, and the other at 41-42 Streets and Chestnut Street. The availability of the trolley contributed greatly to the appeal of West Philadelphia as a residential neighborhood and drove subsequent development. As can be seen on the 1862 Smedley map, the areas contiguous to the trolley lines were developed pretty thoroughly. But the land between the lines which radiated out from the Market Street Bridge and the Chestnut Street Bridge was still undeveloped farmland, or rather “country estates.”

In the near future, during the 1890’s, the trolley lines would be added to Chester and Springfield Avenues. More middleclass housing followed in the area known as Squirrel Hill. (In 1907 the Market Street El was constructed, bringing the subway and the elevated line to 62nd street. Again, develop followed the transportation improvements.) But the wide swath of land between the northern and southern rail lines trailed behind in development.

“However, despite the mass speculative middle class housing that was being erected a number of Philadelphia’s families of wealth continued to choose West Philadelphia as the location for their estates….Charles M. Swain, the son of the founder of the Public Ledger, and a noted newspaper editor, built
his estate at the corner of 45th and Spruce Streets in 1875, presently the site of the University City Mews development.”2

Nonetheless, Charles M. Swain, living in that “country estate” swath, built townhouses across the street from his palatial home. Located on the southwest corner of 45th and Spruce, his home – a Second Empire mansion built in 1875 – occupied half the block. 3

Charles Moseley Swain, Prominent Philadelphia Businessman

Charles M. Swain was born in Philadelphia on July 7, 1849, the son of William M. Swain (1812-1868), a native of New York, and Sarah James (1812-1891), a native of Bristol, England. William Moseley Swain was the founder of The Philadelphia Public Ledger and another son, William James Swain, was founder and financier of the Philadelphia Record.

Charles M. Swain was educated in private schools and in Crittenden Commercial School and Saunders Institute in Philadelphia, and attended the law school of the University of Pennsylvania. In 1867 he entered the law offices of Samuel Hood, where he studied for four years, and was admitted to the Bar in 1871. Charles married Mary Dorothea Smedley (1848-1907) in 1870 and they had three children: Charles James Swain (1880-?), Ida Moseley Swain Steel (1871-1930), and Rosalie James Swain (1872-1877; she died at the age of 5). Charles was involved with a lot of business ventures in Philadelphia. His obituary in the Annual Report of the American Bar Association states:

“...In 1867 he entered the law offices of Samuel Hood, where he studied for four years, and was admitted to the Bar in 1871. He continued in the active practice of his profession until 1886, when he was elected president of the City Trust, Safe Deposit and Surety Company of Philadelphia, and thereafter gave his time and attention to the duties of this office until his death.

He was also actively identified with a number of other financial institutions and business enterprises. From 1877 to 1881 he was a director of the West Philadelphia Passenger Railway Company; in 1885 he became a director of the American Academy of Music; and in 1886 a director of the Franklin Fire Insurance Company. He was also a director of the Merchants’ National Bank of Philadelphia, and a director and for a time president of the Edison Electric Light Company, and a director of the Philadelphia Electric Company.” 4

He served as a member of the common council from 1896 until January 1, 1902, when he resigned because of ill-health and lack of time to perform conscientiously his duties as councilman. Although not in active practice for nearly twenty years, he kept up his acquaintance and friendship with his colleagues at the Bar, and was a member of the American Bar Association and of the Lawyers' Club. He was also a member of the Union League and of the Art Club. For years he was active in the Masonic fraternity, in which he held high office.

2 Ibid., page 6
“Mr. Swain will be remembered as a man of modest, retiring disposition, with a warm regard for his friends, all of whom held him in the highest esteem.” 5 When he died at the age of 55, he left an estate worth $1.8 million and no will; it could be assumed that the death was untimely and unforeseen. It took some time for estate matters to be resolved as can be seen from the sales of the Spruce Street properties. In addition, his wife Mary is referred in legal documents as “A Lunatic.”

Charles Moseley Swain, the Developer

In the early 1880’s, Swain could look out the window of his Italianate mansion and see to the north, west, and south nothing but open fields. To the east was a scattering of large estates with in-fill of middle-class housing. Off in the distance Mr. Swain knew that Philadelphia was growing, filling up the land between the Delaware and Schuylkill Rivers, and spreading west over the Schuylkill with residences, institutions, and commercial ventures. It was the age of growth for Philadelphia. Yet where his mansion stood, at 45th and Spruce, beyond the reach of the trolley lines, it was the dividing line between city and country.

The Swain mansion stood west of the estate of Clarence Clark who, recognizing the rapid growth of housing in the neighborhood, was setting aside a small parcel of his estate for a public park between 43rdl and 45th Streets. Radiating out from the Market Street Bridge, Baltimore Avenue to the south made a bee-line to Baltimore, MD. Trolley lines fanning out like a duckweb along Baltimore, Chester, and Woodlands Avenues had generated the densely-built suburb of Squirrel Hill. The area between Market Street (the main road to West Chester, PA) and Fairmont Park were filling in rapidly after the success of the Centennial Exhibit of 1876.

But in this gap between highways and public transportation the land was still largely rural. Dr. Twaddell to the south had his prize Jersey cows and his resident artist living in a studio in his bucolic fields. 6 A. J. Drexel (“the richest man in Pennsylvania”) to the west enjoyed country living. (He, along with Dr. Twaddell and his wife, served as judges for the Rose Tree Fox Hunting Club in the fall of 1884). 7 Beyond that Eli Price, a successful Quaker real estate lawyer, had extensive landholdings in West Philadelphia and was serving on a board for establishing public parks throughout the city. 8 But Mr. Swain looked out his window and saw the future: urban development.

______________________________

5 Ibid.


7 The Philadelphia Inquirer, 17 October 1884, page 1, Newspapers.com

8 The Times, 07 November 1877, page 3, Newspapers.com
“This rare c. 1900 photograph shows potato fields at 45th and Walnut Streets.” Note that this photograph was taken approximately one block north of the subject property, ten or fifteen years after their construction.

The 1895 map shows Mr. Swain’s mansion on a half block at 45th and Spruce, 4 houses on long, skinny plots across the street, and nothing much else in the immediate area. The 1910 map has Mr. Swain’s house still occupying the half block, though he himself had passed away in 1904, and the whole block across the street built out with long, skinny townhouses, about thirty of them. And still nothing much to the west besides open land. In 1907, to the north of Spruce, the subway and the El was built below and above Market Street, opening up huge swaths of land to development all the way to 69th Street. Apartment buildings were beginning to pop up in Spruce Hill (the Stonehurst Apartments, 1900, and the Sedgley Apartments, 1900) to the east and Squirrel Hill (the Castle Apartments, 1904) to the south. The Twaddells started developing lots in 1895 and the rest of the estate was sold around 1910. The Drexel estate sold to Siegel in 1920 who developed the community now known as Garden Court.

---


10 The Philadelphia Inquirer, 11 June 1895, page 5, Newspapers.com. H. G. Twaddell sold 6 dwellings, carved out of the family estate, on Cedar Avenue near 45th Street for $9,000.00 each.
Less than 2 miles away was the Market Street Bridge, the nexus for West Philadelphia and the city proper. Swain also participated in planning discussions for a new bridge to be constructed at Market Street, the discussions weighing the merits of a stone bridge at the cost of $1,250,000, or two steel bridges – one at Market and one at Walnut – at a cost of $750,000. 11

Since 1866 horsecars facilitated commuting from West Philadelphia to Center City on the east side of the Schuylkill, along Chestnut Street and stopping at 42nd Street. To the south another horsecar ran along Woodland Avenue to a depot at 49th Street.

The depot at 49th and Woodland, known as the Darby Depot, appears on the 1862 Smedley map of Philadelphia. The Philadelphia Traction Company appears on the 1895 Bromley map of Philadelphia in the same location.

From 1877 to 1881 Charles Swain served as a director of the West Philadelphia Passenger Railway Company along with his brother William J. Swain. On May 12, 1884, Stockholders of West Philadelphia Passenger Railway Company, which included Swain, ratified a lease of their road to the Philadelphia Traction Company for nine hundred and ninety-nine years, on a contract to pay each stockholder ten dollars per share annually, in half-yearly payments.12

New Directors of the Market Street Railway.

The stockholders of the West Philadelphia Passenger Railway Company held their annual meeting yesterday morning at 10 o’clock, at the company’s depot, Forty-first and Haverford streets, West Philadelphia. There was a full attendance both of holders of old stock and of over-issue. Samuel Baugh, John F. Gross, Wm. M. Wright, James Rhoads, William J. Swain, Charles M. Swain, Charles Lennig, William Dulles, Charles H. Godfrey, were elected directors for the ensuing year. Messrs. Lennig, Dulles and Godfrey represent the holders of the over-issued stock. The directors will meet this afternoon to elect officers.
4501-4507 Spruce Street
Philadelphia Traction Company Depot at 41st and Chestnut Streets
Chestnut Street horsecar line
Woodland Avenue horsecar line

Philadelphia Traction Company Depot at 49th and Woodland Avenue

1895 G. W. Bromley Philadelphia Atlas, philageohistory.org
Swain was instrumental in the development of West Philadelphia and his four-lot property at 45<sup>th</sup> and Spruce was built with future expansion into West Philadelphia in mind. Swain bought the 100-foot by 120-foot parcel on the northwest corner of 45<sup>th</sup> and Spruce from his neighbor, Sophia M. Brognard, for $9500 on October 27, 1884. (She acquired the property from her parents L. Ney and Mary B. Brognard 26 years earlier, in 1858.) He appears to have turned to an acquaintance of his, perhaps at one of the Charity Balls they both attended, the architect Wilson Eyre, his junior by nine years. (Swain would later hire Eyre to renovate his mansion in 1895.)

It was not unusual to hire an established architect to design speculative housing in West Philadelphia. To the contrary, it would appear from newspaper articles of the time that there was competitive pressure to produce the best possible design in the most fashionable styles for the West Philadelphia area.

As stated in the Philadelphia Inquirer, November 1895, “The character of the houses is of the highest grade. Some are built for and are occupied by the well-to-do class and others for the more moderately fixed as to finances. In all their fittings and furnishings, however, there is displayed that taste for which Philadelphia women are famous. Architecturally the “Colonial” predominate, but it is so varied and interspersed with the fanciful creations of the architect’s brains that the neighborhood is made beautiful through its dissimilar similarity, if such a term may be permissible.”

Swain hired Eyre to design four townhouses on long skinny lots. Eyre is listed as the architect in a construction notice in the November, 1885, publication Building with a construction cost of $24,000. Mr. Swain insured his four investment properties via his own Franklin Fire Insurance Company of Philadelphia. An original copy of the insurance document describes 4503, 4505, and 4507 in great detail and places an insurance value of $3000 on each residence.

Since the corner house is not documented by an insurance record, it can’t be determined what the value of 4501 was, but it can be deduced that at least half the total construction cost was spent on 4501. A look at the 1895 Philadelphia Atlas shows the townhouses eleven years later still sitting on the edge of farmland.

Charles Moseley Swain’s son, Charles James Swain, married and moved into the corner house at 4501 Spruce Street in 1902. Two years later, Charles Moseley Swain died.

In 1907 Charles James Swain sold 4501 Spruce to Isaac Hampshur Jones. 4503 and 4505 Spruce were sold to Elizabeth C. Sailer in 1906 from “the estate of Mary D. Swain, a Lunatic and Robert W. Steele and Ida M. his wife and Charles J. Swain and Elizabeth H. his wife.” Four days later Elizabeth Sailer sold one of the houses to Harry B. Nason. Prior to these transactions there are no records of sale of the four subject properties. It can be assumed that the properties were rented for the years 1885 to 1906.

---


Criterion D. Embody distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen

The subject properties are clear examples of the Tudor style.

Although Wilson Eyre is best known for his later work in the Shingle and English Country House styles -- styles that he is credited for promulgating in both America and Europe --, the four houses at 4501-4507 Spruce Street reflect his early work and are typical of the late 19th century taste for Tudor. Tudor was popular from roughly 1880 to the 1930’s, a transitional style that reflects the aesthetic shift from ornate Victorianism to ascetic Modernism. While historic references abound in Tudor, the emphasis is increasingly on materials, massing, and iconic form.

The popular name for the style is historically imprecise, since relatively few examples closely mimic the architectural characteristics of Tudor (early 16th century) England. Instead, the style is loosely based on a variety of late Medieval English prototypes, ranging from thatch-roofed cottages to grand manor houses. These traditions are freely mixed in their American Eclectic expressions but are united by an emphasis on steeply pitched, front-facing gables which, although absent on many English prototypes, are almost universally present as a dominant façade element in Tudor houses.  

Typical characteristics of Tudor include the following: asymmetrical facades; front-facing gable, often with half-timbering; stucco, brick, and stone veneering; parapeted gables; decorative half-timbering; elaborate chimneys; round or arched doorways; groupings of three windows; cantilevered elements such as oriel windows; and castellation or battlements.  

The subject Spruce Street houses exhibit front gables with half-timbering, a round corner tower (on 4501, but effectively anchoring all four houses by its location on the corner of 45th and Spruce Streets), groupings of three windows, steep roofs, the predominance of stone detailing as opposed to wood detailing, wall projections and oriel, asymmetry, multi-panel windows and diamond-shaped panes, and historical references such as parapets, and heavy ironwork grilles.


16 Ibid., pages 355-359.
Detail of 4507 Spruce Street with stone façade, arched door and window, decorative half-timbering with stucco infill, and stone corbel and post.

Detail of 4501 Spruce Street of a stone flat-arch window with multi-panes and stone lintel.
Detail of 4503-4505 Spruce Street with a stone arch over the two doorways.

Detail of 4507 Spruce Street with a stone archway to the front door, and the stone porch with double doors, a detail common to all four houses.
Detail of 4505-4507 Spruce Street with a corbelled chimney and chimney pot, brick arch connector, steep slate roof (on right), and cantilevered third floor (on left).

Detail of 4501 Spruce Street (façade along 45th Street) of a cantilevered window clad in copper and diamond-pane windows.
Detail of 4505 and 4507 Spruce Street of corbelled, decorative chimneys with the archway connecting them.

In the same year that the subject Spruce Street houses were designed, Eyre also produced the Henry Genet Taylor House and Office in Camden, New Jersey. While the two designs don’t look alike (the Taylor House has “Flemish” elements), they share many of the Tudor features; the Taylor House incorporates brick and stone, the steeply-pitched roof, the triple-window grouping, a paneled oriel, articulated chimneys, stone arches, multi-paned windows, “slit” windows (referring to archers’ slits in Medieval castles), and iron window grilles. All of these elements are incorporated into the four Spruce Street houses.
The Henry Genet Taylor House in Camden, New Jersey, 1884, designed by Wilson Eyre, listed on the National Historic Register.

While Palladian windows are not typical of Tudor style, Wilson Eyre incorporated them into both the subject properties and the Taylor house, but breaking the window unity into three windows and emphasizing their vertical elements juxtaposed on the horizontal lines of lintels and base.

Notice the jerkinhead roof on 4503 Spruce Street. It appears on 4505 as well, but not on 4501 or 4507. This detail is more common in the later bungalow style of the early 20th century but perhaps shows Eyre’s growing interest in the horizontal line in architecture.
Eyre used many of the same stylistic features in the Clarence B. Moore House, 1321 Locust St. in Philadelphia, built in 1891. Common to both the Moore House and the subject properties are the use of brick and stone, a rounded corner tower with a conical slate roof, triple-window groupings, arched and gothic windows, strong horizontal and vertical elements – especially in the composition of the chimneys --, and an emphasis on massing rather than ornamentation. What is particularly appealing about the Moore House and 4501 Spruce Street is the way the stonework curves in and out of the public sidewalk, challenging it with a plasticity that defies the rigidity of the street grid.
The Clarence B. Moore House, 1321 Locust St., Philadelphia PA, 1891, designed by Wilson Eyre. Like the 4501 Spruce house, the Moore House anchors the building with a rounded tower on the corner of Locust and Juniper Streets.
Details of the Moore House showing Eyre’s use of stone and brick, stone detailing, wall projections, iron grilles, stone lintels, and diamond-shaped panes. Notice the plastic qualities of the stone wall.

Details of 4501 Spruce (on the 45th Street side) showing the stonework intruding on the public sidewalk.
In 1884-5, Wilson Eyre was chiefly designing in the Tudor style. Up to that point Mr. Eyre had designed “Anglecot,” the Charles Adams Potter House in Chestnut Hill, “Farwood”, a Tudor mansion in Overbrook, PA; “Wisteria,” a house in Chestnut Hill, PA; the Doctor Henry Genet Taylor Flemish-Revival house and office in Camden, NJ. In keeping with the taste for eclecticism in architecture, Mr. Eyre nonetheless avoided the excesses of his generation—older colleagues, Frank Furness and Wilis G. Hale, a possible factor in the fact that more of Mr. Eyre’s houses remain standing today than those of some of his competition.

As speculative building practices evolved, so did the demographics of the inhabitants who were purchasing the houses. These less elaborate and more compact houses strictly appealed to the middle class. However, despite the mass speculative middleclass housing that was being erected, a number of Philadelphia’s families of wealth continued to choose West Philadelphia as the location for their estates. Among those who settled in the district was real estate developer Clarence Clark, whose handsome mansion was surrounded by lavish grounds that extended from 42nd to 43rd, and Locust to Spruce Streets, the site now occupied by the former Divinity School. Charles M. Swain, the son of the founder of the Public Ledger, and a noted newspaper editor, built his estate at the corner of 45th and Spruce Streets in 1875, presently the site of the University City Mews development. (14) The loss of these estates in the early to mid twentieth century further attests to the continued middle class development pressures.  

Left: Drawing of 4501-4507 Spruce Street (top right). Right: Enlarged detail, from Harper’s Magazine, 1890, showing the four houses designed by Eyre for Charles M. Swain.

17 West Philadelphia Streetcar Suburb Historic District, summary History, National Register of Historic Places, 1998
Mr. Eyre picked Tudor for the overall theme connecting the four houses, but the focal house, the one on the corner of 45th and Spruce, is a tiny stone castle. Only three stories high and occupying a long, narrow plot 25 feet wide, the tiny castle has a round tower with a slate roof, a stone arch over the main door, a copper-clad oriel with diamond-pane glass, and stone “battlements” buttressing the exterior stone wall.

Some of the same stone elements were distributed among the other three houses, but they featured much stucco between decorative half-timbering, a clear reference to the popular Tudor style. The corner castle, however, has more in common with the Moore house in downtown Philadelphia, also a corner residence but considerably bigger. The Moore house has stone on the “basement” and half the main floor, and the other 3 ½ floors are patterned brick. But it shares with the tiny castle strong plastic stonework that curves around the corner, highlights the entrance, and intrudes into the street. The most distinctive features of the Moore mansion are the two towers, one on each corner on 14th Street. They are topped with slate conical roofs, just like the tiny castle. The Moore mansion has Gothic pointed windows and stone lintels under each window. But it also has the stone oriel topped by a parapet. Both houses have brick chimneys with elaborate articulation.

The other three houses on Spruce Street in West Philadelphia are a double and a single. The feature that literally connects them and the corner house are brick arches that spring from just below the roof, leaping from one house to the next. Apparently reinforcing the chimneys, the brick arches have a brick cornice. They accentuate the narrow walkways between the houses and make the houses look taller, rather like a Roman aqueduct.
Criterion E. Be the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or Nation

The subject properties are the product of an up-and-coming young architect, Wilson Eyre, whose later work contributed much to the architectural legacy of the eastern United States in the early 20th century.

In 1885, Wilson Eyre was 27 years old, a practicing architect and only architect of the firm of James Peacock Sims in Philadelphia. Eyre was also teaching pen and ink drawing in the University Of Pennsylvania Department Of Architecture. He had completed some significant residential work in the Philadelphia area, including “Anglecot” in Chestnut Hill (1883), and was working on “Farwood” in Overbrook (1884), “Wisteria” in Chestnut Hill (1884), and the outstanding Dr. Henry Genet Taylor House and Office in Camden (1884).

For his most important early houses, "Anglecot" (1883) and "Farwood" (1884–85), he used a simple plan: a line of asymmetrical public rooms stretching along a single axis, extending even outside to a piazza. Like many Shingle Style architects, he employed the open "living hall" as an organizing element: all of the main first floor rooms connecting to the hall, often through large openings. In addition, he used staircases to extend the space of the hall to the second floor. According to architectural-historian Vincent Scully: "This
sense of extended horizontal plane and intensified "positive" scale evident in Eyre's work becomes later a basic component in the work of [Frank Lloyd] Wright..."[2] Eyre collaborated with artists such as Alexander Stirling Calder and Louis Comfort Tiffany.18

“Eyre’s career got off to a very precocious start in 1882, when, after only a year of architectural training, he took over the office of James Peacock Sims, upon Sims’ death. The then-24-year-old former apprentice was able to maintain Sims’ successful practice. Soon after, Eyre began to design the buildings for which he has in recent decades been best-known – asymmetrical, highly ornamented, willfully eccentric city and suburban houses. For example, the Sallie Watson House in Germantown, built in 1884, appears to have a window in its chimney, and inside, its oddly shaped rooms make for an interior both gracious and nervous.”19

Sallie Watson House, Wikipedia

The date for The Sallie Watson House (Germantown PA, Wikipedia) is cited anywhere from 1884 to 1889. Of interest to this nomination is the similar use of masonry, slate shingles, arched windows, and the oriel with small, leaded panes.


19 The Philadelphia Inquirer 01 April 1994, page 70
Certainly Mr. Eyre went on to become a leading proponent of the international country life movement. His body of work would in time include many styles – Flemish Renaissance, Shingle Style, Tudor, and Renaissance Revival, to name a few – but the picturesque English Cottage style won him recognition on both sides of the Atlantic Ocean. Eyre lectured in England – to the English! – and was featured in the Arts and Crafts magazine “International Studio.” But all that would come later in the architect’s career.

In 1889 Eyre designed “Thurso” for the A. J. Drexel Jr. family in Lansdowne, Upper Darby (west of West Philadelphia). His signature English Cottage style was not yet formulated in this work of just four years later; the house exhibits a lot of the same Tudor characteristics: the round tower, the steep slate roofs, the monumental stone arches, the stone gateposts and wall. Although the style may be the same, the design parameters were different. Thurso is a sprawling mansion on a huge country estate. The Spruce Street residences were prescribed by lot size, street grid, and budget.

“Thurso,” home of A. J. Drexel, Jr., located in Lansdowne, PA 1889 (no longer standing), drexel.png

Bigger projects would come in the near future, such as the University of Pennsylvania Museum (1895-1899, along with Frank Miles Day and Cope & Stewardson Architects). More public works followed, such as the Carnegie Library in Philadelphia (1915) and the Swann Memorial Fountain at Logan Circle (1921). But suffice it to say that in 1884 Wilson Eyre was producing designs that reflected what customers wanted in the end of the 19th century.
Wilson Eyre, Jr., son of Wilson and Louisa Lear Eyre, was born in Florence, Italy, on October 30, 1858. His family opted to live in Italy for the warmer climate in consideration for his father’s poor health. Wilson lived in Italy until the age of 11. He was then educated in Newport, RI and Lenoxville, Canada. He studied one year at MIT, but at age 19 apprenticed with James Peacock Sims in Philadelphia. When Sims unexpectedly died, the firm was working on the St. Paul’s Episcopal Church in Chestnut Hill, and Eyre was able to carry the responsibilities of the firm alone. He briefly partnered with another member of the Sims firm, William E. Jackson, but soon carried on alone until 1911. At that point he partnered with John Gilbert McIlvaine under the name Wilson Eyre and McIlvaine. Together they opened a second office in New York City in 1901 which remained active until 1915. Their commissions were built in Pennsylvania, New York, Connecticut, Rhode Island, Massachusetts, and New Jersey.

In 1883, a year before the Spruce Street commissions, Eyre was a founding member of the T-Square Club, an organization whose mission was to “raise the standards of architecture with the profession in Philadelphia.” Eyre became president of the T-Square Club from 1887 to 1888. In 1887 he was also commissioned to design the University Club located in the 1300 block of Chestnut Street. This building, described as the “Moorish” style for lack of any better name, is hard to place either as Late Tudor or Early Cottage Style. Nonetheless, Eyre’s stature as architect grew. “Eyre became a well-known local architect. His works were often reported on and even showcased in American Architect and Building News, Architectural Record, and Craftsman, and Country Life in America. Through this publicity and his own writings, he became known both nationally and abroad.”

Following his early success, Eyre became a leader in the international country life movement, lecturing in England, and corresponding with British and German architects. He was one of the first U.S. architects to be featured in the Arts & Crafts magazine International Studio, and he was published by Hermann Muthesius, the chronicler of the so-called "English" house of the turn of the century. Prior to Frank Lloyd Wright's rise to prominence, Eyre was arguably the best-known domestic architect in the U.S. among foreign designers. His post-1890 country houses, such as "Allgates" (1910, expanded by Eyre & McIlvaine 1917) are among the most accomplished American essays in the restrained stucco cottage idiom popularized by C.F.A. Voysey and Ernest Newton in England.

Eyre was one of the founders and editors of House & Garden magazine. In his later years he designed many gardens along with his residences and advocated in writing and lectures for the need for interaction between interior spaces and exterior spaces. He died October 23, 1944, and is buried at the Woodlands Cemetery in West Philadelphia.

Conclusion

The residences at 4501, 4503, 4505, and 4507 Spruce Street are examples of the speculative middleclass housing that flourished in the late 19th century in West Philadelphia. Preceding access by readily-available trolley transportation, they anticipated the in-fill of the remaining open land in West Philadelphia. By employing the up-and-coming young architect Wilson Eyre, the wealthy developer Charles M. Swain – who lived across the street -- set a high standard for suburban housing. The four houses, designed in the popular Tudor style, add to the diversity and richness of West Philadelphia architecture.

20 Beisert, Oscar, Nomination “Lycoming” to the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places, Summer 2018, page 38
21 “Wilson Eyre”, Wikipedia.com
Bibliography

H. Skaler, Robert Morris, Images of West Philadelphia, University City to 52nd Street, Charleston, South Carolina, Arcadia Publishing, 2002.
I. Wilson Eyre Biography at Philadelphia Architects and Buildings, philadelphiabuildings.org
Appendices

1. Ownership Information  
   Original property at 45th and Spruce Streets  
   In 1858 (April 28), Sophia M. Brognard bought the property on the northwest corner of 45th and Spruce Streets from her parents L. Ney Brognard and Mary B. Brognard. The property extended 154 feet 3 inches.

   ![Map of West Philadelphia](philageohistory.org)  
   *Philadelphia Atlas, Samuel L. Smedley 1862 map of West Philadelphia (detail), philageohistory.org. The map shows only the locations of the property owners’ houses.*

   In 1884 (October 27 or 29) Charles Mosely Swain bought that property from Sophia M. Brognard. The property extended 100 feet west from 45th Street and 120 feet north from Spruce Street. The purchase price was $9500.00

   **4501 Spruce Street**  
   Constructed 1885, developer Charles Mosely Swain, architect Wilson Eyre. It is a free-standing house, connected by a brick arch to the adjacent house.  
   Charles J. Swain, son of Charles Mosely Swain, moved into 4501 Spruce Street after his marriage to Elizabeth Bingham Hood in January of 1902.

---

22 Philadelphia Archives, Deeds and Building Permits, JOD 235, pages 140 to 142

23 The Times (Philadelphia, PA), Thursday 16 Jan 1902, Page 7, Newspapers.com
In 1907 (November 6) Isaac Hampshire Jones bought 4501 Spruce Street from Charles J. Swain and Elizabeth his wife.

Jones sold the property 10 years later.24

4503 and 4505 Spruce Street
Constructed 1885, developer Charles Mosely Swain, architect Wilson Eyre; it is a double house, connected by a brick arch to the adjacent houses.
In 1906 (September 14) Elizabeth C. Sailer bought the double house from the estate of Mary D. Swain, widow of Charles Mosely Swain (deceased 1904), described in the deed of sale as “a Lunatic”, and Robert W. Steele and Ida M. Steele his wife, and from Charles J. Swain and his wife Elizabeth H. Swain. Ida and Charles were both children of Charles M. Swain.
Four days later – September 18, 1906 – Harry B. Nason bought 4503 (deed states property began 25 feet 10 inches from 45th Street and was 24 feet 11 inches wide and a depth of 120 feet from Spruce Street) from Elizabeth C. Sailer.25

4507 Spruce Street
Constructed 1885, developer Charles Mosely Swain, architect Wilson Eyre; it is a double house, connected by a brick arch to the adjacent houses.
After Charles M. Swain’s death in 1904, the heirs sold the property and house to Elizabeth C. Sailer June 26, 1906. The heirs listed on the deed were “Robert W. Steel and Ida M. his wife and Charles J. Swain and Elizabeth H. his wife and Louis Wagner and Girard Trust Company Committee of the Estate of Mary D. Swain (a Lunatic).” Ida M. and Charles J. were Swain’s two adult children; Mary D. was

24 Philadelphia Archives, Deeds and Building Permits, JOD 235, pages 140 to 142

25 Ibid.
Swain’s widow. Note that Elizabeth C. Sailer bought this house three months before buying 4503-4505 Spruce Street.26 Elizabeth C. Sailer sold 4507 Spruce Street the same day to the Commonwealth Title Insurance and Trust Company, which five months later sold it to Helen V. Gronless. The next sale occurred 32 years later from different owners, not Helen, to new buyers, Edda and DeForrest W. Ewing. 27 (Philadelphia Archives)

It is clear from the deed that Charles M. Swain bought the property in 1884. Based on the fire insurance survey, Swain built the four houses in 1885. According to the deeds he kept them for 20 years, perhaps as rental properties, until his death. After estate matters were resolved, the heirs sold all four properties in 1906 and 1907.28

2. Portraits of Individuals Named in the Nomination

Charles Mosely Swain (1849-1904) from ancestry.com

26 Philadelphia Archives, Deeds and Building Permits, Deed location 21 S 2 132,

27 Ibid.

28 Ibid.
Wilson Eyre, Jr.
Local ID #: EYRE
Press, Isaac H. Blanchard Co., 1901, p. 67

Philadephiabuildings.org
3. Newspaper Clippings

THE LATEST NEWS IN REAL ESTATE

GREAT IMPROVEMENTS MADE IN A BEAUTIFUL PART OF WEST PHILADELPHIA.

HANDSOME HOUSES ABOUND

A Tour of the Section South of Chestnut and West of Thirty-fourth Street Develops Many Important Operations Which Are Embellishing “Across the River” and Which Provide Homes of a High Grade for the Well-to-Do.

No section of this great city of homes has experienced such a wonderful transformation as that lying south of Chestnut street and from Thirty-fourth street west. Embraced within a territory covering a little over a mile square are to be found houses such as the early settlers never even dreamed of as possible creations. From an inaccessible suburb the place has become one of the most accessible and most delightful places of residence within the limits of the municipality. The streets are wide and well paved, shade trees abound and the charm of suburban life is fully maintained through the majority of the houses having small lawns in front and further carried out through the open space between the buildings made possible by the large lots on which they are erected. A feature of this open space is the entire absence of ugly board fences to separate lots and yards. Instead, neat, low iron railing mark the boundary lines and air and sunlight are given an unobstructed sweep.

Although it has been but a few years since the improvements began the change is most wonderful. The character of the houses is of the higher grade. Some are built for and are occupied by the well-to-do class and others for the more moderately fixed as to finances. In all their fittings and furnishings, however, there is displayed that taste for which Philadelphia women are famous. Architecturally the “Colonial” predominates, but it is so varied and interspersed with the fanciful creations of the architect’s brains that the neighborhood is made beautiful through its dissimilar similarity, if such a term may be permissible.
4. **Insurance Survey for 4503 Spruce Street**

   The hand-written description reads as follows:

   **PERPETUAL SURVEY No. 64537**

   Made Nov 24th 1885 for Charles M. Swain and reported to the Franklin Fire Insurance Co. of Philadelphia.

   A three story brick Dwelling house having a pointed Bluestone front with a three story brick back Building and one
   story brick Laundry situate on the North side of Spruce Street No 4503 beginning about 24 ft 9 in west from south
   Forty fifth Street on the Twenty seventh Ward of the City of Philadelphia $3000 Insured. Dimensions 21 ft front by 31
   ft deep back Building 16 ft 6 in by 25 ft deep Laundry the same width by 8 ft 6 in deep. A frame Gable in front with the
   framing timbers exposed and plastered and peble (sic) dashed between them. The rear of back Building is
   weatherboarded with planed boards. Cased window frames and sash double hung except where hung with hinges.
   Hemlock joist yellow pine floor boards Building plastered Gas pipes throughout and a brick heater in the cellar.

   The first story of the main building is in two rooms entry and stairway off the side and has a stone arched head
   doorway I front and an outside vestibule with tile floor and glazed tile panels on the sides and square head front door
   frame with a transom in 12 small lights of sash and panel door an inside vestibule with tile floor and panels on the
   sides similar to outside vestibule and has a square head doorway with transom in 12 small lights of sash and sash door
   having 12 lights of 6 x 8 sash in it. The front room is the Parlor and has a square head doorway in front with inside
   folding sash doors having 24 lights of 6 x 10 sash in them and outside panel shutters to them and a recessed twin (or
   trim) window in the side of front room having 20 lights of 7 ½ x 9 ½ sash in it inside shutters to it. The back room has a
   15 light window back and a recessed window in the side lights the same size as lights in Parlor window inside shutter
   to them. The outside of recessed windows are slaterd under and over frames 4 in finish with plinths 7 ½ in sub and
   moulded washboard a 6/6 double worked passage door to front room from the entry and 8/6 do folding sliding doors
   between rooms an open corner fireplace in each room with Iron lining tile facing and hearth and a white pine pilaster
   frieze mantel over each. Newel and rail stairs in the entry extending to the third story with open string and panel
   below forming a closet underneath. Has a turned white pine newel at the bottom square do above Poplar rail and
   turned white pine balusters. Story 10 ft.

   The second story of main Building is in two rooms entry and stairway off the side of back room. Has a triple (sic)
   window in the Gable front the middle window having a circular top with 16 lights of 6 ½ x 9 ½ sash below the square
   and small lights above. Th side windows having 8 lights each of the same size sash and a window in front having 15
   lights of the same size sash also and a window the same size as last named back inside shutters to all a side closet in
   each room and a white pine pilaster frieze mantel in the front room with a glazed tile panel and a wood moulding on
   the ceiling in the front room also 4 in finish with plinths 7 ½ in sub and moulded washboard 6/6 double worked
   passage 5/6 single do closet doors and story 9 ft.

   The third story of main building is in two rooms entry and stairway off the side of back room and Has an 8 light 6 ½ x 9
   ½ square had dormer in front folding sash hung with hinges and an 8 light 7 ½ x 9 ½ window in the side of the front
   room outside blinds to it and a 15 light do in the side of back room outside blinds to it a large closet in the front room.
   3 in mouldings 6 in moulded wash board 6/6 double worked passage 5/6 single do closet door a skylight over the
   stairway and story 8 ft. a Curbed slate roof pitching to the front extending over about half of the main building with
   projecting eaves Galvanized iron eave troughs and conductors of the same material a flat pitch tin roof to the balance
   pitchin back brick eave fascia and moulding.

   The first story of the back building is in two rooms. Pantry and stairway between them. The front room is the Dining
   room and Has a triple (sic)window in the side having 30 lights of 7 ½ x 9 ½ sash in it inside shutters to them doors
   finish and washboard the same as parlor. The pantry has an 8 light 7 ½ x 9 ½ window outside panel shutters to it 3 in
   mouldings washboard a 6/4 double worked passage door a Butlers sink and shelves a flight of square stairs to the
   second story with cellar steps underneath. The back room is the kitchen has a 25 light 6 ½ x 9 ½ window outside panel
   shutters to it 3 in mouldings 6 in moulded wash board 6/6 double worked passage 5/6 single do cellar door or dresser
   withdrawers and panel doors a Range circulating boiler and cast iron sink. Story 9 ft.

   The second story is the sitting room entry and bath room off the front and entry stairway and a large closet off the
   back. The bath room has a 10 light 7 ½ x 9 ½ window inside shutters to it 4 in finish washboard a 6/6 double worked
passage door a corner washstand with marble top and a basin a copper lined bath tub and a water closet hot and cold water introduced. The sitting room has has (sic) a twin window with 30 lights of 7 1/2 x 9 ½ sash in it and a 10 light do inside shutters to them a wood moulding on the ceiling and a wooden mantel shelf with a glazed tile panel under it finish washboard and passage so as (?) the same as Parlor a flight of winding stairs at the back to the third story a 10 light 7 ½ x 9 ½ window back with inside blinds to it a 5/6 single worked door to the closet and story 9 ft.

The third story is in three rooms the front room being a store room and has an 8 light 7 ½ x 9 ½ window and a 12 light do in each back room outside blinds to the a large closet in the back room 3 in mouldings 6 in moulded washboard 6/4 double worked passage 5/4 single do closet and store room doors. Story 8 ft 3 in a flat pitch tin roof brick eave fascia moulding and galvanized conductor.

The Laundry has a plain back door frame panel door and has 5 light 7 ½ x 9 ½ windows outside panel shutters to them wooden wash tubs and finish washboard and passage door the same as Kitchen. Story 9 ft a flat pitch tin roof fascia moulding and galvanized iron conductor. A porch in front 12 by 7 ft 3 in wide with yellow pine floor stone piers 5 ft high and 8 in square cased columns above hand rail and balusters on two sides. The front over the plate in front is plastered and pebble dashed between the timbers and has a hipped slate roof and fascia and moulding on the eave, a wooden platform at the front entrance with yellow pine floor. Samuel Hillman Surveyor

Survey Made Nov 24th 1885 for Charles M Swain No 64538

Note: the term “weatherboard” in the abridged Oxford English Dictionary (1955) refers to outdoor horizontal siding, what is now known as clapboard.

Note; the 19th century term “washboard” in the 1955 Oxford English Dictionary is a “skirtingboard” or “The narrow board placed round the wall of a room, etc., close to the floor.”

5. **Wikipedia: Wilson Eyre’s Work**

A list from Wikipedia of Eyre’s work follows:

**Philadelphia area**

**Residences**

- "**Farwood**" (Richard L. Ashurst house), Overbrook, Pennsylvania (1884–85, demolished).
- 220 Glenn road, Ardmore, PA, 19003
- **Dr. Henry Genet Taylor House and Office**, 305 Cooper Street, Camden, New Jersey (1884–86). As of January 2015, renovation was underway by Rutgers University–Camden to convert the building into a Writers House.
- **Dr. Joseph Leidy House** and office, 1319 Locust Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania (1894).
- Clover Hill Farm, 910 Penn Valley Rd Media, Pennsylvania (1907).
• Alterations to Wilson Eyre House, 1003-05 Spruce Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania (1909–1910). It was added to the National Register of Historic Places in 1977. [15]

• "Allgates" (Horatio Gates Lloyd mansion), Coopertown Road, Haverford, Pennsylvania (1910, expanded by Eyre & McIlvaine 1917). Added to the National Register of Historic Places in 1979.

• Additions to "Bel Orme" (Thomas Mott house), Matson Ford & County Line Roads, Radnor, Pennsylvania (Eyre & McIlvaine) (1917). [15]

Other buildings


• Carnegie Library, McPherson Square, 601 E. Indiana Avenue, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania (Eyre & McIlvaine) (1915–17). [22]

• Swann Memorial Fountain, Logan Circle, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania (Eyre & McIlvaine, architects; Alexander Stirling Calder, sculptor) (1921–24).

• The St. Anthony Club of Philadelphia. 32 South 22nd Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania. 1888.

Other regions

Residences


• Nathan Franklin Barrett house, "26, The Boulevard", Rochelle Park, New Rochelle, New York (1890). Barrett was the landscape architect and planner of the Rochelle Park community.

• "Greyeres" (Ernest Albert mansion), 9 Manhattan Avenue, Rochelle Park, New Rochelle, New York (1896, demolished). [23]


• E.S. Sands mansion, Southport, Connecticut (1905). [23]

• "Etowah" (George W. King house), 429 Mt. Vernon Ave, Marion, Ohio (1908). Added to the National Register of Historic Places in 1995.

• "Northcote" (Stephen Parrish house), Lang Road, Cornish, New Hampshire (1893). Located near the Cornish Art Colony, this became the home/studio of the client’s son, the painter Maxfield Parrish.

Other buildings

• Detroit Club, 712 Cass Avenue, Detroit, Michigan (1891). Added to the National Register of Historic Places in 2005.

• Newcomb College Memorial Chapel, 6th & Chestnut Streets, New Orleans, Louisiana (1894–95, demolished 1954). Stained glass by Louis Comfort Tiffany. [23]

29 “Wilson Eyre,” Wikipedia.com