October 2, 2019

Ms. Christine Quinn Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 2051 Ridge Avenue (Application No. 1009454)

Dear Ms. Quinn:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of the proposed mixed-use shopping center and residential development at 2051 Ridge Avenue.

The block is in the CMX-3 zoning district and is bordered by Ridge Avenue and 21st Street to the west, Oxford Street to the north, Jefferson Street to the south, and 20th Street to the east. The proposal is divided into four buildings and includes: 92 dwelling units, 31,400 square feet for retail space, 25,000 square feet for medical care, 150 accessory parking spaces, 32 bicycle parking spaces and a 190-space parking garage.

At the meeting of October 1, 2019, the CDR Committee completed the Civic Design Review process and offered the following comments:

1. Registered Community Organization (RCO) comments

An RCO representative was not able to attend, but offered the following comments in letter format:

- Generally supportive of the proposal
- The project will reduce blight and provide new housing
- The community appreciates the provision of safe walkways

2. CDR Committee

CDR committee members believe the proposal is well considered and addresses community needs. More specific comments included:

The site design was commended for its urbanism, which was achieved by creating a street edge along Ridge Avenue, placing the parking lot internal to the site, locating the parking garage towards the rear, and locating new housing across from existing housing.



Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando Ashley Di Caro Tavis Dockwiller, ASLA Michael Johns, FAIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Elise Vider

- The parking garage proposed is of a higher quality than typical concrete garages. Positive design features include its beveled concrete details, brick inlay, spandrel panels, and horizontal façade elements that hide ramping.
- The Committee applauds the use of green space in the center area, and the Ridge Avenue plaza. The applicant should consider expanding the landscaping by installing green roofs.
- The applicant should include more native plants in the project's landscaping
- The Committee expressed concerns with the durability of the paint proposed for the ground surface art work within the proposed Ridge Avenue plaza. The process of refreshing the paint material, possibly with new art and additional community input, needs commitment from development team.

3. Adoption of Philadelphia City Planning Commission (PCPC) staff comments

The CDR committee adopted the majority of PCPC staff comments, which included:

- Staff asked the applicant to consider mitigating the impact of people walking mid-block across Jefferson Street to reach the Housing Authority's headquarters, and across Ridge Avenue to reach the SEPTA bus stop.
- Staff commends the design team for adding crosswalks and sidewalks on the site between the Ridge Avenue plaza and adjacent blocks and commercial spaces. However, staff requests alterations to the walkway in front of the medical center, by increasing its width.
- Staff applauds the design team for further refining the design of the Ridge Avenue plaza by adding low seating walls and by creating a visual connection from the bus stop across Ridge Avenue to the grocery store.
- Staff recommends reviewing the parking garage design, specifically the north and south facades, to add more fenestration and transparency. Staff also noted that the garage will require a PCPC facade review.
- Staff recommends building facades that align more with the neighborhood rowhouse scale, provide a cornice, and use similar material.
- For the 20th Street apartment building: staff commends the project team for the incorporation of ground floor ADA units; and for using stoops that provide a similar character to the row homes across 20th Street.

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the committee's action.

Sincerely.

Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director

CC:

Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, danielg@upenn.edu
Councilmember Darrell Clarke, 5th Council District, darrell.clarke@phila.gov
Corey Bell, Council Office, corey.bell@phila.gov
Maria Sourbeer, Shift Capital, maria@shiftcapital.us
David Schmauk, Wulff Architects Inc., DSchmauk@wulffarchitects.com
Jesse Smith, Wulff Architects Inc., jsmith@wulffarchitects.com
Warren McMichael, Brewerytown Sharswood Community Civic Association, brew.sharsnas@gmail.com

Louise Bunday, Friends of the 47th Ward, <u>Bundy1@comcast.net</u>
Lewis Nash, MAP Holistic CDC, <u>map.nashsr@gmail.com</u>
Vivian VanStory, Community Land Trust Corporation, <u>cltc3@netzero.net</u>
Dorothy Kelly, The Good News Community Organization,
Louise159@verizon.net

Priscilla Tee Bennett, St. Elizabeth's RCO, <u>st.elizabethrco@gmail.com</u> David Fecteau, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, David.Fecteau@phila.gov

Paulose Issac, Department of Licenses and Inspections, paulose issac@phila.gov

Sarah Stevenson, Water Department, sarah.stevenson@phila.gov
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

PHILADELPHIA CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

CIVIC DESIGN REVIEW

October 1, 2019

Ms. Christine Quinn
Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections
Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor
1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 3201 Ryan Avenue (Application No. 985674)

Dear Ms. Quinn:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed public K-8 school at 3201 Ryan Avenue.

The parcel is in the RSA-1 zoning district, and is bounded by Pennypack Park to the north, Ryan Avenue to the west, and Rowland Avenue to the southeast. The project proposal includes a 180,644 square foot public K-8 elementary school. 132 parking spaces are located on-site.

At the meeting of October 1, 2019, the CDR committee completed the Civic Design Review process and offered the following comments.

1. Registered Community Organization (RCO) Comments

- Asked that a similar package to the CDR submission package be presented at future neighborhood meetings
- Request for aquatic rehabilitation and ADA accessibility at Lincoln Pool
- Proposed school building has a design capacity for 1,660 students;
 School District consultants suggested could be up to 2,000
- Noted capacity issues at surrounding schools
- Asked about any proposed enlargement plans for the new school
- Asked about any considerations for anti-active shooter design
 - Development team responded that they have worked to determine the best way to use best practices
- Concerns about adequate parking
 - Development team responded that excess parking at Lincoln High School, plus remaining spots from Austin Meehan School meet code parking requirements
- Concerns about having traffic signals only a block apart from each other
- Concerns about lighting within the larger school campus
- Concerns about field space labeled as "Community Use Fields,"
 - at this location foundations of an old school were never removed

CDR A

Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Tavis Dockwiller, RLA Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Elise Vider

- fields from previous construction were never installed
- Community would like a copy of any existing Phase 1 ESA (environmental site assessment)
- o Concerns about ponding
- Requested an electronic copy of PCPC staff recommendations
- Commends the School District for the proposed school, they just want it done right

2. Councilmember Henon's Office Comments

- Support for design of separate bus and parent drop-off zones
- Clarified that the existing safety and security of the parcel, fields, fencing, etc., will be maintained
- Council office is willing to facilitate further conversations with the community
- Playgrounds at school seem redundant with existing public playground
 - School District clarified that the school playground is intended for use during the day

3. CDR Committee Comments

CDR committee members generally supported the project and had these specific comments:

- Project is well-sited, and has a great use of color and material. The committee appreciated the siting of the playgrounds
- Linking educational activities to stormwater management practices could add to the project. Similarly, the committee asked if even more raised garden beds could be incorporated around the school grounds
- The proposed school seems "walled off" from the landscape, and could integrate more with its surroundings to create more of a campus environment. The committee noted the rarity of an urban school being in close proximity to an extensive park landscape
- The committee asked what modes of transportation the students might use to travel to the school, and if the design of the entry walkway could accommodate them. They noted that a 10-foot walkway may not be gracious enough to accommodate pedestrians and bicyclists easily. They agreed that the separation between busses and cars is a good design feature
 - The development team noted that no estimates of how many students would take the bus, walk, bike, etc. are available.
 However, a mix of school busses, SEPTA busses, walking, biking, and being dropped-off is expected
 - They clarified that the intersection of Shelmire and Rowland Avenues will be signalized
 - Also, they clarified that another entrance off Ryan Avenue, where the old Meehan school is located, will be available

4. PCPC Staff Comments

The CDR Committee accepted staff comments which included:

- Staff commends the use of trees and lighting to buffer the student walk from the access road, and requests more information regarding wayfinding signage, pedestrian lighting, and landscaping phasing on the student walk
- Staff commends the School District's commitment to new fencing and pedestrian lighting, and requests an updated plan showing the location of these improvements, including those within the public realm; staff also requests more information on the design of proposed fencing and lighting
- The connection between the former Austin Meehan Middle School parking (to remain) and the new school needs to be clarified
- Please use standard-sized bricks on the exterior elevations
- Ensure windows are recessed an adequate amount to cast shadows
- Consider more architectural details and articulations around large openings in the brick
- Staff encourages a project of this scale and visibility to pursue 3rd party certification

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, danielg@upenn.edu

Councilmember Bobby Henon, bobby@bobbyhenon.com

Courtney Voss, Council Office, courtney.voss@phila.gov

Lauren Atwell, Council Office, lauren.atwell@phila.gov

Evan Wilbert, Stantec Consulting Services, evan.wilbert@stantec.com

Matthew McClure, Esq., Ballard Spahr, mcclure@ballardspahr.com

Peter McDermott, 64th Democratic Ward, zoning@64thward.org

Bob Cummings, 64th Republican Ward, rhcummings@gmail.com

Kevin Leonard, Mayfair Civic Association, Mayfair Civic Association @yahoo.com

Dave Munson, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, david.munson@phila.gov

Paulose Issac, Department of Licenses and Inspections, paulose.issac@phila.gov

Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov

Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, idougherty@septa.org

Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

October 1, 2019

Ms. Christine Quinn Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 3622 Mt. Vernon Street (Application No. 1002341)

Dear Ms. Quinn:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of "Village Square on Haverford", a proposed mixed-use retail, commercial, and multi-family residential development at 3622 Mt. Vernon Street.

The proposed building parcel is in the CMX-2 zoning district, and is bounded by private a parcel to the east, Haverford Avenue to the south, 37th Street to the west, and Mt. Vernon Street to the north. The project proposal includes 23,675 square feet for a ground floor supermarket with mezzanine, 72 dwelling units, and two parking spaces and two loading spaces. Across Mt. Vernon Street on a separate parcel, a surface parking lot is proposed that includes 44 parking spaces.

At the meeting of October 1, 2019, the CDR committee completed the Civic Design Review process and offered the following comments.

1. Registered Community Organization (RCO) Comments and Concerns
The RCO was enthusiastic about the project and complimented developer on a
comprehensive engagement process which has informed the design to date.

2. CDR Committee Comments

CDR committee members generally supported the project and had the following specific comments:

Site Design

- The committee commended the developer on their community engagement, as well as the incorporation of the existing art studio as a centerpiece of the development.
- They recommend shifting the supermarket entrance slightly to the west, closer to the corner of 37th and Mt. Vernon Streets, to increase the visibility of the retail.
- They commended the proposal's layering of landscape elements, using ground cover, planters, shrubs, and street trees. However, the



Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Tavis Dockwiller, RLA Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Elise Vider

landscape plans lacked a level of detail that caused some to question if the built conditions will look as beautiful as the renderings.

Building Design

 Consider more durable exterior materials, as fiber cement panels and stucco do not age well.

Parking Design

- Concerns were raised about loading management and trash logistics. The proposal does not include an interior loading dock, therefore management of exterior trash receptacles should be planned in advance
- Concerns were raised about pedestrians navigating the parking lot and crossing the street with grocery carts

PCPC Staff Comments:

The CDR Committee accepted staff comments which included:

- Concerns with loading and parking, as parking spaces are close to a building edge, and there may be potential for conflicts between parking and loading as they are in proximity. Additional concerns about truck turning radii onto Mt. Vernon were also shared.
- Request to add more on-street and off-street bicycle parking spaces for residents and visitors
- Current pedestrian and ADA access is very indirect, consider creating pedestrian access at the corner of the parking lot
- Consider other circulation impacts of having the grocery store entrance across the street from the parking lot, including the queueing and management of shopping carts, and pick up/drop off locations for shoppers and visitors.
- A utility cluster (trash, water room, electrical and mechanical rooms) is placed on a prominent street frontage. Is an alternate location possible?
- Staff supports the use of mezzanine glazing and plantings to mitigate the long opaque walls on the ground floor. However, clarification is needed on the sizes of planting areas to ensure a clear sidewalk walking zone.
- Staff commends the detailed attention given to the placement of 32 new street trees
- Staff has concerns about the large expanse of flat, single material, metal panel façade and recommends additional architectural details to respond to the character and depth of existing facades within the neighborhood
- Staff encourages a project of this scale and visibility to pursue 3rd party certification

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely.

Eleanor Sharpe
Executive Director

cc: Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu

Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, danielg@upenn.edu

Councilmember Jannie Blackwell, jannie.blackwell@phila.gov

Timothy Cooper, Council Office, timothy.cooper@phila.gov

Marty Cabry, Council office, Marty.Cabry@Phila.gov

Meredith Ferleger, Esq., Dilworth Paxon LLP, mferleger@dilworthlaw.com

Darwin Beauvais, Esq., Dilworth Paxon LLP, dbeauvais@dilworthlaw.com

Vera Kiselev, WRT LLC, vkiselev@wrtdesign.com Shunning Zhao, WRT LLC, szhao@wrtdesign.com

Charles Lomax, Lomax Real Estate Partners, cdl@lomaxco.com

DeWayne Drummond, Mantua Civic Association, mrdrumm25@gmail.com

James Wright, People's Emergency Center Community Development Corp., jameswright@pec-cares.org

Bernadette Ingrid Wyche, 24th Democratic Ward, biwyche1@gmail.com

Netrisa Dockery, Parkside Area Community Association, netrisat@yahoo.com

Brian Wenrich, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, Brian.Wenrich@phila.gov

Srivatsa Krishnan, Department of Licenses & Inspections, SRIVATSA.KRISHNAN@PHILA.GOV

Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov

Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov

Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org

Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov

Gregory Heller, Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority, Gregory.Heller@phdc.phila.gov

October 1, 2019

Ms. Christine Quinn Permit Services, Licenses and Inspections Municipal Services Building, 11th Floor 1401 John F. Kennedy Boulevard Philadelphia, PA 19102

Re: Civic Design Review for 4101 Market Street (Application No. 1004197)

Dear Ms. Quinn:

Pursuant to Section 14-304(5) of the Philadelphia Zoning Code, the Civic Design Review (CDR) Committee of the City Planning Commission completed the required review of a proposed retail, commercial, and laboratory development at 4101 Market Street.

The parcel is in the CMX-4 zoning district, and is bounded by private parcels to the north, 41st Street to the east, Market Street to the south, and 42nd Street to the west. The project proposal includes 191,000 square feet of retail, commercial offices, and laboratory spaces. 58 parking spaces are off-site on a lot across 41st street.

At the meeting of October 1, 2019, the CDR committee completed the Civic Design Review process and offered the following comments.

1. Registered Community Organization (RCO) Comments

- The RCO was enthusiastic about the project as a whole
- Concerns include parking, and the lighting and security of 42nd Street
- The community requested access to these amenities:
 - The green roof space on level three
 - A community space within the building for meetings and senior activities

2. CDR Committee Comments

CDR committee members generally supported the project and had these specific comments:

- Support for the setback from Market Street and encouraged shade umbrellas to be placed within the setback areas
- Support for retail at this location, and clarified that the retail glazing will be clear, without any tinting
- Some concern about the relationship between the rowhomes and proposed building base on 42nd Street
 - Development team encouraged to explore materials, setbacks, and detailing of western elevation to better relate to the neighborhood



Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director

Nancy Rogo Trainer, FAIA, AICP Civic Design Review Chair

Daniel K. Garofalo Civic Design Review Vice-Chair

Leonidas Addimando Ashley Di Caro, LEED -AP Tavis Dockwiller, RLA Michael Johns, AIA, NOMA, LEED-AP Elise Vider

- Reconsider the scale and type of window openings on 42nd
 Street to reduce the stark contrast between the proposed elevation and the adjacent rowhomes
- CDR committee members commented on the proposal's landscaping:
 - Encourage more plantings on the roofscape with good ecosystem returns
 - Encourage development of landscaping in a manner that also serves educational purposes
 - Encourage more street trees to be placed along the length of 42nd street to soften the relationship between rowhomes and new construction, the RCO also supported this request
 - Support for the larger tree pits which are important to get trees to survive in the city and assists with climate change and habitat creation
- Sustainable design comments include:
 - o Praise for the pursuit of LEED platinum
 - o Support for the proposal for electrochromic glazing
 - Support for the proposed Green Street to manage additional stormwater from public streets

In conclusion, the Civic Design Review process has been completed for this project. Please contact me if you have any questions about the Committee's action.

Sincerely.

Eleanor Sharpe Executive Director

CC:

Nancy Rogo Trainer, Chair, Civic Design Review, nrt23@drexel.edu
Daniel Garofalo, Vice Chair, Civic Design Review, danielg@upenn.edu
Councilmember Jannie Blackwell, jannie.blackwell@phila.gov
Timothy Cooper, Council Office, timothy.cooper@phila.gov
Brett Peanasky, Klehr Harrison Harvey Branzburg LLP, bpeanasky@klehr.com
Geoff Chalkley, The Sheward Partnership LLC, gic@tsparch.com
Gary Jonas, Drexel Area Property Association, dapaboard@gmail.com
Barry Grossbach, Spruce Hill Community Association, b.grossbach@gmail.com
James Wright, People's Emergency Center Community Development Corporation, jameswright@pec-cares.org

Pam Andrews, West Powelton Saunders Park RCO, hello@westpowelton.org
Netrisa Dockery, Parkside Area Community Association, netrisat@yahoo.com
Nicole Ozdemir, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, nicole.ozdemir@phila.gov

Cheli Dahal, Department of Licenses and Inspections, <u>Cheli Dahal@phila.gov</u>
Chris Renfro, Streets Department, christopher.renfro@phila.gov
Casey Ross, Office of Transportation, Infrastructure and Sustainability, casey.ross@phila.gov
Jennifer Dougherty, SEPTA Long Range Planning, jdougherty@septa.org
Paula Burns, Philadelphia City Planning Commission, paula.brumbelow@phila.gov