

**REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION
PHILADELPHIA HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

**18 SEPTEMBER 2019, 9:30 A.M.
1515 ARCH STREET, ROOM 18-029
EMILY COOPERMAN, CHAIR**

CALL TO ORDER

START TIME IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:00:00

The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:34 a.m. The following Committee members joined her:

Committee Member	Present	Absent	Comment
Emily Cooperman, Ph.D., chair	X		
Suzanna Barucco	X		
Jeff Cohen, Ph.D.		X	
Bruce Laverty	X		
Elizabeth Milroy, Ph.D.	X		
Douglas Mooney	X		Departed 10:50

The following staff members were present:

- Jonathan Farnham, Executive Director
- Kim Chantry, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Laura DiPasquale, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Meredith Keller, Historic Preservation Planner II
- Allyson Mehley, Historic Preservation Planner I
- Megan Schmitt, Historic Preservation Planner I

The following persons were present:

- Harrison Haas, Esq., Cozen O'Connor
- Sue Patterson, Penn Knox Neighborhood Association
- David Burkholder, Wisler Pearlstine
- Gabor Antalics
- Patrick Grossi, Preservation Alliance for Greater Philadelphia
- Joseph Catuzzi, Esq., Stradley Ronon
- Richard Scanlan, St. Joseph's Preparatory School
- Arielle Harris, Keeping Society
- David S. Traub, Save Our Sites
- J.M. Duffin, Keeping Society
- Theresa Stuhlman, Parks and Recreation
- Celeste Morello, American historian and criminologist
- Mike Cassidy, MRP
- Alex Balloon, Tacony CDC

CONTINUANCE REQUESTS

ADDRESS: 7709 CHEROKEE ST; 540 W MORELAND AVE; 545 W MERMAID LN

Name of Resource: Keewaydin

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Robin Sommers (7709 Cherokee St); Ganos LLC (540 W. Moreland Ave);

Donald J. Ratchford and Nancy A. Dickson (545 W. Mermaid Ln)

Nominator: Chestnut Hill Conservancy

Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, meredith.keller@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the properties at 7709 Cherokee Street, 540 W. Moreland Avenue, and 545 W. Mermaid Lane and list them on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The three properties historically comprised the main buildings of the Keewaydin estate. The nomination contends that the buildings satisfy Criteria for Designation C, D, E, and J. Under Criteria C and D, the nomination argues that Keewaydin stands as a characteristic example of the Dutch Colonial Revival style, which operated as a particular mode within the broader Colonial Revival movement. Under Criterion E, the nomination contends that the estate was designed by notable Philadelphia architect George T. Pearson. Under Criterion J, the nomination argues that the estate was constructed for Edward W. Clark Jr. and his wife Lydia Jane (Newhall) Clark, a distinguished Philadelphia family and fixture of Chestnut Hill society.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the properties at 7709 Cherokee Street, 540 W. Moreland Avenue, and 545 W. Mermaid Lane satisfy Criteria for Designation C, D, E, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:04:09

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Keller presented the continuance request to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- No one represented the nomination or property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- It typically supports continuance requests proffered by property owners.
- The property would remain under the Historical Commission's jurisdiction during the continuance period.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of the nomination of 7709 Cherokee Street, 540 W. Moreland Avenue, and 545 W. Mermaid Lane and remand it to the November 2019 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

ITEM: 7709 CHEROKEE ST; 540 W MORELAND AVE; 545 W MERMAID LN					
MOTION: Continue and remand to November 2019 CHD meeting					
MOVED BY: Milroy					
SECONDED BY: Laverty					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: 1810 CHESTNUT ST

Name of Resource: Samuel T. Freeman & Co. Auction House
 Proposed Action: Designation
 Property Owner: The Business Known As "C"
 Nominator: Philadelphia Historical Commission staff
 Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, meredith.keller@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1810 Chestnut Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criterion for Designation D. Under Criterion D, the nomination argues that architectural firm Tilden & Register designed the Samuel T. Freeman & Co. Auction House in 1923-24 in Renaissance Revival style; the building’s style offered a sense of distinction and grandeur to a company with a legacy of auctioning the exclusive collections of Philadelphia’s elite.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1810 Chestnut Street satisfies Criterion for Designation D.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:05:40

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Keller presented the continuance request to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Attorney Harrison Haas represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- It typically supports continuance requests proffered by property owners.
- The property would remain under the Historical Commission’s jurisdiction during the continuance period.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of the nomination of 1810 Chestnut Street and remand it to the October 2019 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

ITEM: 1810 CHESTNUT ST					
MOTION: Continue and remand to October 2019 CHD meeting					
MOVED BY: Barucco					
SECONDED BY: Mooney					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: 5250 UNRUH AVE

Name of Resource: The Tacony Worsted Mills

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: 5250 Unruh Avenue Association

Nominator: Alex Balloon, Director, Tacony Community Development Corp.

Staff Contact: Megan Cross Schmitt, megan.schmitt@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 5250 Unruh Avenue and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J. Under Criterion E, the nomination argues that the Tacony Worsted Mills is an early and intact example of an industrial complex designed by Walter Harvey Geissinger, a prolific architect who designed several commercial and industrial buildings throughout Philadelphia. Under Criterion J, the nomination contends that the Tacony Worsted Mills was considered locally and nationally to be one of the finest and largest worsted yarn mills of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 5250 Unruh Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation E and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:06:42

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Schmitt presented the continuance request to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Attorney David Berkholder represented the property owner.
- Alex Balloon, Tacony Community Development Corporation, represented the nomination.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- It typically supports continuance requests proffered by property owners.
- The property would remain under the Historical Commission’s jurisdiction during the continuance period.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of the nomination of 5250 Unruh Avenue and remand it to the December 2019 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

ITEM: 5250 UNRUH AVE					
MOTION: Continue and remand to December 2019 CHD meeting					
MOVED BY: Laverty					
SECONDED BY: Mooney					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: 231 REED ST

Name of Resource: Sacred Heart of Jesus Parochial School
 Proposed Action: Designation
 Property Owner: Christopher Columbus Charter School
 Nominator: Celeste Morello
 Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 231 Reed Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the former Sacred Heart of Jesus Parochial School, constructed in 1893, satisfies Criteria for Designation D, H, and J. Under Criterion D, the nomination argues that the building embodies distinguishing characteristics of Romanesque Revival architecture. Under Criterion H, the nomination argues that the imposing school building, cited on a prominent corner of Moyamensing Avenue where most other buildings are smaller-scale, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood. Under Criterion J, the nomination contends that the building exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 231 Reed Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D and H. The staff fails to comprehend the argument for the satisfaction of Criterion J proffered in the nomination.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:09:30

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Chantry presented the continuance request to the Committee on Historic Designation. She stated that an attorney representing the property owner requested the continuance.
- No one represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- It typically supports continuance requests proffered by property owners.
- The property would remain under the Historical Commission’s jurisdiction during the continuance period.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of the nomination of 231 Reed Street and remand it to the November 2019 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

ITEM: 231 REED ST					
MOTION: Continue and remand to November 2019 CHD meeting					
MOVED BY: Milroy					
SECONDED BY: Mooney					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: 156 W SCHOOL HOUSE LN

Name of Resource: Boxwood

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Teen Challenge Training Center Inc.

Nominator: Penn Knox Neighborhood Association

Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, meredith.keller@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 156 W. School House Lane and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E. Under Criteria C and D, the nomination argues that Boxwood reflects the Colonial Revival style of architecture as applied to upper-class suburban residences in late nineteenth-century Philadelphia. The nomination further argues that the “cottage-stable” at the rear of the property represents Gothic Revival cottage motifs popularized by Andrew Jackson Downing in the late 1840s and early 1850s. Under Criterion D, the nomination asserts that Boxwood was designed by Mantle Fielding, a prolific and significant architect who influenced the built environment in Northwest Philadelphia at the turn of the twentieth century.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 156 W. School House Lane satisfies Criteria for Designation C, D, and E. However, the staff asserts that the so-called “cottage-stable” at the rear of the property does not reflect the Gothic Revival style and, therefore, does not satisfy Criteria C and D as presented in the nomination. While the building has a cross gable, a typical feature of the Gothic Revival, it does

not have any other features characteristic of the style. The building may have served as a barn, potentially for an earlier residence predating Boxwood, and was later updated with a cross gable. The staff recommends that the so-called “cottage-stable” contributes to the site’s historical significance but does not exhibit sufficient character-defining features to be considered reflective of or exemplary of the Gothic Revival style.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:10:29

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Keller presented the continuance request to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- No one represented the property owner.
- Sue Patterson represented the nomination and supported the request to continue the review of the nomination.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- It typically supports continuance requests proffered by property owners.
- The property would remain under the Historical Commission’s jurisdiction during the continuance period.
- The equitable owner of the property, the Pennsylvania School for the Deaf, requested that the nomination be continued to a future meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation meeting.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the review of the nomination of 156 W. School House Lane and remand it to a future meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

ITEM: 156 W SCHOOL HOUSE LN					
MOTION: Continue and remand to a future CHD meeting					
MOVED BY: Milroy					
SECONDED BY: Laverty					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: 1535 W GIRARD AVE

Name of Resource: Charles T. Yerkes House

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Willis W. Berry, Jr.

Nominator: Philadelphia Historical Commission staff

Staff Contact: Laura DiPasquale, laura.dipasquale@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1535 W. Girard Avenue and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property, constructed between 1864 and 1865, is significant under Criteria for Designation A, D, and J. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the property is significant for its association with Charles Tyson Yerkes, Jr., one of shrewdest businessmen and most influential mass-transit financiers of the late nineteenth century. While Quaker-born Yerkes got his start in business in Philadelphia, his influence extended beyond the city, and even the nation, as he would go on to give Chicago its “L,” and London its “Tube” systems. Through his questionable morals and unfettered ambition, Yerkes exemplified the Gilded Age robber baron to such an extent that he was immortalized, shortly after his death, in Theodore Dreiser’s *Financier* trilogy of the early twentieth century. The nomination argues that the free-standing townhouse, located along Girard Avenue, just west of Broad Street was designed in a high-style Italianate or Italian Renaissance style, satisfying Criterion D, and also exemplifies the development of West Girard Avenue as it transitioned from a rural area to a streetcar suburb and ultimately a fashionable thoroughfare for the nouveau riche elite in the second half of the nineteenth century, satisfying Criterion J.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1535 W. Girard Avenue satisfies Criteria for Designation A, D, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:13:15

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. DiPasquale presented a continuance request to the Committee on Historic Designation. She explained that the property owner had an emergency and was unable to attend the review. She reported that he is opposed to the nomination. Ms. DiPasquale noted that he did not specify the meeting to which he would like the nomination to be continued.
- No one represented the property owner.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- It typically supports continuance requests proffered by property owners.
- The property would remain under the Historical Commission’s jurisdiction during the continuance period.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that that the Historical Commission continue the nomination for 1535 W. Girard Avenue and remand it to the November 2019 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation.

ITEM: 1535 W GIRARD AVE					
MOTION: Continue and remand to November 2019 CHD meeting					
MOVED BY: Laverty					
SECONDED BY: Milroy					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: 1045-49 SARAH ST

Name of Resource: Otis Elevator Company Boiler and Engine House
 Proposed Action: Designation
 Property Owner: Antal Group Inc.
 Nominator: The Keeping Society of Philadelphia
 Staff Contact: Laura DiPasquale, laura.dipasquale@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1045-29 Sarah Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the former boiler and engine house of the Otis Elevator Company, built in 1904, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, G, and J. Under Criteria A and J, the nomination argues that the property is significant in the development of Fishtown/Kensington as part of the Morse Elevator Works and the Otis Elevator Company. Under Criterion C, the nomination contends that the building is representative of industrial power plant design of the early twentieth century. Under Criterion G, the nomination argues that the building is part of the earliest, extent, coherent industrial complexes in Fishtown, but does not propose to designate the complex as a district. Many of the other properties associated with the former Morse and Otis Elevator Companies were individually designated in 2015 and 2016.

The Committee on Historic Designation reviewed this nomination on March 12th and recommended that the property satisfies Criteria D and J. The owner, who did not attend the Committee’s review, requested that the Historical Commission remand the nomination to the Committee to provide him with an opportunity to participate in the review. The Commission granted the request, sending the nomination back to the Committee.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1045-49 Sarah Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, C, and J, but not Criterion G.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION, MARCH 2019: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the property satisfies Criteria for Designation D and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:14:08

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. DiPasquale presented the continuance request to the Committee on Historic Designation. She reported that property owner Gabor Antalics was present in the meeting room before the meeting started and requested that the nomination be continued and remanded to the December 2019 meeting of the Committee on Historic Designation to allow his attorney to be present.
- Arielle Harris represented the nominator and did not comment on the continuance request.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- It typically supports continuance requests proffered by property owners.
- The property would remain under the Historical Commission’s jurisdiction during the continuance period.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the Historical Commission continue the nomination for 1045-49 Sarah Street be continued and remanded it to the December 2019 Committee on Historic Designation meeting.

ITEM: 1045-49 SARAH ST					
MOTION: Continue and remand to December 2019 CHD meeting					
MOVED BY: Barucco					
SECONDED BY: Lavery					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

AGENDA

ADDRESS: 4600 DISSTON ST AND 6913 DITMAN ST

Name of Resource: Frank Shuman House and Laboratory

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Jan Smiarowski (4600 Disston); Penn Industrial Installations (6913 Ditman)

Nominator: Yen Ho, Temple University student

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the Frank Shuman House and Laboratory at 4600 Disston Street and 6913 Ditman Street in the Tacony neighborhood of Philadelphia as historic and list them on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. Under Criterion A, the nomination contends that the properties are significant for their association with Frank Shuman, a prolific inventor with more than 60 U.S. patents to his name, including pioneering glass and

solar power inventions. The nomination asserts that Shuman's former home and laboratory also reflect the cultural, economic, social, and historical heritage of Tacony in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries as a center for industry and invention, satisfying Criterion J.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the properties at 4600 Disston Street and 6913 Ditman Street satisfy Criteria for Designation A and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:15:35

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- No one represented the nomination or property owners.

DISCUSSION:

- The Committee asked if the properties have two separate property owners.
 - Ms. Mehley responded that there are two separate owners.
- The Committee asked if the Laboratory building is attached to the adjacent building.
 - Ms. Mehley responded that it is attached by a small section on the west elevation but that the Laboratory maintains its integrity. Ms. Cooperman described the connecting area between the buildings as a "hyphen."
- The Committee commented that the nomination was well-researched and written.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Alex Balloon, Tacony Community Development Corporation, spoke in support of the nomination.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- Frank Shuman was part of a group of scientists that lived in Tacony during the late nineteenth and early twentieth century and is associated with the industrial history of the area, including the Disston Saw Works and other metal fabricators along the waterfront.
- Frank Shuman lived and worked at 4600 Disston Street and 6913 Disston Street between 1895 and 1918, his most prolific period as an inventor.
- Frank Shuman used these properties and the surrounding community of Tacony to test his inventions.
- Despite changes in use and physical alterations, 4600 Disston Street and 6913 Disston Street maintain their historic integrity and appearance.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The buildings are significant for their association with Frank Shuman, a prolific inventor with more than 60 U.S. patents to his name, including pioneering glass and solar power inventions, satisfying Criterion A.
- The buildings reflect the cultural, economic, social, and historical heritage of Tacony in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries as a center for industry and invention, satisfying Criterion J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the properties at 4600 Disston Street and 6913 Ditman Street satisfy Criteria for Designation A and J.

ITEM: 4600 DISSTON ST and 6913 DITMAN ST					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria A and J					
MOVED BY: Laverty					
SECONDED BY: Barucco					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: 711, 713, AND 715 N 6TH ST

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owners: Michael Fausey and Ann McParlin (711); Lanny Larcinese (713); Downtown Philly Properties (715)

Nominator: Arielle Harris, Keeping Society of Philadelphia

Staff Contact: Allyson Mehley, allyson.mehley@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the properties at 711, 713, and 715 N. 6th Street as historic and list them on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the properties satisfy Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and E. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the buildings, which were built in 1872 as part of a 68-building development on land owned by the Stephen Girard Estate, are significant for their association with Stephen Girard. Designed by prominent local architect James H. Windrim, satisfying Criterion E, the twin houses embody distinguishing characteristics of the “high vernacular” Second Empire style popular during the period, satisfying Criteria C and D.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the properties at 711, 713, and 715 N. 6th Street satisfy Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and E.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:20:30

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Mehley presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Arielle Harris represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owners.

DISCUSSION:

- The Committee questioned the association of the buildings with Stephen Girard since he was already dead at the time of their construction. Ms. Cooperman asked the nominator why these buildings are noteworthy.
 - Ms. Harris responded that they were the first ones built as part of a speculative real estate enterprise conducted by the Board of Director of City

Trusts (BDCT) to create income to fund Girard College. She explained that it was this rental income that was directly used for the operations of Girard College.

- Ms. Cooperman stated that it is important to be careful about the associations in between important individuals and real estate operations. She questioned why these buildings rise above others within the speculative development.
- Mr. Lavery pointed out that the Stephen Girard Estate is the mover here, an extremely important nineteenth and twentieth century organization in Philadelphia architecture.
- Ms. Cooperman again questioned that within the context of the Stephen Girard estate and the estate's developments, why are these particularly exceptional.
- Mr. Lavery noted they are the first ones built.
- Ms. Cooperman added these are worthy buildings from a design point of view and there is no doubt about that. She noted that this is something that they need to be very clear about in terms of a developer that owns so much real estate and develops so much over a long period of time. What makes these exceptional? Ms. Cooperman accepted that the nominator had sufficiently answered this question.
- Ms. Milroy stated that it raises an interesting question because, if you think of a development corporation as a corporation, which is the equivalent of a person, it might be an interesting conversation around adjusting the Criteria. Ms. Milroy added that she thinks the nominations are strong and the whole history of the Girard Trust is fascinating.
- Ms. Barucco stated that the influence of Stephen Girard was so significant through his money, and even though he was dead, he had the foresight to establish this entity to carry on. She noted that this is where she saw the association between these buildings and Girard. Ms. Barucco added that Girard's influence in Philadelphia continued so long after his death and continues today.
- Mr. Lavery stated that the description in the nomination of the changing fortunes of this block of homes over a 50-year period after their construction was great. He noted that their rental income went from \$20,000 per year to something like \$5,000.
 - Ms. Harris responded that it was a positive that the BDCT was so thorough in its reports even if the reports provided bad news. She noted that the BDCT was honest about it and they had to break the will to sell the houses, but it was in its best interest to do so.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- David Traub of Save Our Sites spoke in support of designation.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The properties at 711, 713, and 715 N. 6th Street were part of the first speculative development initiated by the Stephen Girard Trust and the BDCT to generate ongoing income for Girard College.
- The association between these buildings and Stephen Girard lies in his foresight to establish the Stephen Girard Trust to carry his philanthropic mission forward.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The buildings, which were built in 1872 as part of a 68-building development on land owned by the Stephen Girard Estate, are significant for their association with Stephen Girard, satisfying Criterion A.
- The buildings embody distinguishing characteristics of the “high vernacular” Second Empire style popular during the period, satisfying Criteria C and D.
- The buildings were designed by prominent local architect James H. Windrim, satisfying Criterion E.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the properties at 711, 713, and 715 N. 6th Street satisfy Criteria for Designation A, C, D, and E.

ITEM: 711, 713, and 715 N 6TH ST					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria A, C, D, and E					
MOVED BY: Barucco					
SECONDED BY: Laverty					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: 128-40 DIAMOND ST

Name of Resource: Kensington Hospital

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Kensington Hospital

Nominator: Steven Peitzman

Staff Contact: Laura DiPasquale, laura.dipasquale@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 128-40 Diamond Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the property, which contains several buildings and additions constructed between 1868 and 1978, is significant under Criteria for Designation A, E, G, and J. The nomination places the period of significance between 1890 and 1945, the years during which the Kensington Hospital for Women occupied and expanded their facilities at this location. Additions and buildings constructed or acquired outside of this period or that are not known to have been significant to the Kensington Hospital for Women are considered non-contributing to the historical significance of the property.

Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the property is significant for its association with Howard A. Kelly, MD., who founded the Kensington Hospital for Women in the 1880s and went on to become an internationally-known figure in gynecology, surgery, and medical education. Under Criterion G, the nomination contends that the Hospital chose to position its facility on Norris Square owing to the then-absolute belief in the value of fresh air and ventilation to avoid hospital infection. Under Criterion J, the nomination explains how the Kensington Hospital for

Women served the women of Kensington and beyond, and expanded its facilities numerous times, including with additions by the prolific firm of Watson & Huckel, satisfying Criterion E.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 128-40 Diamond Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, E, G, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:29:12

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. DiPasquale presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- No one represented the nomination or property owner. Ms. DiPasquale noted that the property owner has not contacted the Historical Commission.

DISCUSSION:

- The Committee commended both the content and the graphics of the nomination.
- Ms. Barucco questioned the implications for Criterion G on Norris Square.
 - Ms. DiPasquale responded that Criterion G would have no impact on Norris Square itself, since it is not part of the nominated property.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- David Traub of Save Our Sites expressed his support for the nomination. He noted that the property enhances Norris Square.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The property at 128-40 Diamond Street is a single tax parcel that contains several buildings and additions constructed between 1868 and 1978.
- The Kensington Hospital for Women occupied and expanded its facilities at this location between 1890 and 1945. Additions and buildings constructed or acquired outside of this period or that are not known to have been significant to the Kensington Hospital for Women will be considered non-contributing to the historical significance of the property.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The property is significant for its association with Howard A. Kelly, MD., founder of the Kensington Hospital for Women, satisfying Criterion A.
- The property includes buildings and additions by the prolific firm of Watson & Huckel, satisfying Criterion E.
- The Kensington Hospital for Women chose to position its facility on Norris Square owing to the belief at the time in the value of fresh air and ventilation to avoid hospital infection, satisfying Criterion G.
- The property served the women of the Kensington neighborhood and beyond, satisfying Criterion J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 128-40 Diamond Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, E, G, and J.

ITEM: 128-40 DIAMOND ST					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria A, E, G, and J					
MOVED BY: Laverty					
SECONDED BY: Barucco					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: OLD BUSTLETON AVE AND WINCHESTER AVE, PENNYPACK PARK

Name of Resource: Roman Catholic Church of Maternity, Blessed Virgin Mary

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: City of Philadelphia

Nominator: Celeste Morello

Staff Contact: Laura DiPasquale, laura.dipasquale@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the Roman Catholic Church of Maternity B.V.M., located in Pennypack Park. The property does not have an Office of Property Assessment-compliant address. The nomination contends that Maternity BVM, which was constructed in 1870 along the Bustleton & Somerton Turnpike, is significant under Criteria for Designation D, G, and H. Under Criterion D, the nomination contends that the small church building embodies distinguishing characteristics of the “Gothic Chapel,” or Gothic Revival style frequently utilized by rural communities of the mid-nineteenth century. Under Criteria G and H, the nomination explains the history of the church from its founding of the church along Pennypack Creek and the former Bustleton Turnpike in rural Bustleton to the City’s acquisition of the church and incorporation into Pennypack Park and its isolation owing to the new Bustleton Avenue that opened in 1970.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the Maternity BVM Church in Pennypack Park satisfies Criterion D, but not Criteria G or H. The staff contends that the arguments made under Criteria G and H may satisfy Criterion J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:34:40

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. DiPasquale presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Celeste Morello represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Morello noted that she attempted to determine the architect of the building, but was advised by Bruce Laverty at the Athenaeum that the design of the building may have come from an architectural pattern book, which was common for Gothic Revival churches of the time.

- Ms. Cooperman responded that it could be a pattern book design or could be by an architect like Samuel Sloan.
- Ms. Milroy noted that it is fascinating that there is a church in a City-owned park. She opined that the designation is worthwhile, but questioned how the history of the property is told.
- Ms. Milroy asked whether there is any information as to why the Archdiocese turned the church over to the City.
 - Ms. Morello replied that that question has baffled her. She noted that the Archdiocese sometimes cedes its properties when they are not profitable or when the congregation moves elsewhere, but in this case, Maternity remained.
 - Ms. Milroy questioned whether Ms. Morello looked at the minutes of the former Fairmount Park Commission.
 - Ms. Morello responded that she did not.
 - Ms. Milroy questioned how this Maternity BVM church is related to the nearby Maternity BVM church.
 - Ms. Morello noted that a 1930s lease for the church that she found at the Archdiocesan archives discusses the responsibilities of the Maternity parish to maintain the property. She explained that a 1982 lease agreement further expands upon these responsibilities.
- Ms. Milroy noted that the Fairmount Park Commission no longer exists, and that references in the nomination should be updated to reflect that fact.
- Ms. Milroy opined that it is an interesting vernacular building, but noted that the nomination compares the church to some high-style buildings. She questioned whether it is more appropriate to think of this building in terms of other vernacular buildings.
 - Ms. Barucco responded that she interpreted the comparisons as reinforcing the popularity of the style as expressed in pattern books.
 - Mr. Lavery noted that in comparison to St. Luke's on Welsh Road that was designated last year, which is a high-style, architect-designed building, Maternity was obviously also influenced by the Gothic Revival or pattern books and buildings.
- Ms. Morello commented that Dr. Robert Armstrong at the Department of Parks and Recreation assisted in researching the property, and opined that Philadelphia may be the only municipality in the United States that owns a Catholic church.
- Ms. Milroy questioned whether the property satisfies Criterion G. She noted that during the creation of the Fairmount Park Commission, the City acquired many buildings, of which this was one. She noted that she cannot think of a similar process happening on a similar scale in other cities.
 - Ms. Cooperman responded that she thinks the building's vernacular style stands on its own without the argument that it is part of or related to a square or a park, noting that it was not intended to be part of the park. She noted that it has a different relationship with the park than houses such as Mount Pleasant, which have a distinct historic relationship to the Schuylkill landscape that became part of Fairmount Park as opposed to this building which was an institution that was built to serve a specific population.
 - Mr. Lavery opined that this building would not have survived if it were not in the park, or if the City had decided to simply widen Bustleton Pike instead of rerouting it. He noted that it would be interesting to see some of the thought behind the location of the new Bustleton Avenue, and whether they were

actively trying to avoid the church or whether it was just happenstance. However, he opined, the history of the building and the park are tied hand in hand.

- Ms. Barucco replied that, in looking at the previous nomination for Kensington Hospital, which also argued for Criterion G owing to the Hospital's explicit relationship to Norris Square and its landscape, she does not see as strong of a connection between Maternity BVM and Pennypack Park. She noted that the church's position in the park may have contributed to its preservation but questioned whether it contributes to its significance. She noted that she does not see the same strength of association. Ms. Cooperman agreed and opined that Criterion G is not necessary.
- Ms. Morello commented that the church was also tied in with the mill community that worked around the Pennypack Creek. She noted that the owner, in a paternalistic gesture, established this church for his workers.
 - Ms. Barucco responded that that may be so, but that the Criteria cited in the nomination do not really address that point.
 - Mr. Mooney noted that this argument may address the staff recommendation that the nomination satisfies Criterion J, rather than G or H. Other Committee members agreed.
- Ms. Barucco questioned whether the property may contain any archaeological potential, satisfying Criterion I.
 - Mr. Mooney responded that he had also wondered about that, owing to the position on the creek, but that he is fairly certain this area has already been surveyed and no archaeological potential determined.
- Mr. Laverty asked whether Maternity was the only Catholic church in the far northeast, aside from St. Dominic's, in 1870.
 - Ms. Morello responded affirmatively.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The property does not have an Office of Property Assessment-compliant address.
- Maternity BVM church was constructed in 1870 along the Bustleton & Somerton Turnpike and later incorporated into Pennypack Park after the re-routing of Bustleton Avenue in 1970.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The building embodies distinguishing characteristics of the "Gothic Chapel," or vernacular Gothic Revival style frequently utilized by rural communities in the mid-nineteenth century, satisfying Criterion D.
- The building was built to serve the rural Bustleton area and its mill communities around the Pennypack Creek, satisfying Criterion J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the Maternity BVM Church in Pennypack Park satisfies Criteria for Designation D and J, but not Criteria G and H.

ITEM: MATERNITY BVM CHURCH IN PENNYPACK PARK					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria D and J					
MOVED BY: Barucco					
SECONDED BY: Mooney					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

ADDRESS: 1734-54 W THOMPSON ST

Name of Resource: Church of the Gesu

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: St. Joseph’s Preparatory School

Nominator: Celeste Morello

Staff Contact: Megan Cross Schmitt, megan.schmitt@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 1734-54 W. Thompson Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criteria for Designation D and E. Under Criterion D, the nomination describes the Church of the Gesu as “High Victorian Baroque,” stating that it “expresses the intellectual, yet contemporary taste of the late nineteenth century with the combination of styles.” The nomination argues that the church, constructed 1879-1888, is also an interesting example of the association the Society of Jesus, the Jesuits, has had with Baroque architecture since the 1500s. Under Criterion E, the nomination recognizes that architect Edwin F. Durang was highly regarded as “insightful [and] thoroughly professional,” and well known for his work on Catholic churches throughout Philadelphia. It contends that Durang’s design for the Church of the Gesu is his “American representation of the Baroque, a ‘Roman Catholic’ style.”

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1734-54 W. Thompson Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D and E.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 00:53:44

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Schmitt presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Celeste Morello represented the nomination.
- Attorney Joseph Catuzzi represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Mr. Cantuzzi stated that his client would like the Committee’s review of the nomination to be continued to allow time for his client to better understand the nomination and the implications of designation. He noted that the Committee recommended in favor of granting several continuance requests at the start of the meeting. Ms. Cooperman rejected the applicant’s request for a continuance, asserting that the Committee had already started its review of the nomination. Mr.

Cantuzzi respectfully asked that the Committee consider his request and again noted that the Committee had supported several other continuance requests during the meeting. Ms. Cooperman denied his request and stated that the Committee would continue with its review.

- Ms. Morello claimed that there was no reason for a continuance, adding that the property should have been designated years ago. She stated that the attorney was providing “silly reasons” for the continuance that “have nothing to do with” the nomination.
- Mr. Cantuzzi stated that his client is a non-profit, educational institution that has no intention of altering the building during the continuance. He stated that he was simply asking for the same consideration that had been given others. He stated that he and his client cannot participate effectively in the discussion if they have not had time to review the nomination and explore the implications of designation.
- Ms. Cooperman denied his request.
- The Committee informed the applicant that he was welcome to make his continuance request directly to the Commission after the Committee had deliberated and made its recommendation.
- Mr. Cantuzzi thanked the Committee for its time and consideration. He said that he wanted to provide the Committee with a brief overview of St. Joseph’s Preparatory School, remarking that the school’s ties to Philadelphia dated back to 1851.
 - Mr. Cantuzzi noted for the record the significant cost associated with maintaining the many buildings and facilities that were located on the school’s campus and expressed the owner’s serious concerns about the availability of resources.
 - Mr. Cantuzzi clarified that the Church of the Gesu is privately used by the school on approximately one dozen occasions throughout the year, primarily for school masses and events. He explained that the church was not open to the public or used as an operational parish.
 - Mr. Cantuzzi informed the Committee that the church building was physically integrated into the adjacent buildings. He noted that the entire roof had been replaced in 2005.
 - Mr. Cantuzzi also added that the property owner had concerns about the scope of the designation as proposed in the nomination because the parcel includes other buildings that are connected to the church.
- Mr. Cantuzzi stated that he had a document that he wanted to submit to the Committee that provided additional information about the school and its facilities.
 - Ms. Cooperman told Mr. Cantuzzi that the Committee could not accept the document because it had not been previously submitted to the Historical Commission staff and made available to the public. The Committee recommended that he retain the document and provide it to the Historical Commission.
 - Mr. Cantuzzi responded that the school did not initiate the nomination and has been scrambling to respond to it. He again noted that his client needed additional time to prepare for the review.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Patrick Grossi of the Preservation Alliance supported the nomination.
- David Traub of Save Our Sites supported the nomination.

- James Duffin of the Keeping Society supported the nomination but suggested that the property owner should be given an opportunity to understand the implications of designation.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The subject building was a fascinating example of the “colonization” of styles.
- The original Church of the Gesu in Rome is a part of a much larger complex surrounded by attached buildings, similar to the subject building.
- The building was an important and prominent landmark in the neighborhood therefore the Committee should consider adding Criterion H to its significance.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- Owing to its association with the prolific architect Edwin F. Durang, the building at 1734-54 W. Thompson Street satisfies Criteria A and E.
- The building exemplifies the High Victorian Baroque style of architecture, satisfying Criterion D.
- The building is an important and prominent landmark within its context, satisfying Criterion H.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 1734-54 W. Thompson Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, D, E, and H.

ITEM: 1734-54 W THOMPSON ST					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria A, D, E, and H					
MOVED BY: Lavery					
SECONDED BY: Mooney					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney	X				
Total	5				1

Mr. Mooney excused himself from the meeting.

ADDRESS: 917 S 47TH ST

Name of Resource: Saint Francis de Sales Church

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Archdiocese of Philadelphia

Nominator: Corey Loftus

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate Saint Francis de Sales Church, one building on a larger parcel at 917 S. 47th Street, and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the church, built between 1907 and 1911, satisfies Criteria for Designation A, D, E, F, H, and J. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that the church is associated with the lives of numerous persons of historic significance, including its designers, music directors, and parishioners. Under Criterion D, the nomination contends that the church building embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Byzantine Revival style. Under Criterion E, the nomination explains that the church building is a result of the work of many design professionals whose work has significantly influenced the historical and architectural development of the City, Commonwealth, or Nation, including Henry D. Dagit (architect), Nicola D'Ascenzo (stained glass) and Rafael Guastavino (tile artist and dome engineer). Under Criterion F, the nomination argues that the grand Guastavino dome contains elements of design, detail, materials and craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation. Under Criterion H, the nomination contends that the church with its great dome represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood. Lastly, under Criterion J, the nomination contends that the church's musical heritage associated with its organ, choirs, and music directors exemplifies the social and historical heritage of the community.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that Saint Francis de Sales Church at 917 S. 47th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, D, E, F, H, and J.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 01:19:45

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Chantry presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- No one represented the nomination or property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Cooperman commented that the staff informed Michael Phillips, the attorney representing the Archdiocese in designation matters, via email of the meeting date and time for this nomination.
- Ms. Chantry stated that a copy of an email from Annabelle Radcliffe-Trenner, the preservation architect who has worked on the restoration of the church for over 10 years, was included with the nomination materials. Ms. Chantry explained that the email outlines several minor technical corrections to the nomination and offers supplemental information.
 - The Committee discussed how to incorporate these minor technical corrections and determined that the recommendation to incorporate them into the final nomination could be part of its recommendation to the Commission, should the Committee recommend that the nomination satisfies one or more Criteria for Designation. The Committee also suggested that the staff work with Ms. Radcliffe-Trenner to incorporate the final architectural drawings

referenced in her email. The Committee agreed that the suggested edits are not substantive, and the nomination does not need to be rewritten.

- Ms. Cooperman commented that the designers should not be included under Criterion A for significance, but rather should be included under Criterion E.
 - Ms. Barucco commented that the Dagits almost transcend their architecture because of the length of their tenure as architects.
 - The Committee commented that the nomination includes a list of persons who are significant under Criterion A, but there is no information provided to explain their significance.
- Ms. Barucco asked about the musical heritage associated with Criterion J.
 - Mr. Laverty responded that the building would qualify for satisfaction of Criterion J even with the musical heritage removed.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

- Celeste Morello supported the designation.
- James Duffin of the Keeping Society supported the designation and suggested that Ms. Radcliffe-Trenner's edits could be incorporated as an addendum.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The nomination proposes only the designation of the church building with a small perimeter buffer, and not any other building on the parcel.
- The review of the nomination was continued and remanded to this Committee meeting by the Commission at its May 2019 meeting, at the request of Michael Phillips, the attorney representing the property owner.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The church building is associated with the lives of numerous persons of historic significance, including its music directors and parishioners, satisfying Criterion A.
- The building embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Byzantine Revival style, satisfying Criterion D.
- The building is a result of the work of many design professionals whose designs have significantly influenced the historical and architectural development of the city, Commonwealth, and nation, including Henry D. Dagit, Nicola D'Ascenzo and Rafael Guastavino, satisfying Criterion E.
- The grand Guastavino dome contains elements of design, detail, materials and craftsmanship which represent a significant innovation, satisfying Criterion F.
- The church building with its great dome represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, satisfying Criterion H.
- The church's musical heritage associated with its organ, choirs, and music directors exemplifies the social and historical heritage of the community, satisfying Criterion J.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that Saint Francis de Sales Church at 917 S. 47th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, D, E, F, H, and J, and that the proposed edits from Annabelle Radcliffe-Trenner should be included in the final nomination as an addendum.

ITEM: 917 S 47TH ST					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria A, D, E, F, H, and J					
MOVED BY: Laverty					
SECONDED BY: Milroy					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney					X
Total	4				2

ADDRESS: 808 S HUTCHINSON ST

Name of Resource: St. Paul’s Roman Catholic Church Rectory
 Proposed Action: Designation
 Property Owner: Archdiocese of Philadelphia
 Nominator: Celeste Morello
 Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the property at 808 S. Hutchinson Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the purpose-built rectory for St. Paul’s Roman Catholic Church satisfies Criteria for Designation A and D. The nomination contends that the Vicar General of the Archdiocese, Maurice A. Walsh, resided in the rectory from its construction in 1879 until his death in 1888, during which time he achieved much success with overseeing numerous activities of the Archdiocese, satisfying Criterion A. The nomination further argues that the building embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Second Empire style, satisfying Criterion D.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 01:31:25

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Chantry presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Celeste Morello represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Morello asked if the Archdiocese opposes the designation.
 - Ms. Cooperman responded that the staff received no communication from the property owner regarding this designation. She stated that Michael Phillips, the attorney representing the Archdiocese in designation matters, was informed via email of the meeting date and time for this nomination.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- St. Paul’s Roman Catholic Church was listed on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places in 1971. This nomination is for its rectory, which is on a separate parcel.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The Vicar General of the Archdiocese, Maurice A. Walsh, resided in the rectory from its construction in 1879 until his death in 1888, during which time he achieved much success with overseeing numerous activities of the Archdiocese, satisfying Criterion A.
- The building embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Second Empire style, satisfying Criterion D.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the property at 808 S. Hutchinson Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and D.

ITEM: 808 S HUTCHINSON ST					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria A and D					
MOVED BY: Barucco					
SECONDED BY: Laverty					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney					X
Total	4				2

ADDRESS: 1501 S 10TH ST

Name of Resource: Church of the Annunciation Roman Catholic Church

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: Rev John V Tolino Pastor, Roman Catholic

Nominator: Celeste Morello

Staff Contact: Kim Chantry, kim.chantry@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate the church building at 1501 S. 10th Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. The nomination contends that the former Church of the Annunciation Roman Catholic Church, now known as Annunciation BVM Church, satisfies Criteria for Designation D and H. Under Criterion D, the nomination argues that the church, which opened in 1863, embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Gothic Revival style. Under Criterion H, the nomination contends that Annunciation is one of very few large, Gothic Revival buildings in this area of South Philadelphia, and therefore represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that the church building at 1501 S. 10th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D and H.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 01:34:25

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Chantry presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.

- Celeste Morello represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Cooperman commented that the staff received no communication from the property owner regarding this designation. She stated that Michael Phillips, the attorney representing the Archdiocese in designation matters, was informed via email of the meeting date and time for this nomination.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The Church of the Annunciation Roman Catholic Church was constructed in 1863.
- The carpports at the far east of the property are considered non-contributing for the purposes of the nomination.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The church building embodies distinguishing characteristics of the Gothic Revival style, satisfying Criterion D.
- The church building is one of very few large, Gothic Revival buildings in this area of South Philadelphia, and therefore represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, satisfying Criterion H.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that the church building at 1501 S. 10th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation D and H.

ITEM: 1501 S 10TH ST					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria D and H					
MOVED BY: Barucco					
SECONDED BY: Laverty					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Laverty	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney					X
Total	4				2

ADDRESS: 1001-19 N 5TH ST

Name of Resource: St. Peter the Apostle Roman Catholic Church

Proposed Action: Designation

Property Owner: St. Peters Roman Catholic Church

Nominator: Celeste Morello

Staff Contact: Meredith Keller, meredith.keller@phila.gov, 215-686-7660

OVERVIEW: This nomination proposes to designate St. Peter the Apostle Roman Catholic Church at 1001-19 N. 5th Street and list it on the Philadelphia Register of Historic Places. While the larger parcel includes several buildings, the nomination proposes to designate the church building exclusively. The nomination contends that the building satisfies Criteria for Designation A and E. Under Criterion A, the nomination argues that St. John Neumann, the first male saint in the United States, who is enshrined at the site, is significant for his role in establishing the country's parochial school system as well as the hospitals that evolved into the St. Francis health system. Under Criterion E, the nomination contends that the church building was reconstructed in 1895 according to designs by prolific Philadelphia architect Edwin Forrest Durang.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: The staff recommends that the nomination demonstrates that St. Peter the Apostle Roman Catholic Church located at 1001-19 N. 5th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A and E.

START TIME OF DISCUSSION IN AUDIO RECORDING: 01:36:24

PRESENTERS:

- Ms. Keller presented the nomination to the Committee on Historic Designation.
- Celeste Morello represented the nomination.
- No one represented the property owner.

DISCUSSION:

- Ms. Morello stated that she forgot to include in the nomination that the architecture of this church served as the model for later buildings on the site and that those buildings all coordinate in material and style with the Durang design. She noted that the Saint John Neumann Center and an old printing factory were more recently designed to resemble the church.
- Ms. Cooperman suggested that Criterion H be applied to the property.
 - Other Committee members agreed.
- Ms. Milroy questioned why the main façade was placed on 5th Street and not on Girard Avenue, which would be considered the more important street.
 - Ms. Morello responded that the original church at that location faced 5th Street.
 - Ms. Milroy conjectured that the church must have followed the existing property lines.
 - Ms. Morello noted that Durang built further out toward 5th Street, adding that she does not know whether there were trolley tracks on 5th Street or Girard Avenue that impacted the church's location.
 - Mr. Laverty asserted that there would have been horse-drawn trolley lines on 5th Street as early as the late 1850s and that they would have been electrified around 1895, about the time the Durang-designed church was constructed.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION FINDINGS & CONCLUSIONS:

The Committee on Historic Designation found that:

- The church building was reconstructed in 1895 according to designs by prolific Philadelphia architect Edwin Forrest Durang.

The Committee on Historic Designation concluded that:

- The church building is associated with Saint John Neumann, who was instrumental in establishing the country’s parochial school system, satisfying Criterion A.
- The building was designed by prolific Philadelphia architect Edwin Forrest Durang, satisfying Criterion E.
- The massive stone structure, situated prominently on the corner of Girard Avenue and 5th Street, is visible from a significant distance, satisfying Criterion H.

COMMITTEE ON HISTORIC DESIGNATION RECOMMENDATION: The Committee on Historic Designation voted to recommend that the nomination demonstrates that St. Peter the Apostle Roman Catholic Church located at 1001-19 N. 5th Street satisfies Criteria for Designation A, E, and H.

ITEM: 1001-19 N 5TH ST					
MOTION: Designate, Criteria A, E, and H					
MOVED BY: Lavery					
SECONDED BY: Milroy					
VOTE					
Committee Member	Yes	No	Abstain	Recuse	Absent
Emily Cooperman, chair	X				
Suzanna Barucco	X				
Jeff Cohen					X
Bruce Lavery	X				
Elizabeth Milroy	X				
Douglas Mooney					X
Total	4				2

ADJOURNMENT

The Committee on Historic Designation adjourned at 11:15 a.m.

PLEASE NOTE:

- Minutes of the Committee on Historic Designation are presented in action format. Additional information is available in the audio recording for this meeting. The start time for each agenda item in the recording is noted.

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION

§14-1004. Designation.

(1) Criteria for Designation.

A building, complex of buildings, structure, site, object, or district may be designated for preservation if it:

- (a) Has significant character, interest, or value as part of the development, heritage, or cultural characteristics of the City, Commonwealth, or nation or is associated with the life of a person significant in the past;
- (b) Is associated with an event of importance to the history of the City, Commonwealth or Nation;
- (c) Reflects the environment in an era characterized by a distinctive architectural style;
- (d) Embodies distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style or engineering specimen;
- (e) Is the work of a designer, architect, landscape architect or designer, or professional engineer whose work has significantly influenced the historical, architectural, economic, social, or cultural development of the City, Commonwealth, or nation;
- (f) Contains elements of design, detail, materials, or craftsmanship that represent a significant innovation;
- (g) Is part of or related to a square, park, or other distinctive area that should be preserved according to a historic, cultural, or architectural motif;
- (h) Owing to its unique location or singular physical characteristic, represents an established and familiar visual feature of the neighborhood, community, or City;
- (i) Has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in pre-history or history; or
- (j) Exemplifies the cultural, political, economic, social, or historical heritage of the community.