

PUBLIC MEETING 2 – TUESDAY, AUGUST 20TH, 2019
REFINERY ADVISORY GROUP – COMMUNITY COMMITTEE
SUMMARY OF PUBLIC FEEDBACK

This document summarizes the feedback received from the public during the Community Committee meeting. The format of this meeting involved small, facilitated group discussions with notes of each discussion recorded by staff. The small group discussions sought feedback around a common set of focus questions. This document provides a summary of all feedback raised in response to these questions, and also breaks out that feedback by discussion group. This document aims to reflect the comments that were written down as accurately as possible, but does not represent a verbatim transcript of all comments raised during the meeting.

COMBINED SUMMARY OF FEEDBACK

This summary intends to capture the comments gathered in the small group discussions into consolidated lists. When groups offered substantially similar comments, the number of groups that offered those comments is shown in parentheses.

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Staying a refinery will be great for the community
- Refinery is great for local economy/local businesses (3)
- Taxes/revenue: \$6 million wage tax; fine money; Taxes generated by the refinery help support other City programs, not just what is local to the refinery; tax revenue – city, state, and federal (4)
- PES provides 40% of east coast/northeast petroleum products (2)
- Less reliance on imports – national security issue/ can't depend on foreign oil (3)

- Employment: More than 1,000 jobs lost; 2,000 people work there per shift – impacts other unions and their ability to earn a living; retain jobs (6)
- Indirect impact; 36,000 jobs were employed directly or indirectly through various related services; ripple effect; employment/unemployment rate; 1:18 jobs; care about jobs (6)
- Continued use as a refinery would be detrimental to the health of the community; public health – respiratory impacts, cost of treatment, particularly for seniors and children; increased eye problems and asthma ER visits; community health concerns; public health issues (7)
- Pollution of air, soil, water; toxic air emissions; bad air quality; air contamination, further contaminate the environment; plant itself an issue due to environmental toxins; single largest air polluter in City; air and water quality; environmental contamination; smog (10)
- Continue to violate national ambient air quality standards
- Cancer, asthma, heart disease; long term health effects; continued health effects; breathing (5)
- There is a potential buyer
- Philadelphia area childhood asthma rate double the national average
- Smells/odors. Have to use towels to block them out. (2)
- Deaths; nobody was truthful about the harm the refinery did to the community – let people die (2)
- Who is interested in purchasing the refinery?
- Lack of knowledge about what's on site; awareness of dangerous chemicals used - HF (2)
- City should take the property by eminent domain (2)
- Refinery people should be in attendance
- The attendance is not representative of the community
- Lack of transparency; need transparency for workers and community; no communication from PES historically; don't send out information (4)
- No trust in PES. Trust in new operator?
- More worried about money than people's lives.
- No action from City; why isn't the city/owners concerned about contamination? (2)
- Houses are too close
- Think about the kids/next generation
- Burglaries related to unemployment
- Employees feel it's a safe environment to work in and live near; in best interest to keep it safe/strong workforce committed to safety; we operate safely; been here 70 years, not dead yet; safe place to work with employee wellness checks (5).
- All donations from refinery would cease; no blood drive
- Refinery can still run without one unit – there are 30 units; refinery still operable even after the fire – that unit can be shut down and the plant can still operate (2).

- Concern of more fires if remaining a refinery; impact of future explosion on life; danger – explosions, more disasters (4).
- People are uninformed about the situation; misperception by community of how things work/safety, etc. inside refinery (2).
- Lack of accountability of PES to the community; need for PES to get involved (2).
- Effects of oil and gas on climate change; look for alternative energy; 10 year window to slow climate change; fossil fuels = mass death of humans due to climate change; climate change contribution; issues for climate change and flooding (7).
- Community/City being responsible for cleanup, not the company.
- Price/cost of living increase for oil and gas users; lower gas/oil/diesel prices. (2)
- Cost of health care due to increase in health hazards; medical cost to neighbors, family die from cancer (2)
- Hydrofluoric Acid waste and healthy waste clean-up
- Products made at the refinery
- Keep refinery safe with skilled workers; highly trained workforce – retain safety; safety of workers; safety for everyone; training/response to explosion fit/exceeded need per event (5)
- New management (oil company); would have a financially responsible owner; owned by an oil company, not banking or venture capital (3)
- Continuous improvement
- Refinery not in Gulf area; reliance on domestic oil (southern refineries have hurricanes) (2)
- Refinery does community outreach
- Facility is old; is the refinery technology old? What has been updated? (2)
- Environmental contamination and risks – HF, carbon, particulates; need to clean property; more use of HF (should be banned) (3)
- How long and how much money needed to recondition for safety
- Closing refinery leads to less environmentally friendly production overseas to satisfy loss in production. Imports vs. exports; standards are higher and known in the USA vs. imports (2)
- Operate in a safe, reliable, environmentally sound manner; safety protocols/exposure controls in place; safe/healthy operation (2)
- Bad state of mind
- How does it fit into Mayor's commitment to transition to green economy? This is not necessarily at odds with economic growth.
- Utility for city – electricity
- Perception of refinery as environmentally unfriendly or a hazard that should go away
- Been there over 100 years, should continue to operate; no issues (2)
- What else can they do with it? Can't be houses or park.

- Those jobs are toxic
- Pays no local taxes – no money going back to schools from one of the largest pieces of land in city
- Chemicals are chemicals, how could it be better?
- Want to keep my job but also listen to community concerns
- Feel like community not listening to us (the workers)
- Feel that refinery operations work well in isolating it from community.
- No direct lawsuits due to health issues.
- Cost to move/relocate is an issue
- Community was not notified at time of incident – families were outdoors.
- Who will clean up the acid to make the community safe? Who’s responsibility?
- Votes
- Support local businesses
- Good site – recycles water
- On-site emergency care
- Location – airport, water, TWIC cards
- Need more information about the oil underground
- If vacant, would allow for Superfund EPA monitoring
- More educate/jobs/schools are needed to help inform safe refinery/industrial uses
- Oil will always be in “someone’s back yard”
- Contamination outside site
- Bad for Philadelphia’s reputation and image
- Decrease investment in the City
- More use of other lethal chemicals in an urban space
- Decrease in property values
- Bad first impression from PHL and I-95
- Missed opportunity to turn a negative into a positive
- We shouldn’t let Phil Rinaldi “back on the scene” or have involvement going forward
- Who becomes responsible for cleanup and remediation?
- Lets PES and Sunoco off the hook for higher standards of site cleanup
- Workforce doesn’t reflect local neighborhoods or local residents; no jobs from neighborhood (2)
- Constitutional right to breathe clean air
- No jobs for the people working there now

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Maintaining as a refinery should be taken off the table
- If it remains a refinery, it should use higher quality equipment/chemicals/facilities; less volatile chemicals (3)

- Get rid of fossil fuels
- Ensure different stakeholders are at the same table
- City should make a commitment to green energy and health of people in the community.
- Can natural gas be used?
- Jobs – at refinery and in neighborhood; jobs (3)
- PES had a Community Action Team that actively sought employees from the local community.
- Workers should be getting back pay.
- Use of a safer method to clean up material.
- Safer refinery to provide jobs and tax money; more investment in safeguards; need to put things into place to protect the neighborhood so people don't continue to be harmed/die (3).
- Use land for solar energy; solar on vacant lots; solar and green options for family safety. (3)
- Use workers to help clean up.
- Keep open dialogue with the community; more community outreach from the refinery (2)
- Neutralize acid – alternatives to HF; HF stored offsite; should HF be allowed back into refinery? (4)
- Convert to non-HF with carbon capture
- Add some renewables – commitment to future; meet renewable fuel standards
- Accountable to existing regulations; go to great lengths to meet EPA and other standards (2)
- Continued maintenance
- Sustain operations for long-term outcomes with ownership invested in that; better owners may be better neighbors (2)
- Keeping costs down for heating and fuel (2)
- Continued support for community businesses – indirect employment (lunches, supplies, etc.)
- If refinery stays, there needs to be an environmental justice expert to monitor and review impacts in neighborhood
- There can be efforts to decontaminate the site while developing solar options
- Retain people living in Philadelphia who work at the refinery
- Revenue
- Economic growth from products
- Employees consuming in neighborhood
- Refined oil goes to Europe
- Cost/tax/safety of transport/trains
- Financial support of community

- Reparations to residents for health impacts; free testing for mental and physical health risks for neighbors; asthma and cancer – support those who are sick (2)
- Environmental remediation; clean up – even as a refinery – to protect public health (2)
- PES should pay for all damages
- Improve working conditions
- Workers must be a priority
- Immediate community must be a priority
- Additional regulations/permits e.g. limits on quantity; regulate pollution better; reevaluate EPA limits; enforcement of laws at every level possible (3)
- Pensions for employees that were laid off
- Emergency response and communication plan must be improved; prepare people better in case of emergency/explosion – alerts, instructions, organization (2)
- Re-hire laid off workers
- Collect public health and pollution data to determine environmental impact – preferably independent research.
- Study should be done to assess the damage done to area, including neighborhood surrounding (soil, air pollution, etc).
- Access to information related to standards and what the refinery does to meet regulations; more communication of what best practices are in the refinery to protect health and environment (2)
- Update the refinery to where it needs to be; need an investor interested in making it a quality operation (2)
- City should hold owner accountable for worker compensation/legal/non-compliance
- Make productive the underutilized space
- Material from refinery should go to productive uses, like roads
- Management should take employee suggestions to improve/modify/adjust
- Invested in union cooperation
- Fire safety training
- Not being an “independent” refinery
- The Renewable Fuel Energy Act takes money out of the state
- Better capitalized
- Should be worker controlled, they should determine regulations and how it’s run
- Include community in all findings and decisions in real time with city officials.
- Have more air pollution monitors for faster readings and response. Focus them in communities in close proximity – upwind and downwind. User friendly website with daily air monitoring info; air monitoring in community and along fence line paid for by refinery (2)
- Emergency safe shelters and transportation for affected community members.
- Education for the community

- Community-based organizations need big oil – know how to profit from safe operations
- There needs to be an assessment of contamination before any reuse including refinery.
- More training needed for near neighbors and refinery workers
- Before any reuse there needs to be a transparent climate resilience plan
- Public inspections should be provided if it stays a refinery.
- Emissions – federal program Title 5 awareness
- More monitoring; better monitoring needed (2)
- Safety drills for public/community if it stays a refinery
- Public participation before starting again – transparent process
- Modernize to mitigate impacts; chance to require updated equipment to meet emissions and air quality standards (2)
- AMS and higher fines, Act 2
- Negotiate local hiring requirement with new owners and/or unions
- Chance to ban use of lethal chemicals

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Air quality has improved since refinery has closed
- PES should pay to remediate the site for future generations; PES must clean up first (2)
- The City should sue PES if necessary
- Control air and water quality as the site is cleaned up. Will contaminants resurface/be exposed during clean-up?; airborne pollution if soil is disturbed is an issue (2)
- Additional traffic and transportation volume that would be needed for other uses could be a problem; 34th and Grays Ferry traffic; increased traffic (4)
- Still would be a contaminated site, still must be cleaned up
- City would benefit.
- Tax revenue
- Employment/jobs; next industry could hire fewer people; number and types of jobs – some like solar may only be temporary; will jobs pay the same?; retention of existing jobs; less jobs (6)
- Millions of dollars in revenue that impacts the whole city. Trickle-down affects the whole economy.
- Solar industry

- Contaminated site/remediation; industrial clean-up would be extensive and take long; concern about how long it would take to get another use up and running; long timeline; time to convert it into something else; time – not a near-case scenario (6)
- Opportunity cost of time spent to clean.
- Reduction of workforce, pay and taxes in solar industry; solar panels – one-time jobs, no taxes; solar field reuse – employment is low (3)
- Expensive material in solar industry
- Not that simple to have clean-up. Lots of pollutants.
- If used for solar, the company takes the risk and makes the investment.
- If used for solar, no excavation necessary.
- Not totally independent of oil and gas; continued burning of fossil fuels and health risks (2).
- What clean-up investment would be required and who pays; who will accept responsibility to clean it?; Would remediation make a difference?; Who is going to pay for it? (4)
- Really don't know until environmental survey is done. Needs to be a clean-up site before it becomes anything else; because contamination is so bad, this is a premature issue (2)
- Loss of resources
- Affordability if property values increase; higher property taxes (2)
- Harder to answer without knowing who and what and how long
- Tanks/fuel terminal
- Tank fields/storage will create issues for reuse
- Port expansion
- Co-gen power plant
- Clean energy use
- New use, new problems
- Sea level rise concerns; need to consider flooding, storm surges – area could be used to mitigate flooding and protect residents (3)
- Pollution and airborne emissions; addressing climate crisis and pollution (2)
- Other working conditions
- Culture of surrounding neighborhood
- Similar issues/threats as first scenario; other high-impact uses will find land appealing (2)
- Wouldn't make similar tax contribution; less income and wage taxes (2)
- Concentrate on non-fossil fuel uses to avoid making a bad situation worse
- What are the long term affects? Fear of health issues perpetuated without knowing affects.
- Proximity to airport – solar reflectance issues?

- Economic impact to the community and state, compared to that of a refinery, would be worse; less money into local economy (2)
- Difficult for any other industrial use
- Containing pollution and toxins; release of pollutants (2)
- What are the stages of cleanup? What are the obstacles and time table for cleanup?
- Warehousing requires cleanup
- Burn at night? Same at day or night
- Voluntary cleanup won't happen/site will not get cleaned up. Who will clean it? How will it get clean?
- Change in ownership – new zoning?
- City influence as neighbor
- Would it be safe?

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Renewable energy; manufacturing renewables (4).
- Clean energy; windmills/solar; geothermal (14)
- Remove soil, put barrier down, put in new soil; clean land and soil for future use (2)
- Options for City ownership – e.g. eminent domain, PES signs over land, make site part of city inventory.
- Control air quality and have experts inform the public every day about air quality, risk of explosion
- PES should rebuild the pipes
- PES workers should be compensated – both union and nonunion
- Job training for the neighborhood funded by PES
- Job training opportunity; incentivize training for new roles within city (2)
- Health treatment for residents and workers
- Regular inspections
- Bioremediation
- Possibly less polluting
- Better management
- Mix of uses; combination of several uses; option to combine uses (energy generation and remediation, for example) (3)
- Revolving uses
- Keep the skilled workers employed in similar work – LNG, biofuels, what else?
- Jobs in other industries, even with similar roles, would not pay as well as the refinery.
- Jobs in converting process
- Oil storage – jobs with fewer air/environmental impacts; tank farm (2)

- None will give equivalent tax base.
- Eco-friendly products
- Expanded treatment plant
- Repair trust
- City prestige
- Emergency plans – predict emergencies and have plans ready
- Better rules about cleanup and education/info about requirements
- Make data available
- Transparent process so we know what’s on that site today and a way to communicate that to neighbors.
- Local hiring
- Evaluate site for sea level rise
- Make equity central to use, development, hiring, and community engagement
- Biofuels
- Trash to steam (2)
- Co-generator
- Remediation (2)
- Hold refinery accountable to clean up site – start somewhere, incremental approach; enforce cleanup by PES/Sunoco (2)
- Can refinery workers be paid to do clean-up work?; propose that workers handle the grounds clean-up since they are most familiar with the site (2)
- Most people in Grays Ferry, Point Breeze, and Southwest are not certified for industrial jobs – need to train people.
- Upgrade safety of site to neighborhood, less hazardous materials
- Holyoke, MA budgeted \$100,000 to work with residents around what kind of industry is acceptable – do this.
- If it’s another industry, should be renewable energy production with a just transition for people previously employed in fossil fuels.
- Community and City need to be much more involved in whatever industry would be there. Refinery has their lobbyists/advocates, need that on the other end.
- Take advantage to switch from fossil fuel to green energy
- Sustainable energy training facility/program for energy conversion for current and new workers.
- Level area, demolish buildings. Don’t disturb soil.
- Natural gas uses – it is cleaner
- Remediation site training facility/training to remediate sites
- Living learning lab – bring in EPA, state, research to educate how to clean up superfund sites. Use current workers who know the industry to help educate, and clean through training and education. This would test cleaning strategies, and employ people to help remediate the site over time.
- Dangers of site need to be known before any reuse is proposed

- Opportunity for growth through remediation and resettlement
- Rail lines
- Riverfront
- Views
- Highway access
- Future trail access
- Could be used as a special zone for climate mitigation and habitat (including human) restoration
- Can require setback from river and create flood mitigation along the site
- Any use (or non-use) is better than continued fossil fuel use
- Bring Amazon or other storage site
- Start fresh with getting the community involved

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- City should keep testing/fining; continuous monitoring (4)
- Clean up (or not)?; clean up needed (2)
- Who controls contamination? Who monitors it? How is the community getting the information?
- If there are no jobs, who would police and monitor the land?
- Sea level rise – must contain/remove contaminants; flooding, other accidents (2)
- How will the City oversee the dismantling to protect the community?
- Can City explore using eminent domain to get land?
- Can Philly become an example for the world when dealing with similar things?
- Cannot safely do much because it would be a Superfund site.
- Will take at least 20 years to clean for other uses.
- No jobs; loss of employment opportunities; fewer jobs; workers have no jobs or payouts; job loss – not acceptable to lose jobs with no alternative (8)
- No tax revenue for the City; less tax money/increase in taxes citywide; loss of tax revenue; no revenue or taxes (5)
- Lost revenue for community
- City will then be responsible for clean-up
- Loss of usage of the river.
- Increase imports of oil/gas
- Would actually be costly for taxpayers; cost to city for security and testing; dump cost on the city, taxpayers would pay (3)
- Schools and city services impacted
- Too long for the soil to turn over.
- Worse for the environment; degradation and pollution (2).

- Residual contamination; chemicals in ground water; underground/water issues; would still be toxic (4)
- Could be something worse.
- No more community involvement from refinery employees
- Businesses would be hurt without an open refinery – local food, restaurants, etc.; loss of local businesses that support the refinery; small business losing revenue (3)
- Employees have received job offers to different cities. Many are lifelong residents. City would lose revenue from relocated families; loss of expertise – people will move, including those who work for the contractors/businesses that service the refinery (2)
- Employees have to cut back on personal expenses
- Employees have to sell homes, no vacations.
- 1,300 acres of brownfield site.
- Flooding; hazards – flooding and water runoff issues; could be a flood zone (3).
- Overrun of cats, rats, deer, geese, pests, rabies, etc.; possible vermin issue (4)
- Impact to local wildlife
- Commodities prices go up; higher cost of living (2)
- Old equipment/tanks resulting in a more dangerous environment.
- Homelessness (2)
- Negative impact on property values (2).
- Eyesore; eyesore to community; eyesore continues (5).
- Unsafe/magnet for crime; drug dealers; attract nuisances/drug use; drugs/illicit activity (4)
- Possible illegal dumping
- Where is accountability?
- If refinery is not active, no one is cleaning the water before it gets to the river.
- Who will pay for remediation?; cost of remediation (2)
- Not shutting down properly – chemicals in the pipes have potential to crack if nobody is there to run the boiler house.
- Higher poverty levels
- Harder to clean up later
- Vacant homes if workers move; people may move; everyone leaves (3)
- Property tax raised on homeowners
- Will be vacant for years
- Maintaining flood walls
- Safety
- Remediate to mitigate a no-use scenario
- Do not feel confident the refinery company will mitigate hazard of a prolonged no-use scenario (units/pipes/drainage)

- Theft/scavengers for materials; vandalism, concerns of trespass; scrapping/vandalism, liability of trespassing (3)
- Nature will take its course, increases in contamination will stop. Could lead way to making it a greenspace.
- Has to be brought back to life. Economically we would be in bad shape if not.
- There's no reason why it should be vacant, companies need to be forced by City to pay for cleanup. Concern that city will ultimately make taxpayers pay.
- Don't know if it won't become a refinery again in the future.
- Worst case scenario for City
- No opportunity – benefits no one!
- What is the process to get land permitted/zoned for other use?
- Leaving it vacant will cause deterioration. No use and possibly more hazards to happen with lack of presence and care; further decline (2)
- Bad for neighbors
- No air pollution – unless it deteriorates
- Taxes being paid in vacancy?
- Loss of jobs, wage, and property taxes
- City should use this much available land

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Take care of displaced workers; workers first in process (2)
- Community Advisory Board; community process (2)
- Safety mechanisms.
- Where is all of PES' money going to go?
- City needs to hold someone accountable; have previous owners of refinery pay to clean up site – make accountable; full resources from local, federal, and state to go after Sunoco/PES (3)
- What do people do in the mean time when they've lost their jobs?
- No gas/oil production; no more pollutants; quicker clean-up of land.
- Carbon capture
- Improved public health in the neighborhood
- None
- Not in our lifetime being reused
- Just transition – better energy; stop fossil fuels; no carbon emissions (2)
- Health and safety over profits
- Stop pollution in air and water; wouldn't pollute more (2)
- Remediation should account for storm surge
- Ecosystem comes back
- Securing the property

- Involve the community and laid-off workers in caretaking and “citizen science” – monitoring conditions
- Look at parceling off segments for sale
- People closest to refinery – workers – are experts and should be involved in addressing this scenario
- Even if it shuts down, someone needs to pay up to the community – pay for affordable housing to be built elsewhere in the neighborhood. More training for other areas of employment for the neighborhood.
- Incredible opportunity to build solar
- Act 2 – environmental laws that would force Sunoco to clean up even though they are not current owners. Required public participation process that they have not done.
- Working people should not pay for this. Have lowest minimum wage in country, corporations have billions.
- Opportunity to re-imagine the site for something other than refinery
- Opportunity to see if health issues improve without refinery.
- As long as there is a plan for remediation it can stay vacant/no issue with refinery staying vacant with ongoing monitoring and reporting to community, make info public.
- Area should definitely be considered for employment options
- Remediate for mixed use/park
- Dismantle and reuse the material on site/up cycle
- Rezone site for less industrial uses to not allow for any further refinery
- Jobs to be options to help dismantle, using local knowledge
- Ensure harmful chemicals are not left behind
- Whole-system remediation
- Intentional use while vacant
- Still better than a petroleum site
- Could be used for art or sculpture or festivals or similar
- Use eminent domain to make decisions

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Earth can be cleaned
- Plant trees; forest reclaimed; forestry (4)
- Green space
- Evaluate extent of contamination
- Find less polluted alternatives
- Turn it into a park/park similar to Central Park; Fairmount Park South (4)

- Greenery/park with clear action plan
- Wetlands
- Levees
- Mushrooms to absorb toxins in soil
- New company using cleaner methods and energy
- Clean-up companies
- Research other global/national companies that we can imitate and learn from.
- Provide retraining of workers for jobs outside of gas and oil.
- Using those same skills in other industries.
- Usage of river trails
- Reuse land (ex: Navy Yard) for multiple uses/businesses; mixed use development in all aspects (2).
- Research opportunities from schools/universities
- Universities/academic use
- Refinery AND alternative energy
- Waterfront housing
- Rocket launch pad
- Other jobs in the fuel industry
- Improved air quality
- Renewable energy/solar energy/wind (5)
- Increase in nearby property values
- Community input opportunities; community input on what would be built (2)
- Green economy
- Clean energy; industrial production facility for green energy (2)
- Amazon/Walmart distribution
- Airport expansion
- Land remediation
- Trash to steam
- Recycling center
- Affordable housing; public housing post-remediation (2)
- Job training site; training (2)
- Schools/hospitals
- Eco friendly products
- Natural gas export
- No other use is suitable
- Bioremediation; remediation – organic/bio (3)
- Nuclear fusion plant
- Investment by fossil fuel company
- Increased economic potential
- Research facility
- Amusement park

- Predict sea level rise; sensitive to sea level rise (2)
- City services locate here? Bus depots, garages, etc.
- People cannot reside here
- Re-wild – storm surge/flooding buffer
- Corridor for tech/startups
- Worker ownership of whatever happens/refinery working with community to achieve.
- Want it to stay as-is, owner should be forced to upgrade it. City has to force it.
- City and state funding for planning process where residents get to vet proposals
- Something family and senior-friendly. Outdoor space, recreation opportunities; playground (2)
- Repurpose clean parts of the 1,400 acres for green space and recreational activities
- Look at other cities (Gas Works Park in Seattle) to see how these issues were handled and turned around.
- This site should never be used as a refinery ever again! Will leave with family.
- Cleaner sites have had a tougher time adapting to another use
- If changed, it will never get cleaned up, and city/government will get the bill
- Museum – studies for brownfield redevelopment
- Energy redevelopment center focused on the site's history/culture, EPA remediation documents, education and training
- Oyster-tecture
- Non-food agriculture
- Naturally dead animal enzyme
- Zoning can change existing use
- Recognize Native American heritage
- Connect FDR and Bartram's
- To be phased: designate site for climate mitigation and habitat restoration in a way that still requires PES and Sunoco to clean it; upon closure and during deconstruction, plant quick growing hedges around site perimeter to control sediment and erosion; low maintenance/low investment/high quality opportunity for urban forests and wetlands; higher cost/higher quality solar farm on top of remediating grasses, no permanent structures to allow future flexibility
- Something like the Viaduct Park or High Line in New York
- Something else to create more jobs
- Show the world how Philly could create green energy jobs

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- What is the legacy cost of the refinery?
- What is the impact on the health of residents?
- Concern of loss of jobs
- How will the City hold PES accountable?; go after PES (2)
- What is the status of the air today?
- What is the refinery going to do to compensate the community for medical conditions?
- What is the possibility of solar panels going there?
- When will the City turn green?; refinery not in line with City sustainability goals (2)
- This was a choice to close.
- They (PES) wants the \$1.6 billion in insurance
- More than half the refinery could still be running today.
- Where is all of this input going?
- Misunderstanding of smoke vs. steam.
- Smooth transition for permitting for a new owner
- Action needs to be expedited – it gets worse the longer it sits; timing is important for jobs/run it safely. Decisions need to be made (2)
- Carlyle payout
- Owned by investors who don't know the industry – City should review qualifications of new buyers.
- Workers have been given no severance and no medical – just one month's notice after 25 years.
- Workers unable to apply for COBRA
- As time goes on, it will be harder to get qualified workers back into the operations.
- Major loss of a customer for key suppliers.
- Viable options need to be presented with accurate estimate of time, cost, feasibility study
- USW 2013 report on need to close HF plants
- There needs to be more of “tonight” – public outreach and info; wider public outreach for this committee (2)
- More back and forth dialogue
- Follow up/report out of data/information to public
- Another meeting for community response
- How can we have more conversation between community and labor? We're not enemies; break silos (environmental groups, neighbors, union workers, etc). (2)

- Even this meeting wasn't publicized the way it should have been, need a meeting in Grays Ferry
- This is all reactive, why didn't this conversation happen sooner?; Have been asking for this for 2 years, no response from City. Could have been prevented.
- People on the advisory committee are all big business, oil and gas industry.
- City has power of eminent domain
- Mistrust of City to be willing to stand up to corporations and demand they rehab; stand up to energy companies not let them open another refinery. Will only happen with a mass movement, people taking to the streets.
- Lung cancer epidemic due to dump sites and pollution. Getting something done takes too long. People lose faith over time to fight and correct issues.
- Timeline of report – need more time. Too short. Need a year or more for this type of report.
- Too complicated for a several month process, we don't know full contamination impact
- Who is the decision maker?
- What does this report do?
- City should rezone site, what options do we have?
- Can City Council use their prerogative to prevent future fossil fuel uses?
- Look at what happened with Delaware City refinery
- City image coming from airport/NJ
- Communication needs to happen. More outreach.
- More transparency – public access to monitoring, periodic reporting
- Recompense for damages
- “Alarm system”
- Enforce PA Constitution Environmental Rights amendment
- Is there a chance that a new operator of a petroleum site could bring HF back to the site?
- Need to focus on the danger posed to 1.1 million Philadelphia residents, not loss of 1,000 jobs.
- Need to look for innovative industrial/manufacturing opportunities to replace lost jobs, not replace the same jobs. Needs to be a priority.
- Need a quieter meeting space.

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

- Through existing community assets – churches, wards, friends groups, block captains
- Social media – Facebook, City Council, Mayor's Office
- Regular press conferences
- Local news

- Why didn't elected officials publicize? City didn't publicize to neighbors
- Don't rush process people will get left out.
- Why meetings back to back?
- Get email addresses for listserv
- Word of mouth
- Have more speakers
- Better venue

GROUP-SPECIFIC SUMMARY OF FEEDBACK

The following section represents the feedback gathered during each of the small group discussions. Group numbers were assigned at random based on the order in which the paper sheets containing the discussion notes were typed. Group sizes varied in their number of participants. Comments/notes that were not related or relevant to the discussion topics were not included.

GROUP 1

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Refinery people should be in attendance
- The attendance is not representative of the community
- Who is interested in purchasing the refinery?
- City should take property by eminent domain
- Continued use as a refinery would be detrimental to the health of the community - pollutes air, soil, water
- Cancer, pollution, asthma, heart disease
- More worried about money than people's lives.
- Lack of transparency
- Epidemic of cancer
- Refinery is the "silent killer"
- Lack of knowledge about what's on the site.
- No action from City
- Too many people have died.
- Smell

- People around the world are fighting for the same things.
- Think about the kids.
- Houses are too close.
- How long will the community have to live if the refinery reopens?

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Maintaining as a refinery should be taken off the table.
- If it remains a refinery, should use higher quality equipment/chemicals
- Get rid of fossil fuels – it's a killer
- Ensure different stakeholders are at the same table
- City making a commitment to green energy and health of people in the community

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Air quality has improved since refinery has closed.
- PES should pay to remediate the site for future generations.
- The City should sue PES if necessary.
- Control air and water quality as the site is cleaned up. Will contaminants resurface/be exposed during cleanup?
- 34th and Grays Ferry traffic.
- Concern of more fires if remaining a refinery.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Renewable energy.
- Remove soil, put barrier down, put in new soil.
- Options for City ownership – e.g. eminent domain, PES signs over land, make site another part of the City.
- Solar panels
- Control air quality and have experts inform the public every day about air quality and risk of explosion.
- PES should rebuild the pipes.
- PES workers should be compensated – both union and nonunion.
- Job training for the neighborhood funded by PES.
- Health treatment for residents and workers.
- Regular inspections.
- Bioremediation.

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- City should keep testing/fining.
- Who controls contamination? Who monitors it? How is the community getting the information?
- Sea level rise – must contain/remove contaminants.
- How will the City oversee the dismantling to protect the community?
- Can City explore using eminent domain to get land?
- Can Philly become an example for the world when dealing with similar things?

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Take care of displaced workers.
- Community Advisory Board
- Safety mechanisms.

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Turn it into a park.
- Wetland
- Levees

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- What is the legacy cost of the refinery?
- What is the impact on the health of residents?
- How will the City hold PES accountable?
- What is the status of the air today?
- What is the refinery going to do to compensate the community for medical conditions?
- What is the possibility of solar panels going there?
- When will the City turn green?

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

- Through existing community assets – churches, wards, friends groups, block captains.

GROUP 2

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Staying a refinery will be great for the community, great for local economy.
- Taxes generated by the refinery help support other City programs, not just what is local to refinery.
- PES provides 40% of east coast/northeast products.
- Can't depend on foreign oil.
- 36,000 jobs were employed directly and indirectly through various related services.
- Have to use towels to block smells.
- Burglaries related to unemployment.
- Employees feel it's a safe environment to work in and live near
- All donations from refinery would cease – no blood drive.
- Refinery can still run without one unit – there are 30 units.
- 2,000 people per shift – impacts other unions and their ability to get overtime and regular work.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Can natural gases be used?
- PES had a Community Action Team that actively sought employees from the local community.
- Workers should be getting back pay.

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- City would benefit.
- Tax revenue
- Employment
- Millions of dollars of revenue that impacts the whole city.
- Trickle-down affects the whole economy.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

n/a

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- Cannot safely do much because it would be a Superfund site.
- Will take at least 20 years to clean for other uses.
- No jobs
- No tax revenue for the City
- Would actually be costly for taxpayers.
- Schools and city services impacted.
- Too long for the soil to turn over.
- Worse for the environment
- No more community involvement from refinery employees.
- Businesses would be hurt without an open refinery – local food, restaurants, etc.
- Employees have received job offers to different cities. Many are lifelong residents. City would lose revenue from relocated families.
- Employees have to cut back on personal expenses.
- Have to sell homes, no vacations.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Where is all of PES' money going to go?
- City needs to hold someone accountable.
- What do people do in the mean time when they've lost their jobs?

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Earth can be cleaned.
- Mushrooms to absorb toxins in soil.
- Park similar to Central Park
- Plant trees
- Find less polluted alternatives.

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- This was a choice to close.

- They want the \$1.6 billion in insurance.
- More than half the refinery could still be running today.

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 3

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Unemployment – more than 1,000 jobs lost.
- Health hazards/air quality
- Wage tax lost
- Loss of fine monies
- People are uninformed about the situation.
- Lack of accountability of PES to the community.
- Effects of oil and gas on climate change
- Community/City being responsible for cleanup, not the company.
- Cost of living increase for oil and gas users.
- Cost of health care due to increase in health hazards.
- Dependency on foreign oil and gas
- Hydrofluoric Acid waste and healthy waste clean-up.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Use of a safer method to clean-up material.
- Safer refinery to provide jobs and tax money.
- Use land for solar energy.
- Use workers to help clean up.

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Solar industry
- Industrial clean-up would be extensive and take long.
- Reduction of workforce, pay and taxes in solar industry.
- Expensive material in solar industry.
- Not that simple to have clean-up. Lots of pollutants.

- If used for solar, the company takes the risk and makes the investment.
- If used for solar, no excavation necessary.
- Not totally independent of oil and gas.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Clean energy
- Geothermal/wind energy.

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- 1,300 acres of brownfield site.
- Flooding
- Overrun of cats, rats, deer, geese, etc.
- Rabies
- Old equipment/tanks resulting in a more dangerous environment.
- Homelessness
- Drug dealers
- Loss of job opportunity
- Property values drop.
- Eyesore
- City will then be responsible for clean-up
- Loss of usage of the river
- Increase import of oil/gas

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- No gas/oil production, no more pollutants, quicker clean-up of land.

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- New company using cleaner methods and energy.
- Clean-up companies.
- Research other global/national companies that we can imitate and learn from.
- Provide retraining of workers for jobs outside of gas and oil.
- Usage of river trails
- Using those same skills in other industries.
- Reuse land (ex: Navy Yard) for multiple uses/businesses.
- Research opportunities from schools/universities.

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

n/a

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 4

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Employment
- Products made at the refinery
- Tax revenue
- Local businesses
- Keep refinery safe – need skilled workers.
- New management (oil company).
- In best interest to keep it safe.
- Indirect economic impact
- Less reliance on imports – national security
- Continuous improvement
- Refinery not in Gulf area.
- Refinery does community outreach.
- \$6 million wage tax
- Closing refinery leads to less environmentally friendly production overseas to satisfy loss in production. Imports vs. exports.
- Strong workforce committed to safety.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Keep open dialogue with the community
- Neutralize acid – alternatives to HF
- Add some renewables – commitment to future
- More investment in safeguards
- Accountable to existing regulations

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- PES must clean up first

- Long timeline.
- Opportunity cost of time spent to clean.
- Next industry could hire fewer people.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Possibly less polluting
- Windmills/solar
- Better management
- Mix of uses

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- Continuous monitoring
- Clean up (or not)?
- Less tax money
- Fewer jobs
- Unsafe
- Magnet for crime.
- Impact on property values.
- Loss of local businesses that support refinery
- Where is accountability?
- Increase in taxes citywide.
- Could be something worse
- Attract drugs/crime

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Carbon capture

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Refinery AND Alternative Energy
- Waterfront housing
- Rocket launch pad
- Other jobs in the fuel industry
- Improved air quality

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

n/a

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 5

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Retain jobs
- Highly trained workforce – retain safety
- Refinery still operable even after the fire - that unit can be shut down and the plant can still operate.
- Indirect economic impacts, not just those who directly work there – ripple effect.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Continued maintenance, invest in high quality equipment and facilities.
- Sustain operations for long-term outcomes with ownership invested in that.
- Keeping costs down for heating and fuel.
- Continued support for community businesses – indirect employment (lunches, supplies, etc).
- Retain people living in Philadelphia who work at the refinery.

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Concern about how long it would take to get another use up and running.
- Additional traffic and transportation volume that would be needed for other uses could be a problem.
- What clean up investment would be required and who pays?

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Keep the skilled workers employed in similar work – LNG, biofuels, what else?
- Jobs in other industries, even with similar roles, would not pay as well as the refinery.

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- If refinery is not active, no one is cleaning the water before it gets to river.
- Who will pay for remediation?

- Not shutting down properly – chemicals in the pipes have potential to crack if nobody is there to run the boiler house.
- ii. **What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?**
- n/a
- 4) **Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?**
- i. **What are the opportunities/possibilities?**
- n/a
- 5) **Next Steps**
- i. **What else would you like us to know?**
- Where is all of this input going?
 - Misunderstanding of smoke vs. steam.
 - Smooth transition for permitting for a new owner.
 - Action needs to be expedited – it gets worse the longer it sits.
 - Carlyle payout
 - Owned now by investors who don't know the industry – City should review qualifications of new buyers.
 - Workers have been given no severance and no medical – just one month's notice after 25 years of service.
 - Workers unable to apply for COBRA
 - As time goes on, will be harder to get qualified workers back into the operations.
 - Major loss of a customer for key suppliers.
- ii. **How best to reach people and their communities for updates?**
- n/a

GROUP 6

1) **Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:**

- i. **What are the issues?**
- Facility is old
 - Environmental contamination and risks – HF, carbon, particulates
 - Public health – respiratory impacts, cost of treatment, particularly for seniors and children.
 - How long and how much money needed to recondition for safety.
 - Climate change – look for alternative energy.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Jobs – at refinery and in neighborhood.
- Revenue
- Economic growth from products
- Employees consuming in neighborhood
- Convert to non-HF with carbon capture

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Time to convert it into something else.
- Loss of resources
- Who will accept responsibility to clean it?
- Affordability if property values increase.
- Number and types of jobs – some like solar might only be temporary.
- Harder to answer without knowing who and what and how long

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Jobs in converting process
- Oil storage – jobs with fewer air/environmental impacts
- Renewable energy like solar power
-

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- If there are no jobs, who would police and monitor the land?
- Loss of tax revenue
- Higher poverty levels
- Monitoring issues – mosquito/rat/pest control
- Small business losing revenue
- Harder to clean up later.
- Vacant homes if workers move.
- Homelessness

- ii. **What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?**
 - Improved public health in the neighborhood

- 4) **Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?**
 - i. **What are the opportunities/possibilities?**
 - Renewable energy/solar energy
 - Greenery/park with clear action plan
 - Increase in nearby property values

- 5) **Next Steps**
 - i. **What else would you like us to know?**
 - Viable options need to be presented with accurate estimate of time, cost, feasibility study.
 - USW 2013 report on need to close HF plants.
 - ii. **How best to reach people and their communities for updates?**
 - Social media – Facebook, City Council, Mayor’s Office
 - Regular press conferences
 - Local news

GROUP 7

- 1) **Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:**
 - i. **What are the issues?**
 - Toxic air emissions
 - 10 year window to slow climate change
 - Would have a financially responsible owner
 - Impact of future explosion on life
 - Operate in a safe, reliable, environmentally sound manner
 - Need transparency for workers and community.
 - Increased eye problems and asthma ER visits
 - Safety of workers
 - ii. **What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?**

- Heat
- Refined oil goes to Europe
- Cost – tax – safety of transport – trains
- Financial support of community
- Reparations to residents for health impacts
- HF acid – stored offsite
- Environmental remediation
- Better owners may be better neighbors

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Tanks/fuel terminal
- Port expansion
- Co-gen power plant
- Clean energy use
- Increased traffic
- New use, new problems
- Would remediation make a difference?
- Sea level rise concerns
- Continued burning of fossil fuels and health risks

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Offshore wind
- None will give equivalent tax base

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- No tax revenue
- Clean up needed
- Residual contamination
- Workers have no jobs or payouts
- Property tax raised on homeowners
- Commodities go up
- Cost of remediation
- Vacant for years

- Maintaining flood walls
- Health issues - pests

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- None
- Not in our lifetime being reused
- Community process
- Just transition – better energy
- Workers first in process
- Health and safety over profits
- Stop pollution in air and water
- Remediation should account for storm surge
- Stop fossil fuels

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Community input opportunities
- Clean energy – can we be more specific
- Amazon/Walmart distribution
- Airport expansion
- Park
- Land remediation
- Trash to steam

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

n/a

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 8

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Bad air quality
- Bad state of mind
- Adding pollution

- Climate change issues
- Safety for everyone
- Need to clean property

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Jobs
- Improve working conditions
- Less volatile chemicals
- Workers must be a priority
- Immediate community must be a priority

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Pollution and airborne emissions
- Traffic
- Higher property taxes
- Will jobs pay the same?
- Other working conditions
- Culture of surrounding neighborhood

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Tank farm
- Solar farm
- Windmills farm
- Renewable energy
- Eco-friendly products
- Expanded treatment plant
- Repair trust
- City prestige

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- Degradation and pollution
- Safety
- Attract nuisances/drug use
- Sea level rise – flooding, other accidents

- People may move
- No jobs
- Eyesore

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- No carbon emissions
- Eco system comes back

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Recycling center
- Affordable housing
- Job training site
- Schools/hospitals
- Solar/ wind/ renewable energy
- Forest reclaimed
- Eco friendly products
- Natural gas export
- No other use is suitable.
- Bio-remediation
- Nuclear fusion plant
- Investment by fossil fuel company
- Increased economic potential
- Research facility

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

n/a

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 9

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Awareness of dangerous of chemicals used (HF)
- How does it fit into Mayor's commitment to transition to a green economy? This is not necessarily at odds with economic growth.
- Explore purchase through eminent domain

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Clean up – even as a refinery – to protect public health
- Alternatives to HF
- Additional regulations/permits – e.g. limits on quantity
- Free testing for mental/health risks for physical neighbors
- Pensions for employees that were laid off
- Emergency response and communication plan must be improved
- Re-hire laid off workers
- Regulate pollution better
- Asthma and cancer – support those who are sick
- Collect public health and pollution data to determine environmental impact – preferably independent research

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Similar issues/threats as first scenario

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Solar farm or other clean energy
- Emergency plans – predict emergencies and have plans ready
- Better rules about cleanup and education/info about requirements
- Make data available
- Transparent process so we know what's on that site today and a way to communicate that to neighbors
- Local hiring
- Evaluate site for sea level rise
- Make equity central to use, development, hiring, and community engagement

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- Public health – monitoring

- Cost to city – security, testing
- Impact to local wildlife

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Securing the property
- Involve the community and laid-off workers in caretaking and “citizen science” – monitoring conditions.
- Look at parceling off segments for sale.

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Comcast forest! (or other use)
- Bio-remediation/mushroom farming
- Evaluate extent of contamination
- Amusement park
- Predict sea level rise
- City services locate here? Bus depots, garages, etc.
- People cannot reside here
- Wind farm/windmills could work here

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- There needs to be more of “tonight” – public outreach and info
- More back and forth dialogue
- Follow up/report out of data/information to public
- Another meeting for community response
- How can we have more conversation between community and labor? We’re not enemies.

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 10

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Jobs – economic growth for city
- Utility for city – electricity
- Revenue generator for other proximate businesses – 36,000 people are affected by refinery closure.
- Owned by an oil company, not banking or venture capital
- Perception of refinery as environmentally unfriendly or a hazard that should go away.
- Standards are higher and known in the USA. If we import we can't know the standards/conditions of other sources.
- Training/response to explosion – Fit/exceeded need per event.
- We operate safely – my husband comes home to me each night.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Go to great lengths to meet EPA and other standards
- Access to information related to standards and what the refinery does to meet regulations.
- Update the refinery to where it needs to be
- Make productive the underutilized space
- Solar on vacant lots
- Material from refinery should go to productive uses, like roads.
- Management should take employees suggestions to improve/modify/adjust
- Reevaluate EPA limits
- More community outreach from the refinery.
- Meet renewable fuel standards
- Not being an “independent” refinery
- The Renewable Fuel Energy Act takes money out of the state
- Better capitalized

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Who is going to pay for it?
- Time – not a near-case scenario
- Wouldn't make similar tax contribution
- Who will pay for remediation?

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Bio fuels
- Trash to Steam/ co-generator
- Remediation
- Hold refinery accountable to clean up site – start somewhere, incremental approach
- Can refinery workers be paid to do clean up work?
- Use significant resources of refinery owners to begin to clean up for the community that lives there. Do so incrementally vs. not at all.

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- Drugs/illicit activity
- Remediate to mitigate a no-use scenario
- Do not feel confident the refinery company will mitigate hazard of a prolonged no-use scenario (units/pipes/drainage)
- Theft/scavengers for materials
- Loss of expertise – people will move, including those who work for contractors/businesses that service the refinery.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- People closest to refinery – workers – are experts and should be involved in addressing this scenario.

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

n/a

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- Wider public outreach for this committee.

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 11

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Air contamination, further contaminate the environment
- Been there over 100 years, should continue to operate.
- What else can they do with it? Can't be houses or park?
- Nobody was truthful about the harm the refinery did to the community. They let people die.
- Those jobs are toxic
- Been here 70 years, not dead yet.
- No communication from PES historically.
- Chemicals are chemicals, how could it be better?
- Fossil fuels = mass death of humans due to climate change
- Pays no local taxes – no money going back to schools from one of the largest pieces of land in city

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Need to put things into place to protect the neighborhood so people don't continue to be harmed/die
- Jobs for the neighborhood?
- Should be worker controlled, they should determine regulations and how it's run.
- PES should pay for all damages
- Study should be done to assess the damage done to area, including neighborhood surrounding (soil, air pollution, etc).

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- What are long term affects? Fear of health issues perpetuated without knowing affects.
- Sea level rise there – need to consider flooding, storm surges. Area could be used to mitigate flooding and protect residents.
- Really don't know until environmental survey is done. Needs to be a clean-up site before it becomes anything else.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Most people in Grays Ferry, Point Breeze, and Southwest are not certified for industrial jobs. Need to train people.
- Upgrade safety of site to neighborhood, less hazardous materials.

- Holyoke, MA budgeted \$100,000 to work with residents around what kind of industry is acceptable – do this.
- If it's another industry, should be renewable energy production with a just transition for people previously employed in fossil fuels.
- Community and City need to be much more involved in whatever industry would be there. Refinery has their lobbyists/advocates, need that on the other end.

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- Nature will take its course, increases in contamination will stop. Could lead way to making it a greenspace
- Has to be brought back to life. Economically we would be in bad shape if not.
- There's no reason why it should be vacant, companies need to be forced by City to pay up for clean up . Concern that City will ultimately make taxpayers pay.
- Don't know if it won't become a refinery again in the future.
- Job loss – not acceptable to lose jobs with no alternative.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Even if it shuts down, someone needs to pay up to the community – pay for affordable housing to be built elsewhere in neighborhood. More training for other areas of employment for the neighborhood.
- Incredible opportunity to build solar
- Act 2 – environmental laws that would force Sunoco to clean up even though they are not current owners. Required public participation process that they have not done.
- Working people should not pay for this. Have lowest minimum wage in country, corporations have billions.

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Re-wild – storm surge/flooding buffer
- Renewable energy
- Corridor for tech/startups
- Worker ownership of whatever happens/refinery working with community to achieve.
- Want it to stay as is, owner should be forced to upgrade it. City has to force it.
- Public housing post-remediation
- City and state funding for planning process where residents get to vet proposals.

- Something family and senior-friendly. Outdoor space, recreation opportunities

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- Even this meeting wasn't publicized the way it should have been, need a meeting in Grays Ferry.
- This is all reactive, why didn't this conversation happen sooner?
- People on the advisory committee are all big business, oil and gas industry.
- City has power of eminent domain
- Have been asking for this for 2 years, no response from City. Could have prevented.
- Mistrust of City to be willing to stand up to corporations and demand they rehab; stand up to energy companies not let them open another refinery. Will only happen with a mass movement, people taking to the streets.
- Concern of loss of jobs

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

- Why didn't council person or state rep publicize? City didn't publicize to neighbors.
- Don't rush process. People will get left out.
- Why meetings back to back?

GROUP 12

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- No issues
- Want to keep my job but also listen to community concerns
- Feel like community not listening to us (the workers)
- Feel that refinery operations work well in isolating it from community.
- Community health concerns
- Misperception by community of how things work/safety, etc. inside the refinery
- No direct lawsuits due to health issues
- Philadelphia area childhood asthma rate double the national average

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Need an investor interested in making it a quality operation
- More communication of what best practices are in the refinery to protect health and environment

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Contaminated site
- Proximity to airport – solar reflectance issues?
- Economic impact to community and state compared to refinery would be worse
- Difficult for any other industrial use.
- Remediation?
- Retention of existing jobs
- Addressing climate crisis and pollution

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Solar energy opportunity
- Job training opportunity
- Combination of several uses

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- No jobs!
- Lost revenue for community
- Chemicals in ground water
- Worst case scenario for City
- Vandalism, concerns of trespass
- Eyesore to community
- No opportunity – benefits no one!

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Have previous owners of refinery pay to clean up site – make accountable
- Opportunity to re-imagine the site for something other than refinery
- Opportunity to see if health issues improve without refinery

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

n/a

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

n/a

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 13

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Health and environment
- Cost to move/relocate is an issue
- Plant itself an issue due to environmental toxins
- There is a potential buyer
- Community was not notified at time of incident – families were outdoors.
- Who will clean up the acid to make the community safe? Who's responsibility?
- Long term health affects

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Solar and green options for family safety
- Prepare people better in case of emergency/explosion. Alerts, instructions, organization
- City should hold owner accountable for worker compensation/legal/non-compliance.
- Include community in all findings and decisions in real time with City officials.
- Have more air pollution monitors for faster readings and response. Focus them in communities in close proximity – upwind and downwind. User friendly website with daily air monitoring info.
- Emergency safe shelters and transportation for affected community members.

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Airborne pollution if soil is disturbed is an issue.
- Containing pollution and toxins
- What are the stages of cleanup?

- What are the obstacles and time table for cleanup?
- Can laid off workers be hired for cleanup?

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Take advantage to switch from fossil fuel to green energy.
- Sustainable energy training facility/program for energy conversion for current and new workers.
- Solar/wind energy
- Propose that workers handle the grounds clean-up, since they are most familiar with the site.
- Level area, demolish buildings. Don't disturb soil.
- Clean land and soil for future use.

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- What is the process to get the land permitted/zoned for other use?
- Leaving it vacant will cause deterioration. No use and possibly more hazards to happen with lack of presence and care.

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- As long as there is a plan for remediation it can stay vacant.
- No issue with refinery staying vacant with ongoing monitoring and reporting to community, make info public.
- Area should definitely be considered for employment options

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Repurpose clean parts of the 1,400 acres for green space and recreational activities
- Look at other cities (Gas Works Park in Seattle) to see how these issues were handled and turned around.
- This site should never be used as a refinery ever again! Will leave with family.

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- Lung cancer epidemic due to dump sites and pollution. Getting something done takes too long. People lose faith over time to fight and correct issues.

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 14

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Jobs
- Safe place to work with employee wellness checks
- Tax revenue – city, state, and federal
- Votes
- Employment/unemployment rate
- Lower gas prices
- Support local businesses
- Lower oil/diesel prices
- Reliance on domestic oil (southern refineries have hurricanes)
- Good site -recycles water.
- On-site emergency care
- Safety protocols in place
- Exposure controls in place.
- Location – airport, water, TWIC cards
- 40% of oil on East Coast
- Economic impact – 1:18 jobs
- Safe/healthy operation

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Invested in union cooperation
- Fire safety training
- Education for the community
- Community-based organizations need big oil – know how to profit from safe operations

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Solar panels – how feasible? One-time jobs, no taxes
- Warehousing requires cleanup

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

n/a

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- No revenue or taxes
- Loss of jobs
- Bad for neighbors

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

n/a

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Cleaner sites have had a tougher time adapting to another use.
- If changed, it will never get cleaned up, and city/government will get the bill.

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

n/a

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 15

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Need more information about the oil underground
- If vacant, would allow for Superfund EPA monitoring
- Is the refinery technology old? What has been updated?
- Why isn't the City or owners concerned about contamination?

- More education/jobs/schools are needed to help inform safe refinery/industrial uses.
- Single largest air polluter in City
- .
- Care about jobs
- Oil will always be in “someone’s back yard”
- Continued health effects

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Air monitoring in community and along fence line. Refinery pay for it.
- There can be efforts to decontaminate the site while developing solar options.
- There needs to be an assessment of contamination before any reuse including refinery
- More training needed for near neighbors and refinery workers.
- Before any reuse there needs to be a transparent climate resilience plan
- Public inspections should be provided if it stays a refinery
- Decontamination while developing solar
- Assessment of contamination before reuse
- Training needed
- Transparent climate resilience plan
- Public inspections
- Emissions – federal program Title 5 awareness
- Should HF be allowed back into refinery?
- More monitoring
- Safety drills for public/community if it stays a refinery
- Public participation before starting again – transparent process
- If the refinery stays, there needs to be an environmental justice expert to monitor and review impacts in neighborhood

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Tank fields / storage will create issues for reuse
- Burn at night? Same at day or night
- Solar field reuse- employment is low.
- Voluntary clean up won’t happen
- Less jobs
- Less income and wage taxes
- Less money into local economy
- Site will not get cleaned up. Who will clean it? How will it get clean?

- Changes in ownership – new zoning?

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Trash to Steam
- Natural gas is cleaner
- Remediation site training facility
- Living learning lab – bring in EPA, state, research to educate how to clean up superfund sites. Use current workers who know the industry to help educate, and clean through training and education. This would test cleaning strategies, and employee people to help remediate the site overtime.
- Revolving uses
- Training to remediate sites
- Enforce cleanup by PES/Sunoco
- Dangers of site need to be known
- Incentivize training for new roles within city.

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- Further decline
- Scrapping/vandalism
- Hazards – flooding and water runoff issues
- Liability of trespassing
- Underground/water issues
- No air pollution – unless it deteriorates
- Taxes being paid in vacancy?
- Loss of jobs, wage, and property taxes.
- Higher cost of living

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Remediate for mixed use/park
- Dismantle and reuse the material on site/up cycle
- Rezone site for less industrial uses to not allow for any further refinery
- Full resources from local, federal and state to go after Sunoco/PES
- Jobs to be options to help dismantle, using local knowledge

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Museum – studies for brownfield redevelopment.
- Universities/academic use
- Energy redevelopment center focused on the site’s history/culture; EPA remediation documents; education and training.

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- Timeline of report – need more time. Too short. Need a year or more for this type of report.
- Too complicated for a several month process, we don’t know full contamination impact.
- Who is decision maker?
- What does this report do?
- Timing is important for jobs/run it safely. Decisions need to be made.
- Go after PES
- City should rezone site, what options do we have?
- Look at what happened with Delaware City refinery
- City image coming from airport/NJ
- Communication needs to happen. More outreach.
- Refinery not in line with City sustainability goals

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 16

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Air and water quality
- Climate change contribution

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Better monitoring needed
- Enforcement of laws at every level possible.
- Modernize to mitigate impacts
- AMS and higher fines; Act 2

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Sea level rise and flooding
- Release of pollutants.
- Other high-impact uses will find land appealing.
- City influence as neighbor

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Opportunity for growth through remediation and resettlement
- Rail lines
- Riverfront
- Views
- Highway access
- Future trail access
- Solar or wind farm
- Manufacturing renewables
- Remediation

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

n/a

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Ensure harmful chemicals are not left behind
- Whole-system remediation
- Intentional use while vacant

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Forestry
- Oyster-tecture
- Non-food agriculture
- Naturally dead animal enzyme
- Zoning can change existing use
- Green economy

- Mixed-use development in all aspects
- Recognize Native American heritage
- Green space
- Remediation – organic/bio
- Sensitive to sea level rise

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- More transparency – public access to monitoring, periodic reporting
- Recompense for damages
- Reporting
- “Alarm system”
- Enforce PA Constitution Environmental Rights amendment.

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 17

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Air quality
- Contamination outside site
- Public health issues (cancer, asthma, etc)
- Danger – explosions, more disasters
- No trust in PES. Trust in new operator?
- Bad for Philadelphia’s reputation and image
- Decrease investment in the City
- More use of HF (should be banned)
- More use of other lethal chemicals in an urban space
- Decrease in property values
- Bad first impression from PHL and I-95
- Missed opportunity to turn a negative into a positive
- We shouldn’t let Phil Rinaldi “back on the scene” or have involvement going forward
- Continue to violate national ambient air quality standards
- Who becomes responsible for cleanup and remediation?
- Lets PES and Sunoco off the hook for higher standards of site cleanup

- Workforce doesn't reflect local neighborhoods or local residents.
- ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?**
- Negotiate local hiring requirement with new owners and/or unions
 - Chance to ban use of lethal chemicals
 - Chance to require updated equipment to meet emissions and air quality standards.
- 2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:**
- i. What are the issues?**
- Concentrate on non-fossil fuel uses to avoid making a bad situation worse
 - Because contamination is so bad, this is a premature issue.
- ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?**
- Could become green industrial like solar farm
 - Could be used as a special zone for climate mitigation and habitat (including human) restoration
 - Option to combine uses (energy generation and remediation, for example)
 - Can require setback from river and create flood mitigation along the site
 - Any use (or non-use) is better than continued fossil fuel use
- 3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:**
- i. What are the issues?**
- Possible vermin issue
 - Eyesore continues
 - Possible illegal dumping
- ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?**
- Still better than a petroleum site
 - Could be used for art or sculpture or festivals or similar
- 4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?**
- i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?**

- Fairmount Park South
- Connect FDR and Bartram's
- To be phased: designate site for climate mitigation and habitat restoration in a way that still requires PES and Sunoco to clean it; upon closure and during deconstruction, plant quick growing hedges around site perimeter to control sediment and erosion; low maintenance/low investment/ high quality opportunity for urban forests and wetlands; higher cost/higher quality solar farm on top of remediating grasses, no permanent structures to allow future flexibility
- Something like the Viaduct Park or High Line in New York

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- Can City Council use their prerogative to prevent future fossil fuel uses?
- Is there a chance that a new owner of a petroleum site could bring HF back to the site?
- Need to focus on the danger posed to 1.1 million Philadelphia residents, not loss of 1,000 jobs.
- Need to look for innovative industrial/manufacturing opportunities to replace lost jobs, not replace the same jobs. Needs to be a priority.

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

n/a

GROUP 18

1) Refinery Scenario: Many former refineries become refineries again. If this is the case:

i. What are the issues?

- Breathing
- No jobs from neighborhood
- Cancer
- Constitutional right to breathe clean air
- Medical cost to neighbors, family die from cancer
- Don't sent out information
- Environmental contamination.
- Issues for climate change and flooding.
- No jobs for the people working there now.
- Need for PES to get involved
- Explosion
- Smog

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- None

2) Other Industrial Use Scenario: If other industrial uses were to locate or be integrated into the site:

i. What are the issues?

- Would it be safe?
- Still would be a contaminated site
- Still must be cleaned up

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Bring Amazon or other storage site
- Solar
- Start fresh with getting the community involved

3) Vacant/No Use Scenario: If the site ends up vacant for a number of years:

i. What are the issues?

- Would still be toxic
- City should use this much available land
- Eyesore
- Everyone leaves
- Could be a flood zone
- Dump cost on the city, taxpayers would pay
-

ii. What are the opportunities/what would make it better for you?

- Wouldn't pollute more
- Use eminent domain to make decisions

4) Other Use Scenario: Are there uses that could be incorporated on the site?

i. What are the opportunities/possibilities?

- Playground
- Solar farm
- Industrial production facility for green energy
- Something else to create more jobs
- Training

- Community input on what would be built
- Show the world how Philly could create green energy jobs

5) Next Steps

i. What else would you like us to know?

- Need a quieter space
- Break silos (environmental groups, neighbors, union workers, etc)

ii. How best to reach people and their communities for updates?

- Get email addresses for listserv
- Word of mouth
- Have more speakers
- Better venue